**Armour of God**

**Presentation: November 27, 2019**

Saint Patrick Basilica

*Catholic Architecture:*

*Beauty Where God’s Glory Dwells*

Donald MacDonald, Architect (retired)

Speech notes – check against delivery See video recording of presentation

**1. The Finger that Pointed to God Slides: Notre Dame Burning – 5 slides**

**Mixing Memory and Desire**

On April 15 2019, the world was shaken by a potentially complete destruction of the world’s most famous gothic cathedral. People of all faiths and none were moved. For Catholics, this was the destruction of the heart of the Church of France, the eldest daughter of the Church.

The “forest” of 800 year old oak burned down surprisingly rapidly within an hour. The 700 ton flèche of oak and lead designed by Architect Violet le duc in 1859 that had replaced the medieval original eventually crashed through the crossing of nave and transept destroying the freestanding altar. Left standing was the medieval high altar and the gold cross installed by Cardinal Lustiger in the 1980’s leaving a symbol both of suffering and redemption. Stat crux, dum volvitur orbis – the cross stands while the world turns.

The thorn of Christ’s crown of His Passion was saved as was his Eucharistic Presence by the brave chaplain priest of the Parisian fire department.

To me, the near destruction of the great cathedral built in Our Lady’s honour has now served as a Marian warning of our society’s almost total lack of faith. Cardinal Robert Sarah, in an address shortly after he visited the ruins, described the flèche as the finger stretching out toward heaven, pointing us to God. The sign of the flèche reaching to the sky is now gone. It was not heeded.

What is this fire? It is our loss of faith and the spirit of faith, a losing sight of the objectivity of faith and thus a loss of the knowledge of God….the great cathedrals of the West could have been built only by men of great faith and great humility who were profoundly happy to know that they were sons of God….Today they are in danger of becoming museums without a soul…. A cathedral no longer makes sense if the liturgy we celebrate there is not entirely meant to orient us toward God, toward the cross…

Those people who cried, sang and prayed that strange night: what was their memory of faith that this cathedral evoked and what was the desire of their hearts for themselves, their country and the world?

Victor Hugo said in 1827 before he wrote the Hunchback of Notre Dame:

Christianity leads poetry to the truth. Everything in creation is not humanly beautiful. The ugly exists beside the beautiful, … the grotesque on the reverse of the sublime, evil with good, darkness with light. Victor Hugo 1827

**2. Our Present Crisis of Faith Slides: Miniputt and Climbing Gym – 1 Slide**

What is going on in our world today can be shown by some ridiculous use of churches some de-consecrated like those climbing gyms, some still in business like Rochester Cathedral, the oldest Gothic style church in England. It was explained that The cathedral says it hopes visitors will learn about faith, and will build "both emotional and physical bridges".

The time honoured slogan in liturgy is, Prosper of Aquitaine’s maxim: Lex Orandi lex credendi – we pray how we believe and we believe how we pray. In a major 2019 Pew survey discovered that 70% of Catholics do not believe in the Real Presence of Christ and think it is only a symbol of Christ. 50 years after Vatican II, many think the blame for this is due to the loss of a sense of the Holy and the sacred in the church and its sanctuary, altar and tabernacle. It is hard not to think that the removal of altar rails, communion in the hand, and banishment of the tabernacle to a room down the hall did not contribute greatly to this diminished sense of reverence and sacramental devotion. We may add the Law of Building – Lex Aedificandi - that what we build in its turn alters our beliefs: We make our buildings and then they make us.

**3a) Overview and Context Slides: Rideau Chapel/Saint Margaret Mary Church Ottawa – 3 slides**

This is a personal not academic talk; less as an architect and more as a Catholic who has lived through the before and after of Vatican II and has seen many “wreckovations” of Catholic Churches – and even sat in protest on church committees as these plans unrolled. My first communion church was a converted Protestant structure with Catholic appointments like angels and altar rails, which looking back seems more “Catholic” than most purpose built Catholic Churches of the past 70 years. I know that many of you are here tonight because of a dissatisfaction with the way our physical churches presents themselves to us today.

After several renovations since Vatican II St Margaret Mary’s is closing this year. The immersion baptismal fount the looked like a strange jacuzzi did not prevent this, nor did the dislocation of the Blessed Sacrament to the side, the removal of altar rails or the whitewashing the colour from the statue of the Sacred Heart of Jesus, the devotion of the Patroness saint of that parish.

**3b) My Background Slides: 4th year project, Newman Chapel – 2 slides**

In university I did my 4th year project on an urban church exploring the relevance of worship spaces in a city. Looking back 40 years, I note how at that time we wanted more relevancy, social justice and credibility for the Church - in a word seeking the friendship and Immanence of God versus the distant and transcendent that often derided as the triumphalism of yesterday. What should our priority be today?

Pictured is Rideau Convent a French gothic interior masterpiece done torn down in 1970 for a steakhouse no one remembers. Heritage activists got it reconstructed in the National Gallery of Canada.

I have written a series of articles for Living with Christ publication and remain a passionate amateur in the subject. So neither being an academic or practitioner, I get comfort from GK Chesterton when he said in his défense of amateurs:

A man must love a thing very much if he not only practises it without any hope of fame or money, but even practises it without any hope of doing it well.

