20

EXPLORING THE IMPACT OF A CULTURE BEARER ON INTERCULTURAL UNDERSTANDING WITHIN A COMMUNITY CHOIR

Benjamin Bolden and Larry O'Farrell

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY

Many singing ensembles engage in the learning and performing of repertoire from diverse musical cultures and traditions. However, in working with such repertoire, directors and ensemble members encounter multiple challenges (Reimer, 2002). The work of singers and choir directors entails seeking, exploring, and negotiating multi-faceted knowledge in order to represent the repertoire in a manner that is respectful to the music itself and the culture from whence it came. To enhance understanding of musical works, singers and choir directors seek to learn about tradition-specific musical idioms and performance practices, cultural contexts, and much more. Singers and choir directors must grapple with issues of trustworthiness of musical sources, authenticity of interaction with the music, cultural appropriation, and political correctness (Klinger, 2002). Associated ethical questions are ubiquitous, complex, and troubling (Countryman, 2009). Hess (2010), for example, identifies the potential of world music education to essentialize cultures, or to result in a self-congratulatory construction of self as "civilized" through encounters with the "other."

More positively, there is evidence that singing music from other cultures can lead to intercultural understanding, for example by shattering stereotypes (Hess, 2010) and enhancing understandings of significant cultural issues (Bradley, 2007, 2009). Many suggest that multicultural music education can lead to greater understanding not only of unfamiliar musics but also of unfamiliar cultures (see, for example, Abril, 2006; Edwards, 1996; Howard, Swanson, & Campbell, 2014; Joseph, 2011; Southcott & Joseph, 2007), particularly when the music is taught in relation to its socio-cultural context (Ilari, Chen-Hafteck, & Crawford, 2013).

Global music expert Patricia Shehan Campbell (2004) suggests a "culture bearer" might be helpful in negotiating the challenges associated with learning and engaging with music from unfamiliar cultures and traditions. Burton (2002) describes a culture bearer as "one raised within the culture who is a recognized practitioner of the culture's music" (p. 178). Culture bearers can provide information and insights about music and contextual factors beyond what is available through listening or researching (Joseph & Southcott, 2013). Ideally the culture bearer knows

intimately and can share the musical and cultural knowledge necessary to support the "respectful representation" of a music tradition (Szego, 2005, p. 212). Erwin, Edwards, Kerchner, & Knight (2003, p. 135) explain that "a guest artist provides an 'insider's view' of a culture that no other form of world music instruction can." Possibilities for singers to meaningfully connect to the music and culture are heightened when students have the chance to connect with an individual who knows the music and culture intimately: "Having the chance to meet with and talk to a guest artist can help dispel stereotypes and provide correct information quickly" (Erwin et al., 2003, p. 135).

The culture-bearer approach makes sense, but it also raises concerns (Hess, 2010, 2013; Vaugeois, 2009). By what criteria does one identify such an "expert"? Whose recognition matters when attempting to determine if the culture bearer is indeed a "recognized practitioner" of a culture's music? Who determines whether the artist is indeed an "insider"? Other concerns arise when considering the artist's interactions with the singers. Will the culture bearer be able to effectively communicate with them, and enable them to gain meaningful understandings? Is it possible for one person, in a protracted period of time, to reasonably provide adequate knowledge of an entire musical tradition, let alone adequate knowledge of the entire culture in which the musical tradition developed? What does an encounter between a culture bearer and singers entail, and what is its impact?

While there is considerable literature that addresses the notion of a culture bearer, the majority of that literature addresses it theoretically. Very little literature reports empirical research concerning the phenomenon of culture bearer as guide for the learning of global music.

