



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

EASTER MEETING

OF CHIEF PLEAS

OF THE

ISLAND OF SARK

HANSARD

Assembly Room, Sark, Wednesday, 10th April 2024

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official Island of Sark Chief Pleas website www.sarkgov.co.uk*

Volume 10, No. 2

Present:

Seigneur

Maj. C M Beaumont Esq.

Speaker of Chief Pleas

P M Armorgie Esq.

Deputy Prévôt

J Godwin

Greffier

T J Hamon

Treasurer

S Hudson

Constable

C Turner

Assistant Constable

Jonathan Godwin

His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey

Lt. General Richard Cripwell CB, CBE

Conseillers:

Edric Baker MBE
Tony Le Lievre
Frank Makepeace
Paul Williams
Sandra Williams
Kevin Delaney
Jolie Booth
John Guille

Christopher Kennedy-Barnard
Andrew Miller
Helen Plummer
Marcus Barker
Scott Sullivan
Benjamin Harris
Christopher Bateson

Business transacted

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Welcome to the Lieutenant Governor | 5 |
| Apologies received | 5 |
| Automatic resignation of Conseiller Couldridge | 5 |
| Tribute to former Conseiller Richard Dewe – Statement by the Speaker..... | 5 |
| Declarations of interest – Statement by the Speaker | 6 |
| By-election – Statement by the Speaker | 6 |
| Statements | 7 |
| Termination of doctor’s contract – Statement by Conseiller Plummer..... | 7 |
| Creux Harbour electrocution incident report – Statement by Conseiller Guille..... | 7 |
| Civil Service staffing – Statement by Conseiller Guille..... | 8 |
| Procedural – Electronic devices..... | 9 |
| Business of the Day..... | 10 |
| 1. Matters arising from the Budget Meeting held on the 22nd of November 2023 | 10 |
| 2. Matters arising from the Christmas Meeting held on the 17th January 2024..... | 10 |
| 3. Questions not related to the Business of the Day – None..... | 10 |
| Procedural motion – Reordering of Business – Motion carried..... | 11 |
| 24. Motion of No Confidence in the Douzaine – Letter from nine Conseillers – Debate commenced – Propositions 1 and 2 carried..... | 11 |
| <i>Chief Pleas adjourned at 6.15 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 6.28 p.m.....</i> | <i>25</i> |
| Motion of No Confidence in the Douzaine – Letter from nine Conseillers – Debate concluded – Propositions 3 and 4 withdrawn | 25 |
| 4. Reform (Election of Conseillers) (By Election) (Sark) Ordinance, 2024 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried | 26 |
| 5. Charities and Non Profit Organisations (Registration) (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2024 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried..... | 27 |
| 6. Amendment to the Control of Dogs Legislation – Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee Report considered – Proposition carried | 28 |
| Procedural – Douzeniers’ swearing-in..... | 29 |
| 7. Amendments to the Medical and Emergency Services Committee Mandate – Medical and Emergency Services Committee Report considered – Proposition carried | 30 |
| 8. 2023 Financial Statements – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried..... | 31 |
| 9. Sunday Tractors – Douzaine Report considered – Proposition withdrawn | 32 |
| 10. Hydrogeological Study – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Propositions carried | 33 |

EASTER MEETING OF CHIEF PLEAS, WEDNESDAY, 10th APRIL 2024

| | |
|--|----|
| 11. Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee Mandate – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried..... | 35 |
| 12. Public Liability Insurance for Accommodation Providers – Tourism Committee Report considered – Proposition carried..... | 37 |
| 13. Royal Assent – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered | 39 |
| 14. Safeguarder Annual Report – Medical and Emergency Services Committee Report considered | 40 |
| 15. Handling of Complaints against the Constables – Report withdrawn..... | 41 |
| 16. Commercial Rubbish Charges – Report withdrawn..... | 42 |
| 17. Tourism Annual Report – Tourism Committee Report considered | 42 |
| 18. Isle of Sark Shipping Annual Report – Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee Report considered | 45 |
| 19. Annual Tax on Enveloped Dwellings – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered | 46 |
| 20. Chief Pleas Rules of Procedure – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered..... | 48 |
| 21. Appointment of Assistant Constable – Douzaine Report considered | 49 |
| 22. Committee Elections – None | 50 |
| 23. Committee and Panel Elections – None | 50 |
| Midsummer Meeting deadline – Statement by the Speaker | 51 |
| <i>Chief Pleas closed at 8.47 p.m.</i> | 51 |

Easter Meeting of Chief Pleas

Chief Pleas met at 5 p.m.

[THE SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

PRAYER

The Greffier

ROLL CALL

The Greffier

The Greffier: There are 15 Conseillers, the Seigneur and the Speaker of Chief Pleas present.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you, Greffier. Thank you very much indeed.

Welcome to the Lieutenant Governor

5 **The Speaker:** Good afternoon and welcome, one and all. And a particular warm welcome to His Excellency, the Lieutenant Governor of the Bailiwick, who joins us this evening. You are very welcome, sir. Thank you very much indeed. Welcome to you.

Apologies received

The Speaker: I have received apologies for absence from two Conseillers, from Conseiller Donovan and Conseiller Couldridge.

Automatic resignation of Conseiller Couldridge

10 **The Speaker:** It is a great sadness that under section 31 of the Reform Law, 2008, Conseiller Couldridge has now been absent from three consecutive ordinary Meetings of Chief Pleas. Upon receipt of a report from the Greffier to this effect, I have no option but to declare that the office of Conseiller Couldridge is now vacant, and she will have deemed to have resigned as a Conseiller immediately at the end of this Meeting.

Tribute to former Conseiller Richard Dewe – Statement by the Speaker

15 **The Speaker:** I have a couple of statements that I would like to make. The first one is with regard to Richard Dewe. As most of you will be aware, very sadly, Richard Dewe passed away

about a month ago, and he was a former Deputy and Conseiller of Chief Pleas. He was one of the longest-serving ever Members of Chief Pleas over many years.

20 He was, for those who are aware, he was a Deputy of the People of Sark from 1st October 1958 to 30th September 1987, and he served again from 19th January 2000 to 2nd October 2002, and then again from 30th March to 1st October 2008. Richard also served as a Conseiller in the new Assembly from 21st January 2009 until 10th November 2016, an outstanding length of service, I am sure you will agree.

25 During his various tenures in Chief Pleas, Richard served on a myriad of Committees, probably more than any other person in recent history. These included terms on the following Committees, some of which no longer exist. He served on the Hall Committee, the Agriculture Committee, the Public Conveniences Committee, Fire Protection Committee, the Playing Field Facilities Committee, Sea Fisheries, Camping, the Douzaine, Constitutional Review, Firearms, GP&A, Harbours, GP&F, Tourism, Medical, Road Traffic, the Policing Review Committee, Shipping, the
30 Law Reform PDT, and also the Isle of Sark Shipping PDT.

Richard was also the Junior Procureur in 1966 and the Senior Procureur in 1968. He served as Vingtenier in 1971 and as Constable in 1972. He was very much the father of the House.

35 On behalf of Chief Pleas, I would like to thank Richard for his loyal public service to Sark and Chief Pleas for so many years. He was also a leading authority on the history of Sark and notably, the German occupation of Sark, and he leaves a huge repertoire of articles and photographs about that period.

Richard was truly one of a kind and I was personally grateful for his knowledge, his wisdom and experience on many subjects and on many occasions. Please can we remember Richard with a moment's silence.

40 Thank you.

Members stood in silence.

The Speaker: Thank you very much.

Declarations of interest – Statement by the Speaker

The Speaker: My second statement is to say that I am pleased to confirm that I have received declarations of interest from every Conseiller. So thank you all very much for letting us have your updated declarations of interest.

By-election – Statement by the Speaker

45 **The Speaker:** The third and final statement from myself is I would like to take this opportunity to remind Conseillers and the Sark electorate that there will be a by-election in Sark on Wednesday, 15th May 2024. Currently, we now have two vacancies to be filled, and I would once again encourage anyone who wishes to stand for election, or to vote, to register on the Sark electoral roll. Registration forms are available from the Greffier or via the Chief Pleas website. The electoral roll for the by-election will close on Friday, 26th April. In the interests of our democracy and the principles of good governance, please register in good time and remember that if you do not register, you cannot vote, and you cannot stand for election. And I once again ask people to be aware of that, and to let other people know that that is the case.

STATEMENTS

**Termination of doctor's contract –
Statement by Conseiller Plummer**

50 **The Speaker:** They are the three statements from myself. I have three Statements from
Conseillers also, and the first Statement is from Conseiller Plummer, the Chair of the Medical
Committee.

Conseiller Plummer; thank you.

55 **Conseiller Plummer:** Thank you, sir.

We wish to inform you that our current doctor has terminated her contract, with her last day
being on 5th May. We understand the importance of continuous medical coverage for our
community, and we want to reassure you that the Medical Committee has arranged for cover for
the next two months to ensure there is no disruption in service.

60 Additionally, we are actively seeking a solution for the long-term sustainability of medical
services in Sark, and to this end an advertisement will be posted shortly for an interim doctor. This
position is not only to fill the immediate vacancy, but also to assist us in developing a new model
of medical cover for Sark. Our goal is to create a system that serves our residents effectively, while
being sustainable for the future. We appreciate your understanding and support during this
65 transition period and are committed to keeping you informed of our progress.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

**Creux Harbour electrocution incident report –
Statement by Conseiller Guille**

70 **The Speaker:** The next Statement is from Conseiller Guille, the Chair of the Policy and Finance
Committee.

Conseiller Guille; thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir. It is a Statement on the Creux Harbour electrocution incident
report.

75 Members of Chief Pleas are aware of the incident that occurred in September last year during
an event at Creux Harbour, when a member of the public received a serious electric shock. Clearly
this was unexpected and of concern, and so discussions were held involving the event organisers,
Guernsey Electricity Ltd (GEL) and Sark Electricity Ltd, following which GEL agreed to carry out an
investigation.

80 A summary of the investigation report has been produced by GEL and a briefing was provided
to Chief Pleas Members on Wednesday, 3rd April. I am sure I speak for all Members who were
able to attend this briefing as to how useful this was and thank those who gave the briefing.

85 There are clearly a number of issues of concern and of public interest and as such GEL have
agreed that the summary report be published on the Chief Pleas website later this week. As this
is undoubtedly a matter of public interest, it is reasonable to assume Members of Chief Pleas may
be contacted by Islanders. In this respect, it is suggested that any concerns be directed to the
Policy and Finance Committee in the first instance, which will then consider what further steps
might need to be taken to address the situation.

Thank you.

90 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

**Civil Service staffing –
Statement by Conseiller Guille**

The Speaker: And we have a third statement, also from Conseiller Guille. Conseiller Guille, your second statement; thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

95 We are pleased to take this opportunity to update Chief Pleas on the current state of play with regard to our Civil Service staffing.

As Conseillers will be aware, we have been undertaking a recruitment process for the Senior Executive Officer (SEO) role, which replaces the Chief Secretary role. At the direction of Chief Pleas, the recruitment panel, with the support of the Policy and Finance Committee, engaged the services of a professional Channel Island HR firm, Insight. Insight and their principal, Simon Nash, have been involved in the recruitment of the current lead civil servants in Jersey, Guernsey and Alderney, providing oversight and advice to these processes.

100 The extensive recruitment campaign resulted in over 30 expressions of interest, many from candidates of very high calibre and competence. With support from Insight, who carried out extensive checks, the panel whittled these down to a short list of seven for video interview and then three for final interview. We now have a preferred candidate with whom we are in the final stages of discussion and for whom extensive reference checks have been completed. We are hopeful these discussions can be concluded this week, such that the candidate can give notice to their current employer and relocate to Sark this summer.

110 Of course, during the recruitment process, we have also had to deal with a further senior vacancy. While not planned, this does provide the opportunity to recruit to the Senior Operating Officer (SOO) role. The SEO and SOO will be key officers supporting Chief Pleas and the work of Committees.

115 As such, we need appointees whose skills are complementary, each able to support the other and the rest of the staff team. In this respect, Insight has recommended that in the first instance, rather than embark on a further round of recruitment, it may be wise, cost-effective, and more time-efficient to see whether any of the good candidates for the SEO role would be interested in the SOO role.

120 In light of this advice, we intend to investigate this avenue first, also ensuring the SEO-designate can be part of the recruitment process for their deputy. We had chance to discuss this with all Conseillers who were able to attend the recent PDG meeting and we will consult all Conseillers in detail before a final decision is made.

125 Although this period of disruption is unwelcome, we are genuinely encouraged with the standard of applicants and optimistic for the future. Utilising the services of a professional HR company has proven invaluable at every step of the recruitment process, from the quality of applicants attracted, to the thoroughness of the interviews. We hope that in the near future this exercise will provide Sark with a professional Civil Service that can even better assist our community in tackling the various challenges we face. In the meantime, the remaining Committee support staff have been doing a sterling job, for which we are all incredibly grateful.

130 Finally, we are also pleased to have enlisted the services of Adrian Lewis as an independent contractor to assist in the Committee offices on a part-time basis through until the start of June. Adrian has a wealth of extensive management experience in the UK, Alderney, Guernsey and Zimbabwe. This included eight years as the Treasurer for the States of Alderney, two stints as Alderney's interim Chief Executive and various senior Civil Service roles in Guernsey.

135 As soon as we have some firm news about the appointment of the SEO and in due course the SOO we will update everyone.
Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille. Thank you very much.

**Procedural –
Electronic devices**

140 **The Speaker:** Before we move on to Agenda Item 1, I would just like to make the usual statement: in accordance with the Rules of Procedure, I would remind all present that mobile phones, cameras, recording devices and other electronic equipment must be switched off now, less for those allowed to Chief Pleas Members in accordance with Rule 18.
Thank you.

