



## Adverse Effects of Vaccines: Evidence and Causality

ISBN  
978-0-309-21435-3

896 pages  
6 x 9  
HARDBACK (2012)

Kathleen Stratton, Andrew Ford, Erin Rusch, and Ellen Wright Clayton,  
Editors; Committee to Review Adverse Effects of Vaccines; Institute of  
Medicine



Add book to cart



Find similar titles



Share this PDF



### Visit the National Academies Press online and register for...

Instant access to free PDF downloads of titles from the

NATIONAL ACADEMY OF SCIENCES

NATIONAL ACADEMY OF ENGINEERING

INSTITUTE OF MEDICINE

NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL

10% off print titles

Custom notification of new releases in your field of interest

Special offers and discounts

Distribution, posting, or copying of this PDF is strictly prohibited without written permission of the National Academies Press. Unless otherwise indicated, all materials in this PDF are copyrighted by the National Academy of Sciences. Request reprint permission for this book

Adverse Effects of Vaccines: Evidence and Causality

# Adverse Effects of Vaccines

## Evidence and Causality

Committee to Review Adverse Effects of Vaccines  
Board on Population Health and Public Health Practice  
Kathleen Stratton, Andrew Ford, Erin Rusch, and Ellen Wright Clayton,  
*Editors*

INSTITUTE OF MEDICINE  
*OF THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES*

THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES PRESS  
Washington, D.C.  
[www.nap.edu](http://www.nap.edu)

THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES PRESS 500 Fifth Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20001

NOTICE: The project that is the subject of this report was approved by the Governing Board of the National Research Council, whose members are drawn from the councils of the National Academy of Sciences, the National Academy of Engineering, and the Institute of Medicine. The members of the committee responsible for the report were chosen for their special competences and with regard for appropriate balance.

This study was supported by Contract No. HHS230200446009I, Task Order 13 between the National Academy of Sciences and the Health Resources and Services Administration of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and the National Vaccine Program Office also provided support through that contract. Any opinions, findings, conclusions, or recommendations expressed in this publication are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the view of the organizations or agencies that provided support for this project.

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Institute of Medicine (U.S.). Committee to Review Adverse Effects of Vaccines.

Adverse effects of vaccines : evidence and causality / Committee to Review Adverse Effects of Vaccines, Board on Population Health and Public Health Practice ; Kathleen Stratton ... [et al.], editors.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-309-21435-3 (hardcover) — ISBN 978-0-309-21436-0 (PDF)

I. Stratton, Kathleen R. II. Title.

[DNLM: 1. Vaccines—adverse effects. 2. Bacterial Infections—prevention & control. 3. Causality. 4. Virus Diseases—prevention & control. QW 805]

615.3'72—dc23

2012007052

Additional copies of this report are available from the National Academies Press, 500 Fifth Street, N.W., Keck 360, Washington, DC 20001; (800) 624-6242 or (202) 334-3313; Internet, <http://www.nap.edu>.

For more information about the Institute of Medicine, visit the IOM home page at: [www.iom.edu](http://www.iom.edu).

Copyright 2012 by the National Academy of Sciences. All rights reserved.

Printed in the United States of America

The serpent has been a symbol of long life, healing, and knowledge among almost all cultures and religions since the beginning of recorded history. The serpent adopted as a logotype by the Institute of Medicine is a relief carving from ancient Greece, now held by the Staatliche Museen in Berlin.

Suggested citation: IOM (Institute of Medicine). 2012. *Adverse effects of vaccines: Evidence and causality*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press.

*“Knowing is not enough; we must apply.  
Willing is not enough; we must do.”*

—Goethe



**INSTITUTE OF MEDICINE**  
*OF THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES*

**Advising the Nation. Improving Health.**

## **THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES**

*Advisers to the Nation on Science, Engineering, and Medicine*

The **National Academy of Sciences** is a private, nonprofit, self-perpetuating society of distinguished scholars engaged in scientific and engineering research, dedicated to the furtherance of science and technology and to their use for the general welfare. Upon the authority of the charter granted to it by the Congress in 1863, the Academy has a mandate that requires it to advise the federal government on scientific and technical matters. Dr. Ralph J. Cicerone is president of the National Academy of Sciences.

The **National Academy of Engineering** was established in 1964, under the charter of the National Academy of Sciences, as a parallel organization of outstanding engineers. It is autonomous in its administration and in the selection of its members, sharing with the National Academy of Sciences the responsibility for advising the federal government. The National Academy of Engineering also sponsors engineering programs aimed at meeting national needs, encourages education and research, and recognizes the superior achievements of engineers. Dr. Charles M. Vest is president of the National Academy of Engineering.

