



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**CHRISTMAS MEETING**

**OF CHIEF PLEAS**

**OF THE**

**ISLAND OF SARK**

**HANSARD**

**Assembly Room, Sark, Wednesday, 22nd January 2025**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official Island of Sark Chief Pleas website [www.sarkgov.co.uk](http://www.sarkgov.co.uk)*

**Volume 11, No. 2**

**Present:**

**Seigneur**

Maj. C M Beaumont Esq.

**Speaker of Chief Pleas**

P M Armorgie Esq.

**Deputy Prévôt**

J Godwin

**Greffier**

T J Hamon

**Treasurer**

S Hudson

**Constable**

C Turner

**Assistant Constable**

Jonathan Godwin

**His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey**

Lt. General Richard Cripwell CB, CBE

**Conseillers:**

Jolie Rose

John Guille

Christopher Kennedy-Barnard

Andrew Miller

Helen Plummer

Marcus Barker

Scott Sullivan

Benjamin Harris

Carol Cragoe

Michael Locke

Natalie Tighe

Christopher Bateson

David Curtis

Edric Baker MBE

Mary Nicolle

James Martin

Steven Lord

## Business transacted

Unveiling of portrait of His Majesty King Charles III by His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor ...	4
Declaration of interest forms – Statement by the Speaker .....	5
Conduct of Conseiller-elect Makepeace – Statement by the Speaker .....	5
Induction and training day for Conseillers – Statement by the Speaker.....	6
Statements .....	6
Education Committee – Statement by Conseiller Rose .....	6
Community Power Project and public meeting – Statement by Conseiller Guille .....	7
La Coupée inspection and stabilisation work – Statement by Conseiller Guille.....	7
Procedural – Electronic devices.....	9
<b>Business of the Day.....</b>	<b>10</b>
1. Questions not related to the Business of the Day – None.....	10
2. The Domestic Abuse and Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried .....	10
3. Amendment to the Constitution & Operation of Chief Pleas Committees – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	14
4. Change of Mandate – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	15
Procedural motion – Reordering of Business – Motion carried.....	17
10. 5th Committee Member – Taxation Review (Special) Committee Report considered – Proposition carried.....	17
5. Annual Information Report and Crawfish Conservation Report 2024 – Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee Reports considered.....	18
6. Sark School Annual Report – Education Committee Report considered .....	18
7. Seasonal Regulation No.2 – Douzaine Report considered.....	19
8. Seasonal Regulation No.4 - 2025 – Douzaine Report considered.....	20
9. Constables Report – Douzaine Report considered .....	20
Procedural motion – Completing Extraordinary (Special) Meeting Agenda – Motion carried .....	25
Committee Elections – Policy and Finance: Conseiller E Baker MBE elected – Taxation Review (Special): election deferred .....	25
Committee and Panel Elections – Policy and Finance: Mr A Mancini elected.....	27
Easter Meeting deadline – Statement by the Speaker.....	32
<i>Chief Pleas closed at 6.42 p.m. ....</i>	<i>33</i>

## Christmas Meeting of Chief Pleas

*Chief Pleas met at 5 p.m.*

[THE SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

### PRAYER

*The Greffier*

### ROLL CALL

*The Greffier*

**The Greffier:** There are 17 Conseillers, the Seigneur and the Speaker of Chief Pleas present.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Greffier. Thank you very much indeed.

### Unveiling of portrait of His Majesty King Charles III by His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor

5     **The Speaker:** So once again, welcome to the Christmas Meeting of Chief Pleas, technically 2004. It is 2005 now. We are going to start proceedings – *(Laughter and interjection)* Twenty-five, thank you. Exactly. And I would like to begin by saying a warm welcome to His Excellency, the Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick. And this evening, a little bit of ceremony, as you may have noticed. I would like to invite, on behalf of Chief Pleas, His Excellency to unveil our  
10 new portrait of His Majesty King Charles III. I have asked Sue Daly to come and photograph the occasion.

So without further ado – it is all very highly organised – Sue is going to stand over there and His Excellency will proceed.

15     **The Lieutenant-Governor:** Ladies and gentlemen, I should just say before I unveil the portrait of His Majesty what an honour it is to do so. His Majesty is, I think you all are well aware of his love for this Island and he was I know – because he told me so – bitterly disappointed that he could not come here last year. But if anyone was in any doubt about the strength of the relationship between this Island and the monarchy, and the King in particular, anybody who was  
20 there in Guernsey last year to see nearly a quarter of this Island greet their Majesties, I think they shook the hand of every single person who was there.

But more broadly, just to see the strength of affection that was given, and received, by both sides was really a very special moment and a very special day. And as I said, I am delighted now that his portrait will hang here in Chief Pleas in place of the late Queen, where I know that we all  
25 hope it will hang for many more years to come.

I should say that this is not my first unveiling. You should be warned that they do not always go according to plan. *(Laughter)* But we will do our very best to do this with some dignity. Thank you very much.

*His Excellency unveiled the portrait of His Majesty; Members applauded.*

30 **The Lieutenant-Governor:** I've done worse! (*Laughter*)

**The Speaker:** Excellent. Thank you very much indeed; a little bit of ceremony at the beginning of our Meeting.

35 **The Speaker:** We have no apologies for absence. We have 17 Conseillers present, so we have no apologies. Welcome one and all.

**Declaration of interest forms –  
Statement by the Speaker**

40 **The Speaker:** I would just like to start proceedings by making a couple of statements from myself. Firstly, I would like to confirm that the Greffier has received all the completed declarations of interest forms from each Conseiller. They were received in due course before the deadline, which was actually last weekend. I would like to thank all Conseillers, but remind you that this is an annual requirement and the Greffier will contact you, remind you, each December. If your circumstances have not changed, then you just say that they have not changed, but if they have changed, please add them to your declaration of interest. That is a rolling record that is kept by the Greffier. So your co-operation is greatly appreciated.

Thank you very much indeed.

**Conduct of Conseiller-elect Makepeace –  
Statement by the Speaker**

45 **The Speaker:** Next, it is a less pleasant statement to make, but I feel under the circumstances of the last few weeks I need to bring this to your attention. It is with regret that I wish to address a matter of grave concern that affects not only the office of Speaker, but also the integrity of our political discourse and the well-being of our Assembly.

50 Immediately after the General Election, I was verbally abused by Conseiller-elect Makepeace, who used rude and obnoxious language, whilst making wild, quite frankly paranoid, and entirely unfounded allegations against me regarding the conduct of the General Election.

55 The incident was witnessed by Michael Bertram, our Senior Executive Officer, and I am grateful that he was present to hear what was said to me, and I want to state unequivocally that such behaviour is bullying and is entirely unacceptable. It will not be tolerated under any circumstances, against anyone involved with Chief Pleas.

60 I will affect Rule of Procedure 12(6) and propose to name and suspend the offending Conseiller from the service of Chief Pleas. There will be no debate or amendment to any such Proposition shall be allowed either by myself or the Deputy Speaker. I sincerely hope that I am not forced to do that. I do not want to take that course of action, but that is a course of action which is open to myself as Speaker or to the Deputy Speaker.

So I am sorry to bring that unpleasant piece of news to your attention, but I wanted to share that with you today.

**Induction and training day for Conseillers –  
Statement by the Speaker**

**The Speaker:** On a happier note, on Saturday, 1st February, we will be having our first induction and training day for Conseillers, both new Conseillers and existing Conseillers. This is something that the Office have worked very hard on, and the agenda for that meeting and the itinerary for that meeting is in the final throes of being processed. You will all get a copy of that next week and I will urge you, if at all possible, if you are here, to try and attend that meeting on Saturday, 1st February. It will cover all aspects and all areas and hopefully will enlighten you, whether you are a new Conseiller or whether you are a longstanding Conseiller.

Certainly I for one am very much looking forward to attending and listening to the information that will be shared with us. And that is on 1st February.

**STATEMENTS**

**Education Committee –  
Statement by Conseiller Rose**

**The Speaker:** At this point, I have three Statements from Conseillers, and the first Statement is from Conseiller Rose, the Chair of the Education Committee, who would like to make a Statement.

Conseiller Rose; thank you.

**Conseiller Rose:** Thank you, Mr Speaker. Good evening, Chief Pleas Members.

I am pleased to provide an update on several key developments from the Education Committee. Firstly, I am delighted to announce the board of governors of Sark School has now been populated. This has been a significant undertaking and I want to acknowledge the immense effort that has gone into reaching this point. I am pleased to share that Jan Guy is now appointed as the chair of the board, and Jon Parry and Helen Magell are community governors.

On behalf of all involved, I would like to extend heartfelt thanks to the now dissolved Board of Education. Their dedication and hard work have been instrumental in laying the foundations for this new governance structure. Their contributions have been invaluable in shaping Sark's education offer and we are deeply grateful for all they have accomplished.

Looking ahead, I am excited to introduce Vicky Mathews and Marcus Cooper from Spiral Partnership Trust, who have been engaged to develop Sark's education offer. Marcus brings decades of experience in primary education, having held senior roles in school leadership, policy development and school improvement, including in Hertfordshire, London and Guernsey, and now holds the post of CEO for Spiral Partnership Trust. He will be primarily supporting Sark with education policy and strategy.

Vicky has over 20 years of experience in education, with extensive leadership roles across primary and secondary phases. She has led on school improvement within a number of local authorities across southern England and has worked alongside Marcus supporting the education and inspection development in the States of Guernsey for the last three years. She will primarily work with the head teacher on the School's development plan and preparations for the inspection in May, which will be designed and conducted by herself along, with an ex-HMI colleague who is a small and island school specialist, Shaun Jarvis. This inspection will serve as an important benchmark for the school's progress.