Business of the Day

1. Matters arising from the Budget Meeting held on the 22nd of November 2023

145 **The Speaker:** So coming to Agenda Item 1, matters arising from the Budget Meeting held on
22nd November 2023. Does anyone have any points that they would like to raise from that
Meeting; from the Budget Meeting held last November? Any points; any comments?
Okay. It is available on the Chief Pleas website, for those of you who would like to read it.

2. Matters arising from the Christmas Meeting held on the 17th January 2024

150 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 2 is matters arising from the Christmas Meeting held on
17th January 2024. Once again, does anyone have any comments that they would like to make or
points they would like to raise from the minutes of the Christmas Meeting?
Yes, thank you very much indeed, Conseiller Barker.

155 **Conseiller Barker:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
If it is possible and you allow, I would like to make a comment about an absentee, former
Conseiller Couldridge, if that is okay.

160 I have spoken to her today. She did miss that Meeting on medical grounds, which I do believe
you are aware of, sir, and I know, obviously, now she is formally classed as she has resigned,
because she missed three in a row. Two of those Meetings she did miss were for medical reasons,
which I know you are aware, and if I am correct, pre-2008 on the Reform Law, medical grounds
were allowed to be absent from a Chief Pleas Meeting, and I think she was confused over that and
perhaps made a mistake.

165 She is extremely devastated and very upset about the situation so far, and she has confirmed
today to me – obviously I am allowed to speak on her behalf because she told me – that she will
be standing in the next election, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you very much indeed, Conseiller Barker.

170 I would add to that, yes, I am aware of the situation. I have had a number of conversations with
Conseiller Couldridge and we have tried to find a solution to this. However, it is enshrined in the
Reform Law, which of course, 2008. Prior to 2008, the rules were different. We are now operating
under a new set of rules, and unfortunately, Conseiller Couldridge has fallen foul of those rules.
I have also encouraged her to possibly put her name forward for the by-election in May as well.
But that is a point well made, thank you very much indeed for that.

175 Does anyone else have any additional points they would like to raise from the Christmas
Meeting of Chief Pleas held in January? Very good.
Thank you.

3. Questions not related to the Business of the Day – None

The Speaker: We will move, therefore, to Agenda Item 3, Questions not related to the Business
of the Day, and unusually for recently, there are none. We have no questions not related to the
Business of the Day; Agenda Item 3.

**Procedural motion –
Reordering of Business –
Motion carried**

180 **The Speaker:** At this point, before we proceed to Agenda Item 4, I propose in accordance with the Rule of Procedure 11, that Item 24 from the Addendum be debated now. I would ask for a quick show of hands to approve that.

So those in favour of debating Agenda Item 24 now, please raise your hands. Thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

**24. Motion of No Confidence in the Douzaine –
Letter from nine Conseillers –
Debate commenced –
Propositions 1 and 2 carried**

To consider a Private Members Paper with Propositions and a letter from nine Conseillers entitled 'Motion of No Confidence in the Douzaine'.

Proposition 1:

That Chief Pleas has 'No Confidence' in the Douzaine.

Proposition 2:

That Chief Pleas shall repopulate the Douzaine.

Proposition 3:

That Chief Pleas shall appoint a Chairman of the Douzaine.

Proposition 4:

That Chief Pleas shall appoint a Deputy Chairman of the Douzaine.

185 **The Speaker:** So therefore, we have Agenda Item 24 and it is, as you will be aware from the Addendum, to consider a private Members paper with Propositions and a letter from nine Conseillers entitled 'Motion of No Confidence in the Douzaine'.

In accordance with Rule of Procedure 21(3), the Chairman of the Douzaine has the right to reply to the debate immediately prior to the proposer of the motion. So I therefore ask
190 Conseiller Makepeace, as the Chairman of the Douzaine, to make a statement.

Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: Thank you, sir.

195 I will be presenting my defence in two parts. The first part is in reference to the accompanying letter. I am asking you that you do the honourable thing this evening and preserve the democratic values that our forefathers fought so hard for in the past, that this petition in its current form is thrown out of Chief Pleas for the following reasons.

200 It is simply unsafe to continue and not possible to make a democratic decision based on a document that has been edited and falsified to deliberately influence the outcome of a motion of no confidence and to deceive the signatories.

I would like to raise the point and seek clarification from yourself in regard to the wording and the editing of the accompanying letter to the motion of no confidence. You will recall, Mr Speaker, last week, despite assurances and promises from yourself that you would supply me with a copy, a written copy, delivered to my house or for me to pick up, of the accompanying letter, you failed

205 to do so. And the first I became aware of this was a member of the public alerted me that this was on the Agenda for Chief Pleas.

So I asked you if you could tell me who compiled and edited the accompanying letter. Was it yourself? Was it a member of the Civil Service? I emphasised to you the importance to me of establishing this. Unknown to yourself, I was in possession of a copy of the original letter. You were unwilling to answer my question, other than to say that you did not know who had edited it and suggested I contacted the Civil Service, which I did. They told me to ask you as they could not be sure either who had edited it. But one thing is sure, it did not edit itself.

210 You may wonder why this accompanying letter and its contents would be of any significance. Well, the reason is I believe the omission of a sentence or two was deliberate and was deliberately edited to besmirch my character and to influence any potential signatory who signed the petition, as it changes the whole context of the letter.

You will be aware the accompanying letter states as published, on the Agenda:

The Douzaine committee will struggle to be repopulated under the current chair's leadership, due to existing style and personality differences. It is my assessment that the Douzaine needs a fresh start ...

220 However, the full letter, this apparently was taken word for word from the original copy of the letter sent to you, Mr Speaker, on 22nd March 2024 by Conseiller Harris. This states, 'The Douzaine will struggle to be repopulated under his leadership' – myself – 'due to existing style and personality differences. I have respect for how hard Frank works and for his engaged approach. It is my assessment the need to fresh start.'

I am sure you would agree the omission of such key words of praise, Mr Speaker, completely changes the whole context of the letter and I believe was deliberately designed to paint me in a bad light and to influence Conseillers to sign the petition.

225 My point is, Mr Speaker, you received this letter. Someone has changed the wording and conveniently missed out part of it which may help me. Neither yourself nor the Civil Service is accepting responsibility for it. The persons who have signed the petition have done so based on the deliberately tampered-with letter, and have not been in possession of the full facts when making a decision to sign. If this petition is allowed to continue and is not removed by yourself, then a full inquiry should be held by an external third party.

230 Before I continue, I would like to ask if you intend to withdraw the petition based on the evidence I have presented. As leader of the House, this is your decision and your decision only. Over to you, Mr Speaker.

235 **The Speaker:** Conseiller Makepeace, I do not like those accusations. They are –

Conseiller Makepeace: They are true!

240 **The Speaker:** One second, please. I will respond to you, (*Interjection by Conseiller Makepeace*) but please give me the courtesy of a response.

Conseiller Makepeace: Of course, sir.

245 **The Speaker:** I quite agree. We had conversations. I said to you at the time that I did not put this together. It is not my job to compile reports for Chief Pleas. They are compiled by whoever it is, be it a Committee or a group of Conseillers. So I do not accept any responsibility for the detail within the report. (**Conseiller Makepeace:** No.) The report was received by me last Wednesday, (**Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes.) and it was then published on the Chief Pleas website. You telephoned me and *demand*ed a copy, that I should take a copy around to you. I do not take kindly to those sorts of demands and I found those demands intimidating.

250 It is as it stands. It is a report drawn up by nine Conseillers and you really need to address those comments to the Conseillers who have drawn up the report accordingly.

255 **Conseiller Makepeace:** No, I am addressing the comments to you, because the correspondence was sent to yourself and there seems to be no trail of where did this go to after it left you? Someone has received this full letter, and then someone has changed it. I was under the impression that yourself in office as a Speaker and the civil servants were supposed to be impartial. So who would have removed those comments? This is just all I am asking.

260 **The Speaker:** Conseiller Makepeace, you are talking to the wrong person. I put the Agenda together, I do not put the reports together. You are talking to the wrong person. You need to address your question elsewhere.

265 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes. So no surprises there. Thank you, Mr Speaker, for your help.

Conseiller Harris: Point of information, if that would help you Conseiller Makepeace, and the and the Chair? Would that assist?

270 **Conseiller Makepeace:** No, thank you. I wish to continue, Mr Speaker, with my defence.

The Speaker: Conseiller Makepeace, we are keen to listen to you, but please keep your comments relevant to the report in front of you.

275 **Conseiller Makepeace:** I would consider them to be very relevant, sir, you may not. (**The Speaker:** No, absolutely.) And a democracy, I think, would also accept that these comments are relevant.

The Speaker: If you give me your assurance that is the case, then please carry on.

280 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Right. This is my response to the motion of no confidence against myself and the Douzaine Committee. Good evening, all. Many of you will recall that at last year's by-election held on 7th September 2023, that Conseiller Harris was elected to Chief Pleas. Many of you will also recall that just 27 days later into his term of office and in the run-up to Chief Pleas held on 4th October 2023, that Conseiller Harris, aided by Conseiller Barker, led an unsuccessful, vitriolic campaign to table a motion of no confidence in the Policy and Finance Committee, and to remove Conseiller John Guille and the Policy and Finance Committee through this motion.

285 The reason for this campaign, in my opinion, was that both Conseillers objected to the terms and conditions of the proposed director of civil servant engagement, and felt rightly or wrongly that too much power would be ceded to Guernsey. Initially, I was involved in this action and supported the motion. However, over the course of the week leading up to the 4th October Chief Pleas, I quickly realised that the reasons behind this motion were, in my opinion, not genuine and were more designed to manipulate the operation of the Policy and Finance Committee and through personality politics remove its Chair, John Guille, as he dared to voice an opinion which suggested closer co-operation between Sark and Guernsey.

295 This campaign descended into a nasty, bitter, personal affair, which I felt I could not support. No thought was given to the aftermath of removing the Policy and Finance Committee and its subsequent repopulation. At the time I mentioned, I previously stated that Conseiller Guille and I would never be on each other's Christmas card list. However, I could not ignore and was impressed by Conseiller Guille's passion and commitment for the Island, and realised he had the best interests of the majority of Islanders in mind.

300 I started to look into more as an offer for the Island and realised that more integration with Guernsey, but still fiercely defending our independence, was the way forward. That it was not control from Guernsey, but the offer of help and guidance which I felt would be in the best interests of the majority of Islanders.

305 Needless to say, with my newfound views of allegiance to Guernsey, or seeking help, this was
not popular with certain newcomer Conseillers, who for reasons only known to themselves,
appeared to oppose any mention or discussion about the benefits of more inter-Island co-
operation. It was very clear to me, despite the excellent support given by our Civil Service, it was
something that was too big and we needed help with.

310 Fast forward today and the vote of no confidence, I believe it is no coincidence that once again,
after being elected to the Douzaine Committee on 17th January this year, Conseiller Harris, just
nine weeks later on 22nd March, aided with his sidekick, Conseiller Barker, are once again at the
centre of a campaign to conspire to remove another Chairman of another lead Committee. And
again, no coincidence, as the current Douzaine Chair, I have been openly outspoken about
315 improving our links to Guernsey and accepting the advice from our Guernsey colleagues.

I believe strongly, currently, there is an underlying attempt by a small group of Conseillers to
systematically work through and remove the leadership and Chairs of all Committees who show
the slightest interest in improving our integration with Guernsey and to repopulate with persons
who represent their isolated views.

320 It is in my opinion, these people are not acting in the best interest of the everyday people of
Sark, but see Sark as some kind of free city libertarian social experiment, with full control exercised
by a commercial corporation, which will bring great financial reward to themselves, but hardship
to the rest of us through unaffordable rental properties and higher cost of living.

325 To finish, Mr Speaker, this vote tonight is *not* a vote of no confidence. It is a vote on whether
or not Sark wishes to be governed by people who actually live and work in Sark, or whether we
want to be governed from beach bars in Ibiza and leather couches in Camden.

Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

330 I would like, at this point, to ask one of the proposers from the private Member's paper to
propose the motion and the Propositions to this.

Conseiller Le Lievre; thank you very much indeed.

Conseiller Le Lievre: Thank you, sir.

335 I represent the signatories of Agenda Item 24, which we are discussing. We are asking the
House to support the Proposition for a vote of no confidence in the current Douzaine Committee,
which is no longer quorate. It is one of our most important nuts-and-bolts Committees that needs
to be repopulated and working as soon as possible. We ask the House to support the Proposition
in order to do this.

340 Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Le Lievre.

Do we have any further questions or debate from the floor before we go to the Propositions?
Any other comments that anyone would like to make?

345 Conseiller Harris; thank you.

Conseiller Harris: Thank you very much, sir.

350 I must congratulate Conseiller Makepeace on his stirring speech. I am not sure how much
relevance it has to the facts of the case. Let's go to the factual point first. What he refers to as a
letter was in fact my email to you, sir, CC-ing Conseiller Makepeace, stating that I was resigning
from the Committee, and I expressed to you my reasons for doing so, after I actually had a very
cordial exchange with Conseiller Makepeace earlier in the day about why I was resigning in the
aftermath of other people resigning. Apparently I am some sort of Svengali who is manipulating
all this behind the scenes. I actually had no idea this was happening until I saw that other Members
355 were resigning.

I had a discussion with the Conseiller about the practicalities of repopulating the Committee. I expressed to him – we did this over email, I would be perfectly happy to have those emails published if he wanted to do so – I made it clear to him that I thought it was not going to be possible to repopulate the Committee under his leadership. So what he refers to as a *letter*, is in fact my email to you, sir, indicating that I would be resigning from the Committee after there had been three initial resignations. I thought it was simply a practical matter that the issue could not go on and we needed to repopulate the Committee.

