



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

EASTER MEETING

OF CHIEF PLEAS

OF THE

ISLAND OF SARK

HANSARD

Assembly Room, Sark, Wednesday, 19th April 2023

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official Island of Sark Chief Pleas website www.sarkgov.co.uk*

Volume 9, No. 4

Present:

Seigneur

Maj. C M Beaumont Esq.

Speaker of Chief Pleas

P M Armorgie Esq.

Greffier

T J Hamon

Treasurer

S Hudson

Constable

P Burgess

Assistant Constable

Jonathan Godwin

His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor

Lt. General Richard Cripwell CB, CBE

Conseillers:

Edric Baker MBE
Frank Makepeace
Fern Turner
Paul Williams
Sandra Williams
Vaughan Bougourd
Kevin Delaney
Pippa Donovan

Jolie Booth
John Guille
Christopher Kennedy-Barnard
Andrew Miller
Helen Plummer
Marcus Barker
Scott Sullivan

Business transacted

Welcome to the Lieutenant Governor, Lt. General Richard Cripwell CB, CBE	5
Apologies received	5
Tribute to former Speaker of Chief Pleas, Lt. Col. Reginald Guille MBE.....	5
Welcome to newly elected Conseillers, Marcus Barker and Scott Sullivan	6
Message from the Speaker.....	6
Statements	6
New electricity system project update – Statement by Conseiller Guille	6
Sark census – Statement by Conseiller Guille	8
Island Health review – Statement by Conseiller Plummer	8
Taxation Review (Special) Committee – Statement by Conseiller Miller.....	9
Procedural – Electronic devices.....	10
Business of the Day.....	10
Procedural – Agenda reordered	10
17. Matters arising from the Extraordinary (Budget) Meeting held on 23rd November 2022	10
1. Matters arising from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting held on 13th January 2023	10
2. Matters arising from the Christmas Meeting held on 18th January 2023.....	10
18. Matters arising from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting held on 18th January 2023. ...	11
3. Questions not related to the Business of the Day – None.....	11
4. Amendment to the Sark Reform Law 2008 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried	11
15. The Reform (Election of Speaker) (Sark) Ordinance, 2023 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Propositions carried	12
5. The Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	13
6. Education Committee and Education Mandate – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Propositions carried	14
7. Public Consultations – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	15
8. 2022 Financial Statements – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	19
9. The Protection of Vulnerable Adults Special Committee – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	21
16. Commercial Rubbish Charges – Douzaine Report considered – Proposition carried	22
10. Review of Seneschal and Deputy Seneschal terms and conditions and remuneration recommendations – Policy and Finance Committee Report and propositions withdrawn....	23

EASTER MEETING OF CHIEF PLEAS, WEDNESDAY, 19th APRIL 2023

11. Education Update – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered.....	24
12. Isle of Sark Shipping, Annual Report – Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee Report considered	24
13. Report from Tourism for the period January 2022 to December 2022 – Tourism Committee Report considered	26
Procedural – Agenda reordered	28
19. Committee and Panel Elections – Douzaine: Conseillers M Barker and S Sullivan elected – Education: E Baker MBE, Conseillers J Booth, A Miller and S Sullivan elected – Taxation (Special): Conseiller M Barker elected.....	28
14. Committee and Panel Elections – None	30
Procedural – Laid before Items removed from Agenda	30
<i>Chief Pleas adjourned at 6.22 p.m.</i>	31

Easter Meeting of Chief Pleas

Chief Pleas met at 5 p.m.

[THE SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

PRAYER

The Greffier

ROLL CALL

The Greffier

The Greffier: There are 15 Conseillers, the Seigneur and the Speaker of Chief Pleas present.

The Speaker: Thank you, Greffier.

**Welcome to the Lieutenant Governor,
Lt. General Richard Cripwell CB, CBE**

5 **The Speaker:** Welcome, good evening, and in particular welcome to His Excellency, the Lieutenant Governor of Guernsey, who joins us this evening for the Easter Meeting of Chief Pleas.

Apologies received

The Speaker: I have received apologies from one person and that is Conseiller Le Lievre, who cannot be with us this evening. So we are one Conseiller light.

**Tribute to former Speaker of Chief Pleas,
Lt. Col. Reginald Guille MBE**

10 **The Speaker:** I would just like to begin proceedings by expressing a vote, a *personal* vote, of thanks, on behalf of Chief Pleas to Reg Guille – Lt. Col. Reginald Guille MBE, to give him his full title – the previous Speaker of Chief Pleas. He was my guide and mentor during my role as Deputy Speaker and I am extremely grateful for his personal advice, knowledge and wisdom whilst I was serving alongside Reg.

15 Reg served Chief Pleas for a total of 25 years and held a variety of positions, including the joint role of Seneschal and President of Chief Pleas. He also served as a Conseiller before being elected to the position of Speaker in February 2020. On behalf of Chief Pleas, I wish Reg a long and happy retirement. (**Members:** Hear, hear.)

Thank you.

**Welcome to newly elected Conseillers,
Marcus Barker and Scott Sullivan**

20 **The Speaker:** Moving on to new business, I would like to welcome new Conseillers Barker and Scott Sullivan, who were elected at the uncontested further election on 15th March 2023. I can confirm that both Conseillers took their oaths of allegiance on 17th March 2023 and have completed their declarations of interest forms, so we are fully up to speed with Conseiller Barker and Conseiller Sullivan. Welcome, gentlemen.

Message from the Speaker

25 **The Speaker:** From my perspective – another statement – I do not need to remind Members that this remains a challenging time for Chief Pleas. The lack of contested elections and Conseillers creates challenges and stresses, as the Committee structure is designed to cater for the statutory Committees and their tasks in running the Island. We are now two Conseillers short of the 18 required, and I urge all residents and Members of Chief Pleas who are qualified to go on the electoral register to register and if eligible, to consider standing for the next by-election, which
30 will probably take place before the Michaelmas Meeting of Chief Pleas.

 So a bit of advanced notice; there is no date on that yet, but that is the plan. I have met with P&F and we have agreed that that is where we want to head. So please, I do urge anyone, if you are not on the electoral register, please register and put yourself forward to join the Members of Chief Pleas. I am sure you can speak to any of the current sitting Members and they will be very
35 pleased to explain the vagaries of how it works. I know it must seem daunting from a distance, but do speak to them and they will be able to fill in the nuances of what is involved.

STATEMENTS

**New electricity system project update –
Statement by Conseiller Guille**

The Speaker: Moving along, there are four verbal Statements this evening and the first of those I would like to call on Conseiller Guille to give a Statement regarding Sark electricity.
 Conseiller Guille.

40

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

 This Statement, to update Chief Pleas and the public on the new electricity system project. The first part of the tender process for the design and build of an Island-owned electricity system has now been completed and we are now engaging with three shortlisted companies working towards
45 more detailed proposals. Expressions of interest for the first stage closed on 24th December and we were very pleased to receive submissions from seven different companies, especially given the busy nature of the renewable energy sector since the beginning of the war in Ukraine.

 A shortlisting panel consisting of the following individuals was convened to review the submissions: Jake Burnyeat from Communities for Renewables; Prof. Richard Cochrane from
50 Exeter University renewable energy department; Alan Bates, Managing Director, Guernsey Electricity; Sally-Ann David, Chief Operating Officer, Guernsey Electricity; Conseiller Tony Le Lievre, Future Energy Committee; and Conseiller John Guille, Policy and Finance Committee. Interviews were arranged with five of the seven companies and following these three companies

were recommended to the Policy and Finance and Future Energy Committees for shortlisting to the next stage.