**3c) Scope and Outline of this Talk Slides: St Mary’s Church Glenfinnan Scotland - 1 slide**

My preferences will undoubtedly show. As my ancestors hail from the Highlands of Scotland, I was delighted to find an excellent example of high Victorian Gothic revival by Welby Pugin in the most scenic vista of Scotland at Glenfinnan, where Prince Charlie first landed for his rebellion. I think of this Catholic church when we play “Highland Cathedral” on the bagpipes.

The scope and history of Christian church architecture is huge and is studied from many perspectives: archeology, technology, aesthetics, stylistic history and liturgy. In a small overview such as tonight I cannot show you all the periods and countless architectural expressions of the Church building, or even dive into all the liturgical arguments of the past 50 years, but I can offer you some points I feel are universally important and even critical for today’s world. I have always been most interested in the Church Building’s meaning for Catholics, Christians and non-believers in our time. What is our relation to the rich patrimony of worship that our forebears have left us? In the end, how can architecture and art bring us closer to God?

I have structured this talk as a series of common questions which you probably already have as I will share my thoughts on possible answers.

**4. The point of my talk is simple: A City on a hill cannot be hidden** / the beauty that will save the world is the love of God that must shine through our architecture, art and liturgy as it must shine through us.

Slides: Pakenham and MontMartre

Our Catholic built heritage is a sacramental sign of God’s Glory – this remains perennially good and helpful for our faith and evangelization. More people are aware of this. The forces of disintegration, mis-information and levelling of the past 70 years that was sold as the “Spirit of the times” has come to an end.

In the hey day of the 20th c Liturgical Movement, Bishop Fulton Sheen in 1931 said: “Marry the spirit of the age and you become a widow in the next.” I will show you how the modern movement in architecture and liturgy used the same “spirit of the age” language to discard what they saw as inauthentic accretions of the past but lost so much of our patrimony of faith in the process.

By the time the early 20th c International style based on the machine aesthetic had run its course by the early 1970s, the post Vatican II renovators were starting to do their worst with this new iconoclasm. The Church, while herself claiming no one official style, but embracing early 20th c Modernism soon found herself stylistically out of date by the end of the century as architects moved on and the faithful wanted their churches to look like churches.

**5. Can the Church Building Evangelize and save Souls? Slides: Corpus Christi Church NYC / Rome 200 Church – 1 slide**

Benedict XVI said that “the church’s two evangelical tools are the saints and the sacraments” – modernists minimize or banish both

what are our guide posts and how do we discern the good in these matters? I believe that, just like the first line of the Code of Canon Law, that the first law is the salvation of souls. To this end the Code says that the work of evangelization is a fundamental duty of all the people of God, since "the whole Church is by its nature missionary" (CIC c. 781)

Thomas Merton, Dorothy Day and countless others tell of how their random visits to a beautiful church started them on the road to conversion.

According to a 2017 study, tried and true tools of evangelization, such as the church building itself, are very influential in a young person’s conversion to Christianity.

**6. Why a Church building at all? Slides: Desert Tabernacle/Jewish Temples/– 1 slide**

God’s Glory dwelling among us - Axis Mundi

God penetrates the world through physical types: Mount Sinai for the decalogue, the Moriah hilltop as Abraham’s intended sacrifice of Issac, the rock outcrop above Jerusalem called the Temple Mount for Solomon’s temple, the Mount of Beatitudes by the Sea of Galilee, Mount Tabour of the Transfiguration, the Mount of Olives of Jesus ascension.

• Isaiah 52:7 How lovely on the mountains Are the feet of him who brings good news

God’s glorified presence known as the Sheckinah was a cloud descended to the ark of the Covenant in the tent of meeting for Moses.

Three centuries later David asked why he lived in a house of cedar while God was in a tent. God replied that He would build David a House. 2 Sam 7 but would let David’s son Solomon “ to build a house for My name and I will establish the throne of his kingdom for ever” David would choose the spot for the House of God, built by his son Solomon who asked “I have built thee and exalted house, a place for thee to dwell in forever. But will God indeed dwell on the earth? Behold, heaven and the highest heaven cannot contain thee; how much less this house that I have built.” . Though the Lord answered that “My name shall be there.” (1 Kings 8:27-29)

Solomon’s Temple was small and not a congregational space as in later Jewish synagogues. The Temple was primarily God’s House and a dwelling for the Sheckinah, the Divine Presence. There three parts, the Vesibule or porch (Ulsan), the Holy Place (Hechal) and the Holy of Holies where no light entered. Mystery occult religions (Mithraic temples) with screens and veils may have been an influence on Eastern and Roman churches

Slide: Church as the Body of Christ – 1 slide

Why a Church building at all? when we have Christ the true and perfect temple of the New Covenant?

Be you also as living stones built up, a spiritual house, a holy priesthood, to offer up spiritual sacrifices, acceptable to God by Jesus Christ. 1 Peter 2:5

Rightly from the earliest times church has also been the name given to the building in which the Christian community gathers to hear the word of God, to pray together, to receive the sacraments and to celebrate the Eucharist”. Because the church is a visible building, it stands as a special sign of the pilgrim church on earth and reflects the Church dwelling in heaven. RDCA

Although God is present everywhere and cannot be confined within the walls of temples built by man (Acts 17:24-25), God instructed Moses to build a tabernacle where He would dwell among the Israelites (Exodus 25:40).

From storefront churches to the most ornate cathedrals, Christ is the Church’s body and we the living stones. It is because of this sacredness, the physical building takes on an importance that is sign and a help for believers. Surveys have shown that this dignity of the building is important to all Christian believers high, low or secular.

