

# The fight against suicide censorship in New Zealand

Lessons from a partial victory

James Hollings

Massey University

# History of censorship of suicide reporting in New Zealand

Year	Legislation	Impact	Public submissions
1951	Coroners Act: S.21	Coroner can now ban reporting of suicides. Rarely used	Some concern from MPs about restriction on media freedom
1988	Coroners Act: S.29	Bans reporting of 'any particular relating to the manner of death, where reason to believe death was self-inflicted'.	Mental health experts warned about 'copycat' risks media freedom concerns
2006	Coroners Act: S71	Bans any suggestion that a death is a suicide, or suspected suicide, UNLESS coroner satisfied no risk to the public from doing so.	Mental health experts warned about 'copycat' risks . Media Freedom Committee, a coroner, and others argued evidence did not justify censorship
2014	Law Commission advised Government to abolish reporting restrictions, except on method		Media Freedom Committee and others said an academic review of evidence did not justify censorship
2015	Coroners Amendment Bill	Can now report 'suspected' suicide, but not method, without express permission of coroner	Mental health experts urged that it keep 2006 restrictions. Media Freedom Committee, a coroner, and others urged that it abolish all restrictions and promote voluntary restraint aka Australia
Oct 2015	Passes 2 <sup>nd</sup> reading	Select committee ADDED: cannot report method, <i>AND any details that might suggest method e.g. place</i>	

# Why did the 2015 select committee tighten the Bill?



- “The concern for all of us, including the committee, is that there needs to be a balance between preventing harmful reporting, which may give rise to copycat suicide episodes, and enabling enough reporting to note that an event has occurred. The last thing that any piece of legislation would seek to do is enable or encourage copycat behaviour, particularly by vulnerable young people.
- “We believe that the changes to this bill strike a good balance in that regard. There is a restriction around publishing; the method; or the site, if it suggests the method of the suicide, will be prohibited unless the Chief Coroner grants an exemption in that case. **This is based on international evidence that strongly suggests that the reporting of these details gives rise to copycat behaviour.**
- Jacqui Dean MP, chair justice and electoral select committee, 2<sup>nd</sup> reading of Coroners Amendment Amendment Bill
- [Sitting date: 20 October 2015. Volume:709;Page:7333. Text is subject to correction.]
- [http://www.parliament.nz/en-nz/pb/debates/debates/51HansD\\_20151020\\_00000028/coroners-amendment-bill-%E2%80%94-second-reading](http://www.parliament.nz/en-nz/pb/debates/debates/51HansD_20151020_00000028/coroners-amendment-bill-%E2%80%94-second-reading)

# Departmental advice to the select committee reviewing the Coroner's Amendment Bill

- “The Committee received and heard a number of submissions arguing that the restriction on suicide reporting should be abolished entirely (and potentially replaced with voluntary standards) ... that the effect of media reporting on inciting further suicides has been overstated, and that the effect is likely small, provided reporting is responsible.
- “We do not support this submission. There is good scientific evidence \* that certain types of media reporting of suicide (lurid, glamorising, method-specific) tends to incite further suicides. The Bill recognises that the current prohibition is uniquely restrictive and seeks to better focus it **on those details most likely to lead to copycat behaviour (the method and the site, if it suggests the method)**.
- “\* For example, see submission by the New Zealand Medical Association and the report provided by the Director of Mental Health.”

# What is that evidence?

- “There is considerable evidence on links between media influences and suicide behaviour. We draw the committee’s attention to the paper by Beautrais and Fergusson (2012) which provides an excellent evidence-based summary of the issue. ... we believe the amendments are consistent with international best practice in suicide prevention.”
- New Zealand Medical Association

# NZ summary of the evidence

## How NZers summarised the evidence

- “Media influences have now been examined in more than 80 scientific studies worldwide. These studies yield **remarkably consistent findings across different types of media, different research methodologies, and different cultures and countries**, for outcomes of both suicide attempts and suicide completions ....
- “In particular, a 2010 study examined both the positive and negative effects of media reporting using Austrian data. This study found that the *repetitive* [their italics] reporting of completed suicide or suicide attempts, had harmful effects and **led to increases in suicidal behaviour.**” Beautrais and Fergusson (2012)

## What they got wrong

- 2010 paper did **NOT** show cause. In fact, no study has. Have only shown correlations.
- Yes, 2010 did find repetition was associated with increase, but this finding was not the main one.
- Authors have made it clear that we still don't know a lot of what kinds of reporting + presentation are actually possibly harmful, and that there are wide regional differences, and that *they do not support censorship*.

# Regional differences

- Celebrity suicides: meta-analysis of 10 studies (98 suicides) found AVERAGE increase of 0.26 suicides/100,000 in month following.
- BUT: in Australia much lower (-0.18)
- Hong Kong (0.53)
- “A growing number of studies indicate that sensationalist reporting of suicide is associated with an increase in suicide rates...”
- “Celebrity suicides will always be reported because they are particularly newsworthy, and we are not suggesting they should be censored. Instead we would argue that they should be reported in a responsible manner ...”
- Thomas Niederkrotenthaler, King-wa Fu, Paul S F Yip, Daniel YT Fong, Steven Stack, Qijn Cheng, Jane Pirkis, (2012). *Changes in suicide rates following media reports on celebrity suicide: a meta-analysis*. J. Epidemiological & Community Health 66, 1037-1042.