The recommendations were focused on selecting companies with proven track records of successfully delivering similar projects. The shortlisted companies are: Schneider, in partnership with Sustainable Development Capital Ltd; Infinite Energy, partnered with Business in Wind; and Eaton in partnership with Vattenfall.

Schneider are a very large multinational technology company with a long history and impressive resume of projects. They have partnered with Sustainable Development Capital Ltd, who were previously partnered with Siemens and have been interested in completing a project in Sark for the last four years.

Infinite are a smaller renewable energy company representing the other end of the corporate scale, but also with an impressive track record of projects. They have partnered with Business in Wind, a wind turbine installation company. Interestingly, Business in Wind have recently installed a wind turbine on Ascension Island in the middle of the Atlantic and they demonstrated a good understanding of the technical difficulties of delivering and installing a wind turbine on Sark.

Eaton, like Schneider, are another very large multinational technology company and they have partnered with Vattenfall, a large Swedish company involved in the generation and supply of renewable energy across Europe.

All three companies answered the initial request for expressions of interest in the design and build of a new system for Sark. During subsequent discussions, they have all expressed an interest in also providing funding options for the project, as this is a common business model used in the industry. These options will be presented alongside the design and build option at the next stage of the tender process.

Schneider/SDCL and Infinite/BiW are visiting Sark next week to further familiarise themselves with the location and the project. Once these initial visits have been completed, we will look to agree a schedule for the next, more detailed design submissions. Once this more detailed work has been completed, there will be a further opportunity for the companies to visit Sark again and present their more refined proposals to the community.

On another bit of related business to the new electricity system project, during the shortlisting process, one of the other companies that submitted an expression of interest suggested that the Barclay family had invested a considerable sum of money in Sark Electricity Ltd and would be unlikely to switch over their properties to a new Island-owned system. This has been mooted as a possibility in the past and has naturally been a concern to the success of a new electricity system for the community.

A few weeks ago, I met Alistair Barclay in person whilst he was visiting Sark and during our discussions I put this suggestion to him directly. Alistair has since helpfully provided the following statement to set the record straight and offer his support for the new system project:

Dear John

Thank you for bringing this to my attention, I can categorically say that neither me or any trust/company associated with me has any interest economic or otherwise in Sark Electricity Ltd, Alan Jackson or any other associated companies.

SEL is our tenant and we have an arm's length lease agreement in place.

Sark Estate is excited for any new plans that will enhance the island and will always support the best long-term solution for Sark and its residents providing they make financial sense.

Kind regards, Alistair

Alistair has also offered to further investigate the implications involved in cleaning up the existing power station site as this was also seen as a worrying unknown with regard to any possible purchase of SEL in the past.

As previously stated in Chief Pleas, and as still is the case, we remain open to renewing negotiations with SEL to discuss purchasing the assets at a sensible price if it will help the Island's transition to a modern generation and distribution system.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

100 There is no debate on this subject, but does anyone have any specific questions that they would like to put to Conseiller Guille at this stage? No? Okay, thank you.

**Sark census –
Statement by Conseiller Guille**

The Speaker: I would like to move on to the next Statement, which is also by Conseiller Guille – a busy man. A Statement about the Sark census, please, Conseiller Guille.

Thank you.

105 **Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir.

Sark census: in 2021, Chief Pleas agreed to carry out the first Island-wide census for 50 years. Legislation was drafted and approved to enable a compulsory census. An independent registrar was appointed, based in Guernsey and local enumerators engaged. Census day was 27th April 2022.

110 All forms were returned via a dedicated PO box to Guernsey and collected via the Guernsey registrar. Three hundred and ten forms were received up to August 2022 when the collection was closed. Initially, the States of Guernsey were going to provide resources to enable data collection and collation with an independent analyst engaged to input and analyse the data. Due to a change in personnel, Guernsey were unable to assist in the end and quotes were then sought from UK companies. These quotes ranged from £3,800 to £5,300.

115 Advice was sought from the Jersey Office of Statistics, who had worked with Sark in developing the census forms and overall process. Whilst in early 2022 Jersey did not have capacity to assist Sark, late in 2022 capacity became available and a quote of £1,200 was agreed instead with the Jersey team.

120 At all times, the anonymity of Sark residents and the challenges of working with small representative numbers has been respected. Jersey, having undertaken their own census in 2021, are very aware of the need for data to remain anonymous at all times. Sark's Civil Service met with the Jersey team in mid-April to discuss progress and suggested parameters.

125 The data entry is now complete and preliminary information from this exercise indicated that there were 570 residents on Sark on 27th April 2022. The next step is to determine parameters and extract essential and invaluable information which will aid in future planning and proofing. A final report will be provided to residents and Chief Pleas in the near future.

Thank you.

130 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Once again, it is not open for debate, but does anyone have any specific questions they would like to put to Conseiller Guille about that Statement?

Thank you.

**Island Health review –
Statement by Conseiller Plummer**

135 **The Speaker:** Next up, I would like to call on Conseiller Plummer to give a Statement on behalf of the Medical Committee, please, regarding Island Health review.

Conseiller Plummer: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

The Medical Committee are aware that in order to serve the community effectively, Sark's medical provision needs to keep up to date and provide the best care possible. As part of the future development for health provision in Sark, the Medical Committee commissioned Island Health, a Guernsey medical practice, to carry out a review into the current service.

The initial review report has been received and further meetings will be held as the Committee work together with the medical team to develop medical care now and in the future. The Committee will consult and engage with the community at the appropriate time and will continue to update Chief Pleas at further Meetings.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

Once again, does anyone have any specific questions about that Statement for Conseiller Plummer? No? Thank you.

Taxation Review (Special) Committee – Statement by Conseiller Miller

The Speaker: And the fourth Statement this afternoon is a Statement from Conseiller Delaney on the Taxation Review (Special) Committee.

Conseiller Delaney, thank you.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

With your permission, I would like our recently elected Deputy Chair to deliver this short Statement.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you. (**Conseiller Delaney:** Thank you.) And that is Conseiller Miller.

Thank you.

Conseiller Miller: Good afternoon.

The public may be aware that the Special Committee has not met for almost a year. However, since the elections in December last year and the January Meeting of Chief Pleas, the Committee has been repopulated and is now meeting again regularly. It is an intention of the Special Committee to present its ideas and suggestions at the Midsummer Meeting of Chief Pleas, having missed the deadline for reports to this Meeting.

The proposed report, based on raising taxes in an acceptable, equitable, fair, cost-efficient and enforceable way, will include a request to let the Special Committee undertake public consultation with the residents and taxpaying population of Sark. I would stress that the Committee is always open to suggestions from the residents of Sark at any time and would welcome any input. Residents should not feel they have to wait until the proposed consultation before getting in touch, either with the whole Committee or its individual members.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Miller.

Once again, does anyone have any specific questions to Conseiller Miller regarding that Statement? No? Okay. Thank you very much indeed.

**Procedural –
Electronic devices**

180 **The Speaker:** So we will move on to the main Agenda now, but in accordance with the Rules of Procedure, I would remind all present that mobile phones, cameras, recording devices and other electronic equipment must be switched off now, please, less for those allowed to Chief Pleas Members in accordance with Rule 18.
Thank you.

Business of the Day

**Procedural –
Agenda reordered**

185 **The Speaker:** I am merging two Agendas, as you will have noticed, and my apologies for any confusion, but at this stage I would like to say before we move to Agenda Item 1, I would propose in accordance with Rule of Procedure 11 that Agenda Item 17 from the Addendum be debated now and that Item 18 from the Addendum be debated immediately before Item 3 on the Agenda. Those in favour of that amendment, please; and those against? **Carried.** So in that case, we will
190 do that, if we may.

