



마틴 냅 Martin W. Knapp, 1853-1901 하나님의 성서학원 (God's Bible School)의 창립자

서울신학대학교 성결신학연구회 주최  
서울신학대학교 글로벌사중복음연구소 주관  
창립기념제 1회 국제학술세미나

## 오순절 성결운동 지도자 마틴 냅과 21세기 한국성결교회

발표자 1 : **Dr. David D. Bundy**

(New York Theological Seminary, 세계기독교연구교수)

발표자 2 : **이연승 박사**

(Boston University, Th.D.)

논찬 : **최인식 교수** (글로벌사중복음연구소 소장)

2014. 3. 10.(월) 오후 2시

서울신학대학교 100주년기념관 512호 영성실습실



## □ 학술 대회 행사순서

사회 : 오성현 교수

시간	내용	순서담당	비고
14:00 - 14:20	개회인사	유석성 총장	
14:20 - 14:30	개회기도	박명수 교수	
14:30 - 15:30	발표 1	Dr. David Bundy	통, 번역 : 박창훈 교수
15:30 - 15:40	Coffee Break		
15:40 - 16:30	발표 2	이연승 박사	영문원고, 한국어발표
16:30 - 16:50	논찬 및 소감	최인식 교수	
16:50 - 17:00	광고 및 폐회기도	사회자	

## □ 광고

1. 글로벌사중복음연구소(GIFT) 창립기념 제1차 국제학술세미나를 개최하게 됨을 하나님께 감사드립니다. <사중복음연구프로젝트 2013~2017>은 서울신학대학교의 지원과 성결교단의 협력으로 진행되고 있습니다. 총장님과 교수님들의 적극적인 지지와 협력에 감사드립니다.
2. 오늘 학술세미나에 순서를 맡아 수고해주신 모든 분들께 진심으로 감사드립니다.
3. 학술세미나에 참여해주신 교내외 교수님들, 박사님들, 학생 여러분들께 감사드립니다. 그리고 관심을 갖고 동참해주신 목회자님들께 감사드립니다.
4. 본 연구소장 최인식 교수님의 책 『예수의 바람, 성령의 바람: 사중복음 정신과 21세기 교회 혁신』이 <사중복음 신학시리즈 No.1>으로 출판되었습니다. 오늘 참석하신 분들께는 50% 할인하여 판매합니다(이후에는 20%, 모든 수익은 연구소 후원비로 사용됩니다).
5. <사중복음 고전시리즈 No.1>으로 마틴 념의 주저인 『오순절 하늘의 번갯불』과 성신연 4인의 연구교수들이 집필한 『초기성결운동 지도자들의 생애와 사상』이 <사중복음 논총시리즈 No.1>로 4월 28일(예정) 개소식에 즈음하여 출간될 예정입니다.
6. 연구소는 매달 정기적으로 공개 콜로키움을 진행하고 있습니다. 관심 있는 분들의 적극적인 참여를 바랍니다.
7. 연구소 개소식과 창립 기념 제2차 국제학술세미나가 2014년 4월 28일 오후 2시에 예정되어 있습니다. 많은 관심과 기도로 동참해주시면 감사하겠습니다.
8. 오늘 참석하신 모든 분들은 함께 사진촬영에 임해주시기 바랍니다.
9. 내빈들을 위하여 저녁식사를 준비하였습니다. 꼭 참석하여 주시기 바랍니다.

## 인사말

서울신학대학교 글로벌사중복음연구소는 21세기 세계교회의 신학혁신과 목회혁신을 위해 성결운동의 전통과 신학의 요체인 '사중복음'을 전문적으로 연구하기 위하여 설립된 초교파적 글로벌 신학 연구기관입니다.

사중복음은 예수께서 전하신 임박한 하나님의 나라를 알리며, 지구상의 모든 민족이 그 나라에 참여토록 요청하는 성서적 케리그마(선포)입니다. 사중복음은 철저한 하나님 나라 중심의 세계관을 보여주며, 예수 그리스도의 십자가 정신과 성령세례를 통해 열려지는 거룩한 삶으로 우리를 이끕니다. 주님의 교회들이 이러한 사중복음의 정신과 그 능력으로 날마다 새로운 존재로 살아갈 수 있도록 사중복음의 전통과 정신을 연구하기 위하여 본 연구소가 태어났습니다.

사중복음과 그 정신을 올바르게 그리고 깊이 있게 알기 위해서는 무엇보다도 사중복음을 선포하고 그 정신으로 살았던 성결교회 창립자들과 그들을 중심으로 한 소위 19세기 '래디컬 성결운동' 그룹의 활동 모습을 자세히 들여다 볼 수 있어야 할 것입니다. 이를 위하여 본 연구소는 창립을 기념하여 만국성결교회 창립을 주도했던 마틴 냅(Martin W. Knapp, 1853-1901)에 초점을 맞추었습니다.

오늘 발제를 맡아주신 데이비드 번디(David Bundy) 박사님은 이 분야의 최고 전문가로 알려진 대학자이십니다. 그리고 이연승 박사님은 서울대, 서울신대학대학원을 거쳐 보스턴 대학교에서 교회사 분야를 연구하여 신학박사 학위를 취득하신 탁월한 역사학자이십니다. 이 박사님의 연구는 학문을 위한 학을 넘어 그 가운데서 영적 에너지를 드러내는 데까지 나갑니다. 두 학자의 귀한 연구논문은 글로벌사중복음 연구소의 발전에 커다란 밑거름이 될 것을 의심치 않습니다.

무엇보다도 성결교단의 목회적, 신학적, 선교적 도약을 위해 본 연구소를 창립케 하시고 인적, 재정적 지원을 아끼지 않으시는 유석성 총장님께 깊이 감사를 드리는 바입니다. 또한, 대학의 동료 교수님들과 후배 학자들의 적극적인 지지와 성원에 감사드립니다. 아울러, 성/신/연 위원님들과 연구교수님들(남태욱, 박문수, 장혜선, 홍용표 박사)의 헌신에 감사드립니다. 현대기독교역사연구소 소장 박창훈 교수님과 조교들의 수고에 고마운 마음을 표합니다.

그리고 성결교회의 미래를 내다보며 사중복음의 신학적, 목회적 가치를 살리고자 하여 글로벌사중복음 연구소의 취지에 동참해주시는 목회자님들께 더욱 깊이 감사드리는 바입니다. 마지막으로 본 연구소의 사역을 위해 기꺼이 후원하시고 동참하시는 교단본부의 우순태 총무님과 특히 교육국의 유윤종 국장님과 강신덕 목사님께 심심한 감사의 말씀을 드립니다.

본 국제학술세미나를 통해 우리 모두에게 귀한 깨달음의 시간이 되기를 기원합니다!

2014. 3. 10

연구소장 최 인 식 드림

## □ 발표자 소개

### 제1발표 번디 박사



#### ■ 학력:

Seattle Pacific University (B.A.)  
Asbury Theological Seminary M.Div./Th.M.)  
Uppsala University (D.Th.)

#### ■ 학위논문:

“Visions of Apostolic Mission: Scandinavian  
Pentecostal Mission to 1935.”  
(Th.D. dissertation, Uppsala University, 2009).

“Scripture and Exegesis in the Epistle  
of Barnabus.” Th.M. dissertation, Asbury  
Theological Seminary, 1973.

#### ■ 주요저서:

*Visions of Apostolic Mission: Scandinavian  
Pentecostal Mission to 1935.* Uppsala,  
Sweden: Uppsala University Library, 2009.

### 제2발표 이연승 박사



#### ■ 학력:

서울대학교 영어교육과 (B.A.)  
서울신학대학교 신학대학원 (M.Div.)  
보스턴대학교 신학대학원 (S.T.M./Th.D.)

#### ■ 학위논문:

“Between Nationalism and Internationalism:  
The YMCA and Yun Chi-ho in Colonial Korea.”  
(Th.D. dissertation, Boston University School  
of Theology, 2011).

“Women in Korean Protestantism:  
The Expansion of Their Participation  
in the World Mission (1886–1945).”  
S.T.M. dissertation, Boston University  
School of Theology, 2000.

#### ■ 주요저서:

맥시 더남, 『영적 훈련』, 이연승 역 (세북, 2002).

# “Religion for Modernity: Martin Wells Knapp and the Radical Holiness Network of the American Progressive Era”

David Bundy  
Research Professor of World Christianity  
New York Theological Seminary

2014. 3. 10(월) 오후 2:00, 서울신학대학교 100주년기념관 512호 영성실습실에서

---

Martin Wells Knapp (1853-1901) is a complicated figure, both for the historian and for his current admirers. He was a strident Radical Holiness advocate, a spottily educated pastor, an evangelist, a significant religious publisher, a journalist, the founder of God’s Bible School in Cincinnati and of camp-meetings in Ohio and Kentucky; he worked vigorously to feed and clothe the poor and he was a promoter of divine healing while not fighting against the medical professions. He was a self-proclaimed social and religious radical. He was arrested for disturbing the peace; the worship conducted by him at the religious services was too loud.<sup>1)</sup> He was censored and tried by the Methodist Episcopal Church for preaching at a camp-meeting outside his “parish.” He had long argued for staying within one’s original denomination to work for the renewal of its spirituality and mission, but separated from the Methodist Episcopal Church just before his death because of perceived and real persecution of him and his Holiness colleagues. Knapp was influential, controversial, honored and debated in traditions that owed their existence to his ideas and influence.

## Why is Martin Wells Knapp Important?

Knapp’s role in the Radical Holiness Network<sup>2)</sup> was enhanced by both his publishing and God’s Bible School in Cincinnati. His connections, and those of the Radical Holiness Network of which he was a part, are crucial for understanding world Christianity.

Among the early students at God’s Bible School were William Seymour, founder of

---

1) “Brother Knapp Arrested,” *God’s Revivalist* 13, 29 (18 July 1901): 15.

2) The Radical Holiness network was a complex phenomenon that has not yet received the scholarly attention it deserves. For an initial paradigm of this tradition, see Appendix I.

the Azusa Street Mission which caught the attention and imagination of Holiness persons and others around the world resulting in Pentecostalism as it is known today.<sup>3)</sup> Tomlinson, an Indiana Quaker, attended at God's Bible School and went on to form two Pentecostal denominations, the Church of God (Cleveland) and the Church of God of Prophecy. Glenn Cook was the key link between the Azusa Street Revival and the conversion of C. H. Mason's church in Nashville to Pentecostalism and in its becoming the mother church of the Church of God in Christ (and for a time of what became the Assemblies of God). Cook was also the key figure in the acceptance of the "oneness" theology by the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World. He was important for Holiness developments in Japan and Korea: J. Nakada, Charles and Lettie Cowman and the Kilbournes were among the "students" at God's Bible School and John Thomas had deep connections to the institution. These were among the eventual founders of the Oriental Missionary Society (OMS), the Holiness Church of Japan; and the Evangelical Holiness churches of Korea.<sup>4)</sup>

The Radical Holiness Churches were deeply indebted to Knapp and to God's Bible School. Among them were the founders of the Pilgrim Holiness Church (1922).<sup>5)</sup> These individuals were part of the network of God's Bible School and Knapp, as were the founders of the even more radical Metropolitan Church Association which was initially modeled after Knapp's ministry and the group that ordained Charles Cowman to the Christian ministry. The Pentecost Bands of the Free Methodist Church, forced out of that denomination for being too radical in their evangelism and social vision, made common cause with Knapp, as did the Vanguard Mission of St. Louis. As a result missionaries across the USA and around the world came to be represented in Knapp's periodicals and influenced by them. Through them, writings of Knapp and of other "radicals" were translated into various languages, including Norwegian and from that language into others, influencing Holiness churches and then Pentecostal churches throughout Scandinavia, and through their mission programs throughout the world.

The influence of Knapp was also seen in the Church of the Nazarene. Among his closest associates were C. W. Ruth, J. O. McClurkan, Seth Cook Rees, and A. M. Hills, all

---

3) During 1991 in Indianapolis, I interviewed older Pentecostals who were children during the early days of Pentecostalism in Indianapolis. Several remembered the visit of Seymour to Indianapolis and remembered the name of the school to which he had gone after his initial time in Indianapolis in the late 1890s: God's Bible School. None of the persons interviewed had had personal contacts with God's Bible School and so there was minimal possibility of contamination of memories. Unfortunately the records at God's Bible School are not complete and his name has not been found in those files (discussions with President Avery and Wallace Omer Thornton, 1991).

4) Note that the Cowmans and Kilbournes were part of the community of God's Bible School. Both couples wrote for *God's Revivalist*. Their financial support came, in fits and starts, from their connections in the national Radical Holiness network as well as from their friendships in Cincinnati. See for example: Charles and Lettie Cowman, "Called to Japan," *Revivalist* 12, 46 (15 November 1900): 9; and Edwin L. Kilbourne, "God-given privileges," *Revivalist* 12, 47 (22 November 1900): 9, in which he is praising Nakada and grateful for the work of Nakada in Japan.

5) The relationship of the eventual Pilgrim Holiness Church to the Associations developed by Knapp is very complicated and are beyond what can be included in this lecture.

of whom played key roles in the establishment of what was originally called the Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene. Other future leaders of the Church of the Nazarene were from the orbit of God's Bible School and the Radical Holiness network. While the Church of the Nazarene prefers to trace its intellectual lineage to the more socially elevated "parlor holiness" of Phoebe Palmer, it would probably be more accurate to trace its lineage through the radical Holiness of Martin Wells Knapp and his colleagues. Palmer was generally detached from the social issues of her day and practiced a non-confrontational Holiness evangelism. Knapp and many of the early Nazarenes from his network were the opposite.

It is noteworthy that God's Bible School also attracted a significant faculty: among its professors in the early period were A. M. Hills, W. B. Godbey and Oswald Chambers. As well, Knapp, through his publishing made theologians like G. D. Watson, Beverly Carradine, Samuel A. Keen, A. M. Hills, Seth Cook Rees, Abbie C. Morrow (who later became a Pentecostal evangelist and theologian) and W. B. Godbey household names within the Holiness Movement and Holiness Methodism. Books he published were cited, reprinted, plagiarized, reinterpreted, and translated around the world. *The Revivalist* (and later titles) was also an important stimulus and support gave a platform and promotion to Holiness missionaries. Many independent Holiness missionaries from the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century were beholden to Knapp's periodical for their larger economic bases.

Despite the fact that Knapp was never the leader of organizations other than the ones he created, and those did not become very large or important in traditional ways, his influence and that of the Radical Holiness movement upon World Christianity was wide and deep. As it turned out the traditions and people he influenced have created two of the largest, if most fractious, Christian communions of the twenty-first century.

Because of the image that developed of Knapp as a key figure in the Radical Holiness networks, many myths have evolved concerning him, often promoted by enthusiastic adherents. The Radical Holiness Network did not spawn research institutions that determine the interpretation of historical traditions. The Radical Holiness adherents often strained and sometimes broke the mores of social respectability in their quest to be heard from positions of social powerlessness. Indeed the Radical Holiness Network eventually became so alienated from its competitors and its derivatives, that it has been essentially ignored in the historiography and considered marginal. How then have scholars dealt with the socially and ecclesiastically marginal trajectories represented by Martin Wells Knapp and with Knapp himself? It is to this issue that we now turn our attention.

## **What are categories for understanding Knapp?**

How is the life and work of such a person to be understood, when he stood at the margins of his church, of society, and whose institutions, the ones he inspired and/or created, in Knapp's case God's Bible School, seem detached from the modern

American religious and social “main stream”?

While Knapp is important, the study of Knapp has only recently been undertaken as other than an example to support a theory. This is generally true of the Radical Holiness Movement which has generally ignored. If it were better known, it would be subsumed under that vast number who are considered to be on the fringes of religion. Studies of religion have for decades tended to understand religious radicals on the fringe of what was considered polite society as anti-modern, as for example both Richard Hofstadter and Charles Taylor.<sup>6)</sup>

Scholars who took the religion of the fringes seriously have searched for paradigms to aid understanding. Robert Mapes Anderson used sociological and Marxist theory to analyze Pentecostalism as the “Vision of the Disinherited.”<sup>7)</sup> Others such as Ann Taves and Rhodri Hayward have understood the movements to be constructions of “interior empires”<sup>8)</sup> Others have understood these American traditions as “Primitivist” and “restorationists” because of frequent calls to “restore” early/primitive Christianity including Richard Hughes and Grant Wacker;<sup>9)</sup> Theological categories were used by Donald Dayton and D. William Faupel. Dayton focused on the “Four-fold Gospel” placing Pentecostalism and the Holiness movement into a theological nexus most popularly understood as the legacy of A. B. Simpson and Aimee Semple McPherson. D. William Faupel argued that eschatology was the key factor for understanding the origins and development of Pentecostalism.<sup>10)</sup>

The process of working to understand Knapp in particular began almost immediately after his death with the biography of his close friend and Radical Holiness colleague, A. M. Hills that will be discussed below. Hills interpreted him as “one of those Divine surprises,” a great man of God who worked on behalf of others and who

---

6) Richard Hofstadter, *The Age of Reform: From Bryan to F.D.R.* (New York: Random House, 1955); Charles Taylor, *Variations of Religions Today: William James Revisited* (Cambridge, London: Harvard University Press, 2002), and, *idem*, *A Secular Age* (Cambridge, London: Harvard University Press, 2007).

7) Robert Mapes Anderson, *Vision of the Disinherited: The Making of American Pentecostalism* (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1979).

8) Ann Taves, *Trances and Visions: Experiencing Religion and Explaining Experiences from Wesley to James* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999); Rhodri Hayward, “From the Millennial Future to the Unconscious Past: The transformation of prophecy in early twentieth-century Britain,” in *Prophecy: The Power of Inspired Language in History 1300-2000*, ed. Bertrand Taithe and Tim Thornton (Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1997); and, *idem*, “Popular Mysticism and the Origins of the New Psychology, 1810-1910” (Diss., University of Lancaster, 1995); and *idem*, *Resisting History: Religious Transcendence and the Development of the Unconscious* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2007).

9) Richard Hughes, *The American Quest for the Primitive Church* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1988); *The Primitive Church in the Modern World* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1995); *idem*, with Crawford Leonard Allen, *Illusions of Innocence: Protestant Primitivism in America 1630-1975* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988); and Grant Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals (and American Culture)* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2001).

10) Donald W. Dayton, *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism* (Studies in Evangelicalism, 5; Metuchen: Scarecrow Press, 1987). David William Faupel, “The Everlasting Gospel: The Significance of Eschatology in the Development of Pentecostal Thought,” *Journal of Pentecostal Theology*, Supplement Series 10 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996).



promoted an egalitarian Holiness vision of the Christian faith.<sup>11)</sup> Lloyd Raymond Day appropriately made him the key figure in the early history of God's Bible School, Cincinnati.<sup>12)</sup> Leon O. Hynson and Al Truesdale selected Knapp as a figure to help articulate trends in the Holiness Movement.<sup>13)</sup> Both Hynson and Truesdale noted that Knapp nuanced the "altar theology" of Phoebe Palmer. Truesdale went further than Hynson and suggested that Knapp further confused the issues, and, it must be said that Knapp evolved in his understanding. What they missed is important: Knapp did not share the optimism of human nature and of instantaneous divine response to prayers claiming the "biblical" promise of sanctification. He moved toward arguing in favor of a slower process, characterized by struggle, toward sanctification while maintaining the crisis experience that provided both assurance of sanctification and power for a life lived as a sanctified person. In this, Knapp was much more Wesleyan than Phoebe Palmer. Both Hynson and Truesdale were lamenting changes to Wesleyan theology within the Holiness movement during the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries.

Several scholars devoted significant work to Knapp's legacy. Marcel Allen Lamb struggled to describe the exegetical methods of Knapp, focusing on the Egypt-Canaan motif that recurs in Knapp's writings. The conclusion, that Knapp's exegesis was "other-than-literal," would not have surprised or been considered an insult by Knapp; indeed it could be applied to some degree to nearly every person who has wrestled with contemporary meanings for ancient texts.<sup>14)</sup> Laurence W. Wood argued that Knapp was a proto-Pentecostal, the missing link between Fletcher and Pentecostalism, an argument that did not take into account the fact that others were using the "Pentecostal" language before Knapp and that Knapp is representative, and never the only leader, in a tradition that was struggling with what interpreting oneself as being in the lineage of "Pentecost" should mean.<sup>15)</sup> Paul Hong argued that Knapp was a proponent of "biblical holiness" as opposed to the "liberal" Wesley which does not recognize Knapp's dependence on Wesley (over against Phoebe Palmer), a proponent of the "Four-fold Gospel" concept and that Knapp (1853-1901) is the true founder of the

---

11) Aaron Merritt Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer: or, The Life of Martin Wells Knapp* (Cincinnati: Mrs. M. W. Knapp, 1902). Reprinted: (Noblesville, IN: Newby Book Room, 1973), 18.

12) Lloyd Raymond Day, *A History of God's Bible School in Cincinnati, 1900-1949*, Ed. (M. Thesis, University of Cincinnati, 1949).

13) Leon O. Hynson, "The Wesleyan Quadrilateral in the American Holiness Tradition," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 20 (1985): 19-33; Al Truesdale, "Reification of the Experience of Entire Sanctification in the American Holiness Movement," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 31 (1996): 95-119.

14) Marcel Allen Lamb, "An Analysis of the Other-than-literal Hermeneutics as Employed in the Egypt-Canaan Writings of Martin Wells Knapp" (M. A. Thesis, Indiana Wesleyan University, 1995). The category of "other-than-literal" is exceedingly problematic. There have been very few if any literal interpreters of Christian biblical texts. More interesting is the way in which Knapp and his contemporary Holiness preachers and writers used metaphors of modernity to connect the experiences of the biblical text to the experience of their audiences.

15) Laurence W. Wood, *The Meaning of Pentecost in Early Methodism: Rediscovering John Fletcher as Wesley's Vindicator and designated successor* (Wesleyan and Pietist Studies, 15; Lanham: Scarecrow Press, 2002).

Pilgrim Holiness Church (founded 1922) and therefore the primary root of the Korean Holiness churches, as opposed to Oriental Missionary Society.<sup>16)</sup>

The two scholars who have made very important contributions toward an understanding of Martin Wells Knapp are Wallace Thornton and William C. Kostlevy. Thornton provided what may be termed a critical-historical careful and incisive “insider” portrayal of Knapp. A scholar and participant in the Radical Holiness tradition, Thornton has an unsurpassed grasp of the details of that history. He is also a careful scholar of American religious history and has carefully placed Knapp within a reading of that discipline. Unfortunately his most complete and detailed analysis remains unpublished. This work, *Back to the Bible: The Story of God’s Bible School* (2001) was intended as a contribution to the Centennial Celebrations but was not completed because of other pressures and a lack of support at God’s Bible School. As it is, Thornton’s work will remain a crucial analysis of the early years of the institution and of Knapp; portions of this research have been published as two articles.<sup>17)</sup>

William Kostlevy focused on the Metropolitan Church Association, another Radical Holiness ministry which later constituted itself as a denomination. He documented the close relationships between Knapp and the Revivalist network and the founders of the Metropolitan Church Association, with influences going both ways, including individuals who were leaders in both groups. He skillfully placed the Metropolitan Church Association in the context of the “Progressive Era” of American history and interpreted it as a representative of the Radical Holiness movement.<sup>18)</sup>

This essay argues, building on the work of these scholars, that Knapp is best understood as representative of and participant in an international impulse seeking a version of modernity different from other versions of modernity. It is argued secondarily that Knapp has to be understood in his American context which shaped his life narrative and theology. It is the context that gives a framework of meaning to the personal, theological, social and ministry decisions made by Knapp. Crucial to that

---

16) Paul Y. Hong, *History of the Korea Holiness Church for 110 Years since the 1897 IHC* [Korean] (Seoul: WWGTM, 2011). See my review in the *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 48, 2 (2013): 223-26.

17) Wallace Omer Thornton, Jr. *Back to the Bible: The Story of God’s Bible School* (Manuscript, 2001). A minimally revised version of this text will be published soon by Emeth Press of Lexington, KY; *idem*, “The Revivalist Movement and the Development of A Holiness/Pentecostal Philosophy of Missions,” *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 38 (2003): 160-86; *idem*, “God’s Trustee: Martin Wells Knapp and Radical Holiness,” *From Aldersgate to Azusa Street* ed. H. Knight (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2010), 148-57. Also important is, *idem*, *Radical Righteousness: Personal Ethics and the Development of the Holiness Movement* (Salem, OH: Schmul Publishing, 1998). Unfortunately, a recent dissertation on the “Bible School Movement,” while it uses Knapp’s definition of a Bible School to set up the need for such a study (pp. 2-3), devotes little attention thereafter to Knapp or to the development of God’s Bible School.

18) William Kostlevy, *Holy Jumpers: Evangelicals and Radicals in Progressive Era America* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010). This is a revision of his still useful “Neither Silver nor Gold: The Burning Bush Movement and the Communitarian Holiness Vision,” (Ph.D. Diss., University of Notre Dame, 1996). See also William Kostlevy, “The Burning Bush Movement: A Wisconsin Utopian Religious Community,” *Wisconsin Magazine of History* 83, 4 (Summer 2000): 226-57.

context was the Radical Holiness network, the collection of men and women who were the friends of Knapp.

## **A Constructed Modern “Self”: Reflections on Knapp and A. M. Hills**

Much of what we know about Knapp and his early ministry comes from Knapp himself, either directly through his publications or through the use of his diaries by his first biographer A. M. Hills, from the records of the Michigan Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, from the independent *Michigan Holiness Record* and from *The Revivalist*. Knapp is the primary source of our knowledge about Knapp, and his self-interpretation was the basis for Hills’s work. Hills merely provided a hagiographical framework for the story. As is always the case, biographical and autobiographical revelations are always developed to articulate values and goals. The stories of saints lives were cultivated first by the saints and then by the hagiographers. That does not mean that the ideas and data are false, but that they represent a perspective, a construction, of a life.

The same can be said of the “life” of Knapp. According to the narrative, his is a narrative of transition from poverty to plenty, a story illustrative of the results of entire consecration to God. He was born into a poor farm family in “a one-roomed log house in Clarendon, Calhoun County,” Michigan, on 27 March 1853. The family struggled to survive. The hard work, and probably bad nutrition, destroyed the health of Knapp’s father and permanently damaged that of Martin Wells Knapp. Supported by his mother’s commitment to education, Knapp enrolled at the Methodist related Albion College, Albion, Michigan.<sup>19)</sup> Forced to work on the farm to support the family, Knapp’s education was frequently interrupted and haphazard. In six years, he was able to complete only two years of course work and that without distinction.<sup>20)</sup>

Martin Wells Knapp entered the ministry under the aegis of the Michigan Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church in 1881, after completing a year-long “course of study,”<sup>21)</sup> and served a number of pastorates, often over the protests of the parishioners. By his own account, he was timid, fearful and frustrated. That he survived in this profession is without doubt significantly attributable to the gifts and confidence of his wife Lucy J. Glenn Knapp. Lucy J. Glenn Knapp was an accomplished speaker, an excellent manager of money, resources and people, and was better educated than her

---

19) Martin Wells Knapp, *Out of Egypt into Canaan* (Cincinnati: Office of the Revivalist, 1887), 188.

20) A. M. hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer* (Cincinnati: Mrs. M. W. Knapp, Mount of Blessings, 1902), 18.

21) George L. Carter, *A Brief History of the Elsie Methodist Episcopal Church* (Elsie, MI: The Elsie Sun, 1934), 5. The “course of study” undertaken while pastoring, was the most normal theological education for Methodist Episcopal Church clergy during the period.

husband. When they were appointed evangelists by the Michigan Conference, both Lucy J. Glenn Knapp and Martin Wells Knapp were listed. Knapp considered her both muse and mentor. They collaborated on every aspect of their work, including the founding of *The Revivalist* in 1888. Her death on 5 September 1890, of influenza, left a huge gap in the life of Knapp and of the family.<sup>22)</sup>

Two years later, on 14 September 1894, Knapp married Lucy's friend and his office assistant Minnie C. Ferle and about two months later the newly-weds moved to Cincinnati, Ohio, to continue Holiness evangelism.<sup>23)</sup> There Knapp and his fellow workers entered a decade of frenetic activity that created the legend of Martin Wells Knapp. W. B. Godbey remembered him as having a "sweetness in manner" that "reminded me of an angel instead of a man, yet he had a power over the human will which was absolutely indescribable and apparently irresistible."<sup>24)</sup> The description of A. M. Hills was more complicated:

He was about five feet four inches high, and weighed about one hundred and twenty pounds. The proportions of his body were not fine: the various parts and members of his body, in their general effect, seemed as if they had been thrown together or had chanced to come together by some laughable accident of nature. The first impression he made upon a strange audience was always unfavorable.<sup>25)</sup>

Hills argued that Knapp had accomplished much despite his lack of education, sophistication, a good speaking voice and attractive physical attributes, concluding that Knapp was evidence of "the uplifting, ennobling, and transforming power of the Holy Ghost on a life."<sup>26)</sup> These factors contributed to what appears to have been his understated leadership which stood in stark contrast from the majority of the famous, handsome, stentorian Holiness revivalists of the period. In the pages of *The Revivalist*, he presented himself as modest and self-effacing. He and his biographer A. M. Hills consistently presented Knapp as an example of a life overcoming adversity through the power of God. There is no evidence that his Radical Holiness contemporaries considered him otherwise.

Hills presented Knapp as a Holiness ecumenist urging Holiness people to

---

22) Martin Wells Knapp, "Glorified," *The Revivalist* 3, 10 (October 1890): 3. See also the testimony of Lucy Glenn Knapp, "Being Dead Yet Speaketh," *The Revivalist* 3, 10 (October 1890): 4. A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer*, 15-106.

23) A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer*, 127.

24) W. B. Godbey, *Autobiography of Rev. W. B. Godbey, A.M.* (Cincinnati: God's Revivalist Office, 1909), 367.

25) A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer; or, Life of Rev. Martin Wells Knapp*, 15. Reprinted: (Noblesville, IN: Newby Book Room, 1973), 15.

