Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy[1]:
Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions

By Gary N. McCloskey, O.S.A.

ABSTRACT:

This essay asks: How Do We Understand Augustinian Pedagogy? This question prepares the reader for the case for an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy for Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions. Based on previous work demonstrating Augustinian Pedagogy as a Signature Pedagogy and recognizing some of the limitations of Augustinian Values as an undergirding for Augustinian Pedagogy, Reflection and Mutual (Common) Benefit are used as a basis for practicing this Characteristic Pedagogy. These factors flow from Insunza's observation that Interiority (Reflection) and Communion (Mutual (Common) Benefit) are the 2 categories of Augustinian thought. Elements (Contact Aspects) of Reflection and Mutual (Common) Benefit are presented to see how they can shape the practices of Augustinian Pedagogy. Finally, these categories are shown as providing the basic frameworks for assessing the effectiveness of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy (in Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions) in a class, in a department, in an institution, among institutions, and over a lifetime.

KEYWORDS:
Augustinian Pedagogy, Characteristic Pedagogy, Interiority (Reflection),Communion (Mutual (Common) Benefit), Communities of Practice, and Assessment

SHORT BIOGRAPHY:
Rev. Gary N. McCloskey, O.S.A. is a researcher/educator focusing on both the Pedagogy of Saint Augustine of Hippo and the practice of Instructional Technology. He has been a teacher and administrator in higher education as well as a teacher on middle and secondary levels in

various locations in the Eastern U.S.A. In addition to publications, he has provided professional development for teachers and shared research findings on 6 of the 7 continents.

To write an essay entitled *Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy: Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions* it would seem right to begin aiming for some clarity about the concept, Augustinian[2] Pedagogy, which underlies it. So, we will begin with the question: How do we understand Augustinian Pedagogy? This will lead to how such a pedagogy can be seen as Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions. Such preparation will be part of a discussion of Signature Pedagogy. Given the values-related reality of Augustinian Schools, Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy will be chosen in place of the Signature Pedagogy, a term understood by fewer practitioners. While Values easily relate to Characteristics, the Cultural Gestalt/Awareness reality of different numbers of values internationally will be shown as a limiting factor. Insunza's observation that Interiority and Communion are the 2 categories of Augustinian thought will be connected to the practice of Augustinian Pedagogy through Reflection (Interiority) and Mutual (Common) Benefit (Communion). Mutual (Common) Benefit will be our starting point. Finally, this essay will show how Communities of Practice of Mutual (Common) Benefit (Communion) and Reflection (Interiority) can be utilized to create frameworks for assessing the effectiveness of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy (in Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions) in a class, in a department, in an institution, among institutions, and over a lifetime.

How Do We Understand Augustinian Pedagogy?

In the almost 25 years that I have been researching, writing, and presenting about Augustinian Pedagogy, I have been clear that there is no specific text on pedagogy (way of approaching teaching and learning) emanating from Saint Augustine of Hippo. This is different from the work of Maria Montessori[3], or Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy coming from Saint Ignatius

Loyola as in his *Spiritual Exercises*[4] which provides guidance for teaching and learning spiritual truths. Applications of the thought of Saint Ignatius to school and other settings can be found in the Jesuits' *Ratio Studiorum*[5], as well as in the thought of Pedro Arrupe, S.J.,[6] a Superior General of the Jesuits in the 20th Century. about being men and women for others.

The lack of a specific directional text does not leave us empty. Having more than 5 million words from Saint Augustine and with researchers finding more writings of Saint Augustine deep in libraries in recent years gives us much to study. Through content analyses[7] these texts can be studied to find patterns and insights that Saint Augustine used in teaching and learning. In his early *Dialogues* we can find not only what he taught but how he taught it. We find here, especially, how he modeled leading and guiding teaching and learning through Socratic method-like dialoguing. Likewise. we can find the shape of elements of his pedagogy in *Instructing Beginners in the Faith* (*De Catechizandis Rudibus*) when he is counseling the Carthaginian Deacon Deogratias to listen to the needs of those he is preaching to in order to craft what he will teach from the pulpit of his "pastoral" classroom and in what ways he can move the hearer who is "not moved." (*Instructing Beginners in the Faith* 13, 18) From this work we can also infer that the importance of "cheerfulness"[8] in preaching also applies to teaching. From *Teaching Christianity* (*De Doctrina Christiana*) and the importance it gives to interpreting Scripture in ways that result in the double love of God and love of neighbor (*Teaching Chrisianity.*, I. 35.39 - 36.40), we can see the implications of this double love for the direction of teaching and learning in Augustinian Pedagogy.

I recently read *Failure* by Emma Ineson, a Bishop of the Church of England and linguist. When she reflects on the grammar of the concept "church,"[9] she observes, "We tend to think most often of 'church' as a noun – an 'object' word."[10] Ineson then suggests we think in different

ways when she asks, "How about 'church' as a verb – a 'doing' word?[11] I think these observations can help to lead us to think of "Augustinian Pedagogy" as a verbal phrase rather than a noun phrase. Doing this can allow us to focus on the how/doing rather than the what/object of the Augustinian Pedagogy thoughts we find in our analyses of Saint Augustine. Even without texts like those of Montessori and Ignatian Pedagogy we can still focus on how we see pedagogical ideas at work shaping the writings and ministry of Saint Augustine. We should have this verbal focus so that, rather than seeking an object or commodity, we are looking at relationships, specifically reciprocity within the relationships in which Saint Augustine was engaged. To guard against poor interpretation, our content analyses and other forms of study should be done in Communities of Research and Communities of Practice, where our sharing with others can aid us to see well by having the humility to receive mutual correction for better thinking. As we go forward in this essay, let us move together seeking a how/doing sense of Saint Augustine's work rather than working from a what/object set of written down principles.