In one of the few research studies that addresses the culture-bearer phenomenon, Joseph (2011) interviewed a black South African culture bearer who worked in schools in Victoria, Australia as a visiting artist, performer, and composer. The culture bearer described teaching through performance as well as storytelling; making use of call and response, imitation and rote teaching in his pedagogy; and stressing the need for cultural context: "I tell them the history and meaning of the songs and the fact that music is part of an oral tradition" (p. 50). The culture bearer also claimed: "I impart knowledge of Africa and I also think it breaks down racial barriers … kids may have stereotypical understandings from someone else" (p. 72). Examining the influence of a Native American culture bearer working with children in Arizona schools, Edwards (1996) found that a guest artist "can significantly affect student perceptions of American Indian music and culture—and may be more powerful than lessons directed by a trained music teacher" (p. 13). Marsh (2000) studied the perceptions of University of Western Sydney students who worked with an Aboriginal performer-in-residence and found that "a significant change in cultural awareness, cultural sensitivity, and cultural valuing was evident … the experience appeared to have a greater effect in developing intercultural understanding than in developing these students' content knowledge of Aboriginal music" (p. 65). Given the paucity of research that has examined the culture-bearer phenomenon, we sought to address this gap, focusing in particular on the potential of the culture bearer to support the development of intercultural understanding.

Purpose, Context, and Research Question

The purpose of our research was to examine an encounter between a culture bearer and singers. Specifically, we examined the case of an African American gospel music expert who spent one week as guest conductor with an adult auditioned community choir in Ontario, Canada. Over the course of the week he led the singers in three two-hour rehearsals then, at the end of the week, conducted the choir in a concert of African American gospel music.

The community choir consisted of around 100 singers. Choir members ranged in age from approximately 20 to 70 years. Although we did not gather information on the backgrounds or

race of the singers, none appeared to have an African Canadian, African American, or African background. The singers performed and rehearsed in a medium-sized Ontario city where, according to 2016 census data, just 10% of the population are visible minorities, and just 0.7% of the population are black (Statistics Canada, 2016). The regular choir director, who was not a visible minority, had been directing the choir for 17 years. He had post-graduate training and extensive experience in western classical piano and organ performance and choral conducting. The choir's regular repertoire consisted primarily of music from the western classical choral tradition, including contemporary compositions in this genre. The choir also performed choral compositions from around the world. The choir had developed a mandate to regularly (once every two years) invite a guest conductor to work with the choir for one week and conduct a concert of repertoire chosen by the guest conductor.

The guest conductor and culture bearer in the encounter we examined, Dr. Rolston (pseudonym), was an African American university professor and choral director, educated in the United States. He was an award-winning composer and arranger of gospel music, and a music director at an African Methodist Church. He was familiar with the culture-bearer role, having previously worked with choirs in Europe, Asia, Africa, and Australia.

We employed case study methods to discover how choir members experienced their encounter with the culture bearer. Our study was guided by the research question, *how, if at all, did the choir members perceive that the experience contributed to their intercultural understanding of the represented culture?*

Theoretical Framework: Intercultural Understanding

The tragic results of intolerance confront us daily in the disturbing headlines presented by the news media. Mass shootings motivated by religious intolerance provide stark examples in the USA and Canada (May & Hafner, 2018; Riga, 2018). Chapter 25 by Shana Redmond presents examples of the American anti-black climate. The need to combat intolerance is self-evident if we are ever to achieve an acceptable level of respect for human rights and peace and stability at home or across the globe.

This is not to say that mere tolerance of difference is sufficient to achieve sustainable social cohesion. A troubling possibility when engaging with global musics is that the seemingly progressive objective of learning more about diverse musics and cultures could actually mask an insidious purpose that Hess (2013, pp. 71–72) describes as "the politics of self-congratulation."

> [T]his self-congratulation—the knowing of oneself through the assumption of the inferiority of the Other and the applauding of oneself for being a "culturally 'tolerant' cosmopolitan" white subject is what I term the politics of self-congratulation. I speak to this way of living with reference to the ways we often perform ourselves as "tolerant" subjects—literally congratulating ourselves on our tolerance of racial Others.

