

THE
AQUATIC
APE:
Fact
or
Fiction?

*The first scientific
evaluation of a controversial
theory of human evolution*

Edited by:
MACHTELD ROEDE
JAN WIND
JOHN PATRICK
VERNON REYNOLDS

**THE AQUATIC APE:
FACT OR FICTION?**

The first scientific evaluation of a controversial theory of human evolution
Edited by Machteld Roede, Jan Wind,
John Patrick and Vernon Reynolds

It is generally accepted that humans descended from an ape-like creature which, about five million years ago, abandoned life in the trees to take the first hesitating steps towards bipedalism. There remains an area of dispute, however. Was the new environment the savannah, as is generally believed, or a region of water and marshland as suggested by Sir Alister Hardy in 1960?

Advocates of the Aquatic Ape Theory have been increasing in number in recent years, due largely to the arguments of Elaine Morgan who published the first book on the subject, *The Descent of Woman*, in 1972. However, the Savannah Theory has remained the established orthodoxy.

This book, derived from the first international symposium on the subject, held at Valkenburg in the Netherlands in 1987, reflects the lively debate among the participating scientists of many disciplines, exploring the pros and cons of both theories and attempting to reconstruct the features and ecological niche of our early hominid ancestors. The conference papers, largely rewritten for this book, range back and forth over geography and fossil material, geological and palaeontological evidence, evolutionary biology and physiological characteristics. Some relevant contributions have been added by scientists not present at the conference, and a balance has been sought between younger and more senior scholars.

The result is the first serious discussion for and against the theory which claims, among others, that our ancestors stood up on two legs to wade through water. Illustrated with photographs, drawings and maps, it is likely to become a standard work on the subject, and to provide a stimulus for much further discussion.

£20.00

To Hqs
with all best wishes

E Lane

THE AQUATIC APE: FACT OR FICTION?

*The First Scientific Evaluation
of a Controversial Theory of Human Evolution*

Edited by

Machteld Roede, Jan Wind,
John M. Patrick and Vernon Reynolds

SOUVENIR PRESS (E&A) LTD

Copyright © 1991 by Souvenir Press (Educational & Academic) Ltd.

First published 1991 by Souvenir Press (Educational & Academic) Ltd,
43 Great Russell Street, London WC1B 3PA
and simultaneously in Canada

All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication
may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,
or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic,
mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without
the prior permission of the Copyright owner

ISBN 0 285 63033 4

Printed in Great Britain by
WBC Print Ltd, Bridgend, Mid Glamorgan

Introduction	36
The area of interest	37
African wetlands and Red Sea rifting	39
Forest and savannah habitat	39
Timing	41
Marine mammal adaptation	41
Marine wetlands ecosystems	42
Resource content of marine ecosystems	42
Contemporary tropical examples	49
Miocene–Pliocene–Pleistocene considerations	51
Primate behaviour	53
Swimming	53
Coastal monkeys and home ranging	57
Social (kin) grouping	57
Dispersal phases – young adults?	59
Day–night cycles	59
Communication	59
Feeding and omnivorousness	61
Some relevant eco-ethological and evolutionary concepts	61
Behavioural integration and optimisation	61
Evolutionary theory	62
An alternative to the Savannah Theory	63
Coastal and riverine forest ape stock: Stage 1	66
An aquatic ape: Stage 2	66
The return inland: Stage 3	69
Conclusion	71
References	72
5 Aquatic Features in Fossil Hominids? <i>Marc Verhaegen</i>	75
Summary	75
Palaeo-environmental evidence	75
Comparative anatomy of fossil hominids	78
Body size	78
Brain volume	79
Brain endocasts	79
Cranial vault	82
Skull pneumatisation	84
External nose	86
Spine	89
Thorax	89
Arms	91
Hands	92
Pelvic girdle	93
Legs	94
Feet	98

Discussion	101
Australopithecine ancestors for all African hominoids?	101
<i>A. afarensis</i> : some <i>Nasalis</i> -like locomotion features	104
Fossil <i>Homo</i> : probably semi-aquatic	105
Conclusion	106
References	106