17. Matters arising from the Extraordinary (Budget) Meeting held on 23rd November 2022

The Speaker: So Agenda Item 17 from the Addendum is matters arising from the Extraordinary (Budget) Meeting of Chief Pleas held on 23rd November 2022. Does anyone have any points they would like to raise from that Meeting? No? Okay.

1. Matters arising from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting held on 13th January 2023

195 **The Speaker:** In that case, we will move on to the next one, which is Agenda Item 1, matters arising from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting held on 13th January 2023. Does anyone have any specific points they would like to raise from that Meeting?
Thank you.

2. Matters arising from the Christmas Meeting held on 18th January 2023

200 **The Speaker:** Therefore, Agenda Item 2 is matters arising from the Christmas Meeting held on 18th January 2023. Does anyone have any points they would like to raise from those minutes?
Thank you.

18. Matters arising from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting held on 18th January 2023.

The Speaker: Finally, in this batch, Agenda Item 18 from the Addendum, matters arising from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting of Chief Pleas held on 18th January 2023. Does anyone have any points they would like to raise from those minutes? Fairly straightforward, you have all got copies of those, and *Hansard* is available, of course.

**3. Questions not related to the Business of the Day –
None**

205 **The Speaker:** Right, moving along to Agenda Item 4 to consider a Report with Proposition – (*Interjection*) Item 3, I am sorry. To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled Amendment – Oh, I beg your pardon, yes, I skipped an Item.

Agenda Item 3 – I will get used to this eventually – questions not related to the Business of the Day. There are none, but thank you, Mr Greffier.

**4. Amendment to the Sark Reform Law 2008 –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Amendment to the Sark Reform Law 2008’.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approves the Projet de Loi as drafted.

210 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 4, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Amendment to the Sark Reform Law 2008’ and I would like to ask Conseiller Bougourd to introduce the Report, please.

Conseiller Bougourd: Thank you, sir.

215 At the Michaelmas Meeting held on 5th October last year, the Assembly agreed to introduce a fifth statutory Meeting to be held seven weeks after Michaelmas to consider the Budget. It is intended that this additional meeting will be a single Agenda Item, allowing focused and informed debate on this very important paper. However, the Projet allows the Speaker to have the discretion and add Agenda Items, if considered essential.

220 At the Assembly, Chief Pleas authorised the Policy and Finance Committee to instruct the Law Officers of the Crown to draft an amendment to the Reform (Sark) Law 2008 to bring into effect the agreed changes. The draft Projet de Loi before the Assembly today gives effect to these amendments.

Thank you.

225

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Bougourd.

Does anyone have any questions or debate regarding the report? Please raise your hands if you would like to ask any questions about ...

Conseiller Plummer. Thank you.

230

Conseiller Plummer: Thank you.

I would just like to say I think this is very good planning, because the Michaelmas Meeting is such a heavy agenda and putting the Budget later is very helpful for us.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you.

Does anyone else have any points they would like to raise regarding this Report and the Proposition that we are about to vote on before we move on to the vote? Very good.

So what I would like to say is please can we vote on the Proposition that Chief Pleas approves the Projet de Loi as drafted. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Thank you very much indeed.

**15. The Reform (Election of Speaker) (Sark) Ordinance, 2023 –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Propositions carried**

To consider a Report with Propositions from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Election of Deputy Speaker Ordinance / Speaker Term of Office’ and to approve the Ordinance entitled ‘The Reform (Election of Speaker) (Sark) Ordinance, 2023’ and to approve the term of office for the Speaker.

Proposition 1:

That Chief Pleas approve the Ordinance entitled ‘The Reform (Election of Deputy Speaker) (Sark) Ordinance, 2023’.

Proposition 2:

That Chief Pleas approve the term of office for the Speaker as detailed above.

The Speaker: Before we move on to Agenda Item 5, once again, I would like to propose, in accordance with Rule of Procedure 11, that Item 15 from the Addendum be debated now. And there is an error on this Report, which I am sure you have spotted. It should read, and I will read it out in full:

Committee entitled ‘Election of Deputy Speaker Ordinance / Speaker Term of Office’ and to Approve the Ordinance entitled ‘The Reform (Election of [Deputy] Speaker) (Sark) Ordinance, 2023’.

And to approve the term of office for the Speaker.

I would like to ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report, please.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

Following the election of the Deputy Speaker, Paul Armorgie, to Speaker at the Extraordinary Meeting held on 18th January 2023, it is necessary now to elect a Deputy Speaker. The timetable for the election of a Deputy Speaker, as agreed by the returning officer, is as follows: 19th April 2023 is Chief Pleas; 26th April 2023, nomination notice published on the Gazette Officielle and Island notice board; 10th May 2023, nominations close; 24th May 2023, Extraordinary (Special) Meeting of Chief Pleas to elect a Deputy Speaker.

In accordance with the Reform Law 2008, the election of a new Deputy Speaker will take place at an Extraordinary Chief Pleas Meeting on 24th May 2023. It is proposed that the term of office for the Speaker will be five years, commencing on 27th February 2023 and ending on 27th February 2028.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

265 Does anyone have any questions or debate regarding the Report and the Propositions before we go to the vote? Anyone like to raise any points? Thank you.

Therefore, for clarity, please can we vote on Proposition 1 to begin with. Proposition 1: that Chief Pleas approve the Ordinance entitled the Reform (Election of *Deputy* Speaker) (Sark) Ordinance, 2023. Those in favour, please? Those against? **Carried.** Thank you.

270 Proposition 2 is that Chief Pleas approve the term of office for the Speaker as detailed above. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Thank you. Very good.

**5. The Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023 –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘The Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023’ and to approve the Ordinance entitled ‘The Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023’.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approves the Ordinance entitled the Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023.

The Speaker: Moving along to Agenda Item 5, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled the Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023 and to approve the Ordinance entitled the Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023. I would like to ask Conseiller Booth to introduce the Report.

275 Thank you.

Conseiller Booth: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

280 At the Christmas Meeting held on 18th January 2023, the Assembly agreed that with regard to the accommodation for pupils continuing their education in Guernsey, the Education Committee will continue to work closely with the Committee for Health and Social Care in Guernsey to try to source term-time hosts, but would no longer have an obligation in law to arrange them. Sark will continue to part-fund accommodation and travel based on the established sliding scale in respect of time spent by a child at Sark School.

285 The Assembly also agreed to formalise the arrangement for the Education Committee to approve schools in the UK. Should parents exercise this option, funding up to that provided for a child attending a school in Guernsey will be made available and paid directly to the school. The Ordinance before the Assembly today gives effect to these amendments.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Booth.

290 Does anyone have any questions or debate regarding the Report and the Propositions before you? Any questions or debate? Very good.

295 In that case, we will go straight to the Propositions, if we may. We have three Propositions. I am going to do them individually, if I may. Proposition 1: that Chief Pleas approve the amendment to the Education Mandate to reduce the membership to four sitting Conseillers, none of whom shall be parents of – (*Interjections*) I have jumped ahead. I do apologise. There it is; I beg your pardon. Yes, a single Proposition; thank you. That Chief Pleas approves the Ordinance entitled the Education (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2023. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? Thank you. **Carried.**

**6. Education Committee and Education Mandate –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Propositions carried**

To consider a Report with Propositions from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Education Committee and Education Mandate'.

