

MS-24 • Class Kit • Discussion Catalyst

Where Does AI Cross the Line?

When does AI helping become AI doing it for you? This class kit uses a live AI prompt to build both sides, then lets the class draw the line.

[Start the discussion](#)

[Jump to kit preview](#)

DISCUSSION PROGRESS

0 XP

Level 1: Question Holder

- Pose the dilemma
- Run the live AI prompt
- Build both cases
- Map the line
- Debate where your line sits
- Finish in class

Teacher-facing discussion catalyst

The class question: **When does using AI in creative work cross a line?**

The discussion stays in class. Students do not send work to Vanguard Scholar. The goal is not to ban AI or celebrate AI. The goal is to build a thoughtful line between help and replacement.

1 Start with the scenario

Put one real-feeling dilemma on the board. Keep it simple.

DISPLAY SCENARIO

A student used AI to write most of a poem. Is the final poem still creative work by the student?

Ask students to silently choose one starting position: **yes**, **no**, or **it depends**. No debate yet. First, build the strongest version of both sides.

THOUGHT BULB

The tricky part is that “AI helped me” can mean many different things: brainstorming, fixing spelling, changing a line, writing a full draft, or making the whole piece.

☐ I understand the dilemma and the first silent vote.

2 Use AI live to build both sides

The teacher types this live into ChatGPT, Claude, or Gemini.

Keep the AI output visible. The class should see that AI can argue both positions.

LIVE TEACHER PROMPT

A student used AI to write most of a poem.

Build the strongest case that it is still creative work by the student – and the strongest case that it is not.

Write for a Grade 9 to Grade 12 classroom.

For each side, give:

1. Three strong arguments
2. One example
3. One weakness in that side

Do not decide the answer for us. The class will debate where the line sits.

Copy live prompt

CAUTION BOARD

AI may sound confident. That does not mean it settled the issue. The class must interrogate the output, not treat it as the final answer.

☐

I ran or prepared the live AI prompt to build both sides.

3

Build the two strongest cases

Do not make either side silly. That is how debates get lazy.

Case A: Still creative

The student chose the topic, selected the draft, edited it, and decided what the final poem should say.

Case B: Not really creative

If AI wrote most of the poem, the main language, rhythm, and images may not belong to the student.

THOUGHT BULB

Strong thinking means you can explain the side you disagree with. That does not weaken your view. It makes your view sharper.

☐

I can explain the strongest case on both sides.

4 Map the creativity line

Where does “helping” become “doing it for you”?

Put these five steps on the board. Students stand, vote, or mark where they think the line is crossed.

1 Brainstorming

AI gives topic ideas.
Student writes.

2 Feedback

AI points out weak
lines. Student edits.

3 Options

AI gives versions.
Student chooses and
rewrites.

4 Heavy drafting

AI writes most of the
poem. Student
tweaks.

5 Replacement

AI makes the whole
piece. Student adds
their name.

CLASS MOVE

Ask: “At which number does the student stop being the main creator?”

☐ I mapped the five levels of AI help and replacement.

Teacher Class Kit Preview

Use this as the 4-page Discussion Catalyst kit copy.

PAGE 1 • OUTCOMES + SETUP

When Does AI Cross the Line?

By the end of this 40-minute class, students will be able to: (1) describe different levels of AI help in creative work, (2) build arguments on both sides of a real creative dilemma, and (3) state where their own line sits and why.

Materials: Projector or shared screen, one AI tool such as ChatGPT, Claude, or Gemini, board/marker, notebooks.

Class stance: AI is not automatically cheating and not automatically authorship. The question is what the student actually contributed.

40-minute discussion flow

Step 1 • 5 min: Display the scenario: “A student used AI to write most of a poem. Is it still their creative work?” Students silently vote yes/no/depends.

Step 2 • 8 min: Teacher uses AI live: “Build the strongest case it is still creative — and the strongest case it isn’t.”

Step 3 • 10 min: Board split: STILL CREATIVE / NOT REALLY CREATIVE. Add the strongest three points from each side.

Step 4 • 12 min: Use the five-level line: brainstorming, feedback, options, heavy drafting, replacement. Students decide where the line is crossed.

Step 5 • 5 min: Exit line: “My line is crossed when _____ because _____.”

Where is your line?

1. If AI suggests a poem topic, is the poem still yours?
2. If AI fixes spelling and punctuation, is the poem still yours?
3. If AI gives three versions and you choose one, what must you edit to make it yours?
4. If AI writes most of the poem but you change the title and five words, is that enough?
5. What matters more: the idea, the words, the editing, or honesty about the process?
6. Should a student be allowed to submit AI-assisted creative work if they clearly explain how AI was used?

TEACHER MOVE

When students say “it depends,” ask: “Depends on what exactly?” Push them to name the rule, not just the feeling.

My AI creativity line

Students write one paragraph: **When does AI helping become AI doing it for you?**

The paragraph should include: one example of acceptable help, one example that crosses the line, and one sentence explaining the student's rule.

Honour-code closer: "If I use AI in creative work, I should be able to explain what I made, what AI made, and what I changed."

Discussion stays in class. Students do not send work to Vanguard Scholar.

Vanguard Scholar - vanguard-scholar.org - Free forever. No login required.

☐

I reviewed the 4-page Discussion Catalyst kit.

Final 5-minute move

Write your own line. Not AI's line. Yours.

My line is crossed when...

Example: My line is crossed when AI writes the main words and I only make tiny changes, because the main creative choices are no longer mine.

☐ I can name one type of AI help that feels okay.

☐ I can name one type of AI use that crosses the line.

☐ I wrote my own rule for creative AI use.

EXIT LINE

“My line is crossed when _____ because _____.”

Print kit

Back to top

Vanguard Scholar — Smart questions. Smarter answers. You, upgraded.

Made with care. No data collected.

Questions? Teachers and parents, write to us. Students, speak with your teacher or a grown-up first.