PART II: REACTIONS TO THE AQUATIC APE THEORY:
FOR AND AGAINST

6 The Refutation that Never Was: The Reception of the Aquatic Ape Theory, 1972–1987	<i>Graham Richards</i>	115
Summary		115
Introduction		115
Lack of consensus among the experts		116
Savannah origins – theory or axiom?		118
How relevant are fossils?		118
The rejection of Elaine Morgan’s ideas		120
The need for human aquaticism to be on the evolutionary agenda		122
Conclusion		124
References		125
7 Does the Geological Evidence Support the Aquatic Ape Theory?	<i>Martin Pickford</i>	127
Summary		127
Introduction		127
Discussion of the Aquatic Ape Theory		128
The early scenario		130
The late scenario		130
Conclusion		131
References		131
8 Adaptation and the Aquatic Ape	<i>Alan Turner</i>	133
Summary		133
Introduction		133
The adaptationist scenario		134
On the beach		136
Conclusion		139
References		140
9 The Aquatic Ape Theory, Seen from Epistemological and Palaeoanthropological Viewpoints	<i>Holger and Signe Preuschoft</i>	142
Summary		142
Introduction		142
Survey of the fossil record		143
A selection of hominoid characters that can be explained		

1. The first part of the document is a list of names.

2. The second part of the document is a list of names.

3. The third part of the document is a list of names.

4. The fourth part of the document is a list of names.

Summary	221
Introduction	221
Thermoregulatory problems of aquatic mammals	223
The energetics of hominids in water	226
The thermoregulatory hypothesis	229
Conclusion	234
References	234
14 Human Respiratory Adaptations for Swimming and Diving	
<i>John M. Patrick</i>	237
Summary	237
Introduction	237
Lung size and buoyancy	238
Keeping water out of the airway	240
Cortical control of breathing	242
Conclusion	244
References	244
15 The Significance of the Human Diving Reflex	
<i>Erika Schagatay</i>	247
Summary	247
The diving reflex in animals and man	247
Factors influencing diving bradycardia in humans	248
Comparative aspects of diving bradycardia	250
Alternative explanations for the prominence of the human diving reflex	251
The temperature-dependence of the diving reflex	252
The 'sea-people'	252
References	253
16 The Burden of Locomotion in Water: Could the Aquatic Ape Have Overcome It?	
<i>Joseph Ghesquiere and Helene Bunkens</i>	255
Summary	255
Introduction	255
Wading in water	257
Swimming	258
Conclusion	261
References	261
17 The Non-Aquatic Ape: The Aquatic Ape Theory and the Evolution of Human Drowning and Swimming	
<i>Jan Wind</i>	263
Summary	263
Introduction	263
Man and water: the paradox	263
Life and water	265
Loss of water adaptation	266
Buoyancy	267

Breathing	269
Aspiration, hypothermia and osmolality	270
Locomotion	273
Human behaviour	276
Evidence from the apes?	277
'Oceanic desires'	277
The AAT and the swimming babies	278
Conclusion	279
References	281
18 Do Aquatic Mammals Provide Support for the Aquatic Ape Theory? <i>Machteld Roede</i>	283
Summary	283
Introduction	283
Evolution and the water adaptations of aquatic mammals	283
Diving	286
Conclusion	286
References	287
19 More Thoughts on the Aquatic Ape Theory	
How the aquatic adaptations of man differ from those of the gorilla and the chimpanzee <i>Karl-Erich Fichtelius</i>	288
Summary	288
Introduction	288
Physical and physiological properties of blood	288
The vagina	289
Prevention of heat loss	289
Conclusion	290
References	290
Some cardiac topographic and morpho-physiological observations of the common seal and of man <i>Cornelis J. van Nie and Machteld Roede</i>	290
Summary	290
Introduction	291
The diving reflex	291
Cardiac topography	292
Coarctatio aortae	292
Conclusion	293
References	293
The answer: the Aquatic Ape Theory and the Savannah Theory combined <i>Sarah B.M. Kraak</i>	293
Summary	293
The answer	294
Conclusion	295
References	296
The second crisis <i>Erika Schagatay</i>	296

