

Straight Talk

Special Receipts
Edition



Cooperators United
4 Reform



Leads to Straight Understanding

October 2024

Understanding this is election season it does not exempt anyone from being factual with the information that is presented to shareholders. We can disagree on choices and policy but to deliberately misstate facts and lie is unacceptable. Regrettably, that is exactly the road Lisa Stark took.

Analysis of Lisa Stark's response to shareholders

Statement related to knowledge, skills, abilities and training of board members not aligned with the CCC. The statement, to me, implies that Jean Hall disregard's DHCR training is a lie and that new members are untrained is another lie.

In fact, members of the new majority are career professionals, highly competent and have completed several training platforms.

Letisha Azizah – Ms. Azizah is Marine Corps veteran and has educated the board on the importance of expanding our service, programs and recognition of our veterans. She brings her expertise as a Property Administrator working with commercial tenants, budget, security, and repair services. Ms. Azizah is new to Rochdale, residing here only two years before she made the decision to volunteer in her community through Board service. She has chosen to take a break and not to run for re-election this year.

Keysha Beasley – Candidate #3 in October 2024 election. Ms. Beasley brings over 20 years of experience as a Customer Relations Specialist. Her unique skills enable her to effectively resolve shareholders complaints and foster improved communications with management and our residents.

Nadine Browne - Ms. Browne brings over 20 years of experience as a Higher Education Professor. She has earned her Master's degree in Public Administration and Nonprofit Management. Her ability to ask probing questions helps the board address critical matters and make effective decisions. She has transformed the Youth Planning Committee (YPC) blending programs of mentorship, educational trips, athletic activities and social events.

Stacey Francis – Ms. Francis has an impressive background in information technology (IT). She serves as an IT System Administrator at SUNY – Fashion Institute of Technology. She handles and resolves campus-wide systems

issues promptly and professionally. She is lending her expertise as we move Rochdale Village to improved IT platforms.

Jean Hall – Ms. Hall retired after 33 years of federal service with the Social Security Administration. In her final position she served as the Deputy Regional Commissioner of Management and Operations Support covering New York, New Jersey, Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, and the U.S. Virgin Islands. (Only the second woman of color to hold this position) She brings executive experience in budget, personnel, labor relations, EEO matters, leadership and diversity. She is also a proud member of Alpha Kappa Alpha Sorority, Inc.

Cody Hamblin – Mr. Hamblin is our newest board member. He is a lifelong resident dedicated to serving our community. Mr. Hamblin is currently a Field Officer with the NYC Department of Sanitation. He oversees cleaning operations, refuse collection, and snow removal across Queens. Previously he was part of the S.M.A.R.T. unit, providing citywide training. His background also includes key roles with the NYPD and Department of Environmental Protection focused on executive support, providing training across both departments including the FDNY, and ensuring exceptional customer service. He brings a dynamic and progressive spirit to the board.

Dr. Yvette Joy Harris-Smith – Dr. Harris-Smith has a doctorate in Communication and Culture. She brings over 20 years of experience as communications strategist, evaluator and educator. Her experience also includes research, analytics, and project management writing goals for city, state and federal agencies.

Khedda Hayden-Ryan – Candidate #4 in the October 2024 election. Ms. Hayden-Ryan is a certified Property Manager bringing over 25 years of on-hand experience. She specializes in Mitchell-lama co-ops, tax credits for HPD and HCR, bidding process and contracts, rental collections and resolving resident complaints. It is because of her experience in contracts that she advised the board we were not receiving complete documentation from management which should include documents for HCR such as the HM-180, HM-23 (award of contract), and HM-31. Ms. Ryan has received training from the DOB (department of buildings) and ECB (environmental control board) for her job as a property manager.

Dr. Althea Hicks - Dr. Hicks has a doctorate in Education. She brings her experience in community funding, program management and non-profit board

governance. She is also a Registered Parliamentarian (RP). Since being voted by her colleagues as Chairperson for the Board of Directors she has led the meetings with grace, competence and professionalism.

Kamal Saleem – Mr. Saleem is a professional bus driver for MTA. But his passion for community service is exemplified in his service as a former Community Board 12 member where he served for six years, his prior six years as a board member and his numerous civic affiliations. He brings a dynamic spirit of energy, vision and 21st century thinking to the board.

Training

Full Day Management Training: Letisha Azizah, Keysha Beasley, Nadine Browne, Stacey Francis, Jean Hall, Khedda Hayden-Ryan, and Kamal Saleem.

Attorney Training: Letisha Azizah, Keysha Beasley, Nadine Browne, Stacey Francis, Jean Hall, Khedda Hayden-Ryan, and Kamal Saleem.

