

Claremont Graduate University

Fall 2023

## PP338. Policy Design and Implementation

### *Class Instructor*

Robert Klitgaard, University Professor

Office: Harper 57

Phone: Cell (909) 257-4175

E-mail: [robert.klitgaard@cgu.edu](mailto:robert.klitgaard@cgu.edu)

Drop-by hours: Tuesdays 9 to 11:45 am or by appointment.

### *Class Schedule*

Semester start/end dates: August 31–December 14.

Meeting day, time: Thursdays 4:00–6:50 pm

Format: Online only.

## Overview

### *Course Description*

How can policy analysis and evaluation help us devise better public policies—and then make them work in practice? This graduate seminar begins with some of the big objectives of public policy, including sustainability, equality, and human flourishing. It moves to classic topics such as estimating the effects of policy changes and then implementing them in practice. It explores cutting-edge themes such as public-private-nonprofit partnerships, cultural diversity, and inclusive processes to engage citizens and policymakers.

The course is designed to suit CGU students from public policy, evaluation, public health, education, economics, business, and information systems and technology.

### *Tailored to Your Interests*

The course is designed to dovetail with each student's policy interests and ongoing projects. In the beginning of the course, you will be asked to select a policy issue to focus on during the course. So, when we discuss policy goals like sustainability, equality, and human flourishing, you will have a chance to apply general readings to your topic. When we consider composite measures, you will explore what measures are used in your policy area. When we discuss how cultural diversity affects the design and implementation of policies and projects, you will have the chance to apply the ideas to your own topic.

### *Artificial Intelligence*

Throughout the course, we will make great use of ChatGPT4. For example, you will use ChatGPT4 as your personal tutor. To help you get started on a policy research project. To anticipate politicized reactions to policy analyses—and take preventive measures. To be your research

assistant, including data analysis. And even to help you with practical questions like proposal writing, fundraising, and counseling on career choices.

Please download ChatGPT4 and be ready to use it in our first class on August 31. ChatGPT4 costs \$20/month, and it is so worth it. Here is to sign up for it. <https://www.zdnet.com/article/how-to-subscribe-to-chatgpt-plus-and-why/>

### *Background Preparation (Prerequisites)*

Students are welcome from throughout CGU and the Claremont Colleges, with the permission of the professor. There are no prerequisites.

### *Learning Outcomes*

By the end of this course, you will be able to:

1. Consider the goals of public policy with subtlety and humility.
2. Design a policy analysis that will help people assess what could work in their particular contexts.
3. Evaluate the uses of randomized controlled trials and econometric methods.
4. Forecast the unintended consequences of policies and programs—and take them into account in design and implementation.
5. Find and learn from successful policies and projects.
6. Create processes to involve stakeholders in design and implementation.

### *Assignments and Assessments*

The reading list includes a suggested time budget for each piece.

The required readings include much or all of these three books:

Gawande, Atul (2010) *The Checklist Manifesto: How to Get Things Right*. New York: Macmillan.

Heath, Chip, and Dan Heath (2010) *Switch: How to Change Things When Change Is Hard*. New York: Broadway Books.

Klitgaard, Robert (2021) *The Culture and Development Manifesto*. New York: Oxford University Press.

This book is available free: Klitgaard, Robert (2023) *Bold and Humble: How to Lead Public-Private-Citizen Collaboration, with Five Success Stories* <https://rigss.bt/publications>

In some of the classes, individual students will make short briefings on readings. You will have ample notice. The purpose of these presentations is to *stimulate discussion*, not to summarize exhaustively a particular work—which in any case would be impossible in a short time. We will review good practice in preparing visual aids and giving briefings. A useful resource is RAND Corporation (1996) “Guidelines for Preparing Briefings.”

<https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a317235.pdf>

This graduate seminar depends on your careful preparation and enthusiastic participation. If for some reason you are unable to do the reading and prepare for a given class, please email me in advance.

Assignments—including discussions on Canvas and briefings—and participation in class count for 35 percent of the final grade. The mid-term exam on October 19 counts for 25 percent of the final grade. The final examination on December 14 counts for 40 percent. Both exams are open book and open notes; each is designed to take two hours, but students are allowed to spend up to three hours.

\* \* \* \* \*

Claremont Graduate University's description of course requirements appears at the end of this syllabus.

## Class Schedule

Estimated reading or watching times are indicated in parentheses.

\* Materials marked with an asterisk are optional.

### *Module 1. August 31. Introduction*

Introductions of participants. Overview of the course. The evolution of policy analysis.

#### *Discussion on Canvas:*

Please post on Canvas under Discussions before 5:00 p.m. on August 30 (the day before class).

Please share a big policy issue that fascinates and troubles you. Illustrative examples: overcoming ethnic disparities, pre-school, homelessness, corruption, mental illness, affirmative action, rural development, reconstruction and reform in Ukraine, universal basic income, climate change, migration, “the baby bust,” and Covid-19: lessons for next time. (Two paragraphs.)

#### *Assignment:*

Please subscribe to ChatGPT4.

### *Module 2. Sept. 7. My Policy Issue*

We'll decide on teams of 2 to 3 people who will take on a policy issue together during the course. In class, we will use AI tools to lay out the problem, suggest examples of things that have worked in addressing the problem, develop those examples into “teaching cases,” and consider what could be done if we had all the proverbial answers.

