

This is a rubric created by the College-Community Partnership for Racial Justice and the Levitt Center for Public Affairs at Hamilton College. It follows guidance for police reform in New York State published in Executive Order 203 of June, 2020 and the *New York State Police Reform and Reinvention Collaborative: Resources and Guides for Public Officials and Citizens*, distributed in August, 2020. Each police reform plan submitted to the State by local governments is examined using this rubric and graded on ten criteria from 0-3 with a final score out of a possible 30.

- A score of **ZERO** means that nothing about the criterion is stated in the plan.
- A score of **ONE** means that the criterion is mentioned.
- **TWO** means that the criterion was specified according to State guidance.
- A **THREE** indicates that practical steps to achieve the criterion are specified.

The scores indicate the way public officials in each jurisdiction approached the mandatory police reform planning process and what might be considered to augment plans submitted to the State by last April 1st.

The entire set of 492 police reform plans can be found at:

<https://policereform.ny.gov/police-reform-plans>

Criteria	Contextual Meaning	Examples
Agency Control of Use of Force	<p>Within police departments, officers and personnel hold each other accountable for their actions. Officers are expected to intervene if they observe misconduct.</p> <p>Use of force is a term used by police that describes the amount and degree of effort that an officer uses in a situation. The concept originated in the 1960s when situational guidelines for force were developed.¹ Levels include verbal commands, less-lethal force, and lethal force. The level of force used is expected to correspond to the level of offender resistance and/or threat.</p>	<p>-Early Intervention System²</p> <p>-Included in performance reviews³</p> <p>-Internal review of all incidents⁴</p> <p>-Duty of Fellow Officers to Intervene⁵</p>
Community Engagement	<p>Municipalities find ways to engage citizens and amplify their voices. The police program time and methods to understand the people they serve, particularly those in marginalized groups, in order</p>	<p>-Community policing plan⁷</p> <p>-Community policing measures in performance review⁸</p> <p>-Periodic assessment of public</p>

¹ Rizer, A., & Mooney, E. (2020, May 21). *The Evolution of Modern Use-of-Force Policies and the Need for Professionalism in Policing*. The Federalist Society. <https://fedsoc.org/commentary/publications/the-evolution-of-modern-use-of-force-policies-and-the-need-for-professionalism-in-policing>.

² *New York State Police Reform and Reinvention Collaborative Resources & Guide for Public Officials and Citizens*. (2020, August). 59. https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/Police_Reform_Workbook81720.pdf?ver=1622140262761.

³ *NYS Guide*. 58.

⁴ *NYS Guide*. 57-58.

⁵ *NYS Guide*. 60-61.

⁷ *NYS Guide*. 23.

⁸ *NYS Guide*. 23.

	to build relationships and trust through sustained dialogue. “Community engagement is imperative to forming trust between officers and the citizens in the neighborhoods they police.” ⁶	opinion and experience (meetings, surveys) ⁹
Anti-Racism	Anti-racism acknowledges historical bias and exclusion of racial and ethnic minorities. The municipality and police department change policies and create new ones to address and prevent bias in law enforcement. This criterion refers to practices both internal and external to the police department.	-Human rights commission or agency in the jurisdiction ¹⁰ -Civil rights or procedural justice committee of jurisdiction’s legislature ¹¹ -Racial justice programming in the jurisdiction ¹²
Shared Responsibility for Community Wellness	Community wellness is a holistic approach to political, economic, and social needs in a given jurisdiction. The <i>New York State Police Reform and Reinvention Collaborative: Resources and Guides for Public Officials and Citizens</i> refers to this as “adjusting the scope of responsibilities assigned to the police department and adjusting its budget correspondingly, shifting resources to social services, community programs, housing, and education to focus on crime reduction.” ¹³	-Mental health and/or domestic violence co-response teams ¹⁵ -Non-police control of school discipline ¹⁶ -Non-police intervention in drug addiction and low-level drug dealing ¹⁷

⁶ NYS Guide. 42.

⁹ NYS Guide. 71.

¹⁰ NYS Guide. 61-62.

¹¹ NYS Guide. 66-67, 69.

¹² NYS Guide. 98-100.

¹³ NYS Guide. 9.

¹⁵ NYS Guide. 13.

¹⁶ NYS Guide. 18-19.

¹⁷ NYS Guide. 13.

	<p>“Some stakeholders have suggested that functions currently performed by uniformed officers could instead be assigned to civilian employees in the police or other departments, particularly functions that involve interactions with citizens and that do not call for an arrest or potential use of force.”¹⁴</p>	
Citizen Oversight	<p>Independent, citizen led oversight of the police is the cornerstone of democratic accountability of law enforcement. The <i>New York State Police Reform and Reinvention Collaborative: Resources and Guides for Public Officials and Citizens</i> adds that “civilian oversight entities have formal duties and authorities.”¹⁸</p>	<p>-Appointed or elected citizen board to review complaints¹⁹ -Referral of complaints to independent third party for investigation e.g. independent investigator, Human Rights Commission, etc²⁰</p>
Role of Police & Culture	<p>The culture of a police department is critical to developing trust and mutual respect between law enforcement and the community. Organizational cultures develop patterns and perspectives over time that may be unnoticed by those working within them. Formal review is required to evaluate</p>	<p>-Internal review of police agency culture (informal procedures and ‘locker-room’ culture)²¹ -External review of police agency culture (informal</p>

¹⁴ NYS Guide. 19.

