

Studies in Church History

50

RELIGION AND THE HOUSEHOLD



John Doran

RELIGION AND THE HOUSEHOLD

PAPERS READ AT
THE 2012 SUMMER MEETING AND
THE 2013 WINTER MEETING OF
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY

EDITED BY

JOHN DORAN (†)
CHARLOTTE METHUEN
and
ALEXANDRA WALSHAM

PUBLISHED FOR
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY
BY
THE BOYDELL PRESS
2014

© Ecclesiastical History Society 2014

All Rights Reserved. Except as permitted under current legislation no part of this work may be photocopied, stored in a retrieval system, published, performed in public, adapted, broadcast, transmitted, recorded or reproduced in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of the copyright owner

First published 2014

A publication of the Ecclesiastical History Society
in association with The Boydell Press
an imprint of Boydell & Brewer Ltd
PO Box 9, Woodbridge, Suffolk IP12 3DE, UK
and of Boydell & Brewer Inc.
668 Mt Hope Avenue, Rochester, NY 14620-2731, USA
website: www.boydellandbrewer.com

ISBN 978-0-95468-102-9

ISSN 0424-2084

A CIP catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library

The publisher has no responsibility for the continued existence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Details of previous volumes are available from Boydell & Brewer Ltd

This publication is printed on acid-free paper

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
List of Illustrations	x
List of Contributors	xv
List of Abbreviations	xviii
Introduction	xxi
John Doran (1966–2012): An Appreciation BRENDA BOLTON	I
Relationships, Resistance and Religious Change in the Early Christian Household KATE COOPER	5
Material Christianity in the Early Medieval Household JULIA M. H. SMITH	23
Households of St Edmund SARAH FOOT	47
‘A faithful and wise servant’? Innocent III (1198–1216) looks at his Household BRENDA BOLTON	59
The College of Cardinals under Honorius III: A Nepotistic Household? THOMAS W. SMITH	74
Perfection and Pragmatism: Cathar Attitudes to the Household BERNARD HAMILTON	86
Daily Commodities and Religious Identity in the Medieval Jewish Communities of Northern Europe ELISHEVA BAUMGARTEN	97
Holy Families: The Spiritualization of the Early Modern Household Revisited (<i>Presidential Address</i>) ALEXANDRA WALSHAM	122
Richard Whitford’s <i>Werke for Housholders</i> : Humanism, Monasticism and Tudor Household Piety LUCY WOODING	161

CONTENTS

The Syon Household at Denham, 1539–50 PETER CUNICH	174
Reforming Household Piety: John Foxe and the Lollard Conventicle Tradition SUSAN ROYAL	188
The Decalogue, Patriarchy and Domestic Religious Education in Reformation England JONATHAN WILLIS	199
Living with the Bible in Post-Reformation England: The Materiality of Text, Image and Object in Domestic Life TARA HAMLING	210
<i>Adoramus te Christe</i> : Music and Post-Reformation English Catholic Domestic Piety EMILIE K. M. MURPHY	240
Needlework and Moral Instruction in English Seventeenth- Century Households: The Case of Rebecca AMANDA PULLAN	254
Catechesis, Socialization and Play in a Catholic Household, <i>c.</i> 1660: The ‘Children’s Exercises’ from the Blundell Papers LUCY UNDERWOOD	269
‘A dose of physick’: Medical Practice and Confessional Identity within the Household SOPHIE MANN	282
‘My house shall be called the house of prayer’: Religion and the Material Culture of the Episcopal Household, <i>c.</i> 1500 to <i>c.</i> 1800 MICHAEL ASHBY	294
‘Conscientious attention to publick and family worship of God’: Religious Practice in Eighteenth-Century English Households W. M. JACOB	307
Sons of the Prophets: Domestic Clerical Seminaries in Late Georgian England SARA SLINN	318

CONTENTS

'Idle reading'? Policing the Boundaries of the Nineteenth-Century Household GARETH ATKINS	331
The Spiritual Home of W. E. Gladstone: Anne Gladstone's Bible DAVID BEBBINGTON	343
The Death of Charlotte Bloomfield in 1828: Family Roles in an Evangelical Household ANTHONY FLETCHER	354
The Oxford Movement, Marriage and Domestic Life: John Keble, Isaac Williams and Edward King JOHN BONEHAM	366
Islam at Home: Religion, Piety and Private Space in Muslim India and Victorian Britain, c.1850–1905 JUSTIN JONES	378
'Domestic charms, business acumen, and devotion to Christian work': Sarah Terrett, the Bible Christian Church, the Household and the Public Sphere in Late Victorian Bristol LINDA WILSON	405
Who is Living at the Vicarage? An Analysis of the 1881 Census Returns for Clerical Households in Lincolnshire JOHN W. B. TOMLINSON	416
The Missionary Home as a Site for Mission: Perspectives from Belgian Congo DAVID MAXWELL	428
Christian Family, Christian Nation: Raymond Johnston and the Nationwide Festival of Light in Defence of the Family ANDREW ATHERSTONE	456
Unfettering Religion: Women and the Family Chain in the Late Twentieth Century CALLUM G. BROWN	469
Household Sovereignty and Religious Subjectification: China and the Christian West compared ADAM YUET CHAU	492

CONTRIBUTORS

Michael ASHBY

Postgraduate student, University of Cambridge

Andrew ATHERSTONE

Tutor in History and Doctrine, and Latimer Research
Fellow, Wycliffe Hall, Oxford