I did invite the Conseiller to resign along with me. I said, perhaps, we should do it together and make it non-personal. I personally do not have a personal feeling about this. As indeed I said in my email, I have been perfectly happy working with Conseiller Makepeace, but I know that there are some personality and style clashes, and that has made it difficult.

So I think there are good practical reasons for voting for this. I was not actually intending to speak, but I think I should set the record straight because what has just been presented is a fantasy, I have to say, sir. Everything I thought about the new civil servant is readable in *Hansard*, people can go and have a look at that.

I made it clear that my issues with it were lack of information, discussion with Chief Pleas as a whole, the potential constitutional imports of some of the phraseology in the job description. In fact, His Majesty's Procureur, when she came to speak to us, indicated that she not had the matter discussed with her and that it would be better if she *had* had the matter discussed with her. She agreed with me that some of the language in the job description *did* need to be changed. That language was changed and we progressed on from there.

I make no apologies, sir, for having a great love of this Island and supporting self-governance for its independent people and I am sorry that Conseiller Makepeace has felt the need to make a quite scurrilous personal attack on me, I think, sir. That is all I have to say.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Harris.

Does anyone else have any comments they would like to make regarding this motion before we go to the Propositions?

Conseiller Delaney; thank you.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I can see nine signatories, I believe. Nine signatories on this letter that of course only relate to Proposition 1. We also have Propositions 2, 3, and 4 to debate.

I think it is disingenuous of my fellow Conseillers who have put their name to this petition not to do what Conseiller Le Lievre and Conseiller Harris have done, and tell us and the public, the people of Sark, why they put their name to it. I sit down to give, if I may, others an opportunity to speak, if they would. If not, then I would like to come back and re-engage you, if you are happy with that?

The Speaker: During this debate?

Conseiller Delaney: No. What I am saying is I would sit down if other Conseillers who signed this would like to reflect and stand up and add to debate, then I would like to come back. And it is actually Propositions 2, 3 and 4 that I would like to debate.

The Speaker: Very good. Okay.

Conseiller Delaney: I am sorry. Am I not making myself clear?

The Speaker: Not absolutely clear.

410 **Conseiller Delaney:** All right, let me try again. There are *nine* signatories on this. We have heard from two Conseillers. I think it is the responsibility of other people who have signed, can we hear their reasoning why they have signed it? I think the public will want to know why it has been signed. So I am relating my comments to Proposition 1.

I would like to sit down, if I may, and if other Conseillers now, on reflection, would like to give us their reasoning, they can. But I would like to come back and as I am sure you will invite us to do, to give comments on Propositions 2, 3 and 4.

415 Thank you.

The Speaker: Yes, absolutely. I understand what you are saying. I am sorry I misunderstood initially what you were asking for. So therefore, there is a request from Conseiller Delaney.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

420 **Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I just thought I would back what Conseiller Delaney has said there. I think it probably is a reasonable thing in a democracy to hear the other signatories' reasons for this. I think the public would benefit from that.

425 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you for that.

Do we have any other responses to ...? Conseiller Sandra Williams first, followed by Conseiller Plummer; thank you.

430 Conseiller Williams.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you, sir.

I have no personal issue with anybody on the Douzaine Committee. I have, over the last eight or nine months, expressed concern to Members of the Douzaine Committee and through our PDG meeting, that the Douzaine does not appear to be working and doing what it has traditionally done, apart from fighting over whether or not the roads have been done properly or whether the bags from the slaughterhouse are the right size, or whether ...

435 I just feel that the Douzaine is part of Sark's history and, unfortunately, there has been all of this. Personalities have got in the way. I have to work with people who I do not particularly like or socialise with, but we all just have to get on and do what is best for the Island and I think a new populated Douzaine Committee is the way to go forward in order to keep Sark functioning the way it is functioning.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

I will come to you in one second, Conseiller Makepeace. Conseiller Plummer, next, please.

445 Thank you.

Conseiller Plummer: Thank you, sir.

I too can voice up with what Conseiller Williams has just said. I feel that we have had no confidence in going forward with the Douzaine. That is fine.

450 I also say that I am Chair of two Committees and that if I felt that my Committees that I Chair, that I was not agreeing with them, or that this was causing controversy, instead of fighting all this, we should be going forward, not fighting, I would willingly stand down on my Committees to let somebody else take the reins. Conseiller Makepeace did a fine job when he was serving with us on the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee. I cannot speak about the goings-on inside the Committee work, because I am not on the Douzaine, but I just feel that a new constituted Douzaine to go forward, to take this Island forward, it is such an important step. That is what I have to say.

455 Thank you.

460 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Plummer. Thank you very much indeed.
Conseiller Makepeace, back to you; thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir.

465 I would just like to go back to the points made by Conseiller Williams. She says that over the last nine months. First of all, I would like to say that Conseiller Williams, on no occasion, has ever approached me about any goings-on at the Douzaine. I have always been courteous and polite and helpful, and done what I can to try to get the toilets painted at the Tourism Office, and gone out of my way.

470 However, I do take the point that she is saying that the events of the last nine months, because that would, of course, then, in that timeline, include the disgraceful situation with the Old Island Hall, brought about by the previous Chairman, Conseiller Le Lievre (**Conseiller Le Lievre:** Mr Speaker –) and Conseiller Williams. However, as this is a subject of a Code of Conduct complaint, I will refrain from going any further.

Thank you, sir.

475 **The Speaker:** Absolutely. That is important, to remember that, thank you. Let's keep it to the debate in question that we are discussing at the moment. Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

Anyone else like to come back and put their point of view in this debate?

Conseiller Miller; thank you.

480 **Conseiller Miller:** In response to Conseiller Makepeace's request that those of us who signed the vote of no confidence should explain why, I will give you my explanation, Conseiller Makepeace. If you have a Committee where every single person has resigned and the Chairman is left alone, he is not quorate and the Committee cannot function. It is a very important Committee and therefore it needs a fresh start and the effect of the vote of no confidence imposes
485 on Chief Pleas the decision to either back it or not and thereafter to repopulate. That is the reason why I signed the motion.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Miller.

I go back to Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

490

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir.

495 I would just like to say that I think we are actually getting this all wrong, because if the Chairmen of the Committees were actually judged by performance, then I would say that the Medical Committee, which has left us without a doctor, should review their leadership. The Tourism Committee, which has become stale, without leadership or direction, should review themselves, and so on and so forth. But we are not. We are dealing in personality politics. If we were actually dealing with *performances* from the Chairs of these Committees, I dare say that these other Chairs would have been gone a long time ago, but we are not.

Thank you, sir.

500

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

Conseiller Sandra Williams, back to you.

Thank you.

505 **Conseiller Sandra Williams:** I would like to make the point that Conseiller Delaney asked why other people had not stood up and had anything to back on what they have proposed and what they have signed and it is for that very reason.

510 I did not sign the petition to have my recent acts of what I have done with Tourism or not done with Tourism or the Medical ... Everything becomes personal. That is not what Chief Pleas is supposed to be about. I have an interaction with Conseiller Makepeace. I speak to him in the

street. I consider him to be a friend. I did not sign this petition so that he could then come back at me and say ... I signed it for the greater good of Sark.

515 We do not all do things that we are happy to do and I would have much rather have seen this done in a much more grown-up and sensible manner. But it was not done that way. So therefore, it is had to come to Chief Pleas and we have had to make this decision, and we have been asked to justify why we signed it. And to allow yet *more* vitriol and hate against Conseillers that are just trying to do their best.

520 **Three Members:** Hear, hear.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.
Conseiller Makepeace, it is back to you.

525 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes, sir.
I do not see really how pointing out the failures, of which I believe are failures of other Committees, are vitriolic and nasty in any way. It is a pure comment. (*Interjection by Conseiller Sandra Williams*) Sorry, it is me speaking.

530 **The Speaker:** I will come back to you in one second, Conseiller Sandra Williams. Would you like to –?

535 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes, I think it is very relevant because if we want to start managing our Committees and our Chairmen, let's do it that way and let's performance test them every year is what I am saying. There is nothing vitriolic about that. That happens every day in business and corporations. People are assessed on their performance. Why should Governments not be the same?
Thank you, sir.

540 **The Speaker:** Okay. Point has been taken.
Conseiller Delaney, to you first, and then back to you, Conseiller Williams, in one second.
Conseiller Delaney; thank you.

545 **Conseiller Delaney:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, and I am obliged to Conseillers Le Lievre, Plummer, Williams, Miller and Harris, and of course Conseiller Makepeace, perhaps not just on behalf of myself, but on behalf of the people of Sark as well. We are a little more enlightened now as to why we are having such a, if I may, bad night at the office, because this is not good for us.

550 We started on a very positive note from the Chair of Policy and Finance with how we are building the structure of the Civil Service and the efforts that have gone into that and how an important part of our road to becoming a mature, 21st century, fully representative democracy is progressing, and this feels very retrospective to me. But I am obliged to those who did stand up and give their comments. As I said, I think we are better informed for that.
Thank you very much.

555 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Delaney.
Back to you, Conseiller Williams.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Sir, I have decided I have got nothing more to say on the subject.

560 **The Speaker:** Thank you.
Before we move to Proposition 1, does anybody else have anything else they would like to add to the debate; any more clarity, any more points they would like to raise while they have got the opportunity before we go to Proposition 1?

Okay, we will start with Conseiller Harris first, then we will come to Conseiller Bateson and Conseiller Paul Williams. Thank you.

565 Conseiller Harris; thank you.

Conseiller Harris: Thank you, sir.

570 It is just a point of information for Conseiller Makepeace, because he was asking who drafted this document. It does bear close resemblance to my email. I did not actually draft the document, so I cannot help him with who used some phrasing from my emails, but it was not me. So I thought I ought to inform the Conseiller that that was the case.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Harris.

575 Conseiller Bateson; thank you.

Conseiller Bateson: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

580 I would just like to say, I am confident that everybody who signed that are doing it for the same reason that I am: for the benefit of the people of Sark, so we get a functioning Douzaine Committee. It is not something we have done lightly, there are reasons for it, but the main reason I signed that is so we get a Douzaine Committee formed quickly, and get it back on stream.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Bateson.

Conseiller Paul Williams; thank you.

585 **Conseiller Paul Williams:** Thank you, sir.

I agree with Conseiller Bateson there, yes, but I would like to make a couple of points myself. It is not very often I stand up and speak in Chief Pleas, as everybody will know. But quite a few months ago, along with Conseiller Le Lievre, we were both on the Douzaine, and we found it very difficult to work with Conseiller Makepeace, when he decided he was going to come along to the meetings.

590 Eventually we decided, after we were taken to task with what we were doing with the Old Island Hall, to stand down, because we could not work at all with Conseiller Makepeace. And over the past months, since the Douzaine has been repopulated by different people, and watching what is going on, it breaks my heart that I have been on the Douzaine for so long, and early last year we were progressing with lots and lots of things; soon as we resigned, nothing seemed to happen. Nothing was being done at all.

595 I think that that is the main reason that I have signed it, that if it is repopulated, and I can get back on the Douzaine, I would like to move things forward, and at the moment, with all this argy-bargy, there is no moving forward and it is an absolute *disgrace*.

600 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Conseiller Makepeace, it is back to you.

605 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes, sir.

In reply to Conseiller Williams' comments, I would like to give an update, actually. For the last six years or so, the Island has been tipping raw, polluted waste over the Island, over the wall down at Les Laches. Nothing has been done about this during Conseiller Williams' time on the Committee. I recently have taken steps and last week, although I was the only Member on the Committee still, I take my duties seriously and I am not going to walk out on the Committee and leave everyone in the lurch as the other Members have. I am going to stick it out and do what I have been elected to do.

610 So we had a chap called Tim Cunliffe who came over, who has worked previously for H2O Water, who has installed all the systems in the Island for reed beds, etc. He is currently working

615 with South West Water on the Scilly Isles, introducing a sewage/power plant, and I have reliably informed him that he should deal with Mr Guille, rather than deal with the Douzaine, for any personal reasons. And also there is an update as well regarding, at the moment, we do not have a code of conduct or any means of complaints against the Police. As you are aware, I spoke with Mr Ruari Hardy and made progress with that, albeit as the only Member of the Douzaine.

620 So I have not thrown my toys out the pram like the rest of the Committee. I have gone along and still carried out my duties the best I could, and the results of Mr Hardy, as you witnessed by the ... were very positive and I hope that that has laid the foundation for the future Douzaine Committee.

Thank you, sir.

625

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

I would just confirm, yes, I did set up a meeting with Mr Ruari Hardy, the Head of Law Enforcement in Guernsey, and it was an amazingly practical meeting. The Douzaine was not quorate, we made that point at the beginning of that particular meeting, but we have laid the foundations for that closer working relationship with the Law Enforcement officers in Guernsey. So I utterly confirm that that has been happening. However, throughout this whole process, for the last almost three weeks now, the Douzaine has not been quorate. The job this evening is to make the Douzaine quorate again.

630

Conseiller Williams; thank you.

635

Conseiller Paul Williams: May I answer those comments on the sewage system at Les Laches, please? That is not correct. It has been working. It has not been out of action for the past six years. It has been out of action for a while, but last year, before Conseiller Le Lievre and myself resigned, we put in place something to sort it out very quickly.

640

I have been on the Douzaine long enough to know exactly what is going on up in Les Laches. The four tanks that are up there are quite easily sorted out and functioning, if it is done properly, and not getting an expert over to look at them, where it will cost hundreds of thousands of pounds. There is a system that can be put in place there, where maybe £10,000 to £15,000 would sort it out with just a bit of maintenance. Unfortunately, as you can see, I cannot speak very well, but I know what goes on up there. There are not many people that have been in those tanks and cleaned them out – I have. I know what they are all about.