Summary	296
The enigmatic question	296
A possible explanation	297
Conclusion	298
References	298
Human sexual dimorphism: a speculative approach	
	<i>Erika Schagatay</i>
	299
Summary	299
Introduction	299
Breasts	299
Buttocks	302
'Blubber'	303
Conclusion	305
References	305
20 Aquatic Man <i>Machteld Roede</i>	306
Summary	306
Introduction	306
Seas and coasts	307
The seas	308
The coasts	311
<i>Homo sapiens</i> and the sea	312
Shipping	313
Diving	315
Legends and myths	318
Discussion and conclusions	325
The physical properties of the sea	325
Cultural relationship between humans and the sea	326
References	327
PART III: GENERAL CONCLUSIONS	
21 Cold and Watery? Hot and Dusty? Our Ancestral Environment and Our Ancestors Themselves: an Overview <i>Vernon Reynolds</i>	331
Summary	331
Introduction	331
Prologue: on advocacy	331
The evidence and the arguments	332
Bipedalism	333
Body hair	334
Sweat	335
Subcutaneous fat	337
The 'diving response'	338
Marsh-wading	339

Location	340
Conclusion	340
References	341
22 Epilogue: Is There a Future for the Aquatic Ape Theory?	
<i>Machteld Roede, Jan Wind, John M. Patrick and Vernon Reynolds</i>	342
Index of Authors	344
Index of Subjects	350

List of Figures and Tables

FIGURES

3.1	The generally supposed relationship of the Nubian plate of the African continent to the Arabian plate during the late Miocene	31
3.2	The configuration of the same region, but as it may have been at the beginning of the Pliocene	31
3.3	The African Rift Valley showing the principal sites where hominid fossils have been discovered	32
3.4	The location of the Tertiary deposits called the Red Series that may yield hominoid fossils if this hypothesis is correct	32
4.1	The African Rift Valley, including the Red Sea	38
4.2	Proboscis monkey on the ground in a mangrove swamp forest	40
4.3	Model of marine wetlands ecosystem	43
4.4	Coral reef back-channel lagoon, with island	45
4.5	Estuarine lagoons	46
4.6	A tropical archipelago	47
4.7	Chacma baboons on a surf shore with sand beach and rock habitats	48
4.8	Topography of the African Rift Valley	52
4.9	Orang-utan wading in the moat at the Singapore Zoo	56
4.10	Models of direct and indirect habitat-shift descent theories for humans	64
4.11	Active aquatic apes in a shallow lagoon	68
4.12	The daily cycle of an aquatic ape	69
5.1	Evolutionary tree of African hominids: a) Molecular tree; b) Fossil tree	77
5.2	Side view of a male Neanderthal compared with modern man	85
5.3	Comparison of thorax form	90
5.4	Schematic anterior view of hominid lower limbs	96
5.5	Comparison of foot skeletons	100
9.1	Chronology of hominid evolution	145
9.2	Reconstruction of <i>Proconsul africanus</i> , the best known among the potential forerunners of hominids	148
9.3	Stresses in finger bones of a primate present during a power	

	grip is used in climbing	149
4.4	The long, narrow dental arcade of Miocene (and modern) apes has been transformed during hominid evolution into a short, parabolic dental arcade without large canines	151
4.5	Schematic representation of the most marked changes of cranial shape during hominisation	152
4.6	In upright trunk postures, a lordosis reduces the load arm length of the more cranial sections of the body, while providing long power arms for the dorsal muscles	154
4.7	Side view of various primates' pelvises to show the shortening and 'lordosising' of the iliac neck during hominid evolution	155
4.8	Right hindlimb under full body weight seen in frontal view: a) Human; b) Gorilla	157
4.9	Valgus position of the right knee joint in <i>Homo sapiens</i> compared to the varus position of the knee in <i>Gorilla</i> ; and elevation of the medial margin in a pongid compared to the elevated lateral margin of the patellar facet, typical of <i>Homo</i>	158
4.10	Stress patterns in the foot: a) adapted to ground walking; b) adapted to prehension	159
4.11	The metatarsals of the Olduvai foot, compared with those of a <i>Gorilla</i>	160
4.12	All primates carry a larger proportion of their body weight on the hindlimbs than other, cursorial mammals	163
4.13	A 'marsh wader' has to keep its trunk, and swing its hind limbs forward, above the water level	166
4.14	Forces acting against the body of a swimming hominid	167
5.1	Flow of 'hairstreams' on the human body ($n > 10,000$)	176
5.2	Hypothetical reconstruction of early hominid hair cover and the effect of pilo-erection	177
6.1	Small female figurine of palaeolithic age from North-West Europe, seen from front and side	196
6.2	The principal superficial adipose depots in a) guinea-pig, b) deer, c) tiger, d) male human	199
6.3	Mass of adipose tissue in superficial depots as a percentage of the total dissectible adipose tissue in 11 adult male badgers	203
7.1	Schematic diagrams of the alignment of the major hair tracts on the trunk and limbs of a) the African apes and b) modern man	222
7.2	The relationship between the resting metabolic heat production, expressed as a percentage of basal metabolic rate (BMR), required to maintain homeothermy and environmental temperature in air and water	227
7.3	a) Natural convective airflow over a model hominid standing in a bipedal posture on a horizontal surface; b) Hair tracts on	

