

*Communities of Values, Communities of Practice:
Insights for Inculturation of an Augustinian Signature Pedagogy¹*
by

Gary N. McCloskey, O.S.A.

ABSTRACT:

Augustinian Pedagogy can be termed a pedagogy of Values and Practices, rather than one with specified methods. Implementation of this pedagogy occurs through Practices that align with the achievement of the Values. In Augustinian Pedagogy there is not a fixed number of Values. In various cultures, there are as few as 2 and as many as 13 identified Augustinian Values. This presentation makes the case that this variety of numbers is not confusing, but rather the Gestalts of various cultures hearing the North African Augustine of Hippo's pedagogical thought with differing numbers of aspects. A positive result of this complexity is that the use of Augustinian Pedagogy needs to be in dialogue with a culture to ensure the fullest enculturation. To ensure consistency of implementation of a culture's understanding, there should be Communities of Practice among practitioners for alignment of Values and Practices. This should lead to an Augustinian Signature Pedagogy.

KEYWORDS:

Augustinian Pedagogy, Pedagogical Values, Cultural Gestalt, Communities of Practice, Signature Pedagogy

SHORT BIOGRAPHY:

Rev. Gary N. McCloskey, O.S.A. is a researcher/educator focusing on both the Pedagogy of Saint Augustine of Hippo and the practice of Instructional Technology. He has been a teacher and administrator in higher education as well as a teacher on middle and secondary levels in various locations in the Eastern U.S. In addition to publications, he has provided teacher professional development and shared research findings on 6 of the 7 continents.

Early in my writing on Augustinian Pedagogy, I noted that it, “must include methods and practices that strengthen the habits of the will to act rightly”² However, I did not spell out in-depth how specific practices of this pedagogy function as the embodiment of the Augustinian Values that animate such a pedagogy. Recently, Kenneth Eze has described with specificity how Augustinian Pedagogy functions as a pedagogy of Values and Practices in the Nigerian context.³ In this presentation, I will strive to outline the relation of Values and Practices in this pedagogy to Communities of Values formed around various cultural iterations of Pedagogical Values derived from the thought of Augustine of Hippo about learning and teaching. I will connect these cultural iterations to the concept of "gestalt"/awareness in the organizational development of meaning-making, which can be advanced through educational "connoisseurship" dialogues within and across institutions. I will also strive to present Communities of Practice as means to develop an Augustinian “decorum” (fitness/suitability), as well as listening practices from Augustine as pedagogical principles for teaching and learning practices. Most importantly a case will be made for the varieties of Augustinian Pedagogical Values as fertile ground for making a case that Augustinian Pedagogy can be a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Pedagogy in ways a case has been made for Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy. Also, these Augustinian Pedagogy Communities of Practice can be ways to develop Reflective Practitioners via a Reflection Process derived from the writings of Augustine. Rather than a hindrance, the variety of iterations of Augustinian Pedagogical Values can be a spur for developing intercultural and cross-cultural Augustinian-style dialogues advancing the practices of Augustinian Pedagogy.

Communities of Values

One can ask. “What are the Augustinian Values on which we base Augustinian Pedagogy?” When we look around the world, we can be confused by the differing numbers of Augustinian Values we find in various countries and cultures. Santiago Insunza identifies Interiority and Communion as the 2 principles of categories of Augustinian thought.⁴ In North America, Augustinian Schools strive to implement what they term the 3 Augustinian Core Values of Truth, Unity, and Love.⁵

While most of these groupings of values are found in schools connected to the Roman Catholic Order of Saint Augustine, the Roman Catholic Order of Augustinian Recollects identify for Augustinian Pedagogy in their schools worldwide their 6 values as Interiority, Truth, Freedom, Friendship, Community, and Solidarity and Justice.⁶ The Federación Agustiniiana

Española (F.A.E.), a union among Augustinian-related religious congregations in Spain, have named 8 Augustinian Values for their schools, namely, Interiority, Search, Truth, Freedom, Friendship, Love, Community, and Solidarity.⁷ (In Spanish the values are: 1. *Interioridad*, 2. *Búsqueda*, 3. *Verdad*, 4. *Libertad*, 5. *Amistad*, 6. *Amor*, 7. *Comunidad*, y 8. *Solidaridad*). Also in the Spanish-speaking world, the Organización de los Agustinos de América Latina (O.A.L.A.) has identified its 10 values as, Search, Interiority, Transcendence, Friendship, Community, Solidarity, Community of Faith, Community of Prayer, Missionary Community, and Community of Charity.⁸ (In Spanish the values are: 1. *Búsqueda*, 2. *Interioridad*, 3. *Trascendencia*, 4. *Amistad*, 5. *Comunidad*, 6. *Solidaridad*, 7. *Comunidad de Fe*, 8. *Comunidad de Oración*, 9. *Comunidad Misionera*, y 10. *Comunidad de Caridad*).