Gareth ATKINS

Research Fellow, Magdalene College, Cambridge, and
Postdoctoral Fellow, Centre for Research in Arts, Social
Sciences and Humanities, Cambridge

Elisheva BAUMGARTEN

Associate Professor, Departments of Jewish History and
History, Hebrew University of Jerusalem

David BEBBINGTON

Professor of History, University of Stirling

Brenda BOLTON

Formerly Senior Lecturer in History, Queen Mary and
Westfield College, University of London

John BONEHAM

Postgraduate student, Aberystwyth University

Callum G. BROWN

Professor of Late Modern European History, University of
Glasgow

Adam Yuet CHAU

University Senior Lecturer in the Anthropology of Modern
China, University of Cambridge

Kate COOPER

Professor of Ancient History, University of Manchester

Peter CUNICH

Associate Professor, Department of History, University of
Hong Kong

CONTRIBUTORS

Anthony FLETCHER
Emeritus Professor of English Social History, University of
London

Sarah FOOT
Regius Professor of Ecclesiastical History, University of
Oxford

Bernard HAMILTON
Professor Emeritus of Crusading History, University of
Nottingham

Tara HAMLING
Senior Lecturer in History, University of Birmingham

W. M. JACOB
Visiting Research Fellow, King's College, London

Justin JONES
Lecturer in the Study of Religion, University of Oxford

Sophie MANN
Postgraduate student, King's College, London

David MAXWELL
Dixie Professor of Ecclesiastical History, University of
Cambridge

Emilie K. M. MURPHY
Postgraduate student, University of York

Amanda PULLAN
Postgraduate student, Lancaster University

Susan ROYAL
Postgraduate student, Durham University

Sara SLINN (*Michael J. Kennedy Postgraduate Prize*)
Postgraduate student, University of Nottingham

Julia M. H. SMITH
Edwards Professor of Medieval History, University of Glasgow

Thomas W. SMITH
Postgraduate student, Royal Holloway, University of
London

John W. B. TOMLINSON
Lecturer, Lincoln College

CONTRIBUTORS

Lucy UNDERWOOD

Fellow, British School at Rome

Alexandra WALSHAM (*President*)

Professor of Modern History, University of Cambridge

Jonathan WILLIS

Lecturer in Early Modern History, University of
Birmingham

Linda WILSON

Senior Lecturer, University of Gloucestershire

Lucy WOODING

Senior Lecturer in Early Modern History, King's College,
London

ABBREVIATIONS

<i>ActaSS</i>	<i>Acta sanctorum</i> , ed. J. Bolland and G. Henschen (Antwerp etc., 1643–)
<i>AFP</i>	<i>Archivum fratrum praedicatorum</i> (1931–)
<i>AHR</i>	<i>American Historical Review</i> (1895–)
<i>AnBoll</i>	<i>Analecta Bollandiana</i> (1882–)
<i>ARG</i>	<i>Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte</i> (1903–)
<i>AV</i>	Authorized Version
<i>BAV</i>	Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana
<i>BHL</i>	<i>Bibliotheca hagiographica latina antiquae et mediae aetatis</i> , 3 vols (Brussels, 1898–1901)
<i>BL</i>	British Library
<i>Bodl.</i>	Bodleian Library
<i>BN</i>	Bibliothèque nationale de France
<i>CChr</i>	Corpus Christianorum (Turnhout, 1953–)
<i>CChr.SL</i>	Corpus Christianorum, series Latina (1953–)
<i>CERS</i>	Church of England Record Society
<i>ChH</i>	<i>Church History</i> (1932–)
<i>CICan</i>	<i>Corpus iuris canonici</i> , ed. E. Richter and E. Friedberg, 2 vols (Leipzig, 1879–81)
<i>CQR</i>	<i>Church Quarterly Review</i> (1875–1968)
<i>CRS</i>	Catholic Record Society
<i>CSEL</i>	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum (Vienna, 1866–)
<i>EETS</i>	Early English Text Society
<i>EHR</i>	<i>English Historical Review</i> (1886–)
<i>ET</i>	English translation
<i>GH</i>	<i>Gender and History</i> (1989–)
<i>HistJ</i>	<i>Historical Journal</i> (1958–)
<i>HR</i>	<i>Historical Research</i> (1986–)
<i>JAH</i>	<i>Journal of African History</i> (1960–)
<i>JBS</i>	<i>Journal of British Studies</i> (1961–)
<i>J ECS</i>	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i> (1993–)
<i>JEH</i>	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i> (1950–)
<i>JEMH</i>	<i>Journal of Early Modern History</i> (1997–)