¹⁸ NYS Guide. 64.

¹⁹ College-Community Partnership for Racial Justice. (2021, February). 60-64. *Best Practices for Police Reform*. Community 4 Justice.
[https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20\(1\).pdf?ver=1625148914461](https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20(1).pdf?ver=1625148914461).

²⁰ NYS Guide. 62.

²¹ College-Community Partnership for Racial Justice. (2021, February). 104-105. *Best Practices for Police Reform*. Community 4 Justice.
[https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20\(1\).pdf?ver=1625148914461](https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20(1).pdf?ver=1625148914461).

	the effects of police culture on officer behavior and community relations.	procedures and ‘locker-room’ culture) ²²
Accreditation	Accreditation is “a useful tool that enables external review of agency policies, procedures, and practices to improve the standards of your police department and quality of your policing services.” ²³ To become accredited, a police department goes through steps including self-assessment and an external commission review. ²⁴ Accreditation increases accountability through requirements that ensure transparency and build trust. ²⁵	-CALEA accreditation ²⁶
Recruiting, Retaining, and Advancing Diverse Police Officers	A police agency that mirrors the population it serves includes perspectives that help counteract negative, harmful stereotypes and biases. This criterion addresses “obstacles to promotion,	-Outreach to youth in diverse communities ²⁸ -Creation of cadet corps ²⁹ -Police athletic leagues in communities of color ³⁰

²² College-Community Partnership for Racial Justice. (2021, February). 105. *Best Practices for Police Reform*. Community 4 Justice. [https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20\(1\).pdf?ver=1625148914461](https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20(1).pdf?ver=1625148914461).

²³ *NYS Guide*. 69.

²⁴ CALEA Accreditation. (n.d.). <https://www.chp.ca.gov/home/about-us/accreditation/calea-accreditation>.

²⁵ Accreditation is a resource intensive process that often requires more personnel. This often makes it more difficult for smaller departments to obtain.

²⁶ CALEA Accreditation. (n.d.). <https://www.chp.ca.gov/home/about-us/accreditation/calea-accreditation>.

²⁸ *NYS Guide*. 15, 38.

²⁹ *NYS Guide*. 87-88.

³⁰ *NYS Guide*. 45.

	ranging from outright bias and discrimination to less insidious but no less harmful factors such as a lack of transparency about the promotion process, or inadequate mentoring relationships and professional development opportunities.” ²⁷	-Cluster hiring ³¹ -Mentorship of minority recruits ³²
Training	Enhanced academy and in-service training should address situations that are conducive to unfair or presumptive interactions with citizens. This includes implicit bias training. Such training will reinforce “values such as accountability, transparency, and fairness in all aspects of policing.” ³³	-Procedural justice training ³⁴
Officer Wellness	“Law enforcement is inherently a physically and emotionally dangerous career. Studies show that people working in law enforcement are at an elevated risk of physical and mental health issues	-Annual physical and psychological evaluation ³⁶ -Retained counselor ³⁷ -Support for college education ³⁸

²⁷ NYS Guide. 88.

³¹ College-Community Partnership for Racial Justice. (2021, February). 110-111. *Best Practices for Police Reform. Community 4 Justice.*
[https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20\(1\).pdf?ver=1625148914461](https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/ce52a1be-8002-4cee-b3c7-7e8a1757ab6d/downloads/BEST%20PRACTICES%20FOR%20POLICE%20REFORM%20Feb%2021%20(1).pdf?ver=1625148914461).

³² NYS Guide. 85.

³³ NYS Guide. 89.

³⁴ NYS Guide. 91.

³⁶ Roufa, T. (2021, July 6). *Learn About the Psychological Tests and Screening for Police Officers.* The Balance Careers.
<https://www.thebalancecareers.com/psychological-exams-and-screening-for-police-officers-974785>.

³⁷ NYS Guide. 106-107.

³⁸ Commentary, G. (2021, March 26). *Mandate higher education for California police officers.* CalMatters.
<https://calmatters.org/commentary/my-turn/2021/03/mandate-higher-education-for-california-police-officers/>.

	<p>when compared to the general population.”³⁵</p> <p>In order to support officers, a counselor should be available to help officers understand the stress and mental demands of the job and to support officers after traumatic incidents.</p>	<p>-College degrees can benefit police officers in many areas, including their attitudes³⁹</p>
--	--	---

³⁵ *NYS Guide*. 103.

³⁹ Basham, S. (n.d.). *Education Offers Best Solution for Police Misconduct*. policechiefmagazine.org.
<https://www.policechiefmagazine.org/education-offers-best-solution-for-police-misconduct/>.