In my Augustinian Pedagogy work I have been blessed with a Community of Research colleagues. Scholars of Saint Augustine have given me feedback in our dialogues so that my own experience/expertise in pedagogy and curriculum has been kept in check to be sure that what I think I am finding is really within Saint Augustine's writings and not my reading of personal experience/expertise into his thought. In biblical study good scholars and preachers seek exegesis not eisegesis. In an Augustinian Pedagogy Community of Research similar good understanding should be sought.

Preparing Learners for Good Work With Others in All Professions

When I first came across Shulman's identification of "Signature Pedagogy"[12] I wondered if Augustinian Pedagogy could be termed such a pedagogy that fosters "the types of teaching that

organize the fundamental ways in which future practitioners are educated for their new professions."[13] But I was stymied by Shulman's notion that such pedagogies were specific disciplinary-based approaches aimed at preparing practitioners for a specific discipline. Augustinian Pedagogy, not being a specific discipline, goes across disciplines. So, it seemed that the "signature pedagogy" nomenclature would not fit it. However, that was true for me until I read how Nowacek and Mountin made the case that Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy[14] "is meant to prepare students for good work in all professions."[15] This thought about "all professions" led me to think again about using "signature pedagogy" to describe Augustinian Pedagogy since it also can intend "to prepare students for good work in all professions." I previously wrote about Augustinian Pedagogy working as a Signature Pedagogy in ways akin to Nowacek and Mountin's case that Ignatian (Jesuit) Pedagogy works as a Signature Pedagogy that aims to prepare students for good work in all professions. The word "professions" may make you think of medical doctor, lawyer, nurse, business person, etc. But, in Signature Pedagogy it means historian, philosopher, and all liberal arts areas as well.

Preparation for good work in all professions is important because as Pope Francis told university students at World Youth Day 2023, "A university would have little use if it were simply to train the next generation to perpetuate the present global system of elitism and inequality, in which higher education is the privilege of a happy few. Unless knowledge is embraced as a responsibility, it bears little fruit."[16] He sees such responsibility as ending in good work when he goes on to say,

> This old man now speaking to you – for I am an old man! – also dreams that yours will
>
> become a generation of teachers! Teachers of humanity. Teachers of compassion.
>
> Teachers of new opportunities for our planet and its inhabitants. Teachers of hope. And

teachers who defend the life of our planet, which today is threatened with severe

ecological damage.[17]

Such insight about education carrying responsibility applies to any educational program, not just those at the university-level. Thus, all education can be seen as carrying responsibility for good work in all professions far and wide.

<center>Augustinian Pedagogy as a Characteristic Pedagogy</center>

Pope Francis' comments can clearly apply to Augustinian Pedagogy with his initial framing of this World Youth Day Address in terms of education as "a spiritual journey" addressing an "inner thirst, restlessness."[18] These concepts of journey and restlessness are core to Saint Augustine's thoughts and message. While Augustinian Pedagogy can be a "signature pedagogy," but when it is understood by the term "characteristic" it can overcome the limits of the term "signature." Using Signature Pedagogy as a terminology has 2 drawbacks. First, this term is one that has meaning mostly to pedagogy specialists. So, it can be esoteric rather than explanatory as a term for non-specialists. Second, the term "signature" can have a branding, marketing, or commodity flavor rather than a values flavor. This can be confusing to users of Augustinian Pedagogy in settings that are value-based, rather than market-based. Arguably, Characteristic Pedagogy may be a better term for value-based practitioners and institutions of Augustinian Pedagogy, since it would go beyond "in the know" specialists and look beyond branding, marketing, or commodity connotations, Characteristic Pedagogy can lead institutions with Augustinian values to broader understanding and usage by practitioners of Augustinian Pedagogy. Assessing our effectiveness in implementing Augustinian Pedagogy in this characteristic way can lead us to understand the effectiveness of an institution with an Augustinian character and mission.

Role of Augustinian Values as Characteristics

In an earlier presentation I made the case of the limitation of using Augustinian Values in implementing and Augustinian Signature Pedagogy.[19] Even though Augustinian Values across the world are very similar and evidence the same qualities, the fact is that various listings of values range from 3 to 13. Such variation among value terms can hamper using any particular listing of values as the underpinning of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy. In that previous essay I assessed the differences as cultural and that each listing represented a "Cultural Gestalt/ Awareness."[20] This difference derives from the number of values that people in a culture need to see what is going on pedagogically in Saint Augustine. Some cultures need a few core values, while others seem to need a large group of values to surround the whole of his ideas. Numbers of values as something culturally related may not be the fruitful way forward in identifying how Augustinian Pedagogy can serve widely in Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions. While the varieties of Communities of Values may not bear the fruit we would like, we are not without ways to go forward.

Communities of Practice and Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy

Santiago Insunza has identified Interiority and Communion as "the principal categories of Augustinian thought."[21] Cabrera has also seen these categories as related to Augustinian Pedagogy.[22] He adds poverty and "ecclesiality" as they connect to particularly religious educational aspects. It may be more fruitful using these categories of Interiority and Communion as structures for assessing how well Augustinian Pedagogy prepares learners for good work "with others" in all professions. The term Reflection, which is in line with the Interiority described by Saint Augustine in *Homily 17 on the Gospel of John*, 8, will be utilized as a less-religiously specific description of Interiority so that it can be more easily seen as applicable

across the curriculum. Likewise Mutual (Common) Benefit, which is in line with the Communion described by Saint Augustine in *Sermon 340,* 1, will be utilized as a less-religiously specific description of Communion for easier application across the curriculum. We shall see each of these categories as families having varied aspects which can animate practice so that learners can incorporate the categories in various ways into their own lived practices. Communities of Practice should help those using an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy to keep centered on their task, rather than being distracted by other attractive pedagogies.

