

The Forgotten Papua: Children and Representation in Garin Nugroho's *Birdman's Tale* (2002).

By: Satrya Wibawa

Introduction

Indonesian history reflects a dynamics of political power that begins with Dutch and Japanese colonialism.. Krishna Sen (1994) breaks Indonesian cinema history down into three periods. Each period signifies political turmoil that influences the content of the films made within the particular era. The first period from the early 1900s to 1956 reflects early Indonesia under the colonialization of the Dutch and the Japanese until its early period as an independence state. The second period is defined as cinema during “political polarisation,” from 1956 to 1966. This period marked the time of the Old Order regime in Indonesian politics. During the third period, 1967 to 1994, Indonesia was under an authoritarian regime, the New Order regime,¹ and Indonesian cinema was used as a political tool by the government to construct the state’s value of nationhood and citizenship. Due to its political agenda, the New Order regime had several restrictions that limited Indonesian filmmakers to minimalize political resistance, such as pre-censorship of film scenario, censorship policy, and strict approval for directors (Sen, 1994). In 1998, the New Order collapsed and the Reform Order government took the control through democratic election. The Reform Order unleashed several restrictions and created some freedom for film production. However, several challenges remained. These restrictions included prohibition to portray sensitive social issues, such as religions and ethnics, and political issues, such as communism ideology and political conflict in some areas of Indonesia.

Indonesian cinema has produced a number of films that present children in the story, including the first feature film made in Indonesia, *Loetoeng Kasaroeng* in 1926. The film, based on local folktale, tells the story of two girls competing for their lives. However, few scholars have discussed child characters in Indonesian films. Furthermore, those few works that do focus on the representation of children in Indonesian film suggest that Indonesian films utilise the image of innocent children in order to decrease potential of political threats (Strassler, 1999; Spyer, 2004). These images of children project an idealised citizen who represents the value of nationhood, according to Kitley (1999) and Allen (2011). This use of the figure of the child dominated cinema during the New Order period. Lyn Parker (1992) argues that the New Order insisted on developing children as idealised citizens through the school and the family because “the state assumes that its inhabitants are not necessarily born as good citizens” (p.42). The New Order defined the Indonesian ‘good citizen’ as an individual who is knowledgeable and prioritizes his/her

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

commitment to Indonesian national development (Kitley, 2000). The New order government also depicted the family and the school system as instruments to cultivate the proper model of citizen.

Javanese culture strongly influenced the New Order's concept of the family system, which reflected an unequal structure, centred on hierarchy and the father as the primary decision maker (Shiraishi, 1997; Mulder, 1996). Mother figures were portrayed as "appendages of their husbands and casts female dependency as ideal" (Suryakusuma, 1996:98). Mothers served their husbands as a leader of the family and, at the same time, as nurturing mediums who represented the father's power to their children. Children were placed at the lowest level in the family hierarchy, controlled by the father who applies top down communication—commands with no space for questioning the order. Children were constructed as passive members who had no authority in the family. The depiction of children in cinema was thus utilised by the New Order to frame the state's ideologies of nationhood.

Garin Nugroho is one among very few filmmakers who challenged these political restrictions. Nugroho produced his films during the political period of peak authoritarian New Order government. Nugroho's first film, *Love in a Slice of Bread* (1991), introduced him as one of the most prominent film directors in Indonesia. Since then, Nugroho has released several films, such as *Letter to an Angel* (1993), *Leaf on a Pillow* (1997) and *The Poet* (1999), that mark him as one of only a few film directors who projected their own political views on contemporary Indonesia during the New Order regime. Most of his films have been internationally acknowledged but failed in their domestic market or were banned for political reasons. Scholars claim that Nugroho additionally chose unusual themes and used uncommon techniques in filmmaking and storytelling² that make his films even less market friendly and hardly acceptable to most of the Indonesian domestic audience.³ His filmmaking style, which combines documentary footage with narrative storytelling, has become his personal signature. Nugroho also selects an ordinary, non-professional person for the leading roles in his films. These signatures resemble the Italian neorealism style, which is highly uncommon in the contemporary Indonesian film industry. Furthermore, as part of his signature, Nugroho often featured children as the main characters or childhood as part of the story in most of his films. One of his films that features children in the main story is the *Birdman Tale* (2002).

In order to contextualize the film analysis in this paper, I divide my discussion into two sections. First, I analysis how *Birdman Tale* is positioned within the context of political conflict in West Papua. Second, I discuss the way in which the film represents on the West Papuan's racialised positions among Indonesia's identity politics. I argue that through the depiction of a child's transition into adolescence the film symbolises the political struggle of West Papuans and, ultimately, opposes the forced national identity.