With regard to post-13 education, we have conducted an extensive consultation with our key stakeholders, which are the parents. We extend our sincere thanks to them for taking their time to share their views with us and there was an overwhelming majority emphasising that providing

105 choice is the most important factor. Discussions are ongoing regarding potential developments and the direction we might pursue, and we aim to present clear propositions for debate at Chief Pleas later in the year.

110 In March, we will participate in an education conference that brings together the newly formed board of governors, the Education Committee and the staff of Sark School. This conference will be a vital opportunity to clarify governance and oversight, ensuring that all roles and responsibilities are well defined to support the delivery of high-quality education in the Island. It will also serve to strengthen collaboration, build stronger working relationships and explore innovative ideas to further enhance Sark's education provision.

115 These updates demonstrate the significant progress we are making in advancing education in Sark. I look forward to providing further updates at a Chief Pleas Meeting later this year, where we anticipate presenting propositions to the House for discussion and debate.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Rose. Thank you very much indeed.

#### **Community Power Project and public meeting – Statement by Conseiller Guille**

120 **The Speaker:** Next, I have had a request from Conseiller Guille to make two Statements on behalf of the Policy and Finance Committee, so we will do one at a time.  
Conseiller Guille; thank you.

**Conseiller Guille:** Thank you.

125 Statement on the Community Power Project and public meeting. The final generation and distribution designs have been received by our project team and are currently being reviewed by independent consultants recommended by Alderney Electricity Ltd. Once these reviews have been completed, the design work will be published and Conseillers will be fully briefed by project lead Jake Burnyeat of Communities for Renewables, and James Lancaster, recently retired managing director of Alderney Electricity Ltd.

130 Shortly following this, in early March, a public meeting will be arranged in the Island Hall, where all the key members of the project team, the designers and other consultants will be in attendance to present this considerable piece of work and answer questions. Dates for this meeting will be announced in the next couple of weeks on the Community Power Project website and Chief Pleas website.

135 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille, for that first Statement. Thank you very much indeed.

#### **La Coupée inspection and stabilisation work – Statement by Conseiller Guille**

**The Speaker:** And – chance to draw breath – your second Statement, please.

140 **Conseiller Guille:** Second Statement on behalf of the Douzaine and Policy and Finance Committees: Statement on La Coupée inspection and stabilisation work.

The immediate stabilisation work in the areas of the recent rockfall and partial wall collapse at the southwestern end of La Coupée were completed last night – Tuesday, 21st January – several

## CHRISTMAS MEETING OF CHIEF PLEAS, WEDNESDAY, 22nd JANUARY 2025

---

145 days ahead of schedule by the team of engineers and rope access specialists from Geomarine  
Guernsey and Jersey. We are immensely appreciative of their rapid mobilisation and exceptional  
hard work over the last couple of weeks and in the last few days.

150 Many thanks must also be extended to Kevin and Simon Adams from the Sark Fire Service for  
assisting the Geomarine team on site and providing floodlighting into the early hours of Tuesday  
morning and until late last night. We are also greatly appreciative for the assistance of the Isle of  
Sark Shipping Company in arranging a cargo charter boat at short notice; the harbour staff, crane  
driver and carters for assisting with this; and for Ray Lowe and his crew in arranging charters for  
Geomarine workers and media.

155 To give a bit of background to the repair work that has been carried out, Chief Pleas first  
arranged for a survey of La Coupée and other cliff areas in autumn 2023 with a separate company.  
The site visit took place, but despite much chasing, a report was never received.

160 In August 2024, and again in November 2024, visits were arranged to Sark by Geomarine Jersey  
and Guernsey engineers to inspect the harbours and surrounding cliffs and also La Coupée. The  
inspections were carried out by engineers using drones to video the cliff faces. A report was  
received in December 2024 on La Coupée, which recommended that physical inspection should  
be undertaken by rope access teams in order to take a closer look at certain areas. These  
inspections were then booked in for the next available timeslot of 10th February.

165 On 13th January, we were notified of the rockfall and partial wall collapse on the southwestern  
end of La Coupée. Geomarine were contacted immediately and arrangements were made for a  
geotechnical engineer from Jersey to visit Sark on 16th January. At the same time, Geomarine  
Guernsey began to mobilise resources to effect remedial work. Equipment and materials were  
sourced in Guernsey and also shipped in from Jersey and the UK. This work began on Monday this  
week and was completed on Tuesday evening, several days ahead of schedule, due to the  
impending bad weather predicted from Storm Eowyn.

170 Today, the rope access team have been clearing vegetation on further parts of La Coupée's  
western side that require physical inspection before the poor weather sets in tomorrow. A smaller  
rope access team will be returning at the next convenient opportunity and good weather window  
to inspect these areas, and to also assess drainage arrangements on both sides of the causeway.  
A plan for further remedial works will then be made.

175 Not only are we grateful to Geomarine for their previous inspection work and subsequent rapid  
deployment after the recent rockfall, but we have also appreciated their open and fair approach  
to quoting and charging for this work. In respect to the emergency work carried out this week, the  
final bill is not yet in, but works have been carried out on an hourly basis, with a clearly defined  
table of hourly labour rates and machinery hire at market rates that can be checked against  
industry norms. These are all standard rates, with no emergency uplift, and are the same rates  
used for competitively tendered work. Chief Pleas will also be provided with a full audit trail of  
material costs.

180 Our only other option for such work would likely have been to request a company to attend  
from the UK, which would have added another layer of logistical challenges and delays. We are  
therefore grateful for Geomarine's fair approach to pricing in this urgent situation.

185 From 25th January, the road will be reopened to general traffic. A delay of a few days is  
required to allow the concrete to reach adequate strength before traffic loads are applied. From  
the 25th onward, there will likely remain a restriction to tractors with lightly loaded trailers only,  
until further inspection and any additional work is completed.

190 A stability assessment is being carried out this week and further advice will be published before  
Saturday. Weekly inspections will be undertaken by Chief Pleas of La Coupée until the rest of the  
western side has been physically inspected and the engineers are satisfied that all necessary repair  
work has been completed.

195 Looking towards the future, we are considering options for regular inspection of the cliff faces  
either side of La Coupée. One option is to continue with regular visual inspections and yearly drone  
video surveys. Another option would be to conduct yearly light detection and ranging (Lidar)



surveys, from which a 3D computer model of the cliff faces can be generated in order to track the progression of the natural erosion.

200 Once again, we would like to thank all involved in completing this project in such short order. This has been a great example of how teams and individuals from across the Channel Islands can come together to support each other when needed. It has also shown how a small jurisdiction like Sark can implement decisions rapidly and efficiently when appropriate. Further updates will be provided as inspection work progresses.

Thank you.

205 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

On behalf of Chief Pleas, I entirely echo what Conseiller Guille has just said. I think the speed at which this work has been undertaken has been phenomenal. So many people have contacted me to say how impressed they are with the way in which it has been conducted. So full marks to everyone who has been involved, on behalf of Chief Pleas.

210 Thank you very much indeed.

**Procedural –  
Electronic devices**

**The Speaker:** At that point, I will say, in accordance with the Rules of Procedure, I would remind all present that mobile phones, cameras, recording devices and other electronic equipment must now be switched off, less for those allowed to Chief Pleas Members in accordance with Rule 19(2).

Thank you.

## Business of the Day

### 1. Questions not related to the Business of the Day – None

215 **The Speaker:** And so, to Agenda Item 1, Questions not related to the Business of the Day. This evening there are none. I have received no questions not related to the Business of the Day.

### 2. The Domestic Abuse and Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024 – Policy and Finance Committee Report considered – Proposition carried

*To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘The Domestic Abuse & Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024’ and to approve the draft Projet de Loi entitled ‘The Domestic Abuse & Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024’.*

*Proposition 1:*

*That Chief Pleas approves the draft Projet de Loi ‘The Domestic Abuse & Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024’.*

**The Speaker:** So we will therefore move straight on to Agenda Item 2, which is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee, entitled ‘The Domestic Abuse & Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024’ and to approve the draft Projet de Loi  
220 entitled the Domestic Abuse and Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024.

I would ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report, please.

**Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir.

225 In March 2024, the Policy and Finance Committee was asked to consider the draft Domestic Abuse and Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024, which was written in recognition of the fact that research, policy and practice in relation to domestic abuse have moved on significantly in the past 20 years, and legislation has moved on in other jurisdictions to reflect this.

The legislation creates new offences and introduces measures that will afford better protection for victims. The Committee, after consultation with the Island Safeguarding Officer and the Sark Constable responsible for safeguarding, gave feedback on the draft legislation to the States of  
230 Guernsey’s Committee for Home Affairs. Guernsey’s States of Deliberation approved the draft Projet de Loi entitled the Domestic Abuse and Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024, on 23rd October 2024. The Policy and Finance Committee now brings the legislation to Chief Pleas for approval.

235 We are also grateful to Conseiller Lord for putting together a comprehensive briefing paper on this legislation, which has been shared with all Conseillers, and we are especially grateful to the MASH team and the Constables for their extensive consultation with Guernsey officials and Law Officers over the past year on this legislation. And I have got a statement kindly supplied from the MASH team that they would like to share with Conseillers regarding this Law:

This Law comes to Chief Pleas after much consultation with the Sark Constable’s safeguarding lead, Safeguarding Officer and MASH. We have been invited to consult on this Law following its early development. The Sark representatives raised a number of concerns about the initial draft. All concerns that can be addressed by Guernsey have been taken on board and either amended in the Law, or through commitment to resolve through action. There

are some issues that will be harder to implement, but these are Sark problems and beyond the influence of Guernsey. Some are moving towards a solution, such as the development of a safe and secure space for use by the Sark Constable. Others will have to be accepted as impossible to implement in Sark, such as the implementation of proximity boundaries. What is clear is that the Law is a much-needed tool in the Constables' armoury. Sark already lacks resources and relies heavily on the Guernsey Police to guide Sark Constables in difficult cases. If we do not accept this Law, then we are making the Constables' role even harder, as Guernsey Police will not be able to advise sufficiently. Without the Law, the only option will be arrest. MASH urges Chief Pleas to support this Law and enable our agencies to work with Guernsey to establish the procedures and practices that will make the Law work effectively for Sark.