DHCR on-site training: (no longer offered since COVID-19): Stacey Francis, Kamal Saleem, and Jean Hall.

New Mandatory HCR training: Letisha Azizah, Keysha Beasley, Nadine Browne, Stacey Francis, Jean Hall, Cody Hamblin, Dr. Harris-Smith, Khedda Hayden-Ryan, and Dr. Hicks.

Regrettably, there is no truth to the following: “Previously, any board expenditure was closely examined with the caution that all budgeted funds were assigned, and any extra spending would require cuts elsewhere. We were always reminded of the Regulations. However, those days are now behind us.”

Fact: Prior to 2022, the board never accounted for any of its’ spending, nor did they budget for how that money would be spent. When I was voted by my colleagues in October 2022 to take the role of Board President, I discovered that the board committees did not have their own accounting id number, in fact some committees were co-mingled with one another. That practice stopped, each committee has a separate budget line and the board votes yearly for the allocations, keeps track of all income and expenditures and readily provides for full accountability and transparency.

The assertion that Jean Hall and the JOJ are powerless to stop HCR from implementing a 30, 40, or 50% increase is false and misleading on its best day.

Fact: The notion that HCR gives Rochdale Village its increases is false. **The financial picture for Rochdale Village is what drives our increases.** The supervising agency (HCR) – carries out the formal procedures when implementing increases.

What has historically been done is Rochdale Village either low balls its increases or gives no increases.

Please review the information below outlining our carrying charge history since 1987.

YEAR	Percentage Increase	Comments
------	---------------------	----------

4/1/1987	18%	
1988	0%	
4/1/1989	16.50%	
1990	0%	
4/1/1991	9.85%	
1992	0%	
1993	0%	
1994	0%	
1995	0%	
1996	0%	
1997	0%	
1998	0%	
1999	0%	
2000	0%	
2001	0%	
2002	0%	
2/1/2003	9.85%	80 Million Dollar loan
2/1/2004	3.60%	
7/1/2005	12%	
2006	0%	
2007	0%	
1/31/2008	12%	
2/1/2008	6.47%	
2009	0%	
6/1/2010	12.30%	
2011	0%	20 Million Dollar loan
2012	0%	
2013	0%	

3/1/2014 2.50%

130 Million Dollar loan

3/1/2015 2.50%

2016 0%

2017 0%

2018 0%

8/1/2019 2.90%

190 Million Dollar loan

2020 0%

6/1/2021 2.90%

2022 0%

2/1/2023 3.76%

2/1/2024 3.62%

This carrying charge should have been implemented 8/12020. However, due to the COVID 19 crisis this was delayed. **Loss Revenue 1.7 million dollars**

Example of Lisa Stark and CCC submitting low ball numbers to the State:

The story of the carrying charge increases for 2023 and 2024 begins with a telephone vote passed on March 10, 2002. R09-22 which stated in part, Be it resolved, that the board of directors approves the budgets for fiscal years 2022 and 2023 and carrying charge increases of 1.8% in each fiscal years 2023 and 2024, respectively, pending approval by New York State Homes & Community Renewal (HCR).

For the motion: Janine Cross, Clifton Stanley Diaz, Edward Douglas, Gary Hawkins, Sheila McKenzie, Timothy Mercer, Jean Randolph-Castro, Derrick Shareef, Lisa Stark, Joyce Williams.

Against the motion: Letisha Azizah and Jean Hall

Abstentions: Keysha Beasley and Maryam Hubbard

Pass: Khedda Hayden-Ryan

I voted against the motion because I knew the numbers were not solid and the increase proposed was not sufficient. This was proven true when HCR reviewed the financials of Rochdale Village and determined that the increase for 2022 should be 3.7% and the increase for 2023 should be 3.6%.

Board members have a fiduciary duty to give shareholders the truth about the numbers. Simply low-balling carrying charge increase numbers is not

acceptable and is definitely not leadership you can trust. Making tough choices and hard decisions is part of a board member's responsibilities.

Fighting for shareholders is a Must

While some may feel they are powerless to make a difference when scenarios of a carrying charge increase that will jeopardize the affordability of Rochdale Village that is not me nor the current board majority.

Rather, than accept what management was saying I began to probe, dig, question, propose and require management to go back and look where they can make cuts to the budget without jeopardizing essential services or quality of life for this community.

Emergency meetings were initiated to bring City, State, Federal and/or HCR or a combination of all to address the financial issues of Rochdale Village. While some may want to stand by and gaslight or raise fears, I am taking a proactive approach of engagement to make sure this community remains affordable, and any increase proposed is reasonable for all of us.