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

A Forgotten West Papua: An Allegory of West Papua's Resistance

The Birdman's Tale, "Aku Ingin Menciummu Sekali Saja,"⁴ tells the story of Arnold, a teenage Papuan boy who falls passionately in love with a female stranger. Arnold's obsession drives him into West Papua's political turmoil. Meanwhile, his girlfriend, Sonja, feels neglected and jealous of the female stranger's closeness with Arnold. Sonja expresses her jealousy through a reflection of the social political discrimination. Their childhood becomes a political allegory for contemporary West Papua.

The *Birdman Tale* is recorded as the first Indonesian film which presents the story of the political conflict between the Indonesian government and the West Papuan people. West Papua is an Indonesian province that experienced escalated political violence since the referendum in 1969. West Papua used to be the Dutch colony until 1968. After the independence war 1945-1949, The Netherlands acknowledged Indonesian sovereignty in most of the former Dutch East Indies' territories except for Western New Guinea. After a series of political negotiations, the Netherlands agreed to renounce West Papua to United Nations administration and signed the New York Agreement. This agreement required the Indonesian government to conduct a referendum in West Papua. This referendum offers two options for West Papua: become an independence territory or integrate with Indonesia. The result was that West Papua was in favour of integrating as part of Indonesian territory instead of being independent. Later, the referendum was widely acknowledged as political abuse of the West Papuan people.⁵ Since then, West Papua has been one of Indonesia's territories and has become part of a global political discourse, particularly after the attempted peace agreements and political unrest in Aceh and Timor Leste.⁶ Unfortunately, after that, West Papua witnessed a series of political violent acts, mainly in the form of military operations against the West Papuans who reject the referendum and demand independence. The violence along with the controversial referendum make West Papua a sensitive topic in Indonesia.

Birdman Tale is one among a few films that represent the story of Indonesia in non-Javanese culture during the New Order, when the government centralised its development programs in Java Island, including the film culture⁷. In fact, *Birdman Tale* is the first film in Indonesian film that used West Papua as its main location. It is also acknowledged as the first film to feature the story of West Papua, and the first to cast West Papuans in its main narrative. For instance Nugroho includes the compelling image of the Chairman of the Papuan Council Presidium, Theys Hiyo Eluway, during the opening of the first West Papuan congress in 2000 and the Papuan declaration of Independence in 2001, as part of the film narrative⁸. Eluway, the respected leader of the West Papuan Independence Movement, was later found shot dead in November 2002. The film also features the cultural richness, traditional music, local dialects, and geographical landscape of West Papua, as well as a Catholic ambience, which is rarely seen in Indonesia's media.

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

The film tells the story of a West Papuan family—Arnold and his parents, Berthold, and Mama. Berthold is a local high school art teacher and also a member of a political movement called the Movement for Papuan Independence. Arnold is a student at the local high school and has three close friends: Sonja, Minus, and Dickson. These teenagers experience a complex childhood. The children live within political turmoil, all having lost their parents to political violence. Sonja adores Arnold; however, Arnold falls in love with a woman he met at the city wharf. His feelings for the woman are so intense, that at some point, his desire to kiss the woman leads him to guilty feelings against his faith and his friendships.

However, this is not a simple romance story. Arnold's conflicted feelings lead the story to the wider and more complex perspective of West Papua. Several rare pieces of documentary footage obtained by Nugroho are integrated into the fictional narrative, which gives the film a surreal aesthetic. The biggest West Papuan people's congress in Indonesian history is featured as the context of this teenage love story, as well as the arrest of Theys Hiyo Eluway, an important community leader, and ultimately the violent situation that followed Theys's murder and his subsequent emotional burial. Arnold tries to understand his feelings by questioning his own faith, while Sonja expresses her feelings of neglect and of being discriminated against.

Arnold's love story signifies Nugroho's understanding of West Papua's issues. Love is connoted by the desire to kiss in this film, as is implied by the Indonesian title of this film: *Aku Ingin Menciummu Sekali Saja* or in English literally means "I want to kiss you once". Nugroho intentionally chooses to have the Indonesian title appear in the opening credits at the very moment he depicts the Papua movement's leader kissing the West Papuan flag. The short appearance of the West Papuan flag, which is forbidden by Indonesian authorities as it assumedly symbolises separatism, reminds us of Frank Kessler's argument that "a fleeting image on the screen could become an image of the national in a brutally simple way."⁹ In this context, Kessler's idea of national could reflect West Papua's demands for independence. The Indonesian title of this film actually signifies several discourses within the narratives. Although it seems the English title of this film would reduce the symbolic connection between the narratives, the title *Birdman Tale* directs the attention of the story to Berthold, Arnold's father. He is a cassowary dancer, which is significant within West Papua's historical context. Since the Dutch colonisation of Indonesia, the West Papuan movement for independence has used the cassowary bird as their symbol.¹⁰ Therefore, the use of cassowary in this film is a symbol for the movement against the Indonesian government. There is a long shot where Berthold's figure is superimposed onto his cassowary costume when he is hiding. His wife, Mama, visits him and begins having a conversation with him. During the conversation, it looks as if Mama is talking to the cassowary rather than Berthold. At the same time, the cassowary voices Berthold's dreams for West Papua.