240 Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

245 Are there any questions or debate from the floor regarding what you just heard from Conseiller Guille, either about the Report, or the subsequent information which has been received by the Committee? Any questions or debate regarding the Report or what you just heard from Conseiller Guille? Any questions?

Yes, Conseiller Lord; thank you.

250 **Conseiller Lord:** Mr Speaker, I have been told time and time again by residents that this House has a tendency to waive Bailiwick Law through on the nod, so to speak. I spent about two months researching this Law. I consolidated that research into a note which I distributed. I sat down with the Safeguarding team and with the Constable responsible for safeguarding. I have to say, to echo the words in their statement, I found the experience very reassuring. It really did well to clear a lot of things up around this Law.

255 This Law is the culmination of about 15 years' worth of effort in the States of Guernsey to develop a domestic abuse strategy for Alderney and Guernsey. The strategy does not extend to Sark, and as such the Law as drafted inherits a number of biases in things – maybe bias is the wrong word, but certainly an expectation that things are available generally that are not on Sark.

260 I think if you look at it as applied in Guernsey, what you have got is a very well-developed Law, and if I was a Deputy in the States of Guernsey, I would wave it through with a smile, without a doubt. However, there are some cracks, especially when applied to Sark. Some of the issues do not go far enough, the elements, but also, for Sark, there is no consideration for any existing legislation. There are repeals put in place for Alderney and Guernsey, there are no repeals registered for Sark, which I believe may have been due to a miscommunication about what child laws exist already. That is going to have to be amended as it is.

265 So a large part of addressing the issues is going to be about what can be amended and what timescales can we get them amended in, because if we do not amend them, there are concerns that we could end up with something that has echoes of, or rhymes with, some of the issues around the Capacity Law.

270 Having said all that, voting contre is not a good option either. It risks creating a two-tier policing system with respect to Guernsey, it makes us look like a soft touch for domestic abuse and that is not a position we want to be in. Much of the actual power being transferred falls in the criminal sphere, that is being transferred through the Law, means that it is not power that we could enact at the moment anyway. And the source of that, I believe, is in Part XVI of the Children (Guernsey and Alderney) Law, 2008. I think that is why it is there.

275 There are issues with this. It is what I believe to be the single transfer of domestic policymaking power from the Island to Guernsey since the Alderney Law of 1948, and originally Guernsey planned to expand the Law through Ordinances, which of course would be put in front of Chief Pleas.

280 So there are issues here and the Safeguarding team are right to say that there are Sark-specific issues. There are issues around the handling of perpetrators and survivors. On Guernsey, you would separate the perpetrator. Here we cannot; we have to separate the victim. But I do not think that voting contre is right either.

285 So the question that I have, probably for Policy and Finance, but I am not sure, is what options  
are available for us to address the issues with this Law, get it amended, and avoid having some of  
the problems we had with the Capacity Law?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Lord.

290 Conseiller Guille, you heard those comment, would you like to hear further debate or come  
back on those at this point? (*Interjection by Conseiller Guille*) Further debate.

So you have heard what Conseiller Lord has said, you have heard what Conseiller Guille said,  
has anyone got any other points they would like to raise, based on that information which you  
have listened to? And obviously you were all privy to an email that went round earlier this week  
from Conseiller Lord on this very subject, so you will have seen that documentation.

295 Does anyone have any other points that they would like to raise about the Report and the  
Projet de Loi that you have before you? Yes, Conseiller Plummer; thank you.

**Conseiller Plummer:** Yes. Thank you very much for this fine piece of work.

300 Would it be possible for us to pass this tonight and then look at the effect of what should be  
changed? I feel that this should go through tonight and I will be voting for it to go through, but  
can we look at it again after this has gone through, please?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

305 Once again, you heard that comment. Anyone in support of that comment? Anyone like to add  
to that comment?

Conseiller Cragoe; thank you.

**Conseiller Cragoe:** Thank you.

310 Yes, I would like to support both Conseiller Lord and Conseiller Plummer. I think to vote it  
through now is a good idea, but we should look, if there are some specific issues that need to be  
addressed.

315 I think, though, that Conseiller Lord also raised a very good point in his email about Law coming  
to us from Guernsey and also Laws coming to this House. Is it even 150 words that was in the  
Report? So I think that perhaps sometimes that the things come to this House, perhaps without ...  
I know they have been deeply discussed in Committee, but perhaps without some of the issues  
being raised and that might be something we would also look at going forward.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Cragoe.

320 Does anyone again have anything they would like to add to what you have just heard from  
Conseiller Cragoe?

Conseiller Rose; thank you.

325 **Conseiller Rose:** Yes. I just wanted to say that I will be supporting this tonight and had an  
experience just a couple of weeks ago where there was an incident where there was no law to  
underpin the situation and safety was at risk, and there was nothing we could do about it. It just  
feels like this is an opportunity for us to be able to protect residents and I think it is a really  
important move forward.

Thank you.

330 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Rose.

Conseiller Nicolle; thank you.

**Conseiller Nicolle:** I have no wish whatsoever to undermine all the work that has obviously  
gone into this, but it seems to me wrong to pass a piece of legislation and then work on it. Could

335 it possibly be deferred to the next Meeting in the light that we do need these protections, but it  
needs to be correct, in my opinion?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Nicolle.

340 Once again, you are hearing these various comments. Conseiller Lord, I will come back to you,  
before I come back to P&F.

Conseiller Lord; thank you.

345 **Conseiller Lord:** Just to respond to Conseiller Nicolle, I would normally 100% agree, however,  
I do believe that the powers are essential. And in this particular case, I think that there is value in  
getting it done. What we need from Guernsey is a commitment that we can join the strategy, that  
we can participate in that as an equal partner, or at least as a junior partner, and that we can have  
the amendments put in with the repeals that will need to be done anyway.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Lord.

350 Does anyone else have any comments? Yes, Conseiller Harris; thank you.

**Conseiller Harris:** Thank you, sir.

355 Yes, I am intending to vote for this this evening, but I have been very gratified by the nature of  
the debate. I think we have had comments from other Conseillers as well, who have not spoken  
this evening, in the past about receiving legislation from Guernsey, where there is limited  
information provided, barebones reports, where it almost seems as we are expected to pass  
things without understanding what the implications for Sark are.

360 I am very gratified to hear from Conseiller Guille there has been a lot of involvement from Sark  
agencies, Sark officials in this. That strikes me as enormous progress. But if I can be so bold as to  
sum up what I am hearing, it is that I think this new House is making a statement that we expect  
to hear more, we expect to get more information from Guernsey and we expect involvement and  
engagement to happen as a matter of course, otherwise these types of pieces of legislation may  
not be passed by this House.

365 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Harris. Thank you very much indeed.

So once again, you are hearing a number of different views and opinions, broadly in support,  
I think, but anyway. Conseiller Guille, would you like to come back at this stage? Does anyone else  
have any other ...?

Conseiller Lord, first.

370

**Conseiller Lord:** Just an idea, I am obviously quite new to this, but what we could do is we could  
potentially pass this Law tonight, and then we could have an agreement that until we hear back  
from Home Affairs, nothing else would be voted on or nothing else would be passed. And I think  
that shows that we really do care about this, but at the same time we want to see us represented  
375 properly.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Lord.

380 Very good. Are there any other additional points from Conseillers on the floor, before I come  
back to Conseiller Guille to sum up? Any other points that you would like to make at this  
stage? No?

In which case, Conseiller Guille, I will come back to you and ask you to respond to what you  
have heard please.

**Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir.

385 There have been some very useful, insightful comments from all the Conseillers who have  
contributed. Like I said at the beginning, we are especially grateful for Conseiller Lord's summary

document that Conseillers received this week on this subject. As the MASH team stated, there is further work to do with this Law and I think the feeling within the House, and certainly within the MASH team, is that it is prudent to pass this Law tonight and this work will continue with Home Affairs and with the Law Officers through the MASH team to amend this. Without going into the detail of these issues, these are, not minor details, but they are not earthshattering details that need to be rectified.

But in terms of Bailiwick Law, certainly had the conversations in the past few weeks and very recently with the newly elected Chair and Deputy Chair of the Policy Development Group. We are coalescing around an idea where we could hold PDGs halfway between each Chief Pleas, and any such Bailiwick Law, like this, should be presented at those PDGs with the relevant officers available to brief all Conseillers together, at some six or seven weeks out from Chief Pleas, which would seem a far more sensible way to approach this and give all Conseillers, and even the Committees that Laws are relevant to, a much more focused and concentrated briefing on what are often quite extensive and complicated bits of legislation.

So I would like to sum up and echo the words of the MASH team, and indeed all the Conseillers who have spoken tonight. It is important we pass this Law tonight, but it is also important we get what details right that we can for Sark, and at the same time we have also got to recognise the limitations that we have on Island and do as our agencies always do, and work around them to their best effect.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

So there you have it, you have heard some debate, you have heard a summing up from Conseiller Guille. I think, therefore, without further ado, that probably brings this debate to a particular position and therefore I will propose the following: that Chief Pleas approves the draft Projet de Loi entitled the Domestic Abuse and Related Provisions (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2024. Those in favour, please raise your hands. Thank you. And those against? That is **carried**. Thank you very much indeed.

