



ISSUE NUMBER 186 - JUNE 30, 2022

ALI & THE FARMHAND : ACQUIT & CONVICT

Some may find this edition a bit strange since only one man murdered Carrie Brown. Totally understandable. However, in this case, a case where there are a good number of twists and turns within the fabric of the story, it is necessary to present, objectively, as much of it that is available and possible for this generation and the next generation of researchers to contemplate in determining the best possible solution....if that is at all possible.

In the years I have been seriously studying the East River Hotel murder, there hasn't been a day in which something has surfaced which either augments my understanding or makes me re-think what I thought I knew. A famous quote from John Wooden, legendary UCLA basketball coach goes "It's what you learn after you thought you knew everything that counts..." This is particularly true in this murder case/mystery, a case which had been considered solved when Ali was released from prison in 1902 and the prevailing theory was that the Farmhand had been the murderer all along. While this may be true and no serious researcher can dispute that possibility, it is nevertheless necessary that in order to make that judgment, one must know all the facts. Very few people do.

This exercise is just one of several that I intend to present in the future.

As with anything I publish in these East River Echo newsletters, if you have a different opinion to what is being presented, please don't hesitate to contact me and share your observations.

\*\*\*\*\*



Ameer Ben Ali

Circumstantial Evidence

- \*\*\*Habit of entering rooms not issued to him at hotel after original male tenant left
- \*\*\*Track record of violence and altercations with women in area
- \*\*\*Blood on his person undoubtedly from another person.
- \*\*\*Feigned ignorance of victim ; Litany of lies from beginning to end and while on witness stand
- \*\*\*Seen sneaking out of hotel on morning of the 24th
- \*\*\*Blood trail leading from his room to Room 31

Direct Evidence

- \*\*\*Material under nails also present in murder victim's corpse



C.Kniclo / Glenmore Man / Danish Farmhand

Circumstantial Evidence

- \*\*\*Possession of key to room 31
- \*\*\*Possession of bloody shirt according to his employer which he left in New Jersey
- \*\*\*Seen in Glenmore Hotel : Two witnesses to his description match in every way - Had blood on his person at the Glenmore Hotel

Direct Evidence

- \*\*\*Last person known to have been with victim in Room 31

The question is : Could both of these men have been convicted ( one was ) and acquitted ?

My contention is that they could have been.

Convicting Ali : He was convicted of second degree murder based on his behavior and the medical evidence against him according to the jury

Acquitting Ali : He was released on the circumstantial evidence which emerged when the key to Room 31 was finally handed over.

Had he told the authorities he only burgled the room and was unaware that Brown lay dead in her bed but had come into contact with her blood when rifling her clothes, he may have been let go.

Unfortunately, confessing to this might have been resulted in the jury not believing this story

Had 21st century DNA technology existed, the blood on his shirt might have proven to have come from Brown

\*\*\*\*\*

Convicting C.Kniclo : Had he been apprehended in 1891 and had the key on his person, that may have found him convicted of murder

Acquitting C. Kniclo : Despite the key being turned in a decade later and reasonable doubt being the basis of Ali's release, that alone did not prove he had murdered Brown.

Had he told the authorities back in 1891 that he had stepped out momentarily from Room 31 ; returned to see her murdered ; came into contact for one reason or the other with her blood ; fled and went to the Glenmore Hotel to clean up.; and then headed home.... Unfortunately, if true, the jury might not buy this story.

Had 21st century DNA technology existed, the blood shirt he was said to have had in his possession might have proven he murdered Brown