**疑體檢發現隱疾 密封門窗燃燒炭**  
**女狗癡製新式毒室自殺亡**

【本報訊】一名愛狗如命女子，因被發現於其位於多倫多市內的一處出租屋內，於昨晚凌晨，在該屋內燒炭自殺。警方在燒炭自殺的現場，發現其門窗均被密封，屋內充滿濃烈的炭氣。警方在燒炭自殺的現場，發現其門窗均被密封，屋內充滿濃烈的炭氣。

**任職保險公司**  
死者年約三十五歲，任職保險公司。據悉，死者生前患有嚴重的憂鬱症，且曾多次嘗試自殺。警方在燒炭自殺的現場，發現其門窗均被密封，屋內充滿濃烈的炭氣。

警方在現場發現燒炭自殺的炭爐及剩餘的炭。

**資料庫**  
**燒炭釋一氧化碳**  
燒炭中的炭會令空氣內充斥過量的一氧化碳。一氧化碳無色無臭，一般空氣中的一氧化碳含量約為百分之零點一，對人體影響小。但一氧化碳粒子進入人體後，會軟弱氧氣分子「腳」快二百倍黏附在紅血球的血紅蛋白上，因而導致紅血球不能攜帶氧氣分子往腦部，漸漸使腦缺氧而死亡。健康的成年人如血液內的一氧化碳含量達百分之六十便足以致命，以往曾有市民以燒炭取暖，卻未注意保持室內空氣流通，結果出事。

# What did that Austrian study actually say?

- Content analysis of 497 suicide-related print media reports in Austria over six months in 2005, compared to suicide rates.
- Yes, did find that repetitive reporting, reports about suicide by jumping, were associated with increases in suicide rates.
- But also found that this effect was not very strong, and certainly not as strong as reports containing other facts (see table):
- “Meaning of the key findings:  
“Evidence to date suggests the preventive potential of quantitative reduction in sensationalist reporting. To this, the present findings add that actual reporting of suicidal ideation itself may contribute to preventing suicide.
- SO: NZ focus on NOT reporting method does not reflect main thrust of recent research.
- Niederkrotenthaler, T. Voracek, M., Herberth, A, Till, B., Struass, M., Etzersdorfer, E., Eisenwort, B., Sonneck, G. (2010) Role of media reports in completed and prevented suicide: Werther v. Papageno effects. British Journal of Psychiatry 197, 234-43.

Class	Effect on suicide rate/100,000 pop
1: reports on case of completed suicide	0.03
2: reports on suicidal intention not accompanied by suicidal behaviour	- 0.08
3: reports on suicide research and statistics	0.14
4: reports on expert opinions, prevention programmes	0.13

# Conclusions

- Departmental advice was ill-informed
- NZ policy formation easily influenced by 'experts' who claim specialist knowledge
- This needs to be challenged ON the evidence itself
- Attempts to argue for media freedom must start with influencing potential advisors, as well as MPs themselves