ABBREVIATIONS

<i>JFH</i>	<i>Journal of Family History</i> (1976–)
<i>JRS</i>	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i> (1911–)
<i>JThS</i>	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i> (1899–)
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LPL	Lambeth Palace Library
<i>LW</i>	<i>Luther's Works</i> , ed. J. Pelikan and H. Lehmann, 55 vols (St Louis, MO, 1955–75)
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica inde ab a. c. 500 usque ad a. 1500, ed. G. H. Pertz et al. (Hanover, Berlin, etc., 1826–)
MGH Capit.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitularia regum Francorum (1883–97)
MGH Epp.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Epistolae (1887–)
MGH SRG i.u.s.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum seperatum editi (1871–)
MGH SRM	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum (1884–1951)
MGH SS	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores (in folio) (1826–)
n.d.	no date
<i>NH</i>	<i>Northern History</i> (1966–)
n.s.	new series
ODNB	<i>Oxford Dictionary of National Biography</i> , ed. H. C. G. Matthew and Brian Harrison (Oxford, 2004)
OECT	Oxford Early Christian Texts
OED	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i>
OHCC	Oxford History of the Christian Church
<i>P&P</i>	<i>Past and Present</i> (1952–)
PL	Patrologia Latina, ed. J.-P. Migne, 217 vols + 4 index vols (Paris, 1844–65)
PS	Parker Society
<i>RH</i>	<i>Recusant History</i> (1951–)
<i>s.a.</i>	<i>sub anno</i> ('under the year')
SC	Sources Chrétiennes (Paris, 1941–)
SCH	Studies in Church History
SCH S	Studies in Church History: Subsidia
<i>SCJ</i>	<i>Sixteenth Century Journal</i> (1970–2006)
SEHT	Studies in Evangelical History and Thought
SHCM	Studies in the History of Christian Missions

ABBREVIATIONS

<i>s.n.</i>	<i>sub nomine</i> ('under the name')
<i>s.v.</i>	<i>sub verbo</i> ('under the word')
TNA	The National Archives
<i>TRHS</i>	<i>Transactions of the Royal Historical Society</i> (1871–)
UL	University Library
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

THE COLLEGE OF CARDINALS UNDER HONORIUS III: A NEPOTISTIC HOUSEHOLD?*

by THOMAS W. SMITH

The College of Cardinals constituted the innermost circle of the medieval papal household – arguably one of the most important households in Christendom – whose influence was sought by envoys pursuing diplomatic affairs and petitioners looking to secure grace and justice. The relationships between the pope and the cardinals of his household, and of the household with those outside the papal curia, were integral to the operation of papal government. The college consulted with the pope on matters of politics and everyday church administration, and its specific roles included the election of new popes, the concession of privileges, auditing legal cases heard at the papal curia, deployment of its members as legates *a latere*, and the administration of important curial departments.¹ Although the pope could not dismiss existing cardinals, it was the personal prerogative of the reigning pope to select clergy for appointment to this elite household, although his decisions seem to have been subject to ratification by the existing members of the college, whose exact level of involvement in appointments remains unclear.²

This essay analyses the nature of the ties within the household of the college which bound cardinals to the pope and each other, ties which derived from a mixture of nepotism and kinship, the influence of contemporary politics, and elements of meritocracy. The pope and his cardinals constituted a household of brothers; in papal documents such as a letter issued by Pope Honorius III (1216–27) on 10 April 1220 popes referred to their discussions

* I wish to express my gratitude to Barbara Bombi, Sarah Foot, Bernard Hamilton, Christopher Tilley and the editors of *Studies in Church History* for commenting on this essay.

¹ Walter Ullmann, *A Short History of the Papacy in the Middle Ages*, 2nd edn (London, 2003), 232; Pierre Jugie, 'Cardinal (jusqu'au concile de Trente)', in Philippe Levillain, ed., *Dictionnaire historique de la papauté* (Paris, 2003), 277–81, at 277–8; Colin Morris, *The Papal Monarchy: The Western Church from 1050 to 1250*, OHCC (Oxford, 1989), 570.

² Ullmann, *Papacy*, 232; Morris, *Papal Monarchy*, 210; I. S. Robinson, *The Papacy 1073–1198: Continuity and Innovation* (Cambridge, 1990), 45–7.

The College of Cardinals under Honorius III

'*cum fratribus nostris*' ('with our brothers').³ Given the pope's role in appointing cardinals, it has been assumed that the college was a nepotistic household, with popes simply selecting relatives and friends to fill the top jobs. Bernhard Schimmelpfennig argued that nepotism and family power struggles were rife in the thirteenth-century College of Cardinals, and stated that Pope Innocent III (1198–1216) had appointed relatives to important positions in the college and removed rivals in the process, supposedly including Cencius *Camerarius*, the future Honorius III.⁴ Colin Morris similarly claimed that Cencius had lost power under Innocent III.⁵ Schimmelpfennig maintained that when Cencius was elected as Pope Honorius III in 1216 'the carousel turned again' and Innocent's kinsmen were ejected and replaced by Honorius's.⁶ In summary, Schimmelpfennig argued that 'a change of popes promised to bring with it a saturation of the control of the favoured clan'.⁷ This was questioned in passing by Sandro Carocci, but Honorius's college has yet to be subjected to modern historical analysis.⁸

Cencius did not belong to the Roman Savelli family as traditionally claimed; rather, he was of humble origins, and stated in the *Liber censuum* (a book of payments owed to the Church which he finished compiling in 1192) that he owed everything in life to the Church.⁹ Werner Maleczek suggests plausibly that he might have belonged to a minor Roman family and worked his way up through the Church.¹⁰ Matthias Thumser posits that he belonged

³ Vatican City, Archivio Segreto Vaticano, Registra Vaticana [hereafter: Reg. Vat.] 10, fol. 171^v; *Regesta Honorii Papae III*, ed. P. Pressutti, 2 vols (Rome, 1888–95; repr. Hildesheim, 1978), no. 2392.

⁴ Bernhard Schimmelpfennig, *The Papacy*, transl. James Sievert (New York, 1992), 175. The most recent German edition maintains this argument: idem, *Das Papsttum: Von der Antike bis zur Renaissance*, 6th edn, rev. Elke Goez (Darmstadt, 2009), 196–7.

⁵ Morris, *Papal Monarchy*, 570.

