

To: Cheryl Holmes[cheryl.holmes@dominionvoting.com]
Cc: Nicole Nollette[nicole.nollette@dominionvoting.com]
From: Kay Stimson
Sent: Mon 9/21/2020 10:47:07 PM
Subject: RE: INTERNAL - Response DRAFT to Wayne County Clerk email - Edits
[Wayne Response NN KS.docx](#)

Here are my suggestions. Do with them what you will. Based on our discussion with Chris Thomas (former state ED), few understand the adjudication module and how it works. Lots of things are in play, so Greg is making somewhat of a premature push here. Chris said he's got the City thinking 1 hour, not 15 mins, for example. He wants us to give him suggestions – he is happy to make them. My one editing philosophy was not to put too much into writing, even if we know more than they do.

Kay

From: Cheryl Holmes <cheryl.holmes@dominionvoting.com>
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2020 5:27 PM
To: Kay Stimson <kay.stimson@dominionvoting.com>
Subject: RE: INTERNAL - Response DRAFT to Wayne County Clerk email - Edits

Kay

Here is the version with Nicole's edits.

Thank you
Cheryl

CHERYL HOLMES | SENIOR MANAGER
CUSTOMER RELATIONS MANAGER – Florida / Louisiana / Michigan
DOMINION VOTING SYSTEMS
1201 18th Street, Suite 210, Denver, CO 80202
1.866.654.VOTE ext. 9324 | DOMINIONVOTING.COM
[559.289.3818](tel:559.289.3818) MOBILE

From: Nicole Nollette <nicole.nollette@dominionvoting.com>
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2020 4:24 PM
To: Kay Stimson <kay.stimson@dominionvoting.com>
Cc: Cheryl Holmes <cheryl.holmes@dominionvoting.com>
Subject: FW: INTERNAL - Response DRAFT to Wayne County Clerk email -

Kay, can you please review this response also before Cheryl sends it to Wayne County?

Nicole Nollette | EVP Operations

DOMINION VOTING SYSTEMS, INC.
1201 18th Street, Suite 210, DENVER, CO, 80202
1.866.654.VOTE (8683) | DOMINIONVOTING.COM

1.866.654.8683 OFFICE x9223
1.702.786.7131 MOBILE

From: Cheryl Holmes <cheryl.holmes@dominionvoting.com>
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2020 2:18 PM
To: Tim Baumbach <tim.baumbach@dominionvoting.com>; David Stahl <david.stahl@dominionvoting.com>; Nicole Nollette <nicole.nollette@dominionvoting.com>; Darren Silverburg <darren.silverburg@dominionvoting.com>; Megan Hanna <megan.hanna@dominionvoting.com>
Subject: INTERNAL - Response DRAFT to Wayne County Clerk email -

All ~

Please see below the draft response to the email sent from the Wayne County Clerk. The original email is attached.
Your comments and edits are appreciated. I would like to send it out tomorrow morning if possible. If the response should be sent from someone other than myself, please advise.

Thank you
Cheryl

<<DRAFT>>

Dear Clerk Garrett,

Thank you for sharing your concerns regarding the City of Detroit Absentee Counting Board process. We include our responses below to your questions and concerns regarding the use of the DSuite systems: ICC high speed scanner/tabulator, adjudication system, RTR and EMS/Server. We had one initial Zoom meeting call with the City last week to discuss the AVCB. System functionality, best practices and questions regarding the system use and capability were discussed. Our emphasis overall has been that they prepare a thorough and organized approach, implement multiple layers of physical and operational security and absolute confirmation of the accuracy of any reports or results before release.

Dominion's customer commitment is to ensure that all users are provided the knowledge, best practice guidance and support in the correct use of the systems and software toward accurate and successful elections. Our onsite support for the City's November election is of the highest caliber and will assist the City Lead in the administration of the DSuite systems as well as troubleshoot and resolve any system issues that may arise.

Please see our responses below. If you have further questions, we welcome any discussion.

Thank you

Cheryl Holmes

1. Will the City of Detroit perform a complete adjudication extract of all their AVCB's each time they want to export?

The City wants to provide results from AVCB tabulators as batches are fully processed (scanned or scanned and adjudicated). This may or may not include full AVCB precincts depending on the time of the export of results files from RTR.

The City would be best to answer how they will manage the AVCBs.

2. **Has any of Dominion's customers performed adjudication exports throughout an election night at the scale of what the City of Detroit is intending to do?**

The results files of completed, fully adjudicated ICC scanned batches are validated, published, and exported from RTR, not adjudication. In the absentee tally process, most Dominion customers export full precincts or ballot styles/types. The scale of results file export generation would be best answered by the City of Detroit.

3. **To perform the adjudication export, do all adjudication stations have to cease adjudicating in order to initiate and complete the file export each time?**
 - a. **If so, has the City shared how they will administratively organize, communicate and ensure its proper application?**
 - b. **Is there any concerns regarding stresses on the EMS System/Server stopping and starting every 15 minutes?**

The results files of completed, fully adjudicated ICC scanned batches are validated, published, and exported from RTR, not adjudication. ICC scanning and adjudication workstations do not have to cease operations. They continue to process batches and adjudicate ballots without affecting the results file export in RTR.