A more ethical and proactive approach to bridging cultural differences is expressed in such terms as inclusion and diversity. Although diversity refers, initially, to the range of differences among people, it is currently used interchangeably with inclusion to reflect a response to cultural difference that goes beyond simple forbearance. The goal is one of valuing and embracing the cultural lives of our fellow human beings not only despite our differences but, importantly, because of the resilience and cultural enrichment that derive from a diverse community.

The antithesis of intolerance has sometimes been articulated as intercultural understanding, and we have adopted this terminology for the purposes of the current study. We view intercultural understanding as knowledge of diverse cultures that recognizes commonalities and differences,

knowledge that is held with the intent of creating connections and developing mutual respect. This research was initiated under the auspices of the AIRS project, which embraced the concept of intercultural understanding though singing. Subsequently, our concept of intercultural understanding was influenced by an action plan for arts education that was unanimously endorsed in 2011 by the General Conference of UNESCO—the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. *The Seoul Agenda: Goals for the development of arts education* was a major outcome of the 2010 UNESCO World Conference on Arts Education held in the Republic of Korea. Among other goals, it calls on governments and educators around the world to "apply arts education principles and practices to contribute to resolving the social and cultural challenges facing today's world" (UNESCO, 2010, p. 2). In specific action items, it proposes endeavoring to expand "multi-cultural dimensions in the practice of arts education" (p. 10) and increasing "intercultural mobility of students and teachers to foster global citizenship" (p. 10). Our study proposes singing as a venue in which the intention to foster intercultural understanding through artistic learning can be made manifest.

Study Design and Methods

The study was guided by a qualitative case study approach. Case study methods enable the exploration of an issue of general interest by examining particular cases (Stake, 1995). A case is an "integrated system" (p. 2). The Ontario community choir's involvement with a culture bearer from the African American gospel music tradition constituted our particular case: a unique integrated system. Although this particular integrated system is, of course, unique, we believe that findings from this case can serve to enhance a general understanding of the broader phenomenon: a guest culture bearer working with a vocal ensemble.

Data Collection

Following clearance by our university's ethical review board, we first collected data through one focus group discussion with a small group of choir members, followed by a series of one-on-one, semi-structured interviews of approximately one hour in duration with five other singers. The focus group consisted of four male singers, ranging in age from approximately 45 to 65 years. Throughout the session we (the authors) verbally summarized the main issues discussed for verification purposes. The understandings we gained from this focus group discussion helped inform the design of the protocol for the subsequent one-on-one interviews with five different singers—two women and three men. While the focus of this study was the perceptions and experiences of choir members, we also interviewed the guest conductor (culture bearer) and the choir's regular conductor to provide complementary data sources, that is, to help us understand the visit of the culture bearer from multiple perspectives. The focus group and all interviews were audio-recorded and later transcribed verbatim by a research assistant. Following the interviews, each one-on-one interview participant was emailed the transcript of his or her interview and invited to add, edit, or delete material so that the transcript effectively represented what the participant wished to communicate.

Data Analysis

Qualitative thematic analysis of the focus group and interview data involved the systematic coding and sorting of data according to topics, themes, and issues important to the study (Stake, 2010). Preliminary themes were derived from relevant literature—for example, "socio-cultural context" (Ilari et al., 2013), "insider's view" (Erwin et al., 2003), "significant cultural issues" (Bradley, 2007, 2009)—while additional themes emerged from the data (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Both investigators read the transcripts closely and repeatedly, and they subsequently

compared their readings to determine themes and sub-themes most salient to the research questions. Codes were assigned jointly to relevant segments of text that described the participants' interpretations and perceptions of their experiences with the culture bearer. Next, the codes and associated data were organized into related categories through repeated comparison and contrast of codes and concepts—the constant comparison method (Strauss & Corbin, 1990).