⁶ Schimmelpfennig, *Papacy*, 175.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Sandro Carocci, *Il nepotismo nel medioevo: Papi, cardinali e famiglie nobili* (Rome, 1999), 116.

⁹ Sandro Carocci and Marco Vendittelli, 'Onorio III.', in Manlio Simonetti et al., eds, *Enciclopedia dei papi*, 3 vols (Rome, 2000), 2: 350–62, at 350–1; Werner Maleczek, *Papst und Kardinalskolleg von 1191 bis 1216: Die Kardinäle unter Coelestin III. und Innocenz III.* (Vienna, 1984), 111–12; *Le Liber Censuum de l'Église Romaine*, ed. P. Fabre, L. Duchesne and G. Mollat, 3 vols (Paris, 1889–1952), 1: 2.

¹⁰ Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 112.

to the Capocci family, but this too has been questioned by Sandro Carocci.¹¹ Cencius's date of birth is unknown, although he must have been born in the mid-twelfth century, probably in the 1150s or 1160s; the curialist Jacques de Vitry referred to Cencius as 'senex' in 1216.¹²

Cencius had been appointed to a canonry at S. Maria Maggiore and held the position of chamberlain at the curia since 1188. He was appointed cardinal deacon of S. Lucia in Orthea by Celestine III in 1193, and was made chancellor in 1194, combining it with his position as chamberlain. Between 1191 and 1198 Cencius acted as an auditor at the curia, and in 1196 was chosen to negotiate with Emperor Henry VI (1191–7). Cencius's dual role as chancellor and chamberlain was abolished by Innocent III, but he was promoted to cardinal priest of SS. Giovanni e Paolo in 1200.¹³

This essay questions whether Honorius III's college was the simple nepotistic household Schimmelpfennig claimed. Such a study is much needed: while prosopographical studies of the college under Innocent III and Gregory IX (1227–41) have been conducted by Maleczek and Agostino Paravicini Bagliani, there remains a significant historiographical gap for Honorius III's reign in the intervening period, which this essay addresses.¹⁴

To assess Honorius's influence over the college, its composition on his accession must be outlined. Honorius inherited twenty-two cardinals from Innocent III.¹⁵ Innocent's influence on the college had been significant, for he made thirty appointments throughout his eighteen-year pontificate, nineteen of whom were still living at the time of Honorius's succession.¹⁶ Of the other three cardinals

¹¹ Matthias Thumser, *Rom und der römische Adel in der späten Stauferzeit* (Tübingen, 1995), 60–1; Carocci, *Nepotismo*, 117.

¹² Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres de la Cinquième Croisade*, ed. R. B. C. Huygens, transl. G. Duchet-Suchaux (Turnhout, 1998), 24; see also Jane E. Sayers, *Papal Government and England during the Pontificate of Honorius III (1216–1227)* (Cambridge, 1984), 1.

¹³ Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 112.

¹⁴ Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*; idem, 'Zwischen lokaler Verankerung und universalem Horizont: Das Kardinalskollegium unter Innocenz III.', in *Innocenzo III: Urbs et Orbis, Atti del Congresso Internazionale Roma, 9–15 settembre 1998*, ed. Andrea Sommerlechner, 2 vols (Rome, 2003), 1: 102–74; Agostino Paravicini Bagliani, *Cardinali di curia e 'familiae' cardinalizie dal 1227 al 1254*, 2 vols (Padua, 1972).

¹⁵ For a full list, see Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 59–62. Maleczek counted twenty-three cardinals on Innocent III's death: *ibid.* 288. Robinson counted twenty-seven: Robinson, *Papacy*, 44.

¹⁶ Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 287–8.

The College of Cardinals under Honorius III

bequeathed to Honorius, one had been appointed by Alexander III (1159–81), and two by Clement III (1187–91). On his election as pope in July 1216, Cencius was the only surviving cardinal (of five) appointed by Celestine III (1191–8).¹⁷ The makeup of the college in 1216 was overwhelmingly Italian, specifically Roman: of the nineteen cardinals whose origins are certain, twelve came from Rome and its environs, and one each from Viterbo, Benevento, Capua and Vercelli. Of three non-Italians, one came from Spain, another from England, and the last from southern France.¹⁸ Innocent drew many of his thirty appointees from other curial offices: nine cardinals were created from papal chapel staff, three from the chancery, and one from the camera.¹⁹ Many were highly educated *magistri*, although relatively few were drawn from religious orders.²⁰ Neither Celestine III nor Innocent III were immune to accusations of nepotism, having both appointed blood relations as cardinals.²¹

The next step in analysing the household is to identify how it changed under Honorius. The number and identity of cardinals that Honorius is claimed to have created varies greatly, with numbers ranging from five to fourteen. Confusion stems from the unreliable but influential list of thirteen cardinals given by Alphonsus Ciaconius in the seventeenth century.²² Drawing on Ciaconius, Lorenzo Cardella printed a similar list in the eighteenth century, substituting one cardinal for another, but keeping the total number at thirteen.²³ In the nineteenth century Johannes Clausen reprinted Ciaconius's list and added an extra cardinal not seen before, bringing the total to fourteen.²⁴ More than half of these alleged creations were incorrectly ascribed to Honorius.

¹⁷ For Celestine's five appointments, see *ibid.* 111–24.

¹⁸ *Ibid.* 293.

¹⁹ *Ibid.* 293–4. On Innocent III's household, see, in this volume, Brenda Bolton, "'A faithful and wise servant'?: Innocent III (1198–1216) looks at his Household', 59–73.