Because of the importance of "with others" for Augustinian Pedagogy, we will begin with Mutual (Common) Benefit as Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions. Saint Augustine's scriptural understanding finds God being with us. Samuel Wells in his extensive study of scripture tells us, "We've stumbled upon the most important word in the Bible – the word that describes the heart of God and the nature of God's purpose and destiny for us. And that word is with." As we shall see the crucial importance that serving "with others" has for Saint Augustine is that it provides the basis for serving "for others." We are to be people with others to serve for Mutual Benefit. Besides its crucial importance for Saint Augustine, serving "with others" also functions as a characteristic that distinguishes Augustinian Pedagogy from other pedagogies, such as Ignatian Pedagogy. Followers of Ignatian Spirituality have "for" as their starting point on the way to "with" and thus differ from followers of Augustinian Spirituality. Being People for Others[23] makes those following Ignatian Spirituality ready to become Men and Women For and With Others.[24] While Nowacek and Mountin[25] speak about "Preparing Learners for Good Work in All Professions," following the importance of "with others" for Saint Augustine has led me to see "Preparing Learners for Good Work 'With Others' in All Professions" as pertinent for Augustinian Pedagogy.

Mutual (Common) Benefit
as Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions

Mutual (Common) Benefit can be seen capturing Saint Augustine's category of Communion in pedagogical terms, particularly when considering his observation,

> I'm terrified by what I am for you, but I am given comfort by what I am with you. For you I am a bishop, with you, after all, I am a Christian**.** The first is the name of an office undertaken, the second a name of grace; that one means danger, this one salvation. Finally, as if in an open sea, I am being tossed about by the stormy activity involved in that one; but as I recall by whose blood I have been redeemed, I enter a safe harbor in the tranquil recollection of this one; and thus while toiling away at my proper office, I take my rest in the marvelous benefit conferred on us all in common.
>
> (*Sermon 340,* 1)

Here the primary focus is on serving "with others" so that our service "for others" is for the common (mutual) benefit. To be effective, the common (mutual) benefit must involve a reciprocal love which Dupont aptly terms Constructive Reciprocity and Fruitful Interaction.[26] While this phrasing can be a mouthful, service with such reciprocal and interactive love, at its heart, should be an essential part of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy "with others." This essential part takes Augustinian Pedagogy from superficial to deep levels of learning where learners come to see reciprocal and interactive love deepening the effectiveness of their learning. Van Bavel tells us that for Saint Augustine, "The essence of friendship is love, reciprocal love based on the sharing of the same commitment. This means common interests, common attractions, common occupations and a common sense of values, as well as common ideas and concerns."[27] This involves commitment through many commonalities. Such mutual commitment can enable learners to face stormy seas like those described in *Sermon 340* above. Saint

Augustine also talks about emotions that disturb the intellect when he says, "I state that there are four passions that disturb the soul - desire, joy, fear, and sadness." (*Confessions* X, 14, 22) Emotions disturbing the intellect is a stormy sea that we need to learn how to deal with and overcome through an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy.

Any learning, as Mutual (Common) Benefit through constructive reciprocity and fruitful interaction, may also be understood as Solidarity where we are in the process of developing an ever more and more radical mutuality. Inspired by Saint John Paul II's call for universities to produce "professionally well-trained young people" and "politically sensitive citizens,"[28] Kolvenbach reminded Jesuit educators that Solidarity as part of their work of Service "is learned through 'contact' rather than through 'concepts.'" [29]

Aspects of "contact" as processes for learning should also animate Mutual (Common) Benefit in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy for preparing learners for good work "with others" in all professions. As such, Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy should be animated *very evidently* by contact aspects of learning such as, All Participants Sharing the Truth, A Spirit of Togetherness/Personal Relationship, Invitations to Companionship[30]/Encounter, and Service through Immersion[31] to Avoid Volunteerism, Voluntourism, and the Savior Complex.[32]

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **All Participants Sharing the Truth***

Saint Augustine's understands that "Truth is the inheritance of all, and thus is not the personal property of anyone. What is in common belongs to everyone so that all who come to it may use it and be enlightened. It is equally distant and equally close to everyone." (*Exposition of Psalm 75(76)*, 17) He also believes, "This is why we must tremble before your judgments, O Lord, for your Truth is not mine, nor his, nor hers, but belongs to all of us whom you call to share it in communion with him, at the same time giving us the terrible warning not to arrogate

9

truth to ourselves as private property, lest we will find ourselves deprived of it." (*Confessions* XII, 25, 34.) This notion of Truth as property held commonly for mutual benefit is foreign to most of the world. Status, power, and private property are realities that learners face. An Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy needs to enable participants to become a community learning with one another, not just a group of people. Then learners can prepare to replicate this togetherness in ways that prepare them "with others" to approach the larger world.

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **A Spirit of Togetherness/Personal Relationship***

This spirit occurs when there is equality among those involved despite status differentials. Here there is Kinship rather than Kingship. Kinship is "not serving the other but being one with the other."[33] When we imagine it as a circle, this is a "circle of compassion" where "we imagine no one standing outside that circle, moving ourselves closer to the margins."[34] When we imagine it as a table, there is always room at the table. Kingship-style ways of being in contact with one another, sadly, is the exercising of power over others in differential ways. As Saint Augustine tells us we should

> Not rejoice in what is privately owned but what is common to all. That is what the first Christians did by making their private goods common ... If all things had remained private property each person would have owned only what belonged to him or her individually; but when each person turned over his personal things to common ownership, he came to own what had belonged to others as well ... We all breathe in the air that belongs to all of us, and we all enjoy the sunshine that is common to all.
> (*Exposition of Psalm 131(132)*, 5)

In a world filled with separation and the emphasis on differences, an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy must teach group work where kinship and equality are supreme, and learners can find

in commonality, togetherness and personal relationships of equality benefits lost in a world of private ownership. Here this pedagogy can give learners the confidence to overcome the fears of loss that society may attribute to sharing.