645

So that is quite false, I am afraid. Other things up at Les Laches are not functioning properly. The dumping of all the ash up there through the open burning. We were allowed to dump all the ash from the incinerators. We had an expert come over from Guernsey to tell us that it was quite legal to do that, and that is exactly what we did. But some of the stuff that is being dumped there at the moment is not right, but I gather that was all well covered.

650

Anyway, sorry, that is enough.

The Speaker: Okay, Conseiller Williams.

655

It just once again confirms that we absolutely need a functioning Douzaine, with a mandate, and that is quorate. It reinforces that.

Conseiller Guille; thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

660

This is obviously a very emotional subject on several different sides, but I would just like to, being aware that we have 24 Items on the Agenda tonight, sir, and after this one we have got 20 left, this comes down to a matter of numbers with regard to the Douzaine. I have spoken to Conseillers myself. It does not seem as if there is going to be enough people willing to reconstitute the Douzaine with, unfortunately, Conseiller Makepeace as Chair, hence why people have signed this motion of no confidence, in order to resolve this situation. And like I said, I have spoken to Conseillers, I think I know which way this vote is going go.

665

I think we have heard from everyone who may wish to speak so far, I think everyone has made their points, I would like to put to Conseiller Makepeace there is obviously still an opportunity to resign his position, and it is ultimately down to trying to reconstitute a Douzaine which is quorate and which can get on with the very important business that this Committee does.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille, for those words of wisdom. Finally, Conseiller Makepeace. Thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: Just say, sir, that I will not be resigning because I do not see that I should be the victim of personality politics, because which Committee will be targeted next? I am standing here for the people of Sark that I represent. I spend more time on this Island than a lot of the Conseillers who spend less time in Sark than a seagull.

So there we go, sir. I am not resigning at all.

The Speaker: Okay. You have made your position quite clear, Conseiller Makepeace.

So I think we have discussed this in some detail. It is clearly a very heated debate and there are divisions on each side, but now comes the nitty-gritty of getting to the vote. So what I would like to do is to vote on Proposition 1.

Conseiller Delaney; thank you.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Could we have a named vote on this, please –?

The Speaker: You would like a named vote? Okay.

Conseiller Delaney: Merely Proposition 1, I am asking for –

The Speaker: Only on Proposition 1? (**Conseiller Delaney:** Thank you.) Okay. Yes, we can organise that. Just give us two minutes to get the paperwork in place.

So I will just remind you that what we are voting on is Proposition 1, which is Chief Pleas has no confidence in the Douzaine.

If you agree with that statement, it is pour; if you disagree with that statement, it is contre. So it is a straightforward two-option vote: pour for in agreement and contre if you are against. So I will ask the Greffier to call out the names.

Thank you, Greffier.

There was a named vote.

Carried – Pour 13, Contre 2, No Vote 0

POUR

Conseiller Edric Baker MBE
Conseiller Tony Le Lievre
Conseiller Paul Williams
Conseiller Sandra Williams
Conseiller Jolie Booth
Conseiller John Guille
Conseiller Christopher Kennedy-Barnard
Conseiller Andrew Miller
Conseiller Helen Plummer
Conseiller Marcus Barker
Conseiller Scott Sullivan
Conseiller Benjamin Harris
Conseiller Christopher Bateson

CONTRE

Conseiller Frank Makepeace
Conseiller Kevin Delaney

NO VOTE

None

The Speaker: That is Proposition 1, which has been **carried**: 13 votes pour, and 2 votes contre, against. So that Proposition is carried. So therefore, once again, just to reconfirm, that means that
705 the Chief Pleas votes that it has no confidence in the Douzaine. That is Proposition 1.

Proposition 2 is that Chief Pleas shall repopulate the Douzaine. So at the moment, we have no Douzaine, we now wish to repopulate the Douzaine and we need seven Conseillers in order to repopulate the Douzaine. So initially I am going to ask for nominations from the floor. You can nominate yourselves. We are not going to take any vote on those individual nominations until we
710 have got all the nominations together.

So can I ask the question, please, if you wish to be part of the new Douzaine ...
Conseiller Delaney, thank you.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
715 Will we get a chance to debate the Proposition before we actually go looking for Members?

The Speaker: Probably not, because we already had that debate.

Conseiller Delaney: We have had the debate about not having confidence in the Douzaine as
720 it was, because there are some points I would like to make that I think are relevant, and helpful and constructive, to the repopulation of the Douzaine. (**The Speaker:** Okay.) I can speak?

The Speaker: Once again, we have no Douzaine at the moment, but I hear what you are saying,
725 (**Conseiller Delaney:** Absolutely correct.) and therefore there is an opportunity for you to make a statement.

Conseiller Delaney: Okay. You are happy for me to speak, yes? (**The Speaker:** Thank you.) Okay;
and I hope it will be taken as constructive comments.

Mr Speaker, of course we have got to repopulate. We took an hour to get to where we all knew
730 we were going to be, quite frankly, but that is democracy. We tried to make a whole decision as open and transparent as we possibly could over the past hour.

We are now going to take nominations from the floor of the House, as you rightly say, to repopulate the Douzaine, and I am going to address my comments, if I may, to Conseiller Le Lievre and Conseiller Paul Williams. We are aware we do not need to go any further than note that they
735 are currently subject to a complaints procedure.

I talked earlier about how we are trying to strengthen our standing as a democracy, the great works being done to strengthen our Civil Service. I have no idea if they are considering putting themselves forward or being nominated to be on the reconstituted Douzaine, but I would ask that they give some consideration to perhaps not putting their names forward at this moment in time
740 with this complaints procedure hanging over them. So that once they have had an opportunity to, one would hope, clear their names, then they could seek a future opportunity to come onto the Douzaine.

I think it would be good for the House. I think it would be good as to how we see ourselves. There is speculation in the media over the complaint. There is not a lot of information out there,
745 but unfortunately, in the absence of any information, a vacuum is created and of course it is filled with speculation and gossip.

My interests are not at a personal level. My interests are in protecting the integrity, trying to continue the journey that we are on and building our integrity as a democracy.

And I would put this to them, if I may. If we are struggling to populate the Douzaine, which we may do, I am perfectly happy to put my name forward to sit on the Douzaine, subject to being
750 elected by my fellow Conseillers, with the caveat that once the complaints procedure is over, I would willingly step down to give an opportunity for either Conseiller Williams or Conseiller Le Lievre to then go on to the Douzaine at that point. So really that is all I want to add to this debate.

Thank you.

755 **The Speaker:** Okay. Thank you, Conseiller Delaney.
Does anyone have any response to that? I think Conseiller Le Lievre first, followed by
Conseiller Bateson, followed by Conseiller Paul Williams.
Conseiller Le Lievre; thank you.

760 **Conseiller Le Lievre:** My response to this is that I have every intention of putting my name
forward. If it is that I am found to be guilty of something once I am a Member of the Douzaine,
and the guilt attached to that is sufficient that I should no longer be on the Douzaine, then I will
stand down or be told to stand down. But in the meantime, I see the complaint as smoke and
mirrors as far as this particular vote is concerned anyway, and no, I am not going to refuse to put
765 my name forward.
Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Le Lievre.
Conseiller Bateson; thank you.

770 **Conseiller Bateson:** Thank you.
As I see it, Conseiller Le Lievre and Conseiller Paul Williams work along the lines where you are
innocent until proven guilty. Otherwise, it would be wrong. So stick with it.

775 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Bateson.
Conseiller Paul Williams; thank you.

Conseiller Paul Williams: Thank you, sir.
Both Conseiller Le Lievre and Conseiller Bateson have said what I was going to say anyway. And
780 yes, I am going to put my name forward for the reconstituted Douzaine, and I am not going to
take my name away at the moment.

The Speaker: Okay. As Conseiller Delaney said, democracy will prevail, so I am really pleased
that we have had this debate. We all know, I think, where we stand. So unless anyone has any
785 further comments they would like to make, we will go to Proposition 2. And Proposition 2 is that
Chief Pleas shall repopulate the Douzaine. So I am asking for nominations from the floor for those
people who would like to stand to go on the repopulated Douzaine. We will deal with individual
hands first and then we will vote on each of those individuals separately.

As I said, we are looking to achieve seven people for the new Douzaine. So therefore, if I could
790 have a show of hands for those people who would like to put their name forward to be elected to
the Douzaine, and please keep your hands up.

So, starting here, Conseiller Paul Williams.

Conseiller Tony Le Lievre, thank you very much indeed.

Conseiller Jolie Booth, thank you very much indeed.

795 Conseiller Bateson, thank you very much indeed.

Conseiller Barker, thank you very much indeed. You can put your hands down on that side now.
On this side, we have Conseiller Harris. Thank you very much indeed.

We have currently six people who are putting their name forwards. Do we have any other
nominations from the floor to join the Douzaine?

800 Conseiller Barker first; thank you.

Conseiller Barker: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I would like to nominate Conseiller Delaney, please.

805 **The Speaker:** Are you happy with that Conseiller Delaney?

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

No. I gave my reasons for my motive for putting myself forward. My motives were about the interest of the House, our integrity, etc. I think a sad evening for the House has got even sadder,
810 but we leave it at that.

But no, thank you; no thanks.

The Speaker: So therefore, we have six names.

815 Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir. I would like to put my name forward for membership of the Douzaine. I have relevant experience.

Thank you, sir.

820 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

So we currently have seven names who would like to join the Douzaine. Do we have any additional names of anyone who would like ...? Conseiller Sandra Williams; thank you.

So we now have eight names. Any advance on eight names? (Conseiller Sandra Williams: Eight?) Eight names. Let me just read out those names for clarity, please. We have, in no particular
825 order, Conseiller Bateson, Conseiller Harris, Conseiller Barker, Conseiller Booth, Conseiller Sandra Williams, Conseiller Paul Williams, Conseiller Makepeace and Conseiller Tony Le Lievre. That is eight people to join the Douzaine. Any advance on eight? Okay, so it is eight people.

So therefore, I would ... Conseiller Makepeace.

830 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes, sir. I wish to withdraw my name and allow the fine standing citizens, the Conseillers, to populate the Committee.

Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: You are withdrawing your name –

835

Conseiller Makepeace: Of course, sir.

The Speaker: – from the election? Okay.

840 So therefore, just to recap, for the purposes of *Hansard* and clarity, we have Conseiller Bateson, Conseiller Harris, Conseiller Barker, Conseiller Booth, Conseiller Sandra Williams, Conseiller Paul Williams and Conseiller Tony Le Lievre. That is seven new people to join the Douzaine.

I would therefore propose a block vote. Once again, please raise your hands clearly, for those seven people to join the new Douzaine. Please, will you ... Sir?

845 **Conseiller Le Lievre:** Sir, can we vote as well?

The Speaker: Yes, absolutely. Individuals can vote for themselves. (**Conseiller Le Lievre:** Okay.) Absolutely you can.

850 So we have seven nominees of people who would like to join the new Douzaine. So therefore can I ask for a show of hands for those seven people. I will repeat them just one more time. This is important to get this right: Conseiller Bateson, Conseiller Harris, Conseiller Barker, Conseiller Booth, Conseiller Sandra Williams, Conseiller Paul Williams and Conseiller Le Lievre. That is seven people. Those in favour of those people joining the new Douzaine, please raise your hands. Okay. And those against? Nobody against. I call that as **carried**, that the new Members of
855 the Douzaine as elected are Conseillers Bateson, Harris, Barker, Booth, Sandra Williams, Paul Williams and Le Lievre.

Thank you for that. A difficult debate, but it is democracy in action. Thank you for bearing with us.

860 Now then, the next phase is I am going to call a recess, because I would like to ask those seven Members to withdraw from the Assembly, and I have arranged for upstairs to be open, upstairs by the Committee Office, if those seven people would like to withdraw. We will take a recess for 10 minutes.

865 When you come back, I would ask you to be in possession of whether you want to proceed or not with Proposition 3 and Proposition 4, or whether you would prefer those Propositions to be dealt with within the next Douzaine meeting, which is technically what should happen. And also to come back with a decision as to your preferred course of action with regard to Agenda Item 9, Agenda Item 15, Agenda Item 16 and Agenda Item 21, which are all Douzaine Agenda Items and they are forthcoming.

870 Please, when you return to the room, will you have that information with you. So thank you for that. We will take a 10-minute recess now. Let's call it a quarter past six, if we could return for 25 past six, please.

*Chief Pleas adjourned at 6.15 p.m.
and resumed its sitting at 6.28 p.m.*

**Motion of No Confidence in the Douzaine –
Letter from nine Conseillers –
Debate concluded –
Propositions 3 and 4 withdrawn**

The Speaker: Thank you very much indeed. That is pretty good timing. That is just two minutes over 10 minutes. Thank you for reconvening.

875 So the seven new Members of the Douzaine adjourned and have now re-entered the room. Can I ask those seven, what are your preferred wishes with regard to Proposition 3 and Proposition 4, which are currently before us? Do you wish to proceed with those Propositions or otherwise? Who would like to speak on behalf ...?

Conseiller Bateson; thank you.

880 **Conseiller Bateson:** Thank you, Mr Speaker. We have had a discussion and (*Interjections*) we would like to withdraw those two, please, yes.

The Speaker: Very good, thank you. (*Interjections*)

885 **Conseiller Bateson:** So we just withdraw them, yes –

The Speaker: Withdraw them. Okay. If I could therefore request, at your first Douzaine meeting, if you could elect a Chair and a Deputy Chair, and then let the Speaker know, and I will let the Office know, and we will put it on the Chief Pleas website.

890 **Conseiller Bateson:** Yes. We have decided who it is going to be, but we will discuss it further tomorrow, in a proper minuted meeting, and we shall let you know after that.