²⁰ Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 294–5.

²¹ *Ibid.* 295.

²² Alphonsus Ciaconius, *Vitae, et res gestae pontificum romanorum et S.R.E. cardinalium*, ed. Augustus Oldoinus, 4 vols (Rome, 1677), 2: 43–66.

²³ Lorenzo Cardella, *Memorie storiche de' cardinali della santa romana chiesa*, 9 vols (Rome, 1792–7), 1/2: 232–43.

²⁴ Johannes Clausen, *Papst Honorius III. (1216–1227): Eine Monographie* (Bonn, 1895), 397–8.

At the beginning of the twentieth century Conrad Eubel removed the erroneous attributions and published a new list of five cardinals appointed by Honorius: Egidio Torres (cardinal deacon of SS. Cosma e Damiano, 1216); Conrad of Urach (cardinal bishop of Porto e S. Rufina, 1219); Nicholas da Chiaromonte (cardinal bishop of Tusculum, 1219); Peter Capuanus (cardinal deacon of S. Giorgio in Velabro, 1219); and Oliver of Paderborn (cardinal bishop of Sabina, 1225).²⁵ This was the most accurate list to date, although Aldebrand Orsini (cardinal deacon of S. Eustachio, 1216; cardinal priest of S. Susanna, 1219; cardinal bishop of Sabina, 1221), whom Eubel listed as one of Innocent III's creations, but whom Maleczek did not identify as one of that pope's appointments, should also be included, because of Honorius's patronage of him.²⁶ The witness lists of papal privileges confirm these identifications and do not reveal any unknown cardinals, although Honorius may have created cardinals of whom no documentary traces remain. The total number of cardinals known to have been created by Honorius III thus stands at six.²⁷

Having spent over a quarter of a century in service at the curia before becoming pope, Honorius must have owed some of his greatest allegiances to his former peers, the cardinals who now made up his own household – men appointed by Celestine III and Innocent III – which may explain why he made so few appointments to the college. Given his age and humble origins, Honorius was probably neither surrounded by ambitious young men, nor had relatives suitable for immediate creation as cardinals; that Honorius only appointed two cardinals in 1216 is perhaps evidence

²⁵ Conrad Eubel, *Hierarchia catholica medii aevi*, 2nd edn, 6 vols (Münster, 1913–58), I: 5.

²⁶ Ibid. 5.

²⁷ Matthias Thumser, 'Aldobrandino Orsini (1217–1221), ein Kardinal Honorius III.', *Römische Historische Mitteilungen* 32/33 (1990/1), 41–9, at 42 and n. 5; Falko Neining, *Konrad von Urach* († 1227): *Zähringer, Zisterzienser, Kardinallegat* (Paderborn, 1994), 159. In 1217 Honorius also promoted four cardinals created by Celestine III and Innocent III: Bertrand from cardinal deacon of S. Giorgio in Velabro to cardinal priest of SS. Giovanni e Paolo; John Colonna from cardinal deacon of SS. Cosma e Damiano to cardinal priest of S. Prassedes; Cinthius from cardinal priest of S. Lorenzo in Lucina to cardinal bishop of Porto and S. Rufina; and Peter Collivaccinus of Benevento from cardinal priest of S. Lorenzo in Damaso to cardinal bishop of Sabina. In 1221 Honorius promoted Guido Pierleoni from cardinal deacon of S. Nicola in Carcere Tulliano to cardinal bishop of Preneste; Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 170, 158, 106, 174, 141 respectively. They are not recorded as having had special connections to Honorius.

The College of Cardinals under Honorius III

for this. However, although Honorius did not appoint any relatives as cardinals, he did appoint kinsmen to lower positions in the Church. A papal letter of 22 January 1218 despatched to the legate in England, Guala, cardinal priest of S. Martino, reveals that after eighteen months in office Honorius could still proudly claim that 'we do not recall having provided any of our own kinsmen to a living, so that they murmur against us', before promptly appointing just such a familiar, John de Tebaldo, to one of the 'better prebends' in England.²⁸

In the first consistory, held in December 1216, Honorius made two appointments to the college. Honorius created Aldebrand Orsini cardinal deacon of S. Eustachio, promoted him in 1219 to be cardinal priest of S. Susanna, and elevated him a second time to become cardinal bishop of Sabina in 1221, making him the only cardinal promoted twice by Honorius. Thumser argues compellingly that Aldebrand belonged to the Orsini family, rather than the Caietani as traditionally thought.²⁹ The Orsini were a powerful Roman noble family that had flourished under Celestine III: the family founder, Orso, was Celestine's nephew.³⁰ Aldebrand's ancestors had served at the curia under Honorius's predecessors, and his swift appointment at the start of the pope's reign and subsequent promotions suggest that Aldebrand was known to Honorius before 1216.

After his appointment Aldebrand used his position at the curia to advance his own relatives: a papal letter was issued on 22 March 1217 to the archbishop and chapter of York that secured a prebend for his relation Gimundus.³¹ Aldebrand exerted his influence again when another papal letter was issued on 13 April 1221 to the bishop and chapter of Paris, ordering that a Paris prebend which he had possessed when cardinal priest of S. Susanna be awarded

²⁸ Reg. Vat. 9, fol. 201^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 1015); ET Nicholas Vincent: *The Letters and Charters of Cardinal Guala Bicchieri, Papal Legate in England, 1216–1218* (Woodbridge, 1996), lxxiii, 144–5 (no. 177); John Doran kindly brought this reference to my attention.