Very good.

**3. Amendment to the Constitution & Operation of Chief Pleas Committees –  
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –  
Proposition carried**

*To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Amendment to the Constitution & Operation of Chief Pleas Committees’.*

*Proposition:*

*That Chief Pleas approves the amended Constitution and Operation of Chief Pleas Committees.*

**The Speaker:** Let us now move on to Agenda Item 3, which is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled ‘Amendment to the Constitution & Operation of Chief Pleas Committees’ and once again I would like to ask Conseiller Guille to introduce the Report.

Conseiller Guille.

**Conseiller Guille:** Can I ask Conseiller Rose to introduce the report, please.

**The Speaker:** Very good; thank you.  
Conseiller Rose; thank you.

**Conseiller Rose:** Thank you.

430 So this is housekeeping, really, and it is because of the situation we found ourselves in with so many of the previous Members of the House leaving, and then our new Conseillers – who I want to extend congratulations to – joining us, but it meant that we found ourselves in some Committees ... we would have been not quorate and it was not clear whether those Conseillers could stay within the Committees until at what point they stopped being Conseillers. So this is just to clear it up and to make it absolutely clear that it is at midnight of the day before the new Conseillers are sworn in. It means that we just can keep the operation going in between.

435 Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Rose.

Does anybody have any points they would like to raise in order to respond to what you just heard, or what you have read in the Report, rather? Any comments; any debate? No?

440 In which case, therefore, the Proposition is before you as follows: that Chief Pleas approves the amended Constitution and Operation of Chief Pleas Committees. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? And that is **carried**. Thank you. Very good.

**4. Change of Mandate –  
Policy and Finance Committee Report considered –  
Proposition carried**

*To consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Change of Mandate'.*

*Proposition 1:*

*That Chief Pleas approves the amended Policy and Finance Committee Mandate.*

**The Speaker:** Next up we have Agenda Item 4, which is to consider a Report with Proposition from the Policy and Finance Committee entitled 'Change of Mandate'.

Once again, Conseiller Guille, is it to you?

445

**Conseiller Guille:** Can I ask Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard to introduce this?

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you very much. Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

450 **Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Section 4 of the Constitution and Operation of Chief Pleas Committees states Committees may have up to three non-Chief Pleas Members without voting rights on them. At present, the Policy and Finance Committee Mandate does not allow for any non-Chief Members on the Committee. The Committee would like to amend this to allow us to appoint up to three non-Chief Pleas Members to the Committee.

455

And secondly, in addition, the Mandate refers to the Chief Secretary/Senior Administrator as members *ex officio*. These roles have now been replaced by the Senior Executive Officer. The Committee also wishes to amend the wording of section (d) of the Mandate from 'Michaelmas Chief Pleas' to 'the Budget Meeting of Chief Pleas'. The Committee ask Chief Pleas to approve the amended Mandate as attached to reflect these changes.

460

So in summary, first of all, we would just like to add extra experience and knowledge to the Committee in the form of non-decisionmakers; and secondly, it is a couple of simple clerical amendments.

Thank you.

465 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard.

Once again, you have read the Report, you have heard what P&F have said, does anyone have any points they would like to raise or questions they would like to ask of Policy and Finance regarding the proposed changes to the Policy and Finance Mandate? Any comments?

Yes, Conseiller Barker; thank you.

470

**Conseiller Barker:** Yes, Mr Speaker, thank you.

I was just wondering if I could ask the question to the Policy and Finance Committee if they have anybody in mind for non-Chief Pleas Members, because obviously this Mandate has been the same for quite a while and I would be really interested to know if they have.

475

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Right. Who would like to answer that on behalf of P&F?

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard; thank you.

480

**Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Yes, sure. Thank you for the question, Conseiller Barker.

We are at a speculative stage at the moment ... *(Interjection by Conseiller Guille)* I will defer to Conseiller Guille. *(Laughter)*

**The Speaker:** Conseiller Guille; thank you.

485

**Conseiller Guille:** Yes, Conseiller Barker's detective work is pretty spot on. We have identified somebody who we would like to add as a non-Chief Pleas Member, and then realised that P&F is the only Committee that does not allow non-Chief Pleas Members on it. I would like to think that was a mistake in the drafting originally and this Item is to amend that, and then there is voting at the end of every Meeting for non-Chief Pleas Members and Committee elections.

490

So yes, you have to wait a little bit longer!

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Back to Conseiller Barker; thank you.

495

**Conseiller Barker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille, for that reply. I would just like to very respectfully add, if this is who I possibly think it is, please do not forget about the Taxation Review (Special) Committee. I would appreciate that.

Thank you.

500

**The Speaker:** Conseiller Barker, is that a question or an observation?

**Conseiller Baker:** I am happy with that, Mr Speaker.

505

**The Speaker:** You are.

There we are, you have read the Report, you have heard the comments. Before we go to the vote, does anyone have any other further points they would like to raise regarding the Report and the Proposition? No?

510

Therefore, in which case, let us go to the Proposition, which reads that Chief Pleas approves the amended Policy and Finance Committee Mandate accordingly. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? That is **carried**. Thank you very much indeed. Very good.



**Procedural motion –  
Reordering of Business –  
Motion carried**

515 **The Speaker:** At this point, I would like to say, before we move to Agenda Item 5, I propose, in accordance with Rule of Procedure 11, that Item 10 from the Addendum be debated now. In order to do that, I need a show of hands to approve that we now discuss and present Agenda Item 10. Could I ask for those in favour to raise your hands? Thank you. Those against? That is **carried**.

**10. 5th Committee Member –  
Taxation Review (Special) Committee Report considered –  
Proposition carried**

*To consider a Report with Proposition from the Taxation Review (Special) Committee entitled '5th Committee Member'*

*Proposition:*

*That Chief Pleas resolve to set the membership of the Taxation Review (Special) Committee as 5 (five) Conseillers.*

**The Speaker:** Therefore we will go to Agenda Item 10, which is from the Addendum, which is to consider a Report from the Taxation Review (Special) Committee entitled '5th Committee Member'. I would like to ask Conseiller Miller to introduce the Report.

520 Thank you; Conseiller Miller. *(Interjection by Conseiller Miller)* Can you turn your microphone on, please, Conseiller Miller? Thank you.

**Conseiller Miller:** I beg your pardon.

525 Everyone can read the Proposition and all of that. I would like to just give a little bit of background to it. First of all, Chief Pleas has a great abundance of talent on a very difficult subject, and therefore the expansion to five Committee Members will only strengthen its ability to make recommendations to Chief Pleas.

530 Secondly, following the consensus taken last autumn, the tremendous number of replies that we were – at least I was – slightly overwhelmed in the detail and ideas that came out of it, needs a lot of hard work on it, so that we can present these ideas in summation to put forward the will of the people. And that is why I believe expansion of the Committee, for those two reasons, would be beneficial to Chief Pleas.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Miller, for introducing the Report.

535 Does anybody have any comments to make, any observations, any debate, regarding what you have read in the Report or what you have just heard from Conseiller Miller? Any observations, any comments, any debate? No? I see no hands going up.

So in which case, let's go straight to the Proposition, which reads as follows: that Chief Pleas resolve to set the membership of the Taxation Review (Special) Committee at five Conseillers. Those in favour? Thank you. Those against? And that is **carried**. Thank you very much indeed.

540 Just for those who are wondering, I intend to introduce at the end of this Meeting an opportunity to be able to vote on who that person might be, but we will do that at the end of the Meeting.

**5. Annual Information Report and Crawfish Conservation Report 2024 –  
Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee Reports considered**

*To consider two Information Reports from the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee entitled 'Annual Information Report' and 'Crawfish Conservation Report 2024'.*

**The Speaker:** Therefore moving on next to Agenda Item 5, which is to consider two Information Reports from the Agriculture, Environment and Sea Fisheries Committee entitled the Annual  
545 Information Report and the Crawfish Conservation Report 2024. I would like to ask  
Conseiller Plummer to introduce the Report and the two documents.

Thank you; Conseiller Plummer.

**Conseiller Plummer:** Thank you, sir.

550 Yes, I am very pleased to bring forward these Reports, and I would like to thank  
David Cocksedge, Jo Birch, Peter Cunneen and Sue Daly for helping with these Reports. And also  
for the numerous volunteers who assist the Committee on very difficult projects at times.

Yes, we have managed to get quite a lot done this year. The dives for the sea fisheries, there  
have been problems, because there have been a lot of octopus around. So therefore there has  
555 been a problem for the fishermen. The octopus have been taking the lobsters out of the store  
pots. So yes, it has been a difficult year for them and also for scalloping, but I am very pleased to  
say that we hope next year will be better.

The seaweed farm, the work has been going on, and we are just waiting now for the  
assessments to be done and the people who are doing this seaweed farm will be coming over and  
560 giving a talk to the Island about it all.

Fish Intel, as you can see here, is going very well. We are surprised to see how many reports  
are coming in on different fish, etc.

And the Asian hornet control, we are going to be doing another door-to-door drop this month,  
beginning of next month. This is very important, because I think we were a stopping Island  
565 protecting Guernsey. They were stopping off here on their way from Jersey last year and that is  
why we have so many queens. I am very supportive of everybody who helps on this lot.

The Crawfish Report: I am very grateful to Sue Daly for sending this marvellous Report and we  
just carry on. They are protected, it is an ongoing law, so we do not need to keep on voting it in.

So thank you very much to everybody. Thank you.

570

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

So these are Information Reports for you, there are no Propositions attached to this. Does  
anyone have any questions which you would like to ask to the Committee regarding the two  
Reports and what you have just heard, Conseiller Plummer summing up and saying thank you?  
575 Anyone like to make any comments about what you have read, what you have heard? Any  
comments? No?