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **Invitations to Companionship/Encounter***

Companionship and encounter are crucial to an authentic relationship[35] with other people in community. As we have seen in *Sermon 340*, Saint Augustine saw companionship and encounter in the community as "comfort," "grace," and "salvation." This is encounter and not performance because "in performance we wear masks that hide our true selves and there is very little listening. In a true encounter with God or anybody else, the condition is one of freedom and trust."[36] Saint Augustine also chose to emphasize the common and shared dignity he and his followers had as members of Christ - the Whole Christ (*Totus Christus*). In his words, you "should love the community and the society of which scripture said: 'They were of one soul and one heart for God' (Acts 4:32). For in that way your soul belongs not just to you but to all the brothers [and sisters], whose souls are also yours, or rather whose souls are not souls along with yours but are one soul, that single soul of Christ." (*Letter 243*) The companionship/encounter he imagined led Saint Augustine to say, "Let us congratulate ourselves then and give thanks for having been made not only Christians but Christ." (*Homily 21 on the Gospel of John*, 8) In another place he made a similar observation, "If you ask what they are in themselves, they are Adam; ask what they are in the other, they are Christ." (*Homily 3 on the Gospel of John*, 12) He imagined people in communion leading to the deepest unity when he shared, "Your soul and mine are one...all those who are very dear and close to me - and you are for me among the first of them in the name of Christ." (*Letter 110*, 4 and 6) He called for others to follow Christ's model of companionship when he said, "By becoming your companion on the way, he himself became

11

for you the way." (*Sermon 236A* 4) In an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy, learners are not only supposed to encounter the companionship of others, but also be companions with others. Such mutual companionship should prepare learner for good work "with others" in all professions.

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **Service through Immersion**[37] **to Avoid Volunteerism, Voluntourism, and the Savior Complex**[38]*

True Service in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy only occurs when we are truly serving **with** others and recognizing that we are on pilgrimages (journeys) together which will transform us and the people we serve with. In this regard, Saint Augustine sees us as having differing home experiences, coming from different parts of cities/nations, and sharing the world but with different cultures and estranged from each other. (*City of God* XIX, 7) Because of estrangement we need to work our way toward others. As Saint Augustine noted, "After the city or town comes the world, philosophers posit as the third stage of human society. They start with the household, go from there to the city, and come finally to the world." (*City of God* XIX, 7) Even though we are at times estranged, we need to overcome this by immersing ourselves in service learning with as well as for each other. In any service opportunities, rather than imposing ourselves on others, we need to have the humility to immerse ourselves to avoid taking the privileged approaches involved in volunteerism, voluntourism, and the savior complex[39] Ignoring differences by imposing our power, language, and culture, like Saint Augustine saw that the Romans had done, will have a cost. As Saint Augustine said, "But at what a cost this [Roman imposition] was achieved: all those terrible wars, all that human slaughter, all that human bloodshed!" (*City of God,* XIX 7) Service in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy teaches learners from differing circumstances how to overcome estrangement as a preparation for good work "with others" in all professions.

In our Communities of Practice related to Mutual (Common) Benefit and engaging in the various points of contact aspects that flow from it, practitioners need to be attentive to the impact of the Role of the Teacher as an equal member of the learning community who needs to be attentive to co-learners. We can find thoughts about this when we read Saint Augustine's advice to the Carthaginian Deacon Deogratias about preaching in *Instructing Beginners in the Faith*. (1,1 -14, 22.) Also in Saint Augustine's thought, attention must be paid not to be confused about the role of the teacher. As he says, "Because there is generally no interval of time between the moment of speaking and that of knowing, and because their coming to learn within follows quickly upon the suggestive force of the speaker's words, they think they have learned from him who spoke those words." (*The Teacher*, 14, 45)[40] This learning from within is the Inner Teacher who Saint Augustine is famous for identifying. The Community of Practice should be guided to focus on their unity with one another with Saint Augustine's observation that "I don't speak as a school master or teacher, but as a servant or minister. I don't speak to pupils, but to fellow students, not to servants, but to fellow servants. There is but a single Teacher whose school is on earth and who teaches us from on high." (*Sermon* 292, 1, 1)

Not all work is done for Mutual (Common) Benefit of the style of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy where there is a radical commonality. To be able to ensure learning is such a style, attention must be paid to designing any work projects so that they are collaborative and cooperative. Learners need descriptions of elements or rubrics describing aspects and levels of attainment that they should be achieving through their work projects. Having these descriptions or rubrics beforehand can aid participants in doing their work projects appropriately as well as being able to make any judgment on success in achieving the desired aspects in completing their work projects. When further success needs to be developed participants can

know what they need to correct. Creators of designs for work projects in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy would do well to engage in Communities of Practice where they can receive and give advice to each other in developing authentic work projects for engaging learners to learn with others. In such exchanges, designers would be doing their own good work with others in this style of pedagogy.

Reflection (Interiority) for Preparing Learners for Good Work in All Professions

In his *Scholarship of Engagement*,[41] Ernest Boyer calls for a scholarship of application, as he observed, "By scholarship of application we mean having professors become what Donald Schon of MIT has called 'reflective practitioners' moving from theory to practice, and from practice back to theory, which in fact makes theory, then, more authentic."[42] In reflection within an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy there is not just a mulling over, but there is a moving beyond any theory or conceptualization in a search for deeper and deeper authenticity. Any practice should be guided by reflection so that it is a reflective practice.