²⁹ Thumser, 'Aldobrandino', 44–6.

³⁰ Sandro Carocci, *Baroni di Roma: Dominazioni signorili e lignaggi aristocratici nel duecento e nel primo trecento* (Rome, 1993), 387–8; John Doran, 'A Lifetime of Service in the Roman Church', in idem and Damian J. Smith, eds, *Pope Celestine III (1191–1198): Diplomat and Pastor* (Farnham, 2008), 31–79, at 78.

³¹ Reg. Vat. 9, fol. 127^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 458); Thumser, 'Aldobrandino', 48.

to his nephew James and thus be retained within his family.³² As a cardinal, Aldebrand functioned as an auditor at the curia on a number of occasions.³³ He also maintained close links with France. In 1219 the chapter of Paris chose Aldebrand as bishop, a decision which Honorius reversed.³⁴ He was also recorded as a contact of King Philip Augustus (1180–1223) at the papal curia.³⁵

The second appointment in December 1216 was a Spaniard, Egidio Torres, whom Honorius created cardinal deacon of SS. Cosma e Damiano.³⁶ Egidio was employed as an auditor throughout Honorius's reign.³⁷ He also secured favours for his relatives and friends. On 2 May 1218 Honorius issued a mandate to the bishop, cantor and a *magister* of Burgos, ordering that Egidio's relative, 'P. *canonicus*' of Zamora, be awarded an archdeaconry.³⁸ Another papal letter of 3 January 1219, sent to the dean and chapter of Orense, reveals that Egidio secured a prebend there for another relative, Arius Petrus.³⁹ On 10 May 1219 Honorius issued a document to the bishop of Palencia granting Egidio's request for a cleric named Bartholomew to be awarded a dispensation to hold an ecclesiastical benefice.⁴⁰ On 21 April 1220, the bishop and chapter of Zamora were ordered to admit Egidio's chamberlain, also named Egidio, to the first available prebend.⁴¹ Such nepotism, spreading outwards from the papal household after a cardinal's appointment, was commonplace.

Honorius made no more appointments until 1219, when he created three new cardinals in January and September consistory. Conrad of Urach was drafted into the college's top rank when he was created cardinal bishop of Porto e S. Rufina in Janu-

³² Reg. Vat. 11, fol. 107^r (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 3241).

³³ *Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 1177, 2095, 2096; *Acta Honorii III (1216–1227) et Gregorii IX (1227–1241) e registris vaticanis aliisque fontibus collegit*, ed. A. L. Tautu (Vatican City, 1950), 98–9 (no. 69).

³⁴ Reg. Vat. 10, fols 145^v–146^r, 152^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 2279, 2286); Klaus Ganzer, *Die Entwicklung des auswärtigen Kardinalats im hohen Mittelalter: Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte des Kardinalkollegiums vom 11. bis 13. Jahrhundert* (Tübingen, 1963), 165.

³⁵ Thumser, 'Aldobrandino', 47.

³⁶ Eubel, *Hierarchia*, 5.

³⁷ *Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 723, 1479, 1533, 1556, 2064, 2851, 3212, 3436, 3794, 4029, 4081, 4809, 4981, 5011, 5261, 5614, 5798, 6138, 6206, 6211.

³⁸ Reg. Vat. 9, fol. 249 (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 1277).

³⁹ Reg. Vat. 10, fols 43^v, 46 (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 1781, 1798).

⁴⁰ Reg. Vat. 10, fol. 92^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 2055).

⁴¹ Reg. Vat. 10, fol. 173^r (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 2405).

The College of Cardinals under Honorius III

ary.⁴² Conrad came from a noble German family, being the son of Count Egino IV of Urach and his wife Agnes, the daughter of Duke Berthold IV of Zähringen, and had enjoyed an education in the household of his great-uncle, Rudolf of Zähringen, bishop of Liège, where he was a cathedral canon. Conrad had pursued a successful church career before his appointment: in 1199 he entered the Cistercian abbey of Villers in Brabant, and rose to become abbot in 1208/9. He became abbot of Clairvaux in 1213/14, and was abbot of Cîteaux by 1216/17.⁴³

The appointment of a German Cistercian marked Honorius's choice as doubly distinct from his predecessors' preferences, and probably reflects the nature of papal diplomacy at this time, which was focused on Emperor Frederick II's crusade. Indeed, Conrad was related to Frederick II (1220–50) in four or five degrees through his mother – something that Honorius must have recognized when despatching him as legate to Germany in 1224, and perhaps even when appointing him.⁴⁴ Conrad spent the majority of his career as cardinal on legation. He worked as a legate *a latere* to combat heresy in the south of France from 1220 to 1223.⁴⁵ In March 1224 he was selected as legate *a latere* to Germany to preach Frederick II's crusade, where he remained until 1226.⁴⁶ Soon after his appointment to Germany, however, in May 1224 he returned to France to conduct follow-up negotiations in Paris with King Louis VIII (1223–6).⁴⁷

In the consistory of January 1219 Honorius also appointed another Cistercian, Nicholas da Chiaromonte, to the college's upper echelon, creating him cardinal bishop of Tusculum.⁴⁸ Honorius's two creations from the Cistercians represented one-third of his total appointments, and probably signal an affinity with the

⁴² Eubel, *Hierarchia*, 5; Neiningen, *Konrad*, 157.

⁴³ Neiningen, *Konrad*, 64.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.* 75.

