

PROVIDENCE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH
1215 Church Rd.
York, PA 17404

June 10, 2025

Dear Session of Tenth Presbyterian Church,

We greet you, our co-laborers in Christ and fellow elders of the Church of Jesus Christ in the name of the great Shepherd of the flock. This email is both a courtesy to you regarding the investigation of your former member, Susan Elzey, and our answer to your request from December 06, 2024, to "discuss these matters."

On June 27, 2024, the session of Providence Presbyterian Church in York PA, requested that the membership of Guy and Susan Elzey be transferred to Providence. Providence's session, being aware that Mrs. Elzey was under an investigation, requested that Tenth's session "communicate to Providence the matters pertaining to Mrs. Elzey." (BCO 38-3.a). On July 31, [REDACTED] on behalf of the session, indicated that Tenth would communicate the details of all past and current investigations. The record of the investigative "commission" was forwarded to Providence on December 6, 2024. However, no session meeting minutes were forwarded. There was no record of the report from the Philadelphia Presbytery's Investigative Committee, and no record of the session's decision in March 2024 to suspend the investigation.

On December 9, 2024, the minutes from Tenth's session meetings on June 23 and 30 were sent. These minutes indicate that Tenth accepted the conclusions of the Philadelphia Presbytery's investigation and the strong presumption of guilt regarding Liam Galigher and Adult Clergy Sexual Abuse (ACSA). However, the record of that report was not forwarded to Providence until December 9 after another request from Providence. Even with this further information, the record was lacking. After further requests, Tenth's session did not send the full record until February 10, 2025, eight months after the initial request.

From June 27, 2024, until February 2025, the session of Providence sought a record of the case against Mrs. Elzey. It took many emails to get the full account. At first it appeared that Tenth's session would only release information that negatively impacted Mrs. Elzey. Exculpatory information, such as the report from Philadelphia Presbytery's investigation and your session's decision to accept this report (07-23-2024) along with the session decision to suspend the investigation of Mrs. Elzey (03-23-2024), which should have concluded the investigation, were not initially sent to Providence's session.

The session of Providence Presbyterian Church expresses concern regarding your mishandling of the situation involving Mr. and Mrs. Elzey. These concerns stem from the emails and minutes you provided to us for our review. Through our review of this information, we have found three main areas of concern which demonstrate serious mishandling of abuse and further infliction of harm to the victim.¹

¹ Isaiah 42:3 "a bruised reed he will not break, and a faintly burning wick he will not quench; he will faithfully bring forth justice." & Ezekiel 34:4 "Those who are sickly you have not strengthened, the diseased you have not healed, the broken you have not bound up, the scattered you have not brought back, nor have you sought for the lost; but with force and with severity you have dominated them."

Below you will find our concerns. When a date is listed that date corresponds with the date of your email and/or session minutes from which we are referring. We have this listed rather than attaching every email and session meeting to this letter. Anytime the names of the Elzeys are listed in this letter, even in quotes, we have removed first names and put either Mr. or Mrs. Elzey out of respect.

Our concerns are as follows:

1. The repeated failure to treat the Elzey's as victims.

- Mr. Elzey was treated as a sinner by the session of Tenth Presbyterian church when they said in an email dated 12-26-2024 that his actions are not "serving him well as a Christian" when he was standing up for his wife, who is the victim.
 - The comment "not serving him well as a Christian" is an attack on Mr. Elzey from the session of Tenth Presbyterian Church. There were no formal charges, or any indication of an investigation brought against Mr. Elzey, as is required in BCO 31-2, 4. The session of Tenth was ruling without process and spreading accusations against the innocent.
 - Husbands are called to love, respect and protect their wives.²
 - Mr. Elzey was loving, respecting, and protecting Mrs. Elzey from the defamatory comments made by members of Tenth and the session of Tenth Presbyterian Church.
- 3/11/24 session meeting minutes say that there is a strong presumption of guilt that Mrs. Elzey broke the seventh commandment.
 - What Rev. Liam Goligher did was abuse³, a sinful crime and not in any way adultery committed by Mrs. Elzey.
 - As leaders in the Church, we are called to protect the weak, stand up for the oppressed, and defend the innocent⁴. The session of Tenth Presbyterian Church failed Mrs. Elzey in their responsibility.
- 3/26/24 session meeting minutes show the session of Tenth noted and acknowledged "several significant aspects from the Goligher Presbytery Investigation Report," including 51 witness accounts against Rev. Liam Goligher indicating a preponderance of lying and deception. Immediately following this acknowledgement, TE Geiger and TE Vanderveen cite BCO 31-7 which presupposes guilt upon the Elzeys as it deals with convicting an offender of the guilt of their sin.
 - Mr. and Mrs. Elzey are not perpetrators of sin, but rather victims of the sinful crimes committed by Rev. Liam Goligher.
 - This is another incident where the session of Tenth Presbyterian Church failed to protect the innocent.
- 7/30/24 session meeting minutes show the session of Tenth acknowledged the results of the Philadelphia Presbytery's investigative committee and voted to approve presbytery's finding (with one abstention), which found a strong presumption of guilt that Rev. Liam Goligher committed adult clergy sexual abuse against Mrs. Elzey, highlighting that she is a victim. But on 10/10/24 via

² Ephesians 5:25

³ "Adult clergy sexual misconduct (CSM), also known as clergy sexual abuse (CSA), is any sexualized behavior by a church leader/spiritual leader toward someone under his/her spiritual care, who by nature is in a position of less power and authority. CSM is an abuse of power and authority, not an "affair," as it cannot be considered mutual consent due to the unequal power dynamics." DASA p. 2458. Emphasis added.

⁴ Proverbs 31:8-9; Psalm 35:10; Isaiah 1:17; Proverbs 116:6

email, RE ██████ stated, "It would be good if at some time Mrs. Elzey could be encouraged herself to repent to us for covering her sin and breaking the 9th commandment though we know her consciousness of it is greatly impaired by the abuse she has suffered."

- The session of Tenth Presbyterian Church acknowledged the findings of the Philadelphia Presbytery investigative committee, voted almost unanimously to approve these findings and then turned around and went against their vote. They blamed Mrs. Elzey and once again targeted and attacked the innocent.
- On July 23, 2024, the session of Tenth accepted, "the results of the Philadelphia Presbytery investigative committee and concurs with their conclusion that there is a strong presumption of guilt."
 - The conclusion of the investigative committee was that TE Goligher was guilty of ACSA.
 - The investigative committee quoted from DASA report that "Clergy sexual abuse is not an "affair" or a "relationship" but a predatory sin against a vulnerable sheep. When a Pastor crosses any sexual boundary with a congregant, whether a child or an adult, it is clergy sexual abuse."
 - By accepting the conclusion of the Presbytery's investigation, the session of Tenth accepts that Mrs. Elzey is innocent of breaking the seventh commandment.
- Scripture is very clear about punishing the innocent⁵.

2. Failure to care for a victim of abuse

- Within the 3/11/24 session minutes, the following statement was found: "We limited statements to those who had firsthand information." While there might be instances in which hearsay evidence may be valid, the session of Tenth's claim that they limited the testimony to first-hand witnesses likely influenced how the congregation of Tenth understood the conclusions of the "commission's" report regarding Mrs. Elzey.
 - ██████'s account to RE ██████ is not firsthand information.
 - ██████'s account to RE ██████ is not firsthand information.
 - ██████'s account to RE ██████ is not firsthand information.
- Within the 4/23/24 session minutes, there is a timeline that shows on December 8-9, 2023, Mr. Elzey informed the elders that Mrs. Elzey was abused. This was confirmed on Dec. 20th, 2023, with RE ██████.
 - In December 2023, Mr. Elzey approached members of the session stating that what his wife had been through was abuse, and yet nothing was done. Mrs. Elzey was continually talked about as a sinner and not cared for as a victim due to the continued mishandling of abuse by the session of Tenth Presbyterian Church.
 - Even with Mr. Elzey's report, the session never investigated the possibility of Mrs. Elzey being a victim of abuse. This is exacerbated because Tenth had hired GRACE to investigate abuse but the session chose not to follow up on the report of abuse by Mr. Elzey. Instead, Mrs.