**7. Wasn’t Vatican II all about getting back to the original idea of liturgy?**

Ressourcement vs Archeologism: Shouldn’t we get back to the worship of the Early Church?

Slides: Duro Europos, Baroque Confessional 1 slide

Ressourcement – back to basics of faith had flip side of romanticizing “archeologism” or “primitivism” of the early Church and by this denying the development of doctrine

Biblical studies, historical critical method and archeology understood well does not support “primitivism” – the notion that the early church was definitive or fully developed in doctrine liturgy, or architecture.

Openness to inculturation of the Gospel – known rightly as the “purification of culture” – is itself good until it ruptures continuity of the Faith or no longer supports it.

A Chronological bias crept in that favoured the early church and post-Vatican II periods and suspect all in between. Primitivism was denounced by Pius XII in Mediator Dei and Benedict XVI championed the heurmenutic of continuity to recognize legitimate development. Many assumptions such as Versus Populum were made about the few early examples of house churches such as Dura Europos that turn out to be false. Some continuity exists for example in the separate room for Baptistry that has been maintained through the ages.

As an example, in the 19th c Architect Augustus Welby Pugin favoured exclusively the Gothic or Pointed Style as the perfect Christian period to emulate. St John Henry Cardinal Newman, known for his teaching on the development of Catholic doctrine, disagreed even though he much admired high church tradition.

St Charles Borromeo energetically reformed the church environment after the Council of Trent. He design the confessional boxes we still use today in response to clerical abuse of penitents and to encourage the sacrament. Time tested Tradition vs emotional innovation eg confessionals vs reconciliation rooms fonts vs immersion pools

**8. What about the Poor? Slides: Dorothy Day/woman/St Mary’s SF**

Yes building projects take many resources but the right to beauty for is rich and poor alike – “Man does not live by bread alone but by every word from the mouth of God.” The expensive perfume used to anoint Jesus’ feet was protested by Judas Iscariot. “the poor have fewer chances to visit a beautiful building,” Duncan Stroik.

As an illustration of this,in 1962 in response to proposals to rebuild San Francisco’s Cathedral, activist Cesar Chavez remarked, “We don’t ask for more cathedrals, we don’t ask for bigger churches or fine gifts. We ask for the church’s presence among us. We ask for the church to sacrifice with the people for social change, for justice, and for love of brother.”

In response, Dorothy Day said, “The church has an obligation to feed the poor, and we cannot spend all our money on buildings. However, there are many kinds of hunger. There is a hunger for bread, and we must give people food. But there is also a hunger for beauty – and there are very few beautiful places that the poor can get into. Here is a place of transcendent beauty, and it is as accessible to the homeless … as it is to the mayor of San Francisco. The Cathedral in San Francisco is one of the few places where the poor can go and sit down and be with God in beauty…”

Sign of contradiction to the World: sign of the eternal life, outward sign of invisible grace, sign of the unseen God.

**9 a). Isn’t the Church about the Assembly of Faithful – the People of God? Ad Populum vs Ad Eucharisticum Slides: Fan Shape Diagrams/Newman St Thomas Chapel Renovations – 2 slides**

Modernity’s trouble with hierarchy and focus on equality under the “priesthood of the laity” has caused overcorrection in emphasis on Christ’s presence in the Assembly:

"But there is another way in which Christ is present in His Church, a way that surpasses all the others. It is His presence in the Sacrament of the Eucharist Paul VI Mysterium Fidei,1965 no. 38).

Much of the theological difficulty modern thinking has with our liturgical architectural patrimony is hierarchy which is inherently Catholic in its “both-and” and almost always misunderstood: You are right to call me Master said the Lord but washed the feet of his disciples.

**9 b). Shouldn’t the Church just be designed for the Mass and the Assembly? Eucharist other Sacraments and Devotions**

Private devotions and public Eucharistic worship vs public worship only – communion of saints have been made invisible – removes or whitewashed statues

• Much emphasis since VII has been on the communal nature of the Mass to the weakening of the transcendent and detriment of sacramental devotional life of the Church

• Most liturgical consultants detested private devotions or popular piety and much liturgical reform seemed to militate against these devotions

• Romano Guardini the great early 20th c liturgist warned against the loss of the necessary distinction between liturgy and devotions, the latter much supported by SC.

The unfolding multivalent hierarchy of God s presence has been flattened by the univalent understanding of God’s presence exclusively in the assembly and its action

The ancient MasterBuilders were religious though most modern architects were agnostic or at best spiritualist . How does Religious knowledge and Faith of the architect translate to the form and meaning of the building?

Baptized christianized architectural styles vs universal secular modernist style – though the Church adopts no one style are they all equal?

**10. Can’t the church building be more practical?**

It’s open only one hour a day?

Tabernacle Reservation of the Blessed Sacrament:

“They have taken my Lord and I do not know where they put Him”

Slides: Tabernacles/Marian Pictures – 2 slides

• The Reserved Sacrament had its original function as Viaticom (communion for the sick) but through tradition there was a growth in adoration of the Real Presence

• Vatican II said that the Tabernacle must be situated “in churches in a most worthy place with the greatest honor” [so as to] foster adoration before the Lord really present in the Blessed Sacrament of the altar. CCC1183, SC128, MF

• Rightly seen as an extension of the altar

• GIRM 2000 allows Tabernacle to be located in sanctuary or separate chapel though still beautifully decorated and conspicuous

• Separate chapels traditional in Cathedrals and shrines but are of more questionable use in a parish church where devotion should be encouraged in the principal nave of the church.