Further, the Order of Saint Augustine's schools in the Philippines follow, in part, the 3 Core Values from North America, but also the Filipino Augustinian, Albert L. Esmeralda, O.S.A. posits 10 values that for him, and those who use his framework, more fully capture the Augustinian Pedagogy experience, namely, Love and the Order of Love, Interiority, Humility, Devotion to Study and the Pursuit of Truth, Freedom, Community, Common Good, Humble and Generous Service, Friendship, and Prayer.⁹ In Malta, the Order of Saint Augustine's school lists their 13 Augustinian Values as Love, Interiority, Humility, Devotion to Study, Pursuit of Truth, Freedom, Community, Common Good, Generous Service, Friendship, Prayer, Journey, and Search for God¹⁰

On the surface, these differing numbers might give the impression that there is a lack of clarity in understanding the values, but a closer look can reveal that the larger numbers of values provide greater specificity to the groupings with fewer named values. If one compares the 10 Esmeralda values and the 13 values listed by the Maltese, one can see that 11 of the Maltese values are the same as Esmeralda's 10 with Esmeralda's Devotion to Study and the Pursuit of Truth split as 2 values and the Maltese addition of the 2 values of Journey and Search for God can be seen as teased out of descriptions of Augustine's notion of Interiority.

In the past, I might have approached discussing these differences with an Academic Research Construct.¹¹ But in approaching these differences now, I must respect the lived experience of the people of these various cultures in their dialogues with the more than 5,000,000 words that we have in the thought of Augustine of Hippo and how that thought speaks to culture. This fluctuation would not be troublesome for Augustine, since in *Confessions* 3:7 he

tells us, “The law shapes conduct in different countries according to the needs of the times. But the law itself has not changed. It is not one thing in one place and something else in another place.”¹² Even though Augustine uses the term “countries,” I believe this applies in the cultural/regional realities of the sets of Augustinian Pedagogical Values. They are also cultural rather than linguistic sets of values because of the differences that can be seen within the same language.

The experiences in the various Communities of Values that have birthed these listings may be what Herb Stevenson has described as Cultural Gestalt/Awareness¹³ in his description of engaging in Organizational Development. As he notes, “Gestalt psychology principles of perceptual organization reveal how we form perceptions and how, as a result, we make meaning, based on our existing knowledge and way of making meaning from experience.”¹⁴ This notion of perceptions related to experience and cultural interpretation can be a rich point of an ongoing discussion of Augustinian Pedagogical Values within and across cultural groupings. About such richness in Gestalt in Organizational Development Stevenson adds, “Reality shifts by widening, deepening, and revealing new or alternative ways of thinking, perceiving, and doing (driving and framing perceptions).”¹⁵ Here in the various sets of Augustinian Pedagogical Values, we can see practitioners making richer and richer meaning, through their cultural gestalts in their practice of Augustine of Hippo’s thinking and presenting on aspects of teaching and learning.

In having such dialogues any evaluative thoughts should not be thought of as rigidly definitive. Rather, evaluation should be guided by Elliot Eisner’s notion of educational “connoisseurship.” As he describes it,

Effective criticism, within the arts or education, is not an act independent of the powers of perception. The ability to see, to perceive what is subtle, complex, and important, is its first necessary condition. The act of knowledgeable perception is, in the arts, referred to as connoisseurship. To be a connoisseur is to know how to look, to see, to appreciate. Connoisseurship, generally defined, is the art of appreciation.”¹⁶

Such a connoisseurship approach would take into account the cultural perceptions and meaning-making that occurs within a culture’s appropriation of Augustine of Hippo’s approaches to learning and teaching.

Strangely, the Covid Pandemic may have trained us in ways to use Zoom and similar means to have these “appreciative dialogues” of connoisseurship to deepen our understanding of the Values within and across cultural Communities of Values. While having these dialogues in differing time zones which may seem a problem, it is an opportunity to engage in fostering what Insunza identifies as the Augustinian category of Communion,¹⁷ as much as possible.

Communities of Practice

Unlike educational theories such as those of Montessori and Piaget, Augustinian Pedagogy does not provide a specific set of practices for program evaluation.¹⁸ Despite not having a blueprint, practitioners can gather to aid one another’s reflection to deepen choices of practices. Rather than “one size fits all,” practitioners may find in their practice things that comport with Augustinian Pedagogy and so they may find their practice is “one size fits one,” yet still be appropriate Augustinian Pedagogy. Here practitioners would participate in an Augustinian style of Reflection. In Augustinian terms, this is “decorum” akin to Dodaro’s description that literary decorum is what “governs what is suitable and fitting in oral or written discourse.”¹⁹ This notion of “what is suitable and fitting” is a tool that Dodaro shows Augustine used in his *Confessions* and *The Trinity*. Within various cultures “what is suitable and fitting” may differ from other cultures, yet still aid in the meaning-making about Augustinian Pedagogical Values across cultures.

A further tool from Augustine, for use in Communities of Practice, is listening to those receiving Augustinian Pedagogy in ways that Augustine recommended in *De catechizandis rudibus*. We can see Augustine’s ideas in this text turned into contemporary educational practices by Immerwahr.²⁰ The suggested principles he identifies are 1. The teacher-learner relationship is vital (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 2,18, and 13,18); 2. Creating a positive learning environment is even harder than getting the content right (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 2,4); 3. Know your students and customize the class for them (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 15,23); 4. Understand student fears, and help overcome them (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 13,18); 5. Constantly reset the students’ attention (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 13,19); 6. Connect learning to the student’s own experience (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 13,19); and, 7. Find the joy in making the old things new (*De catechizandis rudibus*, 12,17). Running throughout these principles is an underlying tenor of “relationality.” This tenor is filled with opportunities for “alliances of learning” between teachers and students dialoguing horizontally rather than the vertical

relationships found in traditional didactic forms of teaching and learning. Dialogue is an important aspect of Augustinian Pedagogy. The “joy” Immerwahr identifies is the “cheerful attitude,” described by Raymond Canning,²¹ and it evidences Augustine of Hippo’s “Scriptural Imagination” in action inspired by Saint Paul’s dictum “God loves the cheerful giver” (2 Corinthians 9:7).