Findings

In analyzing the data, we identified a variety of ways in which singers experienced their involvement with the culture bearer. Specifically we focus on the impacts that related to choristers' cultural understandings, identifying three broad categories: musical understandings, social-historical understandings, and understandings of self in relation to the guest culture. In presenting these findings below, we include quotations from the five choir members who participated in the one-on-one interviews, the regular choir director, and the culture bearer. All names have been replaced with pseudonyms.

Musical Understandings

First and foremost, through their work with the culture bearer, the singers described developing musical understandings. On a general level, the choir members gained flexibility, that is, an openness to new kinds of music and new ways of singing. The choir's regular conductor explained that the experience gave the singers "a greater openness to the range of repertoire and styles, and flexibility in being able to shift from one piece to another and being able to understand the characteristics of the style." Choir member Brian corroborated this observation, suggesting the experience gave him "a broader perspective on things … you have much more material to draw from for your own performance."

More specifically, singers developed understandings of African American gospel music and associated performance practices. For example, as Dr. Rolston explained,

> I have to get the singers to experience the music in a very different way. And sometimes, often, it requires me to challenge them to internalize the rhythm, and to be expressive with their bodies in ways that they're not used to doing in the western classical tradition.

As choir member Frank learned in relation to interpreting rhythmic structures, "The diction informs the time … it's not straight eighth notes, it's sort of swinging … The diction, the way it expresses, just informs where you borrow from one beat to the next." Similarly, Giselle came to understand that interpretation of the music within the tradition placed less importance on the accuracy of reproducing notated pitches and rhythms, and more on communicating the emotion, passion, and message of the music and text: "My intuition would perhaps express itself more, than just following rigid rules of western music … bringing it closer to talking. … It's just a matter of letting go. Of feeling the music." Members of the choir also learned the way to produce idiomatic vocal timbres and stylistic features of the African American gospel music genre:

> There was definitely some swooping, which is a no-no in classical singing [laughs]. There was sliding. There was more—what I would call head-singing. More nasal, kind of like right-at-the-front-of-your-face singing than what you're taught to do as a classical singer. … A lot of the rules that I had been taught as a classical singer were to be broken in this music.
>
> *(Carla)*

In addition to developing understandings of African American gospel music performance practices, choir members described finding hidden or unexpected richness within the music as a direct result of their experience with the culture bearer. Giselle explained, "I remember those two songs particularly, staying with me for a long, long, long, long, time. The text was very simple. A very simple text, but so powerful. And he really brought that out." Similarly, Carla told us:

> I remember thinking, "This music is sooooo easy, and so boring." I felt it wasn't really challenging. But, when we actually sang it with [Dr. Rolston], it *was* quite challenging because there was a lot more behind it … it wasn't easy when we actually, you know, got his comments on it.

The influence of the culture bearer is evident here in the experiences of both participants, and particularly significant in Carla's reconceptualization of the music. Dr. Rolston also addressed this phenomenon of finding hidden richness within the music, and he additionally explained how that recognition could lead singers to a reconceptualization of the culture that produced it:

> When I begin to help people to understand that there's more to it than what most people see on the surface, they began to gain a deeper respect for not only the music itself, but a respect and understanding for the people who created it.

Choir members described varying levels of integration with the African American gospel music tradition as a result of their work with the culture bearer. For Brian, the experience was extreme: "[He] brought me into his world, and transported my abilities into his idiom, rather than me just looking in from outside. I got right into it. I became fully embodied in it." For other choristers, this was a bridge too far; while feeling that they had moved a little closer, they still felt distanced from the culture and its music. Darryl explained, "He didn't turn me into a spiritual chorister from the South. You know what I mean? He can never turn me into a black man who sings. So I always feel a bit of a disconnect there." Likewise, for Giselle,

> understanding the African American gospel music as a whole … I don't think so. I think this music really comes from the bottom of the soul of these people who have been slaves and have suffered a lot. It really expresses their anguish, but also their faith in God. As I said, as a white kind of privileged person, I've never encountered this. So I can't imagine, I cannot really feel it the way they do.