• Post Vatican II Issue of “sign value” or “distraction” of Tabernacle vs the altar of the Mass – false distinction were made between “static” and “active” presence of the Lord

Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger: during the day our churches should not be allowed to be dead houses, standing and seemingly useless

• When thus the eternal light was lit in the Church, and the tabernacle installed beside the altar, then it was as if the bud of the mystery had opened, and the Church had welcomed the fullness of the Eucharistic mystery. The Lord is always there.

• The church is not just a space in which something sometimes happens early in the morning, while for the rest of the day it stands empty,’unused’. There is always the ‘church’ in the church building, because the Lord is always giving himself, because the Eucharistic mystery remains present… The Eucharist the Heart of Life

**11. Why do modern church buildings not look like churches? Should we prefer one style? Slides: Oakland and LA Cathedrals/ Environment and Art Slide**

A simple premise, until you ask questions such as: What does a church look like? Which Style? Is there a preferred style? The history of Western Church architecture shows the acceptance of many styles and building techniques. Vatican II famously said:

The Church has not adopted any particular style of art as her own; she has admitted styles from every period according to the natural characteristics and circumstances of people’s and the needs of the various rites… [the Church] welcomes all artistic expression provided that the style adorns the sacred buildings and the holy rites with due reverence and honour. Sacroscanctum Concilium S123.

Like most things, not having one official style does not mean that some styles are not more conducive for the sacramental and worship functions of a church building. Unfortunately, this statement lead many to assume that we could abandon the heritage of Catholic architecture and start tabla rosa or “from zero” as the Bauhaus architects would have had it. We are only now realizing that the international modern idiom has become as much an historical style as any of the others.

**Architecture’s Crisis of Faith**

• Edward Slovik. “The Non-Church”: the church building is a skin for the worship space”

• Much of the trouble in post Vatican II Church renovations in North America can be traced to a 1978 document created by the (American) Bishops’ Conference on the Liturgy called Environment and Art in Catholic Worship. This non-binding document was never approved by the whole USCCB, but was nevertheless adopted by many bishops and pastors and put into practice. It was specifically abrogated by the release of Built of Living Stones in 2000 https://forums.catholic.com/t/communion-altar-rails/136308/12

• Environment and Art in Catholic Worship 1978 never approved by USCCB – practiced the innovation SC warned against by changed language eg worship space, presider, welcoming space etc. Built of Living Stones 2004 more balanced

• Unprecedented fan seating or rarely used shapes such as centralized altar and previously unseen horizontal proportions were used to emphasize the primacy of the ”Assembly”

• Post Vatican II saw a rise in the profession of “Litugical Design Consultant” a specialist who tried to bridge a pastor ignorant of architecture and an architect clueless about liturgy. How did we ever manage in the past?

• The tabernacle (statuary etc) is a “distraction” from the Eucharistic action of the altar – let’s put in down the hall. They have taken my Lord and I don’t know where they put him Jn 20:13

• Urban myths: “Priest had ‘his back to the people’” St Peter’s altar faces the people so ours should too - though it was in fact facing east the direction of the Parousia

**12. Can a church be horizontal like a conference centre? Verticality and Transcendence Slides: St Denis Basilica – 1 slide**

In my 4th year Design for a Church I was exploring immanence and closeness with a convex ceiling and sensual forms, reminiscent of the Chapel at Ronchamp. The human scale is always necessary in architecture but can be achieved in concert with a vertical transcendent space. However many moderns ignore the vertical using the Horizontal theme of the Assembly as their theological basis for flat and heavy ceilings and low rectangular buildings.

**13. We’re we wrong all those centuries when the Priest said Mass with “his back to the people”? - Ad Orientum**

Slides: Bouyer Direction of Prayer diagram/Old St Peter’s/disposition of the Last Supper/ Basilica Drawings /the Liturgical East – 5 slides

Orientation of prayer vs self enclosed community “leading people to God or having his back to the people?” One cannot study Christian history without noting the powerful directional sense of the great monotheistic religions. The preponderance of scholarship on the Christian orientation of prayer to the East, the direction of Christ’s return has been established.

Jews in Diaspora prayed towards Jerusalem even after destruction of the Temple in 70 AD Eschatological hope for coming of Messiah. Despite all the variations in practice that have taken place far into the second millennium, one thing has remained clear for the whole of Christendom: praying towards the east is a tradition that goes back to the beginning. Ratzinger The Spirit of the Liturgy

• St Peter’s Basilica old and new had its sanctuary and apse facing west for historic reasons so when the priest prays to the east from a freestanding altar over the tomb of St Peter he would have to face the nave and the people would likewise turn to the east for the Eucharistic prayer. This was seen as a precedent: if it is good enough for Rome its good enough for us. The west doors of St Peter’s were opened to admit the rising sun.

• Vatican II documents which says nothing about ‘turning towards the people’ versus populum. , However spirit of VII implementers interpreted versus populum as contributing to active participation of community and the shared sense of the ‘meal’. Later, The 1969 GIRM did allow that altars be built so that they may be incensed and the priest could face the people.

