**Online Appendix for “Force Multipliers”: Conditional Effectiveness of Military and INGO Human Security Interventions.**

**\*Will be available at Corresponding Author’s Website upon Publication**

**Table 1: Do Humanitarian Interventions go to the “Easy” States?**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Without Humanitarian Intervention** | **With Humanitarian Intervention** |
| **CIRI Physical Integrity Rights** | 4.81 (2.30) | 3.03 (2.42) |
| **Measles Immunization** | 71.49 (22.90) | 61.28 (24.61) |
| **GDP per Capita (ln)** | 7.38 (1.55) | 6.61 (1.50) |
| **Polity (-10 to 10)** | 2.45 (7.04) | -0.08 (6.61) |

**Table 2: Treatment Regression: Impact of Humanitarian Interventions on Physical Integrity Rights**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome | Selection Process |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.14557\*\*\* |
|  |  | (0.053) |
| Lagged Mobile Phones |  | 0.00055 |
|  |  | (0.005) |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | 0.59858\*\*\* | -0.19082\*\*\* |
|  | (0.019) | (0.033) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | -0.22014\*\* | -5.36092 |
|  | (0.106) | (420.146) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.13674\*\*\* | -0.26101\*\*\* |
|  | (0.023) | (0.065) |
| Population (ln) | -0.21882\*\*\* | -0.35393\*\*\* |
|  | (0.023) | (0.057) |
| Civil Conflict | -1.00108\*\*\* | 0.12389 |
|  | (0.088) | (0.146) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.03979\*\*\* | -0.00433 |
|  | (0.005) | (0.010) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -0.02224 |  |
|  | (0.252) |  |
| Constant | 4.49376\*\*\* | 5.81920\*\*\* |
|  | (0.418) | (0.953) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,703 | 1,703 |

**LR test of indep. eqns. (rho = 0): chi2(1) = 0.45 Prob > chi2 = 0.5020**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 3: Treatment Regression: Impact of Humanitarian Interventions on Change in GDP Per Capita (ln)**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome | Selection Process |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.15188\*\*\* |
|  |  | (0.052) |
| Lagged Mobile Phones |  | 0.00081 |
|  |  | (0.005) |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | 0.00018 | -0.18839\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.033) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | 0.00197 | -5.56196 |
|  | (0.005) | (654.262) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.00120 | -0.27251\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.064) |
| Population (ln) | 0.00165 | -0.36435\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.056) |
| Civil Conflict | -0.00763\* | 0.12993 |
|  | (0.004) | (0.145) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.00007 | -0.00518 |
|  | (0.000) | (0.010) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -0.01191 |  |
|  | (0.008) |  |
| Constant | -0.01422 | 6.01526\*\*\* |
|  | (0.019) | (0.944) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,717 | 1,717 |

**LR test of indep. eqns. (rho = 0): chi2(1) = 0.39 Prob > chi2 = 0.5308**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 4: Treatment Regression: Impact of Humanitarian Interventions on Measles Immunization Rate**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome | Selection Process |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged Measles Immunization | 0.90128\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.010) |  |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | -0.06968 | -0.17952\*\*\* |
|  | (0.101) | (0.034) |
| Population (ln) | 0.02278 | -0.32196\*\*\* |
|  | (0.123) | (0.058) |
| Civil Conflict | -0.86828\* | 0.09837 |
|  | (0.485) | (0.149) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.44218\*\*\* | -0.23751\*\*\* |
|  | (0.138) | (0.065) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | 0.76511 | -5.40948 |
|  | (0.575) | (168.059) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.01588 | -0.00503 |
|  | (0.029) | (0.010) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -1.87665 |  |
|  | (1.290) |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.12273\*\* |
|  |  | (0.054) |
| Lagged Mobile Phones |  | 0.00045 |
|  |  | (0.005) |
| Constant | 5.24482\*\* | 5.23781\*\*\* |
|  | (2.275) | (0.977) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,707 | 1,707 |