Social-historical Understandings

In addition to musical understandings, through their work with Dr. Rolston, singers developed social-historical understandings concerning the culture that produced and produces African American gospel music. In our analysis we identified three categories of social-historical understandings: choir members learned about African American enslavement, the role of singing among enslaved African Americans, and the legacy of enslavement among African Americans today. As Carla explained:

> Obviously I was familiar with the history of African American slavery … but my greater awareness came from his connection to the emotions of it. Because when you read a book or a historical textbook or things like that, you read the facts, but he brought the emotion. He brought the stories behind those historical facts.

Archie similarly described the culture bearer's descriptions as taking him to a deeper understanding:

> The insight for me was the fact that they were not allowed to talk to one another. Oh my *God*. That to me is where the issue of control came in. Overwhelming control. And he made clear to me the fear of the white overseers … And I guess that dynamic was not clear to me previously … it shocked me—what it must have *felt* like.

Brian also described a felt response: "It brought me right back to that. It brought me right down to the guy that's working in the fields." Of note in these participant responses was the singers' emphasis on the enhancement of their *emotional* rather than factual understanding of African American enslavement.

A particular aspect of African American enslavement that choristers learned about was the unique significance of singing. Archie told us that the culture bearer "described the way in which slaves communicated through the music." Frank recalled learning "something about the motivation of it. … How, basically, slaves were sharing their experience with one another [through singing]. Giving each other hope, right? So I think he gave us a sense of the breadth of that."

In addition, choir members developed understandings of the ongoing legacy of enslavement as experienced by African Americans today. Carla explained,

> He claimed that as his own history: "My people" and, "The experiences of my people." It didn't directly happen to him, but my impression from him is that it wasn't very far removed. That that history still lives on.

Understandings of Self

In addition to gaining musical and social-historical understandings, choir members developed understandings of self in relation to African American culture. Singers described their work with the culture bearer as an opportunity to broaden personal experiences, to find similarities and differences between themselves and the culture, and to confront personal prejudices.

Brian described his involvement with the culture bearer as a valuable opportunity to broaden personal experience—to make his world a little bigger, and richer: "As a cultural experience it becomes part of our lives and that's very important to me. I'd like to live more … And that's what it does for me. It broadens my boundaries."

For some singers their experiences with the culture bearer enabled them to recognize and examine points of intersection and of divergence with the guest culture. As an example of a point of connection, Archie explained,

> It helps me understand people elsewhere because very often the music expresses the same kinds of wishes and desires of people in other lands, which are at root, not so very different from ours. But the context within which they think them becomes clearer.

Darryl recognized that while a cultural exchange of this nature can help participants find commonalities between cultures, another positive advantage is that participants can realize some of the things that they do *not* have in common with other cultures.

> What I'm connecting with in the spiritual/gospel tradition is the amazing rhythms and the music itself, not so much the stories. Because I don't feel they're my stories, you

> know? [But] that's the essence of having respect for another culture: [respecting] the differences and the commonalities … and you do get so much of a richer experience of that when you bring in a culture bearer. And even if you can't bridge the gap between your culture and theirs totally, their presence there for a few days really helps your understanding of where he's coming from, where the tradition is coming from, and kind of where it's going, too.

For Archie, the experience of working with the culture bearer provided the opportunity to grapple with the vestiges of childhood prejudices.

ARCHIE: I was fortunate that my mother and my father went out of their way not to be prejudiced. But it doesn't matter. You still pick it up from where you live. And for the last ten years since I've been here I constantly catch myself thinking the way that my grandfather did, because he was my caregiver from when I was six until the age of eleven. And so many of his attitudes, which were grossly prejudiced, slip into my mind, and I'm constantly trying to push them out … And I had that reaction with [Dr. Rolston]. He managed obviously within minutes to make it go away and I was ashamed of myself. I don't know how to talk about this. I don't talk about it.