Louis Bouyer in Liturgy and Architecture says that this is a mistaken view of the disposition of a meal in antiquity where all were sitting on the same convex side of a curved table.

Modern Western Christians have little sense of direction of whence the Incarnate Word came or will return from.

The Eucharist that Christians celebrate really cannot adequately be described by the term ‘meal’. It refers back to the Cross and the transformation of the Temple sacrifice. Thus the Synagogue liturgy of the Word merged into the remembrance of Christs death and Resurrection to become the Eucharist.

The turning of the priest toward the people has turned the community into a self-enclosed circle.

So just as the congregation in the synagogue looked together toward Jerusalem, so in the Christian liturgy the congregation look together “toward the Lord’….at the Eucharistic prayer all would “turn to the East”. Together knowing they were in a procession to the Lord.

Looking at the priest has no importance. What matters is looking together at the Lord.

Where a direct common turning to the east is not possible, the cross can serve as the interior ‘east’ of faith.

According to Bouyer the whole assembly, the bishop or priest celebrant who stood behind the altar as well as the people in the nave would turn towards the east and hence towards the doors during the Eucharistic prayer.

**14. The Altar: The table of the Lord or the altar of sacrifice? Slides: Meal or Sacrifice? – 1 slide**

Christ as priest, victim and sacrifice- and heavenly banquet . “The Mass is at the same time, and inseparably, the sacrificial memorial in which the sacrifice of the cross is perpetuated and the sacred banquet of communion with the Lord’s body and blood,” CCC 1382

Holy sacred set apart and hierarchically ordered space Vs Universal relativist Space

The ancient Greeks saved their best architecture and craft for the Temple. Nothing of equal value remains of the ancients’ civic buildings. The Parthenon was truly set apart for Greek goddess Athena Parthenos (“Athena the Virgin”). Much like the Hebrew Holy of Holies, this was not an assembly space and the only light that came through was from the east doorway.

The living temple and dwelling of God’s Glory vs the liturgical skin or the “non-church” of the worshipping assembly. Much related to the Lord tabernacling with his people.

Our holy of Holies is the tabernacle. Eucharistic chapels entailing removal from sanctuary has resulted a “dead space“ waiting for the liturgical “action”

• The Rites for the Dedication of a Church put it this way: “the altar of a church … stands as a sign of Christ Himself, who is the priest, the victim, and the altar of His own sacrifice”.

• 5 Crosses inscribed on Mensa (slab) of altar represent 5 wounds of Christ.

• The altar Represents the first covenant altars of sacrifice and new covenant table of remembrance

• The preferred material is stone particularly for the Mensa that represents Christ as the Cornerstone reminiscent of the holy martyrs whose relics may lie within the stone that represents their tomb

• A baldacchino or ciborium can enhance the altar in scale and dignity and evoke the tent of the ark of the covenant

• The sanctuary that depicts heavenly realities end-frames the altar

The altar can also be seen to symbolize the table of the Last Supper, the altar of the Temple in Jerusalem, the cross of Calvary, the tomb of Christ’s burial and resurrection, and the altar in heaven.

The design and construction of the altar should embody meal and sacrifice as well as birth and resurrection.

During the Counter-Reformation, the Protestant denial of the Real Presence of the Eucharist led the Catholic Church to respond by creating large and beautiful tabernacles, joining them with the altar, and employing biblical and Christian imagery supporting the doctrine within spacious churches.

Just as the altar represents Christ, the stone material represents “Christ the rock” and “the stone that the builders rejected which has become the cornerstone” (Ps 118:22).

D. Stroik

**15. The Altar Rail/Chancel Screen/Baldichinno: the symbol of threshold to Heaven – the Sanctuary as Set-apart Slides: altar rail and rood screen**

• The GIRM states that the sanctuary should be appropriately marked off from the body of the church by either being somewhat elevated or by a partular structure or ornamentation

• Sense of enclosure can distinguish sanctuary and sanctify altar but has (unnecessarily) been seen as disunifying to the community

• Rightly seen as an extension of the altar

• Symbolic of the Veil of the Holy of Holies in the Temple of Jerusalem, the altar rail Evolved from chancel walls of late antiquity (Templons) and later medieval rood screens but developed particularly after Trent to enhance view of altar but keep sanctuary separate

• Some say these rails and screens arose from the doctrine of Transubstantiation 4th Lateran 1215, or to protect against worshipers’ pet dogs

• The screen enjoyed a small revival in the 19th c via Augustus W.N Pugin

• Removals of altar rails were never mandated by Vatican but came as result of The indult allowing Communion in the hand was first issued in an instruction, "Memoriale Domini," published May 29 1969

• they seem to be one of the traditional elements most hated by liturgical consultants and many designers. D. Stroik.

• When we take away the thresholds, all the separations that surround and protect the sacred realities… everything becomes common or profane. In rejecting the presence of the sacred in our life, we create a uniform, featureless flattened world. It makes no difference to celebrate Mass in a church or auditorium... the loss of the sense of the sacred is a reason for sadness. Cardinal Robert Sarah The Day is Now Far Spent

**16. Is The Chair / Cathedra of the Bishop too Imperial? Slides: the Chair**

An earthly chair signifies a share in the authority of God who also reigns on a throne

Represents the teaching authority of the bishop and by extension to the celebrating priest

**17. Didn’t Vatican II call for Noble Simplicity in Architecture and Liturgy and many innovations? the 20c Liturgical Movement**

Slides: 20th c Liturgical Books/Perret’s and Rudoph Shwarz Churches – 2 slides

Noble beauty (art and architecture in S.C.). Used interchangeably with noble simplicity (liturgy) this expression had enlightenment roots. By the 1700’s, a reaction against the drama and artifice of the Baroque period had begun, with a return to classical architecture and painting usually called Neoclassicsim. Johanne Winckelmann, a German art historian, captured this period’s mood in his prescription for a “noble simplicity and calm grandeur”. These ideals captured the sensual and spiritual elements of beauty, with heroism and morality in one elegant form. The restraint inherent in these forms reflected the Enlightenment’s belief in reason.