The results export process is conducted in RTR on the EMS System Server without stopping the server.

4. **Are there any issues that Dominion or their customers have experienced exporting adjudication files throughout an election night?**

Results files are exported from RTR, not adjudication. Adjudication files, once complete and submitted within the application, automatically transfer to RTR. We have not seen any issues related to that process.

5. **The City intends to upload an adjudication files to the County's FTPS every 15 minutes, the County will be following its previous protocols of loading hourly, does RTR prevent multiple adjudicated files from doubling the same batch results?**

The City intends to upload an adjudication files to the County's FTPS every 15 minutes, The City would be best able to provide the frequency of the results file uploads to the FTPS that they intend to implement.

the County will be following its previous protocols of loading hourly, does RTR prevent multiple adjudicated files from doubling the same batch results?

The same as in the County's EMS system, RTR prevents the upload files that have already been loaded. RTR will display an error message stating that these files already exist in the system and will not allow them to be uploaded or validated.

6. **Is there any limitation on the number or frequency of adjudication exports the EMS system can handle?**

Results files are exported from RTR, not adjudication. The EMS system does not have a limit on the frequency or number of results files exports. The frequency of exports is usually determined by the time to complete the physical processes to generate the export, print the summary report and confirm results accuracy before uploading.

7. **What are the implications if the City of Detroit accidentally closes out adjudication before the conclusion of the election?**

If the adjudication application is stopped or closed before the conclusion of tabulation, it can be

restarted or reopened without effect. The batches that are pending adjudication remain in queue. When the application is reopened, the batches waiting on adjudication are displayed and ready to adjudicate. Processing would continue as before.

8. The County is very concerned with the City of Detroit closing a tabulator in EMS while results are still being processed by the AVCB.
 - a. What safety protocols does Dominion advise to make sure the customer does not close a AVCB in EMS before all ballots have been tabulated? This is particularly concerning for it could damage public confidence if an AVCB is reporting it is at 100%, yet the results continue to increase throughout the night.

In the City of Detroit, each ICC AVCB tabulator file will be programmed by precinct(s). Ballots are scanned in multiple batches within a precinct(s). When a batch is complete, it is accepted, and the next batch can be scanned. Multiple batches may make up a complete precinct. Instructions provide that the ICC application on the tabulator is not closed until all ballots within that precinct have been scanned and accepted. If the operator inadvertently closes the ICC application on the tabulator, unlike the ICP, it can be reopened, and additional batches can be processed for that ICC AVCB tabulator.

In RTR, only validated and published results files can be printed and/or exported. Any batches in process in the ICC or adjudication applications would not be included in an export. Unlike the ICP, the ICC AVCB tabulator files do not need to be closed in RTR.

Dominion recommends that the City Lead confirm the accuracy and completion of ballot accounting documentation that all ballots for that AVCB have been processed. A thorough review and signoff of the printed summary report is recommended before exporting or uploading results. When all is complete, the ICC AVCB tabulator application can be closed, and file backups created.

9. Has Dominion reviewed and advised the City of Detroit's administrative protocols to ensure all AVCB ballots have been tabulated and adjudicated before AVCBs are closed in the EMS.

Dominion has not yet seen the City of Detroit's administrative protocols.

In addition to the DSuite documentation already provided, Dominion continues to reinforce best practices in the administration of the hardware and software system for accuracy and the successful completion of election night tally.

10. What tests will be performed during the pre-election period to ensure the integrity and accuracy of data being generated while in the middle of adjudicating, through downloading and uploading process?

The City of Detroit would need to provide a response with the full extent of tests to be performed. Dominion recommended to the City that a full and complete mock end to end be run, inclusive of all systems in the tally and reporting process. Those processes and components include but are not limited to ballot preparation front end processes, precinct tabulators, VATS, AVCB tabulators, material management in the tally center, adjudication system, RTR, report review, uploads on the actual networks that will be used Election Day/Night, test results uploads to the City server at COBO and the Boulevard, upload to the County FSTP site and the City website/ENR vendor site. This full end to end for system components should be included in the L&A testing.

We recommended to the City that they contact their other election providers to request best practices and recommendations in conducting and participation in full tests.

11. Can Dominion provide a complete process flow chart of how the mid-stream adjudication export throughout the night will be conducted, not just from an EMS file generation

standpoint but also the global steps that have to be taken in order to get the file from Detroit to the County's FTPS server? ie. Adj. stations stop adjudicating...etc.

The complete process flow chart will be finalized by the City of Detroit. Dominion continues to provide guidance, best practices and support for use and issue resolution as related to the system hardware and software.

Who will be the project lead on Dominion and City of Detroit side?

Dominion's Election Day support lead for the City of Detroit is Nick Ikonomakis, EVP of Engineering. The City of Detroit indicated that their Election Day project lead is Tim Gaffney.

What are the milestones for this project?

The City of Detroit would be best to respond regarding milestones for their project.

CHERYL HOLMES | SENIOR MANAGER

CUSTOMER RELATIONS MANAGER – Florida / Louisiana / Michigan

DOMINION VOTING SYSTEMS

1201 18th Street, Suite 210, Denver, CO 80202

1.866.654.VOTE ext. 9324 | DOMINIONVOTING.COM

[559.289.3818](tel:559.289.3818) MOBILE