RESEARCHER: I understand. I find it significant that you bring this up when I asked you what was valuable about this experience …

ARCHIE: Yeah. It is indeed. It's valuable.

Archie found value in his experience with the culture bearer because it vividly reminded him of —and forced him to acknowledge and confront—the deep-seated prejudices that existed within his own background and himself.

Discussion

The purpose of our research was to examine an encounter between an African American gospel music culture bearer and a community choir. We focused on choir members' perceptions of how the experience contributed to their intercultural understanding of the represented culture. As detailed in the findings section above, choir members identified increased musical understandings, social-historical understandings, and understandings of self in relation to the culture.

An underlying tension in considering these data results from the messiness in defining "the culture." Broadly speaking, the culture bearer represented African American culture. But more specifically—and more accurately—Dr. Rolston represented the aspect of African American culture that has produced the African American gospel music tradition. With this limitation in mind, along with Hess's (2010) caution about the dangers of essentializing a culture, we believe the findings in relation to the singers' enhanced musical understandings are the most convincing. The data are compelling in their demonstration of the choir members' perceptions of increased understanding of African American gospel music and associated performance practices, such as producing idiomatic vocal timbres and gestures, and interpreting rhythmic structures so that the "diction informs the time," and with the understanding that the western notation used to represent the music is only a rough approximation of the intended rhythms, and to some extent this applied to pitch as well. Similarly compelling were the data that indicated singers gained increased appreciation for the music and its richness as a direct result of their experience with Dr. Rolston. The data concerning choir members' sense of enculturation—the extent to which they felt they could take on the culture in performing the music—is less definitive. While Brian told us that Dr. Rolston "brought me into his world and transported my abilities into his idiom," Darryl, in

contrast, clearly stated that the experience did *not* "turn me into a spiritual chorister from the south." It is not surprising that individuals had different experiences; perhaps the most important message to take from these seemingly contradictory data is that a culture-bearer experience is very likely to have different impacts on different individuals, mediated by their own prior knowledge and experience of the culture, and by their personal experiences and perceptions of the encounter.

Our analysis of the data also indicated that, through their work with the culture bearer, singers developed social-historical understandings. Specifically, choir members gained insight into African American enslavement, the significant role of singing among enslaved African Americans, and the ongoing legacy of enslavement as experienced by African Americans today. Within these data our participants emphasized that rather than factual knowledge, the understandings they gained were in the affective domain; they described gaining some limited understanding of what it might have *felt* like to be enslaved. In considering these data, we believe that the opportunity for choir members to take on the voices and words of African American people through the gospel music that Dr. Rolston led them in singing was a powerful contributing factor to the enhancement of this felt experience.

In UNESCO's publication *Education for Intercultural Understanding*, Joy de Leo (2010, p. 13) wrote, "Knowing oneself is seen as an essential foundation for understanding others." The third category of findings that we identified included singers' enhanced understandings of self in relation to African American culture. Within this category we noticed some of the most promising advances of intercultural understanding. Choristers described working with Dr. Rolston as an opportunity to broaden personal experiences, to recognize similarities and differences between themselves and African American culture, and to confront personal prejudices. Beginning with a desire for a broader personal experience of the world is key; this stance of openness is necessary for any headway in intercultural understanding to be made. UNESCO's Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (2001) explains that people can be distinguished and united by both similarities and differences, and that diversity necessarily challenges both intellect and emotions as people learn to live peacefully and respectfully together. Identifying points of similarity with another culture allows a way in; it opens the door to understanding. Identifying differences is equally important, as that recognition forms the necessary basis for accepting and respecting behaviors and practices that are not our own. Exposure to both cultural similarities and differences is key to developing appreciation of diversity (de Leo, 2010). And confronting personal prejudice is critical; it is essential for moving beyond past ignorance and fear of differences to a new understanding of a culture and a new relationship with its people.