Such “Augustinian” listening can be seen in the decades-long work of F.A.E. assemblies in Spain. A recent study by Zagarella²² identifies faculty in a North American Augustinian school asking for such discussions. Expanding these dialogues, especially where they are absent would advance and strengthen the implementation of Augustinian Pedagogy and its Values. Again, the Covid Pandemic may have trained us in ways to use Zoom and similar means to have these “suitability/fitness/listening dialogues” to deepen our understanding of the practices within and across Cultural Communities of Practice of Augustinian Pedagogy, as well as in an individual educational site.

Augustinian Pedagogy as a Signature Pedagogy

I believe that 2 benefits can come from the discussions within and across Communities of Practice. First, Augustinian Pedagogy can become a “signature pedagogy” for Augustinian- animated schools. Lee Shulman described signature pedagogies as “the types of teaching that organize the fundamental ways in which future practitioners are educated for their new professions.”²³ While originally connected to the pedagogies of academic disciplines, Nowacek and Mountin have made the case for Ignatian (Jesuit School) Pedagogy, which they see emanating from the *Spiritual Exercises* of Saint Ignatius Loyola, the founder of the Jesuits.²⁴ being a signature "cross-disciplinary" pedagogy. As they observe,

In the case of Ignatian pedagogy, the ‘professional’ goal, across every discipline and department, is to link the cultivation of intellectual accomplishment and scholarly expertise to the moral and spiritual dimension.... If traditional signature pedagogies are intended to prepare students for good work in the professions, the Ignatian signature pedagogy we describe is meant to prepare students for good work in all professions.²⁵

Since those, using Augustinian Pedagogy. also mean “to prepare students for good work in all professions,” then surely the discussions within and across Communities of Practice can add to making the case for Augustinian Pedagogy as a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Pedagogy.

Areas where the case for Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy as a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Pedagogy can be used to frame a case, via Augustinian Pedagogical Values, for seeing Augustinian Pedagogy as such a Signature Pedagogy are Reflection and Action in the Jesuit Tradition,²⁶ Key Principle of Context,²⁷ Key Principle of Experience,²⁸ Key Principle of Reflection,²⁹ Key Principle of Action,³⁰ Key Principle of Evaluation,³¹ and Scaffolding.³² In their presentation on seeing Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy as a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Pedagogy, Nowacek and Mountin explain how it works in Higher Education classrooms but do not provide much explanation of how students would benefit from it as professionals in the work world. In the following review of aspects of Augustinian Pedagogy as a Cross-Disciplinary signature Pedagogy, attention will be given to its possible contributions to professional thinking and decision-making in post-Higher Education lives.

Reflection and Action in the Jesuit Tradition - Nowacek and Mountin present this as an overarching concept in Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy. In Augustine's thought and the pedagogy derived from it, this would be found in Contemplation and Action. Augustine of Hippo did not see "contemplation" in the limited spiritual or religious sense we find in present times. It was for him a reflective aspect coming from the practice of philosophy in pagan as well as his Christian times. It may be better termed as what Pierre Hadot describes as a "vigilance of the spirit which lets us apply the fundamental rule to each of life's situations."³³

In Augustinian Pedagogical Values terms, this can be seen in interiority. search for truth, communion, solidarity, love/charity, etc. As Augustine describes the relationship between contemplation and action. "No one must be so committed to contemplation that in his contemplation he gives no thought to his neighbor's needs, nor so absorbed in action as to dispense with the contemplation of God. It is the love of study that seeks a holy leisure and only the compulsion of charity that shoulders necessary activity." (*City of God*, XIX, 19) This explication is at the heart of the argument of that section of his famous *City of God*. We might in more contemporary thought term them solitude and solidarity.

At times Augustine favors contemplation over action (*Sermons 169, 179, and 255*). In tending to his need for contemplation, gardens stand out for Augustine as places for cultivating contemplation.³⁴ Garden retreats are for Augustine more than metaphor or imagery. They are places of personal development in the experience of quiet and rest. As he comments, "I'd rather work in the garden ... than deal with people's squabbles, arguments and grievances." (*On the*

Work of Monks, 37) Lawless calls them signposts along the way.³⁵ These gardens may have been like steppingstones in his development. (*On True Religion*, 29, 52) The specific gardens in Augustine's life are 1. The Pear Orchard not far from his parents' home at *Thagaste* (*Confessions* II, 4, 9); 2. At the rented house in *Milan* where Augustine heard *Tolle Lege* (*Confessions* VIII, 12, 28-29); 3. At the estate of Verecundus at *Cassiciacum* (*Confessions* IX, 3, 5); 4. Courtyard of the lodging house at *Ostia* where Monica and Augustine had their ecstatic experience. (*Confessions* IX, 10, 23-26); 5. The inherited property at *Thagaste* where Augustine established his first monastery. (Possidius *Life of Augustine* III); and, 6. The Garden at *Hippo* which Bishop Valerius gave to Augustine as a building site for a monastery. (Possidius *Life of Augustine* V). These garden experiences added to Augustine's Scriptural Imagination as he related them to Gardens of Scripture, such as Garden of Eden, Agony in Garden of Gethsemane, and Resurrection Appearance to Mary Magdalen. These garden experiences evidence in Augustinian Pedagogy that for educating people there is a need to have real places to step aside and reflect to make the best decisions in their personal and professional lives. In his *Rule* (II, 3), Augustine tells us, "Think over in your hearts the words that come from your lips."³⁶ Real space to do this is necessary.