Once again, I would say thank you to the Committee, thank you for the Reports and thank you  
for the opportunity of bringing them to Chief Pleas for information.

**6. Sark School Annual Report –  
Education Committee Report considered**

*To consider an Information Report from the Education Committee entitled 'Sark School  
Annual Report'.*

580 **The Speaker:** At this point, we will go to Agenda Item 6, which is to consider an Information Report from the Education Committee entitled Sark School Annual Report, and I would ask Conseiller Rose to introduce the Report, please.  
Thank you.

585 **Conseiller Rose:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.  
So the Sark School Annual Report is something that used to happen and would be brought to the House every year, and it had fallen by the wayside, I think during the pandemic. And so it is something that we wanted to bring back in and reinstate for transparency and as a way of being able to just look at data and keep an eye on what is happening.

590 The Report is very positive. We did have a soft inspection that took place last year in 2024 and it garnered positive coverage in the local press and it was a successful report. We will be having a full inspection this year in May. We are going to be doing full inspections every two years and in between we will have soft inspections, just to keep moving forward. So the comprehensive inspection is scheduled for May, and that is with the support of Marcus Cooper and Vicky Mathews, who I mentioned earlier in my initial address.  
595 Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Rose.  
From what you have read in the Report and from what you have just heard from Conseiller Rose, does anyone have any questions or debate regarding the Report? There are no Propositions attached to it, it is an Information Report, but would anyone like to ask questions or  
600 to comment on the Report, while you have got the opportunity to do so? No?

So in which case I will say thank you to Conseiller Rose, thank you to the Education Committee and all your comments have been noted.

## 7. Seasonal Regulation No.2 – Douzaine Report considered

*To consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled 'Seasonal Regulation No.2'.*

605 **The Speaker:** Let us move on to Agenda Item 7, which is to consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled 'Seasonal Regulation No.2' and I would like to ask Conseiller Barker to introduce this on behalf of the Douzaine; introduce the Report.  
Conseiller Barker; thank you.

610 **Conseiller Barker:** Conseiller Bateson, sir, will be presenting this Report.  
Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Oh, it is Conseiller Bateson. Very good, thank you.  
Conseiller Bateson; thank you.

615 **Conseiller Bateson:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.  
This is the annual presentation of the Seasonal Regulation for tractors, which will come in as it has done for the last quite a few years on 1st April. It is no different from the one last year. It is relating to the one-way system and the parking of tractors during the tourist season, basically. It is just a housekeeping job, really.  
620 Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Bateson.

625 It is a housekeeping job, an Information Report. While you have got the opportunity, does anyone have any questions that you would like to ask of the Douzaine regarding this particular annual Report? Any comments or observations for the Douzaine? No?

As I said, it is an Information Report, there are no Propositions attached to it, but once again I thank the Douzaine for dealing with this annual task of bringing this to Chief Pleas.

Thank you.

#### 8. Seasonal Regulation No.4 - 2025 – Douzaine Report considered

*To consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled ‘Seasonal Regulation No.4 - 2025’.*

630 **The Speaker:** Let us now go to Agenda Item 8, which is to consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled ‘Seasonal Regulation No.4 - 2025’. Once again, is it Conseiller Barker or Conseiller Bateson?

**Conseiller Barker:** Conseiller Harris, sir.

635 **The Speaker:** Conseiller Harris. Spreading the load.  
Conseiller Harris, thank you, on behalf of the Douzaine.

**Conseiller Harris:** Thank you, sir; threw you a curveball there.

640 Yes, this Regulation is in relation to the regulation of the driving use and parking on public roads of horse-drawn vehicles. It is required to be renewed annually in this Chamber, and it covers the regulation of these forms of vehicles from 1st April until – unless there is any other notice – 30th September.

645 I do not propose to read the whole thing out, I am sure you have all read it, but it does cover things such as needing to drive along the Avenue in an east to west direction, not parking on the Avenue, regulating parking of such vehicles at the Collinette, requiring walking pace at certain areas of the Island where it would be unsafe for a carriage to move faster, and requiring the driver or the controller of a carriage to maintain control of the horse whilst they are there. I think it is all fairly straightforward. It is exactly the same as it was last year.

650 **The Speaker:** Thank you very much indeed, Conseiller Harris, on behalf of the Douzaine.

Once again, it is an Information Report, no Propositions attached. Does anyone have any questions for the Douzaine regarding this annual Report and Seasonal Regulation No. 4 2025? Any points anyone would like to raise? Any questions for the Douzaine while you have got the opportunity? No?

655 It is a piece of annual housekeeping, and once again, on behalf of Chief Pleas, I am very grateful for the Douzaine for bringing this to our attention each year.

Thank you to the Douzaine.

#### 9. Constables Report – Douzaine Report considered

*To consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled ‘Constables Report’.*

**The Speaker:** Let us now move to Agenda Item 9, which is to consider an Information Report from the Douzaine entitled 'Constables Report'. Who would like to introduce this?

660

**Conseiller Barker:** Myself, thank you, Mr Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Very good, Conseiller Barker. Thank you very much indeed.

665

**Conseiller Barker:** This is an Information Report which has been put together by Sark Constables: Constables Turner and Burgess. There are some little statistics here that show the crimes unfortunately, and situations they have had to deal with. It is pretty self-explanatory.

670

There is one small mistake on it, I am afraid. The licences issued are 88, not 150. The 150 is actually the price and Constables Turner and Burgess have kindly written a little statement. I am happy to read it all out, if you would prefer, Mr Speaker.

**The Speaker:** I think, for clarity, I would like to hear it for the sake of *Hansard*, please, and recording. Thank you, Conseiller Barker.

675

**Conseiller Barker:** Yes. Constables Report, 5th October 2023 to 4th October 2024. The following incidents required the Constables' involvement, investigation, mediation or assistance: arrests, 5; animal complaints, 2; air traffic, 19; assault, 9; bike-related issues, including theft, 6; boat-related incidents, including Sark Shipping, 11; custom border agency, 18; drug-related incidents, 2; drunk and disorderly, 6; domestic violence, 12; guns, 7; harassment, 2; welfare checks, 16; medical assist, 3; missing persons, 2; personal disputes, 4; prison/detainment use, 3; road traffic complaints, 40; suspicious person/item, 2; sudden death, 1; sexual assault, 2; theft, including attempted, 6; underage drinking, 2; unlawful entry, 2; and vagrancy issues, 2.

680

Licences issued by our Constables: 88 tractor licences and 197 tractor drivers; carriages, 13; carriage drivers, 25; bicycles, 717; horses, 20; dogs, 92; invalid cars, 28; and gun licences, 48. The rest of this statement, Information Report, I am reading on behalf of Constables Turner and Burgess, Mr Speaker. I would just like to emphasise that.

685

It is important to recognise and appreciate the hard work and dedication of those who work tirelessly to address these issues on Sark. Despite its small size, the island still faces challenges that require a coordinated effort to overcome. The commitment of the Constables, Assistants, and ... [their] team members is crucial in ensuring that Sark remains a safe and thriving community for all who call it home. Their efforts should not go unnoticed or unappreciated as they play a vital role in maintaining the unique character and charm of this special island.

The Constables continue to operate in accordance with The Police Powers and Criminal Evidence (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2003 where appropriate; together with the Special Constables they undertake annual personal safety training ... [with] the Guernsey Police. We are also working towards having mandatory annual classroom training also.

The Constables continue their routine work – carriage and tractor tests, attending meetings, and monitoring the Summer Saturday boat –

– on arrival to Sark and returning evening boat –

– to avoid drink related incidents. The Constables have undertaken unscheduled Patrols in the day to monitor and act on drink-related incidents which cause concerns to residents and visitors to our Island. With the cooperation from all Licensed Premises, we have noticed a drop in calls relating to these types of incidents but appreciate the need for continued vigilance in ... [the] area during the summer months.

Regrettably we have seen a rise in the number of calls to Domestic/family welfare issues and are actively seeking ways to be able to assist more in these types of issues when perhaps, what is required is professional mediation rather than the intervention of Law enforcement. This will be made easier with the upcoming Domestic abuse law which all involved are doing our best to adapt for the uniqueness of Sark.

The collaboration between the Sark Constables and Guernsey Police is crucial in ensuring that investigations are conducted effectively and in accordance with the law. The expertise and support provided by our colleagues from Guernsey ... help us navigate and give guidance in our role as Constables. Knowing that we have this valuable resource at our disposal gives us confidence in our ability to serve and protect our community. We are extremely grateful for their patience and assistance, which enhances the professionalism and integrity of our work as

Constables. The partnership between our two police forces despite the different jurisdictions strengthens our collective efforts to maintain a safe and secure environment for all residents of the Island and its visitors.

... [Special] thanks goes to the Special Constables who turn up day ... [and] night when requested, they are an integral part of our Law Enforcement on the Island. The continuing diligence and hard work of our Constable secretary Ali Bateson who we could not do without, needs to also be mentioned. As does our Custody Officer Antony Dunks. Thanks must also go to our Tourism Officers who have the role of manning the Lost/found property department on Sark through the Tourist Information Centre. Many lost items have been returned to their rightful owners by their efforts.

As with our Welfare statistics, we have seen a huge increase in the need for Guernsey police to assist us on the island. This continuing situation is unsustainable, and action needs to be taken to address the root causes of this increase in criminal activity. By implementing stricter regulations and screening processes, such as detailed work permits, routine DBS checks and having a definition of a resident, we can better protect our community and prevent further strain on our resources. We believe that it is imperative our government takes proactive measures to address these issues before they escalate further. The safety and well-being of our island residents should be a top priority, and we must work together to ensure a secure and thriving community for all.