Study Limitations and Future Research

While this study provided insight into the ways members of an adult community choir experienced their encounter with a culture bearer, there are limitations worth considering. First, it is important to note that our findings might have limited generality; they are the result of our work with particular individuals experiencing this phenomenon in a specific context. Second, our research was limited in terms of the type of data we collected. While we heard richly detailed accounts of participants' perspectives of their experiences with the culture bearer, we collected no observational data to corroborate or enhance what we learned through the interviews and focus groups. Finally, the study was limited by participants' memories of the encounter. We did not conceive of and design the study until after the interactions with the culture bearer had taken place; we spoke with participants approximately six months later. On the positive side, the period of time between the visit and the interviews might have provided choristers the opportunity to reflect on and confirm their enduring impressions and meanings of the encounter.

Future research could build on our study in a number of ways. It would be valuable to examine culture bearers from a variety of cultures and musical traditions working with a variety of singing ensembles—children's choirs rather than adult choirs, for example, or school or professional choirs rather than community choirs. It would also be useful to examine the experience of singers who work with a culture bearer in a role other than conductor of the ensemble—as composer-in-residence, for example. Researchers could also further the understanding of the phenomenon by examining encounters with greater emphasis on the perspective of the culture bearer.

Final Words

This case study illustrates in some detail the potential, asserted in the literature (e.g., Campbell, 2004), of the role of a culture bearer in bridging cultural divides. All the participants—choir members, regular choir director, and the culture bearer—reported the experience as being positive. Within limitations, the choir members perceived that the experience contributed in various ways to their understanding of the represented culture. We hope not only that our report of this study will be informative to other researchers but also that it demonstrates to singers and choir directors and culture bearers the potential value of exploring intercultural understanding through learning and singing together.

Our research has clearly identified some of the ways that an encounter with a culture bearer can contribute to the intercultural understanding of members of a community choir. We close by offering again the words of Dr. Rolston himself, describing the value of such an exchange as he sees it:

> When I begin to help people to understand that there's more to it than what most people see on the surface, they begin to gain a deeper respect for not only the music itself, but a respect and understanding for the people who created it.

Our research shows that, at least to some extent, this intention was achieved.[1]

Glossary

Cultural appropriation Making use of elements of another's culture; the term is usually negative in connotation, and often used in reference to members of a dominant culture appropriating from a minority culture without permission.

Culture bearer An individual who was raised within the culture and who is a recognized practitioner of the culture's music.

Essentializing Reducing a group or culture to a particular set of characteristics; failing to recognize diversity within a group or culture.

Intercultural understanding Knowledge of diverse cultures that recognizes commonalities and differences, and that is held with the intent of creating connections and developing mutual respect.

Note

1 The authors gratefully acknowledge the support of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SHRCC) through the AIRS (Advancing Interdisciplinary Research in Singing) Major Collaborative Research Initiative.

References

Abril, C. R. (2006). Music that represents culture: Selecting music with integrity. *Music Educators Journal*, *93*(1), 38–45.

Bradley, D. (2007). The sounds of silence: Talking race in music education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education 6*(4): 132–162. Retrieved from http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bradley6_4.pdf

Bradley, D. (2009). Global song, global citizens? The world constructed in world music choral publications. In E. Gould, J. Countryman, C. Morton, & L. S. Rose (Eds.), *Exploring social justice: How music education might matter* (pp. 23–37). Toronto, Canada: Canadian Music Educators' Association/L'Association canadienne des musiciens éducateurs.

Burton, B. (2002). Weaving the tapestry of world musics. In B. Reimer (Ed.), *World musics and music education: Facing the issues* (pp. 161–186). Reston, VA: MENC.