26) A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer*, 18-19. Hills disparagement of Knapp's educational endeavors is a bit gratuitous and may be thus stated to emphasize his own standing as a graduate of Yale University. Knapp's education was more extensive than that of many of his peers and disciples. See also Martin Wells Knapp, "Why a college diploma should not be made a condition of entrance to the Christian ministry," *God's Revivalist* 13,27 (4 July 1901): 8.

cooperate as much as possible in light of their different traditions, ecclesiastical relations and social location.<sup>27)</sup> Knapp insisted: "Baptism with the Holy Spirit unites God's people all into one body, whatever their name or creed or clime may be."<sup>28)</sup> He celebrated the fact that traditions other than the Methodists were teaching and experiencing "sanctification". He promoted both Methodist and non-Methodist Holiness speakers and writers in the pages of *The Revivalist*. Despite his strident condemnations of all types of injustice, as will be discussed below, Knapp appears to have been gentler in his spiritual advice to the audiences: he worked to persuade, but trusted the hearers to negotiate with God and to seek, respond, and choose.<sup>29)</sup>

At the same time, Knapp did not shy away from controversy. He refused to be limited by the church, government or the powerful forces of society. He was intensely angry and indignant at injustice, which for him included keeping the "blessing" of sanctification from the people—the masses. He strongly and aggressively promoted and encouraged the ministry of women, in the Revivalist organization and in preaching.<sup>30)</sup> Women were also given important writing assignments, including theological and exegetical columns in the revivalist. These include Anna Abrams, Beatrice M. Finney, Lettie Cowman, Hulda Rees, Alma White, Elizabeth D. Ferle, Minnie Lindberg, Mabel Hirst, Barbara Hershey, and Abbie C. Morrow. He reached out to include African-Americans in the life of GBS, both as students and as liturgists and strategically placed participants in the meetings as is evidenced by the mocking racist cartoons in Cincinnati newspapers. He collaborated with Amanda Berry Smith, although she withdrew from the relationship over pre-millennialism and Knapp's encouragement of those who left the established churches, those who chose "come-outer-ism."<sup>31)</sup>

Hills presented Knapp as an idealist regarding the efficacy of the experience of sanctification, but also as pragmatic and entrepreneurial. While he described the elements of the development of Knapp's program in Albion and Cincinnati, Hills was so

27) A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer*. Knapp spoke of this issue often in the pages of *The Revivalist*. For example: Martin Wells Knapp, "Bigotry a Revival Hindrance," *The Revivalist* 7, 12 (December 1893): 1; Martin Wells Knapp, "This is true in war, politics, business and religion," *The Revivalist* 7, 3 (March 1893): 1; Martin Wells Knapp, "Revival Unity," *The Revivalist* 12, 43 (25 Oct. 1900): 1.

28) Martin Wells Knapp, "Revival Unity," *The Revivalist* 12, 43 (25 October 1900): 1.

29) A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer*, 144-157, *et passim*. This is also seen in *The Revivalist*.

30) See for example, Martin Wells Knapp, "Women's Work," *Revivalist* 11, 52 (28 December 1899): 1. This was an address in the chapel at God's Bible School.

31) Amanda Smith, Letters published in: *The Revivalist* 10, 3 (March 1896): 4; 10, 9 (September 1896): 5. On her role in the first "Cincinnati Holiness Convention" (1893) see, Martin Wells Knapp, "Estimates of the Meeting," *The Revivalist* 7, 6 (June 1893): 1; and *idem*, "Sparks from Amanda Smith," *The Revivalist* 7, 6 (June 1893): 1; See A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer*. While Hills does not mention the presence of African-Americans in *The Revivalist* network, at the camp meetings or at God's Bible School, the Cincinnati newspapers did and were more forthcoming. This lacuna in Hills is significant in light of the decision of the early Asbury College and the Church of the Nazarene, both of which were influenced by Hills not to admit African-American students at Asbury, or to seek participation of Black Holiness denominations in the formation of the Church of the Nazarene. African-Americans were not allowed into the Young Men's Christian Association in Indianapolis.

caught in the moment that he missed the clarity of that program and of the definition of the new reality toward which Knapp was endeavoring to lead the Radical Holiness Movement. One could argue that Hills interpreted Knapp as a typical Holiness preacher in a new "come-outer" church that was aspiring to develop structures like the denominations they had left. He deliberately muted the radicalism of Knapp's vision of the church and society. Hills was by 1902 in favor of forming a Holiness denomination, a structure that Knapp had expressly avoided in favor of "associations" of persons of shared values but with no defined structure. Before and after his separation from the Methodist Episcopal Church, Knapp opposed starting denominations, even Holiness ones.

These comments are not intended to detract from the accomplishments of A. M. Hills. He was a Yale University educated scholar who served as president of Texas Holiness University, whose first book was published by Martin Wells Knapp! His books are still being printed and read and appreciated.

## **Categories for understanding Knapp's Quest for a New Modernity:**

### **(1) Urbanization, Industrialization and Modernization.**

As noted above, many scholars of "revivalistic" religion, see the participants as anti-urban, anti-industrialization and anti-modern; as promoters of primitivism seeking to replicate an ideal world in the past that did not exist. This has been the case at least since the publication of William Warren Sweet's *Religion on the American Frontier*.<sup>32)</sup> However, the reality was much more complex, as I have argued earlier.<sup>33)</sup>

Knapp is a case in point. He moved from ministry in small towns in Michigan, with his periodical and publishing headquartered in the small town of Albion, Michigan, to the major urban center Cincinnati, Ohio, locating as close to the nexus of communication and transportation as he could.<sup>34)</sup> He sought the urban, and celebrated its modernity even as he lamented its brutality and exploitation of the poor and immigrants to the city.<sup>35)</sup> When meetings were announced, this usually included reference to the public transportation systems.<sup>36)</sup> The railroads, and the telegraph, were

---

32) William Warren Sweet's *Religion on the American Frontier* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1931).

33) David Bundy, "Blaming the Victim: The Wesleyan/Holiness Movement in American Culture," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 32 (1997): 161-78.

34) On the move to the YMCA building see: *The Revivalist* 11, 11 (November 1895): 5.

35) See for example; Martin Wells Knapp, "Revival Success in Cities," *God's Revivalist* 13, 11 (14 March 1901): 1.

36) See, for example, Martin Wells Knapp, "A Mountain Holiness Campmeeting," *The Revivalist* 8, 6 (June 1894): 5; Martin Wells Knapp, "Beulah Heights Holiness Campmeeting," *The Revivalist* 8, 8 (August 1894): 1 reported the availability of half-price railroad tickets; Martin Wells Knapp, "Something Better than the World's Fair," *The Revivalist* 7, 5 (May 1893): 1; Lizzie [Elizabeth] D. Ferle, "Sparks from Cincinnati Holiness Meeting," *The Revivalist* 11, 8 (23 February 1899): 4 notes that the meeting will be held one block away from the Cincinnati Grand Central Railroad Depot.

celebrated and used as metaphors for spiritual life and spiritual death; importantly they were rapidly shrinking time and space and enabling persons to think of themselves as relating to the rest of the world in almost real time.<sup>37)</sup> One could actually move with alacrity across the country and travel and communicate more quickly around the world. Maps indicating the influence of *The Revivalist* ministry and influence showed the rays of the sun illuminating the entire United States of America and most of Canada from Cincinnati!<sup>38)</sup> The trans-continental railroads and the widening network of telegraph lines were still new and exciting.

Rail junctions demanding choices became allegories for spiritual choices.<sup>39)</sup> Human inventiveness and productivity was celebrated even as the features of modernity that deprive persons of dignity, food and shelter were decried.<sup>40)</sup> The developments in printing and the production of inexpensive paper and postage were essential to his ministry and he rejoiced in them as he used them vigorously. He was no luddite! The national networks of the Radical Holiness activists were made possible by the railroads. Therefore the railroads and technology that facilitated their cause were viewed as gifts of God, like the other aspects of the creation.

Bruno Latour has argued that technologies become "actants" in the societies that create them, taking on a formative role as a partner in the conversations and decisions that shape society.<sup>41)</sup> One sees in the relationship between Martin Wells Knapp and technology (railroad, printing, telegraph, electricity) a dialogue. Knapp is conforming to the strengths of these technologies while contesting these technologies as they make the powerful more powerful, the purveyors of addictive materials (alcohol, tobacco, drugs) more able to reach and expand their market of addicts. In this dialogue, he does not attack the systems (trains) that make the low cost distribution possible, but the

---

37) Railroad metaphors are ubiquitous in Knapp's writings. For example: Martin Wells Knapp, "The 'By faith and Now Line' to Beulah Land," *The Revivalist* 8, 4 (April 1894): 2. The entire fascicle of *The Revivalist* 10, 4 (April 1896) featured "railroad imagery."

38) See, for example, the map published in *The Revivalist* 11, 22 (1 June 1899): 15.

39) See, for example the chart *Two Railroads* (Diagram Number 2) advertised in *the Revivalist* 3, 1 (January 1890): 3. as a "revival help" which showed two diverging railroads leading to heaven and hell.

40) Martin Wells Knapp, "In Unity there is Strength," *Revivalist* 7, 3 (March 1893): 1. observed human inventiveness over against systems that restrict access and divide.

41) A prolific writer and careful thinker, Bruno Latour has provided a number of books wrestling with the relationship between humans and their inventions. Especially helpful for the present discussion are his, *Science in action: how to follow scientists and engineers through society* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1987), *idem*, *La science en action: introduction à la sociologie des sciences* (Paris: La Découverte, 1989), *idem*, *Aramis ou l'amour des techniques* (Paris: La Découverte, 1992), translated as: *Aramis, or, The love of technology* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1996), *idem*, *La science en action: introduction à la sociologie des sciences* (Paris: Gallimard, 1995), *idem*, *La science en action: introduction à la sociologie des sciences* (Paris : La Découverte / Poche, 2005), *idem*, *Reassembling the social: an introduction to actor-network-theory* (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), *idem*, *Enquête sur les modes d'existence: une anthropologie des modernes* (Paris: La Découverte, 2012), *idem*, *Rejoicing: or the torments of religious speech* (Cambridge: Polity, 2013). See also: Michel Serres, *Eclaircissements : cinq entretiens avec Bruno Latour* (Paris : F. Bourin, 1992) and Lorraine Daston, *Lorraine, Biographies of scientific objects* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000).

purveyors of death and encourages the Christian to be neither a consumer nor purveyor of addictive agents.<sup>42)</sup> Christians were urged to “live long” by resisting these products: “strong drink,” narcotics, gluttony, licentiousness and other sins.<sup>43)</sup> Knapp opined that even coffee could become a substitute addiction for alcohol.<sup>44)</sup> These also were “actants” that controlled the minds and bodies of those who adopted them as companions in life’s way.

One sees this relationship with technology most clearly in songs written by Knapp. For example:

### God’s Cable

There’s a cable laid by Jesus, From my soul up to the sky;  
Telegrams of greatest moment, o’er it oft and swiftly fly,  
Bringing God and help from heaven, Now so very very nigh,  
oh glory to His name.

All the messages are paid for, Thro’ the Saviors precious blood;  
Flowing forth from Calvary’s fountain, In a purifying flood;  
Purchasing for all a pardon, And communion sweet with God,  
To him be all the praise.

Who may use this wondrous cable, Is so very clear and plain;  
Evil all must be forsaken, Howsoever great the pain;  
And the precious blood of Jesus, Cleanse the heart of every stain,  
It now avails for me.

All obstructions to this cable Must be ever kept away;  
Broken vows, neglected duties, Often hinder and delay.  
God is watching very closely, All we think and do and say,  
He searches every heart.

Soon I think my heavenly Father, Will get lonesome there for me,  
And will telegraph a message To forever with Him be;  
Then at home with God in heaven, I will spend eternity,  
At the central office there.

Chorus: Telegraph, believe, He’s hearing, Telegraph, receive,  
He’s cheering; Telegraph, rejoice, He’s nearing,  
Oh glory to His name.<sup>45)</sup>

42) Anonymous Reader from Washington, North Carolina, “The Tobacco Devil Cast Out,” *The Revivalist* 8, 12 (December 1894): 3. “learned...from *The Revivalist* that it must be wrong to sell it as well as use it, and so have bought none for fifteen months and do not intend to. I desire to be made perfect in love.”

43) Martin Wells Knapp, “How to Live Long,” *The Revivalist* 8, 1 (January 1894): 4. Spellings and capitalization as in original.

44) Martin Wells Knapp, “Coffee Drunkards,” *The Revivalist* 12, 43 (25 October 1900): 9.

45) Martin Wells Knapp, “God’s Cable,” *Bible Songs of Salvation and Victory* compiled by M. W. Knapp and R. E. McNeil (Mt. Auburn, Cincinnati: “Revivalist” Office, and God’s Bible School, 1901), no. 48.



Here one sees the telegraph cable ambiguously presented both as a metaphor for prayer and answers to prayer in a two way communication, and the telegraph cable as "actant" in the life of the user of the telegraph cable. By using the telegraph cable as a metaphor it takes on a role that is more than the physical wire passing through the neighborhoods. In another text, Knapp uses the railroads as analogies with analogies from the Bible, the analogies of the one intended to clarify the analogies of the other:

People in spiritual Egypt are like an engine headed the wrong way and "ditched." In the "Sinai Wilderness" of Justification, they are like the same engine redeemed from the ditch, on the track, headed the right way, attached to a train; but somewhat rusty, and making slow progress because of the lack of steam power. In the "Desert Wilderness" they are like the murderous engine which has shot from the track, and carried with it a train of cars, and is buried beneath its wreck and the mangled bodies of those whom it has ruined. In Canaan they are like the engine, brightly burnished, completely equipped, moving at full speed, and gayly bearing its ponderous load as if it were a feather. In spiritual Babylon they are like an express engine, which, moving heavily laden with passengers, at its utmost speed, has plunged with them from the track down an awful precipice. Their condition is worse than those in the "Desert Wilderness," because they have fallen further.<sup>46)</sup>

Here one sees the railroad engines as "actants," in the narrative; one also sees the analogical use of the railroad, as well as the biblical texts, to address issues of the spiritual and daily life. The same use of technology can be seen in his article on "Revival Electricity,"<sup>47)</sup> a cartoon entitled "Two Railroads"<sup>48)</sup> and songs such as "Powerhouse in the Sky" and his railroad songs.<sup>49)</sup>

## (2) Democratization: The Issue of Power

The question of "power" was central for Knapp. There are two kinds of power: positive and negative. Positive power has its source in God. Negative power has its source in the human exploiters (state, political parties, industry, secret societies, church). These institutions conspire together and separately to limit the power of God for their own purposes. The churches are the most evil, excluding those from power who promote the transforming power of God which decreases dependency on those who exploit and thereby the power of the exploiters. Knapp argued that the divine power was for all believers. All humans were created equal and it is the duty of Christians to help all achieve that equality. All have worth no matter how broken they are by sin.

---

46) Martin Wells Knapp, *Out of Egypt into Canaan; Lessons in Spiritual Geography* (Cincinnati: Printed by Cranston and Stowe for the author, 1888), 179.

47) Martin Wells Knapp, "Revival Electricity," *The Revivalist* 12, 8 (22 February 1910): 1.

48) Martin Wells Knapp, "Two Railroads," *The Revivalist* 11, 15 (13 April 1899), 7:

49) See Appendix II and Appendix III.

Knapp insisted that power was to not to be focused on anyone person in the church, society or social group. It is to be dispersed throughout the society; sanctified persons are able to actualize the possibilities of power positively better than others. It is this argument that was set forth in quite other language and intellectual categories most vigorously by Michel Foucault and others influenced by him during the last quarter of the twentieth century.<sup>50)</sup> It is important to note that Knapp does not suggest a national or even city-wide effort to organize to fight for social transformation. He was living in the period of social back-lash against the Holiness moment concomitant with the growing Northern racism and racial anger against the migrating African-Americans from the South, and the agendas of the Progressive Party (see below) were facing stiff and sometimes violent political and economic opposition. Knapp developed projects to transform the lives of the people he and his co-laborers could afford to reach. It was anticipated that individualistic transformation would have social consequences. He wrote: "God, who in nature transforms rot and refuse into roses, fruits and fragrances, in the realms of grace, surprises still more startling transformations."<sup>51)</sup>

Knapp found several aspects of culture that needed renewal and control. He insisted that the large industries were evil when they pushed goods appealing to human greed and which fostered additions that take away the health and free-will of the individual. He defined the larger problem as the "worldliness" of people/Christians:

Worldliness is one of the most fatal worms that saps the life of spirituality. Wherever it gnaws, leaves wither and die. Its presence on every hand may be seen by the following outward marks:

Conformity to worldly fashions;  
Sacrificing to worldly political parties;  
Popularity of worldly churches;  
Affiliation with worldly fraternities;  
Adoption of worldly methods of business;  
Promotion of worldly advertisements in religious papers;  
Insertion of unseemly cuts in such advertisements;  
Worldly people as leaders of choirs, Sunday schools, on official boards;  
The discussion of worldly themes in the pulpit and by the religious press...<sup>52)</sup>

The issue at each point was the abuse of power and the subsequent damaging of

50) Foucault, Michel, *L'archéologie du savoir* (Paris: Gallimard, 1969), idem, *Surveiller et punir: naissance de la prison* (Paris: Gallimard, 1975), idem, *Il faut défendre la société: cours au Collège de France, 1975-1976* (Paris : Gallimard/Seuil, 1997), idem, *Histoire de la sexualité* (Paris: Gallimard, 1976-1984), idem, *Sécurité, territoire, population: cours au Collège de France, 1977-1978* (Paris: Seuil, Gallimard, 2004) , idem, with Michelle Perrot, *L'Impossible prison: recherches sur le système pénitentiaire au XIXe siècle* (Paris : Seuil, 1980).

51) Martin Wells Knapp, "A Glorious Transformation," *God's Revivalist* 12, 47 (22 November 1900): 1.

52) Martin Wells Knapp, "Worldliness," *The Revivalist* 11, 15 (13 April 1899): 5.

the lives and spirituality of the persons to whom they represent positions of power. Thus, Knapp observed that political parties and the State divide people to control them with simplistic slogans that encourage people to act against their own interests, and unwittingly to support the corruption of the parties and the State.

The church was no better, maybe worse because it claimed to be different from the world. Knapp observed that the established churches with their mind numbing rituals are sustained and presided over by egotistical men. These seek to control the people and control access to God so that they can acquire money, titles and power for themselves. Women and the poor are excluded from positions and ministry in the churches.<sup>53)</sup> In support of his position, he published an article by Newton Wray asserting that the Methodist Episcopal Church bragged about its statistics but was in a state of famine of the Spirit, encouraging nominal rather than transformative faith.<sup>54)</sup> He also reprinted a text by A. T. Pierson which argued that the "The ideal church ... is one that is working for the conversion of souls, an educational church, and a democratic church; but it must be in my judgment, a free church."<sup>55)</sup> More pointed were the articles by I. Reid, "Protestant Popery," and E. H. Dashiell, "Ecclesiasticism versus Jesus."<sup>56)</sup> Knapp insisted that he was not against organizations or against the churches, but "against the prostitution of the organization in the interests of the world..."<sup>57)</sup>

He and the Radical Holiness network were strongly opposed to Secret Societies, such as the Free Masons. These exclude women, the poor and those who would refuse to compromise their theological convictions. Decisions made by the elite in secret meetings are made that are deleterious to those excluded. The members of the secret societies, he insisted, protect each other in their corruption and greed.<sup>58)</sup>

---

53) Jacob Knapp, "Honorary Doctors," *The Revivalist* 11, 8 (June 1897): 5; Martin Wells Knapp, "The New Testament Church," *The Revivalist* 11, 9 (September 1897): 1; idem "Hirlings," *The Revivalist* 11, 23 (8 June 1899): 8; idem, "Anti-Revival Churches," *God's Revivalist* 12, 51 (20 December 1900): 1; idem, "The New Testament Church," *God's Revivalist* 12, 52 (27 December 1900): 1; idem, "Societies of God's Church vs. Worldly Societies and Denominations," *God's Revivalist* 13, 7 (14 February 1901): 8; idem, "Wrecked Humanity and Hirelings," *God's Revivalist* 13, 9 (28 February 1901): 1. accompanied by a cartoon: "The Salary Seeking Minister" which shows the clergy getting fat and rich at the expense of the poor; idem, "Come-outerism and Revivals," *God's Revivalist* 13, 14 (4 April 1901), 1. "The societies of God's church should be governed by New Testament principles and practices." Abuses by the established churches, especially by the Methodist Episcopal Church, is a recurring theme in *The Revivalist* and in Knapp's publications.

54) Newton Wray, "Church Statistics and Spiritual Famine," *God's Revivalist* 12, 51 (20 December 1900): 9.

55) A. T. Pierson, "The Ideal Church," *God's Revivalist* 13, 4 (24 Jan. 1901): 4.

56) I. Reid, "Protestant Popery," *The Revivalist* 11, 6 (9 February 1899): 8; E. H. Dashiell, "Ecclesiasticism versus Jesus," *The Revivalist* 11, 6 (9 February 1899): 8.

57) Martin Wells Knapp, "The Revivalist and the Church," *The Revivalist* 11, 26 (29 June 1899): 1.

58) Martin Wells Knapp, "Secret Meetings," *The Revivalist* 11, 21 (25 May 1899): 8; idem, "Secret Societies," *The Revivalist* 11, 21 (25 May 1899): 8; idem, "Dr. Buckley and Secret Societies," *The Revivalist* 11, 45 (9 November 1899), 8, where Knapp notes with satisfaction that the editor of the Methodist Episcopal *Western Christian Advocate* agreed with the earlier critique of "secret societies" published in *The Revivalist*. See also Minnie Ferle Knapp, "Real-Sham," *The Revivalist* 12, 17 (26 April 1900): 8. commenting on the cheap valueless jewelry and Masonic badges put into the collection plate at Revival meetings in Cincinnati.

One example combined the issues of secretiveness and concentration of power in ways that Knapp considered theologically and socially dangerous as well as irresponsible. An example is his extensive attacks on John Alexander Dowie founder of Zion City, Illinois. Dowie had been a long-time radical Holiness leader in Scotland, Australia and the USA. He was invited to participate in the 1885 London conference on healing organized by W. E. Boardman with the collaboration of Asa Mahan and A. B Simpson. Dowie later became a self-proclaimed prophet, and the single significant power in his utopian city and movement. Knapp observed that power was in the hands of one person in Zion. The theological and social issues were shaped to support this concentration of power. The concentration of power led to the abuse of the role of the minister and church leader and therefore of the people who believed.<sup>59)</sup> Note that after Dowie's death, many of his followers around the world became Pentecostal.

The Methodist dominated National Holiness Association was found by Knapp to have adopted non-democratic values similar to those of the Methodist Episcopal Church or Free Masons. That is, they excluded those from the "Holiness Movement" who did not agree with them. They excluded non-Methodists and those that the National Holiness Association leadership thought too radical or too prone to split the denomination or congregations over Holiness; they were committed to staying in the Methodist Episcopal Church as was Knapp until he was attacked for preaching at a camp-meeting without permission from local pastors or the bishop.<sup>60)</sup>

The National Holiness Association was organized for and controlled by the elite among the Holiness leaders of the Methodist Episcopal Church. As Knapp came to understand it, the National Holiness Association was trying to maintain a Methodist monopoly on "holiness" and to make it socially acceptable in order to support their upward social mobility.<sup>61)</sup> He clearly understood "parlor holiness" as Dayton described the approach of Phoebe Palmer,<sup>62)</sup> to be a less than adequate interpretation of the biblical mandate. The breaking point came in 1901 when the leaders of the National Holiness Association wrote a call to the Chicago Convention that excluded all of the

---

59) Martin Wells Knapp, "Superficial Revivals," *The Revivalist* 12, 12 (22 March 1900): 1. Some articles on Dowie, all unsigned and not on the editorial page: "A Word of Warning," *The Revivalist* 12, 12 (22 March 1900): 8; "Dowie's Attack on Moody," *The Revivalist* 12, 12 (22 March 1900): 8; "God's Zion versus Dowie's Zion," *The Revivalist* 12, 12 (22 March 1900): 9; "The Chicago 'Zion'" *The Revivalist* 12, 12 (22 March 1900): 9; Martin Wells Knapp, "The Gospel of Zion vs. the Gospel of Jesus," *The Revivalist* 12, 13 (29 March 1900): 1. Anonymous, "Rescued from Zionism," *God's Revivalist* 13, 28 (11 July 1901): 8.

60) Martin Wells Knapp, *Pentecostal Aggressiveness; or, Why I conducted the meetings of the Chesapeake Holiness Union at Bowens, Maryland* (Cincinnati: M. W. Knapp, 1899).

61) "Sectarian Narrowness," *God's Revivalist* 13, 1 (3 January 1901): 1. This article reprinted from the *Texas Holiness Advocate* argued that some want to "corral and confine the Holiness Movement in the narrow confines of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South." The author noted that the efforts were too late: once the Methodists had a monopoly on the doctrine, but now it has reached all denominations.

62) This term coined originally by Donald W. Dayton to describe the polite inculturated Holiness of the upper class Methodists and those who desired and worked for upward social mobility at the expense of association with or ministry to the poor has become standard terminology.

leadership of the "Pentecostal" Radical Holiness movement.<sup>63)</sup> This division, between the more socially integrated Holiness movement, now represented by "Holiness and Unity," and the Interdenominational Holiness Convention continues. Knapp's influence and institutions are a key part of the International Holiness Convention, and are minimally remembered among the larger Holiness churches in the USA.

Knapp argued that all of these (government, business, church and the National Holiness Association) are designed by the powerful for their benefit, rather than for the common person. A role of the Holiness Revival is to remind people that all resources belong to God. God owns the property.<sup>64)</sup> God provided in the Gospels and Acts of the Apostles a model for the mission that reminds people of their need for God. Knapp insisted that it is the responsibility of the church and of individual Christians to struggle for personal and social transformation and for social justice. He warned that corruption and abuse of the poor by the governments and businesses would not last: "What a transition from poverty to plenty (...) This earth belongs to Jesus Christ, and he will not always allow His brothers and sisters to be treated as they are today."<sup>65)</sup>

### (3) Aspirations for Humanization

The last half of the nineteenth century was a time of expanding aspirations for humanization, the improvement of the quality of life, democracy, and aspirations of empowerment by the working classes and the poor. One sees this in the reception of the writings of Marx and Engels, and the Paris Commune, which remained a tragic iconic dream despite, perhaps because of its being brutally crushed by the French army at the insistence of the invading German army in 1871. In the USA, there was the struggle of the Progressives and the International Workers of the World (Wobblies) for social justice. The "social gospel" movement led by Walter Rauschenbusch (who considered joining the Salvation Army, and who spoke in tongues) made the same argument as did Horace Bushnell (who experienced sanctification and wrote about healing. All of these movements reflect these themes. So do the writings of Knapp and the Revivalist ministry in Cincinnati as well as the other Radical Holiness ministries that

---

63) "Chicago Holiness Convention, March 1-10, 1901," *God's Revivalist* 13, 7 (14 February 1901): 8; Martin Wells Knapp, "Full Orbed Holiness," *God's Revivalist* 13, 18 (2 May 1901): 2. On this event see William Kostlevy, *Holy Jumpers: Evangelicals and Radicals in Progressive Era America* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010).

64) Hence the renaming of *The Revivalist* as *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate*, the naming of his school as God's Bible School and deeding the school to God. This deeding resulted in a court case that lasted for decades when it was finally decided by the Ohio Supreme Court that God could not own property in Ohio.

65) Martin Wells Knapp, "Governmental Positions," *The Revivalist* 11, 33 (10 August 1889): 7. This has striking parallels with the Preamble to the Industrial Workers of the World Constitutions (Wobblies): "There can be no peace so long as hunger and want are found among millions of the working people and the few, who make up the employing class, have all the good things of life." (Industrial Workers of the World website: [www.iww.org](http://www.iww.org)). See below. See also Knapp's essay, "In Union there is Strength," *Revivalist* 7, 3 (March 1893): 1.

were part of the Radical Holiness networks. All of these social revolutionaries sought the transformation of social structures that would enhance the human experiences. It was a global cry against exploitation of "the masses." While there were differences of philosophical and religious perspectives, the goals, rhetoric and music were much the same.

Knapp was in some ways more comprehensive in his arguments, framed in the mid-American context, than many other radicals. He argued that humans have rights that are given by God but taken away by the negative powers. He was against war.<sup>66)</sup> He insisted that the Christian is to care for the poor,<sup>67)</sup> minister to the prisoners,<sup>68)</sup> to lift up the downtrodden ("fallen women,"<sup>69)</sup> orphans,<sup>70)</sup> uneducated persons,<sup>71)</sup> African Americans,<sup>72)</sup> Appalachian poor<sup>73)</sup> and heal the sick.<sup>74)</sup> Healing was presented as a complicated concept: inclusive, liberation, transformation, physical healing. He did not blame those who were ill for their lack of faith for healing or for having sin as a background to their sicknesses. After all, his beloved saintly wife became ill and died; he himself was continuously ill.<sup>75)</sup>

---

66) See for example: Martin Wells Knapp, "There shall be no more war," *Revivalist* 7, 12 (December 1894): 3; *idem*, "Kindness more effective than weapons," *Revivalist* 8, 10 (October 1894), 2; and, *idem*, "The War in South Africa," *Revivalist* 12, 9 (1 March 1900): 9, discussing disapprovingly the attitudes of governments toward war.

67) See for example: Martin Wells Knapp, "Around the World," *Revivalist* 11, 6 (9 February 1899): 9; "Pentecostal holiness is not selfish. It acts the good Samaritan to the bruised and wounded who are dying without the Gospel." And, *idem*, "Holiness in the Sermon on the Mount," *Revivalist* 10, 6 (June 1896): 2; *idem*, "Governmental positions," *Revivalist* 11, 32 (10 August 1899): 7.

68) See for example, Martin Wells Knapp, "Stewards of God, Attention!" *Revivalist* 8, 6 (June 1894): 3, in which he calls for ministry to the poor and to prisoners; *idem*, with Minnie Knapp, "In prison and ye visited me," *Revivalist* 11, 10 (October 1897): 8.

69) Beatrice M. Finney, "A Plea for Fallen Girls," *God's Revivalist* 13, 16 (18 April 1901): 16; Anonymous (Martin Wells Knapp?), "Rescue Home in Sight," *God's Revivalist* 13, 29 (18 July 1901): 15; See also: See: Mrs. Martin Wells Knapp (Minnie Ferle Knapp), "Glimpses of Darkest Cincinnati," *The Revivalist* 12, 9 (1 March 1899): 13; Also published was the anonymous, "The False Employment Snare," *Revivalist* 11, 23 (8 June 1899): 8, warning against sex slavery.

70) See the article of Beatrice Finney cited above from 18 March 1901. An orphanage and rescue home for unwed mothers were promoted by Knapp but established after Knapp's death. See Martin Wells Knapp, "Our Cincinnati Center," *God's Revivalist* 13, 10 (7 March 1901): 9; See also F. W. Messenger, "Slum work in Cincinnati," *God's Revivalist* 13, 12 (21 March 1901): 14.