The actions of learning "with others" at the same time as we share what we have learned "for others" is therefore not enough in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy. Reflection on our learning is the other essential part of this approach. As Saint Augustine tells us,

> Always be thinking, the whole time, that one must love God and neighbor – God with the whole heart, with the whole soul, and with the whole mind; and one's neighbor as oneself. Always think about them, reflect on them, observe them, practice them, fulfill them. In terms of precept, the love of God comes first; but in terms of practice, the love of neighbor comes first. (*Homily 17 on the Gospel of John*, 8)

As with Mutual (Common) Benefit, there are also aspects of "contact," processes for reflection (interiority), undergirding work in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy for

preparing learners for good work "with others" in all professions. As such, this pedagogy should be animated *very evidently* by contact aspects of learning such as, Seeking Truth, Self-criticism, Development, Harnessing the Power of Humility, and Mutual Support of One Another.

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **Seeking Truth***

In the face of facts, as Saint Augustine notes, "Whoever clearly sees that falsehood is thinking something is what it is not, knows that truth is that which declares what is." (*Of True Religion* 36, 66)[43] Among the facts in the sharing of truth with others, as noted above, truth is common property. To share truth, we must first seek the truth. This will include changing from the traditional notion of experts/authorities and non-experts/non-authorities where the experts/ authorities are the only valid voices. We need to have an Augustinian move from the Truth of Authority and Authority of Truth[44] where the voice comes from seeking truth before sharing it. For Saint Augustine, Faustus exemplified trying to be the Truth of Authority (possessor of truth within himself), while Saint Ambrose, speaking with the Authority of Truth, (sharer of the truth he had found) led Saint Augustine to important insights. After hearing from Saint Ambrose, Saint Augustine reflected on what he had heard, "Listen to the voice of truth in reflection and in silence so that you are able to understand it," (*Sermon* 52 19, 22) as well as "Let us listen to the truth from the one who is within, and then speak from the heart to those who are without." (*Exposition of Psalm 33(34)*) This may include listening to and reflecting on our own narratives, imaginations, and memories[45] as we seek the truth in preparation for sharing what we have found. In circumstances that privilege creativity, wondering should not be aimless and wandering. Rather, Augustinian-style learners should be "treasure hunters" seeking true rest in their restlessness. In an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy searching for truth, we should

"Seek in ways by which we can find and find in ways by which we can keep on seeking." (*The Trinity* IX, 1, 1) We should seek to do this in ever more authentic ways.

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **Self-criticism**[46]*

There are great inheritances we have from Saint Augustine that are necessary for an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy in preparing learners for good work "with others" in all professions. Among these inheritances we have his self-criticism and development in his *Reconsiderations* (*Revisions/Retractationes*) when he says, "Those who are going to read these works should not imitate me in my errors but in my progress towards the better. For whoever reads my works in the order in which they were written will perhaps discover how I have made progress over the course of my writing." (*Revisions*, Prologue) He also shares the need for self-criticism in *The Gift of Perseverance* where he writes,

> And yet, I would not want anyone to embrace all my views in order to be my follower,
> but only those points on which he sees that I am not mistaken. ... I have not always held
> the same views, rather, I think that, as I wrote, I made progress by the mercy of God, but
> not that I have started off with perfection. ... We can, of course, have good hope for
> someone if the last day of this life finds him making progress so that he receives in
> addition what was lacking to him as he made progress." (*The Gift of Perseverance*, 21,
> 55.)

In an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy such self-criticism should be shared in the safety of good dialogues with others. Saint Augustine's *Dialogues*, particularly his *Soliloquies*, model dialoguing for self-criticism in search of greater authenticity.

- *Contact Points Animated by the Aspect of **Development***

In an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy development aims toward the Transformation

of Souls,[47] i.e., it is metanoetic.[48] This should involve what Insunza has termed an "Augustinian Process of Personal Development"[49] which embraces

> Know Yourself - Let me know myself, let me know you. (*Soliloquies*, II, 1, 1)

> Accept Yourself - Accept your imperfection, it is the first step to perfection. (*Sermon 142*, 10)

> Surpass Yourself - Do not get stuck where you are, always forge ahead. (*Sermon 169*, 18)

In preparing learners for good work "with others" in all professions, practitioners of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy should heed Saint Augustine's challenges to "Know who you are and be yourself," (*Sermon 137*, 4, 4) and to "Recognize that you are a human being. The sum of humility for you consists in knowing yourself." (*Homily on the Gospel of John* 25, 16) True knowing of oneself is the basis for developing authenticity. Practitioners of Augustinian Pedagogy should utilize Socratic-style questioning like Saint Augustine used in his *Dialogues* and other places. In such maieutic approaches practitioners should serve as "midwives" facilitating development through reflection.

- *Contact Point Animated by the Aspect of **Harnessing the Power of Humility***

Humility having power may sound strange, but this recognizes that when humility grounds us in reality we have power. As Saint Augustine reminded us,

> The first step in the search for truth is humility. The second, humility. The third, humility. And the last one, humility. Naturally, that does not mean that humility is the only virtue necessary for discovering and enjoying truth. But if other virtues are not preceded, accompanied and followed by humility, pride will find an opening and infiltrate them and, sooner or later, finish up destroying good intentions. All other vices are recognized when we are doing wrong; but pride is to be feared even when we do right. Test those

things which are done in a praiseworthy manner lest they be spoiled by the desire for

praise itself. (*Letter 118*, 3, 22)

Saint Augustine in preaching used the image of dirty feet from the Gospel of John (*Homily 55 on the Gospel of John*) where through humility our feet are washed for good work.[50] This embodies the example of the humble God (*Kenosis*) of Philippians 2:7 (see Sermon *198*, 44 (*Dolbeau Sermon* 26)) This humility empowers us to participate with others in the unfolding drama of the lives of our co-learners who suffer injustice[51] as a co-suffering presence,[52] at times just sitting humbly in silence with others. An Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy teaches the power of humility for good work "with others" for all professions by utilizing reflection to enable learners to be positioned for what Runco calls "Insight Restructuring."[53]

- *Contact Point Animated by the Aspect of **Mutual Support of One Another***

Describing reflection, as Mutual Support of One Another, may seem strange because reflection is often seen as a solitary activity. Practitioners of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy should remember Saint Augustine's observation that,