The Speaker: I think that is wise. Thank you.

895 And can I further ask you, while you are on your feet, do we have a spokesperson when we get to Agenda Items 9, 15, 16 and 21?

Conseiller Bateson: We have decided that we ...

900 **The Speaker:** No, I do not wish to know now, I am sorry, Conseiller Bateson, but just as long as somebody is prepared.

Conseiller Bateson: Yes, there is a spokesperson.

905 **The Speaker:** What I am trying to avoid is another recess.

Conseiller Bateson: Yes, I will be the spokesperson for that.

The Speaker: Great. Okay. Thank you very much indeed. (**Conseiller Bateson:** Okay.)

910 So there we are. Propositions 3 and 4 have been removed in order that the Douzaine can go away and consider the Chair and the Deputy Chair, and report back to the Speaker and to the Committee Office, and those results will be posted on the Chief Pleas website as soon as we have them.

So there we are; half past six.

**4. Reform (Election of Conseillers) (By Election) (Sark) Ordinance, 2024 –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition and By Election timetable from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'By Election' and to approve the Ordinance entitled 'The Reform (Election of Conseillers) (By Election) (Sark) Ordinance, 2024'.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approves 'The Reform (Election of Conseillers) (By-Election) (Sark) Ordinance, 2024'.

915 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 4 – moving along – to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'By Election' and to approve the Ordinance entitled the Reform (Election of Conseillers) (By Election) (Sark) Ordinance, 2024 and I would like to ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.

Thank you.

920

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

I am not going to read the Report verbatim. This is a simple Proposition to approve the by-election, which has been mentioned already tonight, on 15th May of this year.

Thank you.

925

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille; thank you very much indeed.

Does anyone have anything that they would like to talk about or debate with regard to the Report attached to this Proposition? Very good.

930 In which case, therefore, let's move to the Proposition which reads as follows: that Chief Pleas approves the Reform (Election of Conseillers) (By Election) (Sark) Ordinance, 2024. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

Thank you very much indeed.

**5. Charities and Non Profit Organisations (Registration) (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2024 –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘The Charities and Non Profit Organisations Registration’ and to approve the Ordinance entitled ‘The Charities and Non Profit Organisations (Registration) (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2024’.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approve ‘The Charities and Non Profit Organisations (Registration) (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2024’.

The Speaker: Agenda Item 5, which is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘The Charities and Non Profit Organisations Registration’ and to approve the Ordinance entitled the Charities and Non Profit Organisations (Registration) (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2024.

Once again, if I could ask Conseiller Guille to present, introduce the Report. Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

This Report relates to strengthening rules around charities and non-profit organisations (NPO) and I am sure many of you can guess this is coming about due to the forthcoming Moneyval assessment for the Bailiwick.

Just to give you the short highlights on this, there are not too many charities and NPOs in the Island which actually come under this. And indeed, with consultation that happened between the various charities and those in Guernsey who have been drafting this legislation, further exemption powers were inserted into the legislation quite recently to further take account of the types of charities and NPOs which are operating in Sark, so that this extra legislation did not become a burden upon them.

I would ask Conseillers to support this very sensible legislation, which is ultimately to protect the Bailiwick against money laundering and funding of terrorist organisations.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Are there any questions or debate from the floor regarding the Report that you have got before you and the Ordinance which you have seen? Any comments? Very good.

If that is the case, then let us go to the Proposition, which reads as follows: that Chief Pleas approve the Charities and Non Profit Organisations (Registration) (Sark) (Amendment) Ordinance, 2024. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

Thank you very much indeed.

**6. Amendment to the Control of Dogs Legislation –
Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee entitled ‘Amendment to the Control of Dogs Legislation’.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas directs the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee to instruct the Law Officers of the Crown to prepare an amendment to ‘The Control of Dogs (Sark) Ordinance, 1970’ as detailed in the above report.

960 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 6, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee entitled ‘Amendments to the Control of Dogs Legislation’ and I call on Conseiller Plummer to introduce the Report.
Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

965 **Conseiller Plummer:** Thank you, sir.

The amendment to the Control of Dogs legislation, the Control of Dogs (Sark) Ordinance, 1970. The ... [*Inaudible*] dogs has now become onerous on the pet owner, while the actual legislation has proven to be effectively unenforceable. The Committee believe that section 1 of the Ordinance, being the restriction on unsprayed dogs, is no longer applicable in Sark and should be
970 repealed. The Committee notes that any puppies arising from accidents would be the responsibility of the dog owners, as would preventing such accidents happening in the first place. A move to repeal section 1 of the Ordinance is supported by the States Vet, David Chamberlain.

I hope that this would go through. In the early days when this was brought forward to a historic House, it was while to keep dogs from moving around animals and upsetting them. Now we have
975 a lot of people with pets; they are pets more than working dogs now. We do have a few working dogs, but they are kept remarkably under control. I only hope that this can go through.
Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

980 Does anyone have any points they would like to raise from the floor, or questions for the Committee regarding the amendment to the Control of Dogs legislation which you see before you. Any comments? Any points? Any observations?
Conseiller Sandra Williams; thank you.

985 **Conseiller Sandra Williams:** I am going to try and sneak this into the *control* of dogs and see how we go.

It is been brought to our attention over numerous months and years now about the dog fouling. While we are looking into the control of the dogs, could we not try and add in a section of the Control of Dogs being dogs have to be on a lead? It is a control of the dog, not allowing a
990 dog ... I do not want to stop dogs from being able to run around the fields and have fun, but what I do want to do is stop fouling the roads where our visitors are walking.

I went to the HSBC bank yesterday morning and passed five different types of dog poo. Got back to my garden and I had two lumps in the gate of my garden, too.

995 I just wondered, I know it is very difficult to control the dogs that are not on a lead, and everyone is always saying it is all very well, but it actually is very difficult to control, but surely, if we could bring in one step to having dogs on the public thoroughfare or on the public highways being on a lead, it just might stop, basically what is happening. I see many people who do stop and pick up, but there is an awful lot who do not.

1000 There are an awful lot of dogs that are on leads permanently and there are five or six dogs that are not, and I just think we should be seen to be leading the way to trying to control some of this. I wondered if it was something that could be looked into through the legislation, the amendment of Controlling Dogs, whether it would slip in somewhere there, and if not, could you look into it, please? I think the public would really appreciate it.

Thank you.

1005

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.
Conseiller Plummer, would you like to respond to that?

1010 **Conseiller Plummer:** Yes, certainly. We have looked into this problem; there is quite a few years, in fact. David Chamberlain came over and we had a lengthy meeting about it. It is a very common problem, and Guernsey also is in here, and it is very difficult to have it policed. But I can look into it and see if there is anything again that can be done.

1015 He suggested having the dogs chipped or having some sort of device that you looked at the poo and you could send it away and it would tell you which particular owner, the animal, and this is absolutely true, I know my poos, and that we could do something about it. It would, however, be costly. But that was about four, five, even six years ago. I can take it back and relook at it again and get in touch and see what we can do.

Thank you.

1020

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.
Conseiller Williams, are you happy with that? (**Conseiller Sandra Williams:** Yes.) Yes.
Thank you.
Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

1025

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir.

I think just to add to Conseiller Williams and from those remarks, we could possibly establish a poo police and the DNA testing would probably be a bit harsh at the moment, because we are suggesting that it is just animals, and it would determine whether it was human or animal waste, sir.

1030

Thank you.

The Speaker: That is an interesting aside, Conseiller Makepeace, but thank you for bringing that to our attention.

1035 Anyway, back to the important business. Therefore, any other comments from the floor regarding the Report that you have before you? No.

In which case, we will go to the Proposition, which is: that Chief Pleas directs the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee to instruct the Law Officers of the Crown to prepare an amendment to the Control of Dogs (Sark) Ordinance, 1970, as detailed in the above Report. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

1040

Thank you very much indeed. Very good.

**Procedural –
Douzeniers' swearing-in**

The Speaker: I would just at this point ... There is something I forgot during the heated debate on Agenda Item 24. Those Members who have been elected to the new Douzaine, please would you remain behind after this Meeting. I have arranged for the Court to effectively swear you in,

1045 even if you have been on the Douzaine previously, you stood down from the Douzaine, you now re-join the Douzaine, and we have to go through that process again.

So please, those seven people, you know who you are, will you remain afterwards in order that the Seneschal and the Court can swear you in as new Douzeniers. Thank you. My apologies for not mentioning that earlier.

**7. Amendments to the Medical and Emergency Services Committee Mandate –
Medical and Emergency Services Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Medical and Emergency Services Committee entitled 'Amendments to the Medical and Emergency Services Committee Mandate'.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approves the amendments to the Medical and Emergency Services Committee Mandate.

1050 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 7, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Medical and Emergency Services Committee entitled 'Amendments to the Medical and Emergency Services Committee Mandate' and once again, Conseiller Plummer, if I could ask you to introduce the Report, please.

Thank you.

1055 **Conseiller Plummer:** Thank you very much.

It is an amendment; it is housekeeping, really. We would like to change the following Mandate, if it is all right with the House.

1060 The Sark medical are the people that we wish to invite to our Committee meetings when they should be needed, but we would like to take them off our Mandate. And that would be the Sark Medical Officer, the Chief Fire Officer, the Chief Ambulance Officer, the officer in charge of special constables, the Sark constables, and the Senior Harbourmaster are to be removed as *ex officio* members, and instead may be invited to attend meetings as deemed relevant and necessary by the Committee. And I would just like to ... It is good housekeeping, if the House approves.

Thank you.

1065 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

Before we go to the Proposition, does anyone have any points they would like to make?

Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

1070 **Conseiller Makepeace:** I would just like to make a comment about the situation with the doctor, or ask a question, because I think she has been treated disgracefully and that it would appear to be almost a constructive dismissal of the doctor. And I would like to ask what is in place, when we say we are going to get a doctor for two months, are we going to get a doctor for two months at £700 a day for a locum, which would be approximately £40,000?

1075

Conseiller Bateson: Point of order, please.

The Speaker: Yes, one second. Conseiller Makepeace, thank you.

Conseiller Bateson; thank you.

1080

Conseiller Makepeace: Thank you, sir.

Conseiller Bateson: Is this relevant to what we are debating at the moment?

The Speaker: I do not believe it is.

1085

Conseiller Bateson: Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you for that point of order. Conseiller Plummer, would you like to confirm that?

1090

Conseiller Plummer: Yes, I will confirm. It is not relevant.

The Speaker: Okay. So Conseiller Makepeace, the point you are making is not valid to this debate.

1095

Conseiller Makepeace: Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: Thank you.

Did I see some other hands up there? Anyone else like to speak regarding this Report? Any other comments from the floor? Okay.

1100

In which case, let's go to the Proposition, which is: that Chief Pleas approves the amendments to the Medical and Emergency Services Committee Mandate. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

Thank you.

**8. 2023 Financial Statements –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition with appendices from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled '2023 Financial Statements'.

Proposition:

That the Financial Statements of the Island for the year ended 31st December 2023 be adopted.

1105

The Speaker: Agenda Item 8, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled '2023 Financial Statements'. The papers for this Report were submitted late due to an admin issue, but they have now been in the public domain for a week and they are attached to the Report for Agenda Item 8. And I would therefore ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.

1110

Thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

I am not going to go through the figures in detail. Suffice to say this is the first year, in recent times, as previously requested by Chief Pleas, that our finances have been audited, by the Perkins Group, and that was a very successful audit. It did not throw up any major problems. Some simple recommendations which we are acting on that have come out of that and I would like to offer my great and sincere thanks to Sarah Hudson and the team in the Treasury for all the extra out-of-hours work that has gone on in order to hit the deadlines for this audit process in the first year, and I can only hope that it will be an easier task in years to come.

1115

1120 Great thanks from the Policy and Finance Committee, but I also think from the rest of Chief Pleas, because the Treasurer acts obviously for every spending Committee on Chief Pleas.
Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

1125 Does anyone have any points they would like to raise or questions that they would like to ask about the Report?
Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir.

1130 I would just like to echo the comments of Conseiller Guille and extend my thanks to Sarah Hudson, the Treasurer, more so for her shrewd investments with Island money, which has actually brought in quite a bit of money, I think, through her shrewd use of Island funds, and long may it continue.
Thank you, Ms Hudson; thank you.

1135 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

Does anyone else have any comments that they would like to make about the Report and the 2023 Financial Statements? No? Okay. Thank you for that.

1140 So let's therefore go to the Proposition before you, which is that the Financial Statements of the Island for the year ended 31st December 2023 be adopted. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Very good.

**9. Sunday Tractors –
Douzaine Report considered –
Proposition withdrawn**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Douzaine entitled 'Sunday Tractors'.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas directs the Douzaine to instruct the Law Officers of the Crown to prepare an amendment to 'The Road Traffic Offences (Motor Vehicles and Bicycles) (Sark) Law, 2013' and 'The Motor Vehicles (Sark) Law, 2013' as detailed in the above report.

The Speaker: Moving next to Agenda Item 9, which is a Report from the Douzaine. So to consider a Report with Proposition. Yes, Conseiller Bateson; thank you.

1145 **Conseiller Bateson:** The Douzaine would like to withdraw this until we have had a chance to discuss it in detail.

The Speaker: Okay. Could I just finish the instruction (**Conseiller Bateson:** Yes, sorry.) and then ask you just for clarity, for the sake of the recording? Thank you.

1150 So the Agenda Item 9 is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Douzaine with a Proposition entitled 'Sunday Tractors'.
Conseiller Bateson, thank you, could you repeat what you said?