71) For example: Martin Wells Knapp, "Beulah Heights Bible School," *Revivalist* 8, 8 (August 1894): 1. This was part of the ministry to the suffering in Appalachia, much of which he attributed to their lack of education. Cf. Knapp's "A Training School for Christian Workers," *Revivalist* 12, 19 (10 May 1900): 3.

72) Martin Wells Knapp published an essay by Charles C. Cook, "Is the world getting better or worse," *Revivalist* 11, 7 (16 February 1899): 6. Which argued that the increased numbers of lynchings and violence against African-Americans provided evidence that the world was getting worse, an argument for pre-millennialism.

73) Martin Wells Knapp, "Beulah Heights Holiness Campmeeting," *Revivalist* 8, 8 (August 1894): 1; *idem*, "Beulah Heights Bible School," *Revivalist* 8, 8 (August 1894): 1. This and the Beulah Heights Bible School project were part of Knapp's agenda to serve as a healing bridge between the USA North and South.

74) Martin Wells Knapp, "Divine Healing," *The Revivalist* 11, 42 (19 October 1899): 10; *idem*, "Healing magnified," *Revivalist* 11, 1 (January 1899): 10.

To be free, one cannot be dependent on the negative powers that constrict one and take away the freedom of the human will. To be free to conform one's will to the will of God, and to achieve one's highest most Godly aspirations, one must struggle to be free and vigilantly be attentive to the details of life in order to maintain that freedom. It is a personal individualist vision, which Knapp expects will transform the people who believe in order for them to bear witness of that transformation to others. It is a revolution, worked out one life at a time.

Thus, one must combat the financial structures that inculcate poverty and dependency (alcohol,<sup>76</sup> drugs,<sup>77</sup> tobacco<sup>78</sup>), and deliver all who are captive to the negative powers. "God, who in nature transforms rot and refuse into roses, fruits and fragrance, in the realm of grace, surprises with still more startling transformations."<sup>79</sup>

Knapp clearly saw that the divisions of gender, race, age, class, rural/urban and North/South were limiting the ministry of individuals and limiting the aspirations of humans trapped in social situations that were used by the privileged to enhance their own status and to limit those deemed less worthy. He therefore argued for the ministry of women and encouraged African-Americans to attend God's Bible School. The holiness vision was, he insisted, one of unity: one must break down all the barriers that separate (gender, age, class, North-South, rural/urban and denominations). "Baptism with the Holy Spirit unites God's people all into one body, whatever their name or creed or clime may be,"<sup>80</sup>

Sanctification is for purity (freedom from the control of sin, institutions and addictions) and power (for living, for self-discipline, for evangelism, for mission). Thus empowered and freed, one is enabled to focus on what is truly important: God; and to conform to God's will in ministry and care for the poor. Thus the Exodus - Canaan imagery and the *Pearl of Patmos*.

Knapp was committed to struggle and exhort against the limitation of human aspirations. However, this was done with little expectation of winning the battle against the anti-human, anti-divine forces in society. It was this realistic assessment of the

---

75) See, Martin Wells Knapp, "The 'by faith and now' line," *Revivalist* 8, 4 (April 1894): 2. This was echoed by W. B. Godby, "Drugs and divine healing," *Revivalist* 12, 19 (10 May 1900): 10, who argued for using medical technology saying "God is a contraction of good."

76) For example: Martin Wells Knapp, "For the License Voter," *The Revivalist* 11, 42 (19 October 1899): 9 [on the economics of alcohol]; *idem*, "Rum and Missions," *The Revivalist* 11, 42 (19 October 1899): 12; *idem*, "An Enemy to Revivals," *The Revivalist* 12, 11 (15 March 1900): 1, 3, in which he discusses alcohol and the alcohol trade, alcoholism, abuse of the weak and the complicity of the churches.

77) For example: Martin Wells Knapp, "Coffee Drunkards," *Revivalist* 12, 43 (25 October 1900): 3.

78) Martin Wells Knapp, "Tobacco users," *Revivalist* 11, 10 (9 March 1899): 8, in which he noted that the smoker is "shortening his own life and the life of his children." See also *idem*, "Tobacco cure," *Revivalist* 11, 10 (9 March 1899): 8; *idem*, "Revival fire—Tobacco cremated," *Revivalist* 11, 15 (13 April 1899): 8; *idem*, "Bro. Cleanmouth," *Revivalist* 11, 23 (8 June 1899): 8.

79) Martin Wells Knapp, "A Glorious transformation," *The Revivalist* 12, 47 (22 Nov. 1899): 9.

80) Martin Wells Knapp, "Revival Unity," *The Revivalist* 12, 43 (25 Oct. 1900): 1.

chances of a final success for his work that led him, and most of the Radical Holiness Movement to adopt the pessimistic pre-millennialism rather than the more optimistic post-millennialism of the more affluent, more upwardly socially integrated National Holiness Association and the Methodist Episcopal Church. The Radical Holiness network perceived that the world could not significantly improve and that any large scale transformation would require the divine intervention of the second-coming of Christ.

#### **(4) Global vision in a period of American ascendancy (with insights from Said [1978] and the Orientalism discussions).**

Knapp was interested in missions at least from 1890. In the second fascicle of *The Revivalist* he published a tribute to Bishop William Taylor and repeated Taylor's call for 100,000 Holiness Christians to go to Africa as self-supporting missionaries.<sup>81)</sup> According to Day, Knapp applied to become a Taylor missionary but was turned down because of health reasons.<sup>82)</sup> Articles followed on mission, frequently including reference to Taylor.<sup>83)</sup> When Knapp was searching for faculty for the Beulah Bible School in Kentucky, he called for a person who was sanctified, able to lead and teach singing, able to deny self, and "willing like Bishop Taylor's missionaries, to launch out on faith alone."<sup>84)</sup>

The "modern" missionary movement that was created by the Congress of Berlin (1884-1885) and the Spanish-American War made it easier for Knapp and the *Revivalist* to be in contact with the rest of the world. The American public was more willing than before to support foreign missions. The secular newspapers, in support of government and business interests, had been vocally avowing the supremacy of American culture and arms. Churches quickly mobilized to take advantage of the new opportunities provided by the victory of "Protestant" America over the "Catholic" Spanish empire. While decrying the bloodshed of the Spanish-American War in particular and militarism in general, Knapp (and other Radical Holiness persons) mobilized resources to engage in overseas mission.<sup>85)</sup>

Knapp was leery of the colonial enterprise and of the commercial interests that profited from the work of others but kept the others in poverty, ill health and bondage to additions.<sup>86)</sup> The initial missionary efforts of *The Revivalist* community were not the

---

81) Martin Wells Knapp "Bishop Taylor," *The Revivalist* 1, 2 (February 1890): 1. On Taylor see:

82) Lloyd Raymond Day, *A History of God's Bible School in Cincinnati, 1900-1949* (University of Cincinnati, 1949).

83) Martin Wells Knapp, "Motives for Engagement in Missionary Work," *The Revivalist* 7, 1 (January 1893): 2; "Prayer Answered," *The Revivalist* 7, 1 (January 1893): 2; Minnie Ferle Knapp, "Samuel Morris," *The Revivalist* 11, 10 (November 1897): 3.

84) Martin Wells Knapp, "Wanted, A Teacher," *The Revivalist* 9, 7 (July 1895): 6.

85) Knapp published an article describing positively a sermon of Seth Cook Rees at Mount Lake Holiness Camp-meeting criticizing President McKinley's call for celebration over the death of Spanish soldiers in the war: T. R. Carskaden, "Sanctification and Politics," *The Revivalist* 11, 14 (6 April 1899): 8.



new colonies of the Philippines, Puerto Rico or Cuba, although other Radical Holiness missionaries and evangelists were involved in the Philippines as members of the Methodist Episcopal Church, including H. C. Morrison, Knapp's estranged friend (conflict over loyalty to the Methodist Episcopal Church).<sup>87)</sup> The newly captured mission opportunities were initially taken by the Holiness Methodist Episcopal evangelists and missionaries of the Methodist Mission Board, the Disciples of Christ and the Presbyterians.

The model chosen and celebrated throughout the Radical Holiness Movement, was "Self-Supporting Mission," also called "Pauline Missions" or "faith mission" as advocated by William Taylor. In "Self-Supporting Mission," as Taylor expounded and lived the theory, the missionary did not submit to a denominational or independent mission board. Filled with the Spirit, they were empowered individual missionaries to go on the model of the Apostle Paul. They were to take with them as little as possible and either trust their converts for sustenance or earn a living, as did the local peoples, by doing something legal and useful. It assumed cooperation with other Christians around the world. There was no distinction made between the pagans in North America and those in other lands.<sup>88)</sup> All needed to be transformed by the "Baptism of the Holy Spirit" which included all aspects of healing, not just spiritual healing.

Missionaries were celebrated and collected. As did most independent Holiness mission organizations, Knapp took initially an inclusive approach. As missionaries realized that *The Revivalist* had a significant circulation, they began to write letters in hope of publication. Missionaries who met Knapp or were part of the Radical Holiness network would have their letters or articles published in Knapp's paper. It gave them free publicity, prayer supporters and potential speaking engagements when in the USA, as well as possible financial support. The exact same approach would be used by William Seymour and the *Apostolic Faith* at Los Angeles a few years later. Thus for example, Anna Abrams and C. T. Sherman of the Vanguard Mission (St. Louis) contributed articles to *God's Revivalist* as did the Free Methodist Ward family, all missionaries to India.<sup>89)</sup>

---

86) Martin Wells Knapp, "Remarks," *The Revivalist* 11, 14 (6 April 1899): 8. In this essay he supports Rees and Carskaden, discussing the alcohol lobby which supported colonizing Spanish lands to gain cheap access to sugar and rum.

87) Martin Wells Knapp, "Go," *Revivalist* 11, 41 (12 October 1899): 9. On this important phenomenon see the work of Luther J. Oconer, *Culto Pentecostal Story: Holiness Revivalism and the making of Philippine Methodist Identity*, (Ph.D. diss., Drew University, 2011). especially Pak Myung Su's.

88) Sometimes these were the same. Knapp wrote two songs to the same tune: "Foreign Missions" and "Home Missions." As the "Home Missions" song shows, Knapp shared the xenophobia of the Anglo-Saxon Protestants against the new immigrants. This was shared with some other Radical Holiness leaders, who, in the case of Alma White, supported and was supported by the KKK because of shared anti-Catholic and anti-Immigrant biases. See Susie C. Stanley, *Feminist Pillar of Fire: The Life of Alma White* (Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1993). William Taylor did not share this disparagement of other cultures. He often insisted that American and British persons who acted like pagans but who claimed to be Christian were far worse than the others, and steadfastly maintained that there was nothing inherently superior about American culture. It would appear that Knapp did not share Taylor's view of culture and the world.

Others were accepted after being rejected by the Methodist Episcopal Church mission board such as Charles and Lettie Cowman who were rejected because of a lack of education, not for theological reasons.<sup>90)</sup> Knapp gave them a base and introduced them to the international Radical Holiness networks that would be marshalled to support their mission work. Finally missionaries were supported from within *The Revivalist* community. The Hirst family was the first missionary family, the Cowmans were the second missionary family sent supported by the *Revivalist*.<sup>91)</sup> Knapp's contacts were not limited to just the American missionaries. For example, Knapp enthusiastically accepted Juji Nakada, founder of the Holiness Church of Japan, as his equal, and recognized his superior abilities.<sup>92)</sup>

### **(5) "Pentecost": a paradigm for the new reality.**

Knapp drew from his radicalized reading of the biblical narratives a vision for a new reality. It was not a vision that he developed alone. It was being developed slowly and in fits, starts and contradictions among the ranks of the Radical Holiness preachers. Taking their cue from Samuel Keen, they came to focus on the biblical narrative of Pentecost as the normative scriptural text in light of which all others were to be interpreted. Knapp published Keen's work and was mentored by Keen. The key elements of this new "Apostolic" "Pentecost" understanding of Christianity were institutionalized by his students Seymour, Cook and Tomlinson as well as by the Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene, as well as eventually the Pilgrim Holiness Church. It can be argued that in no case were they so radical and comprehensive in their analysis as were Knapp, Seth Cook Rees, the Pentecost Bands, the "Churches of God" of the American South and the Vanguard Mission.

The tenets of the new "Pentecostal" or "Apostolic" Holiness movement, the Radical Holiness movement included:

---

89) See for example, Ethel Ward, "Voices from India," *Revivalist* 12, 22 (31 May 1900): 6; and, C. B. Ward, "Good News from India," *Revivalist* 12, 35 (30 August 1900): 9.

90) Although this is never mentioned by those Holiness persons rejected by the Board of Mission of the Methodist Episcopal Church, lack of education was primary, not Holiness beliefs. Most of the Methodist missionaries of this period were Holiness Methodists as their applications indicated. These are in the Methodist Archives at Drew University.

91) See for example, William. N. Hirst, "World Wide Missionary Conference," *Revivalist* 12, 19 (10 May 1900): 2; William N. and Mabel Hirst, "Announcement—Good News," *Revivalist* 12, 39 (27 September 1900): 7, announcing their sailing from New York to South Africa as missionaries under the aegis of the *Revivalist*.

92) There are numerous articles mentioning Nakada and by Nakada in the *God's Revivalist*. See especially, Martin Wells Knapp, "Ho! For Japan," *Revivalist* 12, 45 (8 November 1900): 9. which attests again to the crucial importance of Nakada for Radical Holiness mission in Japan. Another that is very important is J. Nakada, "From Japan," *God's Revivalist* 13, 8 (21 February 1901): 9. This article makes it clear that Nakada had already founded the Bible School in Tokyo, modeled after God's Bible School, had property and students. He was awaiting the promised support from the USA in the form of the Cowmans who did not arrive in Japan until significantly later. Cowmans were having "farewell" meetings to attempt to raise money in San Francisco in early 1901: "From Brother Cowman," *God's Revivalist* 13, 5 (31 January 1901): 9.

- Work for the equalization of power in churches, governments, leaders, corporations, businesses. These structures should have no monopoly on power or the right to use it to the detriment of others.
- Christians should use of all technology and celebrate the improvements of life.
- Support aspirations of humanity: facilitate positive transformation of the current realities.
- All of one's life and possessions should be devoted to God, used in conformity to God's will.
- All have equal access to God and to the power of God, unhampered by clergy or church: Baptism with the Holy Spirit for purity and power is for all.
- Clergy are appointed by God and should care only for God and for the common people [ministry to the poor, physical healing, evangelizing].
- Care for the poor, the sick, prisoners and the socially marginalized is at the core of the gospel: justice involves re-distribution of resources as well as respect for the all.
- Communalism, the equal distribution of resources according to needs and mutual care is the Pentecost paradigm for Christian life.
- Excess consumption takes away life and possessions from others and destroys the creation
- Human ingenuity and inventiveness must be used for the good of people rather than for the aggrandizement of the few who control the wealth.
- Christian, and all society should be egalitarian with no distinctions between race, creed, gender, class, sectional, laws, or educational attainment; all have equal value in the church, society and culture.
- The Pentecost Christian is to live expectantly, anticipating the imminent return of Christ who will right the wrongs and redeem and transform the world. It is "Our Hope".
- The vision of a just Pentecostal world is a global vision of love, mission and justice for transformation.
- The Pentecost Christian is to be pragmatic and entrepreneurial, using all to advance the Kingdom of God.
- Holiness Pentecost theology is pre-millennial: "look at the world" "who can believe it is getting better" only Christ can transform the world and the people in it.
- The Pentecost leader has clarity of program and of the definition of the new reality toward which she or he is leading.

This was the theological paradigm of the Radical Holiness movement. Supporting this was the conservative doctrinal consensus of the late nineteenth century among the Methodists and other daughter churches of the Second Great Awakening. It is important to remember that none of these ideas were unique to or originated by Knapp. He was one of a host of preachers preaching the same synthesis at the same time. The

influence of Knapp was not due to his original thinking or to his reflections about theology or practice. He was a key person in a larger network, centrally located, who like Wesley, borrowed and used the works and ideas of others to great advantage.

## **Why did the People Listen to Knapp and the other Radical Holiness Preachers**

Knapp was a voice, but he did not speak alone. For example:

“Let us not only save people’s souls but ... sanctify their circumstances (...) Let us, then, in the name of God and humanity, combine heartily to abolish slavery, drunkenness, lust, gambling, ignorance, pauperism, mammonism and war.” – Hugh Price Hughes, *Social Christianity*, 1889.

What the Welsh Methodist Hugh Price Hughes (1847-1902) was calling for can be seen also in the Progressive movement in the USA which began to take shape during the 1890s and continued up to the beginnings of World War II and the presidency of Franklin Delano Roosevelt. President Roosevelt’s wife Eleanor Roosevelt attended a Thanksgiving meal for the poor at God’s Bible School. She, her husband and the heirs of Knapp at God’s Bible School saw the correspondence of values and goals.

The Progressive movement sought to purify American culture, to make America a more humane place in which to live. They wanted to remove the powers that exploited the masses for personal gain. The Progressives sought to break the alliance between corrupt government and corrupt business. They sought to aid the poor, the elderly and unemployed and disabled. They sought relief for the impoverished farmers and worked to bring the technological progress (electrification and railroads) to all areas of the nation. They asserted the rights of women and African-Americans to vote and to live in equality and dignity; they believed that power would be more equally shared if all could vote. They promoted education, insisting on education that was practical, not just a matter of status. They fought against child labor. They supported the prohibition of alcohol and the regulation of tobacco products. They fought for the conservation of the physical beauty of the nation and of the soil, air and water. The Progressive Party was formed in 1912 and then its values became part of the Democratic Party in the Great Depression (1928-1939).

Another group formed about the same time. In 1905, the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW) (Wobblies) were organized. The Preamble of the IWW constitution states, “There can be no peace so long as hunger and want are found among millions of the working people and the few, who make up the employing class, have all the good things of life.” It sounds like Knapp as cited above! The IWW also sought to equalize power, share the fruit of human labors equally, and to care for the poor and underclasses. Their criticism of the power of industrialists and capitalists was like that of

Knapp. Knapp was however more inclusive in his recognition of the abuse of power. He included, in the lists of abuser of power, the older churches and the National Holiness Association!

Thus Knapp was speaking but not alone, and he was using the biblical motifs and stories as his warrants for his ideas. As part of a great cloud of witnesses clamoring for justice and for transformation of individuals and society, Knapp and his fellow Radical Holiness colleagues received a glad hearing from the common people. Significantly the powers of society and those fearful of change struck back. Persons from the Progressive movement, the IWW and Radical Holiness preachers were imprisoned as rabble rousers and disturbers of the peace. As noted above, Knapp was also arrested for disturbing the peace with his loud and raucous meetings, and taken to court. The Cincinnati newspapers mocked the Radical Holiness for, among other things, including African-Americans as prominent participants in their worship services. Later when Holiness and Pentecostals, many of whom were Radical Holiness who came to a slightly new definition of Pentecostal, worshipped with African-Americans and treated them as equals, they were persecuted. So intense was the persecution that separate and race based Holiness and Pentecostal denominations were formed. By the 1940's, and the advent of World War II, there was little time in the Radical Holiness preachers in American or European society. The churches that flourished all compromised with the new social realities and in their various ways sought to address the evolving cultures.

## Conclusion

Martin Wells Knapp argued for a version of modernity that would be more faithful to the biblical vision of a transformed humanity. As such it broke with the traditions of classical Christianity which focused on the power of the church and church leaders. Knapp and the rest of the Radical Holiness tradition insisted that "Pentecost" was the model, the biblical paradigm of the new community of God, the paradigm lived out by those who knew Jesus best.

Knapp and the other Radicals drew on, and modified the tradition of Wesley, Fletcher, Lorenzo Dow, Asa Mahan and others. Among the most important intellectual figures of Knapp's period were Samuel Keene, Seth Cook Rees, A. B. Simpson, William Boardman and A. M. Hills.<sup>93)</sup> They did this in the context of American culture of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and need to be understood in that context. They need to be understood in that context in which the Radical Holiness movement developed and in which Knapp ministered. He was neither the creator of this synthesis nor was he its only representative. Both his Holiness and Pentecostal students developed these ideas in ways he would not have foreseen. He was part of a large

---

93) All of these figures deserve additional study. All are crucial to understanding the Radical Holiness movement of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. It is hoped that these figures will be included in the study projects of STU.

“global” international network of radical Holiness people who were insisting that personal, theological and social transformation were part of the salvation offered by God through Jesus Christ, in the power of the Holy Spirit, as their mentor John Wesley had insisted.

Thus it is important to remember that Knapp was a figure of his period. Context is central in historical experience and research. After about 1939, people found the Radical Holiness (and IWW and Progressive) visions of a just and transformed world less convincing. The focus became on the smaller outward aspects of the vision (tobacco, dancing, alcohol, sex) and forgot the larger framework of Knapp and the early Radical Holiness leaders. The development of denominations among the Radical Holiness people also served to exclude and limit those who were most radical and they largely became Pentecostal. What Knapp had feared about denominations also came to be among the Radical Holiness people.

It is also important that Knapp and the Radical Holiness tradition produced two of four global Christian theological traditions that managed to supersede the boundaries of ethnicity and culture. The Holiness, Pentecostal, Catholic and Orthodox have achieved this in ways that the classical nationalistic reformation traditions did not. The later remain largely ethnic enclaves. In Korea it was precisely the theological structures of the “Fourfold Gospel,” or so it appears to this observer, developed in the framework of Korean culture that explains most adequately the phenomenon of Korean Christianity, but that is a discussion for another day!

I would posit that the particular social and theological synthesis Knapp represented has transformed World Christianity. It is hoped that the vision of the Radical Holiness movement can inform the current Holiness churches of the world as they, as we, seek to find a place to stand and to be prophetic in today's modern world. It is hoped that as part of this process, the entire Radical Holiness network will become a focus of study, not just Knapp, and all of course in their contexts.

## Appendix I: Radical “Pentecostal” Holiness Networks

This list of Radical “Pentecostal” Holiness networks could be a lot longer. There is not time in the context of this lecture to deal with the evolving relationships and ideas in this network between the 1870s and the 1930s, or beyond. Many important persons are not mentioned; the list could be many times longer. It is provided to demonstrate the scope and complexity of Knapp’s religious context within his own circles.

There were Radical Holiness “Pentecostal” ministry and/or educational centers in many cities, large and small, across the USA and Canada, including: Shiloh (ME), New York, Cincinnati, Atlanta, Holmes (NC), Chicago, Indianapolis, Louisville/Wilmore, Nashville, Topeka, St. Paul (MN), Pasadena/Greenville (TX), St. Louis, Los Angeles, Pasadena (CA), Oakland, San Francisco, Spokane, Seattle, Salem (OR), Portland (OR), Toronto, Ottawa. There were also representatives of this network in Asia, Africa and Europe, often with connections to those Radical Holiness leaders in the USA and Canada.

### Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in the Midwest/North

[Centers: Cincinnati, Chicago, Indianapolis, St. Louis]

- C. W. Ruth (1865-1941): Holiness Christian Association (1894), Holiness Christian Church (1897) Young Men’s Holiness Association (Indiana), Church of the Nazarene; (Ind.).<sup>94</sup>
- Seth Cook Rees (1854-1933): Friends, CMA, International Apostolic Holiness Union, MCA; Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene, Pilgrim Holiness.
- Hulda Rees (1855-1898): Friends; CMA.
- H. E. Malone: Ohio Yearly Meeting of Friends
- Byron Johnson Rees (1877-1920): Friends.
- David Updegraff: Friends.
- Samuel A. Keen (1842-1895): MEC.
- George David Watson (1845-1924): MEC, CMA, WMC.
- Solomon Benjamin Shaw (1854-1941): WMC, FM, CMA, Primitive Holiness Mission.
- Wilson Thomas Hogue (1852-1920): FMC ,
- V. A. Dake (1854-1892), FM; Pentecost Bands.<sup>95</sup>
- Aaron Merritt Hills (1848-1935) Congregationalist to Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene Vanguard Mission, St. Louis, including: C. W. Sherman and Anna Abrams.  
MCA: separated from MEC (1899); hired Seth Rees (1900) published *Burning Bush* from 1902.

94) See for example works of C. W. Ruth: Definitions of Sanctification, (Westfield, IN: Union Bible Seminary, n.d.); and, The Gift of Tongues, (Cincinnati: God’s Bible School and Missionary Training Home, n.d.).

### **Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in the South**

**[Centers: Louisville/Wilmore, Nashville, Texas, Meridian MS, Jackson MS, Atlanta]**

- William Baxter Godbey (1833-1920): MEC.
- John Wesley Beeson, Meridian Mississippi.
- H. C. Morrison (1857-1942): MECS. Published *Pentecostal Herald* from 1897.
- Leander Lycurgus Pickett (1859-1928): MECS.
- Benjamin Franklin Haynes (1851-1923): MECS, Church of the Nazarene.
- Reuben A. (Bud) Robinson (1860-1942): MECS (expelled for Holiness views) to MCA. Organized the 1901 Chicago revival. Joined Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene.
- James Octavius McClurkan (1861-1914): Cumberland Presbyterian. Founded Pentecostal Literary and Bible Training School, Nashville; Pentecostal Alliance (with the CMA); left CMA in 1901 to form Pentecostal Alliance which became the Pentecostal Mission and then of the Church of the Nazarene.
- Mary Lee Cagle (1864-1955): New Testament Church of Christ, becomes Holiness Church of Christ; a founder of the Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene.
- Beverly Carradine (1848-1931): MECS.

### **Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in the West**

**[Centers: Los Angeles, San Francisco/Oakland, Denver, Seattle, Spokane, Salem/Portland, OR]**

- T. P. Ferguson (1853-1920): MEC, Peniel Mission.
- Phineas F. Bresee (1838-1915): MEC, Peniel Mission, Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene.
- Lizzie Helen Snyder Glide (1852-1951): MECS.
- Seth Cook Rees (1854-1933).
- Carrie Judd Montgomery, Oakland.
- Alma White, Denver (also New Jersey).
- Kent White, Denver.
- Edward Franklin Walker (1852-1918): MEC, Presbyterian, Congregational; Church of the Nazarene.
- Alma White (1862-1946): MEC, Pentecostal Union, Pillar of Fire.
- M. L. Ryan (Salem, Oregon; Spokane): Holiness Church, Pentecostal.
- B. H. Irwin, Topeka Kansas (and other locations): Holiness, Pentecostal.

---

95) Note that he died on ship with William Taylor as they were headed to Africa to do mission work.



## Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in the North-East

[Centers: Providence, New York, Boston

- William Edwin Boardman (1810-1886): Presbyterian.<sup>96)</sup>
- Charles Cullis (1833-1892) Episcopal Church, healing and holiness advocate.
- Frank Sanford (Shiloh, Maine).
- Seth Cook Rees (1854-1933).
- Frank Mortimer Messenger (1852-1931): MEC, MCA, Church of the Nazarene.
- R. Kelso Carter (1849-1926): Presbyterian-MEC; associate of Simpson, healing advocate.

## Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in Canada

- Albert Sims (1851-1935): Primitive Methodist, FM. wrote for God's Revivalist.
- Ralph Cecil Horner (1854-1921): Methodist, Holiness Movement Church, Standard Church of America.

## Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in the Europe

- Mary Baxter, London.
- Elizabeth Sisson, London
- William Arthur, Great Britain, Wesleyan Methodist.<sup>97)</sup>
- Reader Harris, Great Britain [and all of his colleagues at Starr Hall].
- T. B. Barratt (1862-1940): Norway: MEC, founder of European Pentecostalism.
- Sivert V. Ulness, Norway: Free Methodist, Pentecost Bands.
- Erik Andersen Nordquelle (1858-1938), Norway: Pentecost Bands, Pentecostal.
- John Ongman (1845-1931), Sweden: Lutheran, Baptist, Holiness-Baptist, Pentecostal-Baptist.
- John Alexius Edgren (1839-1908): USA: Swedish Holiness Baptist.
- Jonathan A. B. Paul, Germany: Lutheran, Holiness Movement, Pentecostal.
- Count Nicolay, Finland, Russia: Lutheran.
- Emil Gustafsson, Sweden.
- Dorothea Trudel, Switzerland.
- Otto Stockmayer, Switzerland.
- Theodor Jellinghaus, Germany.

96) Best known for his book Higher Christian Life (1859), which was crucial to the Keswick version of Holiness, he was a close associate of A. B. Simpson, Charles Cullis, Asa Mahan, E. Sisson, M. Baxter, A. B. Simpson (1843-1919) Presbyterian-CMA. During the 1870s organized Holiness Association meetings and camp-meetings throughout the North.

97) William Arthur can be considered a sort of precursor to the Radical Holiness movement. He was a determined proponent of holiness. He remains appreciated by the Radical Holiness

### Radical Holiness Leaders/Theologians/Activists in the Asia and Australia

- John Sung, China: Bethel Mission.
- Pandita Ramabai, India.
- J. Nakada, Japan.
- Yee Yong Do, Korea.
- George Mitchell, Australia.

Also numerous Holiness missionaries from mission organizations based in Canada, Denmark, Great Britain, Ireland, The Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, and the USA.

### APPENDIX II

"My Powerhouse"

I have a Power House up in the sky;  
Down come its currents to me from on high;  
Wires are running from it to my soul;  
Waves from its batteries over me roll.

Over these wires comes the current that kills;  
Over them too comes the Spirit that fills;  
Sin is destroyed and the old man is dead;  
Glory to God; how the fire now will spread

Chorus        Are your wires all up to this house in the sky?  
                  Do the currents come down to your soul from on high?  
                  Oh the peace and the joy that triumphantly roll,  
                  As the Spirit descends and is thrilling my soul.<sup>98)</sup>

---

movement, especially for his book *Tongue of Fire* (1859) written primarily during an extended visit to the home of Phoebe Palmer in New York.

98) Martin Wells Knapp, "My Power House," *Praise of His Glory Songs* ed. R. E. McNeill, et alia (Cincinnati: God's Bible School and Revivalist, 1922), no. 86.

### APPENDIX III: The Gospel Train

This song written by George W. Perry, with music by George L. Brown, is a typical railroad song. It was included in *Tears and Triumphs Combined*, a volume that resulted from the collaboration of L. L. Pickett and Martin Wells Knapp. The fourth stanza was written by Knapp and further demonstrates his concern for the use of tobacco.<sup>99)</sup> The issues raise in the song are one piece of evidence that the values of Knapp were shared throughout the Radical Holiness Movement.

The gospel train is coming, I see it just at hand,  
I hear the wheels rolling Triumphant through the land.

The way is free, and all may go, The rich and poor are there,  
No second class on board this train, No difference in fare.

The telegraph is by the way, It reaches up to God,  
To tell our friends who've gone before That we are on the road.