Thank you for taking ... [your] time to read this report, it has been a privilege to serve the Community of Sark as Constable.

Charlotte Turner and Paul Burgess

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Barker. Thank you very much indeed.

690 I was keen for that to be read out, because beyond this Assembly and the Public Gallery, the recordings of Chief Pleas are listened to by *many* people, both within Sark, importantly, and also outside of Sark. There will be a lot of people who are very interested in what they have just heard in that Report, which is why I was keen that it should be made public and read out. And likewise, as has been said by the Douzaine, we are all very grateful to the cover that is provided by the Constables on Sark keeping us all safe.

695 Does anyone have any observations they would like to make as a result of having read the Report or what you just heard from the Douzaine? Any points?

Yes, Conseiller Lord; thank you.

700 **Conseiller Lord:** From my understanding, it is traditional that the outgoing Constable delivers a report on their departure. The last published report was I believe in 2019. The methodology used for that report to get the information was different, so you see differences in how things are counted and what is counted.

705 I was wondering if the Douzaine would be able to make the information more available. We have got some work to do on Online Identity, we are hoping to change the Mandate to allow us to introduce good things like an open data initiative and, not wanting to get too far ahead of myself, I have asked Conseiller Barker via email. But I would like to ask, for the benefit of *Hansard*, whether or not the Douzaine could increase the frequency of the reporting, and whether or not they would be interested in having discussions about the methodology and publishing the data openly on the internet.

710 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Lord. Thank you for that point.

Would someone from the Douzaine like to respond to Conseiller Lord's point? Conseiller Barker; Conseiller Bateson?

Conseiller Bateson, thank you.

715 **Conseiller Bateson:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

720 The Douzaine do not have it within the Mandate or their powers to instruct or demand them to write this or how often they write the report. It lapsed, we do not – I do not know why anyway. It lapsed. We suggested it to them last year, 'Would you be prepared to reinstate the annual report of the Constables?' I am very glad that they have done, and would like to thank them for doing with this, but the Douzaine does not have the authority to tell the Constables how they write their reports and how often. It is not in our Mandate.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Bateson, for that point.

725 Would anyone else like to make an observation as to what they have heard, either from  
Conseiller Bateson or from the Report previously?

Yes, Conseiller Barker; thank you.

**Conseiller Barker:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

730 This is this is an interesting one, because Conseiller Bateson is correct with the Mandate,  
I believe, that the Douzaine has. The Sark Constables, as our Police, are operationally independent  
and I am not sure it is wise, sir, that a political Committee should get involved operationally with  
the day to day of policing. *But* the Douzaine also effectively employ the Constables.

735 So I think Conseiller Lord's point is an excellent one regarding more statistics coming out.  
I think this is common sense, that we could have more updates on a weekly or perhaps monthly  
basis, especially in the high season. The Constables, sir, are invited to Douzaine meetings on a  
three-weekly basis. There is probably perhaps a little bit of tidying up to do with the Mandate  
there, but this Mandate has been there for, I would suggest, a long time.

740 I suppose that another way to look at it would be the same way as perhaps the Policy and  
Finance Committee employ our SEO and our SOO. They effectively are employed by the Policy and  
Finance Committee. So yes, sir, there is probably a bit of tidying up to do in the Mandate, I think.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Barker.

745 Once again, you have heard those comments. Does anyone have any comments or  
observations regarding what you have heard or heard in the Report? Any observations?

Yes, Conseiller Plummer; thank you.

750 **Conseiller Plummer:** I would like to say, sir, as far as the Constables are concerned, we are  
extremely grateful and I know that you perhaps would like to have extra meetings, etc., but  
especially in the summer, I know perfectly well how hard and long hours that they do work. So  
I would maybe just ask, if you are going to bring in new rules, please think about how much work  
they are already doing in the height of the summer; maybe roll it over to a quieter time.

Thank you.

755 **The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Plummer.

Back to Conseiller Barker, thank you. I will come to Conseiller Harris in a minute.

Conseiller Barker; thank you.

760 **Conseiller Barker:** I do not wish to put Conseiller Cragoe under the bus here, but I would like  
her to stand up and repeat something she said in an email today, because I thought it was quite  
good actually, yes.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

765 Conseiller Cragoe; thank you.

**Conseiller Cragoe:** Thank you.

770 In that case, just give me one second and I will find it and read it out, because I think it is a  
good point and thank you for asking for that.

**The Speaker:** Conseiller Cragoe, could you just raise your voice a little bit, please? Your  
microphone is on, but you have a very faint.

**Conseiller Cragoe:** Sorry; is that better?

775 Yes, sorry, I was hoping that I could actually find the email and read it, but I think the three points that I made, that it seemed to me that the Douzaine has had – I literally have been a Douzenier for less than 48 hours, so it is all rather new to me, but we have had some debate about this over the last couple of days and we have received Conseiller Lord’s report, or comments with interest and also the Constables Report.

780 Again, thank you very much for your work, but it seemed to me that there were three points to make, that although I would not in any way wish for politicians to interfere with the work of the Police, I feel that the Douzaine, as the Douzaine appoints the Constables, it was not unreasonable for us to ask for regular reports on what kinds of things are going on, what is happening, whether there are other things; perhaps there are particular issues that we need to  
785 address with other work, something that is coming out.

Secondly, I think that Chief Pleas, as representative of lawmakers, that we probably do have a right to understand on a regular basis how our laws are being enforced, whether they are being broken, what is going on.

And thirdly, I think the people of Sark deserve to know. I do not know what to make on some  
790 level of this report. Is this a lot of numbers? Is two sexual assaults loads? Has that never happened before? Is it nothing? Should I be worried when I walk home tonight that somebody is going to jump out of the bush or is it that actually there were 12 last year?

So I think that is the kind of information and I would hope that we could work ... I think  
795 Conseiller Lord is an amazing resource to have in Chief Pleas and if we can work with his knowledge for data, finding something that looks a little bit like the Guernsey annual policing report, that has statistics, maybe a little bit of commentary on things going up, things going down, maybe we need to think about the domestic violence law. I think 12 domestic incidents this year for a very small population, that is a very high percentage. That is the kind of thing where we need new legislation. There might be other things that we need to think about legislation or reforming  
800 other legislation and we can work ... I think that information that comes from understanding what the Constables do.

I would not in any way wish to say, ‘You should police this in one way’ or police it another, but I think that simply the information would be incredibly useful to have.

Thank you very much.

805

**The Speaker:** Thank you very much indeed, Conseiller Cragoe.

Conseiller Harris had his hand up. One second, Conseiller Rose, I will come to you in a second. Conseiller Harris, did you want to make a point?

810 **Conseiller Harris:** I was just going to make a very quick point, sir, which is yes, we have been talking about getting more of an information channel through the Douzaine, but I think it is important to recognise the Douzaine has always been quite a pragmatic Committee. I think we pride ourselves on being quite pragmatic. And we are in favour of information flow, we are going to have discussions on the Committee, but it is work in progress. We will be talking to all parties  
815 involved, including the Constables. I am certainly not going to do anything onerous – I do not think we should worry about that – and we will make sure that we both get a bit of a better information flow, but without over-bureaucratising things, because I do not think we need any of that.

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Harris.

820 Conseiller Rose; thank you.

**Conseiller Rose:** Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker.

I was just thinking about the incident that I mentioned and how the law did not exist to  
825 underpin it and whether that could be something that is included in the report. So where there are instances where hands are bound and they cannot do something to remedy the situation, that



we could then have that sent up to Policy and Finance, and that is something that we could start considering, of how we would fill those gaps.

Thank you.

830 **The Speaker:** Very good. Of course, we all recognise it is a very dangerous area, because we cannot absolutely talk about individual cases, but I think the points that are being made here are about better communication, better use of IT, without wishing to burden the Constables who already, as has been acknowledged, work very hard on behalf of the community. I think there have been some really positive points that have been made on all sides, and I am sure the

835 Douzaine will go away, consider those points, and hopefully, through PDG meetings, will have the opportunity to share that information with all other Conseillers outside of the Chief Pleas Assembly and then bring it forward to Chief Pleas as and when is appropriate.

So thank you for all those points that have been made regarding the Constables Report. If there are no other points to make, and there is obviously nothing to vote on, we will move on.

**Procedural motion –  
Completing Extraordinary (Special) Meeting Agenda –  
Motion carried**

840 **The Speaker:** At this point, I wish to hold my hand up and say I was rather optimistic when I put this Agenda together back in December. I thought that at the Extraordinary Meeting on Monday, the business would be done and dusted. I thought all the Committees would be repopulated and therefore there was no need for me to put that Agenda Item on tonight's Agenda. I apologise, I overlooked that, and so therefore, what I need to do at this point, with your support is to say, in

845 accordance with Procedure 11, to complete the Agenda from Monday evening, from the Extraordinary (Special) Meeting of Chief Pleas on Monday, 20th January. In order that we can do that, I need a show of hands that you are happy to do that. So it is to complete the voting process.

Those in favour of doing that now? Thank you. And those against? That is **carried**. Once again, I apologise for the oversight.

**Committee Elections –  
Policy and Finance: Conseiller E Baker MBE elected –  
Taxation Review (Special): election deferred**

*To elect Conseillers to Committees, as required.*

850 **The Speaker:** So therefore let's deal with Policy and Finance first. You will recall, on Monday night, that we had one remaining vacancy on P&F and I would remind you that the votes on Monday were equal. We had eight votes for Conseiller Baker and we had eight votes for Conseiller Locke and that is how it ended up on Monday night.