Proposition 1:

That Chief Pleas approve the amendment to the Education Mandate to reduce the membership to four sitting Conseillers, none of whom shall be parents of school-aged children currently being educated through the Sark Education Committee.

Proposition 2:

That, following the repopulation of the Education Committee, Chief Pleas approve the transfer of the Education Mandate from the Policy and Finance Committee to the Education Committee.

Proposition 3:

That, should the Education Committee not be repopulated at the Easter Meeting, the Education Committee Mandate shall remain with the Policy and Finance Committee until reviewed at the next statutory Meeting.

The Speaker: Right, moving to the next Agenda Item, which is Agenda Item 6 – got my notes in order – and that is a Report with Propositions from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Education Committee and Education Mandate'. Once again, I would like to ask Conseiller Booth to introduce the Report, please.

Conseiller Booth: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Education Mandate has been retained by Policy and Finance since the Extraordinary (Special) Chief Pleas Meeting on 13th January 2023, pending the result of the further election that was held in March. At the Policy and Finance meeting on 14th March this year, it was agreed that there are now sufficient Conseillers available to stand as Members of the Education Committee and that it is now also possible to appoint Conseillers for the Committee without the inclusion of Conseillers who are parents of school-aged children currently being educated at Sark School through the Education Committee.

But to ensure parental input into Education Committee meetings going forward, it is proposed that a parent of a school-aged child be appointed as a non-Chief Pleas Member, alongside the current non-Chief Pleas Member, Miss Sarah Smith.

The Speaker: Thank you.

Does anyone have any questions or debate they would like to raise regarding the Report or the three Propositions attached to this Report? No. Okay.

What I am in fact going to do is I am going to read out each Proposition individually, just for clarity, if we may. So therefore, Proposition 1 attached to this Report reads that Chief Pleas approve the amendment to the Education Mandate to reduce the membership to four sitting Conseillers, none of whom shall be parents of school-aged children currently being educated through the Sark Education Committee. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Thank you.

Proposition 2 attached to the Report: that, following the repopulation of the Education Committee, Chief Pleas approve the transfer of the Education Mandate from the Policy and Finance Committee to the Education Committee. Those in favour of Proposition 2? Thank you. Those against Proposition 2? **Carried.** Thank you.

330 And Proposition 3: that, should the Education Committee not be repopulated at the Easter Meeting, the Education Committee Mandate shall remain with the Policy and Finance Committee until reviewed at the next statutory Meeting. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Thank you very much – and when we get further down the Agenda, to Agenda Item 20, we will discuss the population of the new Education Committee. Very good.

**7. Public Consultations –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Public Consultations’.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas agree that public consultations are developed within Committees and the results are brought back to Chief Pleas.

335 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 7 is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Public Consultations’ and I would like to ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.
Thank you.

340 **Conseiller Guille:** Thank you.
At the Christmas Meeting held on 18th January 2023, the Assembly approved the Proposition to allow the Policy and Finance Committee to carry out public consultations on several subjects, including education, healthcare, new power system and the Seigneur stipend. The Proposition included a requirement for Policy and Finance to bring consultation documents to Chief Pleas prior to circulation to residents.

345 Since, the Committee have recognised that these are potentially emotive subjects and residents must form their own opinions when responding to consultations. Debate within Chief Pleas about the consultation prior to the public consultation may potentially affect the integrity of these responses. To ensure transparency and obtain unbiased responses, the Committee propose that public consultations are developed within whichever relevant Committee, with input
350 from the Law Officers, and do not have to go back to Chief Pleas for approval.

The results of all public consultations with any relevant recommendations must be brought back to the first statutory Meeting after the consultation has concluded for debate at Chief Pleas. Not only will this protect the integrity of the answers we receive, but it will just make the whole process of conducting public consultations a lot swifter, because once you decide that you want
355 to go to public consultation, you then have to wait to another sitting of Chief Pleas to get it debated and approved.

So we cannot see the harm in going out to the public and asking for their opinion, we think. If an individual Committee, be it P&F or whatever, whichever feels they want to go for public consultation, that should be a Committee decision and it does not need to come back to Chief
360 Pleas.
Thank you.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Guille.
Does anyone have any questions or debate they would like to raise from this Report? Any
365 questions or debate? Conseiller Sandra Williams. Anybody else?
Conseiller Williams, thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you very much.

370 Whilst I understand that Education consultation will be forefronted by, hopefully, somebody from education that understands education, healthcare is being fronted by a team we have engaged from Guernsey, and we have already heard that you have got people interested in the power system, the stipend will be, I am assuming, through P&F. Who will be engaged to take the take this forward? Will there be consultation with the Seigneur?

375 In order to get the right results, a lot depends on the questions asked. Who is going to be putting the questions forward in order to get the consultation process back that you want back, is my first question. And are we prepared – these are just theoretical questions – that if the stipend goes that the fief may be sold, to whom, at what price, or will it just be another neglected house and garden left to Chief Pleas to look after? We do not have a huge track record of being very good at that.

380 I ask that we should be very careful what we wish for. In 2008 we were voting to split the dual role of the Speaker and the Seneschal. I spoke out about this. I felt quite concerned that it was Mr Reg Guille and I was very quickly told, by Members who are still in the House today, that we were not removing Reg Guille or talking about the Reg Guille, we were talking about the role. And I just want to remind people that the same today applies. We are talking about, not Mr Christopher Beaumont, we are talking about the Seigneur of Sark, and I just think people need to be aware that sometimes you do not always get what you ask for when you start digging too deeply into these things. And that is all I have got to say.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

390 Does anyone else have any points they would like to raise or ask of Conseiller Guille regarding the Report or the Proposition?

Conseiller Donovan, thank you.

Conseiller Donovan: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

395 I think that the points made by Conseiller Williams highlight the fact that we should not be bringing back items for public consultation to Chief Pleas before going out to the public to consult with them on matters which clearly are so emotive, such as the Seigneur stipend. I believe that any Committee will follow the correct procedures in terms of collating the right questions and deliberating it, passing anything through the Law Officers, and following those procedures that ultimately gets the right and fair answers for Islanders. So I think that just demonstrates the point as to why this Proposition should be passed: to enable the Committees to figure out the questions that they want to ask in accordance with the Law Officers as well.

Thank you.

405 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Donovan.
Back to Conseiller Williams. Thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you for that.

410 I am more than happy that that will happen with education, healthcare and the power system. I am not convinced that P&F, as they stand at the moment, will know what questions to put to the public and where they will seek their advice for this. Their advice that we will take for the healthcare will come from people that we have engaged with in Guernsey who are doing a review. Obviously the same is going to happen with education. We are basically agreeing tonight to allow P&F to go ahead and set whatever questions they want to set in order to get whatever consultation back they want to get back and I would like to think that the most decent thing to do, the first person you need to consult with, would be our Seigneur of Sark.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Does anyone else have any questions or points they would like to raise regarding the Report or questions directly to Conseiller Guille?

Conseiller Makepeace, thank you. Conseiller Plummer, I will come to you –

Conseiller Makepeace: Thank you, sir.

I would just like to say I agree with Conseiller Williams in that I do not think that we should just allow the Policy and Finance Committee to propose the questions and to decide this alone, because we run the fear of the personality politics creeping into this and I think it should be a decision of the whole House and not just one Committee.

Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

Conseiller Plummer, next. There was a hand up – one second.

Conseiller Plummer, thank you.

Conseiller Plummer: Thank you.

It was just to say that I agree with Conseiller Williams on this matter. It is very important and it has to be debated properly.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard, next.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard: Yes, I do agree with Conseiller Makepeace in this case too. It makes sense, it is more democratic, to have it to a wider audience.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you.