Augustine sees complementation and action as teaching us to find balance among the aspects of our lives. In his writings, he uses the images of Martha and Mary, Peter and Paul, and Rachel and Leah to teach us to balance reflection/contemplation and action. About the story of Martha and Mary, Augustine notes, "In these two women two kinds of life are represented: present life and future life.... Now it's up to you to think about them more fully." (*Sermon 104*, 4) He balances reflection and action here where most interpreters have seen a clear opposition with action as a negative. About Peter and John, he observes, "The Church knows two lives... one in the effort of action, the other in the reward of contemplation.... Let Peter be loved and let John be loved." (*Homily on Gospel of John 124*, 5) In Rachel and Leah, Augustine sees their names as teaching us to understand the need to balance action and contemplation. As he says, "Leah is translated as 'laboring,' but Rachel is translated as 'principle seen' or 'word by which the principle is seen.'" (*Answer to Faustus - A Manichean*, XXII, 52)

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making that working on Reflection (Contemplation) and Action can provide is in understanding the need to find time and space to balance them and how to use them appropriately for good and sustainable professional

practice. Antidotes to the current imbalance may be seen in the reintroduction of mindfulness, yoga practices, self-care in the workplace for more balance in work life. Learning how to balance these aspects may help in keeping in front of the professional mind truisms like “Think before you act” and “learn from your mistakes.”

Key Principle of a Signature Ignatian Pedagogy: Context - Nowacek and Mountin present Key Principles of a Signature Ignatian Pedagogy. The first presented is Context. As they write, “This is a legacy of the Jesuit awareness that adaptation to different cultures is crucial.”³⁷ Augustinian Pedagogical Values in their variety demonstrate deep attention to cultural contexts. Also, teaching in specific contexts groupings of Augustinian Pedagogical Values that have been created from cultural gestalts can enable teachers and learners to attend more easily to cultural aspects. The various ways that interiority and searching and other aspects of the groupings are conveyed can help people in a specific cultural context as well as aid those involved to connect the Values to their personal experiences.

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making is that the attention to the culturally understood Augustinian Pedagogical Values can provide learners with experiences of considering cultural context and personal experience within professional thinking and decision-making, as well as balancing these aspects with other factors.

Key Principle of a Signature Ignatian Pedagogy: Experience - Nowacek and Mountin in this Key Principle extend the idea of experience included in the Context Key Principle. A Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy can do much about attention to student experience since Augustine posits the nexus of learning within the learner rather than through the action of the teacher. Augustine reminds his readers, “Consider this great puzzle. The sounds of my words strike the ears, but the Teacher is within. Do not think that any human teaches another. The sound of our voice can admonish, but the one who teaches is on the inside. The sound we make is useless.” (*Tractate on I John III*, 12) In a dialogue with his son, Adeodatus, from his early writings, we can read, “What foolish oddity could ever lead someone to send a child to school so that he can learn what the teacher thinks?” (*The Teacher*, 45) Here he is telling us that the focus on the teacher is misplaced. He went on to note, “Because they coexist, the inspirational light of the teacher is confused with the activated light of the student.” (*The Teacher*. 14, 46). As he describes in another place, “Let us listen to the truth from the one who is inside, and then speak from the heart to those who are outside.” (*Exposition on Psalm 33*) Also,

in *De Catechizandis Rudibus*, described above, Augustine emphasizes the importance of preachers/teachers attending to the experience and situations of hearers so that they may be truly heard.

Education via a Signature Augustinian Pedagogy educates students to process their experience and listen within in ways that Augustine dialogued with his Reason in his *Soliloquies*. Through deep experiences of processing Interiority and Search for Truth, such a Signature Pedagogy can enable participants to understand and value their own experience, as well as to differentiate between personal desire and a true understanding of reality.

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making a Signature Augustinian Pedagogy can make to the Key Principle of Experience includes helping learners to see where the real work goes on. Professionals need to get others to follow them and their decisions. This type of Signature Pedagogy teaches participants the importance of listening over telling for successful professional thinking and decision-making. Further, it advances the thought that professional thinking and decision-making are not solely individual endeavors, but more importantly, filled with relationships and relational dimensions.

Key Principle of a Signature Ignatian Pedagogy: Reflection – Nowacek and Mountin in this Key Principle extend the idea of reflection with a look at reflection processes, such as the *Examen*, which is a famous part of the teachings of Ignatius of Loyola. A Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy would involve means of developing self-knowledge through processes like those that led Augustine to ask the Inner Teacher. “Let me know myself. Let me know You.” (*Soliloquies*, II, 1,1) In another place, he encouraged his hearers to “Know who you are and be yourself.” (*Sermon 137*, 4, 4) To be true to its Augustinian roots a Signature Augustinian Pedagogy must have processes like these. Augustine sees such processes as “mirrors” we hold up to know what is truly going on. As he observes, “It is not like a person being told ‘Look at your face,’ which he can only do in a mirror.... When the mind is told ‘Know yourself’ it knows itself the very moment it understands what ‘yourself’ is.” (*Trinity X*, 12) It is up to the seer to find what is truly going on. In Augustine’s words,

You must tell yourselves the truth. I have simply put a mirror in front of you for you to look at yourselves. I am the mirror’s reflective power showing those who look into the mirror their faces. Note that the faces I am talking about now are the ones that are inside of us. I can address these faces through your ears even though I

cannot see them. Now that I am presenting you with a mirror, each of you should look at yourselves and tell yourselves what you see. (*Sermon 306B*, 4)

In his *Rule* (VIII, 2) for Christian living, Augustine even provides a “mirror” process for advancing in a good direction, when he says,

And that you may see yourselves in this little book, as in a mirror, have it read to you once a week so as to neglect no point through forgetfulness. When you find that you are doing all that has been written, give thanks to the Lord, the Giver of every good. But when one of you finds that he has failed on any point, let him be sorry for the past, be on his guard for the future, praying that he will be forgiven his fault and not be led into temptation.