> It is the task of Christians daily to make progress toward God, and always to rejoice in God or his gifts always. For the time of our pilgrimage, our wandering in exile, is extremely short, and in our home country time does not exist…. Here devotion is required of you, there you take your rest. For that reason, like good traders, let us note every day how we have got on, what profit we have made. You see, we have to be not only attentive at listening, but vigilantly active as well. This is a school in which God is the only teacher, and it demands good students, ones who are keen in attendance, not ones who are truant. (*Sermon 16A*, 1)

In the Communities of Practice in Augustinian Pedagogy we should be making this progress

together in mutual support of each other. Practitioners should support one another as well as the learners they serve by inviting, mentoring, and modelling reflection. As Saint Augustine noted, "Imitation seems to me to be so much a part of the [liberal] arts, that if it is removed, nearly all of them are destroyed. For masters exhibit themselves to be imitated, and that is what is called teaching." *(On Music 1,6)*[54]

After some service with others and for others for the Mutual (Common) Benefit and his related interior Reflection, Saint Augustine noted,

It is not the images of that reality that I harbor, but the realities themselves; for everything that I know about literature, or skill in debate, or how many questions can be formulated … images of them are captured with astonishing speed, put away in wonderful compartments. And brought out again in a wonderful way when we recall them. (*Confessions* X., 9, 16.)

Hopefully, Augustinian Pedagogy can function as an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy preparing learners for good work "with others" in all professions so that the values and practices of Mutual (Common) Benefit (communion) and Reflection (interiority) may become evident over and over in the lives of those who experience it.

Assessing Effectiveness in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy

Assessment is something that is not spoken of enough related to Augustinian Pedagogy. In Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy used in circumstances where Augustinian values are involved there should be a need for assessing if its use is effective. This would assess the realities Saint Augustine speaks about above to see that there are more than just nice images, and assure that the desired pedagogy is really happening, and that desired thresholds are being reached. Assessment should be identifying if the Mutual (Common) Benefit and Reflection Activities are

helping in the achievement of Mission, particularly around the Augustinian Values that are part of the specific Mission. Likewise, it should identify that an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy aids those involved to achieve understanding and make meaning with one another. Assessment should seek to ensure that this pedagogy would lead, as Galende Fincias points out, to an Augustinian Education of Formation,[55] not just training.

- *Assessment for Mutual (Common) Benefit (Communion)*

Given the qualitative aspects of the categories and related contact aspects in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy of Mutual (Common) Benefit it would be wise to rely on the Communities of Practice to ensure qualitative aspects are attended to. Rubrics developed with the aid and advice of Rubric Juries can enable a practitioner to develop things, that can be used in site specific situations, to assess the Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy aspects of work projects and activities. These juries would assist in working toward content validity in these endeavors. As Diez del Rio reminds us, part of the content validity should be making sure that there has been Pedagogy of Heart,[56] as well as pedagogy of the mind. An Augustinian Pedagogy of the Heart can be fostered by the Climate of the school having a foundation of Restorative Practices[57] that Morahan describes as encouraging relationships through an Augustinian Pedagogy. Also, these juries can help in ensuring that the situations a practitioner imagines go beyond imagination into reality. This Communities of Practice work should help practitioners by communicating practices in authentic situations. Such communication would be important in the effort to Prepare Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions in the situations like those they will face. Thus, authentic situations should enhance the possibility of transferring the skills, attitudes and values learned into new realities of work with others.

Surely, not all reflection is in the style of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy. To be able to have reflection in such a style, attention must be paid to the design of any reflection activities. Learners would need listings of elements or rubrics describing aspects and levels of attainment that can be developed. As noted above, having these beforehand can aid participants in their reflections as well as their being able to make any judgment on success in achieving the desired reflection. To be truly Augustinian, the desired reflection should be educating as Insunza Seco reminds us, for interiority and love.[58] When further success needs to be developed, lists and rubrics can help participants to know what they need to correct. Such practices should not only involve reflection, but should also, as I have pointed out in another place, include attention to the transformation[59] that an Augustinian Pedagogy should foster, to be true to its inspiration. Creators of designs for reflection activities in an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy would do well to engage in Communities of Practice where they can receive and give advice is developing authentic reflection activities, that can lead learners to greater authenticity through their reflective practice. In their participation in Communities of Practice, practitioners should experience mutual (common) benefits.

Utilizing the understanding of the categories and contact aspects of Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy, gained through rubrics, can aid learners in implementing the co-learner aspect of all of us engaged in an Augustinian style learning to gain agency and empowerment. Using rubrics, etc. will assist learners to grow into being able to engage in self-assessment of their own work, particularly assessment of an individual's contribution to group work. This even raises the possibility of arriving at true agency where teachers give learners choice along three main areas of process, product, and content of their learning. With such agency, there can be a

Methodology of Dialogue,[60] that Alcalde de Arriba sees as essential to Augustinian Pedagogy. Also, learners can grow to be rubric makers as well as project and activity designers. In being able to reflect with co-learner agency and empowerment such learners can become fully Reflective Practitioners[61] as mentioned above.

- *Ongoing and Wider Assessment*

While the needs of the local class/teacher would lead to the creation of site-specific rubrics or activity lists, working on the common understanding of the categories of Mutual (Common) Benefit (Communion) and Reflection (Interiority) as well as their related contact aspects would result in similarities across classes/teachers especially within a specific discipline and/or school setting. In such situations local Communities of Practice could develop ways of combining findings from rubrics in individual settings, etc. to create meta-analyses within a discipline or within a specific school setting. These analyses can provide data so that a specific setting can make judgments about how this pedagogy is helping those involved to live out their culturally understood Augustinian Values. When various settings have similar rubrics, approaches, etc., meta-analyses across these settings can be conducted. Importantly any meta-analyses should not only aid in assessing how effective the implementation of an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy has been but also where improvements can be made.

