FILED: ALBANY COUNTY CLERK 07/09/2019 05:15 PM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 2

INDEX NO. 904100-19

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 07/09/2019

P.O. Box 792 Wainscott, N. Y. 11975 Exhibit A

MOBILE: (631) 903-9154

November 26, 2018

Records Access Officer
Office of the NYS Comptroller
110 State Street
Albany, NY 12236-0001

E-MAIL: SI@WAINSCOTT.LIFE

Sent via Fax and Email
Fax: +1-518-473-8940

Email: FOIL@OSC.State.NY.US

Re: FOIL Request
Deepwater Wind South Fork, LLC

Dear Sir or Madam:

Pursuant to New York State Freedom of Information Law (FOIL), I hereby request a copy of each "record" of the Office of the NYS Comptroller ("OSC") and each "agency" of the OSC (as the terms "record" and "agency" are defined in Public Officers Law §86), specifically:

- The Power Purchase Agreement ("PPA") between Deepwater Wind South Fork, LLC
 ("Deepwater") and the Long Island Power Authority ("LIPA") executed February 2017 (OSC
 contract number: C000883) together with all appendices and/or attachments referred to in the
 PPA including but not limited to the contract price and any increase or decrease in contract price
 over the term of the PPA; and
- 2. The PPA between Deepwater and LIPA executed November 2018 together with all appendices and/or attachments referred to in the PPA including but not limited to the contract price and any increase or decrease in contract price over the term of the PPA.

In the event that either Deepwater and/or LIPA claims that contract price(s) are "trade secrets ... submitted . . . by a commercial enterprise and which if disclosed would cause substantial injury to the competitive position of the subject enterprise" (Public Officers Law § 87(2)(d)), the OSC must provide "persuasive evidence" that disclosure would cause the harm envisioned by an exception to rights of access and that a "speculative conclusion that disclosure might potentially cause harm" or similar blanket denial is insufficient to meet the burden of proof (Markowitz v. Serio, 11 NY3d 43, 51, 862 NYS2d 833 [2008]).

For the avoidance of doubt, I am <u>not</u> requesting any records pertaining to how the contract price is derived, records of formulae or costing information which may be considered to be legitimate "trade secrets".

Clerk: KT

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 2

INDEX NO. 904100-19

Office of the NYS Comptroller, FOIL Request by Kinsella - Re: Deepwater Wind South Fork, LLC

I am requesting the negotiated contract price and terms as expressed in the PPA. The subject of the PPA, the South Fork Wind Farm, is "unique" (Contracting Plumbers Cooperative Restoration Corp. v. Ameruso, 105 Misc. 2d 951, 430 NYS 2d 196, 198 [1980]) insofar as its location, capacity, technology, distance of delivery, infrastructure needs, geology, regulatory environment, etc., and the PPA, as stated in Contracting Plumbers, supra, has been "negotiated independently with certain benefits and concessions ... depending upon circumstances particular to" the South Fork Wind Farm. Disclosure of the contract price, therefore, would neither adversely impact negotiating positions nor substantially injure the competitive position of future projects.

This FOIL request is in the public interest and the specific interest of Long Island ratepayers who ultimately will have to pay the contract price. Revealing the terms of public contracts fosters the purpose of the Freedom of Information Law "to shed light on government decision making, which in turn both permits the electorate to make informed choices regarding governmental activities and facilitates exposure of waste, negligence and abuse" (Encore College Bookstores, Inc. v. Auxiliary Service Corporation of the State University of New York at Farmingdale, 87 NY2d 410 (1995)).

In early 2017, the deadline for submission of bids had been reached and the PPA was awarded to Deepwater. Deepwater, therefore, as the "successful bidder [has] no reasonable expectation of not having its bid open to the public" (Contracting Plumbers, supra). As stated in Contracting Plumbers, supra, and confirmed in a case involving a request for a copy of a successful proposal following an award, "Once the contract was awarded ... the terms of [the] RFP response could no longer be competitively sensitive" (Cross-Sound Ferry v. Department of Transportation, 219 AD2d 346, 634 NYS2d 575, 577 [1995]).

Furthermore, the holding company of Deepwater disclosed the contract price to the ratepayers of Rhode Island and Maryland for two of its subsidiaries, namely Deepwater Wind Rhode Island, LLC of Rhode Island (24.4 ¢/kWh with a 3.5% yearly increase) and Skipjack Offshore Energy, LLC of Maryland (13.2 ¢/kWh with a 1% yearly increase). The ratepayers of Long Island should be treated in the same way and the contract price should be disclosed as it was to the ratepayers of Rhode Island and Maryland.

The time period covered by this FOIL request is from January 1, 2017 through the date of your response to this request. I am willing to pay the applicable fee for delivery of copies of the requested records. The requested records may be delivered vie email (Si@Wainscott.Life) or via United States Postal Service (addressed to: PO Box 792, Wainscott, NY 11975).

Thank you very much for your cooperation.

Sincerely yours,
Sikinxlla

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 07/09/2019

Si Kinsella

November 26, 2018 Page 2 of 2 FILED ALBANY COUNTY CLERK 07/09/2019 05:15 PM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 2

INDEX NO 904100-19

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 07/09/2019

ST. TIME	DESTINATION NUMBER	DESTINATION	ID	NO.	MODE	4	PGS.	RE	SULT
01/12 14:17	17844856568			5414	AUTO RX	ECM	1	OK	00'28
01/16 13:20	4562679			1057	TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'18
01/16 17:19	17844856568			5415	AUTO RX	ECM	1	OK	00'27
01/17 17:00	7844562344			5416	AUTO RX	ECM	1	OK	00'17
01/19 12:07				1058	TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'19
01/19 18:50	4562679			1059	TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'17
01/19 20:02				5417	AUTO RX	i	0	NG	00'20
								0	
01/20 22:26					TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'32
01/24 13:28					TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'18
01/25 14:40					AUTO RX	ECM	1	OK	00'30
01/25 20:36					TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'19
01/25 20:55					TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'30
01/25 20:59	4578667			1065	TRANSMIT		0	NG	00'00
								0	
01/25 21:00	4578667			1063	TRANSMIT		0	NG	00'00
				CHREW WHILE				0	#018
01/27 15:05					TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'18
01/30 12:24	15184738940			1067	TRANSMIT		0		00'35
40.454.00	(1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-							0	#018
01/30 12:35				The second second	TRANSMIT	ECM	2	OK	00'36
01/30 13:09	10 March 10			2.850 E. F. CAL	TRANSMIT	ECM	1	OK	00'17
01/30 14:13	The state of the s			1070	100 marsh (1960) 40 marsh (1960) 100 marsh (1960)	ECM	1	OK	00'17
01/30 14:34	7844856261			5419	AUTO RX	ECM	1	OK	00'32