**LR test of indep. eqns. (rho = 0): chi2(1) = 1.14 Prob > chi2 = 0.2849**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 5: Alternative Treatment Regression: Impact of Humanitarian Interventions on CIRI Physical Integrity Rights**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome | Selection Process |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | 0.59824\*\*\* | -0.18904\*\*\* |
|  | (0.019) | (0.033) |
| Population (ln) | -0.21858\*\*\* | -0.35234\*\*\* |
|  | (0.023) | (0.057) |
| Civil Conflict | -1.00385\*\*\* | 0.13108 |
|  | (0.088) | (0.145) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.13613\*\*\* | -0.25839\*\*\* |
|  | (0.023) | (0.060) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | -0.22172\*\* | -5.35919 |
|  | (0.106) | (428.381) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.03978\*\*\* | -0.00406 |
|  | (0.005) | (0.009) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -0.02190 |  |
|  | (0.252) |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.14497\*\*\* |
|  |  | (0.053) |
| Constant | 4.49732\*\*\* | 5.77213\*\*\* |
|  | (0.417) | (0.936) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,705 | 1,705 |

**LR test of indep. eqns. (rho = 0): chi2(1) = 0.46 Prob > chi2 = 0.4959**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 6: Alternative Treatment Regression: Impact of Humanitarian Interventions on Change in GDP Per Capita (ln)**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome | Selection Process |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | 0.00036 | -0.18573\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.033) |
| Population (ln) | 0.00166 | -0.36328\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.056) |
| Civil Conflict | -0.00688\* | 0.14228 |
|  | (0.004) | (0.144) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.00129 | -0.26734\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.059) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | 0.00236 | -4.97291 |
|  | (0.005) | (149.171) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.00006 | -0.00499 |
|  | (0.000) | (0.009) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -0.01156 |  |
|  | (0.008) |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.15108\*\*\* |
|  |  | (0.052) |
| Constant | -0.01607 | 5.95652\*\*\* |
|  | (0.019) | (0.926) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,720 | 1,720 |

**LR test of indep. eqns. (rho = 0): chi2(1) = 0.42 Prob > chi2 = 0.5171**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 7: Alternative Treatment Regression: Impact of Humanitarian Interventions on Measles Immunization**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome | Selection Process |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged Measles Immunization | 0.90177\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.010) |  |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | -0.06646 | -0.17766\*\*\* |
|  | (0.101) | (0.033) |
| Population (ln) | 0.02584 | -0.31965\*\*\* |
|  | (0.123) | (0.058) |
| Civil Conflict | -0.85862\* | 0.10360 |
|  | (0.485) | (0.148) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.43725\*\*\* | -0.23589\*\*\* |
|  | (0.138) | (0.060) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | 0.77240 | -5.42397 |
|  | (0.575) | (178.454) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.01628 | -0.00480 |
|  | (0.029) | (0.009) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -1.86988 |  |
|  | (1.290) |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.12206\*\* |
|  |  | (0.054) |
| Constant | 5.17202\*\* | 5.18664\*\*\* |
|  | (2.270) | (0.957) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,708 | 1,708 |

**LR test of indep. eqns. (rho = 0): chi2(1) = 1.14 Prob > chi2 = 0.2848**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 8: Two-Stage Least Squares: Impact of Human Rights INGOs on Physical Integrity Rights Outcome**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome Stage | First Stage |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | 0.0452457\*\*\* |
|  |  | (.0118287) |
| Lagged Mobile Phones |  | .0056785\*\*\* |
|  |  | (.0008319) |
| Human Rights INGOs (ln) | 0.15753 |  |
|  | (0.345) |  |
| Lagged CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | 0.58379\*\*\* | .0163681\*\* |
|  | (0.021) | (.0070479) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.13507\*\* | .1008774\*\*\* |
|  | (0.063) | (.0131946) |
| Population (ln) | -0.24298\*\*\* | .1675412\*\*\* |
|  | (0.074) | (.0119753) |
| Civil Conflict | -1.00308\*\*\* | .0411655 |
|  | (0.101) | (.0344139) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | -0.27186\*\* | -.049852 |
|  | (0.120) | (.0413788) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.03436\*\*\* | .0277515\*\*\* |
|  | (0.011) | (.0021918) |
| Constant | 4.43941\*\*\* | -.5387511 |
|  | (0.616) | (.1940588) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,372 |  |
| R-squared | 0.739 |  |