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

There is a moment when the militia think they have caught and killed Berthold in his cassowary costume, only to realise that they have killed a real cassowary. Indonesia military, during the conflict with Papuan's movement, used the term "hunting" to describe their war in field. They "hunted" the West Papuan militia. Kivimaki and Thorning describe how the use of the term "hunting" helped soldiers feel less guilty for killing their enemies and "normalise[d] the killing of enemies"¹¹. Soldiers hunted and killed their enemies as if they were simply hunting cassowary birds.

While Berthold's story of West Papua's political violence is depicted as a terrifying metaphor of a seasonal hunt, Arnold's story has a romantic side: kissing. *Birdman Tale* uses kissing as an allegory for political issues in West Papua like adolescence is for children: it is a hard time, complicated and difficult to understand. Through the politics of kissing and the figure of Arnold, Nugroho positions several religious symbols in several shots to remind the audience that, although Muslims comprise the majority of Indonesia, West Papuans are largely Catholic devotees. And Arnold is religious; he attends church on Sundays, helping the priest during the event. Arnold's adolescent journey starts when he sees a young woman at the local wharf. She is physically different compared to the stereotypical West Papuan: she has light skin and straight hair. While she looks sad, Arnold feels in that moment that he falls in love, and at the same time, a Christian cross appears in the background. During their accidental meeting, Arnold finds the woman's rosary, and this motivates Arnold to find the woman, who is by then lost from his sight. While the church, the priest, the Christian cross, and the rosary seem banal, in the context of Indonesian geo-politics when the film was made, they are strong symbols against the dominant Islamic symbols in the media and Indonesian films at the time.

Arnold's obsessive desire to kiss the strange woman becomes his own battle between sinfulness and curiosity. He keeps a picture that shows a man kissing a woman, an inappropriate picture according to his Mama. "This is a porn," Mama scolds Arnold. He disagrees and goes to church to find answers where he discovers that the Bible recognises two types of kissing, as explained by the priest: "There are two kissing events. First, the betraying kiss of Judas Iscariot. And, second, the kiss from Jesus when he washed the feet of Peter, His student." Unfortunately, neither event fits with his desire, which prompts Arnold to question the priest directly. Arnold's battle with his budding adolescence is reminiscent of the classical children's concept of the European Protestant Christian tradition, which Bazalgette & Buckingham explain as:

Children used to be seen as marked with original sin, and it was thought by most that they needed to be disciplined – sometimes savagely – into acceptable adult behaviour.¹²

The way Mama “judges” Arnold for keeping the picture reflects how adults measure their moral values with their children. Meanwhile, children are set up as “sexual beings, resulting in the perception that children require constant adult surveillance at all cost.”¹³ Robinson argues that classical Protestant discourse frames sexual activities as sinful and immoral and therefore need to be controlled by adults.¹⁴ In this context, Arnold’s desire, which reflects a normal adolescent feeling, is judged by Mama as against adult authority. Only adults can decide a proper sexual desire because children are socially constructed as “innocent and asexual beings.”¹⁵ The issue of adult authority also appear in the conversation within Arnold’s family. Arnold’s parents urge him to pay more attention to West Papua’s political problems instead of his own personal issues. For example, Berthold asks Arnold to get closer to the people around him. He says: “Arnold, do not lock yourself in the room. Come out and see what is going on in your country. Arnold, if you want to be a leader then you should come and find out about your people’s problems.”

In a political context, Seaton explains that children are “political actors-in-waiting” to understand the argument between Arnold and his father, Berthold.¹⁶ While children may experience the politics of nations within their community or family, the conversation implies that children are not capable to choose, and should be directed by adults. Children are defined as a humans who have a “temporary disability form that is defined by its inabilities and [in] immanent need of correction.”¹⁷ Consequently, the status of adults gives them social privilege as “political community has an exclusive adult membership with children unable to provide qualification for entry.”¹⁸

Aside from Arnold’s desire to kiss the woman, *Birdman Tale* also proposes that the act of kissing symbolises loyalty for different purposes. The opening scene that shows Theys kissing the West Papuan flag instead of Indonesia’s official flag signifies West Papuan’s loyalty to the motherland. The “kissing” implies a political rejection of Indonesia’s official flag, which is forbidden by the Indonesian government. Disrespectful behaviour to the national symbol, including the national flag, is considered a serious offence, and the perpetrator framed as a national traitor. While kissing can be politically offensive, *Birdman Tale* also suggests that kissing is part of loyalty to God and humanity. Arnold shows his loyalty by kissing Jesus Christ’s statue, while Sonja and Minus have a conversation about how kissing will eliminate war and hatred:

Minus: “You never know that actually I care about you. And I also have a feeling like Arnold. I want to kiss a girl”

Sonja: “What do you mean, Minus?”