Practitioners and their Communities of Practice can also study how graduates are doing in maintaining the implementation of the categories and contact aspects in their post-schoolwork lives. If an Augustinian Characteristic Pedagogy aims at Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions, then there should be some assessment of the impact on the work approaches of those who have learned through such a pedagogy. However, those doing such studies should not be surprised if learners have difficulty implementing the Mutual

(Common) Benefit category in their work lives. Saint Augustine's sense of our co-learner "equality" reality in the school of the one teacher, (*Exposition of Psalm 126(127)*, 3 and *Sermon 16A* 1) can seem so foreign within contemporary senses of the work world. In a work world that values autonomy, hierarchy, leader dominance, product/commodity, winner take all atmosphere, Mutual (Common) Benefit may seem out of place. Communities of Practice might explore how they can provide professional development where graduates can explore ways that they can bring back the relational and reflective elements that may have eroded under the pressure of the workplace's different values approach. In such a post-schooling assessment Preparing Learners for Good Work "With Others" in All Professions should not be seen as ending at the class bell or graduation.

---

[1] Earlier thoughts about this concept were presented in "Augustine and Service: Preparing Learners for Good Work in All Professions" at Journées Augustiniennes de Carthage 2022/Augustinian Days in Carthage 2022: Augustine of Hippo: A Bridge between Cultures, Shared Perspectives in the Francophone Region and Beyond + Workshop on Service Learning, - 11-13 November 2022, Carthage, Tunisia, https://augustinianpedagogy.org/characteristic-pedagogy. My thanks to Merrimack College for the opportunity to participate in the annual Journées Augustiniennes de Carthage 2020-2022/Augustinian Days in Carthage 2020-2022 of which they were cosponsors. Also, I thank the largely Muslim Tunisians who participated in these events for their probing questions and welcoming attitude to the thoughts of Saint Augustine who studied and taught in Carthage. These interchanges were crucial in formulating these ideas. My thanks Gordene MacKenzie and Nancy Nangeroni for giving me hospitality and space to pull this essay together.

[2] Quotes from Saint Augustine are from *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century* (WSA). Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, except where noted.

[3] Maria Montessori, who was an Italian physician initiated this method in the early part of the 20th century. Montessori used scientific experimentation with her students to test and develop her theories. Private and public schools in various parts of the world have been implementing and further developing this method.

[4] The Spiritual Exercises include contemplative practices, meditations, and prayers, coming from St. Ignatius Loyola. They have been used to help people deepen their relationship with God. Since the time of Saint Ignatius, these Exercises have commonly been given on a retreat of around 30 days length in an atmosphere of silence and solitude.

[5] The first issuing of the *Ratio Studiorum* of the Society Jesus was in 1599. This was 43 years after Saint Ignatius Loyola died in 1556. It has since been seen as the founding document of Jesuit education.

[6] Arrupe, Pedro, "Men and Women for Others" in *Pedro Arrupe: Essential Writings*, Kevin F. Burke, S.J. (ed.) Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2004, pp. 171-187.

[7] Content Analysis is the study of communication to find patterns through methods that are systematic and replicable.

[8] "Cheerful attitude" is Raymond Canning's translation of Augustine's use of "*de hilaritate comparanda*" in section 2,4 in Saint Augustine, *Instructing Beginners in Faith* Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2006, Introduction, p.16.

⁹ Ineson, Emma, *Failure: What Jesus Said About Sin, Mistakes and Messing Up Stuff.* London: SPCK, 2022, pp. 128-134

¹⁰ *Ibid.,* p. 129.

¹¹ *Ibid.,* p. 132.

¹² Shulman, Lee, "Signature Pedagogies in the Professions." *Daedalus,* 134, 2005, pp. 52-59.

¹³ *Ibid,*, p. 52.

¹⁴ Emanating from the *Spiritual Exercises* of Saint Ignatius Loyola and the *Ratio Studiorum* of the Society of Jesus.

¹⁵ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M., Reflection in Action: "A Signature Ignatian Pedagogy for the 21ˢᵗ Century" in Chick, Nancy L., Haynie, Aeron, and Gurung, Regan A.R. (eds.) *Exploring More Signature Pedagogies: Approaches to Teaching Disciplinary Habits of Mind*. Sterling, VA: Stylus, 2012, p. 131. This volume is a follow up to Gurung, Regan A.R., Chick, Nancy L., and Haynie, Aeron, *Exploring Signature Pedagogies: Approaches to Teaching Disciplinary Habits of Mind*. Sterling, VA: Stylus, 2009.

¹⁶ Pope Francis, "Meeting with University Students on Apostolic Journey of His Holiness Pope Francis to Portugal on the Occasion of the XXXVII World Youth Day (2 - 6 August 2023)". https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/speeches/2023/august/documents/20230803-portogallo-universitari.html.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁹ McCloskey, Gary N., "Communities of Values, Communities of Practice: Insights for Inculturation of an Augustinian Signature Pedagogy" presented at Journées Augustiniennes de Carthage 2021/Augustinian Days in Carthage 2021 - Value-Driven, Practice-Oriented Education: Contemporary Examples Informed by Saint Augustine of Hippo - 11-13 November 2021, Carthage, Tunisia. https://augustinianpedagogy.org/characteristic-pedagogy.

²⁰ Stevenson, Herb. "Awareness and Emergence: A Gestalt Approach to Global Diversity and Inclusion." *Gestalt Review,* 20(2), 2016, pp.162-187.

²¹ Insunza, Santiago, "Augustinian Spirituality in the Life of the Laity" in *Our journey back to God: Reflections on Augustinian Spirituality*. Rome: Pubblicazione Agostiniane, 2006, p. 405.