Recognizing the need to address error and faults ties into the role of Humility in education through a Signature Augustinian Pedagogy. It is truly part of the process of reflection. In a crucial text from Augustine we hear,

The first step in the search for truth is humility. The second, humility. The third, humility. And the last one, humility. Naturally, that does not mean that humility is the only virtue necessary for discovering and enjoying truth. But if other virtues are not preceded, accompanied and followed by humility, pride will find an opening and infiltrate them and, sooner or later, finish up destroying good intentions. All other vices are recognized when we are doing wrong; but pride is to be feared even when we do right. Test those things which are done in a praiseworthy manner lest they be spoiled by the desire for praise itself. (*Letter 118*, 3, 22)

Importantly, we can learn from Augustine a humility that our reflection processes cannot be individual or purely personal. As he shows us truth is common property rather than personal property. In his words, “I must tremble in the face of your judgments, Lord, because your truth is neither mine, nor his, nor hers. Rather, it belongs to everyone whom you call to share it in communion with you. Likewise, you give us the terrible warning not to take truth as personal property, for fear we will find ourselves deprived of it.” (*Confessions XII*, 25, 34)

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making reflection processes learned through a Signature Augustinian Pedagogy can make are the awareness of processes of self-knowledge and knowledge of others can add to successful professional thinking and

decision-making, especially when expanded with humility as the crucial step in the search for truth and that professional thinking and decision-making are communal acts.

The second benefit that can come from the discussions within and across Communities of Practice is engagement in Reflective Practice related to the concept of Donald Schon's "Reflective Practitioner"³⁸ Communities of Practice of a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy can be ground for Reflective Practice. In the dialogues of such communities, they would be following Schon's notion of converting "*knowing-in action* to *knowledge-in-action*."³⁹ In reflective practice conversations, "the practitioner's effort to solve the reframe problem yields new discoveries which call for new reflection-in-action. The process spirals through stages of appreciation, action, and reappreciation."⁴⁰ Further, this would lead to a practitioner's deeper understanding of their role as professional thinkers and decision-makers.

Key Principle of a Signature Ignatian Pedagogy: Action - Nowacek and Mountin extend in this Key Principle their earlier discussion of Action to focus on "knowledge-in-action,"⁴¹ but do not reference Schon's work on Reflective Practice specifically. Earlier they identify the professional goal to which knowledge-in-action would be connected. They note, In the case of Ignatian Pedagogy, the 'professional' goal across every discipline and department, is to link the cultivation of intellectual accomplishment and scholarly expertise to the moral and spiritual dimension. We are in the oft-quoted words of Father Pedro Arrupe forming 'men [and women] for [and with] others' (Arrupe (1973)⁴² – a goal that does not stray far from Shulman's initial formulation⁴³ [of the concept of Signature Pedagogy].

The parenthetical phrases [and women] as well as [and with] are additions of Nowacek and Mountin. Since their presentation about a Signature Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy in institutions serving women as well as men, it is appropriate to add [and women] to the thought of Arrupe which was addressed to the Jesuits who are a religious Congregation of men.

I see their addition of "[and with]" being more appropriate to a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy. Since the "With/For" thoughts identify the direction of our working with others, I also see in "with" a Distinctive Augustinian Leadership Characteristic different from the Jesuit characteristic of "Men [and Women] for Others." Augustine describes himself as a leader with others making a comparison of "with" and "for" when he comments on his leadership as bishop,

My place as your head frightens me, but what I share with you comforts me. I am a bishop set over you, but together with you I am a Christian. The first is the title of the office I have assumed, the second is a grace; the first is a danger, the second is salvation. The office seems like a storm tossing us about in a raging sea. But when we remember who redeemed us by His blood, it seems we enter the safety of a harbor in the stillness of that thought. Even though this office is personally hard work, the common benefit gives me rest.” (*Sermon 340*, 1)

Similar thinking can be found in *Sermon 23*, 1. A Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy embodies a “with” direction in its education on Augustinian Pedagogical Values like Communion, Community, Friendship, Solidarity, and Love. I see that Love in an Augustinian Signature Pedagogy can be termed as a Preferential Option for Least and Lost. This can be seen in additions that Augustine made to the words of Jesus, “For I was hungry, and you gave me to eat . . .” (Matthew 25:35-46) with a series of thoughts including. “When the least of mine learn, I learn.” (*Sermon 21 on Gospel of John*, 7,2). In an Augustinian context, there is a need to see and practice love to accomplish authenticity.

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making that direction of Action in a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy is having a “with” orientation in leadership, professional thinking, and decision-making. Such an orientation leads to asking questions about community participation like, “Who is the least in this situation?” Also, it leads to asking questions about “Who is left out?” Finding the answers in a “with” approach in reflective practice demands the inclusion of the least and the left out for full participation, full Communion, full Community, full Friendship, full Solidarity, and full Love.

