

CRITICAL EVALUATION FRAMEWORK

Teaching Students to Evaluate AI Outputs
Before Using Them Professionally



Megan O'Connor

University of Southern Indiana | Career Success Center

Audience: Career Services Professionals | Adaptable for student workshops, course modules, and advising tools



ABOUT THIS FRAMEWORK

This framework gives students and career professionals a structured method for evaluating AI outputs across five lenses: accuracy, relevance, bias, authenticity, and privacy. It is designed to be used at the point of review, before any AI-assisted content is submitted or shared.

The framework was developed as part of the GENS 401 curriculum at USI and reflects the GPS principle that runs through the entire course: AI navigates, students drive. Critical evaluation is what keeps the student in control of their own career narrative.

The core question every student should ask before submitting any AI-assisted career document: “If a recruiter, advisor, or employer asked me to explain or expand on any part of this, could I do it credibly? If no, this document is not ready.”





The Quick Evaluation Checklist

Use this as a final review step before any submission. Students can complete it themselves or walk through it with an advisor. A completed checklist with all 'Yes' responses means the document is ready. Any 'Needs Work' item is a revision prompt, not a failure. The framework is designed to surface issues before they become professional liabilities.

Teaching This to Students: Facilitation Notes

The most effective way to teach this framework is through application, not explanation. Walk a student through the checklist using a document they actually produced. Ask the evaluation questions aloud and let the student respond. The conversation itself is the learning.

For workshops, use one of the scenarios from the Appropriate vs. Over-Reliant Scenarios document and apply the five lenses to the AI output in each scenario. Students quickly see how the same piece of content can fail multiple lenses simultaneously.

For courses, assign the checklist as a required submission document. Every career deliverable should be accompanied by a completed checklist. This does not add significant time burden, but it builds metacognitive habits that transfer to professional contexts.



AI-Assisted Content Disclaimer:

This document was developed with AI assistance and has been reviewed, verified, and approved by Megan O'Connor, SHRM-CP, CPRW, as the human expert of record.

Final content reflects the author's professional judgment and subject matter expertise.