1155 **Conseiller Bateson:** I shall repeat: the Douzaine would like to withdraw this until they have had a chance to discuss it.
Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you. Very good.
The Report is therefore withdrawn. Thank you.
1160 Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: I would just like to say I think it is not exactly a good move to postpone this now, because when the next Chief Pleas comes along, we will be in June, and the idea of allowing more freedom on the roads on Sundays was for the hoteliers, people in the hospitality industries and everything else to be able to function. So delaying this for three months I do not think is a very wise move regarding the tourism industry and anyone who relies on a tractor on a Sunday.

Thank you, sir.

1170 **The Speaker:** Yes, thank you.
Conseiller Le Lievre; thank you.

Conseiller Le Lievre: Thank you, sir.

1175 However laudable the Proposition might be, the current Douzaine do not feel that they can make a decision on something that they have not discussed.

The Speaker: Thank you for that clarity.

Okay. So Agenda Item 9 has been withdrawn, to be brought back at the next available, convenient Meeting. Very good.

10. Hydrogeological Study – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Propositions carried

To consider a Report with Propositions from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Hydrogeological Study'.

Proposition 1:

That Chief Pleas instructs the Policy and Finance Committee to employ a qualified hydrogeologist to investigate the water supply quality and availability on Sark for current and future island needs.

Proposition 2:

That Chief Pleas approves the provision of funding for a hydrogeological scoping study, as mentioned in Proposition 1, with a budget not exceeding £5,000.

1180 **The Speaker:** Moving on to Agenda Item 10, therefore, which is to consider a Report with Propositions from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Hydrogeological Study'. I would like to ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.

Thank you.

1185 **Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir.

A secure water supply, both in terms of quantity and quality, is vital for sustaining life and promoting good health. Sark's water supply is provided from ground sources such as wells and boreholes, both of which require power to access. To a lesser extent, water is provided via catchment. The matter of power security is being dealt with as a separate important matter by Chief Pleas and is outside the scope of this Report.

1190

I have got a correction here. It should read the recent Property Company proposals have suggested that Sark could support a much greater population than it currently does. However, such a broad statement without supporting evidence is meaningless.

1195 In the case of the water supply, a current hydrogeological assessment needs to be undertaken and we had been drawn to reports from several years ago suggesting that the Island could support, I think it was around 700 people. Then we have separately, the Committee was approached to initiate such works, and we are very grateful to the help of Dr Norwich for looking into this for us and so he has in turn spoken to a professor at Southampton University, who is proposing to conduct a study on water supply for the Island. I think this is at a very reasonable
1200 cost and I would urge Conseillers to support what could be a pretty critical paper examining the building blocks of Island life.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

1205 Does anybody have any questions or debate regarding Agenda Item 10, the Hydrogeological Study, before we go to the Proposition?

Conseiller Williams first, followed by Conseiller Delaney. Thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: It is not controversial, sir. It brings me on to a matter that I have
1210 already discussed with Policy and Finance through my Tourism hat. We had acknowledgment from the Guernsey board of health last year that they were coming to Sark to conduct some borehole and well testing, quality and quantity. On asking after they had been for the results of those said tests, we were informed that they were not for us, they were for the Environmental Health in Guernsey. Because under the new Law that we passed 18 months ago, two, three years ago, the
1215 food and feed, Guernsey Environmental Health takes responsibility for water testing.

So I asked our water tester in Sark, who is well known to everybody in the Island, to make enquiries through the board of health in Guernsey, to Charlotte, to try and get some results of some of these tests. And to this day, we still have not had them.

1220 I wondered whether it would be worth Policy and Finance, with their stronger and bigger hat on, approaching them. Whilst I realise it is not quite as serious as what they are looking to do, I do think that the tests that were taken on the 10 boreholes would be interesting for Sark to have, and would be interesting to see whether it would be a starting point moving forward.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

1225 Conseiller Delaney, you were next.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I think that is a very interesting point, Conseiller Williams; certainly educating me on that matter. I think it would be essential we get this information.

1230 I merely wanted to stand up to say that I will be supporting this Proposition. It is a great initiative, very little money, and a good move forward, I believe, for the Island.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Delaney.

1235 Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard: Thank you.

I just thought I would say that I will be supporting this Proposition as well, and I support what
1240 Conseiller Sandra Williams has requested there.

I think with water quality, we are all drinking this, we are all showering in this water from these boreholes. I suspect there is a disparity in the quality in different parts of the Island and I think we need to be looking for more than just *e. coli* and chloroforms. There are lots of other things that

can actually be harming us as a population and it is very important that we test for those other things and that we know that we have safe water to drink and shower in and bathe in, and whatever else.

1245

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you very much indeed, Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard.
Back to you Conseiller Guille; thank you.

1250

Conseiller Guille: Yes, thank you, Conseillers Delaney and Kennedy-Barnard for the support. Thank you, Conseiller Sandra Williams, for the question. That certainly sounds like very useful pieces of data and I would suggest that we will make a request and I think the obvious place to send the data will be to this professor conducting this report.

1255

Likewise, I think I can say to wider Chief Pleas and to the public, I know certainly myself, I have done it with my own water supply, I have tested the water, and if anybody does have any recent or historical results I think they would probably be useful from all areas of the Island for the professor conducting this study.

1260

And then I think, off the back of that, we can develop policies for the future, because if the water is bad in your borehole, it is almost certainly going to be a similar situation in some of the boreholes nearby. So hopefully this can be developed into a wider piece of work so we can more actively monitor the state of water which we all rely on and which we all share as a community in Sark.

Thank you.

1265

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Before we go to the Proposition, does anyone else have any comments they would like to make or questions regarding the Report that you have got, Agenda Item 10?

1270

In which case, thank you. We have two Propositions. let's take them one by one. Proposition 1 reads: that Chief Pleas instructs the Policy and Finance Committee to employ a qualified hydrogeologist to investigate the water supply quality and availability on Sark for current and future Island needs. Those in favour? Thank you. That is **carried**; Proposition 1 is carried.

1275

Proposition 2 reads that Chief Pleas approves the provision of funding for a hydrogeological scoping study, as mentioned in Proposition 1, with a budget not exceeding £5,000. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried**. Thank you. Both those Propositions are carried.

Thank you very much indeed.

**11. Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee Mandate –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee Mandate'.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approves the amended Mandate to the Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee, as attached to this report.

The Speaker: Moving to Agenda Item 11. Agenda Item 11 is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled the 'Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee Mandate' and I would ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.

1280

Thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir. I must apologise, firstly, that I am presenting all the Reports tonight. Our recent P&F meetings we forgot to share out the presenting of reports. So sorry you have got to listen to me again and again tonight, but this is hopefully another pretty straightforward Report.

1285 This Report and this Proposition is in relation to adding, and clarifying, which Committee is responsible for the Avian Influenza and Control of Birds Ordinance, 2006, because obviously there is nationally and internationally a current outbreak of avian flu, and the States Vet in Guernsey were uncertain about which Committee they should be directed to in Sark on this.

1290 And if you read the reports, it gives an interesting history on the Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee, in that it first came into existence in April 2006 as the Avian Influenza Committee and then it was not until 2010 that it changed to the Sark Influenza (Human) Pandemic Committee. And now what we are proposing is that it covers both human pandemics and avian pandemics as well, and I have a correction. So this is a Proposition to approve the amended Mandate and I have a correction to that amended mandate, which is printed out and on the tables in front of all the
1295 Conseillers, unfortunately not in the papers that the public may have.

In the published papers, number (1) in the Mandate says:

1.To prepare and co-ordinate any and all measures necessary to deal with a possible pandemic outbreak of COVID-19 on Sark.

That is a mistake. That is far too specific for the Pandemic Committee. So the corrected Mandate, which we are asking Chief Pleas to agree tonight, would read, in the Mandate:

1.To prepare and co-ordinate any and all measures necessary to deal with a possible pandemic outbreak on Sark.

1300 So it has removed that specific reference to COVID-19, and then, just for completeness, to follow on, number (2) in the Mandate is:

2.To carry out the functions of "the committee" under The Avian Influenza and Control of Birds (Sark) Ordinance, 2006.

So I would ask fellow Conseillers to approve this Mandate change for the Pandemic Emergency Committee.

Thank you.

1305 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Just for clarity, the Proposition remains the same; the Proposition has not changed.

Conseiller Guille: Yes, sir. The Proposition remains the same. It was an error in the drafting of the Mandate.

1310

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you for talking us through that.

Does anyone have any questions for Conseiller Guille regarding the Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee Mandate? Any questions or queries?

Conseiller Harris; thank you.

1315

Conseiller Harris: Thank you, sir. Thank you for the description of why this is happening, Conseiller Guille.

1320 When was the last time this Committee met? I am wondering if ... (A Member: Twenty twenty-two.) Twenty twenty-two. So I am wondering if it would not make more sense to, I do not know if there will be any requirements to have regular discussions on the Avian Influenza and Control of Birds Ordinance or not, but would it not make more sense to put it onto a Committee that has more regular meetings?

1325 I, for one, am hopeful that the Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee will not be required to meet for many years to come, or indeed ever again. So it is more of a practical point, but is it not hard to get the Chairmen of the Committees together to discuss something like this? Would it be better, I do not know, under P&F or under Agriculture or something like that?

The Speaker: Thank you.
Conseiller Guille; thank you.

1330

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, Conseiller Harris.

I am very tempted to answer that we last met when there was last a pandemic, (*Interjection*) which is painfully obvious.

1335 I believe the logic behind it is that the Pandemic Committee is constructed with Chairs of other main Committees in order to be able to have a good overview of the goings-on in the Island and to be able to introduce measures swiftly and effectively when drastic actions need to be taken. I think that is why it was originally set up as the Avian Influenza Committee in 2006, to be more of a ... This is not for ongoing procedures with birds. It is in the case of a serious emergency when drastic emergency measures need to be implemented by the States Vet.

1340 It would have all be under the guidance of the States Vet, but it was just felt that it was probably the most appropriate Committee set-up to implement Island-wide emergency measures that might ... thankfully, I have not had to live through that in relation to bird flu, but I can see the parallels to similar Island-wide emergency measures that had to be introduced in the human pandemic. So I hope that gives some sort of sense.

1345 Hopefully it is a Mandate that will never get used in anger, but I think that gives some sense of why it was appropriated to that Committee, which covers, through its constitution, the Chairs of a lot of the main Committees of Chief Pleas, sir.

Thank you.

1350 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Does anyone else have any comments or observations they would like to ask Conseiller Guille while we are dealing with this report? No?

1355 In which case, let's go to the Proposition, and the Proposition reads as follows: that Chief Pleas approves the amended Mandate to the Sark Pandemic Emergency Committee as attached to this Report. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? **Carried.**

Thank you very much.

**12. Public Liability Insurance for Accommodation Providers –
Tourism Committee Report considered –
Proposition carried**

To consider a Report with Proposition from the Tourism Committee entitled 'Public Liability Insurance for Accommodation Providers'.

Proposition:

That Chief Pleas approve the recommendation from the Tourism Committee, that for the purposes of being granted an Accommodation Permit under 'The Tourism (Sark) Law, 1982', the accommodation provider shall have Public Liability Insurance.

The Speaker: Agenda Item 12. Where are we? Five past seven. Agenda Item 12, to consider a Report with Proposition from the Tourism Committee entitled 'Public Liability Insurance for

1360 Accommodation Providers' and I would like to ask Conseiller Sandra Williams to introduce the Report.

Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you very much.

1365 This is a bit of Tourism housekeeping. If I might just ask, I have reread the last paragraph, and it says:

If the proposition is approved the change would be applied under section 8(g) and come into force immediately.

1370 I think we have four businesses at the moment who do not have public liability, two of which are awaiting permits because they have not had the appropriate water tests; fire. So I would just like to ask Conseiller Williams and Conseiller Plummer if they would be happy to strike out that bit that says 'and come into force immediately' because it would seem unfair that people who have had their permits now until the end of February next year would fall under this as of now and we will not actually have the legislation drafted up in time for that. But on reading the Report, it asks that it comes into force immediately.

1375 I just want to be aware that there are four or five people that are waiting on their permits who should not automatically have to pay and pay out the extra as of now.

The Speaker: Okay. So it is a correction to the Report –?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: It is a correction to the Report.

1380 **The Speaker:** Okay. So you are asking that of Conseiller Plummer and Conseiller Paul Williams?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: To agree the change on that. It is only when I reread it earlier on today that I realised what the implications may mean.

1385 **The Speaker:** Yes. And would the plan be to just withdraw that statement from the bottom?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: It would just say it is proposed 'the change would be applied under section 8(g).'

1390 **The Speaker:** Right. After 'section 8(g)'?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Yes, because it would be section 8(g) in the Tourism (Sark) Law.

1395 **The Speaker:** Very good. Conseiller Plummer, Conseiller Paul Williams, are you happy with that proposal?

Conseiller Plummer: Yes, we are. We have discussed this previously and we are happy.

1400 **The Speaker:** Right. Okay. So therefore, for the purposes of the Report, not the Proposition, the final sentence in the Report now reads: 'If the proposition is approved the change would be applied under section 8(g).' That is the end of the Report. (**Conseiller Sandra Williams:** Yes.) Does anyone have any questions of Conseiller Williams regarding this Report? Any questions; any observations? No.

1405 In which case, let's go to the Proposition, which reads that Chief Pleas approve the recommendation from the Tourism Committee, that for the purposes of being granted an accommodation permit under the Tourism (Sark) Law, 1982, the accommodation provider shall have public liability insurance. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? Thank you. **Carried.**

**13. Royal Assent –
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered**

To consider an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Royal Assent’.

The Speaker: Agenda Item 13, which is an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Royal Assent’. Could I ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report?

1410 Thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

I have not read out some of the Reports in full, but I am going to read this one out, because I think it is such a significant step forward for Sark and for the other Islands of the Bailiwick.