Actual Figures listed below regarding the assertion from Lisa Stark that since the 2013 renovation of the ballroom that revenues generated exceeded \$500,000 annually until the pandemic. **FALSE/ MISSTATEMENT**

Fiscal Years 2014 through 2024

2014 Revenue \$104,400	Income/Loss (309,874)
2015 Revenue \$131,175	Income/Loss (335,146)
2016 Revenue \$94,216	Income/Loss (412,474)
2017 Revenue \$183,275	Income/Loss (320,588)
2018 Revenue \$326,118	Income/Loss (161,688)
2019 Revenue \$420,497	Income/Loss 30,229
2020 Revenue \$534,819	Income/Loss 33,047
2021 Revenue \$81,650	Income/Loss (275,598)
2022 Revenue \$90,627	Income/Loss (282,147)
2023 Revenue \$524,845	Income/Loss 79,068
2024 Revenue \$655,859	Income/Loss (281,130)

Allegation of spending according to Lisa Stark: From 2022 to 2024 Jean Hall and JOJ affected the budget by more than 1.5 million dollars.

In 2022 the majority board was made up of members from the CCC. There was no detailed reporting on board spending, no detailed budget for board committees. The board spent as it saw fit and all the years of control by the CCC majority (about 2 decades) Lisa Stark never sent a door-to-door flyer raising objections about their spending or calling for the board to stop hosting community wide events.

Lisa Stark figure = **1.5 Million**

Actual 2023 Expenses: $234,963.08 + 238,271.75 = \$473,234.83$

To date 2024 Expenses: **\$150,424.98**

Totals: **\$623,659.81**

Seems like Lisa Stark's math ain't mathin

Pavilion aka Birdcage is a space within the community that I feel should remain the resident's space. We should not reduce shareholder's free space and amenities and charge them for its use. Nor do I believe residents who reside close to the birdcage want to be subjected to ongoing events. This is my viewpoint. At the end of the day, the majority on the board makes the decision. Currently renting that space is limited to shareholders.

The shortfall in funds has forced Rochdale Village to postpone employee raises without retroactive compensation. I am not sure when Lisa Stark made that determination, but I can assure you it was without a full board discussion.

As I recall a discussion was held in a legal and management meeting – April 2024. Management was tasked to bring information back to the board before additional discussion and a decision would be made. Management has not provided the board with the requested information for discussions to continue.

Bidding Process

Please Note: If it were not for Ms. Khedda Hayden-Ryan and her knowledge of what must be submitted when conducting a bid process the board would still be receiving incomplete packages from management.

It is my belief that all the uproar about the laundry contract from Lisa Stark and the CCC board members is because they do not want change. They want to keep everything the same. Some gave me their rationale: I'd rather stick with what I know, I like John, you know we owe John so much money so if he has the laundry money coming in that will help matters. None of those factors go into my consideration for a laundry contractor. However, I did take into consideration that Woodside (current laundry vendor) also has the contracts for the convector project and the restoration (for our apartments) contract under the name of Genesys.

Some shareholders seemed upset because they went online and saw a 2.1 satisfactory rating. Let me pose this question: what rating would Woodside get, for that matter they way some people talk about Rochdale what rating would we receive??

The bidding process was followed; all required documents were sent to HCR as required. (note Lisa Stark did not attend the interview with Woodside) does that mean her mind was made up? Nor did she attend the interview with Hercules.

The board members received a 16-page bid package from Woodside, and a 94-page bid package from Hercules, a Laundry Room Contractor Bid Summary from Management which outlined the named vendor, commission, allowances, kiosk features, room furniture, washing machine costs, dryer costs, and extras. At the request of a board member management then supplemented the document with their observations.

Different bids will follow slightly different processes. However, the documentation to HCR is required always. So, for instance when the board bid out the management contract, a third-party evaluation was not required, nor was a third party required for the auditors or general counsel. That is not a hard fast rule as was alluded in Lisa Starks response.

Having a third party does not guarantee good decision making. I need only to refer to the convector project. Let's do a little walk down memory lane!

In 2019, the Board of Directors voted for a refinance package with Wells Fargo for 195 million dollars. Of the proceeds netted, 31 million was set aside for the convector project. The engineers on the project were Goldman Copeland and they reviewed the bids received and recommended to management and the

board on November 20, 2020, that the contract be awarded to Genesys construction.