Conseiller Donovan next. Thank you. I beg your pardon, I will come to you in one second, Conseiller Turner. (*Interjection*) Conseiller Donovan first, thank you.

Conseiller Donovan: As Conseiller Williams highlighted when she was speaking about it being the position of Seigneur in this case, in respect of the topic of discussion, I think it is really important ... And I agree with that point: it is the position and not the person. I think it is also really important to remember that this is the Committee and not certain personalities within the Committee. So people might have a problem with certain people on P&F, but actually, this is Policy and Finance as a Committee that would be agreeing this, the timeline and the way in which consultation is.

I think it is also important to state that consultation is many things other than just a survey for instance, in terms of asking a question and getting a response. There are many different ways in which consultation can happen. So I think it is important to look at the bigger picture and remember that it is the Committee, not certain people, and also, in this case, I agree that it is the position of Seigneur and not the person currently holding the position at the moment.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Donovan.

Conseiller Turner. Thank you.

Conseiller Turner: Just briefly, I believe that public consultation should not just be questions that we are asking of the public, but their own opinions that they form without questions presented firstly. So that is something that I will put forward when we are in P&F and questions

470 are brought up: we also need to give them the chance to present their views to us and develop questions from the public's questions.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Turner.

475 Before I ask Conseiller Guille to ... Conseiller Guille would you like to come back on that? (*Interjection by Conseiller Guille*) Before we come to that section, does anyone else have any other points they would like to raise regarding the Report and the Proposition?

Therefore, could I ask Conseiller Guille perhaps to sum up, please.

480 **Conseiller Guille:** Yes, I would like to focus on the first stated reason for this Proposition, and I think the debate has really pretty well demonstrated that. Public consultation is something we ... Those subjects, and especially the one about the stipend, is probably one of the most requested things that we get asked for, to go out to public consultation. If we have to come to Chief Pleas with the list of questions and it gets debated like it already has done this afternoon, it is before
485 you have even sent the questionnaire out or gone for consultation or asked people's opinions, it has already been tarred with everybody's opinions and the 40-minute debate in Chief Pleas.

I do not know if it was a misuse of words, but it is not about asking the questions to get the answer that you want. It is about asking plain and honest questions and giving the public the opportunity to put their opinions forward to us. So I literally think debate here has showed taking
490 every single public consultation back to Chief Pleas to agree the set of questions in my mind defeats the purpose of going out to the public unfiltered to ask their opinion in the first place.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Does anyone have any further questions they would like to ask the Committee,
495 Conseiller Guille?

Conseiller Williams. Thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I still would like to think that in order to take public consultation on something, it would be interesting to know actually what the Seigneur does to earn his stipend.
500 People often say to me it is fine that he has a stipend and he is often seen to be doing lots of things, but I think before you can consult on something, people need to know exactly what the role includes.

I am sure that nobody in this House recently, in the new House recently, has had a meeting or a briefing or a consultation with the person who earns the stipend to find out exactly what it is
505 that he does to earn the money. We are making it out like we just hand it to him every year and nothing is done about it. I would just want to be sure that it is all done in the programme in which it should be done.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

510 Conseiller Guille.

Conseiller Guille: On that exact point, forgive me if I get this wrong by a year, but I think it was two years ago we wrote to the Seigneur himself and got his version of exactly what he does, what he believes he does that contributes towards the stipend or whichever way you want to put it,
515 and yes, that document would definitely be shared in the public consultation. That was asking the Seigneur himself what he believed his roles and responsibilities were. So that has already happened. If it was not two years ago, it might have been three, but yes, hopefully that has answered that one. (*Interjection*)

520 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.
Conseiller Makepeace.

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir. I would just like to ask Conseiller Guille will the Seigneur be given a chance to update his list of duties, rather than using the report from two or three years ago?

525 Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Conseiller Guille, would you like to answer that?

Conseiller Guille: I cannot see any harm in that happening at all.

530

The Speaker: Okay, it is an affirmative. Does anyone else have any specific questions of Conseiller Guille and P&F regarding the Report and the Proposition before we go to the vote? No. Okay, thank you very much indeed.

535 Therefore, I would like to go to the Proposition, which reads that Chief Pleas agree that public consultations are developed within Committees and the results are brought back to Chief Pleas. Those in favour? Okay, thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

Thank you for that.

**8. 2022 Financial Statements –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Financial Statements and Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled '2022 Financial Statements'.

Proposition:

That the Financial Statements of the Island for the year ended 31st December 2022 be adopted.

540 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 8, to consider a Report with the Financial Statements and Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled '2022 Financial Statements'. Conseiller Guille, would you like to introduce the report, please?

Conseiller Guille: Yes, thank you, sir.

545 I am not going to read out this long Report. Safe to say, please, if you have any questions from the floor, can you either direct them to the relevant Committee Chairs or to P&F, and in turn we may ask the Treasurer to answer specific questions.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

550 Does anyone have any questions of Conseiller Guille or the Committee, specifically about the Report?

Conseiller Makepeace, thank you.

555 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes, it is just a question, actually. Excuse my ignorance on this matter, but I have noticed that in the last few years we have shown a healthy surplus and I just wondered why it is necessary then to increase the personal taxation if we have got a healthy surplus each year.

Thank you, sir.

560 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace. Conseiller Guille, would you like to answer that question?

Conseiller Guille: Yes. So the taxes are set the preceding year, when you are forecasting what you are going to need for the following year, and our forecasts are always very close to the wire in order not to raise tax quite so much. We have had, not a massive surplus recently, but we are also in the process of building back up the Island's funds. We took a chunk out of Island funds to do the slaughterhouse not so many years ago, and there is definitely big capital projects looming, with the Coupée, potentially. It might need some remedial work, and the old harbour certainly springs to mind as well, which is going to need some significant work in the future.

So yes, taxes are set when we are making the budget for the following year, without the benefit of foresight that we are going to end up with a surplus, and the surpluses recently have been used to restock the piggy bank, with thinking towards the future.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Does anybody else have any further questions regarding the Report or the Proposition we are about to vote on before we go to the vote?

Conseiller Turner. Thank you.

Conseiller Turner: Just in response to the raising of taxes and budgeting in advance, I am aware that the Treasurer and most Members of P&F would like to see a forecast budgeted for five years in advance at least, but it is a matter of having time to deal with Committees. I think putting back the Budget Meeting may help with this, but all the Committees need to work with the Treasurer to plan in advance for future expenditure to prevent an *ad hoc* increase in tax.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Turner.

Conseiller Guille, thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Yes, and thank you, Conseiller Turner, for highlighting that. Apologies, I did miss this off my opening remarks: I would like to thank our Treasurer very much for the work she does in preparing some pretty detailed budgets and it is certainly our wish on P&F, and definitely the Treasurer's wish, to be working towards longer-term forecasts. I would just request that given that we are now officially moving the Budget Meeting back, the Treasurer needs as much assistance as possible from Committee Chairs and Committees with giving her the information to be able to do these longer range forecasts. So thanks to the Treasurer and a request that people can work more closely with her in the future.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Before we go to the vote on the Proposition, does anyone have any further questions or points they would like to raise regarding the Report? Very good.

In which case we will go to the Proposition. So it is a single Proposition which reads as follows: that the Financial Statements of the Island for the year ended 31st December 2022 be adopted. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Thank you very much indeed. Very good.

**9. The Protection of Vulnerable Adults Special Committee –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘The Protection of Vulnerable Adults Special Committee’.