**Durbin-Wu-Hausman chi-sq test: 0.13866 Chi-sq(1) P-value = 0.7096**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 9: Two-Stage Least Squares: Impact of Sustainable Development INGOs on Change in GDP Per Capita (ln)**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome Stage | First Stage |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | .0587376\*\*\* |
|  |  | (.0118639) |
| Lagged Mobile Phones |  | .0063499\*\*\* |
|  |  | (.0008419) |
| Sustainable Development INGOs (ln) | 0.03357\*\* |  |
|  | (0.014) |  |
| CIRI PHYSICAL INTEGRITY RIGHTS | -0.00057 | .0242259\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (.0074561) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | -0.00597\*\* | .091966\*\*\* |
|  | (0.003) | (.0132161) |
| Population (ln) | -0.00532 | .1746184\*\*\* |
|  | (0.003) | (.0121663) |
| Civil Conflict | -0.01021\*\* | .0120809 |
|  | (0.005) | (.0353015) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | 0.00771 | -.1162634\*\*\* |
|  | (0.006) | (.0412686) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | -0.00051 | .034954\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (.0022346) |
| Constant | -0.00878 | .6469868 \*\*\* |
|  | (0.022) | (.1974478) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,386 |  |
| R-squared | 0.007 |  |

**Durbin-Wu-Hausman chi-sq test: 1.71377 Chi-sq(1) P-value = 0.19050**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 10: Two-Stage Least Squares: Impact of Sustainable Development INGOs on Measles Immunization**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) |
| VARIABLES | Outcome Stage | First Stage |
|  |  |  |
| Lagged News Media Coverage (ln) |  | .0548619\*\*\*  (.0116272) |
| Lagged Mobile Phones |  | .0065346\*\*\* |
|  |  | (.0008166) |
| Sustainable Development INGOs (ln) | 0.06230 |  |
|  | (1.662) |  |
| Lagged Measles Immunization | 0.89557\*\*\* | -.0017522\*\* |
|  | (0.012) | (.0007056) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.58841\* | .1169614\*\*\* |
|  | (0.355) | (.0128753) |
| Population (ln) | 0.09256 | .1707247\*\*\* |
|  | (0.376) | (.0115951) |
| Civil Conflict | -0.99119\*\* | -.0492325 |
|  | (0.497) | (.0303754) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | 0.74029 | -.0915288\*\* |
|  | (0.674) | (.0400147) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.00959 | .0365128\*\*\* |
|  | (0.069) | (.0020864) |
| Constant | 2.60740 | .8000269\*\*\* |
|  | (2.284) | (.1867663) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 1,401 |  |
| R-squared | 0.867 |  |