Minus: “Don’t fight Sonja. Wise men say, when couples kiss each other, there will be no fighting or war”

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

In a way, children are chosen to generate the politics of kissing in this film, which suggests that the film is about how West Papuan children see their land and themselves within the bigger discourse of Indonesia.

Seeking the Motherland: Papuan Children and the Politics of Race

West Papua has experienced political violence under the Indonesian government since 1962. Since that time, West Papua has been a military operation area in the name of Indonesian political and security stability. This military operation has caused casualties on both sides and caused political trauma for the victims in particular and the people of West Papua in general. Thus, for decades, the changing generations of West Papuan lives is intimately connected with political turmoil as depicted through the characters of Arnold and Sonja. Arnold's father is chased by the Indonesian militia due to his involvement in the West Papua Freedom movement; Sonja lost her father during the conflict; and Minus never had a chance to know his father.

Arnold and Sonja build their friendship through mutual feeling of loss. Then, when Arnold is occupied with his obsession for the woman he met at the wharf, it leads Sonja to feeling neglected. Sonja's mixed feeling of sadness, anger and loss is reflected through her confession time at the church. Sonja's confession goes beyond a simple love story to a story of oppression:

Sonja: "Father, why when we have nothing, being oppressed, being abandoned, does the hatred rise up?"

Priest: "My child, your father loved to talk about Mussolini, the fascist leader. Before Mussolini had many followers, he always swore to help all of his poor people. However, after he became a leader, he forgot his promises. He oppressed his own people. That's why his lover left and critiqued him: 'I would not ever want to be with you anymore, because you have done nothing for your own people. What you have done, you have done only for yourself. You never talk from your heart to your people. You use your power and violence against your own people.'"

Her conversation with the priest is an allegory for West Papuans' feelings of being oppressed by the Indonesian government's decades long military operations in West Papua. Sonja's expression of hatred both because of her feeling of being oppressed and being neglected signifies West Papuans' feelings under the Indonesian regime.

In this context, the priest connects the West Papuan' position to the story of Mussolini, who is deliberately used to criticise Indonesia's policy, which has drastically changed since President Soekarno insisted that West Papua join the

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Republic of Indonesia as historically part of the nation's territory.¹⁹ President Soekarno, in his speech in 1963, assured West Papuans that race would not be an issue under Indonesian authority:

“A nation is not only a matter of race or the colour of skin... Are Americans all white[?]. The Hawaiian are another race, and black Negroes are another race; the Papuan – yes – they, too are another race, and so are the Dayaks. But the Dayaks are happy as Indonesians”²⁰

However, while President Soekarno underlined that race would not be an issue, the Indonesian government's political strategy has shown a contradictory policy. The formal discourse about West Papua addresses minorities as part of the nation and is still being utilised by the Indonesia government, while, in contrast, discrimination is evidenced by outbursts of political violence.²¹

Birdman Tale suggests that West Papua still has issues of race discrimination through the contrast of the strange woman and Sonja. The stranger woman is positioned as physically different from the main cast, who mostly have dark skin and curly hair. The woman's presence, with her straight hair and light skin, creates a visual contrast that represents “the spectacle of the other.”²² This whiteness of the female outsider opposes the Indonesian classical beauty concept for woman, including *hitam manis* (sweet black) for dark skin or *kuning langsung* (bright yellow) that is usually used to represent the royal family. Since colonialism, whiteness has been endorsed as the ideal construction of beauty in Indonesia while blackness is framed as the opposite. Yulianto explains that in Indonesian media, white is constructed as *holy, good, and beautiful*, while black is associated with ugly, dirty, sinful, and sadness or sorrow.²³ Cheah suggests that *Birdman Tale* proposes “to invert the roles of Indonesia and Papua. . .Indonesia inadvertently becomes the minority culture” by the appearance of the outside woman.²⁴

Nevertheless, in the politics of race, the film deliberately suggests West Papuans are still constructed as the minority through the conflict between Sonja and Arnold. Sonja alleges that Arnold desires the other woman because the woman is “not black,” while Sonja is:

Sonja: “Arnold, why didn't you respond to my poem? Why did you only remember her? Is it because she is not a black woman? Are you ashamed, Arnold? I am your friend. You think I don't know what is in your mind? You feel inferior. You are a hypocrite, Arnold.”