Key Principle of a Signature Ignatian Pedagogy: Evaluation - A further aspect of the discussions within and across Communities of Practice of engagement in Reflective Practice can be found in Nowacek and Mountin’s Key Principle of Evaluation as “a type of Metareflection.”⁴⁴ In another place, I have presented a metareflection/approach to metacognition as an Augustinian Reflection Circle (L.O.R.D. Approach).⁴⁵ The L.O.R.D. Process stands for **L**isten, **O**rganize/Re**O**rganize, **R**efine for sharing, and **D**ialogue with Others. This is derived from the reflective/metareflective thinking that can be found in Augustine of Hippo’s writings, *Soliloquies, Reconsiderations/Retractationes, Confessions, and Dialogues/Sermons/Letters*. In *Dialogues/Sermons/Letters* Augustine had writing structures available for him to use to convey

his thoughts. But in his *Soliloquies, Reconsiderations/ Retractationes, Confessions*, a case can be made that he created metareflective genres of writing to convey his thoughts. By conveying Augustine's thinking via the values of a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy learners would be educated in varieties of metareflective practices that they can utilize as reflective practitioners.

About his metareflective thinking in the *Soliloquies*, a word Augustine created, he shared, "I also wrote two volumes in keeping with my zeal for and love for searching out the truth, through reason, in regard to matters that I especially desired to know. I questioned myself and responded to myself as though we were two persons, reason and I, despite the fact that I was alone, and that is why I entitled this work *Soliloquies*." (*Reconsiderations*⁴⁶ (*Retractationes*) I, 4, 2) This style of thinking in the *Soliloquies* is the source for **L**isten in the L.O.R.D. Process

Concerning his metareflective thinking in the *Retractationes (Reconsiderations)*, Augustine also wrote, "My task is to reconsider my works from an uncompromisingly critical perspective, whether they be books or letters or sermons, and in these pages to single out for censure what I disapprove of." (*Reconsiderations (Retractationes)* Prologue, 1) He added to this "Those who are going to read these works should not imitate me in my errors but in my progress toward the better. For whoever reads my works in the order in which they were written will perhaps discover how I made progress over the course of my writing. So that he may do so, I shall make the best possible effort to see that he is exposed to that same order."

(*Reconsiderations (Retractationes)* Prologue, 3) This style of thinking in the *Retractationes (Reconsiderations)* is the source for **O**rganize/Re**O**rganize in the L.O.R.D. Process,

About his metareflective thinking in the *Confessions*, Augustine wrote,

The thirteen books of my *Confessions* praise the just and good God for both the bad and the good that I did, and they draw a person's mind and emotions toward him. As for myself, that is how they affected me when they were being written, and that is how they affect me when they are being read. What others may think about them is up to them, but I know that they have pleased and do please many of the brothers a great deal. (*Reconsiderations (Retractationes)* II, 6, 33, 1)

This style of thinking in the *Confessions* is the source for **R**efine for Sharing in the L.O.R.D. Process,

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making that seeing Evaluation as a type of Metareflection in a Cross-Cultural Signature Augustinian Pedagogy can be attention to a thorough review of what has gone on in our professional thinking and decision-making as well as the aspects of the development of situations and including corrections for errors as we think further and make additional decisions as well as prepare for engaging well in the Dialogue with others aspect of the L.O.R.D. Process,

Scaffolding - From Evaluation as a type of Metareflection we can see the importance of instructors' attention to the "scaffolding a process of reflection"⁴⁷ that Nowacek and Mountin identify in their Conclusion. Scaffolding is important to Augustine as he notes, "Use knowledge as a kind of scaffolding to help build the structure of love and understanding, which will last forever even after knowledge destroys itself. Knowledge is useful when it is used to promote love. But it becomes useless, even harmful in itself, if separated from such an end." (*Letter 55*, 33) In this, Augustine reminds us that scaffolding is not just about the delivery of instruction. He calls us to look for something more lasting than the immediacy of instruction. Also, Augustine does not limit himself to scaffolding but even adds the image of "ladder" to a developmental approach to reflection and learning. As he comments, "To reach a high spot you need a ladder. To get to the height of greatness, use the ladder of humility." (*Sermon 96*, 3) In adding humility to the notion of progress he reminds us of the need to correct errors and learn from our mistakes. The circle aspect of the Augustinian Reflection Circle - L.O.R.D. Process is another developmental image, but this Process can also be seen as scaffolding and a ladder.

The contribution to professional thinking and decision-making that scaffolding and other images like ladders can provide is a sensitivity to the developmental aspects of our work and to plan to include them in our designing, monitoring, and evaluating of our professional thinking and decision-making.