**Durbin-Wu-Hausman chi-sq test: 0.31422 Chi-sq(1) P-value = 0.57510**

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 11: Order Probit: Influence of Joint Humanitarian Military Interventions and Human Rights INGOs on CIRI Physical Integrity Rights**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
|  | Post Civil Conflict/ Disaster | Post Disaster | Post Civil Conflict | Post Civil Conflict/ Disaster | Post Disaster | Post Civil Conflict |
| **VARIABLES** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Population (ln) | -0.22837\*\*\* | -0.23592\*\*\* | -0.13516\*\*\* | -0.22891\*\*\* | -0.23687\*\*\* | -0.12966\*\*\* |
|  | (0.016) | (0.016) | (0.032) | (0.016) | (0.016) | (0.032) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 0.28202\*\*\* | 0.29690\*\*\* | 0.12632\*\*\* | 0.28751\*\*\* | 0.30028\*\*\* | 0.14212\*\*\* |
|  | (0.018) | (0.018) | (0.035) | (0.018) | (0.018) | (0.035) |
| Civil Conflict | -1.27076\*\*\* | -1.26410\*\*\* | -0.87438\*\*\* | -1.26809\*\*\* | -1.25997\*\*\* | -0.88315\*\*\* |
|  | (0.068) | (0.071) | (0.082) | (0.068) | (0.071) | (0.083) |
| Human Rights INGOs (ln) | -0.14701\*\*\* | -0.15634\*\*\* | 0.00686 | -0.16724\*\*\* | -0.16826\*\*\* | -0.08279 |
|  | (0.040) | (0.041) | (0.072) | (0.040) | (0.041) | (0.074) |
| **Humanitarian Intervention \* Human Rights INGOs (ln)** |  |  |  | **0.50781\*\*\*** | **0.34967\*** | **0.97690\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  | **(0.169)** | **(0.189)** | **(0.170)** |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -0.55702\*\*\* | -0.43480\*\*\* | -0.34254\*\*\* | -1.99002\*\*\* | -1.42691\*\*\* | -3.10615\*\*\* |
|  | (0.103) | (0.111) | (0.131) | (0.486) | (0.545) | (0.490) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | -0.44658\*\*\* | -0.43517\*\*\* | -0.31276\*\*\* | -0.45240\*\*\* | -0.43817\*\*\* | -0.34928\*\*\* |
|  | (0.071) | (0.073) | (0.101) | (0.072) | (0.073) | (0.103) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | 0.05389\*\*\* | 0.05294\*\*\* | 0.02557\*\*\* | 0.05401\*\*\* | 0.05307\*\*\* | 0.02428\*\*\* |
|  | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.007) | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.007) |
| Cut 1 | -4.63779\*\*\* | -4.68550\*\*\* | -3.15446\*\*\* | -4.67789\*\*\* | -4.71581\*\*\* | -3.26999\*\*\* |
|  | (0.268) | (0.270) | (0.585) | (0.268) | (0.271) | (0.593) |
| Cut 2 | -4.02733\*\*\* | -4.08077\*\*\* | -2.56324\*\*\* | -4.06277\*\*\* | -4.10993\*\*\* | -2.66530\*\*\* |
|  | (0.262) | (0.264) | (0.581) | (0.262) | (0.264) | (0.588) |
| Cut 3 | -3.50494\*\*\* | -3.54681\*\*\* | -2.01977\*\*\* | -3.53772\*\*\* | -3.57517\*\*\* | -2.11086\*\*\* |
|  | (0.259) | (0.261) | (0.578) | (0.259) | (0.261) | (0.584) |
| Cut 4 | -3.06740\*\*\* | -3.10583\*\*\* | -1.62128\*\*\* | -3.09945\*\*\* | -3.13405\*\*\* | -1.70723\*\*\* |
|  | (0.257) | (0.258) | (0.575) | (0.257) | (0.259) | (0.581) |
| Cut 5 | -2.49463\*\*\* | -2.54237\*\*\* | -1.17872\*\* | -2.52572\*\*\* | -2.57003\*\*\* | -1.25758\*\* |
|  | (0.255) | (0.257) | (0.575) | (0.255) | (0.258) | (0.581) |
| Cut 6 | -1.95683\*\*\* | -2.00391\*\*\* | -0.65933 | -1.98726\*\*\* | -2.03099\*\*\* | -0.73158 |
|  | (0.255) | (0.256) | (0.574) | (0.255) | (0.257) | (0.579) |
| Cut 7 | -1.40859\*\*\* | -1.45087\*\*\* | -0.05373 | -1.43919\*\*\* | -1.47795\*\*\* | -0.12268 |
|  | (0.254) | (0.256) | (0.570) | (0.254) | (0.256) | (0.575) |
| Cut 8 | -0.58742\*\* | -0.61903\*\* | 0.48569 | -0.61715\*\* | -0.64548\*\* | 0.42441 |
|  | (0.255) | (0.257) | (0.567) | (0.255) | (0.258) | (0.570) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 2,473 | 2,392 | 734 | 2,473 | 2,392 | 734 |