The **Institute of Medicine** was established in 1970 by the National Academy of Sciences to secure the services of eminent members of appropriate professions in the examination of policy matters pertaining to the health of the public. The Institute acts under the responsibility given to the National Academy of Sciences by its congressional charter to be an adviser to the federal government and, upon its own initiative, to identify issues of medical care, research, and education. Dr. Harvey V. Fineberg is president of the Institute of Medicine.

The **National Research Council** was organized by the National Academy of Sciences in 1916 to associate the broad community of science and technology with the Academy's purposes of furthering knowledge and advising the federal government. Functioning in accordance with general policies determined by the Academy, the Council has become the principal operating agency of both the National Academy of Sciences and the National Academy of Engineering in providing services to the government, the public, and the scientific and engineering communities. The Council is administered jointly by both Academies and the Institute of Medicine. Dr. Ralph J. Cicerone and Dr. Charles M. Vest are chair and vice chair, respectively, of the National Research Council.

**[www.national-academies.org](http://www.national-academies.org)**

COMMITTEE TO REVIEW ADVERSE EFFECTS OF VACCINES

- Ellen Wright Clayton** (*Chair*), Craig-Weaver Professor of Pediatrics;  
*Director, Center for Biomedical Ethics and Society; Professor of Law;*  
Vanderbilt University
- Inmaculada B. Aban**, Associate Professor, Department of Biostatistics,  
University of Alabama, Birmingham
- Douglas J. Barrett**, Professor, Departments of Pediatrics, Molecular  
Genetics & Microbiology, Pathology, Immunology, & Laboratory  
Medicine, University of Florida College of Medicine
- Martina Bebin**, Associate Professor of Neurology and Pediatrics,  
University of Alabama at Birmingham
- Kirsten Bibbins-Domingo**, Associate Professor and Attending Physician,  
University of California, San Francisco
- Graham A. Colditz**,<sup>1</sup> Associate Director for Prevention and Control,  
Alvin J. Siteman Cancer Center, and Niess-Gain Professor in the  
School of Medicine, Department of Surgery, Washington University  
School of Medicine
- Martha Constantine-Paton**, Investigator, McGovern Institute for Brain  
Research; Professor of Biology, Department of Biology, Department  
of Brain and Cognitive Sciences, Massachusetts Institute of  
Technology
- Deborah J. del Junco**, Senior Epidemiologist and Associate Professor of  
Biostatistics, Epidemiology, and Research Design, University of Texas  
Health Science Center at Houston
- Betty A. Diamond**, Head, Center for Autoimmune and Musculoskeletal  
Disease, The Feinstein Institute for Medical Research, North Shore-  
LIJ Health System
- S. Claiborne Johnston**, Associate Vice Chancellor of Research; Director,  
Clinical and Translational Science, Institute Professor of Neurology  
and Epidemiology; Director, Neurovascular Disease and Stroke  
Center; University of California, San Francisco
- Anthony L. Komaroff**, Steven P. Simcox, Patrick A. Clifford, and James  
H. Higby Professor of Medicine; Senior Physician, Brigham and  
Women's Hospital; Harvard Medical School
- B. Paige Lawrence**, Associate Professor of Environmental Medicine;  
Associate Professor of Microbiology and Immunology, University of  
Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry
- M. Louise Markert**, Associate Professor of Pediatrics and Immunology,  
Division of Pediatric Allergy and Immunology, Department of  
Pediatrics, Duke University Medical Center

---

<sup>1</sup>Committee member resigned August 2010.

**Ruby H. N. Nguyen,**<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Division of Epidemiology and Community Health, University of Minnesota School of Public Health  
**Marc C. Patterson,** Chair, Division of Child and Adolescent Neurology; Professor of Neurology, Pediatrics, and Medical Genetics; Director, Child Neurology Training Program, Mayo Clinic  
**Hugh A. Sampson,** Professor of Pediatrics and Immunology; Dean for Translational Biomedical Sciences; Director of the Jaffe Food Allergy Institute, Mount Sinai School of Medicine  
**Pauline A. Thomas,** Associate Professor, Department of Preventive Medicine and Community Health, New Jersey Medical School; and Associate Professor, School of Public Health, University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey  
**Leslie P. Weiner,** Richard Angus Grant, Sr. Chair in Neurology; Professor of Neurology and Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California

*Study Staff*

**Kathleen Stratton,** Study Director  
**Andrew Ford,** Program Officer  
**Erin Rusch,** Research Associate  
**Trevonne Walford,** Research Assistant (from August 2009)  
**William McLeod,** Senior Research Librarian  
**Hope Hare,** Administrative Assistant  
**Amy Pryzbocki,** Financial Associate  
**Rose Marie Martinez,** Director, Board on Population Health and Public Health Practice

---

<sup>2</sup>Committee member resigned March 2010.