Given the valuable contributions that a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy can provide, it is certainly important to create Communities of Practice through practitioner discussions within and across Cultural Communities of Augustinian Pedagogical Values. While having these dialogues across Communities of Values and Communities of Practice with differing time zones may seem a problem, it is an opportunity to engage in fostering in practitioners of Augustinian Pedagogy what Insunza identifies as a category of Augustinian Thought - Communion

Concluding Note

As a North American, I have been steeped in the North American Cultural Community of Augustinian Pedagogical Values and their related Communities of Practice. Yet, I have also been blessed to have had several cross-cultural experiences of Augustinian Pedagogical Communities of Values and Communities of Practice. From my particular vantage point, I see in the Conference, “Journées Augustiniennes de Carthage 2021/Augustinian Days in Carthage 2021 - Value-Driven, Practice-Oriented Education: Contemporary Examples Informed by Saint Augustine of Hippo,” a sign of hope in it being part of the return to Africa, in ever-larger ways, of Augustine of Hippo’s educational legacy. Dialogues in Communities of Values in different African cultures hearing/perceiving, in their study of Augustine will serve to enrich each other in creating Cultural Communities of Augustinian Pedagogical Values rooted in African experiences. These Values dialogues in Africa will also provide deeper understandings for the other cultural groups who have already identified Augustinian Values and thus provide more food for their reflection. This African expansion can also expand the Communities of Practice of Augustinian Pedagogy resulting in further dimensions of practice, increased numbers of reflective practitioners of Augustinian Pedagogy, and deeper possibilities for the further development of a Cross-Disciplinary Signature Augustinian Pedagogy.

¹ The essence of this text was presented at Journées Augustiniennes de Carthage 2021/Augustinian Days in Carthage 2021 - Value-Driven, Practice-Oriented Education: Contemporary Examples Informed by Saint Augustine of Hippo - 11-13 November 2021, Carthage, Tunisia.

² McCloskey, Gary N. Considerations and practices in Augustinian Pedagogy. In *Basic elements of Augustinian pedagogy*, E. Berdon (coor) Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, 2006, p.119. <https://augustinianpedagogy.org/mccloskey-documents> (Retrieved on October 14, 2021, at 1 pm)

³ Eze, Kenneth, O.S.A. The Role of Augustinian Educational Values as Elements of Social Transformation in the Church’s Mission of Evangelization in Africa, 2020. <https://augustinianpedagogy.org/various-authors> (Retrieved on October 14, 2021, at 3 pm), p.3.

⁴ Insunza, Santiago M., O.S.A. “Augustinian Spirituality in the Life of the Laity,” in *Our Journey Back to God: Reflections on Augustinian Spirituality*, ed. Miguel Angel Keller, O.S.A. Rome: Pubblicazione Agostiniane, 2006, p. 405.

⁵ Augustinian Secondary Education Association. The Augustinian Core Values, *Augustinian Secondary Education Association Handbook* (November 2012), pp. 16-17.

⁶ Eguarte, Fray Enrique B., O.A.R. *Augustinian Values and Pedagogy*. Quezon City, Philippines: Recoletos Educational Apostolate in the Philippines. 2017, pp. 53-103.

⁷ Insunza, Santiago M., O.S.A. El Ideario O «Carácter Propio» de Un Colegio Agustiniiano, *Testigos en La Escuela: Programa de Formación Para Educadores Agustiniianos*, 8. Madrid, Spain: Federación Agustiniiana Española, n.d.

⁸ Ferreira, Arthur Vianna. *Donde hay unidad, hay comunidad: la educación agustiniana en América Latina*. São Paulo, Brazil: Pimenta Cultural, 2020, pp.24-28.

-
- ⁹ Esmeralda, Alberto L., O.S.A. Ten Augustinian Values. *Colegio San Agustin-Bacolod Research Journal*, IV (1), 2002, pp. 45-82.
- ¹⁰ Saint Augustine College, Malta, About Us, <https://staugustine.edu.mt/who-we-are/st-augustine-college/> (Retrieved on October 14, 2021, at 4 pm)
- ¹¹ When writing about religious involvement in educating Native Americans in the United States I framed it as Opposed Colonial Models in Provenzo, E.F., Jr. & McCloskey, G.N. Catholic and Federal Indian Education in the Late 19th Century: Opposed Colonial Models. *Journal of American Indian Education*, 21 (1) November 1981, pp. 10-18. I described teacher understanding of legislatively imposed school reform with thoughts on Metaphors and Meaning in Provenzo, E.F., Jr., McCloskey, G.N., O.S.A., Kottkamp, R.B., Cohn, M.M. (1989) Metaphor and Meaning in the Language of Teachers. *Teachers College Record*, 90 (4), 1989, pp. 551-573. To understand society's conceptualization of schooling, I have used the conceptualization of Ethoses in Conflict in Provenzo, E.F. Jr. and McCloskey, G.N., O.S.A. (1996) *Schoolteachers and schooling: Ethoses in conflict*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing. Since these values are presented, mostly, as something applied in schools more generally than school level climate, they are of a larger scope than the conceptualizations in Michael D. Morahan, O.S.A.'s "Climate in the Augustinian School." (Morahan, Michael D., O.S.A. (2006) Climate in the Augustinian School. In *Basic elements of Augustinian pedagogy*, E. Berdon (coor) Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane (pp.170-182).)
- ¹² Saint Augustine, *Confessions*, trans, Benignus O'Rourke, O.S.A. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 2013. All other citations of Saint Augustine are from *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century*. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, unless otherwise noted. The New City Press translations with permission of the Augustinian Heritage Institute, Villanova, PA, the holder of the copyright.
- ¹³ Stevenson, Herb. Awareness and Emergence: A Gestalt Approach to Global Diversity and Inclusion *Gestalt Review*, 20(2), 2016, pp.162-187.
- ¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 166.
- ¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 165.
- ¹⁶ Eisner, Elliot W. *The Educational Imagination: On the Design and Evaluation of School Programs*, 3rd Edition. New York: Macmillan College Publishing, 1994, p.215.
- ¹⁷ Insunza, Santiago M., O.S.A. "Augustinian Spirituality in the Life of the Laity," *Op. Cit.*
- ¹⁸ For evaluation of Montessori programs, see, for example, Marshall, Chloe. Review Article: Montessori education: a review of the evidence base. *Science of Learning* (2017) 2:11, pp.1-9. For evaluation of Piagetian programs, see, for example, Mangan, James. Piaget's Theory and Cultural Differences: The Case for Value-Based Modes of Cognition. *Human Development*, 21 (3) (1978), pp. 170-189.
- ¹⁹ Dodaro, Robert, O.S.A. Language Matters: Augustine's Use of Literary Decorum in Theological Argument. *Augustinian Studies* 45:1 (2014) 1-28.
- ²⁰ Immerwahr, John. Teaching in the Inspiration of St. Augustine: Seven Augustinian Principles, 2008. <https://www1.villanova.edu/villanova/mission/campusministry/RegularSpiritualPractices/resources/spirituality/educatorresources.html> (Retrieved on October 14, 2021, at 2 pm)
- ²¹ "Developing a cheerful attitude" is Canning's translation of Augustine's expression *de hilaritate comparanda* in *De catechizandis rudibus*. See R. Canning. "Introduction" in *Instructing Beginners in Faith*. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2006, p. 16.
- ²² Zagarella, Joseph. Review of *Lay Faculty's Understanding and Operationalization of Augustinian Core Values in Secondary Education*. Ed.D. Dissertation, Seton Hall University. 2021.
- ²³ Shulman, Lee. Signature Pedagogies in the Professions. *Daedalus*, 134, 2005, p. 52.
- ²⁴ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M. Reflection in Action: A Signature Ignatian Pedagogy for the 21st Century in Chick, Nancy L., Haynie, Aeron, and Gurung, Regan A.R. (eds.) *Exploring More Signature Pedagogies: Approaches to Teaching Disciplinary Habits of Mind*. Sterling, VA: Stylus, 2012, p. 129. This volume is a follow-up to Gurung, Regan A.R., Chick, Nancy L., and Haynie, Aeron, *Exploring Signature Pedagogies: Approaches to Teaching Disciplinary Habits of Mind*. Sterling, VA: Stylus, 2009.
- ²⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 131.
- ²⁶ *Ibid.*, pp.132-135.
- ²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 135.
- ²⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 136.