We can see a parallel to this in the 20th c reaction to Victorian eclecticism, with Sacrosanctum Concilium of Vatican II calling for “in encouraging and favouring art that is truly sacred, Ordinaries should seek after noble beauty rather than mere sumptuous display” sC 124 . Though “noble simplicity” was used in SC in reference to the form of the liturgy, Post Vatican II documents used the latter phrase for architecture in support of the modern style.

• The Second Vatican Council teaches that “there must be no innovations unless the good of the Church genuinely and certainly requires them, and care must be taken that any new forms adopted should in some way grow organically from forms already existing” (Sacrosanctum concilium 23).

**18. Is Ornament a Crime? Why do we need Iconography? The Scourge of Iconoclasm**

Slides: Iconoclasm pictures early and late – 2 slides

Iconoclastic Heresy 6c-9c

Christianity is unique in the great monotheistic religions Judaism and Islam inasmuch as Christ made God visible through His Incarnation

“He who has seen me has seen the Father” Jn 14:9

Judaic influence and persecution of early Church and later Muslim pressure suppressed Byzantine images 730-787AD ban finally restored by Byzantine Emperors in 843 AD

“No one has ever seen God” Jn 1:18

the 1st Commandment against idol worship and carved images creates tension through history from Moses to many of the Protestant reformers 16c-17c (Calvin, Zwingli and Cranmer)

Iconoclasm is indeed a common and recurring human trait to exert supremacy of ideological or religious points of view practiced by all civilizations.

Bernard of Clairveau founder of the Cistercians fought Abbot Suger and the monastery at Cluny for their visual oplulence and political connections

Anti-Christian fervour heightened at French Revolution for atheistic and anti-monarchist reasons.

Heavenly realities iconography “holy distraction” vs

Abstract and structural expressionism. Why are the kids bored at Mass?

**19. Why is Church Art and Architecture Sacramental? Iconography – the Bible in Stone Slides: The Bible in Stone – Notre Dame**

Architecture and art is a sacramental means by which one can enter the Church. The Church sees Matter as good and worthy of being part of a Sacrament or Sacramental. Modernism reduces matter to a utilitarian “skin” for function, or a gnostic materialism where the use matter is minimized leading to such expressions as the Non-Church building.

The physical church is also didactic, it teaches us of important events of Christ and the saints. It is said to be the Bible in stone and glass. Iconoclasts and many Protestants emphasize only the aural/written word of God for a teaching function.

• “The practice of placing sacred images in churches so that they may be venerated by the faithful is to be maintained. Nevertheless their number should be moderate and their relative positions should reflect right order. For otherwise they may create confusion among the Christian people and foster devotion of doubtful orthodoxy” (Sacrosanctum Concilium, 125).

**20. Did the Modern Movement’s notion of functionalism affect the 20th c Liturgical Movement? Slides: EACW**

• Ornamentation is a Crime”. Adolf Loos (understandable reaction to Victorian excess though he was referring to the criminal class’s fondness for tattoos)

• A house is a machine to live in”. Le Corbusier

• Mechanization takes Command – Siegfried Gideon

• “Form ever follows function” Louis H. Sullivan (But how does this machine serve all our needs and who defines these functions that form is supposed to follow?)

• Earthbound mechanistic view of life inspired by Darwin, Marx and Freud

• Le Corbusier and Gropius were seeking in their own ways integration of the classical goals of architecture.

• The great styles of the past have each attained their full perfection and we cannot hope to equal, much less surpass them, by copying; we must set our faces towards the future with full confidence that the newly dawning epoch will express the aspirations of our time, as the work of former epochs ex- pressed theirs. . . . The glance of the artist is forward, not backward.” Barry Byrne in Architecture – Embalmed or Modern? 1934, an American Catholic modernist architect and disciple of Romano Guardini and Schwarz

• ‘holy emptiness’ is nothing negative” but rather “[T]he emptiness and sobriety empha- sizes God’s wealth and majesty in an over- whelming and impressive way.” Fr. Hans Ansgar Reinhold 1938

• the Universal relativist space

• Scruton reverses Sullivan by saying that “Function follows Form” because if a building is beautiful we will want to keep it and adapt uses to it.

• My approach and that of the architectural thinkers above is that we have not defined the function of a church enough – its very ontology as “a sacred place fitting for divine worship” Code of Canon Law:

• Stroik has 6 definitions: liturgical, sacramental, houses liturgical elements, is devotional (public and private), iconographic/symbolic, and sacred

**21. What are some of the Principles of Good Architecture? Slides: Notre Dame Regulating Lines – 1 slide**

Vitruvius’ Triad of Architecture

• Architecture is firmitas, utilitas, venustas (firmness, commodity and delight) according to ancient Roman architect Vitruvius, these 3 being always in play to greater or lesser extent.