Proposition:

The Protection of Vulnerable Adults Special Committee be disbanded with immediate effect.

The Speaker: Moving to Agenda Item 9, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘The Protection of Vulnerable Adults Special Committee’, and I would like to call on Conseiller Donovan to introduce the Report, please.

Conseiller Donovan: Thank you, sir.

The Vulnerable Adults Committee, as I understand, has never met. The Capacity Law will, when the Sark guidelines are issued, cover vulnerable adults and comes under the Medical Committee, so there is no need now for a specific Special Committee. It was discussed at last PDG and agreed to disband it. So I ask that everyone supports this Proposition, please.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Donovan.

Does anybody have any questions or points they would like to raise with the Committee or with Conseiller Donovan regarding the Report?

Conseiller Williams; thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I would just like to support what Conseiller Donovan said. We did meet and we did discuss this and since the new laws have come in in Guernsey, which is the Law ... has escaped my brain for the moment. Capacity Law – it covers more than we could ever wish for, which is why there will be a slight hold up because we need to make it ... It is fit for purpose, it just is not always fit for Sark in all the ways that it is there. So if people could just bear with us. We are not just forgetting about the vulnerable adults, they are very much thought of in the Capacity Law.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Does anyone else have any questions for the Committee and Conseiller Donovan in particular on this Report? Very good.

In which case we will go to the vote and the Proposition is the Protection of Vulnerable Adults Special Committee be disbanded with immediate effect. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? Thank you. **Carried.** Very good.

**16. Commercial Rubbish Charges –
Douzaine Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Douzaine entitled 'Commercial Rubbish Charges'.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approve the Douzaine consulting with the Law Officers of the Crown, to draft legislation as set out in this report.

635 **The Speaker:** Once again, playing shuffle the Agenda, before we move to Agenda Item 10, I propose, in accordance with Rule of Procedure 11, that we take Item 16 from the Addendum to be debated now. Item 16 is a Report with Proposition from the Douzaine entitled to consider a Report with a Proposition from the Douzaine entitled 'Commercial Rubbish Charges'.

Conseiller Le Lievre is not here. Who would like to present the report? Conseiller Bougourd, thank you very much indeed.

640 **Conseiller Bougourd:** Thank you.

The Douzaine is aware that the current schedule of public works charges for commercial rubbish is neither complete nor coherent and somewhat *ad hoc*. More important than any of the former, the amount being charged does not cover the cost to the Island collecting and disposing of commercial waste. The Douzaine, which is responsible for public works, has looked into the matter of the charges for commercial rubbish and believes any new schedule ought to be backed up by appropriate legislation.

650 The Douzaine is thus requesting permission to speak with the Law Officers of the Crown with a view to the drafting of legislation to permit the introduction of a new schedule of charges. The draft of any such legislation shall be brought to a future Chief Pleas for debate and discussion before any final version is drafted. The Douzaine would see this as an ideal opportunity to review and possibly include domestic charges also. This is really just a courtesy request for us to go to the Law Officers.

Thank you.

655 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Bougourd.

Does anyone have any specific points, questions they would like to raise with Conseiller Bougourd and the Douzaine?

Conseiller Turner; thank you.

660 **Conseiller Turner:** Just a question for Conseiller Bougourd regarding this. With the recent charges for private residents on the Island, will there be a public consultation before you proceed with contacting the Law Officers to say where we are making money, where we are losing money now, what the charges will be for any increases that are going to be applied? Or are you going to go ahead and choose charges, speak to the Law Officers and bring that to the House without public consultation?

665 Thank you.

The Speaker: Conseiller Bougourd.

670 **Conseiller Bougourd:** The short answer is I do not know. That is why we are going to the Law Officers to ask their advice on all things commercial recycling.

Thanks.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Bougourd.

675 Does anybody have ...? Conseiller Turner first, and I come to Conseiller Guille in just one second.

Thank you.

Conseiller Turner: In response to that, then, I am sorry, just for my personal opinion, I will be voting against this until we have got further clarification, as it was a new charge originally. To add on to a charge without public consultation I do not think is fair, especially when you say that at the moment it is somewhat *ad hoc*.

Thank you, Conseiller.

685 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Turner.
Conseiller Guille.

Conseiller Guille: I would just like to thank the Douzaine and the Treasury Department for all the hard work they have been doing to get a hold of subjects like the rubbish collection and other Island services where a lot of charges were being missed out and there was a lot of lost income for the Island, which probably was not very fair on the people who were actually paying their charges. I think the Douzaine and the Treasury Department have done a lot of work on this and I will be offering them my support with how they want to take this forward.

Thank you.

695

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Does anybody else have any points they would like to raise with the Douzaine regarding commercial rubbish charges before we go to the Proposition? Thank you.

In which case, we will move to the Proposition, which reads that Chief Pleas approve the Douzaine consulting with the Law Officers of the Crown to draft legislation as set out in this Report. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Thank you.

10. Review of Seneschal and Deputy Seneschal terms and conditions and remuneration recommendations – Policy and Finance Committee Report and propositions withdrawn

To consider a historic (2017 Information) Report with Propositions from Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Review of Seneschal and Deputy Seneschal terms and conditions and remuneration recommendations'.

Proposition 1:

That Chief Pleas authorise the Policy and Finance Committee to consult with the Law Officers of the Crown, the Seneschal, Deputy Seneschal and relevant stakeholders to draft terms and conditions for the office of Seneschal.

Proposition 2:

That, in accordance with section 6(4) of the Reform (Sark) Law 2008, the Policy and Finance Committee submit the terms and conditions, with recommendations, for the office of Seneschal to the Midsummer Meeting.

The Speaker: Moving along to Agenda Item 10, I would like to ask Conseiller Guille just to make a brief statement, please.

705 **Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir.
Policy and Finance Committee would like to withdraw this Item at this time whilst we seek further legal advice and we will endeavour to bring it back to the next Meeting of Chief Pleas.
Thank you.

710 **The Speaker:** Thank you.
There will be no debate on this because it has been withdrawn. I would *personally* ask that all the parties involved in this matter should communicate clearly, concisely and effectively with each other in order to fully appreciate and avoid any future misunderstandings. End of chapter.

11. Education Update – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered

To consider an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Education Update’.

715 **The Speaker:** Moving swiftly along to Agenda Item 11, to consider an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Education Update’. Once again, Conseiller Booth to introduce the Report. *(Interjection)* Is it correct or ...? No, Councillor Donovan. Okay, *(Interjection)* my apologies. Conseiller Donovan, thank you.

720 **Conseiller Donovan:** Sorry. Thank you, Mr Speaker.
This Information Report only and I think it is fairly self-explanatory and fairly short. So if anyone has got any questions, we will do our best to answer those.
Thank you.

725 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Councillor Donovan.
Does anybody have any questions or debate regarding the update from Education? No. In which case, there is no proposition attached to that.

12. Isle of Sark Shipping, Annual Report – Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee Report considered

To consider an Information Report from the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee entitled ‘Isle of Sark Shipping, Annual Report’.

730 **The Speaker:** We will move next to Agenda Item 12, which is to consider an Information Report from the Tourism Committee entitled ‘Report from Tourism for the period from January 2022 to December 2022’ and I would ask Conseiller Sandra Williams – **(The Seigneur: Item 12.)** Item 12, I beg your pardon.

The Seigneur: You’re on 13.

735 **The Speaker:** I have jumped ahead. I do apologise.
So yes, it is to consider an Information Report from the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee entitled the ‘Isle of Sark Shipping, Annual Report’. And who would like to introduce that Report?
Conseiller Williams, thank you very much indeed.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I would love to.