Sonja's use of the phrase “not black” refers to Sonja's claim that the other woman is the opposite of herself. Luke and Carrington argue that race is not merely a given constructed identity, but also allows a self-naming to identify themselves.²⁵ Sonja points out that the other woman is not a black woman to identify herself as a black

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

woman. While West Papuans are considered as a minority among Indonesians because they are physically “different,” the film suggests a blackness and whiteness paradox. The woman in this film reflects Fechter’s idea of the “white other”:

whilst ‘the gaze usually refers to white gazing at a ‘Black Other’, conversely it can hold for whites themselves being fixed in the gaze of this other – thus becoming a ‘White Other.’²⁶

Sonja accuses Arnold of being inferior but also is racially prejudiced against the woman. The woman is not a white Caucasian; however, in the context of Indonesian multiculturalism, she is whiter than most West Papuans. Among other ethnic groups in Indonesia, West Papuans have darker skin and are considered a minority. Thus, the woman is seen by Sonja as “the Other.” Sonja places the woman as an outsider in many aspects, and, at the same time, Sonja identifies herself. Sonja’s self-naming can be seen through Miron’s perspective that skin colour defines position in society; “the darker the skin, the greater the subordination.”²⁷ This sense of inferiority is reflected in Sonja’s anger during her confession:

Sonja: “My heart is suddenly filled with hatred. I hate other skins. I don’t feel confident anymore. What should I do? Why when we have nothing, being oppressed, being abandoned, the hatred rises up? My father taught me to love each other, staying together and giving forgiveness. But, every time I read a book, why did the word “black” always means bad, dark and oppressed? I am angry and hate all those things. I hate words, television and also love. Why wasn’t Jesus born black like me?”

Dyson discusses how culture creates a conflict between blackness and whiteness through an ideological construction which places “whiteness as the positive universal versus blackness as the negative particular.”²⁸ Sonja’s anger towards her perceived inferior blackness reflects Indonesia’s multiculturalism issues. Indonesia’s social construction continues to place whiteness as the standard of contemporary Indonesian female beauty, to which Arnold is inexorably drawn.²⁹ Sonja’s anger in this film reflects this racial construction which is experienced by West Papuans and manifests as a feeling of inferiority because of their difference in skin colour. During the New Order, being a West Papuan was not part of nationalism discourse. Being an Indonesian was constructed under the domination of Javanese culture. Indonesian children were set under the centralised educational curriculum that endorsed homogeneity of citizenship. The school applied the familism influenced by Javanese culture where the teacher is the leader for the class and the text book is the main source for the knowledge.

Both Sonja and Arnold’s lives have been troubled since the arrival of the strange woman. The film introduces this woman with little information. She looks
Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

sad when she arrives at the wharf. She goes to the church and cries when praying. She keeps supporting her feeling by writing the number of a chapter in the Bible. Several scenes depicting the woman resemble the image of the Virgin Mary.³⁰ Seemingly, because most West Papuans are Catholic, the film associates religion with the depictions of the motherland. Ostrowska claims that “the myth of the . . . mother, being an embodiment of an ideal femininity, is deeply rooted in the maternal discourse of Christian religions.”³¹ Additionally, Zindar-Swartz (1992) argues:

At the personal level, Mary is viewed as the nurturing, concerned mother who saves her children from evil and from the wrath of God. On a social level, particularly as reflected in her apparitions, Mary is seen as a leader of a mighty army of faithful who will do battle with evil.³²

The mysterious appearance of this woman, and her random depiction throughout the story, also suggests the idea of the Indonesian figure of *ibu pertiwi* or “motherland.” Stephens claims that the nationalist movement utilises the image of woman in representing the nation.³³ Loomba argues that woman is constructed as a national emblem, as mothers or wives literally and figuratively reproduce the nation.³⁴

Additionally, Innes argues that the nationalist and colonial writers construct the figure of the female as the motherland and as a “nurturing mother and sensual maid.”³⁵ In an Indonesian context, Sunindyo explains that the figure of the motherland is constructed as “a suffering feminine beauty” and “a fragile feminine being who needs to be rescued and protected.”³⁶ Nugroho deconstructs the image of the motherland by portraying her as an attractive woman. She is not depicted as a heroic leader or leader of the army; she is a nervous woman who is seemingly terrified by something. Therefore, the narrative of this film proposes the idea that this figure of woman depicts the motherland which is distressed because one of her forgotten children has a problem. She does not recognise him again. Nugroho symbolizes the relationship between the Indonesian state and West Papua through the relationship between Sonja and Arnold with the other woman. Arnold’s adolescent situation represents West Papua: a lonely, but growing people, looking for peace and eventually love. On the other hand, Sonja’s feelings of inferiority represent the feelings of West Papuans who are oppressed by the New Order regime. Selo Sumardjan, a professor of sociology at the University of Indonesia states that for decades, the New Order systematically created a stereotype of Papua as “underdeveloped, uncultured and wild.” He states:

How many young people from Java have been in Papua? They understand the Papua people only from newspapers, from pictures and the image that they have from them is that the Papua men walk around naked—underdeveloped, uncultured and wild.³⁷

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

West Papua, despite its political turmoil, has been forgotten as having historical value within Indonesian modern history. Through this film and the boy Arnold, Garin Nugroho suggests that West Papua needs better treatment and better policies if the government still considers the province as an integral part of Indonesia.

Conclusion

Buckingham (1995), Strassler (1999), and Spyer (2004), have argued that children's depiction in cinema does not merely represent children's ideas solely about themselves. Most of their presence in film is used to manifest adult points of view. I have argued that *Birdman Tale's* depicts children in the narrative as a cinematic allegory for West Papua's political turmoil within the Indonesian state. The film opposes the constructed national identity through the image of West Papuan children who experience unfair treatment from the state. As is his signature in his films, Garin Nugroho offers a surrealist approach by combining documentary footage with a fictional story within a strong West Papuan cultural background. Nugroho stands against the formal national identity of the New Order's Indonesia by suggesting his own vision of West Papua. The use of children in the film also reflects the idea that children suffer the most from the political problems. The children might not be directly engaged in politics; however, ideologically, their everyday lives experience the politics of nations, which includes violence. The film represents different meanings of kissing--love of God, friendship, and also loyalty to the motherland—to convey Nugroho's vision of unfair racialized positioning of West Papua within Indonesia.

Bibliography

- Abel, Richard, Giorgio Bertellini, and Rob King, eds. *Early Cinema and the "National."* Bloomington: John Libbey, 2008.
- Astuti, Tri Marhaeni Purdji. "Konstruksi Sosial Dunia Barat dan Timur: Kata pengantar". In *Pesona 'Barat': Analisa Kritis-Historis tentang Kesadaran Warna Kulit di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta & Bandung: Jalasutra, 2007
- Bazalgette, Cary, and David Buckingham, eds. *In Front of the Children: Screen Entertainment and Young Audiences*. London: British Film Institute, 1995.
- Benporath, Sigal R. "Autonomy and Vulnerability: On Just Relations between Adults and Children." *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 37:1 (2003): 127–45. doi: 10.1111/1467-9752.3701009.
- Cheah, Philip, ed. *And the Moon Dances: the Films of Garin*. Jogjakarta: Bentang, 2004.
- Dyson, Michael Erick. "The Labor of Whiteness, the Whiteness of labor, and the Perils of Whitewashing." In *Race, Identity, and Citizenship: A Reader*, edited *Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019*

- by Torres, Rodolfo D., Luis F. Mirón, and Jonathan Xavier Inda, 219–34. Massachusetts, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1999.
- Fechter, Anne-Meike. “The 'Other' Stares Back: Experiencing Whiteness in Jakarta.” *Ethnography* 6:1 (2005): 87–103. doi: 10.1177/1466138105055662.
- Hall, Stuart. “The Spectacle of the 'Other.’” In *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*, edited by Stuart Hall, 225–238. London: Sage Publications in association with the Open University, 1997.
- Harvey, Rachel. “Indonesians See Papua in New Light.” *BBC NEWS*, January 10, 2003. Retrieved November 22, 2007, from <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/low/asia-pacific/2642783.stm>.
- Innes, Cl. 1994. “Virgin Territories and Motherlands—Colonial and Nationalist Representations of Africa and Ireland.” *Feminist Review* 47 (1994): 1–14.
- Kirsch, Stuart. “Ethnographic Representation and the Politics of Violence in West Papua.” *Critique of Anthropology* 30:1 (2010): 3–22. doi: 10.1177/0308275X09363213.
- Kessler, Frank. Images of the “National” in Early non-fiction Films in *Early Cinema and the “National.”* eds Richard Abel et al, Bloomington: John Libbey, 2008
- Kivimäki, Timo, and Ruben Thorning. “Democratization and Regional Power Sharing in Papua/Irian Jaya: Increased Opportunities and Decreased Motivations for Violence.” *Asian Survey* 42:4 (2002): 651–72. doi: 10.1525/as.2002.42.4.651.
- Loomba, Ania. *Colonialism-Postcolonialism*. London: Routledge, 1998.
- Luke, Carmen, and Vicki Carrington. “Race Matters.” *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 21:1 (2000): 5–24. doi: 10.1080/07256860050000768.
- Mason, Jan, and Toby Fattore, eds. *Children Taken Seriously: in Theory, Policy and Practice*. London, Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers, 2005.
- Miron, Louis. F. “Postmodernism and the Politics of Racialized Identity.” In *Race, Identity, and Citizenship: A Reader*, edited by Torres, Rodolfo D., Luis F. Mirón, and Jonathan Xavier Inda. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1999.
- Mote, Octovianus, and Danilyn Rutherford. “From Irian Jaya to Papua: The Limits of Primordialism in Indonesia's Troubled East.” *Indonesia* 72 (2001): 115–140.
- Ostrowska, Elzbieta. “Filmic Representation of the 'Polish Mother' in Post-World War Two Polish Cinema.” *The European Journal of Women's Studies* 5 (1998): 419–35.
- Robinson, Kerry H. “The Social condition of UK Childhoods.” In *Children Taken Seriously: In Theory, Policy and Practice*, ed. Mason, Jan, and Toby Fattore, 66–77. London and Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers, 2005.
- Seaton, Jean. “Little Citizens: Children, the Media and Politics.” *The Political Quarterly* (2006): 124–45.
- Sen, Krishna. *Indonesian Cinema: Framing the New Order*. London: Zed Books Ltd. 1994.