⁴⁵ Honorius III, *Opera omnia*, ed. C. A. Horoy, 5 vols (Paris, 1879–82), 3: 373; *Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 2301; Neiningen, *Konrad*, 64.

⁴⁶ Reg. Vat. 12, fols 183, 183^v–184^r (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 4903, 4904); Neiningen, *Konrad*, 64.

⁴⁷ Reg. Vat. 12, fol. 178^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 4921, 4922); Neiningen, *Konrad*, 207.

⁴⁸ Eubel, *Hierarchia*, 5, not to be confused with his predecessor as cardinal bishop of Tusculum (1204–18/19), also named Nicholas.

order.⁴⁹ We have only fragmentary knowledge of Nicholas's background. Falko Neininger wrote that he was an abbot and also a chaplain of Innocent III.⁵⁰ Nicholas Vincent has argued that he was the papal penitentiary who served in England under the legate Guala in 1217, although this has been queried by Patrick Zutshi.⁵¹ However, Vincent's case is convincing, and supported by circumstantial evidence: a papal letter of 29 November 1217, sent to the former abbot of Lagny, refers to the penitentiary in England, Nicholas, as a monk of Casamari.⁵² The abbey of Casamari was not only a Cistercian foundation, but also enjoyed the favour of Emperor Frederick II, to whom Nicholas was later sent as legate.⁵³

If we accept that Nicholas already had experience of international diplomacy in the service of an important legate and came from an abbey which enjoyed close relations with Frederick II, it may explain why he was quickly chosen for high-profile legations. Nicholas was first despatched as legate *a latere* to Frederick II's court in 1220 to prepare for the emperor-elect's coronation, then again in November 1221, and later to southern France in 1223 to fight heresy.⁵⁴ The name Chiaromonte appears to indicate that Nicholas originated from the Kingdom of Sicily, which, at a time when papal-imperial diplomacy revolved around the status of the kingdom and its relationship to the Holy Roman Empire, adds another dimension that perhaps sheds light on his creation as cardinal and selection as legate to Frederick II. When not on legation Nicholas also worked as an auditor at the curia.⁵⁵ The spread of nepotism from the curia was demonstrated once again on 23 September 1219, when Nicholas influenced the production of a papal document that ordered Bertrand, cardinal priest of

⁴⁹ Neininger, *Konrad*, 157.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.* 159.

⁵¹ *Letters*, ed. Vincent, lxxxvi, 110–12 (no. 142); Patrick Zutshi, 'Petitioners, Popes, Proctors: The Development of Curial Institutions, c.1150–1250', in Giancarlo Andenna, ed., *Pensiero e sperimentazioni istituzionali nella 'Societas Christiana' (1046–1250)* (Milan, 2007), 265–93, at 277 and n. 51; see also Emil Göller, *Die päpstliche Pönitentiarie: Von ihrem Ursprung bis zu ihrer Umgestaltung unter Pius V.*, 2 vols (Rome, 1907–11), 1: 82–3, 86, 131.

⁵² Reg. Vat. 9, fol. 176^r (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 493).

⁵³ Attilio Stendardi, 'Casamari', in André Vauchez, Barrie Dobson and Michael Lapidge, eds, *Encyclopedia of the Middle Ages*, 2 vols (Cambridge, 2000), 1: 247–8, at 247.

⁵⁴ Reg. Vat. 11, fols 37^v, 166 (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 276, 3581); *Opera*, ed. Horoy, 4: 492–3 (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 4646).

⁵⁵ *Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 2043, 2204, 4447, 4562, 5449, 5639, 6000.

The College of Cardinals under Honorius III

SS. Giovanni e Paolo, to provide a benefice for Nicholas's cleric, *magister* William.⁵⁶ On 19 November 1219 Nicholas, lacking a residence in Rome, was granted one by the pope.⁵⁷

Honorius's third creation was made in the September 1219 consistory when he made Peter Capuanus the Younger cardinal deacon of S. Giorgio in Velabro.⁵⁸ Peter was a distant nephew of the elder Peter Capuanus (d. 1214), who had served as a cardinal under Innocent III, most notably as legate on the Fourth Crusade (1202–4).⁵⁹ Both Peters belonged to a prominent Amalfitan family, but the elder Peter's major role under Innocent III would surely have lent the younger Peter *gravitas* in Rome.⁶⁰ Peter seems to have been inspired to follow his namesake's career path, and as a young papal subdeacon he followed in the elder Peter's footsteps to study at the University of Paris, where he earned the title *magister* and a doctorate, and subsequently held a chair of theology.⁶¹ The patronage of the elder Peter may have secured him a canonry in Sens, a benefice from the chapter of Saint-Martin at Tours, and perhaps also a canonry in Paris.⁶² Before his appointment as cardinal Peter had already been chosen as Latin patriarch of Antioch by Honorius, who cited the younger Peter's pedigree in a letter of 25 April 1219 to the dean and chapter of Antioch.⁶³ Peter did not pursue as illustrious a career as his uncle: there is little documentary evidence for his role, though he spent some time working as an auditor.⁶⁴ That Honorius proposed Peter as patriarch of Antioch before reversing his decision to create him cardinal points to favouritism: Honorius was apparently anxious to further Peter's career. It seems plausible that this derived from Peter's blood tie to the elder Peter Capuanus, with whom Honorius had served under Innocent III.

In August or early September 1225 Honorius made his final appointment, creating Oliver of Paderborn as cardinal bishop of Sabina, transferring him straight into the college's upper eche-

⁵⁶ Reg. Vat. 10, fol. 131^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 2201).