740 It is pretty much as it is on the paper. I have been concerned over the last three weeks about how quiet Sark seems to be, even with the special offers that Sark Shipping have been running. But we cannot force people to come to the Island. So I contacted the Company yesterday and was surprised to hear that actually our numbers are not low compared to 2019, 2022 and 2023. If anything, our numbers for March were above average for the other times of the year and at the moment we are 2% visitor day-trippers up on 17th April last year.

745 I know there is a lot of concern around the Island and everyone is saying how quiet it is. There is a lot being done, there is a lot of advertising going out there, but unfortunately, if the visitors are not in Guernsey, we cannot get them to come to Sark. I think Sark Shipping are looking into venturing with Manche Îles now and I have a very small fraction of the timetable where Manche Îles will go into Guernsey and pick up passengers from Guernsey to come ... Sorry, you can go through Jersey, Guernsey, Sark and then back to, which will be an all-in price. So we are hoping that that may pick up for Sark on the days that the Manche Îles is not travelling through directly.

750 Manche Îles is due to start on 6th May and they have got mainly, nearly three, sometimes four sailings a week. But as we know, time and tide and weather very dependent. So all we can do is say we have built it, now let's wait for them all to come.

755 Thank you very much.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

760 Does anyone have any questions for Conseiller Williams and the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee. Starting with Conseiller Donovan first; come to Conseiller Makepeace in a second.

Conseiller Donovan, thank you.

Conseiller Donovan: Thank you, sir.

765 It is not a question, and I am not sure if it fits into this bit or the Tourism bit, but I would just like to say that I think it is really positive and promising to see so many new businesses, restaurants, lots of new things opening and lots of events being put on as Islanders endeavour to make Sark an attractive place to visit, either for a day or a weekend. It is a really positive thing and I hope that that means that there is a good season ahead. So I just wanted to raise that point.

770 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Donovan.

Conseiller Makepeace.

775 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes, sir.

I would just like to comment on the report, the Shipping Report and the Tourism Report in one go. I would like to thank Conseiller Williams for the Report. I have read the Report and I was pleasantly surprised by the depth of content and found it to be statistically very informative. I think it is an excellent Report and believe it will be very useful to everyone involved in tourism and the like going forward. So thank you to Conseiller Williams.

780

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

Was your hand up over here, Conseiller Guille? (**Conseiller Guille:** Yes.) Thank you, sir.

785 **Conseiller Guille:** Yes. It is heartening to hear the March figures are actually slightly up and I would like to thank Sark Shipping for listening to our requests. We had a Sunday boat every other Sunday between Christmas and Easter and I do know that there are some businesses on Sark, tourist-related businesses, that are aiming to try and do more of a year-round offering. Whilst, if the tourists are not arriving in Guernsey, we cannot benefit from those from further afield, I think we still do benefit from our Bailiwick neighbours coming over here and they can come here year

790

round. So I think the year-round tourism business is something we should be encouraging and supporting and the every other Sunday boat was a good step towards that this year. I thank them for that.

795 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Does anyone else have any points they would like to raise or specific questions for the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee? Very good.

There are no Propositions attached to that, but thank you for that Report.

13. Report from Tourism for the period January 2022 to December 2022 – Tourism Committee Report considered

To consider an Information Report from the Tourism Committee entitled 'Report from Tourism for the period January 2022 to December 2022'.

800 **The Speaker:** Very closely allied with that is to consider an Information Report from the Tourism Committee entitled 'Report from Tourism for the period January 2022 to December 2022'. Conseiller Williams, would you like to introduce that Report, please?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you, sir.

805 I will not repeat what Conseiller Donovan has already said, even though I have got it on my list and already I am hearing positive feedback from the few visitors that I do see up on my way, to say that it is nice to have somewhere different, somewhere else on a Monday and a Tuesday evening to eat. So yes, that has got to be all positive, I think.

810 I have not really got very much else to add to the Tourism Report, because I do not work on a day-to-day basis in the office and interact with the customers, but I think it is clear to see that tourism is starting to grow again. We did have two very difficult years. We are interacting at the moment. We are in the process of building a new website. We are going to hopefully be all singing, all dancing, which is what we need to be doing, I think.

815 Facebook and Twitter and social media is just blowing me away. I never thought I would be standing here saying what an amazing tool social media is. And just thanks to the staff, really, who have to put up with all the difficult questions and the angry people who come into the office complaining when it is raining, because it obviously was not raining in Guernsey when they got on the boat and it was not giving rain on the forecast.

So I have not really got much more to say, but thank you.

820 **The Speaker:** But you cannot control the weather. *(Interjection by Conseiller Sandra Williams and laughter)* Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Does anyone have any questions that they would like to ask of the Tourism Committee, specific to the Report that you have all seen?

Conseiller Makepeace once again.

825 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Thank you, sir.

830 I would just like to say that I think Tourism under Conseiller Williams is doing a great job and therefore I cannot understand – it is really a question – why the budget provided to the Tourism Committee has been reduced considerably by Chief Pleas, the contribution by Chief Pleas, in the last few years. I do not understand the reason for this, why it would be reduced, because it must put them under more pressure.

Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you.

835 Conseiller Williams, back to you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I can briefly answer that question – and we have really struggled this year. Obviously we have not needed the money in the last two years because we have not been going out to anywhere further than Guernsey, really. But we do a lot with very little. We were getting support from Visit Guernsey by up to £5,000 a year. They were doing lots of joint advertising with us. I have noticed a big difference since the relationship in Guernsey has changed into different fractions of tourism, that we do not get as much publicity as a jewel in the crown of the Channel Islands.

845 It is something that I am very keen to work on, but as I have only noticed it has been happening over the last couple of months, I have not had time to deal with this. And it is a big worry. We were looking very deeply. We have done advertising in Liverpool this year for the very first time. We do not know whether it is going to pay off or not, but because we have not ever done it before, they contacted the office last week and said, ‘We’ve got your advertising here for the Liverpool duty-free shop’ which we thought was really handy, because they are all going for the Eurovision Song Contest this year. We have paid for a month and they have actually allowed us to have it up on their board for nine weeks.

850 So we have benefited greatly there, but we will be, I am sorry to say, coming back some time this year and asking for some more money in our bank, because every other week more advertising is coming our way. And, sadly, we were out of money by the end of February to be able to do any more advertising. If something sure comes along that we really cannot afford to miss, I would quite happily go to the Committee and say it is quite desperate, we need this money, but nothing that we cannot live without has occurred as of yet this year. So we will just keep an eye on what is happening.

Thank you.

860

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Once again, before we close this Agenda Item – (*Interjection*) Yes, Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard. Thank you.

865 **Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** I just want to back what Conseiller Williams is saying there. I am noticing that Alderney and Herm advertising very aggressively. They are really competing for every visitor at the moment and I think it would be a really good idea to increase budget, where necessary, for our tourist board.

Thank you.

870

The Speaker: Thank you for that.

Does anyone else have any further points they would like to make? Conseiller Guille, followed by Conseiller Donovan. Thank you.

875 **Conseiller Guille:** Yes. I do not think Conseiller Makepeace’s assertion was very accurate, that the Tourist Committee are being refused money.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: No, we’re not being, I made that point.

880 **Conseiller Guille:** The Tourist Committee sets their own budget and they are extremely careful and mindful of the budget, but obviously, if they have got any further ideas for next year, then they have just got to come back to the House. I cannot ever remember it being refused so far.

So good luck to everybody involved.

885 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Conseiller Donovan. Thank you.