1415 At the Extraordinary Chief Pleas 24th May 2023, Item 4, under the title of ‘The Grant of Royal Assent to Projets de Loi, Counsellors of State and other constitutional Matters’ the Committee presented a policy letter issued by the Policy & Resources Committee of the States of Deliberation of the Island of Guernsey proposing an alternative Royal Assent process.

1420 Previously, Royal Assent was granted to Projets de Loi – Projets – by His Majesty the King acting through the Privy Council. That process relied on regular meetings of the Privy Council, and timely review of Projets by UK ministers, acting in their capacity as Privy Counsellors. The policy letter proposed an alternative Royal Assent process whereby His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor could grant Royal Assent on behalf of the Privy Council, unless the Projet was specifically reserved for consideration by the Privy Council.

1425 It was suggested that the alternative process for granting Royal Assent should result in faster processing of legislation, would not be reliant on existing schedules for Privy Council meetings, and would also underline the Bailiwick’s domestic legislative autonomy and international identity. The Committee now presents to Chief Pleas a copy of the Order in Council, which came into operation on 29th February 2024.

1430 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Does anyone have any questions or comments regarding this Information Report from Policy and Finance?

1435 Yes, Conseiller Sandra Williams; thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I would just like to say how pleased I am to see this finally in front of us, sir. I know that over the years of 2008 to 2012, when we were trying to do our Reform Law, it was hard going, with the Privy Council taking most of the summer off. So I think this is a giant step for mankind.

1440 Thank you very much.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

1445 Does anyone else have any comments to make on this Information Report from Policy and Finance? No. Very good. There are no Propositions attached to it. It is an Information Report and clearly you have taken it on board. So thank you for Policy and Finance, for bringing this to our attention, as Conseiller Williams says, after a long time in gestation.

**14. Safeguarder Annual Report –
Medical and Emergency Services Committee Report considered**

To consider an Information Report from the Medical and Emergency Services Committee entitled 'Safeguarder Annual Report'.

1450 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 14, which is to consider an Information Report from the Medical and Emergency Services Committee entitled the 'Safeguarder Annual Report' and I would ask Conseiller Plummer to introduce the Report.

Thank you.

1455 **Conseiller Plummer:** Thank you, sir.
May I hand this over to Conseiller Sandra Williams, please?

The Speaker: Very good.
Conseiller Sandra Williams; thank you.

1460 **Conseiller Sandra Williams:** I thank you, sir.
There is not really very much that I can add to this Report. It is a full and inclusive Report of everything that our Safeguarding Officer does in the Island. There is a lot of information here, with no names next to a lot of it, and that is because of what is within the Report.

1465 We must apologise, though, on behalf of the Medical and Emergency Committee, because this Report was supposed to have been brought to you in October. It got filed under miscellaneous, and it was only unearthed when Conseiller Plummer and myself were talking to the Safeguarder recently about some up-and-coming changes.

So it is just a Report. We hope you appreciate how much work is done in the Island and will continue to be done in the Island and I would just like to thank the Island Safeguarding Officer, the Sark Constable responsible, the teachers and everybody else that makes this happen.

1470 Thank you very much.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Williams. Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

It is an Information Report. Does anyone have any questions of the Committee regarding the Report?

1475 Yes, Conseiller Delaney; thank you.

Conseiller Delaney: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1480 Not so much a question, but an observation. I think it is an excellent Report, and with your permission, I would like to just read two or three sentences out of it. They really touched me and I think they really encompass the work of the Safeguarding Officer and all of the team.

She notes that:

We have a rising demographic of elderly residents, a lot of whom have family and friends that help with day-to-day issues. [But] Sadly, there are some residents who do not have this cushion of support and I have been able to pick up on many of these to help –

– which I find very encouraging and I think that is very commendable. And she finishes with:

Sark and its residents have always had a great sense of Community and it is difficult to imagine that Safeguarding is necessary, [but] sadly it is but also [is] such a positive asset to Sark and all its residents as there is help and support out there in times when people may feel most alone and desolate.

And once again, I just really would like to record my appreciation for their support.

Thank you.

1485 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Delaney.
Does anyone else have any further comments they would like to make regarding this Report? No.
In which case, I would say thank you to the Committee for bringing it forward, and once again thank you for taking the time to read it and respond to it.

**15. Handling of Complaints against the Constables –
Report withdrawn**

To consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled 'Handling of Complaints against the Constables'.

1490 **The Speaker:** So moving on to Agenda Item 15, which is to consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled 'Handling of Complaints against the Constables'. Once again, I am going to turn to Conseiller Bateson to ask for a decision about this.

1495 **Conseiller Bateson:** The Douzaine would wish to withdraw this until they have had a chance to consider it in a meeting.
Thank you.

The Speaker: Very good. Okay. So Agenda Item 15 is withdrawn until such time as the new Douzaine have had the opportunity to consider it. Thank you for that.
1500 Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir.
I am quite concerned about this, because at the moment there is no mandate in place. The mandate was never handed back to the Douzaine. So effectively we do not have any machinery in place for anyone to make a complaint against the Constables. Are we now expected to go to the next Chief Pleas, are we; in three months' time, go another three months, leaving ourselves open to risk of a complaint with no machinery to deal with it?
1505 Thank you, sir.

1510 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.
I think, and I do not wish to necessarily respond on this, but I would suggest you have got the option of bringing it back to the Midsummer Meeting, or there is an opportunity, if the Douzaine so wish, if the urgency is there, then to bring it back to an Extraordinary Meeting between now and the Midsummer Meeting.
1515 Conseiller Bateson.

Conseiller Bateson: I would like to say this is just an Information Report, and us withdrawing it today, and for later consideration, is not going to delay or speed anything up ... *[Inaudible]* There is not an action involved here.

1520 **The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Bateson, for that clarification.
So that Report has been withdrawn.

**16. Commercial Rubbish Charges –
Report withdrawn**

To consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled ‘Commercial Rubbish Charges’.

1525 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 16, which reads to consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled ‘Commercial Rubbish Charges’ and once again I would like to ask Conseiller Bateson to make a statement.

Conseiller Bateson: Yes. The Douzaine would like to wish to withdraw this Information Report as well, for the same reason as before, because we have not had a chance to consider it yet.

1530 **The Speaker:** Thank you. (**Conseiller Bateson:** Thank you.)
Yes. Once again, it is an Information Report which will be brought back to Chief Pleas at the next convenient opportunity.
Thank you, Conseiller Bateson.

**17. Tourism Annual Report –
Tourism Committee Report considered**

To consider an Information Report from the Tourism Committee entitled ‘Annual Tourism Report 2023’.

1535 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 17, which is to consider an Information Report from the Tourism Committee entitled ‘Tourism Annual Report’ and I would like to ask Conseiller Sandra Williams to introduce the Report.
Thank you.

1540 **Conseiller Sandra Williams:** Thank you very much.
I do not really have very much to add to what has already been written down, because it has been done quite recently. We have had better news relating to cruise ship passengers. There will be cruise ships coming this year. Not as many as before, but there will be more than none, which is what we thought we were going to end up with at the beginning of the end of last season.

1545 The advertising has been going very well and has had some very good feedback. Obviously the authoress that came over here, JK Rowling, has given Sark quite a boost on media and on Instagram and other things, and all I can say is that the Committee do their best and the officers do their very best to try and promote Sark for everything it has to offer.

1550 I know people think that we do not do as good a job as we can do, but I assure you that, with my hand on my heart, I do everything I can do, that is possible to do, with the very small amount of money that we take in to promote our home and our Island.
Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.
Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

1555 **Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Yes. Just a thought on tourism. I know that Guernsey publishes a full report of their strategy for the next upcoming year or two. Is there a way we could do something like that in Sark? I know tourism is one of the biggest concerns of the average person I speak to. They would like to see an uplift. They do not understand exactly how it functions or how

1560 it is working for us. Is there a way we could look to have some sort of published report in the future to let people know exactly what we are trying to do?
Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you for the question.

1565 Conseiller Williams, would you like to respond to that?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: We work very closely with Visit Guernsey and when they put their project forward for what they are going to do for the up-and-coming season, we share and collaborate through items that they are doing that we could never do.

1570 I think it is an interesting question, and if there were more hours in the day, I am sure we could sit and plan what is going to happen through the rest of ... We normally have an idea by March of every year where our money is going to be spent, but we do have, and I am more than happy that that is available in the Office at any time for anybody to go and collect, but we do also do a lot of last-minute offers and last-minute people come along and they say, 'Oh, we're doing such and such, would you like to sponsor it or support it? It evolves.

1575 So yes, I take on board it would be lovely to have a plan in December for what is going to happen for the following year, but Sark is very dependent on Guernsey and we believe that our money and our time spent working with Guernsey is the best money we can spend.

1580 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Williams.
Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard: Thank you, Conseiller Sandra Williams.

1585 I obviously take on board your comment about hours in the day and all of us are volunteers for filling these roles as Conseillers. However, I would say that the Tourism Committee, as far as I am aware, is the Committee that meets the least of perhaps almost any on the Sark Government Committees.

1590 I think people would just like to see through a report or there to be more transparency, so people know exactly what is going on and how we are moving forward, and how we plan to tackle these many challenges in getting increased tourist numbers to the Island so that the businesses and people in the Island can have more of a thriving economy, because I think we have to move towards that. It just seems crucially important.

So that is pretty much what I have to say on it. Thank you.

1595 **The Speaker:** Okay. Thank you for those comments. Conseiller Williams. I will come to you in a minute, Conseiller Makepeace.
Conseiller Williams; thank you.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you very much.

1600 I think the week just gone we had 17 emails from the Tourism Committee, through the Tourism Committee, from the Office asking us to make decisions on one thing or another. We do not meet every five minutes because I personally, along with another Member of the Committee, go to the Office twice a week on a regular basis. We did seven inspections last week of properties that fall very low on the level of what people coming onto Sark expect.

1605 Yes, I admit, we do not have a meeting every four or five weeks, but the Committee is a busy and active Committee, and we get much more done through email in the evenings when other people have more time on their hands than having a structured meeting in the diary once every three or four weeks.

1610 We could have meetings every month, but most of the stuff that happens is dealt with prior to the meeting arriving. We have to deal with stuff as and when it happens, not at the end of every six weeks or four weeks when other Committees have them to manage. It is an everyday, evolving

Committee. Every day there are Committee decisions to make, every day there are problems that have to be dealt with and it is a very busy Committee. So that is my answer to that.

1615 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Once again, Conseiller Makepeace first, coming back to Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard in a second. Just one second.

1620 **Conseiller Makepeace:** Yes. I would just like to say, in defence of the Tourism Committee, I think they have one of the most difficult jobs going, because it is not actually their job to, though it might be seen as part of their job, to create interest in the Island, but they are not responsible for the attractions in the Island, or the lack of attractions. So I think it is a very difficult task that they face. And plus the fact that none of us know from day to day how many people are going to arrive, the spending habits of those people, what they intend to do.

1625 I think that we need – and this is not a fault with the Tourism Committee – to be collecting more data, from whatever way we can, and to analyse that data and to try to find ways of improving the numbers through this. Because at the moment, we are just waiting every day, and there is 20 here today, or there is 50 here today, and we do not know what they are going to do. And it is a difficult thing. I do not think that is the responsibility of the Tourism Committee.

1630 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Makepeace.

Conseiller Williams, do you want to come back on that or go to the next question?

1635 **Conseiller Sandra Williams:** I would just like to thank Conseiller Makepeace.

It is not a very easy job. We do have, and we are able to, collate information from people landing in Guernsey and people coming from Jersey. Obviously we have our landing tax every year, that is in the accounts, that tells you how many people have visited Sark.

1640 We do collate a lot of information from the new computer system we have in place. Unfortunately, we have fallen foul of the Easter holidays this year and I was not able to get some up-to-date, last-minute information about exactly who is using what in order to find where Sark is, what the domain name is, what the most popular search engine is. But that sort of information, I am hoping, will be available and it is our intention, in the up-and-coming six weeks, to have a Tourism Forum meeting along with Sark Shipping to look at things that maybe have not worked quite so well last year to try and improve things moving forward.

1645 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

1650 **Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Just a couple more quick points. I do wonder, Conseiller Williams has alluded to the challenge and the work involved, and obviously every one of us in this Island wants to see the tourist numbers boosted significantly. It is vital if the Island is to survive. I do wonder if maybe increasing the numbers of Committee Members on that particular Committee might help share that workload and yield a better result perhaps. That is one side of things.

1655 The other thing I wanted to say was will you commit to publishing a marketing strategy for tourism, for, let's just say, 2025 now? Would that be possible, Conseiller Williams?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: I will discuss it with our Committee at our next meeting.

1660 **Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you, Conseiller Williams.

1665 This is an Information Report from the Tourism Committee. Before we draw this to a close, does anyone else have any comments or observations, before we move on to the next Agenda Item?

Okay, thank you very much indeed.

**18. Isle of Sark Shipping Annual Report –
Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee Report considered**

To consider an Information Report from the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee entitled 'Isle of Sark Shipping Annual Report'.

The Speaker: Let's therefore discuss Agenda Item 18, which is to consider an Information Report from the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee entitled 'Isle of Sark Shipping Annual Report'. Conseiller Williams, you are back on your feet.

1670 Thank you very much indeed.

Conseiller Sandra Williams: Thank you very much.

1675 Again, I have nothing further to add, apart from, hot off the press this afternoon, we thought it would be a very hot topic this evening: where is the *Corsaire*? She is in St Sampson's. She has a cracked drive plate. So anybody who is aware of cracked drive plates in a boat will know that the part has been ordered. It has yet to arrive, because Evri really are not that reliable, and as soon as everything is ready for that part to be put in, and as soon as the part arrives, it will be fitted and the *Corsaire* will be back with us.