855 We have one spare seat on the P&F Committee and I would like to ask Conseiller Guille perhaps to introduce this. Have you got anything you would like to say or should we go straight to the vote?

**Conseiller Guille:** Yes. We had a Policy and Finance meeting last night, and we agreed to expand the Mandate of the P&F meeting at the next available meeting of Chief Pleas to seven members and tonight we would like to propose Conseiller Baker for the currently

860 available seat.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you.

So Conseiller Baker is being proposed for the vacancy currently on P&F. Conseiller Baker, you are happy with that?

865

**Conseiller Baker MBE:** I am happy, sir, yes.

**The Speaker:** Very good. Do we have any other nominations from the floor? I have got to be fair about this. Any other nominations from the floor, other than the nomination from P&F for Conseiller Baker?

870

In which case, we will go to a show of hands and I would ask for those in favour of Conseiller Baker joining the Policy and Finance Committee, please raise your hands. Thank you. Those against? **Carried.** Conseiller Baker, welcome back to P&F. (**Conseiller Baker MBE:** Thank you.)

875

Whilst we are on this, would the Taxation Special Committee like to propose a nomination, based on what we have heard this evening?

**Conseiller Miller:** I would like to suggest Conseiller Barker to speak.

880

**The Speaker:** To speak or is it a nomination?

**Conseiller Miller:** Well, he wants to speak and make a contribution.

**The Speaker:** He wants to speak. So this is to do with the Taxation Review (Special) Committee and the extra position that has been created on that Committee tonight.

885

So Conseiller Barker, thank you.

**Conseiller Barker:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I am on that Committee, actually. I would like to nominate, and use his resources as a qualified lawyer, which would probably help us in legal analysis and tax policies, of understanding regulatory compliances – I think he is an asset and we are not using him enough – I would like to nominate Conseiller Harris, please, sir.

890

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

895

Conseiller Guille; thank you.

**Conseiller Guille:** I would like to nominate Conseiller Locke, sir, to serve on the Special Taxation Committee.

Thank you.

900

**The Speaker:** So we have two nominations there. Do we have any other nominations from the floor? No?

So we are going to go to a vote on this. Two names are being proposed and therefore let's go with the first one, which is those in favour of Conseiller Harris joining the Taxation Review (Special) Committee, please raise your hands. Thank you for that.

905

And those in favour of Conseiller Locke joining the Committee? Thank you. Hands high, please. Conseiller Cragoe, could you raise your hand, please. I do not believe it. I think we have got a ... (*Laughter*)

910

**The Seigneur:** Who hasn't voted! (*Laughter*)

**The Speaker:** Someone has not voted, therefore. We have an abstention. Conseiller Miller, would you like to vote? I recognise you are the Chair or the Deputy Chair of that Committee. Would you like to vote?

915

**Conseiller Miller:** I would prefer not, sir.

**The Speaker:** You would prefer not to vote? *(Interjection)*

920

**Conseiller Miller:** Prefer not to.

**The Speaker:** Okay. We have a hung vote, therefore. It is very unfair to ask: would anyone like to change their position? No?

925

So we have therefore eight votes; eight votes in favour of Conseiller Harris and eight votes in favour of Conseiller Locke. I think it is excellent that these things are contested, but maybe not quite so closely. *(Laughter)*

930

In which case, I am going to defer this to the next Meeting of Chief Pleas. That is what the Rules of Procedure call for. So for the time being, Conseiller Miller, your Committee vacancy remains as is. We will defer it and we will bring it back to the next Meeting of Chief Pleas, which will give you all time to consider your positions.

Thank you.

#### **Committee and Panel Elections – Policy and Finance: Mr A Mancini elected**

*To elect non-Chief Pleas Members and Panel Members to Committees and Panels, as required.*

**The Speaker:** Whilst we are about it, again a hangover from Monday evening, does anyone have any non-Chief Pleas Members which they would like to propose?

Conseiller Guille; thank you.

935

**Conseiller Guille:** Thank you, sir.

Seeing as our Mandate change was agreed tonight, the Policy and Finance Committee would like to nominate Mr Tony Mancini to join the Policy and Finance Committee as a non-Chief Pleas Member.

940

Tony was a tax partner at KPMG in the Crown Dependencies for 17 years up to his retirement in September 2024, based in their Guernsey office. For the last three years, he led the tax practice at KPMG across Guernsey, Jersey and the Isle of Man. Tony has been a tax professional for 35 years and moved to Guernsey from the UK in 2003. In his time in Guernsey, he has worked closely with successive States on tax policy, from the introduction of Zero-10 in 2008, through the implementation of the Common Reporting Standard, the introduction of the economic substance rules and most recently on Guernsey's adoption of the OECD minimum tax rules.

945

His primary focus has been business and international tax, but as the tax lead partner for the Guernsey office has experienced across all aspects of tax, advising clients on a range of tax issues. Tony is a former chair of the Guernsey International Business Association, a member of the Tax Committee of the British Venture Capital Association (BVCA) in the UK, and currently sits as a non-States Member of the Committee for Economic Development.

950

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Guille, for that introduction, for those people who are not familiar with Mr Mancini. Thank you for that.

955

Conseiller Barker; thank you.

**Conseiller Barker:** Thank you, Mr Speaker; thank you, Conseiller Guille.

I earlier in Chief Pleas mentioned this point regarding the non-Chief Pleas Members to P&F. It was actually myself who introduced Tony Mancini to the Taxation Committee and I think he is a fantastic non-Chief Pleas Member, he will do a tremendous job. But I am a little bit confused, because should he not be a part of the Taxation Committee, not Policy and Finance? I am very aware, Conseiller Guille, Mr Speaker, that the Taxation Committee is a Special Committee of the Policy and Finance Committee, but I can only say how I feel jumping here a little bit to one to the other. So I think it would be good for the Taxation Committee for him to be involved. I am sure I am going to get an explanation.

965 Thank you, Mr Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Conseiller Barker, I appreciate that question, very sensible. Conseiller Guille, back to yourself.

970 **Conseiller Guille:** Conseiller Barker is not recalling a conversation we had in the Taxation Special Committee, when it was myself, Conseiller Miller and ex-Conseiller Delaney. We talked about Mr Mancini joining as a non-Chief Pleas Member. His time is very valuable. We are very lucky to secure somebody like this. The Special Taxation Committee brainstorms ideas for new taxes and brings them to P&F for implementation. It was specifically discussed in that meeting, and it was agreed, as far as I was aware, amongst all of us, that Mr Mancini's valuable time would be better served focusing on well-developed ideas and advising upon them that then get taken through P&F for implementation.

980 So I was surprised to hear Conseiller Barker bringing that up off the hoof tonight. We have had to approach Mr Mancini formally to ask him for his nomination, so I am absolutely not going to propose him for a Special Taxation Committee tonight, that he knows nothing about the nomination. But he has agreed to join P&F as their first non-Chief Pleas Member and I think it is for very logical reasons, in utilising the time of such an experienced person. He certainly cannot afford timewise to come to every meeting of P&F, far from that, but we are very grateful for the time that he is going to contribute to us in hopefully contributing to a significant overhaul of the Island's tax system. I hope that is a suitable explanation.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille. Conseiller Barker, back to yourself.

990 **Conseiller Barker:** Yes, thank you, Conseiller Guille for that explanation, I appreciate it.

I am back to the point where this started from the Taxation Committee, but I think this common sense could prevail here. Perhaps it would be a progressive and a good idea for Members of the Taxation Committee to be invited to the Policy and Finance Committee when Tony Mancini is there. It did all start from that Committee, Conseiller Guille, and I would really appreciate if that could be the case. I think that is very sensible. Or anyone else from Policy and Finance who would like to comment would be lovely.

**The Speaker:** So we are hearing what is being discussed here. Thank you for the various points that have been raised. Would anyone else like to add observation to this conversation?

1000 Conseiller Cragoe; thank you.

**Conseiller Cragoe:** Thank you.

1005 I suppose it is just a practical question. I am a little bit confused about if the Taxation Committee has not yet come up with ideas, perhaps Conseiller Guille could explain a little more how Mr Mancini is going to fit in, certainly in the first instance, particularly if they are meeting in separately.

**The Speaker:** Very good. Thank you, Conseiller Cragoe.  
Conseiller Guille, would you like to respond to that question?

1010

**Conseiller Guille:** The Taxation Committee does not have the exclusive right to come up with ideas about tax for the Island. Tax for the Island sits with Policy and Finance, sir, and the implementation of tax legislation for the Island sits with Policy and Finance. We do not sit on our hands waiting for the Taxation Committee to come up with the ideas. That is not the flow of policy here.

1015

Again, I am surprised Conseiller Barker cannot recall the specific conversation we had *in* the Taxation Committee about how best to utilise Mr Mancini's time. I am surprised by the off-the-cuff interjection tonight. I clearly told the Taxation Committee that we were going to approach Mr Mancini to join Policy and Finance.

1020

Myself, Michael Bertram, the SEO, and the Treasurer, Sarah Hudson, met with Mr Mancini in the KPMG offices in Guernsey, where we had an incredibly useful couple of hours with him. We are grateful to Conseiller Barker for getting him to Sark in the first place to meet the Special Taxation Committee, but none of this is new to me, and it should not be new to anybody on the Special Taxation Committee.

1025

I am certainly not going to make off-the-cuff commitments to end up with nine or 10 people in a room when we are trying to utilise the time efficiently of a very valuable asset for the Island. I do not think that is how good governance happens, just to make off-the-cuff commitments back and forth, when this was something that I thought was understood very well by everybody on the Taxation Committee and Policy and Finance.

1030

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille, for that comment. Would anyone else like to add any observations?

Back to Conseiller Barker; thank you.