Conseiller Donovan: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

890 I think it is important that it is recognised that yes, Alderney and Herm do come under
Guernsey as part of the umbrella and their advertising budget and resources and everything is
very different to ours, but I think it is also worth considering that the ways in which Sark Tourism
as a whole operate need to just be mindful of efficiencies, changes in things. It does not actually
require more and more money to keep being thrown at, say, social media. I think it is the way in
which advertising in this case is done or how things are gone about.

895 We can get, as we have seen by the budget, a considerable amount of output and value for the
budget, which is, as Conseiller Guille said, very carefully managed by the office and by the Tourism
Committee. It is just a case of acknowledging that there is a change in how people advertise, how
people consume information, how people do go on holiday and I think the new website that has
been worked on will be a really promising step forward.

900 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Donovan.

Does anybody else have any comments they would like to make regarding the Report from
Tourism for last year, 2022? No. In which case, thank you very much.

**Procedural –
Agenda reordered**

905 **The Speaker:** We will go to the next Agenda Item, and this is the last shuffle. Before we move
to Agenda Item 14, I propose, in accordance with Rule of Procedure 11, once again, that Agenda
Item 19 from the Addendum be debated now. Those in favour? Thank you very much.

**19. Committee and Panel Elections –
Douzaine: Conseillers M Barker and S Sullivan elected –
Education: E Baker MBE, Conseillers J Booth, A Miller and S Sullivan elected –
Taxation (Special): Conseiller M Barker elected**

To elect Conseillers to Committees, as required.

910 **The Speaker:** So Agenda Item 19 from the Addendum is Committee elections; to elect
Conseillers to Committees, as required. I have had printed off, thank you to the office, for the
current list and we have vacancies, as you will be well aware, on the Douzaine and we would like
to repopulate the Education Committee. Therefore, can we perhaps deal with the Douzaine first?
Two vacancies, I have had no nominations so far, would anybody from the floor like to nominate
somebody, or themselves, to go on to the Douzaine?

Conseiller Turner.

915 **Conseiller Turner:** I would like to nominate Marcus Barker.
Thank you.

920 **The Speaker:** Are you happy to be nominated, Conseiller Barker? *(Interjection by
Conseiller Barker)* Very good.

So we have one nomination in Conseiller Barker. Do we have any other nominations to join the Douzaine? Any the other nominations for the Douzaine? Very practical, hardworking Committee; hands on. Conseiller Sullivan.

925 **Conseiller Sullivan:** I will nominate myself.

The Speaker: Excellent. Okay, so we have two nominations to join the Douzaine, Conseiller Barker and Conseiller Sullivan. Do we have any other nominations? In which case, can I have a show of hands that the nominations for Conseiller Barker and Conseiller Sullivan to join
930 the Douzaine are carried. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? You can vote for yourselves. In which case, I confirm, therefore, that Conseiller Barker and Conseiller Sullivan are duly elected to join the Douzaine. Thank you, gentlemen.

Moving along to Education, currently Education rests with Policy and Finance, as we are well aware and we have very much heard confirmed this evening. There are five vacancies on the
935 Committee. (**A Member:** Four.) Four, I am sorry. Four vacancies – cross that bottom one off. Do we have any nominations from the floor to join the Education Committee?

Conseiller Williams.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I would like – I am not nominating myself – to nominate
940 Miss Jolie Booth, please.

The Speaker: Nominate Conseiller Booth. Do we have any additional nominations?
Conseiller Booth.

945 **Conseiller Booth:** I would like to nominate Edric Baker, Andrew Miller, and Scott Sullivan.

The Speaker: Well, that is a combination that is ... Conseiller Baker, Conseiller Sullivan and Conseiller Miller. Are each of those four people happy that they should be nominated to join the Education Committee? Conseiller Baker? Anybody else like to throw their name into the arena,
950 into the hat, to join the Education Committee?

Therefore, based on that as a joint vote, I would like to propose that Conseillers Booth, Baker, Sullivan and Miller are now the new Education Committee. Can I have a show of hands, please, to confirm that? Thank you. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? So just for confirmation therefore, Conseiller Booth, Conseiller Baker, Conseiller Sullivan and Conseiller Miller are the new
955 Members of the Education Committee. Thank you to each and one of you for putting your name forwards for that challenging role.

Do we have any other vacancies currently that would require to be filled?

Conseiller Baker MBE: Yes, sir, if I may.
960

The Speaker: Yes, Conseiller Baker.

Conseiller Baker MBE: With all my other Committees, I would like to forward my resignation of the Harbours Committee; give us an opportunity to replace me for that position.
965

The Speaker: You would like to stand down from the Harbours Committee? (**Conseiller Baker MBE:** Yes, please.) I am a bit rusty on this. Please could you put that in writing –

Conseiller Baker MBE: I will do.
970

The Speaker: – to the Speaker, Conseiller Baker? Thank you.

Conseiller Baker MBE: *[Inaudible]* ... Thank you very much, I will.

975 **The Speaker:** So I think I am right in saying we cannot vote on that now? Yes. *(Interjection by Conseiller Baker MBE)* So if you could put that in writing –

Conseiller Baker MBE: Yes, I will.

980 **The Speaker:** – and then we will deal with it formally at the next Meeting. So you are still there for the time being. *(Interjection by Conseiller Baker MBE)*

There were some more hands up over here. Conseiller Delaney. Thank you.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

985 In respect of the Tax Review (Special) Committee, we have one vacancy. We have had representation from Conseiller Barker that he would like to join the Committee and I think, on the basis that one volunteer is worth 10 pressed men, we put Conseiller Barker forward for the position.

990 **The Speaker:** Like to nominate Conseiller Barker to join the Special Taxation Committee? Do you have any other nominations to join the Special Taxation Committee; from the floor? Conseiller Barker, are you happy with that nomination? *(Interjection by Conseiller Barker)* Very good. Can we have a show of hands of those who are in approval of Conseiller Barker joining the Special Taxation Committee? Thank you. And those against? **Carried.** Conseiller Barker, welcome to that Committee.

995 Do we have any other vacancies that we would like to fill from the floor? Very good. I think, according to my record, that that probably populates the Committees. Any other questions regarding nominations or anyone not happy on a Committee, other than Conseiller Barker? I would remind you, if anyone is not happy, and I do not want to depopulate Committees, please put it in writing to the Speaker ahead of the Meeting, in order that we can bring it to the Meeting and then vote on it within the Meeting.

1000 So that is Agenda Item 19.

14. Committee and Panel Elections – None

To elect non-Chief Pleas members and Panel members to Committees and Panels, as required.

1005 **The Speaker:** Not dissimilar, jumping through to Agenda Item 14, Committee and Panel Elections, to elect non-Chief Pleas members and Panel members to Committees and Panels as required. Once again, I have had no nominations here. Does anybody have any nominations for anybody to join any committee as non-Chief Pleas members or Panel members to Committees or Panels? Any nominations? Any suggestions? No. In which case, we will move along from that.

Procedural – Laid before Items removed from Agenda

1010 **The Speaker:** Finally, before I say thank you and close the Easter Meeting, I would just like to apologise and say that the laid before Items were incorrectly included on the Agenda, and I propose that these Items are removed from the Agenda. That is not necessary, but I do need a

vote in favour of that, please. Those in favour of removing the laid before Items? It was a technical error. Thank you. Those against? **Carried**. Thank you very much indeed.

Once again, thank you very much indeed for attending. It is now 6.21 and I would ask the Greffier, please, to read the closing prayer.

1015 Thank you.

Chief Pleas adjourned at 6.22 p.m.