

Dear Malik,

You are not the first one to object to such reports in Islamic history.

You say: While all this was happening to Hazrat Fatima, was Hazrat Ali watching just as a bystander? Or was he busy in having his daughter Hazrat Kulsum marry Hazrat Umar??

Hazrat Ali was above and beyond personal considerations. The Day Fatima Zahra's house was attacked by the government officials, Imam Ali was arrested first. Ali was not going to fight for his personal rights. He would definitely have won over the attackers and taken over the government single-handedly. However, later historians would accuse Ali of using force of arms in establishing Islam.

Imam Ali was more concerned about the ideology of Islam than his own personal power.

The Prophet had said many times: "I am leaving among you two valuable things, the Book of Allah and my Ahle-Bayt. They will not separate from each other until they meet up with me at the Pond; if you attach yourselves to these two, never ever shall you go wrong."

True to that Hadeeth, the members of the Ahl-e-Bayt were always in the forefront giving one sacrifice after another in the service of the Prophet's mission, until the Tragedy of Karbala happened.

Anyway, the attack on the house of Fatima Zahra is very well documented. You can look at the book titled: *Al-Imama was-Siyasa* by Ibn Qutayba Daynoori.

If you cannot read Arabic, I suggest you consult the New Encyclopedia of Islam and peruse three articles: (i) Ghadeer-e-Khum, (ii) Fatima Zahra, and (iii) Fadak.

There are many other books.

As far as Imam Ali marrying his daughter named Umm Kulsoom to Umar is concerned, it is a fabricated report. I have written about it at length. I can share that text with you if you are interested.

A large part of the Muslim community has been left completely in the dark about such reports. Everytime, a writer brings these reports in public, he is immediately labeled as a liar and is ridiculed.

I live in New Jersey, USA. Three years ago we held a joint Shia/Sunni conference on Karbala. Believe me, there were people from Egypt who had not heard of Karbala, they only vaguely had heard the name of Imam Husayn, let alone knowing about Karbala. Imagine such young men and women who were raised in Egypt and are now living in the USA. These people came from a country which has one of the oldest and most prestigious institutions of Islamic learning – the *Al-Azhar*.

So, please, do some reading before forming any opinion about others.

You say:

You know of all these fairy tales that Hazrat Ali could not have stayed quiet, meaning that these things are fabricated and attributed to the holy Prophet, invented by the people, especially of Kufa, in their animosity against people from Hijaz. As for you I will pray to Allah to take the poison in you lying at your mental base since your childhood making you see things in a different pattern.

These are not fairy tales, these are reports from books written by established historians and Islamic scholars.

Instead, you should question your elders and teachers who have kept you in complete darkness of information.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Syed-Mohsin Naquvi



Connecting Communities Through Education