1680 And the *Venture* – shiny, spanking, lovely *Venture* – is not able to run tomorrow to do with an MCA inspection, which is why there are some differentials on the timetable. The cargo boat is doing two boats out of Sark, two boats out of Guernsey, to sort the rotation out for tomorrow. And that is from Sark Shipping at four o'clock this afternoon.

The Speaker: Thank you for that clarification.

1685 Have you got anything else to add to the Report? (**Conseiller Sandra Williams:** No.) No? Does anyone have any questions relative to the Report?

Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

1690 **Conseiller Makepeace:** It is just I am not sure what an MCA report is. I suppose it is 'marine' something is it? Or is it like an MOT or something?

Conseiller Sandra Williams: It is. It is an MOT.

1695 **Conseiller Makepeace:** All right. (*Interjections*)

Conseiller Guille: It is the Maritime and Coastguard Agency

Conseiller Makepeace: Oh, okay, thanks.

1700 **The Speaker:** Thank you for that clarity.

Thank you for that Report. Any further questions regarding that Information Report from the Harbours, Shipping and Pilotage Committee? Thank you.

Yes, Conseiller Williams; thank you.

1705 **Conseiller Sandra Williams:** Sorry, I was just going to say that there has been a growing concern over the last eight months of the prices of the vessel bringing visitors from Guernsey to Sark and it is something that we have been discussing. We did run some special offers over the Easter period, where the parents or safeguarders were £22 and the children were £2, and it made a real big difference on the boats for those days.

1710 I am hoping that we can encourage Sark Shipping and the directors of the company to take note of the changes that have ... the difference it has made. And just as one aside, we did Mother's Day as an experiment this year because it was on the Sunday that there was not a boat, and we had 96 people from Guernsey that day. It is out of season, but obviously, for families in Sark, it worked really well.

1715 The one thing I would really like people to do is give some feedback on the prices that are currently being charged for the overnight stays in Guernsey. For a family to come from Guernsey to Sark for the night, it is £76 without the children. Unfortunately ... I have never quite understood the mechanics of why it costs us £18 to go to Guernsey in the morning and come back for that £18, but if you go to Guernsey on the four o'clock boat in the afternoon and come back on the 1720 11 o'clock boat the next morning, it is £37.

I just think that now really is the time that we need to start drilling, because that all makes such a difference to people coming here for the day, for the night. It would encourage more people, even from Guernsey or from Jersey, if they could get something that was more realistic. It is cheaper to go to Weymouth or Poole than it is to actually come to Sark overnight, and that is something that I think collectively, as Conseillers and the public, we really need to be looking into moving forward with the company.

Thank you very much.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Williams.

1730 What you cannot see is lots of nodding behind you. (**Conseiller Sandra Williams:** Okay.) Thank you for that.

Does anyone else have any comments on the Information Report from Harbour, Shipping and Pilotage? In which case, thank you for that.

19. Annual Tax on Enveloped Dwellings – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered

To consider an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Annual Tax on Enveloped Dwellings'.

1735 **The Speaker:** Let's move on to Agenda Item 19, which is an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled the 'Annual Tax on Enveloped Dwellings', abbreviated to ATED, and I would ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.

Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

1740 **Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir. I think it is another one that is important to be read out in full. Sark Property Transfer Tax in respect of property owned by companies is under intense scrutiny. The current Law is insufficient in this matter, as it creates a loophole for companies that own property to be sold without change to the Cadastre, therefore avoiding paying Sark Property Transfer Tax, which is similar to UK Stamp Duty. This therefore denies the Sark people a valuable source of income.

1745 One of the currently prominent thoughts is the introduction of an Annual Tax on Enveloped Dwellings, ATED, which would negate the loss of revenue on subsequent disposal of the property. Other ideas of interest include making the companies legally required to pay Sark Property

1750 Transfer Tax. If this were the choice, then the proposal brought to the House for debate would include that any approved change in the Law would be with effect from this date to avoid sales of companies owning property in Sark being disposed of before the necessary and lengthy process of the enactment of the Law.

1755 It is also realised that the policing of such disposals of property by sale of the company could be difficult, as there would be no change to the Cadastre. The purpose of this written report to Chief Pleas is to put on notice all interested parties, and in particular potential purchasers and vendors of companies that own property in Sark, that they will be subject to some sort of taxation for the exchange of property.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

1760 Does anyone have any comments or observations they would like to ask about this Information Report from Policy and Finance?

Conseiller Harris; thank you.

Conseiller Harris: Thank you, sir.

1765 I just want to thank Conseiller Guille for bringing this to the House. I think this is an extremely important Information Report, particularly as I like that there is a flexibility in there to consider either an ATED or making the companies legally required. This is clearly a very important matter. I am glad that thought has been put into it. I wholeheartedly support it.

1770 I think Conseiller Guille and I do not agree on everything, but it is important to recognise that this measure attracts very widespread support across the House as a revenue-raising measure.

The Speaker: Okay. Thank you, Conseiller Harris.

Back to Conseiller Guille; thank you.

1775 **Conseiller Guille:** Thank you for the comments, Conseiller Harris, and I must put a special thanks to Conseiller Miller, who has put a considerable chunk of work into this.

1780 In addition to those words of support, both Policy and Finance Committee, and I think I can speak for the Taxation Special Committee also, would welcome any ideas from Conseillers and likewise members of the public for any novel solutions that we can arrive at to deal with this problem. And in more general the issue of taxation in Sark, which I think is widely recognised is becoming less sufficient for the drains on our budget that are required in the modern world; and it is becoming more widely recognised that are probably less fair than they should be across the community.

1785 So this is certainly something which taxation, we keep coming back to it on various Committees, as budget being the source of a lot of issues, and it is widely recognised taxation has to change, or has to develop in one form or another, and I would just encourage Conseillers and members of the public to please approach either of those two Committees with any suggestions that they may have.

Thank you.

1790

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

They are of course points that have been made previously.

Conseiller Delaney; thank you.

1795 **Conseiller Delaney:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

It is probably appropriate that I note for the record that my day job is that I represent Sark Developments Ltd, who are a substantial land and property owner in the Island.

I, too, in line with Conseiller Harris, welcome the idea that there is a choice being offered here, and I think working on the basis of what would satisfy a reasonable man or a reasonable woman,

1800 I would be fully supportive of the levelling up of Property Transfer Tax in the Island. Regardless of who or what entity sells the property, moves the property on, each sale should be subject to the Property Transfer Tax.

I am supportive of the fact that if this came to the House that it would become in effect immediately, and a matter of interest and observation, the only certainty around company ownership of large tracts of land and property in the Island at the moment is the uncertainty, of course.

1810 I note that the Sark Property Company, their hope is to buy up 40% of the property in the Island. If I was the Treasurer, I would be salivating at the prospect of all those transactions happening and money coming into the exchequer. I think there should be no difference, whether it is a company owning property or individuals owning property. When a property changes hands on this Island, it should be subject to Property Transfer Tax.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Delaney.

1815 Does any anyone have anything else they would like to add to this Report from Policy and Finance before we close? There is nothing to vote on, no Propositions, but the points have been well made and I am sure you will take them on board.

Thank you for presenting that Agenda Item 19.

20. Chief Pleas Rules of Procedure – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered

To consider an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Chief Pleas Rules of Procedure’.

1820 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 20 is to consider an Information Report from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Chief Pleas Rules of Procedure’, and once again I would like to ask Conseiller Guille to present this Report.

Thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir; for the last time tonight.

1825 It is a simple Information Report to notify Chief Pleas that the Rules of Procedure have now been updated to include the Budget Meeting in November as one of our statutory Meetings of Chief Pleas, and I hope this has been a welcome change. I think it has, whilst not making the Treasury’s job easy, it is a more sensible position in the year for this Meeting. And it is just notifying the House that this is now officially in the Rules of Procedure of Chief Pleas.

1830 Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille, for confirming that.

An Information Report, does anyone have any questions of Conseiller Guille while we are looking at this?

1835 So there we are, the new Rules of Procedure are in operation and have been for a while. Very good. Okay, we skipped along really well – gosh, 20 to eight.

**21. Appointment of Assistant Constable –
Douzaine Report considered**

To consider a Verbal Report from the Douzaine entitled ‘Appointment of Assistant Constable’.

The Speaker: So let us move to Agenda Item 21, which is to consider a Verbal Report from the Douzaine entitled the ‘Appointment of Assistant Constable’.

Conseiller Bateson, what would you like to do with this one?

1840

Conseiller Bateson: I would like to give a Verbal Report on this one, please. Yes.

The Speaker: Very good. Thank you.

1845

Conseiller Bateson: On Saturday, 6th April, three applicants for the Assistant Constable position were interviewed by Constable Charlie Turner, Philip Falla from the Guernsey Coroner’s Office and the Constable secretary. Following those interviews and after discussion with Constable Paul Burgess, the decision was made to offer the job to Jordan Burton. We would therefore ask that Jordan Burton is proposed at the Easter Chief Pleas on Wednesday, 10th April.

1850

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Bateson.

So there we have it. That is a Verbal Report from the Douzaine.

Conseiller Makepeace; thank you.

1855

Conseiller Makepeace: Yes, sir.

I would just like to ask Conseiller Bateson how he became in possession of this information? As on Saturday, he was not a Member of the Douzaine, when I as Chair was unaware of this. Does he have some sort of connection to the Constables or what? And in what capacity would he have been notified on something?

1860

Thank you, sir.

The Speaker: I will actually answer that question, Conseiller Makepeace. It is a very valid question. I will answer that question.

1865

This was given to me in a sealed envelope this afternoon to present to the new Douzaine. So the first person that had knowledge of it was not me, but it was the new Douzaine, and that is the process. It came from the Committee Office to the new Douzaine. So perfectly open, transparent and above board.

Conseiller Makepeace: This evening or this afternoon?

1870

The Speaker: It was handed to me at 4.30 this afternoon.

Conseiller Makepeace: And when would the new Douzaine have had knowledge of this?

1875

The Speaker: As they broke, after Proposition 2, I had the envelope and I gave the new Douzaine Members the envelope to consider as they withdrew from the Assembly. *(Interjection by Conseiller Makepeace)* So there is no skulduggery. It was all perfectly open and transparent.

Conseiller Bateson first, followed by Conseiller Guille.

1880

Conseiller Bateson: I would just like to confirm, I have an envelope here with a seal on there, *(Laughter)* which I was given earlier this evening. If anybody wishes to inspect it, come see me after the Meeting. *(Interjections)*

The Speaker: Yes, I can vouch for all of that.

1885 Conseiller Guille; thank you.

Conseiller Guille: Thank you, sir.

1890 I would just like to thank the new Douzaine for bringing that forward and allowing the Constables to continue with the sterling work they do for the Island in a difficult job and getting them back up to a full complement as soon as possible. Thank you for acting swiftly on that.

Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you, Conseiller Guille; thank you Conseiller Bateson. Thank you, Conseiller Guille for that clarification.

1895 So there we are, we are still here. Agenda Item 21. No, it is not, we have done that. *(Interjections)* Agenda Item 22. *(Interjection)* I am being asked the question do we have to vote on the Assistant Constable and the answer is no. It is a given.

Thank you.

22. Committee Elections – None

1900 **The Speaker:** Agenda Item 22, which is Committee Elections, to elect Conseillers to Committees as required. I have got here a list that was printed off for me again this afternoon. The Douzaine has been repopulated, so the vacancies that were on the Douzaine have been filled. The Douzaine is now fully filled.

1905 We have vacancies on two other Committees. We have one vacancy on the Future Energy Committee. Let's deal with that first. Do we have any nominations, self-nominations or Committee nominations, for anyone to join the Future Energy Committee, which is currently missing a Member? Anyone keen to join the Future Energy Committee? No? Okay.

So that Committee will remain as is and I will just confirm the Committee comprises Conseiller Guille, Conseiller Le Lievre, Conseiller Miller and a non-Chief Pleas member is Anthony Beaumont. And that is the Committee; the Future Energy Committee.

1910 The other vacancy that we currently have is on the Top Level Domain Committee. We have one vacancy there. Is anyone keen to want to nominate or be nominated to join the Top Level Domain Committee? Okay. Not much appetite for that. It is a shame. The Top Level Domain Committee comprises of Conseiller Le Lievre, Conseiller Harris and Conseiller Delaney, and non-Chief Pleas members, Mr Roger Norwich and Mr Mike Locke, as the two non-Chief Pleas members. So that
1915 Committee, therefore – there is no appetite to join it – remains as is, on Agenda Item 22.

23. Committee and Panel Elections – None

1920 **The Speaker:** Let's move, therefore, to Agenda Item 23, which is Committee and Panel Elections, to elect non-Chief Pleas members and Panel members to Committees and Panels as required. Do we have any nominations from the floor to join any Committees, particularly? No? That is a familiar answer, but I would just reiterate, those Committees who think, and it was mentioned by Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard, if any Committee feels it might benefit from having additional input, please let those particular Committees know and those proposals can be brought back to Chief Pleas for future Meetings, so it has been discussed previously.

So thank you for that.

**Midsummer Meeting deadline –
Statement by the Speaker**

1925 **The Speaker:** And with that, we will all breathe a sigh of relief at quarter to eight. I would just make one closing statement, if I may. Please be aware that the Midsummer Meeting of Chief Pleas is on Wednesday, 3rd July, and that the Agenda closes for that Meeting on Wednesday, 5th June. Wednesday, 5th June for that Meeting, the Midsummer Meeting, on 3rd July.

And with that, I declare the Meeting closed at just past a quarter to eight.
Greffier, the prayer; thank you.

PRAYER

The Greffier

Chief Pleas closed at 8.47 p.m.