⁵ Isaiah 29:21; Exodus 23:7; Proverbs 17:5.

Elzey was subject to a disciplinary investigation and multiple defamatory reports.

- In the letter to the congregation dated 4/2/25, the session of Tenth informed the congregation of all current ruling elders' resignation effective 12/31/25. They then immediately informed the congregation of the process needed to re-elect these same men, which would take effect on the same day (12/31/25).
 - This appears as though the session is heeding recommendations from the presbytery investigation while not actually making any changes in leadership. This is disingenuous.
 - This deeply concerns the session of Providence Presbyterian Church as it perpetuates abuse and shows a lack of accountability as well as an unwillingness to accept the consequences of your actions.
- [REDACTED] wrote in an email on 2/8/25 "I don't think we have a choice but to send it all," [referring to the record of the case against Mrs. Elzey] "but this information may potentially expose Tenth in terms of 'wrong handling' of abuse. We just need to be prepared for this."
 - This is self-acknowledgement that sharing your own communications would bring to light serious mishandling of abuse.
 - This appears to be an effort to control the narrative rather than honestly communicate the reality of the situation.
 - Your Self-acknowledgement reaffirms that Mrs. Elzey is a victim.

3. Withholding of information and misleading the Session of Providence Presbyterian Church.

- There were multiple times that Dr. Vince Wood (Senior Pastor at Providence Presbyterian Church) reached out for information pertaining to the investigation of the Elzey's and received only part of the information that was requested.
- Providence Presbyterian Church received minutes from Tenth's session meeting on April 23, 2024. Within these minutes the session of Tenth had information "blacked out" indicating that it had nothing to do with Providence's investigation of the Elzeys. Within the "blacked out" sections, the session of Tenth quoted the DASA report from page 2399 which states "Believing the victim is a care-filled response. There will be time later to verify the veracity of the claims."
 - The Session of Tenth Presbyterian Church mislead the session of Providence Presbyterian Church by covering up information that was directly related to Providence's investigation of the Elzeys.
 - In so doing, the session of Tenth Presbyterian Church appears purposeful in an attempt to mislead and control a false narrative of the investigation.
 - The session of Tenth Presbyterian Church quotes from the DASA report that the victim must be believed, yet they refused to believe Mr. and Mrs. Elzey.

The session of Providence Presbyterian Church is disappointed regarding the session of Tenth's repeated failure to care for the Elzeys as victims, their continued failure to care for a victim of abuse, and their withholding of information and misleading the session of Providence in an attempt to control Providence's investigation. We the session of Providence Presbyterian Church have concluded our investigation of the Elzeys and have unanimously concluded the Elzeys are victims. We will continue to love, value, and walk alongside them while declaring to the congregation of Providence, the session of Tenth, and the watching world that Susan Elzey is innocent of the charge of breaking the seventh commandment. She (and her husband) face no disciplinary actions regarding this situation.

As for the session of Tenth Presbyterian Church, we the session of Providence Presbyterian Church pray that you realize the wrong you have committed, the pain you have caused, and the ways in which you have failed in your responsibilities as elders. We believe that you failed to fulfill the responsibilities of shepherds of Christ's flock, and we are deeply concerned about the harm that may continue under your leadership. We encourage you to own your failures and find ways to better care for the people of God under your leadership. We are willing to walk alongside you in this effort and welcome the opportunity to suggest ways to better care for God's people in your midst.

Yours in Christ,

The Session of Providence Presbyterian Church



RE ~~Warren B. B. B.~~
Clerk of session



TE ~~Warren B. B. B.~~
Moderator

cc: Guy and Susan Elzey