²² Cabrera Montero, Juan Antonio, "Le herencia intellectual y spiritual de Agustin" in *Pertinence de la Pensee de Saint Augustin aux Defis du XXIème Siècle,* Salah Hannachi, (ed.) Carthage, Tunisia, L'Academie Tunisienne des Sciences. des Lettres et des Artes *Beït al-Hikma,* 2022, p. 86.

²³ Arrupe, Pedro, pp. 171-187, *op.cit.*

²⁴ https://thejesuitpost.org/2022/05/men-and-women-for-and-with-others-must-be-formed/.

²⁵ Nowacek, Rebecca S. and Mountin, Susan M., *op. cit.*

²⁶ Dupont, Anthony, "Augustine's Relevance for Contemporary Religious Education. A Deconstructive and Constructive Reading of Augustine." *Edetania* 48 [December 2015], 63.

²⁷ Van Bavel, T.J., O.S.A.. *Christians in the World.: Introduction to the Spirituality of St. Augustine*, trans. Marcella van Brryn. New York: Catholic Book Publishing, 1980.

²⁸ Pope John Paul II, "Address of the Holy Father John Paul II to the Catholic University of the Sacred Heart, Milan Italy. Thursday 13 April 2000." https://www.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/en/speeches/2000/apr-jun/documents/hf_jp-ii_spe_20000413_univ-catt-sacro-cuore.html. Downloaded on August 25, 2022 at 2 pm EDT.

²⁹ Kolvenbach, Peter-Hans, S.J., "The Service of Faith and the Promotion of Justice in American Jesuit Higher Education," in "A Jesuit Education Reader, ed. George Traub, S.J. Chicago: Loyola Press, 2008, p. 155. Kolvenbach was the as the 29th Superior General of the Society of Jesus serving from 1983-2008,

³⁰ Menkhaus, James, *Immersion: A Pilgrimage into Service.* Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2022, 132.

³¹ *Ibid*.

³² *Ibid.*, p. 83.

³³ Boyle, Gregory, *Tattoos on the Heart: The Power of Boundless Compassion*. New York: Free Press, 2010, p. 188.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 190.

35 Menkhaus, p. 102.

36 Wallace, Frank, "Prayer as Encounter and Not Performance," in *Encounter Not Performance.* Australia: E.J. Dwyer, 1991, p. 6. Cited in Menkhaus, James, p. 102.

37 Menkhaus, p. 132.

38 *Ibid.,* p. 30.

39 *Ibid.*

40 Saint Augustine, *The Teacher*, trans. Robert P. Russell, O.S.A. in *Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*, Volume 59. New York: The Catholic University of America Press, 1967.

41 Boyer, Ernest, "The Scholarship of Engagement." *Journal of Public Service & Outreach* 1(1) (1996), 11-20.

42 *Ibid.*, 17.

43 Saint Augustine, *Of True Religion*, trans. J,H,S, Burleigh. South Bend, IN: Gateway Editions. 1959.

44 Jacobs, Richard M. O.S.A. "Augustine's Pedagogy of Intellectual Liberation: Turning Students from the 'Truth of Authority' to the 'Authority of Truth'" in K. Paffenroth and K. L. Hughes, *Augustine and Liberal Education*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2000, p, 122.

45 Menkhaus, p. 30.

46 Dupont, p. 71-72.

47 Menkhaus, p. 37-38.

48 Robert Barron. *And Now I See: A Theology of Transformation. New* York: Crossroad Publishing, 1998, p. 14.

49 See, Insunza, S. "Affectivity in Religious Formation" in *Affectivity and Formation for Religious Life: Course for Augustinian Formators 2004*, coor. Emanuel Borg Bonello, O.S.A. Rome: Pubblicazioni Agostiniane, Curia Generalizia Agostiniana, 2006, pp. 216-222.

50 Lawless, George, O.S.A., Augustine of Hippo as Preacher in *Saint Augustine the Bishop. A Book of Essays*. Fannie LeMoine and Christopher Kleinhenz, editors. New York: Routledge, 1994. 18.

51 Menkhaus, p. 148.

52 *Ibid.*, p. 131.

53 Runco, Mark, *Creativity: Theory and Themes: Research, Development, and Practice*, Second Edition. London: Academic Press (Elsevier), 2014, pp. 24-27. My thanks to Dr. William Carr for introducing to this concept.

54 Saint Augustine, *On Music*, trans. Robert Catesby Taliaferro in *Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*, Volume 2. New York: CIMA Publishing. 1947.

55 Galende Fincias, Francisco. "The Augustinian Educational Model" in *Basic Elements of Augustinian Pedagogy*, Berdon, Eusebio, (coor.). Rome: Pubblicazione Agostiniane, 2006, pp. 33-42.

56 Diez del Rio, Isaias. Augustinian Pedagogy: Philosophical and Anthropological Premises" in *Ibid,*, pp. 43-62.

57 Morahan, Michael. "Climate in the Augustinian School" in *Ibid,*, pp. 170-182

58 Insunza Seco, Santiago. "Identity of an Augustinian School" in *Ibid,*, pp. 137-169.

59 McCloskey, Gary. "Considerations and Practices of Augustinian Pedagogy" in *Ibid,*, pp. 114-136.

60 Alcalde de Arriba, Agustin. "Augustinian Methodology" in *Ibid.*, pp. 89-113.

61 Schon, Donald A. *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action.* New York: Basic Books, 1983. With the date of 1983, the concept of "Reflective Practitioner" could seem outdated. However, it has taken hold and continues in recent publications like Hall, Pete and Simeral, Alisa A. *Creating a Culture of Reflective Practice: Building Capacity of Schoolwide Success.* Alexandria, Virginia: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2017, Sellars, Maura. *Reflective Practice for Teachers*, 2nd Edition. London: Sage Publications, 2017, and Bassot, Barbara. *The Reflective Practice Guide: An Interdisciplinary Approach to Critical Reflection*. London: Routledge, 2015.