Campbell, P. S. (2004). *Teaching music globally*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Countryman, J. (2009). Stumbling towards clarity: Practical issues in teaching global musics. In E. Gould, J. Countryman, C. Morton, & L. S. Rose (Eds.), *Exploring social justice: How music education might matter* (pp. 105–119). Toronto, Canada: Canadian Music Educators' Association/L'Association canadienne des musiciens éducateurs.

de Leo, J. (2010). *Education for intercultural understanding*. Bangkok, Thailand: UNESCO. Retrieved from: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0018/001890/189051E.pdf

Edwards, K. L. (1996). *Cultural perceptions of fourth-grade students toward American Indians and their music*. Paper presented and the MENC Social Sciences SRIG Session, Music Educators National Conference, Kansas City.

Erwin, J. H., Edwards, K. L., Kerchner, J. L., & Knight, J. W. (2003) *Prelude to music education*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Hess, J. (2010). Musically Creolizing subjects: Re(Envisioning) world music education. *Encounters on Education*, *11*, 155–166.

Hess, J. (2013). Performing tolerance and curriculum: The politics of self-congratulation, identity formation, and pedagogy in world music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, *21*(1), 66–91.

Howard, K., Swanson, M., & Campbell, P. S. (2014). The diversification of music teacher education: Six vignettes from a movement in progress. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, *24*(1), 26–37.

Ilari, B., Chen-Hafteck, L., & Crawford, L. (2013). Singing and cultural understanding: A music education perspective. *International Journal of Music Education*, *31*(2), 202–216.

Joseph, D. (2011). Cultural diversity in Australia: Promoting the teaching and learning of South African music. *Australian Journal of Music Education*, *1*, 42–56.

Joseph, D., & Southcott, J. (2013). So much more than just the music: Australian pre-service music teacher education students' attitudes to artists-in-schools. *International Journal of Music Education*, *31*(3), 243–256.

Klinger, R. (2002). A materials girl in search of the genuine article. In B. Reimer (Ed.), *World musics and music education: Facing the issues* (pp. 205–217). Reston, VA: MENC.

Marsh, K. (2000). Making connections: A case study of pre-service music education students' attitudinal change to indigenous music. *Research Studies in Music Education*, *15*(1), 58–67.

May, A., & Hafner, J. (2018, October 29). Pittsburgh synagogue shooting: What we know, questions that remain. *USA Today*. Retrieved from www.usatoday.com/story/news/nation-now/2018/10/29/pittsburgh-synagogue-shooting-what-we-know/1804878002/

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd. Ed). London, UK: Sage.

Reimer, B. (2002). The need to face the issues. In B. Reimer (Ed.), *World musics and music education: Facing the issues* (pp. 3–11). Reston, VA: MENC.

Riga, A. (2018, March 28). 'What I did was unforgivable,' Quebec mosque shooter says after pleading guilty. *Montreal Gazette*. Retrieved from https://montrealgazette.com/news/quebec/quebec-mosque-shooter-alexandre-bissonnette-pleads-guilty

Southcott, J., & Joseph, D. (2007). From empire to filmi: A fusion of Western and Indian cultural practices in Australian music education. *International Journal of Music Education*, *25*(3), 235–243.

Szego, C. K. (2005). Praxial foundations of multicultural music education. In D. Elliott (Ed.), *Praxial music education: Reflections and dialogues* (pp. 196–218). New York: Oxford University Press.

Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Stake, R. E. (2010). Qualitative research: Studying how things work. New York, NY: Guilford Press.

Statistics Canada. (2016). *Census Profile, 2016 Census*. Retrieved from Statistics Canada website: www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/index-eng.cfm

Strauss, A. L., & Corbin, J. M. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

UNESCO (2001). *Universal declaration on cultural diversity*. Paris: Author. Retrieved from: http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=13179&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

UNESCO (2010). The Seoul Agenda. Retrieved from: www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/CLT/pdf/Seoul_Agenda_EN.pdf

Vaugeois, L. (2009). Music as a practice of social justice. In E. Gould, J. Countryman, C. Morton, & L. S. Rose (Eds.), *Exploring social justice: How music education might matter* (pp. 2–22). Toronto, Canada: Canadian Music Educators' Association/L'Association canadienne des musiciens éducateurs.