**No smoking car is there to marr The happy heav'nly ride,  
A parlor couch is free to all The fully sanctified.**

It's coming around the mountain, Its passengers to take,  
Our savior is on board the train, Controlling steam and brake.

I hear the welcome whistle, I'm sure 't will be on time,  
Poor sinner, you're forever lost, If you are left behind.

It's halting at the station, Oh! must we say farewell?  
O sinner must we leave you? Escape from sin and hell!

Chorus: Get on board, Oh, quickly heed the call:  
Get on board, hurry, There's room for one and all.

99) *Tears and Triumphs Combined for Revivals, Sunday Schools and the Home* ed. L. L. Pickett, J. R. Bryant, and Martin Wells Knapp (2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Cincinnati: Martin Wells Knapp, Y. M. C. A. Building, 1899), Part II: no. 147.

서울신학대학교 글로벌사중복음연구소 주관

< 제 1 회 국제학술세미나 >

## 오순절성결운동 지도자 마틴 넵과 21세기 한국성결교회

### 제1발표 “근대성을 위한 종교”

발표 : 데이비드 번디 박사  
(New York Theological Seminary, 세계기독교연구교수)

번역 : 박창훈 교수  
(서울신학대학교, 교회사)

2014. 3. 10(월) 오후 2:00, 서울신학대학교 100주년기념관 512호 영성실습실에서

마틴 웰스 넵(1853-1901)은 역사가와 현대에 그를 열광하는 사람들 모두에게 난해한 인물이다. 그는 단호한 급진적 성결주창자, 불규칙하게 공부한 목회자, 복음전도자, 중요 종교출판가, 기자, 신시네티 하나님의 성서학원(God's Bible School)과 오하이오와 켄터키의 캠프미팅 창설자였다. 가난한 사람들에게 열정적으로 음식과 옷을 나누었고, 의사들에게 반대하지 않으면서도 신유를 강조하였으며, 스스로 사회적으로 종교적으로 급진주의자라고 선언하였다. 종교 행위 가운데 그가 행한 예배가 너무 시끄러워 평화를 위협한다고 체포되기도 하였다. 그는 자기 “교구” 밖의 캠프미팅에서 설교하였다는 이유로 감리교회에 의해 검열 받고 재판을 받았다. 교단의 영성과 선교를 갱신하기 위해 자신의 원래 교단에 남아야 한다고 오랫동안 변론하였으나, 그와 성결동료들에 대한 박해를 실제로 감지하였기에 그는 죽기 직전 감리교회에서 분리되었다. 넵은 그의 사상과 영향에서 생긴 전통내에서 영향력이 있었고, 논란이 많았으며, 영광을 받았다.

### 왜 마틴 넵이 중요한가?

급진적 성결네트워크(Radical Holiness Network)에서 넵의 역할은 그의 출판과 신시네티 하나님의 성서학원에서 돋보였다. 그의 연결망과 그가 참여한 급진적 성결네트워크는 세계 기독교를 이해하는데 중요하다.

하나님의 성서학원 초기 학생들 가운데 아주사거리선교회의 설립자 윌리엄 세이무어가 있었는데, 이 단체는 세계의 성결인물들과 다른 사람들의 주의와 상상력을 붙잡았고, 오늘날 알려진 것과 같은 오순절주의를 낳았다. 인디애나의 웨이커인 톰린슨은 하나님의 성서학원에 참석하였고, “하나님의 교회”(Cleveland)와 “예언의 하나님 교회” 등 두 개의 오순절 교단을 형성하는 것으로 나아갔다. 글렌 쿡은 아주사거리선교회와 내쉬빌의 메이슨의 교회가 오순절주의로 바뀌는 사이의 주요연결고리인데, 이것이 “그리스도의 하나님교회”의 모교회가 되었다(그리고 후에 “하나님의 성회”가 되었다). 쿡은 또한 세계오순절성회가 “단위론”신학을 수용하는데 주요 인물이었다. 그는 일본과 한국에서 성결운동이 발전하는데 중요한 인물이었다: 나카다 주지, 찰스 카우만과 레티 카우만, 길보른 집안은 하나님의 성서학원의 “학생들”이었고, 존 토마스는 이 학교와 깊은 연관이 있었다. 이들은 동양선교회(OMS), 일본성결교회, 한국성결교회의 궁극적인 설립자들이었다.

급진적 성결교회들은 냅과 하나님의 성서학원에 깊이 빚을 지고 있었다. 그들 가운데 필그림성결교회(1922)의 설립자들이 있었다. 처음에 냅의 목회를 본뵈고, 찰스 카우만을 기독교 목회를 위해 인수하였던 모임이었던, 보다 급진적인 메트로폴리탄 교회연합의 설립자들처럼, 각각의 인물들은 하나님의 성서학원과 냅의 네트워크의 한 부분이었다. 세인트루이스의 밴가드 선교회처럼, 전도와 사회적 비전에서 너무 급진적이어서 교단으로부터 퇴출당한 자유감리교회의 오순절밴드는 냅과 공동의 노력을 하였다. 결국 미국전역과 세계의 선교사들은 냅의 간행물을 대변하게 되었고, 그것으로부터 영향을 받았다. 그들을 통하여, 냅과 다른 “급진주의자들”의 저작은 노르웨이어를 포함한 다양한 언어로 번역되었고, 그 언어로부터 다른 언어로, 스칸디나비아반도 전역에 그리고 그들의 선교프로그램을 통하여 전 세계에, 성결교회들 그리고 오순절교회들에 영향을 주었다.

냅의 영향은 또한 나사렛교회에서도 볼 수 있었다. 그의 친한 친구 가운데는 루스, 맥컬간, 세스 쿡 리스, 힐스 등이 있었고, 이들 모두는 처음 오순절 나사렛교회라 불렀던 교회설립에 중요한 역할을 하였다. 나사렛교회의 이후 지도자들은 하나님의 성서학원과 급진적 성결네트워크 영향권에서 나타났다. 나사렛교회가 보다 사회적으로 고상한 피비 팔머의 “응접실 성결”에서 지적인 혈통을 추적하려고 하지만, 아마도 마틴 웰스 냅과 그의 동료들의 급진적 성결운동을 통하여 그 혈통을 추적하는 것이 보다 정확할 것이다. 팔머는 대개 당시의 사회적 이슈로부터 떨어져서, 대립적이지 않은 복음전파를 시도했다. 냅과 그의 네트워크 출신의 초기 나사렛인들의 다수는 그 반대였다.

하나님의 성서학원이 또한 주요한 교수들을 끌어왔다는 것은 주목할 만하다. 초기 교수 가운데는 힐스, 갓비, 오스월드 채임벌스 등이 있었다. 당연히 냅은 자신의 출판으로 왓슨, 비버리 카라딘, 사무엘 킨, 힐스, 세스 쿡 리스, (후에 오순절 전도자이며 신학자가 된) 애비 모로우, 갓비 같은 신학자들을 성결운동과 성결 감리교 내의 가족이 되게 하였다. 그가 출판한 책들은 세계에서 인용되고, 재출판되고, 표절되고, 다시 해석되고, 번역되었다. 「부흥지」(그리고 이후의 제목)는 또한 중요한 자극제였고, 지원은 성결선교사들에게 발판과 홍보를 제공했다. 20세기에 들어서면서 많은 독립적인 성결선교사들은 그들의 전반적인 경제적 기반을 냅의 간행물에 신세 지고 있었다.

냅은 그가 만든 조직들 외의 다른 조직의 지도자가 아니었고, 그리고 그것들이 크게 성장하거나 전통적인 방식에서는 중요하지 않았을지라도, 그의 영향과 세계 기독교에 대한 급진성결운동의 영향은 넓고 깊었다. 전통들이 되어가면서 그가 영향을 준 사람들은 21세기 기독교 공동

체에서 아주 이상하게도 가장 큰 2개의 전통을 만들었다.

냅이 급진적 성결네트워크의 중요인물이라는 개선된 이미지로 인해, 열광적인 추종자들은 그에 대한 많은 신화를 촉발시켰다. 급진적 성결네트워크는 역사적 전통을 해석할 연구소를 만들지 않았다. 급진적 성결 추종자들은 종종 무리하여, 사회적 약자의 위치에 귀 기울이고자했던 사회적으로 존경할만한 관행을 때때로 깨뜨렸다. 사실 급진적 성결네트워크는 결과적으로 경쟁자들이나 방계가족과 너무 떨어지게 되어, 역사적으로 무시되었고 주변부로 간주되었다. 그렇다면 학자들은 마틴 웰스 냅이 대표하는 사회적·교회적으로 주변부였던 귀족과 냅 자신을 어떻게 다루어왔는가? 이제 우리의 관심을 끄는 것이 바로 이 문제다.

## 냅을 이해하기 위한 범주는 무엇인가?

냅이 교회와 사회의 주변에 위치하며, 그의 단체가, 즉 그가 영감을 주거나 만든, 냅의 경우엔 하나님의 성서학원이 현대의 미국 종교와 사회의 “주류”로부터 떨어져 있는 것 같은데, 어떻게 그러한 인물의 삶과 업적을 이해할 수 있을까? 냅이 중요하지만, 이론을 지지하는 예시 이상으로 수행된 냅에 대한 연구는 최근에서야 겨우 이루어지고 있다. 이것은 일반적으로 무시되었던 급진적 성결운동에 대해서도 사실이다. 좀 더 잘 알려졌다면, 종교의 가장자리에서나 고려될 수 있는 수많은 사람들 가운데 포함되었을 것이다. 리차드 호프스타터나 찰스 테일러의 예와 같이, 종교학은 수십 년간 종교적 급진주의자들을 상류사회로 간주되는 것 가장자리에 있는 반-근대적인 것으로 이해하려는 경향이 있었다.

가장자리의 종교로 간주하는 학자들은 이해를 돕기 위한 예를 찾고자 했다. 로버트 메입스 앤더슨은 사회학적이고 마르크스주의적인 이론을 사용하여, 오순절주의를 “상속권 없는 비전”으로 분석하였다. 앤 테이브스와 로드리 헤이워드 같은 이들은 그 운동을 “내적 제국”의 건축물로 이해하였다. 리차드 휴와 그랜트 웨커를 포함하여 다른 이들은, 초기/원시 기독교를 “환원하라”는 주장으로 인해 이 미국의 전통을 “원시주의자”와 “환원주의자”로 이해하였다. 도널드 데이튼과 윌리엄 파펠은 신학적 범주를 사용하였다. 데이튼은 심슨과 애미 샘플 맥퍼슨의 유산이라며 가장 대중적으로 이해되는 신학적 결합으로, 오순절주의와 성결운동을 이끈 “사중복음”에 집중하였다. 윌리엄 파펠은 종말론이 오순절주의의 기원과 발전을 이해하는 중요 요소라고 주장하였다.

냅을 이해하는데 도움을 준 과정은 특별히 그가 죽은 직후 그의 친한 친구이며 급진적 성결동료인 (아래에서 다룰) 힐스의 전기와 함께 시작했다. 힐스는 그를 “하나님의 경이 가운데 하나”이며, 다른 사람들을 대신하여 일하고 기독교 신앙의 평등적인 성결비전을 발전시킨 하나님의 위대한 인물로 해석했다. 로이드 레이먼드 데이는 적절하게 그를 신시네티 하나님의 성서학원의 초기 역사에서 중요 인물로 그리고 있다. 레온 힌슨과 알 투르스테일은 냅을 성결운동의 전통들을 설명하는데 도움을 주는 인물로 선택하였다. 힌슨과 투르스테일은 냅이 피비 팔머의 “제단신학”의 의미를 담고 있는 것으로 지적했다. 투르스테일은 힌슨 보다 더 나아가, 냅이 그 주제에 혼란을 겪으면서 자신의 이해를 발전시켰다고 봐야한다고 제안했다. 그들이 잘못 이해한 것이 중요하다: 냅에게는 인간성에 대한 낙관주의나 “성서적” 성결의 약속을 요청하는 기도에 대한 하나님의 순간적인 응답에 대한 낙관주의가 없다. 그는 성결의 확신과 성화된 사람으로 살아가는 삶을 위한 능력을 부여하는 순간경험을 유지하면서도, 성결에 대하여 분투로 특징되는 느린 과정을 선호하는 쪽으로 나아갔다. 여기서 냅은 피비 팔머보다 더 웨슬리안적이다. 힌슨과 투르스테일은 19세기와 20세기 초 성결운동내에서 웨슬리안 신학으로의 변화를 애석해했다.

몇몇 학자들은 냅의 유산에 대한 중요한 과업에 기여했다. 마르셀 알렌 램은 냅의 저서에 나타나는 이집트-가나안 주제에 집중하여 냅의 주석방법을 설명하려고 하였다. 그의 결론, 즉 냅의 주석이 “문자적인 의미 이상”이라는 결론은 놀랍지도 않으며 냅도 모욕이라 생각하지 않을 것이다. 사실 이것은 고대본문에 대한 현대적인 의미로 고민하는 거의 모든 사람들에게 어느 정도 적용될 수 있기 때문이다. 로렌스 우드는 냅이 플랫처와 오순절주의 사이의 빠진 부분을 완성하는 원-오순절이었다고 주장하였는데, 그 주장은 다른 사람들이 냅 이전에 “오순절”이란 용어를 사용하고 있었고 냅은 스스로 “오순절”이 의미하는 혈통이라고 해석하는 것을 불편해하는 전통을 대표하며, 유일한 지도자도 아니라는 사실을 고려하지 않았다. 홍용표는 (피비 팔머에 반대하는 것 이상으로) 냅이 웨슬리에게 의존하고 있음을 인정하지 않는 “자유주의적” 웨슬리안과는 대조적으로 “성서적 성결”의 지지자였으며, “사중복음”용어의 지지자였다고 주장한다. 그리고 냅이 (1922년 설립된) 필그림성결교회의 진정한 설립자이며, OMS와는 반대로, 한국성결교회의 원초적인 뿌리가 된다고 주장한다.

마틴 웰스 냅을 이해하는데 매우 중요하게 기여한 두 명의 학자는 윌리스 손튼과 윌리엄 코스트리비이다. 손튼은 냅의 초상을 역사-비평적으로 주의 깊고 예리한 “내부자”라고 할 수 있는 모습으로 그렸다. 급진 성결전통의 학자이며 참여자로서 손튼은 타의 추종을 불허하는 그 역사의 섬세한 사실을 포착하였다. 그는 또한 미국종교사의 중요한 학자이며, 주의 깊게 냅을 그 원칙에서 해석하는 것으로 취급하였다. 불행하게도, 그의 완전하고 세심한 분석은 아직 출판되지 않았다. 이 책, 『성서로 돌아가서: 하나님의 성서학원 이야기』(2001)는 100주년 기념 헌정으로 예정되었으나, 다른 압박과 하나님의 성서학원의 지원부족으로 완성되지 못했다. 이처럼, 손튼의 저술은 학교의 초기시기와 냅에 대한 중요한 분석을 남겨두고 있다. 이 연구의 일부분이 두 개의 논문으로 출판되었다.

윌리엄 코스트리비는 후에 교단으로 설립된 또 하나의 급진적 성결목회였던, 메트로폴리탄 교회연합에 주목하였다. 그는 냅과 「부흥지」 네트워크와 메트로폴리탄 교회연합의 설립자들과의 가까운 관계, 즉 양쪽의 지도자 개인들을 포함하여 양방향으로 영향을 주고받았음을 기록하였다. 그는 탁월하게도 미국역사의 “진보시대”라는 배경에 메트로폴리탄 교회연합을 두고, 그것을 급진적 성결운동의 대표자로서 해석하였다.

이 학자들의 업적위에, 본 논문은 냅이 근대성에 대한 여타 해석과는 다른 또 다른 근대성을 추구하는 국제적인 충격(운동)의 대표자이며 참여자로 가장 잘 이해될 수 있다고 주장한다. 둘째로 냅은 그의 이야기와 신학을 형성한 미국적 맥락에서 이해되어야만 한다고 주장한다. 냅이 수행한 개인적이며, 신학적이고, 사회적이며, 목회적인 결정에 대한 의미들을 제공하는 것이 그 배경이다. 그 배경에 결정적인 것은 냅의 동료였던 남성과 여성의 집합체였던 바로 급진적 성결 네트워크였다.

## 의미 있는 근대적 “자아”: 냅과 힐스에 대한 생각들

냅과 그의 초기 목회에 관해 우리가 아는 것 대부분은 냅 그 자신으로부터, 혹은 그의 출판물을 통하여 직접적으로, 아니면 그의 첫 전기 작가 힐스가 사용한 일기로 부터, 감리교 미시간연회의 기록물로부터, 독립적인 『미시간 성결록』으로부터, 그리고 『부흥지』로부터 온다. 냅은 냅에 대한 우리 지식의 1차 자료이며, 그의 자기-해석이 힐스 저술의 기초이다. 힐스는 단순히

그 이야기에 성인전 같은 틀을 제공했을 뿐이다. 항상 그렇듯이, 전기적이고 자서전적인 이야기는 항상 가치와 목적을 설명하는 것으로 나아간다. 성인들의 삶의 이야기는 성인들에 의해, 그리고 성인전 작가에 의해 배양된다. 이것이 그 생각과 날짜가 거짓임을 의미하는 것은 아니며, 한 인생에 대한 어떤 관점을, 즉 의미를 드러낸다.

냅의 “생애”에 대해서도 같다고 할 수 있다. 그 이야기에 따르면, 그의 이야기는 가난에서 부유함으로 전환되는 이야기이며, 하나님에 대한 전적인 헌신의 예증이 되는 이야기이다. 그는 1853년 3월 27일 “미시간-주 칼흔-군 클래렌틴의 방 한 칸짜리 통나무집”에 사는 가난한 가정에서 태어났다. 그 가족은 힘겹게 살아나갔다. 극한 노동과 아마도 잘 먹지 못해서, 냇의 아버지의 건강은 몹시 나빴고, 마틴 웰스 냇의 건강도 계속 악화되었다. 교육에 대한 어머니의 열성으로, 냇은 감리교 교단의 미시간주 알비온의 알비온 대학에 등록하였다. 가족부양을 위해 농장에서 일을 해야 했기에 공부는 자주 중단되었고 계획적일 수 없었다. 6년에 걸쳐 그는 2년의 교과 과정을 겨우 마칠 수 있었고, 탁월하지도 않았다.

마틴 웰스 냇은 1년의 “공과연구”를 마친 후, 1881년 감리교회 미시간 연회소속의 목회를 시작하여, 몇 군데의 목회지에서 봉사하였고, 자주 교인들의 반대에 부딪혔다. 그의 진술에 따르면, 그는 소심하고, 두려움이 많으며, 좌절감을 느꼈다. 그가 이러한 직업에서 살아남았다는 사실은 틀림없이 그의 아내 루시 글렌의 재능과 신뢰 덕이라는 것이 중요하다. 루시 글렌 냇은 뛰어난 연설가이며, 재정, 재원, 사람들에게 대한 탁월한 경영자였고, 남편보다 나은 교육을 받았다. 미시간 연회의 전도사로 임명되었을 때, 루시 글렌 냇과 마틴 웰스 냇 둘 모두 포함되었다. 냇은 아내를 영감을 주는 멘토로 생각했다. 그들은 1888년 「부흥지」의 설립을 포함하여 사역의 모든 면에서 협력하였다. 1890년 9월 그녀가 감기로 죽자, 냇과 그의 가족의 생애에 커다란 틈이 생겼다.

2년 후 1894년 9월 14일 냇은 루시의 친구이며 사무실 조력자였던 미니 펄과 결혼하였고, 2달 후 신혼부부는 성결복음전도를 계속하기 위해 오하이오 신시네티로 이사했다. 거기서 냇과 그의 동료들은 마틴 웰스 냇의 전설이 되는 십여년간의 열렬한 활동을 시작했다. 갖비는 그를 “사람이라기보다는 천사를 연상시키는 다정함”을 가진 사람으로 기억하였지만, 그는 절대적으로 형언할 수 없고, 분명히 거부할 수 없는, 인간의지에 대한 능력이 있었다. 힐스의 묘사는 더 복잡하다:

그는 약 1m 63cm의 키에 54kg의 몸무게를 가졌다. 그의 몸의 비율은 좋지 않았는데, 대체적인 평가는, 몸의 여러 부분과 요소가 우연히 결합되었거나 우스운 자연적 우연으로 만난 것 같았다. 친숙하지 않은 청중들이 갖는 그의 첫 인상은 항상 유쾌하지 않았다.

힐스는 냇이 교육도 부족하고, 세련미도 없으며, 좋은 목소리가 아니고, 매력적인 육체적 특성을 지니지 않았음에도 불구하고, 많은 것을 이루었다고 주장했고, 냇이 “인생을 고양시키고, 고귀하게 하며, 변화시키는 성령의 능력”의 증거라고 결론 내렸다. 이러한 요소로 당시의 유명하고, 잘 생겼으며, 우렁찬 여러 성결부흥사들과는 극명한 대조를 보이는 그의 잘 알려지지 않은 지도력으로 나타나게 하였다. 「부흥지」에서, 그는 스스로를 보통의 소심한 사람으로 표현하였다. 그와 그의 전기작가 힐스는 줄곧 냇을 하나님의 능력을 통해 역경을 극복하는 인생의 예로 표현하였다. 그의 급진적 성결동료들도 그를 다르게 생각했다는 증거는 없다.

힐스는 냇을 성결인들로 하여금 자신들의 다른 전통, 교회, 사회적 지위를 고려하여 가능한 협력하도록 독려하는 성결연합운동가로 그리고 있다. 냇은 “성령세례는 이름이나 신조나 지역에 관계없이 하나님의 사람들을 모두 한 몸으로 연합시킨다”고 강조하였다. 그는 감리교 이외의



전통들이 “성결”을 가르치고 체험하였다는 사실을 기뻐하였다. 그는 감리교와 비-감리교 성결연설가와 저술가들을 「부흥지」의 페이지에 소개하였다. 아래에서 논의하게 될, 어떤 형태의 부정의에 대해서도 그가 단호하게 비난하였을지라도, 냅은 청중들에 대한 영적인 조언에서는 보다 부드러웠던 것 같다: 그는 설득하려고 하면서도, 청중들이 하나님과 화해하여 찾고, 반응하며, 선택할 것이라 신뢰하였다.

동시에, 냅은 논쟁을 피하지 않았다. 그는 교회나 정부나 사회의 강력한 힘에 의해 제한받는 것에 반대했다. 그는 부정의에 대해 강력하게 분노하고 분개했는데, 그에게 있어 그것은 사람들-대중들로부터 성결의 “축복”을 멀어지게 하기 때문이었다. 그는 「부흥지」의 구성과 설교에서 강력하고 공격적으로 여성의 사역을 권장하고 격려했다. 여성들은 「부흥지」의 신학과 주석란에서 중요한 필진으로 참여하였다. 여기에는 애나 아브람스, 베아트리스 피니, 레티 카우만, 홀다리스, 알마 화이트, 엘리자베스 펄, 미니 린드버그, 마벨 히르스트, 바바라 허시, 그리고 애비 모로우 등이 있었다. 그는 하나님의 성서학원 생활에서 학생과 예배위원에 흑인을 포함하기까지 하였고 전략적으로 그 모임들에 참여자로 삼았는데, 신시네티 신문에서 비웃는 인종차별 만화로 입증될 정도였다. 전천년설과 기존교회를 떠나 “탈퇴주의”를 선택한 이들에 대한 냅의 격려로 인해, 아만다 베리 스미스가 관계를 끊었을지라도 그는 그녀와 협력했다.

힐스는 성결의 체험의 효험에 관하여 냅을 이상주의자이지만, 실용적이고 기업가적이라고 소개하였다. 알비온과 신시네티에서의 냅의 발전요소를 소개하면서, 힐스는 그 순간에 너무 사로잡혀서, 그 프로그램의 명확함과, 냅이 급진적 성결운동을 인도하려고 행했던 새로운 실제의 정의의 명확함을 놓쳤다. 힐스는 그들이 떠난 교단과 같은 구조를 발전시키려고 했던, 새로운 “탈퇴자들”의 교회에 속한 전형적인 성결운동 설교자로 냅을 해석했다고 할 수 있다. 그는 의도적으로 교회와 사회에 대한 냅의 비전의 급진주의에 침묵했다. 1902년까지 힐스는 성결교단을 형성하기를 선호했다. 그것은 냅이 분명하게 가치를 공유하는 사람들 그러나 정해진 구조를 갖지 않았던 “연합”을 선호하여 피하고자 했던 구조였다. 감리교회로부터의 분리 이전과 이후에 냅은 교단, 성결교단 조차도 시작하는 것에 반대했다.

이 평가가 힐스의 업적을 손상시키려는 것은 아니다. 그는 텍사스 성결대학교에서 근무한 예일 대학교에서 교육받은 학자였고, 그의 첫 저서도 마틴 웰스 냅에 의해 출판되었다! 그의 저서들은 여전히 출판되고, 읽히며, 가치가 있다.

## 새로운 근대성을 찾는 냅의 탐구를 이해하기 위한 범주들

### (1) 도시화, 산업화, 그리고 근대화

위에서 밝힌 것처럼, “부흥적인” 종교에 대한 많은 학자들은 그 참여자들을 반-도시, 반-산업화, 반-근대, 존재하지 않았던 과거 이상세계를 복제하려는 원시주의의 장려자들로 본다. 이것은 적어도 윌리엄 워렌 스위트의 『미국 국경의 종교』 출판 이래로 사실이었다. 그러나 실제로는 앞에서 언급한대로 더 복잡하다.

냅은 그 점에서 한 예이다. 그는 미시간 알비온이라는 작은 마을에 간행물과 출판본부들 둔 미시간의 작은 마을 목회에서부터, 그가 할 수 있는 한 통신과 교통이 연결되는 곳에 가까이 위치한 주요 도시 중심지인 오하이오 신시네티로 이동했다. 그가 도시의 야만성과 가난한 사람들과 도시이주자들에 대한 착취를 통탄해 했을지라도, 그는 도시를 찾았고, 그 근대성을 강조했다.

모임이 알려지면 대개 대중교통체계에 대한 언급도 포함했다. 철도와 전보가 강조되어 영적인 생명과 영적인 죽음의 은유로 사용되었다. 특히 시간과 장소를 줄여서 사람들로 하여금 스스로 거의 실시간에 세계 전체와 연관되었다고 생각할 수 있게 하였다. 실제로 사람들은 민첩하게 나라를 돌아다니고 세계를 보다 빠르게 여행하고 소통할 수 있었다. 「부흥지」의 사역의 영향력을 나타내는 지도는 신시네티로부터 미국 전역과 캐나다 대부분을 비추는 햇빛을 표현하였다! 대륙횡단 철도와 전보의 넓은 네트워크는 여전히 새롭고 흥미로웠다.

선택이 필요한 철도환승장은 영적인 선택에 대한 우화가 되었다. 인간으로부터 존엄성, 음식, 거주지를 빼앗는 근대성의 모습이 비난받을지라도, 인간의 창조성과 생산성은 고양되었다. 인쇄의 발전과 저렴한 종이와 우표의 생산은 그의 목회의 기본이었으며, 그는 이러한 것들을 열정적으로 사용함으로 향유하였다. 그는 신기술반대자가 아니었다! 급진적 성결활동가의 국가적인 네트워크는 철도로 인해 가능했다. 그러므로 그들의 동기를 가능하게 했던 철도와 기술은 창조의 또 다른 측면과 같이 하나님의 선물로 보였다.

브뤼노 라투르는 사회를 형성하는 대화와 결정에서 동역자로서 긍정적인 역할을 수행하면서, 기술이 그들을 만든 사회에서 “행위자”가 된다고 주장했다. 마틴 웰스 법과 기술(철도, 인쇄, 전보, 전기) 사이의 관계에서 대화를 볼 수 있다. 이 기술이 강자를 더 강하게 만들고, 중독물(술, 담배, 약물) 공급자들이 중독자시장에 더 잘 연결되고 확대할 때 이러한 기술에 반대하면서도, 법은 이러한 기술의 강점에 따르고 있다. 이 대화에서 그는 저가분배를 가능하게 하는 체계(철도)를 공격하지 않지만, 그리스도인들이 중독물의 소비자나 공급자가 되지 않도록 강조한다. 그리스도인들은 이러한 생산물(“독주,” 마약, 과식, 음탕과 다른 죄들)에 저항함으로 “장수하도록” 권고를 받는다. 법은 커피도 술에 대한 대체 중독이 될 수 있다는 의견을 밝혔다. 이것들도 인생에서 동반자로서 받아들이는 사람들의 마음과 몸을 좌우하는 “행위자”이다.

넵이 쓴 노래에서 보다 분명하게 기술과의 대화를 볼 수 있다. 예를 들면 다음과 같다:

하나님의 전선

내 영혼에서 하늘 위까지, 예수님이 놓으신 전선이 있네.  
위대한 순간의 전보는 자주 빠르게 저 높이 날아,  
이제 그렇게 아주 가까이, 하나님과 하늘로부터의 도움을 전하네, 그의 이름에 영광을.

구세주의 귀한 보혈로 모든 메시지는 지불이 되었네.  
갈보리 샘으로부터 흘러나오는 깨끗케 하는 물로  
모두를 위한 용서와 하나님과의 달콤한 교제를 얻으셨네, 그분에게 모든 찬양을.

이 놀라운 전선을 사용하는 자는 너무도 분명히 그리고 쉽게  
그 고통이 아무리 크더라도 모든 악은 떨쳐나고,  
예수님의 귀한 보혈이 모든 더러운 마음을 씻으시네. 이제 나에게 역사하네.

이 전선의 모든 방해물은 제거되어야만 하네.  
헛된 약속과 무책임이 자주 방해하고 지연시키지만  
하나님은 아주 가까이서 우리의 생각과 행동과 말을 보시네. 모든 마을을 살피시네.

이제 하늘 아버지께서 나를 위해 한적한 곳을 마련하시고,  
그분과 영원히 나눌 메시지를 전보로 부치실 것이네.  
하늘 하나님과 함께 집에서 나는 영원히 사네. 그 곳 중앙사무실에서

합창: 전보, 믿으라. 그는 듣고 계시네. 전보, 받으라. 그가 기뻐하시네.  
전보, 기뻐하라. 그분이 가까이 계시네. 오 그의 이름에 영광을.