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

- Sen, Krishna, and Hill, David. T. *Media, Culture and Politics in Indonesia*. Oxford & New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Stephens, Sharon. "Children and Nationalism—Introduction." *Childhood-A Global Journal of Child Research* 4:1 (1997): 5–17.
- Sunindyo, Saraswati. "When the Earth is Female and the Nation is Mother: Gender, the Armed Forces and Nationalism in Indonesia." *Feminist Review* 58 (1998): 1–21.
- Suryakusuma, Julia. I. "The State and Sexuality in New Order Indonesia." In *Fantasizing the Feminine in Indonesia*, ed. Laurie J Sears, 92–119. Durham & London: Duke University Press, 1996.
- Torres, Rodolfo D., Luis F. Mirón, and Jonathan Xavier Inda, eds. *Race, Identity, and Citizenship: A Reader*. Malden: Blackwell Publishers, 1999.
- Wyness, Michael, Lisa Harrison, and Ian Buchanan. "Childhood, Politics and Ambiguity: Towards an Agenda for Children's Political Inclusion." *Sociology: The Journal of the British Sociological Association* 38:1 (2004): 81–99. doi: 10.1177/0038038504039362.
- Yulianto, Visia, Ita. *Pesona 'Barat': Analisis Kritis-Historis tentang Kesadaran Warna Kulit di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta & Bandung: Jalasutra, 2007.

Filmography:

- Garin Nugroho (2002). *Birdman Tale (Aku Ingin Menciummu Sekali Saja)* [Motion Picture]. Indonesia: SET Film Workshop.

Acknowledgment:

This article is part of my thesis for my Masters degree (by research) under the supervision of Dr. Antonio Traverso and Prof. Krishna Sen at Curtin University. Perth, Western Australia in 2008. The thesis title is *The Representation of Children in Garin Nugroho's Films*.