⁵⁷ Reg. Vat. 10, fol. 140^v (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 2261).

⁵⁸ Eubel, *Hierarchia*, 5; Werner Maleczek, *Petrus Capuanus: Kardinal, Legat am vierten Kreuzzug, Theologe († 1214)* (Vienna, 1988), 282.

⁵⁹ Maleczek, *Petrus*, 62.

⁶⁰ Ibid. 51; family tree *ibid.* 313–18.

⁶¹ Ibid. 281–2; Eubel, *Hierarchia*, 93.

⁶² Maleczek, *Petrus*, 281.

⁶³ Reg. Vat. 10, fols 86^r, 152^r (*Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 2031, 2285); Ganzer, *Entwicklung*, 165.

⁶⁴ *Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, nos 2321, 3449, 3793, 6232; Maleczek, *Petrus*, 282.

lon.⁶⁵ As cardinal, the papal registers only record that Oliver was employed as an auditor in an affair regarding Cologne.⁶⁶ We know more about Oliver's career before his appointment. At the end of the twelfth century, Oliver was a cathedral canon at Paderborn, before moving in 1201 to teach at the cathedral school of Cologne. Between 1205 and 1207/8 he preached the Albigensian Crusade, and made contact with the other curialists Robert of Courson and Jacques de Vitry at the University of Paris. After preaching the Fifth Crusade between 1213 and 1215, Oliver attended the Fourth Lateran Council in November 1215. He participated in the Fifth Crusade (1217–21) and wrote its most influential account, the so-called *Historia Damiatina*. Subsequently, he preached Frederick II's crusade in 1223.⁶⁷ On 7 April 1225, a matter of months before his creation as cardinal, Honorius confirmed Oliver as bishop of Paderborn.⁶⁸ Oliver therefore had an enviable record of papal service, which points to a more meritocratic creation by Honorius. The second appointment of a German cardinal also probably reflected the intensity of papal-imperial negotiations over Frederick II's crusade, of which Oliver had personal experience. Indeed, soon after his creation as cardinal Oliver was present at the papal-imperial colloquium at San Germano in July 1225 to plan Frederick's crusade.⁶⁹

The identification of six cardinals appointed piecemeal throughout Honorius's reign permits us to conclude that Honorius did not sweep away Innocent III's household and flood the college with his own kinsmen on his accession. In fact, the college as it operated under Honorius was mostly staffed by Innocent's appointees. The college did not change greatly in size under Honorius, although on his death in 1227 the membership had fallen slightly to eighteen.

The ties which bound Honorius's household together included nepotism, but also political necessity and aspects of a meritocracy.

⁶⁵ Eubel, *Hierarchia*, 5; H. Hoogeweg, ed., *Die Schriften des kölnen Domscholasters, späteren Bischofs von Paderborn und Kardinal-Bischofs von S. Sabina* (Tübingen, 1894), 1.

⁶⁶ *Regesta*, ed. Pressutti, no. 6235.

⁶⁷ Giancarlo Andenna and Barbara Bombi, eds, *I cristiani e il favoloso egitto: una relazione dall'Oriente e la storia di damietta di Oliviero da Colonia*, *Verso l'Oriente* 4 (Milan, 2009), 13–14; Rudolf Hiestand, 'Oliver Scholasticus und die Pariser Schulen zu Beginn des 13. Jahrhunderts: Zu einem neuen Textfund', *Jahrbuch des Kölnischen Geschichtsvereins* 58 (1987), 1–34, at 1–2.

⁶⁸ Hoogeweg, ed., *Schriften*, xlix.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*

The College of Cardinals under Honorius III

The sources do not tell us much about the pope's personal links with the men he appointed. The fact that he was appointing non-Romans, rather than Roman family and friends, suggests that they were known to him prior to their creation.⁷⁰ Honorius bucked the trend for appointing Roman cardinals that had predominated under his predecessors: half of his creations were not even Italian, let alone Roman. Honorius's creations of two cardinals from Germany and one from the Kingdom of Sicily appear political given the papal-imperial diplomacy that dominated his reign. The aversion to appointing Roman cardinals perhaps reflected a prioritization of imperial affairs over relations with the Roman nobility, and he may have intended to regain a modicum of independence from their influence, which had been embraced following the papacy's return to Rome under Clement III.⁷¹ By favouring the appointment of Cistercians, Honorius again seems to have adopted a different approach to that pursued by Celestine III and Innocent III, who – proportionately – created relatively few cardinals from religious orders.⁷² Some of the cardinals whom Honorius appointed had strong nepotistic tendencies and the pope connived in this. Nevertheless, the idea that Honorius transformed the college on his accession, purging rivals and flooding it with family and close friends, is flawed. Forms of nepotism certainly existed in Honorius's household, but they were more complex than has been recognized. Honorius had a shorter reign than Innocent III and created fewer cardinals: his six appointments actually made little impact on the composition of the college. Indeed, viewed solely in terms of its overall composition, Honorius III's College of Cardinals was still very much Innocent III's household.

Royal Holloway, University of London

⁷⁰ See Vincent's point regarding Innocent III's creation of Guala Bicchieri: *Letters*, ed. Vincent, xxxiv.

⁷¹ Doran, 'Lifetime', 31–2.

⁷² Maleczek, *Kardinalskolleg*, 294. Innocent III, however, made considerable use of Cistercians to combat heresy in southern France: John C. Moore, *Pope Innocent III (1160/61–1216): To Root up and to Plant* (Leiden, 2003), 152–3.