



Review

Reviewed Work(s): Henry Highland Garnet: A Voice of Black Radicalism in the Nineteenth Century by Joel Schor

Review by: Walter L. Williams

Source: *The Journal of American History*, Vol. 64, No. 4 (Mar., 1978), pp. 1106-1107

Published by: Oxford University Press on behalf of Organization of American Historians

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1890774>

Accessed: 12-10-2024 00:44 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

Organization of American Historians, Oxford University Press are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Journal of American History*

Cherokee, Union Indian regiments outnumbered the Cherokee in the Confederate ranks, disproved any such identity.

The organization is somewhat confused, dates are too often omitted, and checking a particular statement may reveal that the authority is an obscure secondary work with no primary source indicated (for example, pp. 37, 47n.), or a collection, such as the Foreman Papers, with no identification of the item's character.

The volume, however, brings together a body of information which will be appreciated by all interested in the civilized tribes, frontier aspects of Afro-American history, and slavery in general, particularly by anyone considering a study of slavery in some other Amerindian tribe.

UNIVERSITY OF OREGON

KENNETH WIGGINS PORTER

Henry Highland Garnet: A Voice of Black Radicalism in the Nineteenth Century. By Joel Schor. (Westport: Greenwood, 1977. xii + 250 pp. Illustration, notes, bibliography, and index. \$15.95.)

While studies of black abolitionists usually concentrate on Frederick Douglass or Martin Delany, Henry Highland Garnet is usually remembered only for his radical call for slave resistance. Joel Schor rightly emphasizes other aspects of Garnet's ideology. The leader of blacks who abandoned a Garrisonian nonpolitical stance, Garnet worked actively for the Liberty Party. As a minister and missionary, he led relief and civil rights efforts for northern blacks, as well as more traditional abolitionist concerns. Garnet's other major contribution to black leadership was a more international perspective: first with his activities in the Free Produce movement in Europe (organizing boycotts of slave-produced goods), and later with his concern for emigration out of America.

Rivalry between Garnet and Douglass reflected divisions among black leaders on all these issues. Following studies by Howard Bell and Floyd Miller, Schor argues that emigration sentiment was much stronger in the 1850s than Douglass admitted. Interest declined after 1860, not so much because of black ideological commitment to America, but because of economic and physical changes in West Africa, Haiti, and the United States. Garnet was thus not inconsistent to support the Union war effort, the author argues, because changed conditions presented opportunity for revolution within the South after 1861. Schor demonstrates the relation of emigration, with its ideas of building a strong independent black nation, and improvement of black status in America.

Although this is a workmanlike biography of Garnet's life to 1865, there are some flaws in the book. The writing style is sometimes marred by a tendency to quote long passages and to be overly detailed. For example, do we really need to know the time of each church meeting for

Garnet's mission in Jamaica (p. 126), or the text of a resolution of thanks presented to him (pp. 141-42)? On the other hand, there is too little on Garnet's adult family life or personality.

It was a mistake to end the book at 1865, since valuable insights could have been presented about Garnet's later disgust with the limits of Reconstruction, and his consequent renewal of interest in Africa. From diplomatic papers in the National Archives, Schor could have gained perspective on Garnet's attitudes toward Africa during his term as United States minister to Liberia.

Nevertheless, this book does provide a balanced summary of the multi-faceted Garnet, who has been incorrectly labeled as an anti-white, pessimistic, separatist. For showing that these things are untrue, and that radicalism was a positive force in Afro-American history, Schor deserves thanks.

UNIVERSITY OF CINCINNATI

WALTER L. WILLIAMS

Travis. By Archie P. McDonald. (Austin: Jenkins, 1976. 214 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, and index. \$12.50.)

The Quaker abolitionist Benjamin Lundy once referred to the leaders of the Texas revolt as "ambitious aspirants who, having lost the confidence of the people in their own country, sought a new theatre where they might press their claims to public favor and political distinction. . . ." This description closely fits the subject of Archie P. McDonald's book. In 1831 William B. Travis abandoned his family in the Alabama hinterlands and migrated to Texas, where, after dabbling in law and politics for several years, he took up arms in the independence movement. A competent soldier, Travis eventually assumed command of the Alamo; there, on March 3, 1836, the young officer penned a passionate defense of the cause for which he was about to die. This eloquent apologia, together with his gallant conduct, earned him a high place in the Texas pantheon.

McDonald writes in pursuit of two major goals, namely, to portray Travis as "a man of flesh and blood" and to evaluate the hero "as a man of the American frontier." Unquestionably, those portions of the book which depict Travis as the paradigmatic Jacksonian opportunist are the most successful. Reminiscent in substance, albeit not in style, of Turner, De Voto, and Boorstin, the author is at his best in delineating the venturesome Travis as he schemes and manipulates against a frontier backdrop. Paradoxically, McDonald's attempt to develop "a man of flesh and blood" is less effective. Notwithstanding Herculean efforts, the biographer fails to impart life to his subject; Travis remains a mannequin arranged in heroic stance.

More specific flaws also mar the work. The absence of maps, the use