Notes

- ¹ For more comprehensive discussion on the New Order, see Anderson, Benedict, *Old State, New Society: Indonesia's New Order in Comparative Historical Perspective*, Vol XLII, No.3 *Journal of Asian Studies*, May 1983
- ² Philip Cheah, ed., *And the Moon Dances: The Films of Garin* (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Bentang, 2004).
- ³ Philip Cheah, ed., *And the Moon Dances: The Films of Garin* (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Bentang, 2004).
- ⁴ literally means I want to kiss you once
- ⁵ Stuart Kirsch, "Ethnographic Representation and the Politics of Violence in West Papua," *Critique of Anthropology* 30:1 (2010): 3–22.
- ⁶ Timore Leste (East Timor) achieved independence from Indonesia in 1999 and is now a sovereign country
- ⁷ Krishna Sen, *Indonesian Cinema: Framing the New Order* (London and New Jersey: Zed Books Ltd. 1994).
- ⁸ Theys Hiyo Eluway was well known as respected leader of the West Papuan pro independence guerrillas See details in Kimivaki & Thorning, 2002, Democratization and regional power sharing in Papua/Irian Jaya, *Asian Survey*, 42:4, p.651-672
- ⁹ Frank Kessler, "Images of the 'National' in Early non-fiction Films," in *Early Cinema and the 'National'*, ed Richard Abel et al. (United Kingdom: John Libbey Publishing, 2008).
- ¹⁰ Kimivaki & Thorning, "Democratization in West Papua," 657.
- ¹¹ Kimivaki & Thorning, "Democratization in West Papua," 657.
- ¹² Carry Bazalgette and David Buckingham, "Introduction to the Invisible Audience, in *In front of the Children: Screen Entertainment and Young Audience*, ed Carry Bazalgette (London: BFI Publishing, 1995), 1.
- ¹³ Kerry H Robinson, "Childhood and Sexuality; Adult Constructions and Silenced Children," in *Children Taken Seriously: In Theory, Policy and Practice*, ed Jan Mason and Toby Fattore, (London Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers, 2005), 69.
- ¹⁴ Robinson, "Childhood and Sexuality," 66–76.
- ¹⁵ Robinson, "Childhood and Sexuality," 70.
- ¹⁶ Jean Seaton, "Little Citizens: Children, the Media and Politics," *The Political Quarterly*, 76:1 (2005): 125.
- ¹⁷ Sigal R Benporath, "Autonomy and Vulnerability: On Just Relations between Adults and Children," *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 37:1 (2003): 131.
- ¹⁸ Michael Wyness, Lisa Harrison, and Ian Buchanan, "Childhood, Politics and Ambiguity: Toward an Agenda for Children's Political Inclusion," *Sociology* 38:1 (2004): 82.
- ¹⁹ Octovianus Mote and Danilyn Rutherford, "From Irian Jaya to Papua: the Limits of Primordialism in Indonesia's Troubled East," *Indonesia* 72 (2001): 115–140.
- ²⁰ Kimivaki & Thorning, "Democratization in West Papua," 654.
- ²¹ Stuart Kirsch, "Politics of Violence in West Papua," 22.
- ²² Stuart Hall, "The Spectacle of the 'Other,'" in *Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices*, ed Stuart Hall (London: Open University Sage, 1997), 225.
- ²³ Vissia I Yulianto, *Pesona 'Barat': Analisis Kritis-Historis tentang Kesadaran Warna Kulit di Indonesia*. (Yogyakarta & Bandung: Jalasutra, 2007).
- ²⁴ Philip Cheah, "And the Moon Dances," 117.
- ²⁵ Carmen Luke and Vicki Carrington, "Race Matters," *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 21:1 (2000): 5–24.
- ²⁶ Anne-Meike Fechter, "The 'Other' Stares Back: Experiencing Whiteness in Jakarta," *Ethnography*, 6:1 (2005): 91.
- ²⁷ Louis F Miron, "Postmodernism and the Politics of Racialized identity," in *Race, Identity and Citizenship: A Reader*, ed Rodolfo D Torres (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1999), 82.
- ²⁸ Michael Eric Dyson, "The Labor of Whiteness, the Whiteness of labor, and the Perils of Whitewashing," in *Race, Identity, and Citizenship: A Reader*, ed. Rodolfo D Torres (Massachusetts Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1999), 220.

Red Feather Journal Volume 10 issue 1 Fall 2019

Standard Periodical Directory Publisher ID# 480178658

ISSN: 2150-5381

OCLC Number: 429903332

-
- ²⁹ Astuti, T. M. P.. Konstruksi Sosial Dunia Barat dan Timur: Kata pengantar. In *Pesona 'Barat': Analisa Kritis-Historis tentang Kesadaran Warna Kulit di Indonesia* (Yogyakarta & Bandung: Jalasutra, 2007).
- ³⁰ Garin admitted that he put a white tissue on the actresses' head to make her look like the Virgin Mary; see Philip Cheah, "It's About Loving the Others," 117.
- ³¹ Elzbieta Ostrowska, "Filmic Representation of the 'Polish Mother' in Post-World War Two Polish Cinema," *The European Journal of Women's Studies* 5 (1998): 421.
- ³² The image of the Virgin Mary representing the Polish as a nation can be found in Polish Cinema. See details in Sandra Zimdar-Swartz, *Encountering Mary: From La Salette to Medjugorje* (Princeton-Oxford, Princeton University Press, 1991).
- ³³ Sharon Stephens, "Children and Nationalism," *Childhood* 4:1 (1997): 5–17.
- ³⁴ Ania Loomba, *Colonialism-Postcolonialism* (Oxon & New York: Routledge, 2005), 180.
- ³⁵ Chaterine Lynnet Innes, "Virgin Territories and Motherlands: Colonial and Nationalist Representations of Africa and Ireland". *Feminist Review*, 47 (1994): 3–4.
- ³⁶ Saraswati Sunindy, "When the Earth is Female and the Nation is Mother: Gender, the Armed Forces and Nationalism in Indonesia," *Feminist Review* 58 (1998): 4.
- ³⁷ Rachel Harvey, "Indonesians See Papua in the New Light," *BBC*, January 10th, 2003, accessed: 22/11/2007, <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/low/asia-pacific/2642783.stm>