1035

**Conseiller Barker:** The Taxation Committee, Mr Speaker, has three current Members, which is a Special Committee of the Policy and Finance Committee, it has got three current Members *from* the Policy and Finance Committee. So we are not going to increase the numbers, sir, to nine or 10, whatever was suggested. We are going to increase it to the other Members. Actually, that is just myself at this present moment in time and possibly one other at the next Chief Pleas Meeting.

1040

I did not think it was a big request to ask for, I did not think it was off the cuff, I thought it was pretty sensible, sir. Initial meetings happened with the Taxation Committee, so I just think it would have been pleasant to be asked to join that when Tony Mancini it was over, and that is all.

Thank you.

1045

**The Speaker:** Conseiller Guille, thank to yourself.

**Conseiller Guille:** True. I absolutely cede that on numbers; my mistake on the numbers. But I am going back to this: I have been blindsided by Conseiller Barker's inability to remember the clear discussions we had in Special Taxation, and I am not going to commit to a suggestion that has just come off the floor tonight. It is a pretty simple thing. We agreed that Mr Mancini would be most effective joining Policy and Finance and I am not going to react off the hoof because Conseiller Barker cannot remember what went on in our meetings.

1050

1055

**The Speaker:** Interesting debate.  
Conseiller Lord; thank you.

**Conseiller Lord:** I get the sense of an element of frustration on the part of my colleague Conseiller Guille and I can understand, I can empathise. Perhaps it would help for certainly I feel,

1060 as one of the newbies, maybe for the other newbies as well, the Special Tax Committee is there to go and have access to try and come up with tax ideas. He is right that it is not exclusive. I am struggling to understand why stopping the Tax Committee from having access to Mr Mancini is an issue.

1065 I can understand having him on the Policy and Finance Committee, but perhaps having the Special Taxation Committee present in the meetings, or maybe we could have a summary that is sent to them might be useful to them. As long as they have got access to the resource, that would seem to be reasonable to me.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Lord.

1070 I will come to you in one second, Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard. Back to Conseiller Guille, please.

**Conseiller Guille:** It is very simple: we have asked Mr Mancini to join the Policy and Finance meeting, we did not ask him to join a combined Policy and Finance and Taxation Committee meeting. I cannot offer that myself without consulting with him.

1075 So I am not trying to be obstructive, I am just trying to do things in the correct order without ... I thought this was all agreed a long time ago and these off-the-cuff suggestions off the floor, sometimes they are useful, but sometimes you have got to respect the professional people who you have engaged with, and you have got to do things in a proper order. So I think that is fair on everybody involved.

1080

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard, you had your hand up; thank you.

**Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard:** Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker.

1085 Just from a point of view of mediation and maybe bringing this to a close, because we had a few back and forths, I do understand what Conseiller Guille is saying, that we make decisions via Committee, so I think he would probably like to go back to Committee and discuss that. There are a couple of workarounds here, obviously.

1090 Tony Mancini, I do not know the chap. I presume he does not live on the Island. If he does come across here, there is probably a potential for him to meet with the Taxation Committee before a P&F potentially, so that could be one option, or I do believe in Committees working together as much as possible for the betterment of the Island, so there may be a possibility of a joint Committee meeting at some stage. I am just offering a couple of solutions there that I think could work.

1095 Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard.

Conseiller Cragoe, you had your hand up as well; thank you.

1100 **Conseiller Cragoe:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1105 I am not going to weigh in particularly on this debate, but I do think there are some implications more widely for how the Special Committees that are primarily composed of Policy and Finance Members operate in regard to their non-Policy and Finance Members and whether decisions are being made, the non-P&F Members are occasionally being invited to decorate a meeting. Or whether there is actually a genuine ... *[Inaudible]* the Committees function. I think there is potentially an issue with two competing roles, that things get discussed in P&F that might belong in one of the Special Committees sometimes, even if it is primarily composed of P&F Members.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Cragoe.

1110 Conseiller Guille, back to yourself.

1115 **Conseiller Guille:** I am not sure where Conseiller Cragoe has got that idea from. When we discussed Tony Mancini joining the Policy and Finance Committee, we discussed it in the Taxation Committee at a time when there was myself, Conseiller Miller, from Policy and Finance, and Conseiller Delaney and Conseiller Barker not from Policy and Finance in the Taxation Committee.

1120 I will reiterate it again: we discussed what is a useful application of this very valuable professional's time and it was felt his time would be more usefully put into the implementation and the final 20%, or the final half of doing tax policy. The Special Taxation Committee can come up with ideas to feed into P&F, but you need to really polish them and stress test them in the Policy and Finance Committee.

1125 It was never felt that he would have enough time to cover both Committees, and it was felt that his time would be best spent zeroing in on the final concepts of taxes that we are going to bring to the House and ask to be passed into law. That is certainly how I remember the discussions in the Special Taxation Committee.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Guille.

1130 So there we have it – never had such an interesting debate about a non-Chief Pleas Member. I can see the different opinions, the different views. I think the fact remains, and I cannot judge on this, Mr Mancini has been approached by the Policy and Finance Committee to be a non-Chief Pleas Member of that Committee. What is currently being discussed is maybe not doing that. I am not sure we can actually go down that route, as I read it. I hear also what Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard said.

1135 I am inclined to go to the vote and to say – do not put your hands up just yet – those in favour of Mr Mancini joining the Policy and Finance Committee as a non-Chief Pleas Member, as agreed in the Mandate change this evening under Agenda Item 4, that is the sort of thing that I would like to propose. And those obviously who do not wish to vote that in favour can obviously vote against that, but I think that is the fairest way of going about this. Mr Mancini has been approached with that in mind.

1140 One second, Conseiller Harris; Conseiller Guille first.

1145 **Conseiller Guille:** Yes. We are asking a professional to join and offer his services to Chief Pleas and I do not find that this is a very professional way ... He has been approached specifically by the Policy and Finance Committee, he has accepted that, he already does work for the Economic Development Committee in Guernsey. I do not think it reflects very professionally if a simple proposition like this is then pulled apart on the floor of the House and I do not think it is very encouraging for professionals who are going to offer their time for free to Chief Pleas, if there is a mishmash on a simple thing like electing him to help a Committee.

1150 **The Speaker:** Conseiller Guille, thank you.  
Conseiller Harris; thank you.

**Conseiller Harris:** Thank you, sir.

1155 I am interested by talk about professionalism, professionality. I think one of the issues this is the exhaust of is the fact there are a lot of people in here who feel that information is kept quite tightly reined in around a small ... I hear Conseiller Guille's sigh, and I know it is irritating to hear me say it again. I am not going to bleat on about it, but I think if there is a feeling that things are tightly managed, then people feel that things are done perhaps in order to get outcomes, rather than to have open discussions.

1160 I heard Conseiller Kennedy-Barnard suggest that the Policy and Finance Committee could discuss what they want to do with this resource and I wondered if that was a good idea, whether the Committee at its meeting, maybe it could meet with the Taxation Committee or not, but they could have a discussion, as a Committee, to decide what to do with this resource perhaps, but I do not know.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Harris.

1165 So there we have it. Obviously this debate has come about directly – Conseiller Barker, one second – as a result of the change of the Mandate this evening at Agenda Item 4. So this is new ground. Before we go any further, and I come back to Conseiller Guille, Conseiller Barker, have you got something you would like to add?

1170 **Conseiller Barker:** Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker.

It is in the best interest of Sark for Tony Mancini to come to the Island as a non-Chief Pleas Member. This is not in question at all. I will be voting for this proposition 100%, but I think I have said what I have said really. I am bit disappointed in how it is all happened, that is all, regarding the Taxation Committee. That is it.

1175 Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Conseiller Barker.

Conseiller Guille, before we go to the vote on this, would you just like to sum up for clarity for everyone as to what is being proposed by P&F?

1180 **Conseiller Guille:** I do not think I need to. It is very straightforward.

**The Speaker:** Fine.

1185 In which case, there you are, you have heard the discussion, you have heard the debate, it is based on the change to the Mandate of the Policy and Finance Committee that we did earlier this evening, Agenda Item 4, and therefore the proposition is that Mr Mancini should be elected to the Policy and Finance Committee as a non-Chief Pleas Member. Those in favour, please raise your hands. That is everyone. Thank you very much indeed. That is unanimous. Therefore, Mr Mancini (*Interjection by Conseiller Harris*) has joined the Policy and Finance Committee as a non-Chief Pleas Member. (*Interjection by the Seigneur*)

1190 **Conseiller Harris:** I abstained, sir.

**The Speaker:** Oh, you did. I beg your pardon, sir. So therefore, those in favour was 16, those against ... Are you voting against or ...? (*Interjection by Conseiller Harris*) No voting; abstaining. So 16 in favour and one no vote. But the fact remains – thank you – that Mr Mancini has joined the Policy and Finance Committee as a non-Chief Pleas Member. Getting myself in knots.

1200 Are there any other nominations to join any other Committees, based on what we have heard? Obviously we are deferring the Policy and Finance one until the next Meeting – no we are not, we are ... Taxation Review.

### **Easter Meeting deadline – Statement by the Speaker**

**The Speaker:** With that, I think that concludes the business. Where is my script? We have gone off *piste* here. So my closing statement is that the Easter Meeting of Chief Pleas is on Wednesday, 30th April. Committees, will you please ensure to submit your reports with supporting papers in good time and no later than 12 noon on Tuesday, 1st April 2025. This time is necessary for administration purposes. The papers will be produced the following week and distributed. And that is for the Meeting that will take place on Wednesday, 30th April.

1205 With that, I will call the Meeting to a close and ask the Greffier for the closing prayer. Thank you.



**PRAYER**

*The Greffier*

*Chief Pleas closed at 6.42 p.m.*