# References

- Anon. (2011). Hamilton Lake Death not suspicious. Stuff: Available at: <http://www.stuff.co.nz/national/5949994/Hamilton-Lake-death-not-suspicious>
- Anon. (2011). Draft media guidelines on the reporting of suicide.
- Anon. (2011). Girl Home Alone with Dead Mother. Stuff: Available at: <http://www.stuff.co.nz/dominion-post/news/local-papers/upper-hutt-leader/5892057/Girl-home-alone-with-dead-mother>
- Anon. (2011). Dead body of Gary Speed discovered by wife. Stuff: Available at: <http://www.stuff.co.nz/sport/football/6060036/Dead-body-of-Gary-Speed-discovered-by-wife>
- Beautrais, A. (2005). Submission to the Select Committee on the Coroners Bill. March 29, 2005. Available at NZ Parliamentary Library, Ref: Cor 28w.
- Beautrais, A.L., Horwood L.J., Fergusson D.M. (2004). Knowledge and attitudes about suicide in 25-year olds. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry* 38: 260-5; pp 263-4.
- Chapman, K. (2011). Key favours loosening suicide reporting rules. Stuff, 28 August 2011. Available at: <http://www.stuff.co.nz/national/health/5523624/Key-favours-loosening-suicide-reporting-rules>
- Crane, Catherine<sup>1</sup>; Hawton, Keith<sup>1,3</sup>; Simkin, Sue<sup>1</sup>; Coulter, Paddy. (2003). Suicide and the Media: Pitfalls and Prevention: Report on a Meeting Organized by the Reuters Foundation Program at Green College and University of Oxford Centre for Suicide Research at Green College, Oxford, UK, November 18, 2003
- Collings, S., Kemp, C. (2010). Death knocks, professional practice, and the public good: The media experience of suicide reporting in New Zealand. *Social Science & Medicine* 71 244-248.
- Collings, S., & Niederkrotenthaler, T. (2012). Suicide prevention and emergent media: Surfing the opportunity. *Crisis: The Journal of Crisis Intervention and Suicide Prevention*, 33(1), 1-4.
- Etzersdorfer, E., & Sonneck, G. (1998). Preventing suicide by influencing mass-media reporting. The Viennese experience 1980–1996. *Archives of Suicide Research*, 4, 67-74.
- Francis, C. (2011). Helium suicide sparks call for review. Stuff August 22, 2011. Available at: <http://www.stuff.co.nz/national/5484448/Helium-suicide-sparks-call-for-review>
- Gauntlett, D. Ten Things wrong with the effects model. In Roger Dickinson, Ramaswani Harindranath & Olga Linné, eds (1998), *Approaches to Audiences – A Reader*, published by Arnold, London. Available at: <http://www.theory.org.uk/david/effects.htm>
- Konrad, M., Frey, C., Wyss, K., & Valach, L. (2000). An exercise in improving suicide reporting in print media. *Crisis* 21/2, 71-79.
- Littmann, S.K. (1983). The role of the press in the control of suicide epidemics. In J.P. Soubrier & J. Vedrinne (Eds.), *Depression and suicide: Proceedings of the XI Congress of the International Association for Suicide Prevention*, Paris, July 5–8, 1981(pp. 166–170). Paris: Pergamon
- Mental Health Commission. (2011). National health indicators: Measuring mental health and addiction in New Zealand. Wellington: Mental Health Commission.
- McRobbie, A., & Thornton, S.L. (1995). Rethinking 'Moral Panic' for Multi-Mediated Social Worlds. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 46, 559-574. Mental Health Commission. (2011). National health indicators : Measuring mental health and addiction in New Zealand. Wellington: Mental Health Commission.
- Michel, K., Wyss, K., Frey, C., & Valach, L. (2000). An exercise in improving suicide reporting in print media. *Crisis*, 21, 71.
- Ministry of Health. (2008). NZ Suicide prevention action plan 2008-2012 The evidence for action. P48.
- Ministry of Health. (2008). NZ Suicide Prevention Action Plan: The summary for action.
- Ministry of Health. (2011). Reporting Suicide: A resource for the media. Developed by the media Roundtable and adopted by the Media Freedom Committee and the Newspaper Publishers' Association, December 2011. Available at: [http://www.health.govt.nz/system%2Ffiles%2Fdocuments%2Fpublications%2Freporting-suicide-a-resource-for-media-dec2011.doc&ei=Q3aZUJqtOYTpiAeQ0oGYCA&usg=AFQjCNFLNp\\_681asAaWVVvsJ5sV0d61pbug](http://www.health.govt.nz/system%2Ffiles%2Fdocuments%2Fpublications%2Freporting-suicide-a-resource-for-media-dec2011.doc&ei=Q3aZUJqtOYTpiAeQ0oGYCA&usg=AFQjCNFLNp_681asAaWVVvsJ5sV0d61pbug)
- New Zealand Parliament, (1988). Coroner's Bill, 1988, Clause 29, (1).
- New Zealand Parliament, (2006). Coroner's Act
- Niederkrotenthaler, T., Voracek, M., Herberth, A., Till, B., Strauss, M., Etzersdorfer, E., Eisenwort, B., & Sonneck, G. (2010). Role of media reports in completed and prevented suicide: Werther v. Papageno effects. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 197, 234-243.
- Niederkrotenthaler, T., & Sonneck, G. (2007). Assessing the impact of media guidelines for reporting on suicides in Austria: interrupted time series analysis. *Australasian Psychiatry*, 41, 419-428.
- Pillay, L. (2006). Coroner's Bill: Additional matters raised during consideration of the coroner's Bill Department report. Letter to Justice and Electoral Committee, New Zealand Parliament, March 13, 2006. Available at NZ Parliamentary Library, Ref: Cor/moj/5
- Pirkis, J. (2010). Contribution to knowledge about media professionals' experiences with reporting suicide. A commentary on Collings and Kemp. *Social Science & Medicine*, 71, 249-50.
- Pirkis, J., Blood, R.W., Beautrais, A., Burgess, P., & Skehan, J. (2006). Media guidelines on the reporting of suicide. *Crisis*, 27 (2), 82-87.
- Pirkis, J., Dare, A., Blood, R.W., Rankin, B., Williamson, M., Burgess, P., et al. (2009). Changes in media reporting of suicide in Australia between 2000/01 and 2006/07. *Crisis*, 30, (1), 25.
- Thom, K., McKenna, B., Edwards, G., O'Brien, A., & Nakarada-Kordic, I. (2012). Reporting of suicide by the New Zealand media. *Crisis: The Journal of Crisis Intervention and Suicide Prevention*, 33(4), 199-207.