• Can be translated to Permanence, Verticality and Iconography to refer to the time immemorial needs of the Christian church i.e. tradition, transcendence and teaching

• Is there more than an accidental parallel to the 3 transcendentals of Truth, Goodness and beauty

Christian Triads

Holy Trinity: Father Son and Holy Spirit (Three Doors on Façade)

Church Militant, Suffering and Triumphant (Nave, signified by doors from Narthex of Catechumens, Chancel, signified by Rood Screen and Chancel Arch and Altar signified by Triumphal Arch)

Integrity Proportion and Clarity (Integritas, Consonatia and Claritas) – St Thomas Aquinas

• 1. Integritas (wholeness) –It must not be deficient in what it needs to be most itself.

• 2. Consonantia (proportionality) –Its dimensions correspond to other physical objects and to a metaphysical ideal

• 3. Claritas (radiance) –radiate intelligibility

**22. How does Light affect the experience of Church Architecture? Slides: Rose Window/Ronchamp – 2 slides**

Polychromatic vs white light

Stained glass technology has not changed much in 800 years. Why has it become so identified with churches and cathedrals – to tell stories of saints and salvation? To mediate white light into the full prism of colours? To tell of the glory of God that one can only see fully from the inside of the church. Outside the church the windows are dull and grey.

The [stained glass] windows let in the luminous presence, joyful and multi-coloured, of the saints in heaven. Cardinal Robert Sarah

St Dionysius

“Jesus, the Light of the Father, the Real, the true, which lighteth every man that cometh into the world, by whom we have access to the Father, the Origin of Light. Let us raise our thought according to our power, to the illuminations of the most sacred doctrines handed down by the Fathers. “ Pseudo Dionysius 5-6 c Celestial Mysteries

Abbot Suger of St Denis 12c

“When one stands before the glorious colours from the sacred windows, it is as if the viewer were transported halfway to heaven.”

The writing above the door reads, (from the Latin):

Bright is the noble work, but being nobly bright, the work should brighten the minds, so that they may travel through the true lights

Le Corbusier

Architecture is the masterly, correct and magnificent play of volumes brought together in light

**23 Are there any signs of a return to our architectural heritage?:**

**Slides: Notre Dame Fleche/Proposals/New Classicism – 3 slides**

**24. What is meant by Beauty?**

**24 a) The Ancients: Slides: the Roman Pantheon/the Parthenon, Number and order in Creation**

Theogenes 6c BC beauty is lovable

Plato to behold beauty is to behold reality (truth and goodness)

Aristotle beauty is order

• The chief forms of beauty are order and symmetry and definiteness, which the mathematical sciences demonstrate

Plotinus beauty is Being and is loved for that

• Being is desirable because it is identical with Beauty, and Beauty is loved because it is Being. We ourselves possess Beauty when we are true to our own being; ugliness is in going over to another order; knowing ourselves, we are beautiful; in self-ignorance, we are ugly.”

**24 b) Architects on Beauty:**

The Architect, … gives us the measure of an order which we feel to be in accordance with that of our world, he determines the various movements of our heart and of our understanding; it is then we experience the sense of beauty.” Le Corbusier

“If you foolishly ignore beauty, you will soon find yourself without it. Your life will be impoverished. But if you invest in beauty, it will remain with you all the days of your life.” Frank Lloyd Wright

**24 c) Christians on Beauty:**

St Augustine

• "I have loved, O Lord, the beauty of your house and the place where your glory dwells (Ps 25:8). We love the beauty of Gods house and the place where his glory dwells if we ourselves are that house. What is the beauty of Gods house and the place where his glory dwells if not the temple of which the Apostle says, 'Gods temple is holy, which you are'(1 Cor 3:17)? In buildings made by hands, when they are elegantly and magnificently constructed, our bodily sight is struck; so when living stones, the hearts of believers, are held together by the bond of charity, this is the beauty of Gods house, the place where his glory dwells. Learn, then, what you should love so that you are able to love it. One who loves the beauty of Gods house loves the Church, not in walls and roofs built by a carpenter, not in gleaming marble and gold-paneled ceilings, but in faithful and holy people, people who love God with all their heart and with all their soul and with all their mind and their neighbors as themselves." (Augustine, Sermon 15, 1; PL 38, 116)

Thomas Aquinas: it is the attractive power of the Truth

“beauty is the Splendor of the Truth”

• “As can be seen from the words of Dionysius, Beauty comprises both splendor and suitable proportions: and in fact he states that God is beautiful ‘as the cause of the splendor and the harmony of all things’. Thus the Beauty of the body consists in having well-proportioned limbs, with the brightness of the appropriate colour.” St Thomas Aquinas S.T. II-II 145-2

beauty is apprehended by the mind and not by appetites

Beauty adds to goodness a relation to the cognitive faculty: so that "good" means that which simply pleases the appetite; while the "beautiful" is something pleasant to apprehend.