## Reviewers

This report has been reviewed in draft form by individuals chosen for their diverse perspectives and technical expertise, in accordance with procedures approved by the National Research Council's Report Review Committee. The purpose of this independent review is to provide candid and critical comments that will assist the institution in making its published report as sound as possible and to ensure that the report meets institutional standards for objectivity, evidence, and responsiveness to the study charge. The review comments and draft manuscript remain confidential to protect the integrity of the deliberative process. We wish to thank the following individuals for their review of this report:

**Steven Black**, Cincinnati Children's Hospital  
**Patricia K. Crumrine**, University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine  
**Anne A. Gershon**, Columbia University College of Physicians & Surgeons  
**Maric R. Griffin**, Vanderbilt University Medical Center  
**Neal Halsey**, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health  
**Diane Harper**, University of Missouri-Kansas City School of Medicine  
**Gerald T. Nepom**, University of Washington  
**Richard Platt**, Harvard Medical School  
**Stanley A. Plotkin**, University of Pennsylvania  
**Sam Shekar**, Northrop Grumman  
**Donald Silberberg**, University of Pennsylvania Medical Center



# Contents

SUMMARY	1
Charge to the Committee, 2	
Assessing the Weight of Evidence, 10	
Causality Assessment, 14	
Causality Conclusions, 17	
Susceptibility, 24	
Concluding Comment, 24	
References, 24	
1 INTRODUCTION	27
Charge to the Committee, 30	
Committee Process, 36	
Outline of the Report, 36	
References, 36	
2 APPROACH	39
Literature Searching, 40	
Weight of Evidence, 42	
Causality Assessment, 48	
Special Considerations, 54	
References, 54	

3	EVALUATING BIOLOGICAL MECHANISMS OF ADVERSE EVENTS	57
	Latency Between Antigen Exposure and Peak Adaptive Immune Response, 57	
	Immune-Mediated Mechanisms, 59	
	Viral Activity, 76	
	Injection-Related Adverse Events, 78	
	Coagulation and Hypercoagulable States, 81	
	Increased Susceptibility, 82	
	Alterations in Brain Development, 85	
	Contribution of Animal Models, 89	
	References, 91	
4	MEASLES, MUMPS, AND RUBELLA VACCINE	103
	Introduction, 103	
	Measles Inclusion Body Encephalitis, 108	
	Encephalitis and Encephalopathy, 111	
	Febrile Seizures, 119	
	Afebrile Seizures, 133	
	Meningitis, 137	
	Ataxia, 143	
	Autism, 145	
	Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 153	
	Transverse Myelitis, 154	
	Optic Neuritis, 156	
	Neuromyelitis Optica, 158	
	Multiple Sclerosis Onset in Adults, 159	
	Multiple Sclerosis Onset in Children, 164	
	Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 165	
	Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 166	
	Opsoclonus Myoclonus Syndrome, 167	
	Brachial Neuritis, 168	
	Anaphylaxis, 169	
	Transient Arthralgia in Women, 174	
	Transient Arthralgia in Children, 182	
	Chronic Arthralgia in Women, 190	
	Chronic Arthritis in Women, 195	
	Chronic Arthropathy in Children, 199	
	Arthropathy in Men, 201	
	Type 1 Diabetes, 204	
	Hepatitis, 211	
	Chronic Fatigue Syndrome, 212	
	Fibromyalgia, 213	

CONTENTS

xv

Hearing Loss, 214	
Concluding Section, 217	
References, 222	
5 VARICELLA VIRUS VACCINE	239
Introduction, 239	
Disseminated Oka VZV Without Other Organ Involvement, 242	
Disseminated Oka VZV with Other Organ Involvement, 249	
Vaccine-Strain Viral Reactivation Without Other Organ Involvement, 256	
Vaccine-Strain Viral Reactivation with Other Organ Involvement, 261	
Encephalopathy, 267	
Seizures, 268	
Cerebellar Ataxia, 269	
Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 271	
Transverse Myelitis, 272	
Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 273	
Small Fiber Neuropathy, 274	
Anaphylaxis, 275	
Onset or Exacerbation of Arthropathy, 278	
Stroke, 279	
Thrombocytopenia, 281	
Concluding Section, 282	
References, 285	
6 INFLUENZA VACCINE	293
Introduction, 293	
Encephalitis and Encephalopathy, 296	
Seizures, 301	
Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 308	
Transverse Myelitis, 309	
Optic Neuritis, 310	
Neuromyelitis Optica, 314	
Multiple Sclerosis Onset in Adults, 314	
Multiple Sclerosis Relapse in Adults, 318	
Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 321	
Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 334	
Bell's Palsy, 335	
Brachial Neuritis, 340	
Small Fiber Neuropathy, 340	
Anaphylaxis, 341	