여기서 전보선은 모호하게 양방향 통신에서 기도와 기도의 응답에 대한 은유와, 전보선 사용자의 인생에서의 “행위자”로 나타나는 것을 볼 수 있다. 전보선을 은유로 사용함으로써 이웃까지 통하는 물리적인 전선 이상의 역할을 하고 있다. 다른 본문에서 넓은 성서로부터의 유비와 함께 철도를 유비로서, 나머지 유비를 밝히는 하나의 유비를 사용한다:

영적인 이집트에 있는 사람들은 잘못된 길로 가서 도랑에 빠진 엔진과 같다. 칭의라는 “시내 광야”에서 그들은 도랑에서 건져져, 바른 길로 향하는 길에서 기차에 붙은 엔진과 같다. 그러나 증기력이 약해 다소 녹이 슬어 천천히 나아간다. “사막”에서 그들은 경로에서 떨어진 끔찍한 엔진과 같아서, 차량을 달고 가다가, 그 잔해 아래 그리고 그가 파멸시킨 사람들의 잘려진 시체들 아래 묻혀있다. 가나안에서 그들은 밝게 빛나고, 완전하게 갖추어져, 최고 속도로 나아가서, 무거운 짐을 마치 깃털처럼 유쾌하게 나르는 엔진과 같다. 영적인 바벨론에서 그들은 급행 엔진과 같아서, 승객들을 가득 싣고 최고의 속도로 끔찍한 절벽으로 향하는 경로에서 추락한다. 그들의 상태는 “사막”에 있는 자들보다 나쁘는데, 그들은 더 타락했기 때문이다.

여기 이야기에서 우리는 기차엔진을 “행위자”로 볼 수 있다. 또한 성서본문처럼, 철도를 영적인 매일의 생활에 대한 문제를 제기하는 유비로 사용하고 있음을 볼 수 있다. 기술에 대한 이 같은 사용이 “부흥의 전기”라는 글, “두 철도”라는 만화, 그리고 “하늘의 동력실” 같은 노래와 그의 철도 노래에서 볼 수 있다.

## (2) 민주화: 권력의 문제

넵에게 “권력”의 문제는 중심이다. 긍정적이거나 부정적인 두 가지 종류의 권력이 있다. 긍정적인 권력은 하나님 안에 그 근원을 갖는다. 부정적인 권력은 인간착취자들(국가, 정당, 산업, 비밀모임, 교회) 안에 그 근원을 갖는다. 이러한 기관들은 자신들의 목적에 따라 하나님의 권력을 제한하기 위하여 함께 그리고 각각 공모한다. 교회(조직)는 가장 악하다. 왜냐하면 착취하는 사람들, 그리고 그 착취자들의 권력에 대한 의존성을 감소시키는, 하나님의 변화시키는 능력을 증진하는 권력으로부터 그들을 배제시키기 때문이다. 넵은 하나님의 능력은 모든 신자들을 위한 것이라고 주장했다. 모든 인간은 평등하게 창조되었고, 그 평등을 온전히 성취하는 것을 돕는 것이 바로 그리스도인의 의무이다. 그들이 죄로 아무리 상처를 입었더라도 그런 가치를 지니고 있다.

넵은 권력이 교회의 어느 사람이나 모임이나 사회적 집단에게 집중되어서는 안된다고 주장한다. 이것은 사회를 통하여 나누어져야만 하는데, 성화된 사람들은 다른 사람들보다 더 능동적으로 권력의 가능성을 현실화할 수 있다. 다소 다른 언어와 지적인 범주로, 가장 적극적으로 미셸 푸코와 그에게 영향 받은 사람들에게 의해 20세기 마지막 사반세기에 제시된 것이 바로 이 주장이다. 넵은 사회적 변화를 위해 싸우기 위해 준비하는, 국가적 도시적 차원의 노력을 제안하지는 않았다는 사실이 중요하다. 그는 남부로부터 이주하는 흑인들에 대한 점증하는 북부의 인종주의와 인종적 분노와 같은 시기에, 성결운동에 반대하는 사회적 반발의 시대에 살고 있었고, 진보정당의 주장은, 경직되고 때때로 폭력적인 정치적 경제적 반대에 직면하고 있었다. 넵은 그와 동료 일꾼들이 만날 수 있는 사람들의 삶을 변화시킬 계획을 발전시켰다. 개인적인 변화가 사회적 결과를 가져올 것이라 기대되었다. 그는 다음과 같이 썼다: “자연에서 썩을 것과 쓰레기를 장미

와 열매와 향기로 변화시키시는 하나님께서 은혜의 영역에서 보다 깜짝 놀라운 변화를 일으키실 것이다.”

냅은 새롭게 통제될 필요가 있는 문화의 몇 가지 측면을 발견하였다. 인간의 탐욕에 호소하는 물건을 내고, 개인의 건강과 자유의지를 앗아가는 부산물을 배양하는 거대산업은 악하다고 주장했다. 그는 보다 큰 문제를 사람들/그리스도인들의 “세속성”으로 정의했다:

세속성은 영성의 삶을 무너뜨리는 가장 치명적인 벌레 가운데 하나이다. 그것이 갹아먹은 곳은 어디나 시들고 죽어버린다. 모든 측면에서 세속성의 존재는 다음의 외부적인 표시들로 드러날 수 있다:

세상적인 유행에 일치  
세상적인 정당에 헌신  
세상적인 교회의 대중성  
세상적인 집단에 가입  
세상적인 사업방법의 채택  
종교적인 신문에 세상적인 광고채택  
그 광고에 부적절한 장면 삽입  
세상적인 사람을 성가대, 주일학교, 운영위원의 지도자로  
강단과 종교적인 매체에서 세상적인 주제 토론하기....

각각에서 문제는 권력의 남용과 그에 뒤따르는 것, 그들이 권위를 행사하는 사람들의 삶과 영성을 파괴하는 것이었다. 그리하여 냅은 정당과 국가가 자신들의 관심에 반하여 행동하고, 자신도 모르게 정당과 국가의 타락을 지원하도록 하는 단순한 주장으로, 사람들을 통제하기 위하여 사람들을 분리시킨다고 파악했다.

교회는 더 낫지도 않고, 세상과는 다르게 주장하기 때문에 아마도 더 나쁘다. 냅은 기존 교회들이, 마음이 마비된 예식으로, 이기주의적인 사람에 의해 유지되고 인도되고 있다고 주목했다. 이들은 스스로를 위해 돈과 명예와 권력을 얻으려고, 사람들을 지배하고 하나님께로 나가는 길을 제어하려고 한다. 여인들과 가난한 사람들은 교회의 여러 지위와 목회로부터 배제된다. 그의 입장을 지지하기 위하여, 그는 감리교회가 그 통계를 자랑하지만, 변화시키는 신앙이라기보다는 명목상의 신앙을 독려하면서, 영혼의 기근상태에 있다고 주장하는 뉴튼 레이의 글을 출판하였다. 그는 또한 “이상적인 교회는 ... 영혼의 회개, 교육적인 교회, 민주적인 교회를 위해 일한다. 내 판단에는 그것은 자유교회(a free church)임에 틀림없다”고 주장하는 피어슨의 본문을 재출판하였다. 리드의 “개신 천주교,” 그리고 대של(Dashiel)의 “교회주의對 예수” 등이 보다 더 분명하다. 냅은 자신이 조직이나 교회에 반대하는 것이 아니라, “세상에 대한 관심을 가진 조직의 매체에 반대”하는 것이라고 주장했다.

그와 급진적 성결네트워크는 프리메이슨 같은 비밀모임에 강력하게 반대하였다. 이들은 여성, 가난한 사람들, 그리고 자신들의 신학적 확신과 타협하기를 거부하는 사람들을 배제한다. 비밀모임에서 엘리트들에 의해 결정된 것은 배제된 사람들에게 해로운 것이 된다. 비밀모임의 구성원들은 자신들의 타락과 탐욕으로 서로를 보호한다고 그는 주장했다.

냅이 무책임할 뿐만 아니라 신학적으로나 사회적으로 위험하다고 생각한 방식으로, 비밀주

의와 권력집중에 대해 한 예가 맞아떨어진다. 그 한 예는 일리노이주 시온시(Zion City)의 설립자인 존 알렉산더 도위에 대한 그의 광범위한 공격이다. 도위는 스코틀랜드, 오스트레일리아, 그리고 미국에서 오랫동안 급진적 성결지도자였다. 그는 아사 마한, 심슨과 협력하여 보드만이 조직한 1885년 런던 신유권퍼런스에 참석하도록 초청받았다. 도위는 후에 스스로 예언자라고 선언하였고, 자신의 유토피아 도시와 운동에서 유일한 주요 권력이 되었다. 냅은 권력이 시온시의 한 사람의 손에 있음을 주목하였다. 신학적이고 사회적인 이슈는 이 권력집중을 지지하도록 형성되었다. 권력의 집중은 목회자와 교회지도자의 역할, 그러므로 믿는 사람들의 역할을 남용하도록 만들었다. 도위가 죽은 후, 세계에서 그의 많은 추종자들이 오순절주의자들이 되었음을 주목하라.

냅은 감리교가 주도하는 전국성결연맹(National Holiness Association)이 감리교회나 프리메이슨과 유사하게, 비-민주적인 가치를 채택하였다고 발견하였다. 그리하여 그들은 자신들에게 동의하지 않는 사람들을 “성결운동”으로부터 배제했다. 그들은 비-감리교인과, 전국성결연맹의 지도자들이 너무 급진적이어서 성결에 관여한 교단이나 교회를 분열시키기 쉽다고 생각하는 사람들을 배제하였다. 그들은, 냅이 지역 목회자들과 감독의 허락 없이 캠프미팅에서 설교한 것을 비난받기까지 냅이 그랬던 것처럼, 감리교회에 남는 것에 전념했다.

전국성결연맹은 감리교회의 성결지도자들 가운데 엘리트들에 의해 조직되었고 조정되었다. 냅이 그것을 이해하게 된 것처럼, 전국성결연맹은 “성결”에 대한 감리교의 독점을 유지하여, 자신들의 상향적인 사회적 이동을 지원하기 위하여 성결을 사회적으로 용납될 수 있게 만들려고 하였다. 데이튼이 피비 팔머의 접근법을 묘사한 것처럼, 그는 분명하게 “응접실 성결”을 성서적 명령에 대해 적절하지 못한 해석으로 이해했다. 전국성결연맹의 지도자들이 “오순절적” 급진 성결운동의 모든 지도자들을 배제하였던 시카고회의(Convention)를 소집하였던 1901년 결별의 순간이 왔다. 이제 “성결과 연합”으로 대표되는 보다 사회적으로 묵인 성결운동과 초교파 성결회의 사이의 분열은 계속되었다. 냅의 영향과 조직은 국제성결회의의 주요부분이며, 미국의 광의의 성결 교회들 가운데서는 극소수만이 기억하고 있다.

냅은 이 모든 것(정부, 사업, 교회, 전국성결연맹)이 일반적인 사람들이 아니라, 자신들의 이익을 추구하는 권력자들에 의해 조직되었다고 주장했다. 성결부흥의 역할은 사람들이 모든 근원이 하나님께 있음을 기억하게 하는 것이다. 하나님이 그 재산을 소유하고 계신다. 하나님은 복음서와 사도행전에서 사람들에게 하나님이 필요함을 깨우치는 선교를 위한 모델을 제공하셨다. 냅은 개인과 사회의 변화와 사회적 정의를 위해 분투하는 것이 교회와 개인의 책임이라고 주장했다. 그는 정부와 사업에 의한 타락과 가난한 자에 대한 남용은 지속되지 않을 것이라 경고했다: “가난으로부터 풍부함으로의 변화... 이 땅은 예수 그리스도에게 속했고, 그는 자신의 형제들과 자매들이 오늘날 같이 취급되는 것을 항상 허락하지는 않으실 것이다.”

### (3) 인간화에 대한 열망

19세기 후반은 인간화의 열망, 삶의 질 개선, 그리고 노동자들과 가난한 사람들의 권한에 대한 갈망을 확장하던 시대였다. 막스와 엥겔스의 저서, 그리고 파리코뮌의 수용으로 이것을 알 수 있으나, 아마도 1871년 독일군대가 침략할 것이라는 주장에 따라, 프랑스 군대에 의해 야만적으로 붕괴되었기에 비극적인 상징적 꿈으로 남았다. 미국에서는 사회정의를 위한 진보주의자들과 세계산업노동자조합(IWW, 우울병자들)의 투쟁이 있었다. (구세군에 합류하여 방언을 받아들

인) 월터 라우웬부쉬가 지도하는 “사회복음” 운동은 (성결을 체험하고, 신유에 관하여 저술한) 호레스 부쉬넬과 같은 주장을 하였다. 이 모든 운동들은 같은 주제를 반영한다. 급진적 성결네트워크의 일부이었던 다른 급진적 성결목회뿐만 아니라 냅의 저서와 신시네티의 부흥사역도 그것을 반영한다. 이런 모든 사회적 혁명들은 인간 경험을 향상시키는 사회적 구조를 변화시키려고 하였다. 이것은 “대중들”의 착취에 항의하는 세계적 외침이었다. 철학적 종교적 통찰력은 달랐으나, 그 목적, 수사학, 음악은 아주 유사했다.

중부-미국의 배경에서 형성된 그의 주장에서, 냅은 다른 많은 급진주의자들 보다는 다소 복잡하다. 그는 하나님으로부터 부여받았으나 부정적인 힘으로 빼앗긴 권리를 인간이 가지고 있다고 주장했다. 그는 전쟁에 반대했다. 그는 그리스도인이 가난한 사람들을 돌보고, 수감자들을 돌보며, 억압받는 사람들(“타락한 여인들,” 고아, 무교육자, 흑인, 애팔래치안 가난한 이들)을 고양시키고, 병자들을 치료해야 한다고 주장했다. 치료는 복잡한 개념으로 제시되었는데, 해방, 변화, 육체적 치료를 포괄하였다. 그는 치유에 대한 믿음 부족이나, 죄를 자신의 질병의 배경으로 가지고 있어서, 아픈 사람들을 비난하지 않았다. 결국, 그의 사랑하고 경건한 부인은 질병으로 죽었고 그 자신도 계속 질병을 앓았다.

자유롭게 되기 위하여, 사람들은 사람을 제약하고 인간의지의 자유를 빼앗는 부정적인 힘에 의존할 수는 없다. 자유롭게, 하나님의 의지에 사람의 의지를 일치시키고, 사람의 가장 고귀하고 경건한 열망을 성취하기 위하여, 인간은 자유를 위하여 분투해야 하며, 그 자유를 지키기 위하여 조심스럽고 세심하게 인생을 살피야 한다. 냅이 기대하기로는, 그들이 다른 사람들에게 그 변화를 증언하기 위하여, 믿는 사람들을 변화시키는 것은 바로 개개인의 개인주인적 비전이다. 그것은 한 인생을 한 번에 좌우하는 혁명이다.

그리하여, 사람들은 가난과 의존성(술, 약물, 담배)을 심어주는 재정구조에 대항해 싸우고 부정적인 힘에 사로잡혀 있는 사람들을 구해야 한다. “자연에서 썩을 것과 쓰레기를 장미와 열매와 향기로 변화시키시는 하나님께서 은혜의 영역에서 보다 깜짝 놀라운 변화를 일으키실 것이다.”

냅은 성, 인종, 나이, 계급, 지방/도시, 북/남의 분열이 개인들의 목회를 제한하고, 자신들의 지위를 향상시키고 덜 중요하다고 간주되는 사람들을 제한하기 위하여, 특권층이 사용하는 사회적 지위에 사로잡힌 인간의 열망을 제한하고 있음을 분명히 알았다. 그래서 그는 여성의 사역을 위해 논쟁했고, 흑인이 하나님의 성서학원에 참석하도록 독려했다. 성결의 비전은 연합하는 것이라고 그는 주장했다. 사람들은 (성, 나이, 계급, 북-남, 지방/도시, 그리고 교단을) 나누는 모든 장애물을 철폐해야 한다. “성령세례는 이름이나 신조나 지역에 관계없이, 하나님의 사람들을 모두 한 몸으로 연합시킨다.”

성결은 정화(죄, 조직, 중독의 제어로부터의 자유)와 (생존, 자기규율, 전도, 선교를 위한) 능력을 위한 것이다. 그리하여 능력을 받고 자유를 얻은 사람은 진정으로 중요한 것, 즉 하나님에 집중할 수 있고, 목회와 가난한 사람들을 돌보는데 하나님의 의지에 일치할 수 있다. 즉 출애굽-가나안과 『빛모섬의 진주』 이미지.

냅은 인간열망을 제한하는 것들에 대항하여 투쟁하고 촉구했다. 그러나 사회에서 반(反)-인간적이고, 반(反)-하나님적인 힘에 대항하는 전투를 승리하리라는 기대는 거의 없었다. 그와 대부분의 급진적 성결운동이, 더 부유하고 사회적으로 상향적으로 결합된 전국성결연맹과 감리교회의 보다 낙관적인 후천년설보다는, 비관적인 전천년설을 채택하도록 이끈 것은 바로 그의 사역에서 최종성공의 기회라는 이 실제적인 의견이었다. 급진적 성결네트워크는 세상은 근본적으로 개선될 수 없으며, 어떤 큰 규모의 변화는 그리스도의 재림이라는 하나님의 개입을 필요로 할 것이라고 생각했다.

#### (4) (사이드의 통찰력과 오리엔탈리즘 토론과) 미국지배 기간의 세계적 비전

넵은 적어도 1890년부터 선교에 관심을 가졌다. 「부흥지」의 제2권에서 그는 윌리엄 테일러 감독에 대한 헌사를 출판하였고, 10만명의 성결 그리스도인들이 자급 선교사로 아프리카로 가도록한 테일러의 요청을 반복했다. 데이에 따르면, 넵은 테일러의 선교사가 되기 위해 지원하였으나, 건강상의 이유로 거부되었다. 테일러에 대한 언급을 자주 하면서, 선교에 관한 글들이 계속 뒤를 이었다. 넵이 켄터키 블라성서학원을 위한 교수를 찾고 있을 때, 성화되어, 노래를 인도하고 가르치며, 자기를 부정하여, “믿음만으로 출발하는 테일러 감독의 선교사들과 같기를 바라는” 사람을 초청했다.

베를린 회의(1884-1885)와 스페인-미국 전쟁으로 이루어진 “근대”선교운동으로 넵과 「부흥지」는 쉽게 주변 세계와 접촉하게 되었다. 미국 대중은 이전보다 더 해외선교를 지원하려고 하였다. 정부와 기업의 이익을 지지하는 세속적인 신문들은 미국 문화와 군대의 우수성을 소리 높여 공언하였다. 교회들은 “가톨릭” 스페인 제국을 이긴 “개신교” 미국의 승리로 생긴 새로운 기회에서 이익을 얻고자 재빠르게 움직였다. 특별히 스페인-미국 전쟁에서와 일반적으로는 군국주의로 인한 유혈사태를 비판하면서, 넵(과 다른 급진적 성결인들)은 해외선교에 참여할 재원을 동원하였다.

넵은 다른 사람들의 일로부터 이익을 취하면서 다른 사람들을 가난과 나쁜 건강과 중독에 구속시키는 제국적인 기업과 상업적 이익을 미심쩍어 했다. 「부흥지」 공동체의 우선의 선교노력은 필리핀이나 푸에르토리코나 쿠바에 새로운 식민지를 만드는 것이 아니었다. 반면, (감리교에 대한 충성의 갈등으로) 넵과 떨어진 친구인 모리슨을 포함하여, 다른 성결선교사들과 전도자들은 필리핀에서 감리교 회원으로 관여하였다. 새롭게 얻은 선교 기회는 성결 감리교전도자들과 감리교 선교회, 사도교회, 장로교 등의 선교사들이 먼저 얻었다.

급진적 성결운동을 통하여 선택되고 강조된 모델은, 윌리엄 테일러가 지지한 것처럼, “자급 선교,” 이른바 “바울형 선교,” 즉 “신앙선교”였다. 테일러가 설명하고 이론을 세운 “자급선교”에서는 선교사가 교단이나 독립선교회에 종속되지 않는다. 성령충만하여, 그들은 사도바울의 모델을 지속하는 능력있는 개인 선교사들이다. 그들은 가능한 적게 가지고, 그들이 회심시킨 사람들에게 생계를 의존하거나 지역사람들처럼 법적으로 유용한 일을 해서 생활비를 번다. 이것은 세계의 다른 그리스도인들과의 협력을 취한다. 북미와 다른 지역의 이교도들 사이에서도 다를 것은 없다. 모두는, 단순히 영적인 치유만이 아니라 치유의 모든 측면을 포함하는 “성령세례”에 의한 변화가 필요했다.

선교사들이 기념되고, 모집되었다. 가장 독립적인 성결선교단체들이 했던 것처럼, 넵은 우선 포괄적인 접근을 취했다. 선교사들이 「부흥지」가 상당한 정도 배포되는 것을 알게 되었기에, 그들은 출판을 희망하는 편지를 쓰기 시작했다. 넵을 만났거나, 급진 성결네트워크에 참여한 선교사들은 그들의 편지나 글이 넵의 신문에 출판되게 했을 것이다. 그것은 가능한 재정지원뿐만 아니라, 미국에 있을 경우 무료홍보, 기도후원, 구두약속 등을 제공했다. 정확하게 같은 접근이 후에 윌리엄 세이무어와 LA 사도신앙회(the Apostolic Faith)에서 사용되었다. 그리고, 예를 들어, 인도선교사였던 자유감리교회 워드가족이 했던 것 같이, (세인트루이스의) 뱅가드선교회의 애나 아브람스와 서만은 「부흥지」에 글을 기고했다. 신학적 이유가 아니라 학력부족으로 거부되었던 찰스 카우만과 레티 카우만 같이 다른 사람들은 감리교 선교회에 의해 거부된 후에 받아들여졌다. 넵은 그들에게 기반을 제공하고, 그들의 선교사역을 지원하도록 결집된 국제 급진적 성결네트워크에 그들을 소개했다. 마침내 선교사들은 「부흥지」 공동체 내부로부터 지원을 받았다.

힐스트 가족이 「부흥지」에 의해 지원을 받은 첫 선교사 가족이었고, 카우만 부부가 두 번째 선교사 가족이었다. 냅의 접촉은 단순히 미국 선교사들에게만 한정되지 않았다. 예를 들어 일본성결교회의 설립자인 나카다 주지를 자신의 동료로 열정적으로 받아들였고, 그의 뛰어난 능력을 인정하였다.

## (5) “오순절”: 새로운 실재를 위한 패러다임

냅은 성서이야기에 대한 자신의 급진적인 해석으로부터 새로운 실재를 위한 비전을 끌어왔다. 이것은 그가 혼자서 발전시킨 비전이 아니라 급진적 성결설교자들 가운데서 천천히 그리고 간헐적으로, 갈등 속에서 발전되었다. 사무엘 킨의 예를 따라서, 그들은 다른 모든 사람들이 해석해야 할 규범적인 성서본문으로서 오순절 성서이야기에 집중하기 시작했다. 냅은 킨의 저서를 출판했고, 킨으로부터 멘토를 받았다. 기독교에 대한 이 새로운 “사도적,” “오순절적” 이해의 주요 요소는, 오순절 나사렛 교회나 결과적으로 필그림성결교회뿐만 아니라, 그의 학생이었던 세이 무어, 쿡, 톰린슨에 의해 형성되었다. 그들이 분석할 때, 냅, 세스 쿡 리스, 오순절 밴드, 미국 남부의 “하나님의 교회,” 그리고 벵가드미션 만큼이나 결코 급진적이거나 통전적이지 않았다고 주장할 수 있다. 새로운 “오순절적” 또는 “사도적” 운동, 급진적 성결운동의 교리는 다음을 포함하였다:

- 교회, 정부, 지도, 협동조합, 사업에서 권력의 평등화를 위해 일하라. 이러한 구조는 권력을 독점하여 다른 사람에게 손상을 초래하도록 사용할 권리가 없어야 한다.
- 그리스도인들은 모든 기술을 사용하여 삶의 개선을 기해야 한다.
- 인간성의 열망을 지원하여, 지금의 현실에 대한 능동적인 변화를 가능하게 하라.
- 사람의 모든 삶과 소유는 하나님께 헌신되어, 하나님의 뜻에 일치하도록 사용되어야 한다.
- 모든 사람은, 목회자나 교회의 방해를 받지 않고, 하나님과 하나님의 능력에 동등하게 접근할 수 있으며, 정화와 능력을 위한 성령세례는 모두를 위한 것이다.
- 목회자는 하나님에 의해 파송된 것이며, 하나님과 일반인들(가난한 사람들에 대한 목회, 육체적 치유, 복음전파)만을 돌본다.
- 가난한 사람들, 환자, 수감자, 그리고 사회적 약자들에 대한 보살핌이 복음의 요점이다. 정의는 모든 사람에 대한 존경뿐만 아니라, 자원의 재분배와 관련된다.
- 공동체주의, 즉 필요와 상호 돌봄에 따라 자원을 동등하게 나누는 것이 그리스도인 생활의 오순절 패러다임이다.
- 과도한 소비는 다른 사람으로부터 생명과 재산을 빼앗으며, 창조를 파괴한다.
- 인간의 독창성과 창의성은 부를 제어하는 소수의 권력강화를 위해서가 아니라, 사람들의 이익을 위하여 사용되어야 한다.
- 그리스도인과 모든 사회는 인종, 신조, 성, 계급, 분파, 법, 또는 교육의 기회에서 어떠한 차별도 없이 평등적이어야 하며, 교회, 사회, 문화에서 모두 동등한 가치를 지닌다.
- 오순절 그리스도인은 잘못된 것을 바로잡고 세상을 구원하여 변화시킬 그리스도의 임박한 재림을 대망하면서 기대하며 살아야 한다. 그것이 “우리의 소망”이다.
- 바로 그 오순절 세계의 비전은 사랑, 선교, 변화의 정의를 위한 세계적 비전이다.



- 오순절 그리스도인은 실용적이고 경영적으로 하나님 나라를 앞당기는 모든 것을 사용한다.
- 성결 오순절신학은 전천년설적이다: “세상을 보라” “세상이 더 나아진다고 누가 믿을 수 있는가” 오직 그리스도만이 세상과 그 안의 사람들을 변화시킬 수 있다.
- 오순절 지도자는 그가 인도하고 있는 새로운 실재의 계획과 정의에 명확성을 지닌다.

이것이 급진적 성결운동의 신학적 패러다임이었다. 이것을 지지하는 것이, 감리교인들과 제2차 대각성운동의 결과로 생긴 다른 교회들 가운데, 19세기 후반의 보수적인 교리적 공감이었다. 이러한 생각 가운데 어느 것도 냅에게 고유하다거나 기원된 것은 거의 없다는 것을 기억하는 것이 중요하다. 그는 같은 시기에 같은 종합적인 내용을 설교한 일군의 설교자들 가운데 하나였다. 냅의 영향은 그의 원래 생각이나 신학과 실천에 관한 생각에 기인하는 것이 아니었다. 그는 중앙에 위치한 보다 넓은 네트워크의 주요 인물이었고, 웨슬리처럼 다른 사람의 저작과 생각을 유리하게 빌려오고 사용하였다.

## 왜 사람들은 냅과 다른 급진적 성결설교자들에게 귀 기울였는가

냅은 하나의 목소리였지만 혼자 말하지는 않았다. 예를 들어:

“우리로 사람들의 영혼을 구할 뿐만 아니라 그들의 환경을 성결하게 만들도록 하라... 그리고, 우리로, 하나님과 인간의 이름으로, 노예, 술취함, 욕망, 도박, 무지, 가난, 물신주의, 전쟁을 철폐하기 위하여 진심으로 연합하도록 하라.” 휴 프라이스 휴스, 『사회적 기독교』, 1889.

웨일즈 감리교인 휴 프라이스 휴스(1847-1902)가 외친 것은 1890년대 형성되기 시작하여, 제2차 세계대전과 프랭클린 델라노 루즈벨트 대통령의 재임 시작까지 계속된 미국의 진보운동에서도 볼 수 있다. 루즈벨트 대통령의 부인 엘리노 루즈벨트는 하나님의 성서학원의 가난한 사람들을 위한 추수감사절 식사에 참석하였다. 그녀, 그녀의 남편, 그리고 하나님의 성서학원의 냅의 후예들은 가치와 목적이 유사한 것을 보았다.

진보운동은 미국문화를 정화하여, 미국을 살기에 더 인간적인 곳으로 만들려고 하였다. 그들은 개인적인 이익을 위해 대중들을 착취하는 권력을 제거하기를 원했다. 진보운동은 타락한 정부와 타락한 사업 사이의 연합을 깨뜨리려고 하였다. 가난한 사람들, 노인들, 실업자들, 장애자들을 도우려고 하였다. 그들은 가난한 농부를 구제하고, 국가 전체영역에 기술적인 진보(전기와 철도)를 이루려고 노력했다. 여성과 흑인들이 투표하여, 평등과 존엄을 누릴 권리를 주장했는데, 모두가 투표할 수 있다면 권력이 평등하게 분배된 것이라고 믿었다. 그들은 교육을 증진하여 단순히 지위의 문제가 아니라 실제적인 교육을 강조했다, 아동노동에 대항하여 싸웠다. 금주와 담배생산물제한을 지지했으며, 국가, 즉 토양, 공기, 물의 물리적 아름다움의 보존을 위하여 싸웠다. 진보정당은 1912년 형성되었고, 그때의 가치는 대공황 때(1928-1939) 민주당의 부분이 되었다.

또 다른 그룹이 같은 시기에 형성되었다. 1905년 세계산업노동자조합(IWW)이 조직되었다.

IWW 헌법의 서문은 “수백만의 노동자들 가운데 기아와 결핍이 발견되고, 고용계급을 만드는 소수가 인생의 모든 좋은 것을 소유하는 한 평화는 있을 수 없다”고 진술한다. 위에서 언급한 것처럼, 이것은 냅과 같은 소리이다! IWW는 또한 권력을 평등하게 하여 인간 노동의 열매를 평등하게 나누며, 가난한 사람들과 하층계급을 돌보려고 하였다. 산업주의자들과 자본주의자들의 권력에 대한 그들의 비판은 냅의 비판과 같았다. 그러나 냅은 권력남용에 대한 인식에서 보다 더 포괄적이었다. 그는 권력 남용자들 목록에서 오래된 교회들과 전국성결연맹을 포함시켰다!