Robust standard errors in parentheses, All variables lagged one year \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Table 12: Tobit: Influence of Joint Humanitarian Military Interventions and Sustainable Development INGOs on Measles Immunization Rates**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
|  | Post Civil Conflict/ Disaster | Post Disaster | Post Civil Conflict | Post Civil Conflict/ Disaster | Post Disaster | Post Civil Conflict |
| **VARIABLES** |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| CIRI Physical Integrity Rights | -1.19539\*\*\* | -1.25210\*\*\* | -2.03583\*\*\* | -1.12034\*\*\* | -1.15199\*\*\* | -1.74115\*\*\* |
|  | (0.268) | (0.271) | (0.431) | (0.267) | (0.270) | (0.434) |
| Population (ln) | -2.63014\*\*\* | -2.58346\*\*\* | -2.68310\*\*\* | -2.62651\*\*\* | -2.56016\*\*\* | -2.85604\*\*\* |
|  | (0.395) | (0.396) | (0.774) | (0.393) | (0.393) | (0.743) |
| GDP per Capita (ln) | 4.17435\*\*\* | 4.32200\*\*\* | 6.52205\*\*\* | 4.03818\*\*\* | 4.09318\*\*\* | 6.26550\*\*\* |
|  | (0.340) | (0.344) | (0.611) | (0.342) | (0.347) | (0.616) |
| Civil Conflict | -8.90646\*\*\* | -8.72601\*\*\* | -8.05337\*\*\* | -8.65402\*\*\* | -8.53975\*\*\* | -7.32578\*\*\* |
|  | (1.304) | (1.325) | (1.743) | (1.299) | (1.309) | (1.746) |
| Sustainable Development INGOs (ln) | 9.98626\*\*\* | 9.60633\*\*\* | 13.12271\*\*\* | 10.43948\*\*\* | 10.29087\*\*\* | 14.75660\*\*\* |
|  | (0.985) | (0.991) | (1.920) | (0.996) | (1.007) | (1.986) |
| **Humanitarian Intervention \* Sustainable Development INGOs (ln)** |  |  |  | -10.50735\*\*\* | -15.80353\*\*\* | -13.88950\*\*\* |
|  |  |  |  | (2.978) | (2.554) | (4.076) |
| Humanitarian Intervention | -3.45087\* | -3.19819 | -0.32692 | 40.94804\*\*\* | 63.26555\*\*\* | 59.02528\*\*\* |
|  | (1.972) | (2.087) | (2.854) | (12.909) | (10.620) | (18.196) |
| Non-Humanitarian Intervention | -1.11342 | -1.67261 | 1.22354 | -0.92576 | -1.42646 | 2.09854 |
|  | (1.374) | (1.394) | (1.926) | (1.373) | (1.393) | (1.946) |
| Polity (-10 to 10) | -0.10845 | -0.14042 | -0.09332 | -0.11044 | -0.14756\* | -0.08574 |
|  | (0.086) | (0.086) | (0.154) | (0.085) | (0.086) | (0.152) |
| Constant | 46.12259\*\*\* | 46.57380\*\*\* | 16.46940 | 44.54860\*\*\* | 44.18361\*\*\* | 12.24044 |
|  | (5.749) | (5.778) | (11.814) | (5.722) | (5.748) | (11.469) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 2,317 | 2,261 | 693 | 2,317 | 2,261 | 693 |

Robust standard errors in parentheses, All variables lagged one year

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

**Figure 1: Histogram of Measles Immunization Rates in Sample**