	Inactivated Influenza Vaccine and Asthma Exacerbation or Reactive Airway Disease Episodes in Children and Adults, 345	
	Live Attenuated Influenza Vaccine and Asthma Exacerbation or Reactive Airway Disease Episodes in Children Younger Than 5 Years of Age, 356	
	Live Attenuated Influenza Vaccine and Asthma Exacerbation or Reactive Airway Disease Episodes in Persons 5 Years of Age or Older, 366	
	Onset or Exacerbation of Systemic Lupus Erythematosus, 373	
	Onset or Exacerbation of Vasculitis, 379	
	Polyarteritis Nodosa, 383	
	Onset or Exacerbation of Arthropathy, 384	
	Stroke, 386	
	Myocardial Infarction, 387	
	Fibromyalgia, 389	
	All-Cause Mortality, 390	
	Oculorespiratory Syndrome, 391	
	Concluding Section, 401	
	References, 405	
7	HEPATITIS A VACCINE	421
	Introduction, 421	
	Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 423	
	Transverse Myelitis, 424	
	Multiple Sclerosis, 425	
	Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 426	
	Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 427	
	Bell's Palsy, 427	
	Anaphylaxis, 428	
	Autoimmune Hepatitis, 429	
	Concluding Section, 430	
	References, 432	
8	HEPATITIS B VACCINE	435
	Introduction, 435	
	Encephalitis and Encephalopathy, 437	
	Seizures, 438	
	Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 440	
	Transverse Myelitis, 442	
	Optic Neuritis, 443	
	Neuromyelitis Optica, 446	
	Multiple Sclerosis Onset in Adults, 447	
	Multiple Sclerosis Onset in Children, 454	

## CONTENTS

*xvii*

Multiple Sclerosis Relapse in Adults, 455	
Multiple Sclerosis Relapse in Children, 457	
First Demyelinating Event in Adults, 458	
First Demyelinating Event in Children, 464	
Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 465	
Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 466	
Brachial Neuritis, 467	
Anaphylaxis, 468	
Erythema Nodosum, 469	
Onset or Exacerbation of Systemic Lupus Erythematosus, 471	
Onset or Exacerbation of Vasculitis, 473	
Onset or Exacerbation of Polyarteritis Nodosa, 477	
Onset or Exacerbation of Psoriatic Arthritis, 479	
Onset or Exacerbation of Reactive Arthritis, 480	
Onset or Exacerbation of Rheumatoid Arthritis, 482	
Onset or Exacerbation of Juvenile Idiopathic Arthritis, 485	
Type 1 Diabetes, 488	
Fibromyalgia, 490	
Concluding Section, 490	
References, 494	
9 HUMAN PAPILLOMAVIRUS VACCINE	505
Introduction, 505	
Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 507	
Transverse Myelitis, 508	
Neuromyelitis Optica, 509	
Multiple Sclerosis, 510	
Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 511	
Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 512	
Brachial Neuritis, 512	
Amyotrophic Lateral Sclerosis, 513	
Anaphylaxis, 515	
Transient Arthralgia, 516	
Pancreatitis, 517	
Thromboembolic Events, 519	
Hypercoagulable States, 520	
Concluding Section, 520	
References, 522	
10 DIPHTHERIA TOXOID-, TETANUS TOXOID-, AND ACELLULAR PERTUSSIS-CONTAINING VACCINES	525
Introduction, 525	
Encephalitis and Encephalopathy, 534	

Infantile Spasms, 537	
Seizures, 539	
Ataxia, 544	
Autism, 545	
Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 546	
Transverse Myelitis, 547	
Optic Neuritis, 549	
Multiple Sclerosis Onset in Adults, 550	
Multiple Sclerosis Relapse in Adults, 554	
Multiple Sclerosis Relapse in Children, 555	
Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 557	
Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 558	
Opsoclonus Myoclonus Syndrome, 560	
Bell's Palsy, 561	
Anaphylaxis, 563	
Chronic Urticaria, 565	
Serum Sickness, 566	
Arthropathy, 567	
Type 1 Diabetes, 571	
Myocarditis, 579	
Fibromyalgia, 581	
Sudden Infant Death Syndrome, 581	
Immune Thrombocytopenic Purpura, 582	
Concluding Section, 584	
References, 589	
<b>11 MENINGOCOCCAL VACCINE</b>	<b>599</b>
Introduction, 599	
Encephalitis and Encephalopathy, 602	
Acute Disseminated Encephalomyelitis, 603	
Transverse Myelitis, 604	
Multiple Sclerosis, 605	
Guillain-Barré Syndrome, 606	
Chronic Inflammatory Disseminated Polyneuropathy, 607	
Anaphylaxis, 608	
Chronic Headache, 610	
Concluding Section, 610	
References, 612	
<b>12 INJECTION-RELATED ADVERSE EVENTS</b>	<b>615</b>
Complex Regional Pain Syndrome, 615	
Deltoid Bursitis, 618	
Syncope, 620	