## TOPICAL SEMINAR NEWCOMB RESPONSE

How do destructive ideas, such as eugenics or racial supremacy, gain widespread acceptance? What conditions make a society vulnerable, and what are the most effective ways to combat them?

I found the following key ideas from <u>Claude.ai</u> to be a helpful outline

- 1) What characterizes a "destructive idea"
  - a) Oversimplification of complex problems
  - b) Dehumanization
  - c) Zero-Sum Frame
  - d) Resistance to evidence
  - e) Emotional Manipulation
  - f) Scapegoating
  - g) Utopian promises through extreme means
  - h) Self-reinforcing isolation
- 2) Destructive ideas are nothing new
  - a) Religious supremacy and forced conversion to Christianity 11th c
  - b) The Spanish Inquisition
  - c) Divine Right Absolute Monarchy 16th-18th c
  - d) Mercantilism and zero-sum economics 16th 18th c.
  - e) Civilizing missions, Scientific Racism and Manifest Destiny 19th c.
  - f) Science of Eugenics 19th and 20th c
- 3) In the 20th century we have also seen
  - a) Revivals of Anti-Semitism
  - b) Economic Determinism
  - c) Totalitarianism
  - d) Strength in Tribal and Cultural Homogeneity

Essentially, destructive ideas often feel compelling because they offer clarity and certainty in confusing times, provide a sense of meaning or belonging, and identify clear villains to blame. This is precisely what makes them dangerous—they satisfy psychological needs while leading toward harm. Perhaps this last phrase is the most important.

I couldn't pass up this image which was used by an author at this past Saturday's History Book Festival



John Gast, American Progress, 1872. Chromolithograph published by George A, Crofutt. Source: Prints and Photographs Division, Library of Congress.

How have societies combatted these ideas in the past? The challenging and dismantling of these destructive ideas happened through multiple overlapping processes, <u>often</u> <u>taking decades and remaining incomplete:</u>

- 1) Through Catastrophic Failure and Moral Revulsion (e.g. Stories of Holocausts, Post-War Revelations)
  - I submit that we are in the midst of one of these cycles now. Tactics that worked in the 1940's and 1950's now overwhelm a viewing or reading public.
- 2) Counter Expertise and Scientific Refutation
- 3) Genetic Research
- 4) The Anti-Colonial movements of 1947 19??

## 5) U S Civil Rights Movement

International Human Rights frameworks

- UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) established equality as international principle
- **UN Convention on Genocide** (1948) criminalized the ultimate expression of these ideologies
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (1965)

Intellectual and Cultural Counter-Movements

- 1) Harlem Renaissance
- 2) Existentialism and anti-colonial theories
- 3) Critical Race studies
- 4) Liberation Theology

I do not know the source of this list, but I think this reflection on past struggles is worth putting forward DESPITE its Critical Limitations

## Mechanisms of Dismantling a Destructive Idea

The dismantling happened through:

- 1. Delegitimization Removing scientific and moral authority
- 2. Legal prohibition Making discriminatory practices illegal
- 3. Institutional transformation Changing organizations that perpetuated these ideas
- 4. Cultural shift Altering what was socially acceptable to express
- 5. Counter-education Teaching new generations different frameworks
- 6. Economic disincentives Making racism costly (boycotts, sanctions)

I am left with the following reflections and questions -

- How are the destructive ideas of the 21st century related to those of centuries before?
- Did we truly dismantle the destructive ideas that colored the period prior to 1945?