	the head of a human foetus; c) Natural convective airflow over the human head	233
15.1	Changes in heart rate (HR) from pre-immersion values during apnoeic face immersion (AFI) in untrained Swedish control and trained Indonesian subjects	249
15.2	Comparison of mean (\pm SE) pulse reduction (a) and mean (\pm SE) breath-holding (b) between untrained control and trained subjects	249
16.1	Net oxygen uptake in ml per kg body weight at speeds 1 to 2.5 km per hour in 6 women and 6 men on dry land and wading through water up to their armpits	256
16.2	Oxygen consumption per unit travel range versus speed for various on-land and in-water activities	257
17.1	Schematic representation of the value of observing modern animals for elucidating the evolutionary history of humans	264
17.2	Evolution of the human airway as indicated by some representative modern species	271
17.3	Comparison of the concentration of the most common ions present in sea water and human blood plasma	272
17.4	Swimming position in a) the tree-shrew, b) the rhesus monkey, and c) man, illustrating that breathing during swimming in pre-Miocene human ancestors must have been less difficult than in man	275
17.5	Summary of the causes of man's proneness to drowning as they have evolved during his descent from the first vertebrates	280
19.1	When food got scarce on the dying reefs the aquatic apes started to explore the river beds and finally left the sea	296
19.2	Three positions which could be used by the aquatic ape mother when feeding her baby at sea	301
19.3	Stone Age torso, steatopygous bushwoman and fashionable nineteenth-century lady	303
19.4	At the end of the aquatic phase Ms Missing Link may have looked something like this	304
20.1	The fisherman Glaucus, after a seventeenth-century Dutch engraving	324

TABLES

2.1	Human features shared with a) savannah b) aquatic mammals	20
4.1	Difficulties with the Savannah Theory of human evolution	37
4.2	Relative environmental stresses and risks, resource accessibility and adaptive demands in tropical marine wetlands	50
4.3	Swimming and other water activities of primates	54

4.4	Group organisation of primates	58
4.5	Observations on primate roosting and waking in a 27-cage arena at the San Diego Zoo	60
4.6	An alternative theory for human evolution	64
4.7	Some human characters, arranged in four sets with comments on aquatic adaptiveness	65
5.1	Survey of fossil hominids	76
5.2	Some East African fossil sites: abbreviations used	76
5.3	Classification of living primates	80
5.4	Living hominid and pongid species	80
5.5	Brain weights of various mammals weighing 50–70 kg	80
5.6	Explanations for neolithic reduction of cranial capacity in man	81
5.7	Explanations for skull vault thickening in fossil <i>Homo</i>	82
5.8	Explanations for supra-orbital torus development in <i>H. erectus</i> and <i>H. neanderthalensis</i>	83
5.9	Traditional explanations for platycephaly in <i>H. erectus</i> and <i>H. neanderthalensis</i>	84
5.10	Pneumatisation in fossil hominids	86
5.11	Pneumatisation in other animals	87
5.12	Possible explanations for skull pneumatisation	88
5.13	Possible functions of an external nose	88
5.14	Possible explanations for medullary stenosis of femur and tibia in <i>Homo erectus</i>	97
5.15	Some cranial resemblances between apes and Australopithecines	102
11.1	Maximum urine concentration in different mammals	189
11.2	Human characteristics compared with those of aquatic and savannah mammals	190
15.1	Comparison of bradycardia and breath-holding time between apnoea in air (A) and apnoeic face immersion (AFI) in untrained control and trained divers	251
16.1	Buoyancy in 'constructed' black and white models	259
17.1	A summary of animal and human density	268