그렇다면 냅은 혼자 말한 것이 아니며, 자신의 사상에 대한 보증으로 성서의 주제와 이야기를 사용하였다. 개인과 사회의 정의와 변화를 주장하는 구름같이 많은 증인들의 부분으로, 냅과 그의 동료 급진적 성결인들은 일반인들로부터 발언할 기회를 얻었다. 중요하게도 사회의 권력자들과 변화를 두려워하는 자들이 다시 공격하였다. 진보운동, IWW, 급진적 성결설교자들 출신의 인사들은 민중선동가와 평화방해자로 구금되었다. 위에서 언급한 것처럼, 냅도 큰 소리와 거슬리는 모임으로 평화를 방해한다고 체포되어 법정에 섰다. 신시네티 신문들은 다른 것들 가운데, 급진적 성결운동이 흑인들을 예배의 중요 참여자로 포함시켰다는 이유로 조롱했다. 후에 성결운동가, 오순절주의자, 조금 다른 새로운 오순절의 정의를 가진 급진적 성결운동가들 다수는 흑인들과 함께 예배드렸고, 그들을 평등하게 대했을 때 박해를 받았다. 그 박해가 너무도 심했기에, 분리된 인종에 기초한 성결교단과 오순절 교단이 형성되었다. 1940년대까지, 그리고 제2차 세계대전의 도래에, 미국과 유럽사회에서 급진적 성결설교자들에게 시간은 거의 없었다. 변창한 교회들은 모두 새로운 사회적 실재와 타협하였고, 다양한 방법으로 진화하는 문화에 접근하려고 하였다.

## 결론

마틴 웰스 냅은 변화된 인간성이라는 성서적 비전에 보다 충실한 근대성의 한 모습을 위해 논쟁했다. 그와 같이, 이것은 교회와 교회 지도자들의 권력에 집중한 고전적인 기독교전통을 깬다. 냅과 나머지 급진적 성결전통은 “오순절”이 모델, 하나님의 새로운 공동체의 성서적 패러다임, 예수를 가장 잘 알았던 이들에 의해 살아졌던 패러다임이었다고 주장했다.

냅과 여타의 급진주의자들은 웨슬리, 플렛처, 로렌조 다우, 아사 마한 등의 전통을 받아들였으며, 변화시켰다. 냅의 시기에 가장 중요한 지적인 인물들 가운데는 사무엘 킨, 세스 쿡 리스, 심슨, 윌리엄 보드만, 그리고 힐스가 있었다. 그들은 19세기말과 20세기초의 미국 문화라는 배경에서 이렇게 활동했으며, 그 맥락에서 이해될 필요가 있다. 그들은 급진적 성결운동이 발전하고, 냅이 목회한 맥락에서 이해될 필요가 있다. 그는 이러한 종합의 창조자도 아니었고, 유일한 대표자도 아니었다. 그의 성결운동과 오순절운동의 학생들은 모두 그가 예상하지 못한 방식으로 이 사상을 발전시켰다. 그는, 그들의 멘토 웨슬리가 주장한 것처럼, 개인적, 신학적, 사회적 변화는 예수 그리스도를 통하여 성령의 능력 안에서 하나님께서 제시한 구원의 한 부분이라고 주장하는, 넓은 “세계적” 국제적인 급진적 성결인들의 네트워크의 부분이었다.

그러므로 냅은 그의 시대의 인물임을 기억하는 것이 중요하다. 배경은 역사적 경험과 연구에서 중심이다. 1939년경 이후, 사람들은 정의롭게 변화된 세계에 대한 급진적 성결운동(과 IWW 그리고 진보주의)의 비전이 덜 확신이 간다는 것을 발견했다. 초점은 그 비전의 더 작은 외적인 측면(담배, 춤, 술, 성)에 모아졌고, 냅과 초기 급진적 성결지도자들의 보다 큰 체계는 잊어버렸다. 급진적 성결인들 가운데 교단의 발전으로 또한 가장 급진적인 사람들은 제외되고 제한

되었으며, 그들은 거의 오순절주의자들이 되었다. 냅이 교단에 대해 염려하던 것들이 급진적 성결인들 사이에 존재하게 되었다.

냅과 급진적 성결전통은 인종과 문화의 경계를 잘 넘어선 4개의 세계기독교 신학전통 가운데 2개를 형성하였다는 것이 또한 중요하다. 성결교단, 오순절교단, 가톨릭, 정교회는 고전적인 국가적 종교개혁 전통이 하지 않았던 방식으로 이것을 이루었다. 정교회는 거의 인종적으로 거주 지역에 남아있다. 한국에서 그것이 엄밀하게 “사중복음”의 신학적 구조이며, 연구자들에게 보이는 것처럼, 한국 기독교현상을 가장 적합하게 설명하는 한국문화의 틀에서 발전되었다. 그러나 이것은 또 다른 날을 위한 토의 주제이다!

본인은 냅이 대표하는 특별한 사회적·신학적 종합은 세계 기독교를 변화시켰다고 받아들인다. 현재의 성결교회들이, 그리고 우리가, 서 있을 위치를 찾고 오늘날의 현대세계에서 예언자가 되고자 할 때 급진적 성결운동의 비전이 그들에게 세계를 알려줄 수 있다고 소망한다. 이 과정의 부분으로서 전체 급진적 성결네트워크가 냅만이 아니라 물론 그들의 배경에서, 연구의 초점이 될 것이라고 희망한다.

서울신학대학교 글로벌사중복음연구소 주관

< 제 1 회 국제학술세미나 >

## 오순절성결운동 지도자 마틴 냅과 21세기 한국성결교회

### 제2발표 “마틴 냅과 급진적 성결운동”

발표 : 이연승 박사  
(Boston University, Th.D.)

2014. 3. 10(월) 오후 2:00, 서울신학대학교 100주년기념관 512호 영성실습실에서

---

The Revivalist in January 1890 revealed the secret of what A. M. Hills called Martin Wells Knapp's "unusual success" as a revivalist: "much of the revival success lies in the skill to produce just the right truth at the right time, in the right way to the right persons."<sup>1)</sup> In advancing the radical Holiness Movement, Knapp did not passively wait for the descent of the Holy Spirit. Instead as a shrewd statesman he systematically calculated the components of the spiritual revival. With the iron determination to do right, Knapp did so well that his radical Holiness Movement subsequently gave birth to myriads of Holiness and Pentecostal churches. Roger Finke and Rodney Stark argue that the Holiness Movement, driven by "unsophisticated souls, sadly out of joint with modern times," engendered rapidly growing denominations, while the denominations that expelled the Holiness Movement have been rapidly declining.<sup>2)</sup> Martin Knapp succeeded the legacy of John Wesley and provided an important link between the antebellum holiness movement initiated by Phoebe Palmer and twentieth century Pentecostalism opened by Charles Parham. Between Palmer and Parham, Knapp used his knack in leading the radical Holiness Movement to boast its tributaries today in the most successful religious quarters of the world. Accordingly William Kostlevy posits Martin

---

1) Martin Wells Knapp, *The Revivalist* (January 1890): 1; (April 1890): 1.

2) Roger Finke and Rodney Stark, *The Churching of America 1776-1990: Winners and Losers in our Religious Economy* (New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1992), 5.

Knapp as “one of the great, if neglected, figures of the early 20th century Holiness Movement.”<sup>3)</sup> Wallace Thornton also addresses Knapp as a central figure of the Holiness Movement.<sup>4)</sup> By now scholars have concurred with the argument that Martin Knapp and his radical Holiness Movement centering on the International Holiness Union and Prayer League have an immediate theological connection with the Korean Holiness Church.<sup>5)</sup> This paper places Martin Knapp and the radical Holiness Movement in the backdrop of American Christianity in the late nineteenth century. It explores the thoughts and practice of Knapp and his coterie in the radical Holiness Movement with four interpretive frameworks: revivalism, Biblicism, perfectionism and internationalism.

## Revivalism and The Revivalist

From George Whitefield (1714-1770) and Jonathan Edwards to Charles Finny and D. L. Moody, American Christianity has been shaped by revivalists. The First Great Awakening was fueled by Anglican George Whitefield who gave impetus to the rise of popular evangelicalism and democratization of America. Introducing outdoor preaching in markets and empowering ordinary people, he emerged as an icon of revivalists who preached in plain language extemporaneously without notes. During his 33 year career, Whitefield allegedly preached 15,000 times, drawing the record number of 8,000 people at once to the heartfelt experience of Christianity. Congregational Jonathan Edwards (1703-1758) invoked a wave of revival in New England with his fiery sermons, including “Sinners in the Hands of an angry God.” He threw the limelight on God’s sovereignty, human depravity, attainable experience, grace, absolute necessity of dependence, and the life of holiness. These two Calvin revivalists converged on their Wesleyan emphasis on heart regeneration, encounter experience, and Augustinian fascination with grace for a genuine change of morality, all of which produced the points of the posthumous collection of Edwards’ writings entitled “The Nature of True Virtue (1765).”<sup>6)</sup>

3) William Kostlevy, *Holy Jumpers : Evangelicals and Radicals in Progressive Era America* (Oxford University Press, 2010), 8.

4) Wallace Thornton Jr., “Martin Wells Knapp and Radical Holiness,” in *From Aldersgate to Azusa Street : Wesleyan, Holiness, and Pentecostal Visions of the New Creation*, ed. Henry H. Knight III (Oregon: Pickwick, 2010), 148.

5) 이명직, 『조선 예수교 동양선교회 성결교회 역사』 (경성: 동양선교회 이사회, 1929), 10; 조종남, 『성결교회의 신학적 배경과 사중 복음』 (부천: 서울신학대학교 출판부, 1991); 기독교대한성결교회, 『성결교회사』 (서울: 기독교 대한 성결교회 출판부, 1992); 박명수, 초기 한국 성결교회사 (서울: 대한 기독교 서회 2001); Meesaeng Lee Choi, “In Search of Full Salvation: The Fourfold Gospel and the Korea Holiness Church in Relation to the American Holiness Movement” (Ph. D. diss., Drew University, 2002). Meesaeng Lee Choi’s dissertation devotes one chapter to Martin Knapp’s life and thoughts, which was published as *The Rise of the Korean Holiness Church in Relation to the American Holiness Movement: Wesley’s “Scriptural Holiness” and the Fourfold Gospel* (Lanham, Maryland: The Scarecrow Press, 2008). She argues that an exclusive focus on sanctification and holiness in the study of the theology and history of the Korean Holiness Church can be “reductionistic” despite the centrality of the theme. See page 6. Introduction to the historiography of the studies of the Korean Holiness Church in her study should suffice at present.

6) Mark A. Noll, *A History of Christianity in the United States and Canada* (Michigan: William

The Second Great Awakening (Cir. 1795- 1810) owed much to the itinerant evangelists, who catapulted Methodist and Baptist churches to run abreast of Presbyterian and Congregational denominations by 1830. Francis Asbury, an American Wesley on the move, crisscrossed 300,000 miles over the Appalachians. Opposing formality, promoting 'the mystery of intimacy,' and combining democratic and autocratic disciplines, Asbury elevated the number of Methodists from 300 to 200,000 by 1816. Presbyterian Charles Grandison Finney (1792-1875) would be more popular than Asbury among radical Holiness revivalists. Stretching over a vast swathe of upstate New York, Ohio, Philadelphia, New York, and Boston, Finney led revivals for entire sanctification with new measures inventing the use of "anxious bench." Finney was noted for his revivals combined with social reform. His book *Lectures on Revivals* (1835) became a standard textbook for the holiness revivalists. Given his influence on the American public and the church, Mark Noll asserted Finney should be ranked with Abraham Lincoln and Andrew Carnegie.<sup>7)</sup> During the second Awakening, Timothy Dwight (1752-1817) drew campus revivals by his sermons on Christian fundamentals including the centrality of the Bible, resulting in the conversion of one third of 225 students at Yale University in 1802. Yale revival in Connecticut spread to Williams College and Andover Newton Theological Seminary in Massachusetts, taking over the missional impulse of William Carey and generating subsequently the historic Student Volunteer Movement. The second Great Awakening at Cane Ridge exhibited what was characteristically erupted at Methodist camp meetings: jerking, dancing, falling, laughing, groaning, and barking. During the second Awakening James McGready's Church prayed regularly for years for Christian revivals at local churches as well as those in the world from 1797. Piggybacking its transatlantic communications and American activism, the second Awakening laid a foundation for America's international venture, as it would soon witness the birth of numerous foreign mission societies spearheaded by the American Board of the Commissioner for Foreign Missions in 1810.<sup>8)</sup> William Taylor was one of first missionaries on the wing of this missionary movement whose trajectory covered three continents in the world. Martin Knapp regarded him as "the Paul of the present age," and used his paper to report Taylor's missionary itinerary.<sup>9)</sup>

Seen from the lens of this revivalist tradition, fin de siècle American Christianity straddled between Formality and worldliness. Drab Calvinism, dangerous liberalism, rank fanaticism, rigid Methodism clouded religious landscape. Mormons from Scandinavia landed in Utah, while masonic houses multiplied. Unitarian views occupied Harvard

---

B. Eerdmans, 1992), 91-97; Harry S. Stout, *The Divine Dramatist: George Whitfield and the Rise of Modern Evangelicalism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991).

7) Mark A. Noll, *A History of Christianity in the United States and Canada*, 176.

8) *Ibid.*, 166-80.

9) William Taylor, *Seven Years' Street Preaching in San Francisco* (1857); *Christian Adventures in South Africa* (1867); *Four Years' Campaign in India* (1875); *Our South American Cousins* (1878); *Self-Supporting Missions in India* (1882); *The Story of My Life* (1895); *Flaming Torch in Darkest Africa* (1898); As for the news about William Taylor, see *The Revivalist* (February 1890): 2.

University, while Christian Science increased its audience. Under the marching band of progress, Christianity was forced to accommodate itself to the demand of age.

Martin Knapp orchestrated the radical Holiness Movement in such a context. He lamented that eloquent preaching, human federation, church loyalty, and ecclesiastical government superseded loyalty to the Holy Spirit and genuine holiness in the churches. Methodist churches became a "foundry without any fire to melt the metal which must be moulded."<sup>10</sup> The churches were denuded of fire and word. The Foundry, the first Methodist preaching house and a headquarters of British Methodism for four decades had become a social club. Powerless pulpit, clueless post-conversion curriculum left pastors generally bewildered with what to do with Christian converts. Some ministers were unconverted, choir members unsaved, and hired for money. Some professed Christians were stingy and unforgiving, some others denying revivals. Knapp put all these scenes under the rubric of "religious monstrosities."<sup>11</sup> Methodist churches were so desperate to finance the building construction that they rented pews, which Martin denounced with the name of "stock churches." Churches were full of coldness, deadness, and lukewarmness, covered by mere formality. Preachers and people were smoking tobacco, chewing, dipping, drinking alcohol, dancing, playing card, going theater, using opium. Church members that sponsored Sunday papers, Sunday trains, street cars, yet lacked generosity to help the poor and send missionaries.<sup>12</sup> Knapp's evangelistic work as an itinerant preacher brought him opportunities to observe this reality of many churches which turned into "Arctic icebergs chilling the heart and freezing souls on every side."<sup>13</sup> This perception compelled him to plunge into the radical Holiness Movement.

Knapp's call to revivals came through pen and press. Two pillars of Knapp's life were the literary work surrounding the *Revivalist* and the nurturing of evangelists and missionaries in God's Bible School and Missionary Training Home. In particular the *Revivalist* was a repository from which we can glean the gem of his radical Holiness Movement. The *Revivalist* was issued monthly from 1888 and then weekly from 1899. The *Revivalist* declared its purpose: "A monthly devoted to the promotion of a Revival spirit and the maintenance of genuine Revival work."<sup>14</sup> Knapp was the only editor of the *Revivalist* for over ten years. From January 1892 for a year, Byron E. Paddock served as an associate, yet Knapp remained the Editor who claimed the authorship of all articles in *The Revivalist*, unless credited otherwise.<sup>15</sup> The *Revivalist* wasted no room for big fonts or advertisements. Instead it packed every corner with compressed lessons for

---

10) "Conviction," *The Revivalist* (January 1890): 1.

11) Martin Knapp, *The Revivalist* (January 1890), 3.

12) "A Revival Breeze," *The Revivalist* (October 1890): 1.

13) A. M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer or Life of Rev. Martin Wells Knapp* (Cincinnati: Mount of Blessings, 1902), 125.

14) "The Revivalist," *The Revivalist* (February 1890): 2.

15) *The Revivalist* (March 1890): 1

revivalists and revival seekers. It functioned as a forum for Holiness advocates. The sale of the paper was hardly negligible. It reached 20,000 subscribers by 1899.<sup>16)</sup> The escalation of The Revival subscription was proportionate to the sale of his books which reached 70,000 by 1897. The Double Cure reached the sale of 10,000 copies within two years of its publication by 1897. The biggest sale of his books came from revival song books Tears and Triumphs jointly composed by L. L. Picket and Knapp. 100,000 copies were sold within two years of its publication.<sup>17)</sup> The Revivalist office by 1897 raised the sale of Godbey's Electric Light library to 100,000; Keen's Pentecostal Library, 80,000; Godbey's Commentary on Revelation, 3,000 within 3 months; Carradine's Better Way, 3,000 in nine months.<sup>18)</sup> The Revivalist stirred readers' curiosity and expectations for prayers to be answered, provided advice and admonitions, and created waves of revivals through varied means of news, sale numbers, instructions, reports, incidents, testimonies, and choice passages of classics. The statistics tend to be illusive, yet they provided a relative estimate of what was happening around the Revivalist office in response to the needs of people.

Knapp commenced as a lone ranger to publish a four-page monthly from June 1888 until 1899, except for a brief period of assistance by associate editors. During that time of over a decade, Minnie C. Ferle succeeded Lucy Knapp in business matters from October, 1890, after Lucy's passing in September 1890. Ferle assumed an office manager in July 1892 and an associate editor in June 1894. Knapp's marriage to Ferle and move to Cincinnati in September 1, 1892 anticipated the growth of The Revivalist.<sup>19)</sup> It was so because Minnie succeeded in implementing Knapp's aspirations and visions for decades.<sup>20)</sup> The location of the office was promising. Cincinnati, Ohio, was called Azusa Street for the holiness revivalists, the favorite city for the National Holiness Camp Association. While The Revivalist kept its four page monthly format, the topic revolved around revivals and entire sanctification. From 1895, the Revivalist was expanded to eight pages, and 1899 to a 16 page-weekly, which would become the oldest holiness periodical in the U.S. While The Revivalist was being managed with two Martin and Minnie Knapp in 1897, Martin posted a special letter for its subscribers. It disclosed salient features of the paper; faithfulness to Christ and holiness; Gospel paper; a "readable" style, containing "choicest selections from best writers"; a family paper; condensed; containing more salvation reading in one issue than many religious weeklies in ten; no questionable nor worldly advertisements; striking illustrations, worth more than the price of the paper; cheap, costing less than 1/12 of a cent per day.<sup>21)</sup> In 1899, the paper

---

16) Wallace Thornton, Jr., "The Revivalist Movement and the Development of a Holiness / Pentecostal Philosophy of Missions," (160-186): 163.

17) "An Effective Song Book," *The Revivalist* (March 1897): 1.

18) "Book Notes," *The Revivalist* (March 1897):5.

19) A.M. Hills, *A Hero of Faith and Prayer or Life of Rev. Martin Wells Knapp* (Cincinnati: Mount of Blessings, 1902), 123.

20) "Mrs. Knapp's work to go on," *The Revivalist* (October 1890): 3.



dressed itself with an enhanced editorial board, highlighting God's proprietorship; Martin Knapp its editor; Seth C. Rees an associate editor; W. N. Hirst staff for the book department; Byron J. Rees as review editor; W. B. Godbey for Sunday school for international subscribers and Question Drawer; Minnie Ferle Knapp for the young people's corner. The unlikely business of *The Revivalist* was booming.

Although the *Revivalist* made an explicit announcement of its purpose, the unspoken message was barely ambiguous. As the title tells, Knapp located the heart of the Methodist legacy on the people called revivalists, who roughly included circuit riders or nomadic evangelists. Knapp placed the highest premium on the role of revivalists in the 1880s, when American interest in revivals or camp meetings significantly dwindled. The office of evangelists was lifted by the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, in 1894. The revivalists, once the architects of American Christianity, were sidelined during the age of establishment and social progress. Revival meetings were looked askance in fashionable quarters. William Ellery Channing once complained that revivalists were "too emotional," "too content with an uneducated ministry," and "talked too much about sin."<sup>22)</sup> Objections notwithstanding, Knapp identified himself as an evangelist.<sup>23)</sup> The *Revivalist* drove home an unsettling thrust that revivals, thereby revivalists, were the heart of Christian reformation, a touchstone to test authenticity of Christian piety. Ministers once pitched in a place could be liable to monotony, which generate formality.<sup>24)</sup> Evangelists had to brace themselves to depend on God, unhindered by trappings of comfort. John Wesley was a bona fide revivalist and an evangelist on the move. Unlike Luther or Calvin, Wesley built Methodism on a horseback with the consuming fire of revivalists. It was the revivalist spirit that transformed nooks and markets as a greenhouse for new souls and that equally caused his descendants after generations to wonder if Wesley had written any tomes for theology. American Methodism owed to the very activism of revivalists who crisscrossed the vast American frontiers.

Not all revivalists were commanded as contributing to Christian revivals. In as much as Knapp set his goal for the renewal of Christianity, sham revival creators were subjected to his attack. He did so with rhetoric of comparison between genuine and sham revivals, a recurring theme in the *Revivalist*. B. S. Taylor's so called "popular revivals" was introduced to show what sham revivals were like. "Popular revivals" generate spurious converts. There are laughs, yet no tears; comforts, but no repentance; talks, but no change of heart. Popular revivalists talk of the love of God in a gushing way, mention promises and blessings, yet shun God's fearful warnings, terrors of the law, fiery judgment. They

---

21) Martin Knapp, "A Letter to You," *The Revivalist* (June 1897): 6.

22) E. Brooks Holifield, *Theology in America, Christian thought from the Age of the Puritans to the Civil War* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), 305.

23) "Something better than the World Fair," "A General Invitation," "Call for a Conference of Evangelists," "A Rally of Holiness Association Officers," *The Revivalist* (May 1893): 1. ; John Leland Peters, *Christian Perfection and American Methodism* (New York: Abingdon Press, 1956), 146.

24) "Evangelists" *The Revivalist* (March 1897): 1.

avoid using the words "perfect" "Holy" "Sanctify" "cleanse" "Purge" along with death, hell, Satan, lust, rum, inbred sin, except in the most "gingerly and exquisite manners," lest they "offend secret hypocrite." They do not allow "dear young people" to think for a moment that any "sacrifice" or "self-denial" is essential to becoming a Christian.<sup>25)</sup> Seekers' attitude also conditioned sham revivals. If they neglected prayers, skipped revival services, criticized the revival methods, sided with the unsaved in opposing revivals, complained of the plain preaching, neglected to receive the baptism of the Holy Spirit, revivals would be hindered. Knapp asserted that such attitudes would in effect please Satan and grieve the Spirit.<sup>26)</sup>

## **Mighty Travail for the fullness of Grace**

Knapp argued that genuine revivals came from God, therefore governed by fixed laws. It gives sanctification, brings fear to the wicked, and gives fortitude to move on despite oppositions.

Genuine revivals seem to be related to the experience of the cross in whatever paths, since Knapp made a singular emphasis on the importance of repentance, abandonment, obedience, and suffering concerning revivals. The doctrine of the cross seems to be implicit in Knapp's teaching. Perhaps Knapp's own experience of suffering and trials cultivated in him sharp perspicacity as to the attack of sin and Satan on human life. His diary shows recurring struggles and agony against trials and temptations during the most productive period of his life from 1888 to 1892. He produced four books and started the *Revivalist*, despite the loss of his wife in 1890 and his father in 1892 in the midst of ensuing vacillation between joy and depression. Through this experience, he seemed to gain an intensified perception of fake piety, sham and superficial revivals. From this understanding, he reached an adamant axiom for a genuine revival that merits a lengthy quotation.

"Revivals of some sort may be gotten up, stirs, excitements, religious spasms, unspiritual forms and movements may be secured by manipulations, gotten up by human forces, by fleshly agencies, by hook or crook, by management, sensation machinery, generalship; but a Revival from God, one that is prayed down and comes with Holy Ghost power, is not secured without the agency of a soul going out to God in mighty travail for the fullness of His grace. Whatever exceptions to this may appear, they are only seeming. It may be stated as a spiritual axiom that there comes on no individual, on no congregation, a mighty quickening from God, and a sensible and impressive display of His power, save as that soul or that Church is going with groaning to this perfection, or has gained its glorious and victorious heights. This is the normal condition that reveals law of spiritual aggression and victory."<sup>27)</sup>

---

25) "Popular Revivals," *The Revivalist* (August 1890): 2

26) "Revival hindrances," *The Revivalist* (February 1890): 1.

Knapp contended that no individual can experience entire sanctification without passing through the stage of "groaning" or "mighty travail." Knapp leaves no exception. This travail seems to be related to the death to self and inbred sin, and partaking in Jesus' crucifixion before joining in His glory of holiness, one of essential themes of Christianity. Knapp seems to intimate that the cross whether in the life of Christ or that of Christians is an indispensable gate to crown or sanctification. His theology of crucifixion can be identified from the series name of his books, "the Cross and Crown." George D. Watson's view is slightly different from Knapp in that Watson made an exception for young converts to experience the entire sanctification without passing through the gate of travail. Watson states, "not all are led into full sanctification along this painful route; a great many young converts, when they can get clear, specific instruction as to the nature and need of complete cleaning, will receive it readily; but with most Christians, tribulation in some form, discloses the deep needs of the heart and hastens it to the Almighty Cleanser and Comforter."<sup>28</sup>) Another condition to Watson is "clear, specific instruction."

Knapp treated revivals as a product of systematic efforts, rather than mysterious eruptions. Chronic seekers meant chronic patients. Knapp teaches revivalists should understand why the seekers experience their troubles; how they respond to specific Scriptural promises and requirements; their emotional expressions were all under scrutiny. Then revivalists examine their conviction of justification and assurance. Thorough and complete renunciation or consecration of their life, time, reputation, friends, and talents wouldn't be overly emphasized. Total renunciation was repeatedly commanded. Alter works had clear instructions as well. Some acts or words should "be definite," be done "one at a time," be "deliberate." Some acts should "never" or "always" be done.<sup>29</sup>)

Knapp suggested that to experience genuine revivals, individuals or churches need to undergo two phases of revivals: destructive and constructive. Given the human depravity and predicament caused by sin, self, and Satan, individuals need first to root out inbred sin, pull down, throw down, and destroy the schemes of devil. Only then, Knapp asserted, God, the author of genuine revivals, can advance the project of implanting, cultivating, and building holiness. The double cure involves destruction of the sinful nature and construction of holy character and habits.

While one needed to pass through the valley of mighty travail, the camp meeting was a major vehicle to facilitate the experience of the baptism of the Holy Spirit. The origin of camp meeting in the US predates the famous holiness camp meeting in 1867. One of the first camp meetings was conducted by Presbyterian revivalists in July 1800 at the Gasper River Church in Kentucky, drawing a huge success with farm families. At the Cane Ridge camp meeting in Kentucky in 1801, a number of Methodist and Baptist

---

27) "Holiness, God's Remedy for Superficial Revivals," *The Revivalist* (January 1892): 1.

28) George D. Watson, *White Robes or Garments of Salvation and Spiritual Feasts* (Cincinnati, Ohio: God's Revivalist Press, 1883), 155.

29) "Seven Hints to Alter Workers," "Chronic Seekers," *The Revivalist* (March 1897): 1.

evangelists collaborated for "multitudes writhing on the ground," with a record number between 10,000 to as many as 20,000 turn out.<sup>30)</sup> The leading force of the Second Great Awakening, Charles Finny, stressed that "revivals did not simply happen, but had to be carefully staged."<sup>31)</sup> Revivals, for Finny, were not something miraculous, but events to which appropriate and innovative means should be applied to draw attention from people to Gospel. Knapp and his radical Holiness Movement, perhaps learning from Finny, made it sure that right means were used at right times for annual and seasonal camp meetings in order to catch attention from right people, the seekers, all the year round. The vicinity of the camp sites saw the surge of visitors and business. Camp meetings cooperated with the railroad company to discount train fares. Surrounding the Revivalist, teachers of God's Bible School, professor of Oberlin College, ministers, evangelists, editors of the Revivalist, and authors cooperated for camp meetings all in the capacity of a revivalist. From January the Revivalist announced the revival meetings that would be held in summer. Fall issues were filled with the victory reports gathered from summer revivals. Here we need to briefly look at the National Camp Meeting for the Promotion of Holiness held in 1867, since it was an important turning point in American Christianity, from which varied holiness associations emerged, mushroomed, and consolidated.

## **The National Camp Meeting for the Promotion of Holiness at Vineland July 17, 1867**

The National Camp Meeting was launched in the midst of much criticism and threatening from the Methodist Church leadership.<sup>32)</sup> Since its first meeting in Vineland, New Jersey, in which approximately 10,000 attendees gathered, it continued to be held four times a year in the North America. The successful subsequent meetings in Vineland, Manheim, and Round Lake eventually resulted in 10 New York meetings; 10 Illinois meetings; 8 Main meetings; 8 Pennsylvania meetings. Within 20 years of its inception, 84 national meetings and 11 tabernacle meetings were held in the US states and Canada.<sup>33)</sup>

---

30) Roger Finke and Rodney Stock, *The Churching of America 1776-1990: Winners and Losers in our Religious Economy* (New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1992), 92, 93.

31) Ibid., 89, 90.

32) 박명수, 『초기한국성결교회사』 (서울: 대한 기독교서회), 14-18. "한국 성결교회의 직접적인 배경은 바로 이 단체이다. (...) 한국 성결교회의 성결론은 근본적으로 이 운동에 뿌리를 두고 있다. (...) 에드윈 길보른은 1885 년도에 결정된 이 성결에 대한 정의가 오늘날에도 성결운동 단체들 사이에 기본이 되고 있다고 주장하였다. 이것은 그대로 한국 성결교회의 헌법에 반영되어 있다." Pak points to the importance of this National Camp Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness and its theological link to the Korean Holiness Movement. As a context for the rise of this holiness camp meeting, he refers to the bureaucratization of the church structure, shift of ecclesial leadership from spiritual revivals to administration; loss of vitality in worship and heart-warming experience of grace; worldliness of the Methodist Church expressed in the pervasive use of whiskey, tobacco, and luxuries. Pak states the holiness movement concerned more about the worldliness of the Methodist church rather than about the advance of liberal theology, which the Methodist Church began to tackle in the early 20th century.

33) *The Double Cure, or Echos from National Camp Meetings* (Boston and Chicago: The

The regularity, mobilization, consistency, and scale of the National Camp Meeting was remarkable in reclaiming a Methodist cause and legacy: the promotion of Holiness. As the National Meeting evolved to see regional variants, the National leadership ensured denominational boundaries by prescribing that the National Association would be “an instrument of Methodist reform.”<sup>34)</sup> Here the National Association diverged from Knapp’s vision. Despite the presence of commonality in the pursuit of Christian holiness through the second blessing, the National Camp Meeting Association parted from the radical Holiness Movement in its primary focus on the renewal of the North American Methodists. Knapp’s primary concern reached beyond the Methodist boundaries to restore New Testament Christianity. For Knapp, Wesleyan Methodism was something to be imported, not to be imposed as long as aligned with the New Testament teachings.