-
- ²⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 136-137.
- ³⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 136-137.
- ³¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 138-139.
- ³² *Ibid.*, p. 140.
- ³³ Hadot, Pierre. *Philosophy As a Way of Life*, trans. Michael Chase. Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishing, 1995, p. 84.
- ³⁴ George Tavard, *Les jardins de Saint Augustin: Lectures des Confessions*. Montréal: Editions Bellarmin, 1988 and Lawless, George Rev., "Augustine's Journey and Signposts Along the Way" (1996). *International Institute for Clergy Formation*. 501 (Audio) <https://scholarship.shu.edu/summer-institute/index.8.html>. Downloaded January 17, 2021, at 3 pm EST.
- ³⁵ Lawless, George Rev., *Ibid.*
- ³⁶ Augustine, Saint. *Rule of Saint Augustine*. Villanova, PA: Brothers of the Order of Hermits of Saint Augustine, 1976. This translation by Robert Russell, O.S.A., is based on the critical text of Luc Verheijen, O.S.A., (*La regle de saint Augustin, Etudes Augustiniennes*, Paris, 1967). Two sentences not contained in the critical text have been included to conform with the official text published with the *Constitutiones Ordinis Fratrum S. Augustini* (Rome 1968).
- ³⁷ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M., *Op. Cit.*, p. 135.
- ³⁸ Schon, Donald A. *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action*. New York: Basic Books, 1983. With the date of 1983, the concept of "Reflective Practitioner" could seem outdated. However, it has taken hold and continues in recent publications like Hall, Pete and Simeral, Alisa A. *Creating a Culture of Reflective Practice: Building Capacity of Schoolwide Success*. Alexandria, Virginia: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2017, Sellars, Maura. *Reflective Practice for Teachers*, 2nd Edition. London: Sage Publications, 2017, and Bassot, Barbara. *The Reflective Practice Guide: An Interdisciplinary Approach to Critical Reflection*. London: Routledge, 2015
- ³⁹ Schon, *op.cit.*, p.59.
- ⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 132
- ⁴¹ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M., *Op. Cit.*, p. 137.
- ⁴² Arrupe, P., S.J. (1973) "Men and Women For Others" presented at the Tenth International Congress of Jesuit Alumni of Europe in Valencia, Spain, on July 31. <https://onlineministries.creighton.edu/CollaborativeMinistry/men-for-others.html>. Retrieved October 2, 2020, at 3 pm EDT.
- ⁴³ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M., *Op. Cit.*, p. 131.
- ⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 138.
- ⁴⁵ McCloskey, Gary N., O.S.A. *Augustinian Learning in a Technological World: Social and Emotional Applications*. Presented at *Journées Augustiniennes de Carthage 2020/Augustinian Days in Carthage 2020: Relevance of the Pedagogical Theory of Saint Augustine to the 21st Century*, 12-14 November 2020, Carthage, Tunisia /Zoom Meeting, p.7.
- ⁴⁶ While this translation is from *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century* of New City Press volume entitled *Revisions*, I am using the title, *Reconsiderations*, that comes from Henry Chadwick. (2009) *Augustine of Hippo: A Life*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, p. 167. It also reflects the verb "reconsider" in this quotation about the purpose of the text.
- ⁴⁷ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M., *Op. Cit.*, p. 140.