TUCSON UNIFIED
SCHOOL DISTRICT

November 23, 2021

Human Resources Department
Review of Hiring Process

Tucson Unified School District | 1010 E. Tenth Street, Tucson, AZ, 85719
Desk Phone 520-225-6073

The Office of Internal Audit has completed the assessment of the Human Resources (HR) hiring process. This review was requested by the Governing Board. It was scheduled and performed as an added assignment to the originally provided Annual Audit Plan.

This report deviates from the traditional internal audit report format due to the individuality of the assignment. There are no district criteria or industry benchmarks that directly address the unique elements necessary to effectively measure the TUSD's hiring process. The letter of intent stated this would be a function-specific audit. However, for efficiency and effectiveness, the audit and its reporting format were modified to a review of the HR hiring process.

Reviews are nonconforming, they:

- Focus on unique areas, including but not limited to, pre-evaluations of software purchases, implementation of new processes, upgrades and/or changes within the organization that lack conventional measures.

- Use key evaluating elements to identifying activities that deviate from expectations.

- Have a lean report format; content is limited to listing identified deviations.

- Do not require management to respond to the listed observations.

- Limit the report distribution to need to know recipients.

The Human Resources (HR) Department is responsible for overseeing processes that include recruitment, training, staffing, retirement, etc. HR's employment and recruitment functions include recruiting qualified and diverse candidates for school sites, programs, and district staffing needs. The department is managed by the Human Resources Executive Director and assisted by its HR Leadership Team (HRLT).

"The TUSD Recruitment Function, A Guided book for New Employees" states "We're hiring to continue to provide excellent service to our faculty and staff. Your role is critical to help us find and retain the talent we need, to ensure the continued academic, health, social and emotional success of our 42,000 students and 7500 staff. TUSD is a great place to work, and with you on our team, we will continue to build on our success and reputation in the Tucson community. "

The purpose of the review was to evaluate the overall HR hiring process and procedures; the focus was on performance, timelines, and to identify areas of potential improvement.

The scope of the review: July 1, 2020 through September 30, 2021.

Methodology:
Conducted meetings and interviews with schools, departments, and HR staff.
Performed reviews of electronic documents.
Analyzed data in Infinite Visions (iVisions), TalentED, and "Complete Payroll" report from TimeClock Plus.

Sample:

A random sample of one hundred names from a population of 4,222 was collected from the two systems - iVisions and TalentEd-. The sample contained a mixture of Employee Personnel Application Requests (ePAR's) position requests, new hire assignments, current employee assignments, and staff termination requests. Names from the sample were cross referenced between all three sources.

Terminology:

iVisons Web Portal: It the system used by TUSD to manage district positions and employee records.

TalentEd: Is TUSD's Application Tracking System for posting jobs for recruitment and completing hires.

ePAR: Electronic Personnel Action Request (ePAR), is the electronic form to process hiring, pay, position, and termination transaction or all employees. It triggers and instruct Finance, HR, and Payroll to make changes/additions to employee positions and pay.

Deviations: Segmented into the three different categories below:

1. Supplemental discoveries: Issues, concerns, and/or discrepancies in the three sources:

- Overuse of an undefined task title "Current Employee Assignment" and an inconsistent use of the title "New Hire".

- Duplicated ePAR identification numbers, from one school year to the next, and also within the same school year. Assigned ePAR numbers are intended to identify specific processes. Duplicating or reusing these numbers makes it difficult to track and identify specific processes.
  - o Potential Improvement: Consider starting all e-PAR numbers with a two digit year code and a hyphen.

- Some of the documented processes did not include dates.

- "Job Lifecycle flowchart" which is part of the instructions provided to the HR staff, is missing steps and includes steps that are out of order.

- Employees getting paid extended shifts without breaks, up to 16.75 consecutive hours per shift.

- Most of the employee hours are being calculated and paid in 15 minute increments while others are being calculated and paid to the exact minute.

- After the fact ePAR's. Over 7% of the ePARs in the sample were submitted after the recorded completion date.

2. Supplemental discovery: Inefficiencies with in the HR Department:

- Inadequate training for HR staff results in unqualified personnel performing tasks above their current skill and proficiency level. Developed proficiency should not be considered a replacement for proper training. Staff members should be properly and fully trained prior to receiving assignments. All staff members should be provided a complete, accurate, and detailed instruction manual for all systems.

- Lack of consistency in the way individual associates perform their tasks and record their information. There is no consistency for tracking processes in the system. Associates also have significant variation in tracking their pending tasks. Examples include Excel spreadsheets, paper calendars, calendar reminders, or personal notes.

- The amount of overtime currently being approved on a regular basis would nearly cover the cost of three full time employees. The department is currently paying out an average of 79 hours of overtime every week. 79 hours of overtime is equivalent to approximately 118.5 hours of regular pay. The current overtime expense would cover 98% of the salaries to three additional full time employees. Overtime should be a temporary solution to temporary staff shortages, not a permanent practice.

- Paper files – There is a significant amount of time, resources, and storage space dedicated to paper files. There is currently no known requirement for any of the HR data to be stored as hard copies.

- The current HR Training manual is lacking. "THE TUSD RECRUITMENT FUNCTION A Guidebook for New Employees" is a general overview but does not include complete or step by step instructions.

- HR is allowing individual sites to circumvent the final steps of the hiring process.
  This results in:
    o Instances of new hires starting before they are officially employed by TUSD.
    o HR being required to backdate hiring steps and processes.
    o Backdating these particular steps is creating an illusion that these specific tasks are taking longer than they actually are.

- The systems –iVision and TalentEd – are not integrated, and require duplicate data to be entered manually and individually into each system.

- TalentEd application management is not regularly updated. The active tab under the "Status" contained applicants noted by HR as having "accepted other offer", not eligible, or inactive. It also had a couple of applications dated over eight months old, and several over five months.

3. Processing time for new hires:

- The average time from receiving a complete request to fill a position, to an individual's first day on the job is approximately 11 weeks.

- Of those 11 weeks, approximately 6-7 weeks are already at the minimum timelines such as:

- o Number of days for ad postings.
  - o Interviews by the department.
  - o Number of days for background checks.
  - o Candidate's review of offer letter.
  - o Testing or verification of credentials.
  - o Candidate's submission of required documentation.
  - o Scheduling orientation date.
- The remaining tasks of the hiring process are being performed by TUSD HR department in an average of 4 weeks.

- Based on interviews with the HR Staff this 4 week period could potentially be shortened to 1 week of accumulated time. This potential increase to efficiency has several variables of consideration.
  - o It is apparent that the current HR staff has a high workload.
  - o Some of the staff is not able to use either of the systems efficiently or effectively.

- The aforementioned timelines are averages based on normal circumstances. Exceptions to these averages would be employees that require additional vetting or verifications, such as:
  - o Coaches: First Aid and Cardiovascular Pulmonary Recitation (CPR) certifications.
  - o School Bus Drivers: Obtaining their Commercial Driver's License (CDL) may be part of their hiring process.
  - o Anyone requiring Paraprofessional testing in lieu of actual experience.

Conclusion

The purpose of this evaluation was to provide reasonable assurance on the requested assignment. The conducted evaluation was performed using due professional care; the information reviewed provides a reasonable basis for the conclusions.

Appreciation is extended to the Human Resources Department staff and the visited sites for their time, assistance, and cooperation during this review.

Respectfully,

Office of Internal Audit
Martha Smith
Martha Smith
11/23/2021