## **A Central Union Pentecostal Revival Meeting and Convention in 1893**

Knapp’s denominational stance is better discernable in his sponsorship of a Central Union Pentecostal Revival Meeting and Convention held in Cincinnati in 1893. The convention was interdenominational, for which Knapp served as president of the Cincinnati Holiness League. As Park Myung-su pointed out, local camp meeting associations were more flexible in taking an ecumenical position, partly because of an already existing neighborly network than the broadly connected national association. The Cincinnati Convention displayed such a characteristic. For eight days, Cincinnati was burned with the old-time Pentecostal services holding twice a day. The advertisement indicated what the Convention was counteracting, “Something Better than the World’s Fair.” In September 1893 Chicago marked the American history with the World’s Fair and the Parliament of Religions, the first of interreligious gatherings with Roman Catholic cardinals, Eastern Orthodox priests, and representatives from Bahai religion, Vedanta, and theosophy along with Protestant missionaries and ecclesial luminaries. Here also was the first exhibition of electricity powered by the dynamo.<sup>35)</sup> Knapp’s work *Lightning Bolts from Pentecostal Skies; or, Devices of the Devil Unmasked* published in 1898 gives a glimpse at how he incorporated the image of then state-of-the art technology into the first century Christian spirituality for the moderns. The radical Holiness Movement was fighting against religious pluralism that was infiltrating the U. S. in the late nineteenth century. Such a movement required unity across denominational distinctions and divides. At Cincinnati Convention, key revivalists included two from the National Camp Meeting

---

Christian Witness Co, 1887), 5-8. John Wood first suggested a measure to restore Methodist spirituality through a camp meeting, for which Harriet E. Drake, W. B. Osborn, J.S. Inskip collaborated. Park Myung-su claims that, unlike Moody’s revival meetings targeting at seekers, the National Camp Meeting targeted at the renewal of Methodists, which caused contentions as to sermons focusing on divine healing and the return of Jesus Christ. Pak. 20, 21.

34) Charles Edwin Jones, *Perfectionist Persuasion: The Holiness Movement and American Methodism, 1867-1936* (Methuchen, New Jersey: the Scarecrow Press, 1974), 21.

35) Dana Robert, 225, 226.

Association, John Thompson (Methodist Episcopal Church) and B. Carradine (Methodist Episcopal Church, South). Here also included was the personnel that the National Camp Meeting Association would not invite: Edgar M. Levy of the Baptist Church, Phoebe Palmer's disciple. Along with the Convention were held a conference of evangelists and officers of various Holiness Associations, Leagues, and Bands of all States. Noticeable in this conference was the conference of evangelists that was held prior to the Pentecostal Revival Convention.<sup>36)</sup>

Between Fanaticism and Formalism: Behind these revivals and camp meetings lurked the possible criticism of fanaticism. It was not only the case of the late nineteenth century. Methodist revival in the eighteenth century underwent the castigation of fanaticism. A term, Methodist, was coterminous with a religious fanatic of emotional excesses.<sup>37)</sup> While the mainline churches were criticized for their formality, the point of criticism against revivalists converged at fanaticism. Knapp gave a special attention to the criticism of fanaticism, since it scared people off from revival meetings, and thereby suppressed their experience of the second blessing. Knapp contended that the critics would "carp at methods when they should be rejoicing over results," make a holiness teacher as "offender for a word, instead of grasping the spirit of his meaning," "lead none into the experience of holiness," hold no meetings and conduct no alter services for the purpose, but find fault with those who do this, say less or nothing about the frosts or formality and worldliness" in their own churches. Assuming the friendship of the holiness promoters, these critics of revivals "warned vehemently of fanaticism." He stated, "A preacher warning a worldly church of the dangers of fanaticism is like a polar bear on an Arctic iceberg warning his companions to beware of exposure to sunstroke."<sup>38)</sup> We can read from the frequency of Knapp's rebuttal against the criticism of fanaticism in the *Revivalist* the extent of antipathy towards revival meetings and the obstructions the Holiness Movement had to weather.

In view of the criticism of fanaticism, Knapp completed *Impressions* in June 1892. The book boasted the sale of over 8,000 by 1902 and still enjoys James Dobson's accolade as "the best guide on finding God's will." It was written when Knapp was engulfed with trials and temptations. His diary records the loss of his beloved wife Lucy in September 1890, a lonely battle with bereaved two children of three and five year old, financial constraints, and dogged external attacks. The tribulation, however, seemed to sharpen Knapp's spiritual antennae to discern disguised piety, deluded prayers, and the issue of fanaticism that undermined authentic Christian piety. The book was composed interactively, Knapp soliciting from *The Revivalist* subscribers their personal experiences of impressions.<sup>39)</sup> This bottom-up approach significantly increased the books' practicality and popularity, touching on the felt needs and questions of daily lives. In it,

---

36) "Something Better than the World Fair," *The Revivalist* (May 1893): 1.

37) G. M. Ditchfield, *The Evangelical Revival* (London: UCL Press, 1998), 57.

38) "Friends of Holiness," *The Revivalist* (August 1894): 2.

39) "Impressions," *The Revivalist* (April 1892): 3.

he explained how divine messages are transmitted through 1) the electronic wires of the Bible which wrapped God's will in human languages 2) God's messengers who send indelible messages 3) personal influence from friends 4) prayer 5) reading of wholesome books and piety papers. In order to put hedges against the attacks of fanaticism, Knapp suggests here the Bible instructions, wisdom of the community of believers like ministers and friends, direct prayer, and lessons from the professional and experiences. Given this, Knapp was an undeniable scion of enlightenment. It was proven in his emphasis on the role of literature in finding God's will.

Good books and papers are among the mightiest agencies which God is now using to impress men with His truth. Through them He is silently undermining the fortifications of the enemy, and building up His spiritual kingdom. They have won many who were impervious to all other appeals, and their influence is mighty and quiet, like the law of gravitation.<sup>40)</sup>

This praise of reason, however, is balanced by his affirmation of supernatural dimension of Christianity. He affirmed the possibility of communication with God through angels and dreams. His diary shows an unabashed reference to his dreams. Among his caution against Satanic impressions included the dangers of self-appointed ministers or self-imposed will of believers. Especially Knapp regarded professional ministers who taught universalism as committing "the most baneful kind of infidelity." He regarded the toxin of universalism more harmful than that of liquors, as the former affects human heart under the veil of Christianity. He admonished the readers against misguided prayers, Satan's perversion of the Scriptures, Satan's deceptive disruptions of God's work, temptations, the flesh and its appetites, human influence, unsanctified pursuits, and reading harmful literature.<sup>41)</sup> It was in *Impressions* that Knapp used the metaphor of electric wires, as the key passage to transmit God's will, which Charles and Lettie Cowman would later use for the title of their missionary journal. *Impressions* also illuminate how the efforts of Knapp and the radical Holiness Movement, characterized by revivalism, were also intricately intertwined with an enlightenment impulse. It was expressed more so in their emphasis on the centrality of the Bible in Christianity.

### **"An Empty Head Makes an Empty Heart" – Biblicism<sup>42)</sup>**

The study of Methodism as the religion of heart in the eighteenth century England has been mostly tied to unreasonable enthusiasm until recently. David Hempton, however, shed lights on how the unlikely combination of enthusiasm and enlightenment

---

40) Martin Wells Knapp, *Impressions* (1892), 9, 10, 14, 15.

41) James Dobson seems to popularize in the college campus the statement widely circulated that finds its source in Knapp's book, "While we cannot hinder such wicked thoughts from coming, yet we can refuse to harbor them and thus remain guiltless." *Impressions* (1892), 13.

42) "An Empty Head Makes an Empty Heart," *The Revivalist* (January 1892): 3.

characterized eighteenth century Methodist movement.<sup>43)</sup> A similar argument can be made to the study of the Holiness Movement that has been relegated to what Rodney Stark and Roger Finke called a movement by "the unsophisticated and the poor." Combined by the undaunted battle for revivals, Knapp's radical Holiness Movement with its literary enterprises and the mettle to push the centrality of the Bible in Christianity justifies Hempton's assumption. The Bible, for Knapp, was the source for his central interests: "the best book on Revivals, Salvation, and Holiness." He saw in the Bible the "chart" of Life's sea, a "guide" of Life's railroad, a "rock," "an indestructible foundation" for the righteous, and the "letter of the Creator for the creature."<sup>44)</sup> Here we see a typical elevation of the practical usage of the Bible with no particulars for developing a theology. But his consistent exaltation of the Bible over all the theologians had a reason. As much as Knapp endeavored to reclaim Christian heritage shaped by revivalists, he absolutely placed the locale of Christian authority on the Trinity and the Bible. That stance made Knapp vastly different from his contemporaries who devoted to Luther, Calvin, or Wesley as a theological apex. Knapp could be seen eclectic at this point, yet his focus on the trinity and the Bible was something to merit our attention. Through the title of the paper, He defined the nature and orientation of the radical Holiness Movement by etching words with a deliberate choice.<sup>45)</sup> "God's" and "Bible Advocate" in the title made the magazine, *The Revivalist*, take a more explicit stance about God's proprietorship from 1901. The school he founded also exalted the name, God and the Bible, instead of any human name. Centrality of the Bible pervaded the columns and contents of the paper and Knapp's work. In a sense, Knapp's unswerving commitment to the biblical standards made his coterie of radical Holiness promoters similar to restorationists who, in championing the Bible, dismissed institutional churches, man-made dogma, creeds, or doctrines.

The North America ridden by the blood of the Civil War began to favorably view to a restorationist impulse. E. Brooks Holifield points out the characteristics of the restorationist agenda: imparting the authority to interpret the Bible not to the erudite theologians, but to the ordinary people; pursuit of the purity of primitive Christianity; appeal to the apostolic Christianity so as to overcome denominational or sectarian divisions; a vision of the egalitarian church with no hierarchy between clergy and laity, no elevation of one class over another; disregard of the institutional churches, creeds, dogma, doctrines. As this agenda indicates, Restorationists' main value was Christian unity through ridding of the divides made from classes, denominations, confessions, creeds, and elitism. They found a perfect model of united Christians, the undivided and undefiled, in the Bible and the first century Christianity.<sup>46)</sup> Here the emphasis was on

---

43) David Hempton, *Methodism: Empire of the Spirit* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005), 32-54.

44) "The Bible," *The Revivalist* (March 1890): 1.

45) "The Revised Name," *The Revivalist* (January 3, 1901): 1.

46) *Ibid.*, 296.



the accessibility of the Bible, given not to “the learned, (...) but to all men, indiscriminately, including the rude, and plebean.” Holifield points that such phenomena repeated “endlessly” in the American restorationist movement. He also points out that restorationists published most of their theology for the people in “newspapers and popular journals.” An exception was a few like Alexander Campbell (1788-1844) who wrote *Christian System* in 1835 and Walter Scott, *The Gospel Restored* in 1836. Typically restorationists’ wedding of the Bible with the first century Christianity led them to take an extremist position, snugly proclaiming “The Bible, the whole Bible, and nothing but the Bible is the religion of Protestants,” as Campbell did.<sup>47)</sup>

Stretching our glance a little back to Wesley who desired to be a man of only one book, the Bible, it is barely a matter of surprise that Knapp resonated profoundly with those restorationists in their common belief in the Bible. Knapp went further to show affinity with restorationists in other areas such as believing the infallibility and inspiration of the Bible, egalitarianism towards women and laity, empowerment of the underprivileged, the unlearned, claim to free salvation and grace for all, primitivism, populist orientation, intense eschatological expectation, and fascination with the book of Revelation. Nevertheless, Knapp showed divergence from restorationists in his denial of the need of separatist stance from the churches. Knapp occasionally denounced the learned, but never excluded or denied the learned. Knapp did not throw away creeds, and churches, or make an exclusive promotion of the Bible. He shunned the restorationist position of reductionist by limiting the veracity of the Scriptures exclusively in the assumedly “facts” of acts and words.

## Wesley and Knapp

Apart from adoration of the Bible, Knapp shared more legacy of John Wesley. Knapp introduced Wesley’s works in the *Revivalist’s* early issues.<sup>48)</sup> The best work that shows Martin Knapp’s respect of John Wesley is *Soul Rest as Taught by John Wesley*. In 1900, Knapp’s revivalist office published Wesley’s six sermons of utmost importance and relevance in a series of handy booklets that catered to the labor-laden modern believers. Six sermons include “Sin in Believers,” “Repentance in Believers,” “Perfection,” “Patience,” “The Church,” and “Schism.” The selection needs to be understood in light of Knapp’s struggle against Methodist ministers’ teaching which equated justification with sanctification. Knapp deemed such a teaching by the Methodist preachers as “absurd heresy,” an outcome of their compromise and worldliness. “Sin in believers” and “Repentance in Believers” endorsed Knapp’s usual emphasis on the importance of repentance

---

47) Alexander Campbell and N. L. Rice, *A Debate Between Rev. A. Campbell and Rev. N. L. Rice, On the Action, Subject, Design, and Administration of Christian Baptism* (Lexington, Kentucky; Skillman, 1844), 49; Campbell, *Christian System*, 134. Cited from E. Brooks Holifield, *Theology in America: Christian Thought from the Age of the Puritans to the Civil War* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), 292-96.

48) *The Revivalist* (May 1890): 3

of sins and of the Spirit baptism.<sup>49)</sup> Knapp regarded Wesley's teaching of entire sanctification the cream of creeds that did "more than any other truth that is preached today to unite believers and bring them back to the purity of the early church."<sup>50)</sup> In promoting instantaneous sanctification, Knapp quoted Wesley's rebuttal of Bell and Owen: "You have over and over denied instantaneous sanctification; but I have known and taught it over these twenty years. I have continually testified for these five and twenty years in private and public that we are sanctified as well as justified by faith. It is the doctrine of St. Paul, the doctrine of St. James, of St. Peter, and St. John."<sup>51)</sup>

As the founder of the periodical, Knapp could not help paying attention to the use of the printing house by Wesley and Zinzendorf. Knapp commended how Wesley incomparably excelled other religious groups by utilizing the method of print evangelism. Knapp also followed the model of Wesley making literature cheap for the masses. Knapp commended Wesley for being the "pioneer of cheap literature" and seeking to "flood the societies with good reading." He also referred to Wesley for exhorting each preacher to give books prudently, to beg money of the rich to buy books for the poor, advising "Be more active in disposing of the books."<sup>52)</sup> Knapp encouraged William Godbey to write and publish the Bible commentaries. William Godbey, beginning to publish bible commentaries nudged by Knapp, authored Bible commentaries which amounted thousands of pages.

## Book Evangelism

Knapp taught that three most effective means of preaching the Gospel were first through our lives, then with our lips, and through our pen and press.<sup>53)</sup> This advice seems to be made to encourage the circulation of the Revivalist, yet the promoters of the radical Holiness Movement were on their part prolific writers, as with the case of Godbey, particularly propelled by the belief in book evangelism. The Revivalist fought with one of the ills of then Christian sectors: reputedly believers read neither the Bible nor Christian literature. The dearth of piety books and lack of reading habit was mentioned as a cause of Christian decline. In Cincinnati, 1873, Asbury Lowrey deplored that general disregard of the holiness literature and Wesley's works explained the decline of the Methodist churches.<sup>54)</sup> Knapp attempted to disseminate the expectation of revivals by making holiness literature available in cheap and condensed forms so that

---

49) Martin Wells Knapp, *Soul Rest Taught by Wesley* (Cincinnati: Revivalist Office, 1900), 2.

50) Martin Wells Knapp, "The Bible vs. Creeds," *The Revivalist* (January 12, 1899): 6.

51) "An Error Corrected," *The Revivalist* (August 1894): 2.

52) "John Wesley and Book Evangelism," *The Revivalist* (November 1895): 1.

53) 'Pen and Press Preaching,' *The Revivalist* (August 1894): 2.

54) *Advocate of Christian Holiness* (June 1873): 265-267; Dieter, *The Holiness Revival of the Nineteenth Century*, 128-30. Cited from Pak, 24.

they may easily reach the masses. Attempt to encourage reading devotional literature had a long history in Protestant evangelicalism, since the age of Zinzendorf, yet the holiness revivalists appropriated the legacy vigorously, especially spreading the idea that pen and press are a means of evangelism. The Revivalist set one page for the seekers. Reading the Revivalist, its readers were exposed to the holiness movement, people's experience of the Spirit baptism, the useful holiness books, and revival news and reports.<sup>55)</sup> The Revivalist saved one page for the youth and one page for world missions, linking two topics together. Perhaps the youth was seen as the powerful candidate of world missions. The printed literature was easily transmitted across the national boundaries, making the holiness movement transnational. Knapp stressed that literature can be either a means of God's kingdom or that of crafty Satan. Spearheading with his first book, *Christ Crowned Within* (1886), *Out of Egypt into Canaan*, and *Revival Tornadoes*, Knapp produced handy tracts and pamphlets for evangelism: *Fire From Above*, *How I come to be an evangelist*, *Church Fairs and Festivals*, the *Model Class Leader*, *True and Sham Holiness Revival*, *Torpedoes* containing charts of *Two Railroads*, *This Life and the Life to Come*, *River of Death*, and *Excuses Exposed*, with *Invitation to Methodist meetings*, *An Echo from the Border Land*, *What Sin is Destroying your soul*.

His role from the pastorate of the Michigan Conference to an evangelist for six years gave him many opportunities to observe the situations of many Methodist churches which had turned cold and formalistic, just like the cold, dry, and formal European churches on the eve of evangelical revivals. The state of these churches compelled him to produce a source book for church revivals, *Revival Kindling* in 1890. The last book Knapp left was *Holiness Triumphant* written in 1901. *Methodist Triumphant* was first published as a rebuttal of Wesley's Methodist movement. Martin used the similar title for defending the Holiness Movement, as a prophetic proclamation of the validity of the holiness movement. *Holiness Triumphant* relied much on the exposition of the Revelation, his beloved scripture during the final trial of his life. Particularly popular was his *Revival Song Books*, *Songs of Joy and Gladness*, which were sold over 300,000 by 1890.<sup>56)</sup>

## Egalitarianism

With his belief in egalitarianism crossing the boundaries of gender, race, and class, Knapp promoted women's leadership and supported African American missionary, Amanda Berry Smith who worked with William Taylor and was also known as a holiness advocate. Particularly Knapp's partnership with women in the administration of the publishing house as well as sharing the pulpit at camp meetings was contrasted to the dominant culture of the Methodist Church, which made permission for the Methodist

---

55) *The Revivalist* (April 1892): 3.

56) "Revivalist Gold Mine," *The Revivalist* (April 1890): 3.

women as lay delegates to sit at the quadrennial meeting of the governing body of the Methodist Church as late as 1904. When Francis Willard, president of one of the largest and most influential moral reform movements in American history, attended the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church as an elect delegate of her church, an "enormous brouhaha" followed, which eventually repealed women's right to sit at the conference until 1904.<sup>57)</sup> During this time, Lucy J. Glenn was a revivalist of the holiness camp meetings in her own right and editor of the *Revivalist*; Minnie Ferle was associate editor of the *Revivalist*; Bessie Queen, Mary Storey, along with Minnie Ferle, were the triumvirate trustees of the *Revivalist*. Women editors were rare, except for women's periodicals such as *Heathen Women's Friends* started by women's missionary society. It was uncommon that Lucy Knapp functioned as a revivalist and editor, while Minnie Ferle took charge of the *Revivalist*. It was even more uncommon that three women, Minnie Ferle, Bessie Queen, and Mary Storey took charge of trusteeship of the *Revivalist*.

## Ecumenical Orientation

Knapp consistently strove to promote Christian unity by transcending denominational distinctions. This trait was pronounced in the each issue of the *Revivalist* with its motto, "In essentials, unity; in non-essentials, liberty; in all things charity." The *Revivalist* also embossed in the heading of the paper: Pentecostal, Loyal, and Evangelical; which later changed to Pentecostal, Missionary, Holiness, Nonsectarian. Knapp claimed that Wesley's experience of the baptism of the Holy Spirit enabled him to be free from sectarian bias, which prepared Wesleyan tradition to be all believers' property.<sup>58)</sup> Knapp's ecumenical stance was expressed in the editorial staff. The trans-denominationalism was evident in his selection of coworkers: Northern Methodists (John Thompson), southern Methodists (Beverly Carradine), Quakers (Seth C. Rees), Baptists (Edgar Levy). Knapp set a column aside for interdenominational holiness testimonies in which one finds Charles Finney (Presbyterian), Edgar M Levy (Baptist), Francis Ridley Havergal (Episcopalian) D. L. Moody (Congregational), Daniel Steel (Methodist), B. Carradine (Methodist Episcopal Church, South), and Madame Guyon (Roman Catholic).<sup>59)</sup> The *Revivalist* featured a series of Charles Finney's autobiography in addition to a frequent reference to his works. Entire series of books by L. L. Pickett from the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, and George D. Watson appear from the first years of its publication with Knapp's commentaries.<sup>60)</sup> It

---

57) David Hempton, *Evangelical Disenchantment* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2008), 110.

58) Martin Wells Knapp, *Soul Rest Taught by Wesley* (Cincinnati: Revivalist Office, 1900), 2.

59) "Interdenominational Holiness Testimonies," *The Revivalist* VII (May 1893): 2.

60) George D. Watson's books include *Love Abounding*, *Coals of Fire: Being Expositions of Scripture on the doctrine, Experience, and Practice of Christian Holiness* (1886), *Fruit of Canaan, A Holiness Manual* (Boston: AcDonald, Gill & Co., Office of the Christian Witness, 1882), the *Seven Overcomeths*, *White Robes or Germents of Salvation and Spiritual Feasts* (1883). The contents of the *White Robes* include inbred sin, the double Cure, the Growth previous to

also featured D. L. Moody on the gift of the Holy Spirit for service, distinct and entirely separate from conversion. The need to search and inquire the reason why we do not receive the second blessing,<sup>61)</sup> on the assurance of salvation, <sup>62)</sup> Mrs. Booth was frequented resources. The ubiquitous teachings and testimonies on the experience of entire sanctification, baptism of the Holy Spirit, total consecration, and biblical sanctification by those luminaries of varied denominations persuaded the readers of the simple fact that the baptism of the Holy Spirit and Christian perfection had become not the exclusive prerogative of the Methodists, but the property of Christianity. Knapp's non-sectarian stance became a parting point from H. C. Morrison's attempt to confine the holiness movement within the Methodist Church and from Phineas F. Bresee to confine the new movement into a new denomination.<sup>63)</sup> This doesn't mean Knapp denied the benefit of denominational affiliations. Knapp's concern was on the restoration of the New Testament spirituality of Christianity, not on the creation of a new clique or new denomination, as John Wesley had first done. Knapp made an unambiguous injunction against "anarchistic come-outism" and it became a parting point from the anti-denominational Church of God Anderson.<sup>64)</sup> Perhaps in anticipation for an emerging world-wide Christian community, Knapp promoted non-sectarianism as a forefront engine of his radical holiness movement.

## **Perfectionism: the Goal of Revival: Entire Sanctification or Christian Perfection**

The radical holiness advocates repudiated half-way consecration or perfunctory commitment to Christian piety, the source of formality and worldliness of the church. The terms like holiness and perfection irksome to the moderns thus were unabashedly elevated. This position compelled the Revivalist readers to think, contrary to their contemporaries, that something went seriously wrong if the professed believers were unholy and backslidden. The Revivalist hammered home the point that "utter renunciation," "entire sanctification," and "full appropriation of faith" would fling the door widely open to Scriptural revivals for Scriptural holiness. In this vein, these radical holiness proponents deplored a selective teaching of the Scriptures. They promoted the full gospel which included justification by faith, regeneration, witness of the Spirit, entire sanctification, total

---

Sanctification, purified-but how far, obstructions to growth, purity and growth, believing just now, the special holiness meeting, the sweetness of love, substitutes of holiness, the fullness of capability, through tribulation, threefold divine guidance. A number of these contents indicate G.D. Watson's influence on Martin Knapp's books such as "The Double Cure.

61) "Moody on the Second Blessing," *The Revivalist* (January 1894): 2.

62) "Mr. Moody on "Know so" Religion," *The Revivalist* (August 1894): 4.

63) Wallace Thornton Jr., *From Aldersgate to Azusa Street : Wesleyan, Holiness, and Pentecostal Visions of the New Creation*, ed. Henry H. Knight III, 148-52.

64) "Sect-fighting Sectarianism," *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate* (February 21, 1901): 8.

consecration, travail of Soul, fasting, tithes, verbal confession of faith, divine healing, second coming of Christ, pre-millennium, final judgment, baptism, laying on of hands, repentance of sins, restitution.<sup>65)</sup> Behind the emphasis on full and free gospel for all by the radical holiness movement was a battle over divine healing and the second coming of Christ.

Knapp displays the language of Palmer in emphasizing the importance of alter consecration and emotional exuberance of entire sanctification. Entire Sanctification as Spiritual Banquet: Entire sanctification was presented as an exciting follow-up ensuing conversion. Instead of attempting to hold the converts with such programs as public lectures, amusement concerts, or entertainments in lyceums, while the church became notable with elitism, formal worship lacking enthusiasm, George D. Watson presented the program for entire sanctification such as meditating the Psalms or the Song of Songs as some outburst or "banquet" of "rapturous delights."<sup>66)</sup> Even funeral of Lucy was made to appear "cheerful" instead of conventionally "gloomy" appearance.

The alter consecration of the entire human life was depicted as a delight for the radical holiness people.<sup>67)</sup> As for the relation of entire sanctification, genuine revival, and perfect love, Knapp wrote that one's conversion does not guarantee perfect love; seeking to obtain perfect love by "growth" wearies and perplexes, but by faith brings "blessed uplifts.;" evil still "lurks" in the converted heart which is not made perfect in love; perfect love does not exempt one from being a target for "Satan's fiery darts"; all doubtful doings should be given a "tremendous letting alone.;" perfect love if possessed, should be confessed; it does not save from "ignorance, infirmities and defects."<sup>68)</sup> The Holy Spirit: Prevailing Prayer invites the Holy Spirit and the function of the Holy Spirit is fivefold; 1. The descent of the Holy Spirit is an answer to prevailing prayer, 2. Conviction: Revival without conviction of sins is shallow. Conviction of sins thus is highlighted with the introduction of personal testimonies. 3. Renewal of the churches, 4. Sanctification, 5. strengthening, 6 Assurance.<sup>69)</sup> Knapp uses a binary method of affirmation and abnegation in his understanding of sin, salvation, and sanctification. Knapp held entire sanctification as redemption of both future and present, a way of foretaste of the impending kingdom of God, physical healing in addition to spiritual salvation was a corollary of full gospel's promise.

---

65) B. S. Taylor, "Leaders," *The Revivalist* (January 5, 1899): 8. Taylor states, "They cry out against the gospel of Healing, Second Coming, etc. ---- One can testify to the blessed hope of our Lord's appearing without pitching into hair-splitting controversies on "post" and "pre"-millennialism."

66) "Spiritual Luxuries," *The Revivalist* (January 1890): 3.

67) "A Luxury to Kneel," *The Revivalist* (August 1890): 3.

68) "Perfect Love," *The Revivalist* (April, 1892): 2.

69) *The Revivalist* (January 1890): 1; (May 1890): 4.

## **The Great Physician of the Full Gospel: salvation of spirit, soul, and body**

To the radical holiness advocates, Jesus Christ was the Great Physician who cared for both spirit and body in their system of full gospel. From this perspective and with the ample proof in the synoptic Gospels and the Acts of the Apostles where Jesus Christ demonstrated such a high attending the sick, Seth Rees questioned the reluctance of teaching of divine healing and a strange reaction of restlessness by the self-designated Bible Christians. Rees asked, wouldn't it be appropriate for the holiness teachers, editors, and preachers to pay a proportionate endeavor to the theme of divine healing as Jesus did? He further went on to question the fatalism of the "violent and vehement Arminians" who easily turned to "radical Calvinists" and "the error of one John Calvin," when they came to divine healing and viewing some sick as elected for God's glory. Then Rees threw a trenchant self-criticism in response to their skepticism: "the greatest enemies to the success of the holiness cause are in our own ranks. If we had, all of us, what we profess to have, and God could trust us with the supernatural, the miraculous, the amazing, the convincing, the overwhelming, we would cut our way through regiments of devils and regiments of diabolically-inspired ecclesiastical dignitaries and tyrants."<sup>70</sup> Compared to Rees, Knapp approached the theme of divine healing with an attenuated tone, perhaps, as the publisher of the *Revivalist* and with his antenna directed toward its some 20,000 subscribers and the wider voice of proponents of faith healing, critics of fanaticism, and cautions of holiness eclipse. Before looking at Knapp's view of divine healing, we need to briefly glance at the currents of divine healing in the U.S.

For the salvation of believers' whole life, divine healing had been experimented and promoted before Knapp. Donald Dayton traces its root back to German Pietism, especially in John Albert Bengel, Johann Christoph Blumhardt who argued for the interrelationship of sin and sickness and established Bad Boll, a Wurttemberg spa for the invalid in 1852, and George Muller, a student of Halle, who inaugurated the principle of "faith" in Christian ministry. For Muller, "importunity in supplication" was a sort of panacea. Across the Atlantic, Charles G. Finny adopted Muller's importunity principle in the birth of "new measures," which was applied also for the healing of diseases. These intermittent occurrences of divine healing became a part of a full-blown ministry of faith healing in conjunction with the experience of entire sanctification by Charles Cullis. Cullis is particularly engaging for our study because of his holiness experience under the influence of Phoebe Palmer's Tuesday Meeting in 1862, his visit to Europe's faith homes including Dorothea Trudel's with William Boardman in 1873, conviction of healing of A.B. Simpson in Main under his ministry in 1881, and that of R. Kelso Carter, an acquaintance of Simpson, through his prayer in 1879. By 1884, when Carter published *Divine Healing* or the

---

70) Seth C. Rees, "Divine Healing," *The Revivalist* (March 9, 1899): 10.