In December 2020 the Board passed R51-20 which awarded the contract to Genesys based on the recommendation from the engineers and they were the lowest responsible bid in the amount of \$9,748,500.00' plus 20% contingency for unforeseen issues that may arise during installation for a cost of \$1,949,700.00. This brought the total contract award to \$11,698.200 to Genesys.

The motion was moved by Barbara Staples and seconded by Jean Randolph-Castro – Voting for this motion was: Talib Bey, Janine Cross, Ed Douglass, Sheila McKenzie, Barabara Staples, Glynis Urquhart, Jean Randolph-Castro, Clifton Stanley-Diaz, Gary Hawkins, Derrick Shareef, Lisa Stark and Joyce Williams.

Then board president Jean Castro signed an order to proceed on January 19, 2019, which included the following rationale for accepting Genesys: contractor has installed hundreds of in-kind units in Rochdale Village over the past years.

Issue: Neither Management, Engineer (Goldman Copeland), Fan coil manufacturer (Zoi Contracting (Verano / SRS enterprises), and Contractor (Genesys) identified that the flow of water from the power plant to the units should be continuous (with all of their expertise). This led to some of the coils freezing when the temperature took a dive and led to severe flooding in some units. **This error by all the professionals involved let to a change order costing the corporation \$1.9 million dollars.**

Note: Remember the order to proceed signed in 2019. That project was begun without the final approval of HCR. The HM-23 award of contract was submitted to HCR late November 2020. Now who is following the rules????

Confidentiality Agreement

Discussion with management about the arrears report that used to be available to all board members took place. However, those board members without clean hands did not want the information disclosed. Management stated if the information would remain confidential, they would release the report. Former general counsel drew up the confidentiality agreement and board members were asked to sign. As I have stated confidentiality is not just limited to the arrears report, it also involves contracts, litigation, and personnel issues. None

of the CCC board members have signed the agreement. Again, some of the folks not wanting the release of the arrears report is because they do not have clean hands and let's just leave it at that.

Fighting for Shareholders – A fight worth having!

Over the years I have been a strong advocate for shareholders. Whether I served as a minority member of the board or now in the majority fighting for shareholders is a worthy choice for me. The amendment for term limits received a majority of votes from shareholders in the October 2023 election. The current by-laws of Rochdale Village severely limit the ability of shareholders to amend their by-laws. Currently our by-laws state, "the by-laws of the corporation may be amended, repealed or altered, in whole or in part at any meeting of the Board of Directors by a vote of 2/3 of the entire existing board or at a meeting of the shareholders by a majority vote of all existing shareholders.

With that provision shareholders need 2,931 votes cast in an election to change the by-laws. This number has never been reached in the twenty-seven (27) years this provision has existed.

The board had a 2/3 majority that were in favor of term-limits and passed R39-23. This motion was moved by Khedda Hayden-Ryan and Seconded by Jean Hall. For the motion: Letisha Azizah, Keysha Beasley, Nadine Browne, Stacey Francis, Jean Hall, Yvette Joy Harris-Smith, Khedda Hayden-Ryan, Althea Hicks, Maryam Hubbard, and Felicia Perrin.

Against the motion: Talib Bey, Clifton Stanley-Diaz, and Lisa Stark. Abstaining: Jean Randolph-Castro and Kamal Saleem

The motion was sent to HCR on November 7, 2024. HCR notified Counsel on December 6, 2023, they were denying the proposed by-law amendment.

The board directed General Counsel to pursue an Article-78 against DHCR's ruling. In June 2024, Rochdale was granted approval by DHCR for the by-law amendment. It is not always easy to take a stand and fight for our rights but is it necessary. Lisa Stark will not fight for you and lied when she said it cost the shareholders tens of thousands of dollars. Actual cost for the successful case \$10,988.50.

I encourage all shareholders to carefully consider the information that has been disseminated to you. Carefully review the information and beware when allegations and accusations are made that lack the receipts.

I am proud of the work that I do on behalf of my community. I do not seek to mislead you or lie to you or make you afraid of change to get your attention.

I and my colleagues are peeling off the layers of an onion piece by piece and it is making some folks uncomfortable.

Anyone who was told as you were going to vote last week, that if you vote for JOJ they will raise your carrying charges, please know that was a lie!

For those of you coming out to vote on October 16, 2024 – choose wisely.

Continue to embrace change, transparency and accountability.

I proudly endorse Keysha Beasley, Khedda Hayden-Ryan, and Jacqueline Telfer candidates running under the Jewel of Jamaica (JOJ) umbrella.

**Vote on October 16, 2024 for
#3, #4, and #8.**

They Listen, They Act, They Deliver!



Respectfully written by Jean Hall, President – Cooperators United for Reform