Roger Scruton beauty shapes our world as home and endures

Through the pursuit of beauty we shape the world as a home, and in doing so we both amplify our joys and find consolation for our sorrows. There is a deep human need for beauty and if you ignore that need in architecture your buildings will not last

Dietrich Von Hildebrand beauty expresses spiritual ideas and deeper truths

Aesthetic power of nature and 2nd power of art expressing spiritual ideas, involving an apprehension of deeper truths, blending truth and beauty indistinguishably. Often, when we encounter beauty of the second power, we are struck by the truth of the idea expressed by it, and in such cases beauty and truth seem to blend indistinguishably

**24 d) The Church on Beauty:**

Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy and Сatechism of the Catholic Church:

• The fine arts, but above all sacred art, “of their nature are directed toward expressing in some way the infinite beauty of God in works made by human hands. Their dedication to the increase of God’s praise and of his glory is more complete, the more exclusively they are devoted to turning men’s minds devoutly toward God” (Sacrosanctum Conciliam 122).CCC2513

• With his openness to truth and beauty, his sense of moral goodness, his freedom and the voice of his conscience, with his longings for the infinite and for happiness, man questions himself about God’s existence.” CCC 33

• Letter to Artists – St John Paul II 1999

• “Beauty enthuses us for work and work raises us up.“ Beauty fills us with God so we can be exalted through prayer

• May the beauty which you pass on to generations still to come be such that it will stir them to wonder!... Thanks to this enthusiasm [for wonder], every time humanity loses its way, it will be able to lift itself up and set out again on the right path.

• In this sense it has been said with profound insight that “beauty will save the world”.

• Meeting with Artists – Pope Benedict XVI

• Authentic beauty, however, unlocks the yearning of the human heart, the profound desire to know, to love, to go towards the Other, to reach for the Beyond. If we acknowledge that beauty touches us intimately, that it wounds us, that it opens our eyes, then we rediscover the joy of seeing, of being able to grasp the profound meaning of our existence. Meeting with Artists Benedict XVI

**25. Will Beauty save the World?** Slides: the Pieta/Hans Hobien/Notre Dame Holy Week/

• Lumen Fidei Pope Francis (Benedict XVI)

• Yet it is precisely in contemplating Jesus’ death that faith grows stronger and receives a dazzling light;

• Pope Benedict XVI, the primary drafter of Lumen Fidei, emphasized the absolutely essential role of beauty in human life in his Meeting with Artists. Here he quoted again Doestoevsky bold and paradoxical words:

• ”Man can live without science, he can live without bread, but without beauty he could no longer live, because there would no longer be anything to do to the world.” (quoting from the novel Demons

• Dostoevsky’s The Idiot, Prince Myskin sees a painting by Hans Holbein the Younger depicting Christ dead in the tomb and says:

• “Looking at that painting might cause one to lose his faith.” The painting is a gruesome portrayal of the destructive effects of death on Christ’s body. Yet it is precisely in contemplating Jesus’ death that faith grows stronger and receives a dazzling light; then it is revealed as faith in Christ’s steadfast love for us, a love capable of embracing death to bring us salvation. This love, which did not recoil before death in order to show its depth, is something I can believe in; Christ’s total self-gift overcomes every suspicion and enables me to entrust myself to him completely (§16).

• This quote is significant in relation to Dostoevsky’s vision of beauty for a number of reasons. Like “beauty will save the world,” it comes from The Idiot and refers to Prince Myskin. Second, it points to a central theme of the novel, the struggle with beauty, physically and spiritually, in the midst of suffering. Third, this struggle and tension between physical and spiritual beauty becomes a central motif in the engagement of modern culture. In the midst of sickness, how can one perceive beauty clearly? Beauty should be a path to truth, and thus faith, but the modern world itself is disfigured and trapped in darkness. It has a kind of spiritual epilepsy, an internal, maddening sickness, which, unlike for Myskin, impairs the perception of true beauty.

Prince Myskin: “What matter though it be only disease, an abnormal tension of the brain, if when I recall and analyze the moment, it seems to have been one of harmony and beauty in the highest degree—an instant of deepest sensation, overflowing with unbounded joy and rapture, ecstatic devotion, and completest life?”

Dostoevsky’s remark, ‘Beauty will save the world,’ was not a careless phrase but a prophecy. Alexander Solzhenitsyn Noble lecture.

Michael D. O’Brien: “Beauty will save the world.” This oft-quoted maxim of Dostoevsky’s, derived from The Idiot, is widely misunderstood and misused in our times. As the author demonstrates throughout the novel, beauty alone cannot save the world. However, one of his primary insights, …is that beauty and suffering can seize the human heart of the observer for reasons other than carnality or even romanticized idealized attraction, …As the lover grows in love of the beloved, he must continuously seek the ultimate good of the beloved. If his love is to avoid degenerating into selfishness, it must become more and more Christ-like.

The beauty that will save the world is the love of God. This love is both human and supernatural in character, but it germinates, flowers, and comes to fruition only in a crucified heart. Only the heart united with Christ on the Cross is able to love another as himself, and as God loves him. Only such a heart can pass through the narrow gate of the Cross and live in the light of Resurrection. The good news is that this resurrection begins here and now.

**25. Conclusion • Slides: Dappled Things/Psalms 26 & 27**

So it is through the love of God that we attain the beauty we so long for. And whether it is in the beauty of nature or in the transcendence of our art we see, know and love our God through dappled images of the Creation He saw that was very good.

Glory be to God for dappled things… He fathers-forth whose beauty is past change: Praise him. Gerard Manley Hopkins Pied Beauty

I love the house where you live, O LORD, the place where your glory dwells. Psalm 26:8

One thing I have asked from the LORD, that I shall seek: That I may dwell in the house of the LORD all the days of my life, to behold the beauty of the LORD and to meditate in His temple. Psalm 27:4