Atonement for Sin and Sickness, Cullis had founded four centers for the indigent and invalid on the model of George Muller's orphanage in 1864, a worker's home, a cancer home, a spinal home, an orphanage, a mission, a chapel, a Faith Training College in 1876, a holiness publisher, Willard Tract Repository, and a yearly "Consumptives Home Report," and a monthly "Times of Refreshing" in 1879, a children's monthly, "Loving Words," composed a book Faith Cures, or Answers to Prayer in the Healing of the Sick in 1879, "More Faith Cures: or Answers to Prayer in the Healing of the Sick," in 1881, which would be ensued by "Other Faith Cures: or Answers to Prayer in the Healing of the Sick" in 1885, conducted a "faith-cure" meetings in 1881, and "faith-cure" home was built in 1882, held Faith Conventions in Massachusetts, Main, and New Hampshire, and purchased "Intervale Park" in New Hampshire to hold his Faith Convention.<sup>71)</sup> In the meantime, Boardman popularized the story of Cullis through his book Faith Works in 1874, served as a professor at Cullis' Faith Healing College, and invited American faith healers to the International Conference on Divine Healing and True Holiness in London in 1884. We get a glimpse of the scale and gravity of faith healing currents through the vast enterprises of Charles Cullis in the North Atlantic world in the 1880s.

With this backdrop, it is no wonder that faith healing was affirmed and practiced across the denominational distinctions by A. B. Simpson, A.T. Pierson, A.J. Gordon, and R. A. Torrey, the participants of the Presbyterian dominated Keswick Conventions and the Niagara Conference. They all affirmed divine healing, while not excluding the use of "means".<sup>72)</sup> Charles Cullis promoted faith healing, while a medical doctor, a board member for founding Boston University School of Medicine, and an Episcopalian serving Beacon Hill Church in Boston. In the midst of the faith healing controversy, Cullis established the Consumptives Home which provided nutrition and healthy environment for TB patients.

A. J. Gordon, founder of Gordon College and pastor of Clarendon Street Baptist Church, Boston, wrote *The Ministry of Healing* in 1882. Following Gordon, R. Kelso Carter's *Divine Healing or the Atonement for Sin and Sickness* was published first in 1884 and in 1888. Ensuing Carter was H.T. Davis' in 1901. Gordon's concern was a pervasive theory of the cessation of miracles in his time. Against this, Gordon affirmed modern day miracles with his belief that "healing the sick rests on a distinct and specific promise to believers--- this kind of miracles is possible in every age of the Church's history."<sup>73)</sup> He asserted that "whenever we find a revival of primitive faith and

---

71) Donald W. Dayton, *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism* (New Jersey, London: The Scarecrow Press, 1987), 119-22.

72) Dana Robert, *Occupy until I Come: A. T. Pierson and the Evangelization of the World* (Michigan, Cambridge: William B. Eerdmans, 2003), 264.

73) A. J. Gordon, *The Ministry of Healing* (1882), 53, 54, 55. He also affirmed the miracles of prophecy, stating that "as to miracles of prophecy, we see no reason to believe that they were strictly limited to apostolic times." Although he mentioned the rationale of cessation theory based on the Epistle of Corinthians regarding prophecies, tongues, and knowledge, Gordon claimed that there were no biblical limitations as to healings. Gordon regards the age of Constantine a watershed from which the supernatural manifestations significantly "ceased to be generally recognized, or were supplanted by the gross and spurious type which characterize



apostolic simplicity there we find a profession of the chaste and evangelical miracles which characterized the apostolic age.”<sup>74)</sup> Here Gordon does not necessarily link divine healing and Pneumatology, although he has been generally noted for his Pneumatology. His concern here seems to be more on the implementation of the apostolic faith that leads to divine healing. According to his belief, he marshals an impressive array of incidents and documents as historical evidence of divine healing from the teachings of the early Church Fathers to the incidents of the nineteenth century. An impressive compendium of testimonies and witnesses, quotations from other Christian luminaries, Carter intimates, do not need for divine healing, since he believed that biblical promises were profuse and authoritative enough for divine intervention for healing.<sup>75)</sup> From this brief survey, issues related to divine healing have been 1) cessation theory, 2) the point of healing in atonement, or healing ensued after entire sanctification, 3) the relation between sins and healing, 4) the use of means, 5) primacy of healing versus holiness, and 6) the basis of modern healing on the historical precedents or biblical exegesis. On the shoulders of this development of the doctrine, Knapp advanced his view on divine healing.

Knapp devoted a chapter on divine healing in his *Lightning Bolts from Pentecostal Skies* written in 1898. This chapter was made into a booklet for a broader usage with a title, “Fruit of Pentecost.” In it, we can see Knapp’s comprehensive approach to human life. To Knapp, a care for body with hygiene, healthy habits and environment are as important as an instantaneous divine intervention for physical healing. Here he displays a trait of enlightenment and commonsense in pointing to the need of a reasonable care of the material areas, which encompassed all rudimentary activities of human life as much as “Elders.” “Clean hearts, clean spirits, clean habits, clean bodies, clean clothes, clean food and clean homes are all requisites of a Pentecostal experience, yet people persist in professing it who seldom take a thorough bath, and when dirt begets disease, wonder at the appearance of the dreaded child, and invoke a miracle to kill it. If such persons would more frequently call for “Elders,” Soap, Water, and Diet, there would be less need for other “Elders” to pray for Pentecostal healing.”<sup>76)</sup> As Carter generalized about faith-healers’ belief in the use of means in 1888, Knapp did not eliminate the use

---

the Church of the middle ages. And the era of Constantine’s conversion confessedly marks a decided transition from a purer to a more degenerate and worldly Christianity.” Historical evidence with passages or texts includes the incidents of Justin Martyr, Irenaeus, Tertullian, Origen, Clement, Augustine, it went on to an impressive array of those who believed through their own experiences divine healing: Luther, Philip Melancthon, Waldenses, Moravians (United Brethren), Huguenots, the Scotch Covenanters, Friends, a host of Baptists, and Methodists. Particularly A. Bost and Zinzendorf of Moravians, John Welch, Robert Bruce, John Scrimgeour in the 17th century, George Fox, Methodist Ann Mather, daughter of Joseph Benson, the Methodist Commentator, Richard Baxter, John Albert Bengel, Edward Irving, Horace Bushnell, Christlieb, Grotius, Dorothea Trudel, Samuel Zeller, Blumhardt, Dr. Cullis, etc. 62-245.

74) Ibid., 64.

75) R. Kelso Carter, *Divine Healing or the Atonement for Sin and Sickness* (New York: John B. Alden Publisher, 1884), 8, 9.

76) Martin Wells Knapp, 123.

of means as with other faith healers.<sup>77)</sup>

Knapp affirmed God's healing both through means and without means and both gradual and instantaneous healing, yet he made a qualification that healings performed by Jesus and apostles were instantaneous. Knapp clarified the purpose of divine healing: glorifying God, evangelism, elevating Jesus, bringing a revival, developing a Christian character. Divine healing as a miracle operating in the progressive era thus was a benediction to humanity, Knapp claimed, rather than something to be ridiculed as a superstition. In an apologetic tone, Knapp asserted that "Instead of hindering the revival or detracting from holiness, divine healing added an impetus to both" in response to the contemporary suspicion about divine healing, especially by Asbury Lowrey, who suspected that the pursuit of faith healing might supersede that of holiness. As with salvation, Knapp stated that divine healing is available for all, free, present, and fully. Human instrumentality of "elders" is here mentioned as with the role of revivalists in drawing revivals.<sup>78)</sup>

Compared to other book-length studies on divine healing, Knapp's chapter ran only 11 pages among other topics. The *Revivalist*, however, circulated the teachings and testimonies of divine healing in one full page from 1899. Featured in the weekly, the magazine familiarized the topic of divine healing to its subscribers along with topics like revivals, the second coming of Jesus Christ, book evangelism, world missions, etc. The section expanded to address other gifts of the Spirit in 1901, inclining toward the twentieth century Pentecostalism. The subscribers of the *Revivalists* were exposed to other information on divine healing such as H. T. Davis' "Modern Miracles," and A.J. Gordon's popular book, "Ministry of Healing." The weekly might have been more effective in drilling and developing a routine for readers to appropriate divine power of healing. The readers of the *Revivalist* and students at God's Bible school in Cincinnati reported their experience of divine healing, some through Knapp's prayer and teaching or on the lessons of the columns.<sup>79)</sup> In this way, the *Revivalist* popularized and maximized the benefits of divine healing on shaping American Christianity.

Knapp's affirmation of divine healing derived its authority from biblical references and God's answer to prayers. He asserted that divine healing is a "doctrine of the Bible, which can be secured by faith in the name of the Lord Jesus."<sup>80)</sup> Believing that "The New Testament mightily magnifies the healing of the human body," Knapp saw the foundation of divine healing in Christ's healing examples, Apostles' teaching on divine healing, testimonies of healing in the primitive church, one of nine gifts in the first Corinthian, Luther and Wesley's practices, and instructions of James.<sup>81)</sup> He viewed

---

77) R. Kelso Carter, *Divine Healing or the Atonement for Sin and Sickness* (New York: John B. Alden Publisher, 1884), 18. Carter's earlier insistence of exclusive divine healing without the use of means was modified later in 1888.

78) Martin Wells Knapp, *Lightning Bolts*, 123-33.

79) "Healed at the Bible School," *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate* (January 24, 1901): 10; "Healed of a Cancer," (January 31, 1901): 11.

80) "Divine Healing," *The Revivalist* (January 12, 1899): 10.

81) Martin Wells Knapp, *Lightning Bolts* 83. Both Knapp and A.J. Gordon refer to Luther for

experiencing the entire sanctification without a belief in divine healing or the return of Christ as "mutilated holiness."<sup>82</sup> Full gospel that gives full salvation includes divine healing and the imminent eschatology. Knapp understands Satan "distorted," "deceived," "perverted," "counterfeited," "abused." Hence, Knapp accounts his own experience of healing by using the expression, the "disease was suddenly rebuked and fled."<sup>83</sup>

Charles Cowman's account of his own experience of divine healing reflected a number of points that the radical holiness advocates emphasized; Cowman experienced instantly the healing of his own eyes on God's words; He passed through travail right before the experience of healing; He gave a public testimony of the healing; healing came through his prayer on his faith by the Holy Spirit.<sup>84</sup> Right before Cowman arrived in Japan, he was gripped by la grippe with "awful chills and fever and severe headache." After prayer with Lettie Cowman, he experienced an immediate cure. Lettie Cowman was also contracted with a nervous prostration. She invited Dr. Godbey to pray and she records, "the devil had to retreat again and I am feeling just splendid. Our faith is increased a hundred-fold. We had another meeting at Peniel Mission last evening. One man came to the altar or sanctification."<sup>85</sup>

Godbey, who experienced divine healing himself from pulmonary congestion, argues that failing to experience divine healing does not prove the shortage of spirituality, since healing is given as a gift and salvation by grace. Godbey's view is contrasted to Charles Finny's new measure that a lack of faith incurred thorn in the body in Paul, risking the accusation of new measure as a way of manipulating God." Godbey understood the contribution of the holiness movement in Christian history rested on the restoration of the teaching of the second coming of Christ and divine healing. His view of Christian history follows.

It is one of the glories of the present Holiness Movement to restore the great Bible truth of Divine healing for the body, which was so prominent in the apostolic age, and like the other great cardinal truths, went into eclipse during the dark ages, following the great Constantinian apostacy. God used Martin Luther to rescue from the rubbish of Romanism the great fundamental Bible doctrine of justification by the free grace of God in Christ, received and appropriated by faith without works. He used John Wesley to restore the great and glorious doctrine of entire sanctification, wrought by the Holy Ghost, through the cleansing blood, instantaneously received by simple faith for that might work. In a similar manner the present holiness Movement has restored to the Church the great and inspiring truth of the Lord's return on the throne of the

---

mediating divine healing on Melancton, yet Dayton states that Luther's practice was extremely limited, only with a minimal reference.

82) "Mutilated Holiness," *The Revivalist* (April 6, 1899): 1.

83) Martin Wells Knapp, "Healing Magnified," *The Revivalist* (January 5, 1899): 10.

84) Charles E. Cowman, "Don't tell it," *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate* (January 24, 1901): 10.

85) Lettie Cowman, "Off for Japan," *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate* (February 14, 1901): 9.

glorious Theocracy, also the beautiful and encouraging doctrine of bodily healing and woman's ministry. As the present age is flooded with illustrative examples of Divine healing innumerable everywhere, I presume the reader of these pages is a believer in this precious truth."<sup>86)</sup>

## **Holism: Salvation for Present and Full, Free and for All**

Knapp's theological position was crystalized in the motto, "Salvation for Present and Full, Free and for All" on the heading of each issue. Salvation free and for all highlighted Wesleyan tradition in contrast to the Calvinism's exclusive double election: total depravity of humanity, God's unlimited grace, limited salvation, perseverance, which caused some to disparage Calvinists as subject to fatalism, antinomianism, and reprobation. Calvin's exclusive stance was condensed in Wesley's statement, "One in twenty of mankind are elected; nineteen in twenty are reprobated. The elect shall be saved, do what they will: The reprobate shall be damned, do what they can." We see in Salvation for Present and full a transition from Wesleyan tradition to the emerging Pentecostalism which emphasizes the efficacy of salvation not in the future and up in the sky, but its full appropriation on the earth at present. The present possibility of entire sanctification and indwelling of the Holy Spirit indicate that Knapp was closely aligned with Palmer's holiness movement, as Charles Jones claims.<sup>87)</sup> Salvation for all, present, full, and free prepared a way for the wider world with the gospel for the nations. The inclusive stance does not negate the presence of original sin in humanity. Knapp's radical holiness movement made repentance of sins integral parts of sermons contrary to the contemporary's reluctance of broaching the issues of sins. In this vein, Knapp's holiness movement complied neither with New Haven's New Theology which denied humanity's original sins, nor with liberals which located sins in society.

## **Toward the Wider World: Internationalism**

The heart of the aggressive and radical holiness movement was its missionary impulse. Nowhere was the missionary impulse more visible than in the orientation of God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate, after Knapp's death. Before his passing, in order to steadily conserve the spirit of the founder and editor of the Revivalist, Knapp had secured two other editors in addition to his wife Minnie Knapp who had managed the business matters since 1890. Minnie Knapp, M. G. Standley, and Mary Story succeeded

---

86) "Divine Healing," *The Revivalist* (January 5, 1899): 10.

87) Charles Edwin Jones, *Perfectionist Persuasion: The Holiness Movement and American Methodism, 1867-1936* (Metuchen, N. J. The Scarecrow Press, 1974), 4 .Jones states that the differing emphasis on "entire sanctification as a present possibility" as in Phoebe Palmer or as a process as in John Wesley resulted in a vast differing results: the latter with a "generation of seekers after Christian perfection, the former a century of holiness professors intent on reviving primitive Methodism."

the very missional spirit of Knapp. Moreover, they enhanced God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate into a full-fledged mission journal with an eye to Christian internationalism even during the economic constraints of the 1920s and 1930s in the U.S.. The seed of internationalism had been hidden in The Revivalist which was devoted to the promotion of revivals. It incorporated missional columns with the news of missionaries like William Taylor and Amanda Berry Smith from its beginning years.<sup>88)</sup>

As the twentieth century dawned, Knapp made a radical resolution: withdrawal of his membership from the Methodist Episcopal Church on January 1, 1901.<sup>89)</sup> This separation was a corollary to his earlier steps in preparation for the Holiness outreach toward the wider world, since the Methodist churches had become denounced for making their parish the world. By 1901, Knapp consolidated his ecclesiology. He differentiated loyalty to the Church as a body of Christ, from loyalty to customs, Roman Catholic ecclesiasticism, human opinions like a church dogma, or to some department or committees for Christian activities. Instead, Knapp declared that true loyalty to the Church was to Jesus and the Word.<sup>90)</sup> This stance was a modification of his earlier view. About ten years earlier in 1890, Knapp had repudiated "Come-outism" as "chilling," destroying, poisoning the church, and "paralyzing all organized agencies" that were engaged in soul saving works. He denounced Come-outism as having "serpent's sting and fangs."<sup>91)</sup> Knapp pronounced such a strong word partly because of his primacy on church unity and partly as a preemptive measure against the separatist trend of forming independent congregations that began to augment from about 1883.<sup>92)</sup> The mid-1890s saw the contention converged on the issues of divine healing and the second coming of Christ. The anxious of the Methodist Church leadership between two forces of progressive modernity and the need for renewal reacted in an exclusion policy by limiting membership to those who advocated divine healing and Jesus' imminent return. Their concern was the protection of the integrity of the Methodist Church. One of those put out included the International Holiness Union and Prayer League (IHUPL) that was organized around Martin Knapp in 1897.

The IHUPL had the word, "international" with Knapp's clear vision of gearing the

---

88) "Stay Ye," "Go Ye," "Send Ye," *The Revivalist* (May 1890): 3; "Revivals and Mission Work," "Motives for Engagement in Missionary Work," *The Revivalist* (January 1893): 2.

89) "Church Relation Changed," *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate* (January 10, 1901): 13.

90) "Loyalty to the Church" (September 1894): 2.

91) "Come-outism," *The Revivalist* (April 1890): 2. Meesaeng Lee Choi presents Kenneth Lowe's introduction of "Comeoutism" used as synonymous with the later holiness movement. This come-outism describes the holiness movement that caused a massive exit from the Methodist Church in the late nineteenth century. Meesaeng Lee Choi, *The Rise of the Korean Holiness Church in Relation to the American Holiness Movement: Wesley's Scriptural Holiness" and the "Fourfold Gospel* (Lanham: Scarecrow Press, 2008), 37

92) Vinson Synan, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Movement in the United States* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing C., 1971), 53. The period between 1893 and 1900, Synan claims, gave birth to 23 holiness associations.; Charles Edwin Jones, *Perfectionist Persuasion; The Holiness Movement and American Methodism, 1867-1936* (New Jersey: The Scarecrow Press, 1974), 90-91. Jones gives a detailed account of the increase of separating congregations from 1882.

organization in the direction to partner with the wider world. Internationalism was a watershed that differentiated the IHUPL from the National Holiness Association (NHA). American nationalism with its principle of exclusive stance became the hallmark of American Christianity, since the American Revolution forced its inhabitants to separate the church and states and to avoid foreign entanglements. Particularly Methodist Episcopal Church, seen as a descendant of the Church of England until the 1780s had to be more mindful of this delicate issue.<sup>93)</sup> The majority of the NHA was Methodist ministers. Being expelled by the NHA, the IHUPL became free to pursue its ideal of internationalism. The year IHUPL was founded was also the year the Niagara Summer Conference lasting for a decade suspended its summer conference.

The Niagara summer conferences and the IHUPL seem to be mutually unrelated. The IHUPL, however, not only resonated with, but boldly popularized the key values of the Niagara Summer Conference: pre-millennialism and internationalism. Pre-millennialism was known to be the product of the group called the Plymouth Brethren. The founder of the Brethren, John Nelson Darby from Ireland, was sharply conscious of the degrading world and churches' backsliding. He taught believers to prepare for Christ's impending advent, apart from the institutional Church, especially since the world was getting worse until Jesus' return. The point is 1. Human effort would not make the world better. 2. Only the intervention or return of Jesus Christ would cleanse the world and initiate the millennium. 3. Society would not progress toward the kingdom of God on earth. This teaching sounded bizarre to the nineteenth century American Methodists who viewed themselves as a city on the hill, whose activism would bring civilization to the world. But to build the millennium on earth, they needed more time before Jesus comes. Their effort will be poured on building what the Westerners viewed as a civilized world. While this optimism pervaded in the U.S. the pre-millennial view began to infiltrate through agents like widely popular George Muller, who successfully persuaded A. T. Pearson with pre-millennialism in 1879. The Niagara Conference was the safe haven for pre-millennialists, the first Niagara summer conference held in 1883. A greenhouse for pre-millennialism, the conference was seen as "almost an "underground" network of pre-millennialists." Dana Robert describes how pre-millennialism was a controversial doctrine in the 1880s, pastors reluctant to preach it on pulpit. During that time, the Niagara Conference spent a week long summer retreat devoted to the Bible reading, belief in the infallibility of the Bible, the promotion of holiness piety, views on the decadence of the back alleys in human society.<sup>94)</sup>

To Knapp, the bleak signs of his time proved the validity of the premillennialism: an increasing number of murders, divorces, wickedness, violence in the urban context. He also regarded the increasing number of nominal Christians who attend the church, but the fallacy of this position was Church's claim that her collective endeavors will make

---

93) Mark A. Noll, *A History of Christianity in the United States and Canada*, 166.

94) Dana Robert, *Occupy Until I Come: A. T. Pierson and the Evangelization of the World* (Grand Rapids, Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 2003) 104-107, 133-35.

the world better before Jesus will come and rule. Knapp lamented that the church nourished substitutes for holiness when she backslid. Into the cold hollow of the Methodist Church were built mentally drilling college culture, eloquent preaching instead of Holy Spirit preaching, human federation, instead of the unity of the Spirit, church loyalty for loyalty to the Holy Spirit and the Bible, reading holiness books and papers instead of practicing the ethics of holiness, defending instead of exemplifying, professing it in the place of possessing it, when both should go together.<sup>95)</sup> Given this, Knapp's vision of the New Testament Church was subordinating, passing the theology of the Methodist Church, to the higher command of the Holy Spirit and the Biblical injunctions. For this purpose, Knapp deemed the union of holiness people necessary in order to rake a greater revival conflagration and to expose the futility of worldly pursuits. Now his role was to explicitly fight against secularization and formality of the church, not necessarily the church. In this sense, Knapp's premillennialism did not consent with John Darby's ecclesiology which categorically denied the institutional church. Rather like many women mission societies organized in the second half of the nineteenth century, the IHUPL diverted its radical holiness movement toward the broader world missions. Missional aspiration had gripped Knapp, who from January 1893 sprinkled the *Revivalist* with missional columns, "Revival and mission Work," and "Motives for engagement in missionary work." Knapp's internationalism had a clear ideological basis propped by his belief in premillennial return of Jesus.

## Premillennialism

Knapp's espousal of pre-millennial view of Jesus return was the product of his literal interpretation of the Bible. He often used Jesus' reference to Noah in the end time, as a proof of the degenerating world until Jesus' advent. He also used A.T. Pearson to underscore the fact that the end time was unknown at variance with the earlier mistake of George Bell's prophecy which caused Wesley's unambiguous refutation. Knapp's emphasis on premillennialism was a corollary of his Biblicism. Literal interpretation of the bible phrases necessitated believers to prepare for the sudden return of the bridegroom, Christ, by wearing white robes, by being entirely sanctified. The preparation of the impending Jesus return with entire consecration to Christ provided a rationale for an active engagement in world missions before his return. Knapp elaborated on the relationship between Pre-millennialism and mission work.

Premillennialism is a mighty incentive to mission work, bearing the gospel at once to every creature, as Jesus commanded. Post-millennialism holds that the time for doing this is long, and hence weakens the hands that otherwise might move more swiftly. Pre arouses conviction with the cry: "Behold, He cometh!" Post lulls to sleep with: "My Lord delayeth His coming." Pre believes that the mission of the church is to declare the

---

95) "Substitutes of Holiness," *God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate* (January 3, 1901): 2.

gospel to every creature, giving all a chance to meet Jesus when "He comes, and reign with Him. Post declares that the mission of the gospel is to save all men, and hence foists on the world the spectacle of a gospel that is a failure, thus inviting infidelity. Pre anticipates the speedy return of Jesus and the conversion of the world. Post transfers it to the misty future. Pre agrees with the revelations of Scripture and the facts of history as they exist today. Post construes both to sustain its own human fallacies. Pre exalts Christianity; post, churchianity.<sup>96)</sup>

The connection between the pre-millennial return of Jesus and the impulse of world missions is identifiable in Knapp. Pointing out George Muller and Charles H. Spurgeon from across the Atlantic and the North American A. B. Simpson as the most prominent proponents of pre-millennialism, Knapp argued that their position was the source of inspiration for driving the most marked mission promoters. With a usual rhetoric of boldness, Knapp underscored, "While on every side men abound who hold post-millennial views who are listless in regard to mission work, yet we have never known a man, a pre-millennialist, who was not awake on that subject. Let us stick to the facts, though the heavens fall."<sup>97)</sup>

Donald Dayton offers an explanation of how theological emphasis was shifted from post millennialism to pre millennialism in American religious history. He does this by illuminating on the interconnectedness of pneumatology, eschatology, and the impulse of reformation. Particularly important in this juncture, Dayton claims, is a human desire for social change. For the postmillennialists, the initiative for change comes from a human community, the churches. The optimistic anticipation for the betterment of human conditions, aka the advance of millennium, the prosperous period of peace, or the kingdom of God on earth, motivated Christians to pour their efforts for social progress through cultural projects of education, medicine, and civilization. The Copernicus shift took place, however, when those optimists tackled with historical realities in which human limits of control were exposed through events like the Civil War, frustration with modern life, urban anarchy and destitution, and the contradictory evidence of what progressive science and technology promised. The optimists began to experience the dichotomy between the vision of reform on earth and the sordid reality. Premillennial view of Bible interpretation was a reaction to reconcile the tragic reality and the promise of millennium. Here emerged pre-millennialism in the late nineteenth century to the post-war generation.<sup>98)</sup> Dayton pinpointed here what concerns us most and what made Knapp a visibly radical holiness advocate and distinctive from the stance of the National Holiness Association: "Premillennialism was, with healing, one of the issues most resisted by the leadership of the National Holiness Association."<sup>99)</sup> Pak Myung-su

---

96) Martin Wells Knapp, "Pre-Millennialism vs. Post- Millennialism," *The Revivalist* (January 5, 1899): 6.

97) Martin Wells Knapp, "Inspiration of Missionary Work," *The Revivalist* (January 12, 1899): 6. 1; A Post Millennial Fallacy, *The Revivalist* (March 1897): 2.

98) Donald Dayton, *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism*, 143-67.



concur that the National Holiness Association criticized those who centered their evangelism on healing and the imminent return of Christ as side-tracked and limited their membership in 1887.<sup>100)</sup>

Another avenue for Knapp's adoption of pre-millennialism can be D. L. Moody from the British Keswick Movement. The Keswick Conventions held since 1876 paved its distinctive path from the American Holiness Movement. This British holiness movement was neither conditioned by Methodists, nor relied on Wesleyan theology. The Keswick left room for 1) discovering sins in believers by endorsing that the entire sanctification counteracted one's inclination to sin, but did not eliminate it. The Revivalist took a different stance at this point from the Keswick people, but The Keswick teachings endorsed a premillennial eschatology, which could be imported to the American evangelicals by D. L. Moody, while the American Holiness Movement generally remained committed to the postmillennialism of its Methodist forebears.<sup>101)</sup> Moody, a popular revivalist for the Knapp group, was also a coworker of A. T. Pierson at Northfield summer conferences and there propagated Keswick views among North American evangelicals. D. L. Moody, A. J. Gordon, and A. T. Pierson, the nineteenth century evangelicals took the premillennial outlook of the world, which compelled them to be engaged in world missions for bringing more souls for Christ. Faith Mission: Premillennial eschatology, the imminent return of Jesus Christ, also led people to easily sell out their possessions, relocate for Bible training, and commit to foreign missions. This characteristic was the same with the case of the Salvation Army missionaries, the reason why Knapp did not put lucrative secular advertisement in the Revivalist.

## Advance to the World

God's Revivalist and Bible Advocate was the key magazine in the US delivering the missionary news from Korea, Japan, China, South Africa, and London by 1909. In 1901, William Hirst was commissioned to Cape Town. Charles and Lettie Cowmans were one of the first missionaries sent via the Knapp's radical Holiness Movement. One of the most successful fruit of the international enterprises by the Radical Holiness Movement was the formation of the Korean Holiness Church. From the outset, the Korean Holiness church was given birth during the historic period of Korea's Great Revival. The Korean Holiness Church was characterized by Korean initiative in partnership with Cowmans. Zeal in the Bible study from the outset and a collective ministry of three evangelists are reminiscent of Knapp Bible advocate and his team work with Seth Lees and W. Godbey. Egalitarian ethos dominant in the Revivalist was one factor that allowed Lettie Cowman to be the first to write a report about the mission in Korea before Charles Cowman

---

99) Ibid., 164.

100) Pak Myung-su., 108.

101) William Kostlevy, *Holy Jumpers*, 19.

began to pick up the report. Lettie Cowman also sent a report on the Asia mission to the Revivalist almost every month since the couple had been commissioned in 1901. This section with rich documents unexplored requires another paper.

## Conclusion

One of the handicaps in modern historical studies results from vast research materials and compartmentalization of disciplines. This state causes a fragmentation of knowledge of people and events that overlap in the areas of different disciplines. Martin Knapp inherited the legacy of revivalism that shaped for centuries American Christianity, yet history textbooks of American Christianity hardly mention his name. On the other hand, his assertion of right means, right message, right time, and right target is mostly reminiscent of Charles Finny's new measures in the Second Great Awakening which staged revivals in measured activities that would bring the maximized tangible results. No historians refer to Charles Finny in relation to Knapp. Camp meetings and revivalists as the key vehicle of Gospel messages of the radical Holiness Movement were the reinvention of the earlier legacy of revivals in American Christianity. Martin's literary project of the Revivalist as a means of creating and maintaining revivals can be also traced back in the printing project of Pietism as well as Wesleyan Methodism, exhibiting the characteristics of enthusiasm as well as enlightenment in the heart religion. Standing at the ebb tide of the Methodist Church's religious vitality, Martin locates the fountain of renewal not on the great theologians, but on the New Testament spirituality of Pentecost and the Bible. Martin leads the radical Holiness Movement through the interstices of restorationists extremities and the criticism of fanaticism. As seen in the four mottos of the paper, Pentecostal, Holiness, Missionary, and Unsectarian, Knapp explicitly pronounced the orientation and values of the radical Holiness Movement by seeking to restore God's image in holiness through the Pentecostal experience of Christianity. In proclaiming that salvation of the Gospel is present, free, full, and for all, the radical Holiness Movement promoted the present appropriation of the Holy Spirit's gifts, its efficacy for all, Gospel of grace, and belief in his sovereignty in all areas of human life. The belief allowed the radical Holiness Movement to accept the imminent advent of Christ, which facilitated its vigorous engagement in world missions before His advent. Martin Knapp and the radical Holiness Movement needs to be studied under the scrutiny of Martin Knapp and his coterie, and as yet in light of the wider history of American Christianity and of world Christianity.

서울신학대학교 글로벌사중복음연구소 주관

< 제 1 회 국제학술세미나 >

오순절성결운동 지도자 마틴 냅과 21세기 한국성결교회

## 논찬

논찬 : 최인식 교수  
(서울신학대학교, 조직신학)

2014. 3. 10(월) 오후 2:00, 서울신학대학교 100주년기념관 512호 영성실습실에서

---