#### *Assignment:*

Compton, Mallory E., and Paul 't Hart, eds. (2019) *Great Policy Successes*, ed. New York: Oxford University Press. Chapter 1. (One hour.)

<https://academic.oup.com/book/42635/chapter/358101222>

Mitchell, Gregory, and Philip E. Tetlock (2022) “Are Progressives in Denial About Progress? Yes, but So Is Almost Everyone Else” *Clinical Psychological Science* 1–22, December. (One hour.) <https://doi.org/10.1177/21677026221114315>

Hervey, Angus (2023) “Why Are We So Bad at Reporting Good News?” Ted Talk, April. (About 15 minutes). <https://youtu.be/x5mAqRx62rk>

Shah, Vikas (2023) “A Conversation with Bjørn Lomborg on the 12 Most Efficient & Impactful Solutions to Our World’s Most Important Challenges” ThoughtNomics blog, August 1. (30 minutes.) <https://thoughtnomics.com/bjorn-lomborg>

\* Pinker, Steven (2018) *Enlightenment Now: The Case for Reason, Science, Humanism, and Progress*. New York: Penguin Books.

\* Dorn, Emma (2023) “Behind the scenes of Mississippi’s school turnaround with Carey Wright.” An interview. (15 minutes) <https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/education/our-insights/behind-the-scenes-of-mississippis-school-turnaround-with-carey-wright>

\* The World Bank (2023) “What Works to Narrow Gender Gaps and Empower Women in Sub-Saharan Africa? A summary of eight ‘evidence briefs.’” (20 minutes) <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/publication/what-works-to-narrow-gender-gaps-and-empower-women-in-sub-saharan-africa>

### *Module 3. Sept. 14. What Is Good Policy Analysis?*

#### *Case Study: Climate Change*

Watch UN Secretary General António Guterres at the 2023 World Economic Forum, January 18 (15 minutes, from about minute 4 to about minute 19) <https://youtu.be/TlsT6FzPraY>

Watch Johan Rockström at the 2023 World Economic Forum, January 18 (the first few minutes—watch more of course if you wish) <https://www.weforum.org/events/world-economic-forum-annual-meeting-2023/sessions/leading-the-charge-through-earths-new-normal>

Watch Konstantin Kisin at the Oxford Union, January 16, 2023 (about 10 minutes) <https://youtu.be/zJdqJu-6ZPo>

Watch Hank Green “The Biggest Science Story of the Week.” Vlogbrothers. August 4, 2023 (7 minutes) <https://youtu.be/dk8pwE3lByg>

Schelling, Thomas C. (1992) “Some Economics of Global Warming.” *American Economic Review* 82(1): 1–14. On Canvas. (2 hours.)

Robert, Christopher, and Richard J. Zeckhauser (2011) “The Methodology of Normative Policy Analysis.” *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management* 30(3): 613–643. (2 hours.) [https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/rzeckhauser/files/methodology\\_of\\_normative\\_policy\\_analysis.pdf](https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/rzeckhauser/files/methodology_of_normative_policy_analysis.pdf)

#### *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Use our canonical tutor prompt to have a conversation with ChatGPT about climate change policies. Don’t stop with a carbon tax! Focus on policy design and implementation.

Be prepared to share what you learned in class about (a) the strengths and weaknesses of ChatGPT and (b) the kinds of benefits and costs that should be considered in policies to deal with climate change.

#### *Discussion on Canvas*

What stand out to you as two strengths of Schelling's paper in terms of guiding policy design and implementation? No more than three paragraphs.

Please share on Canvas before 5:00 p.m. on Sept. 13 (the day before class). After you submit your answer, please comment on at least two of the posts of your colleagues.

#### *Module 4. Sept. 21. What Are We Trying to Do? Goals and Measures (1)*

##### *a. Case Study: Equality*

Peter G. Peterson Foundation (2019) "Income and Wealth in the United States: An Overview of Recent Data." 4 October. (15 minutes) <https://www.pgpf.org/blog/2019/10/income-and-wealth-in-the-united-states-an-overview-of-data>

\* Nature (2023) "Editorial: Reducing inequality benefits everyone — so why isn't it happening?" *Nature*. August 16. (5 minutes.) <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-023-02551-3>

\* Follett, Chelsea, and Vincent Gelosos (2023) "Global Inequality in Well-Being Has Decreased across Many Dimensions: Introducing the Inequality of Human Progress Index." *CATO Policy Analysis*, No. 949. June 8. (45 minutes.) <https://www.cato.org/policy-analysis/global-inequality-well-being-has-decreased-across-many-dimensions>

\* Heathcote, Jonathan, Fabrizio Perri, Giovanni L. Violante, and Lichen Zhang (2023) "More Unequal We Stand? Inequality Dynamics in the United States, 1967–2021." *Review of Economic Dynamics*. Pre-proof available online, August 9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.red.2023.07.014>

Rothman, Joshua (2020) "The Equality Conundrum: We All Agree That Inequality Is Bad. But What Kind of Equality is Good?" *The New Yorker* 13 January: 26–31. (1 hour). <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2020/01/13/the-equality-conundrum>

Skim Anderson, Elizabeth (1999) "What Is the Point of Equality?" *Ethics* 109: 287–337. (Don't spend more than one hour—unless you're enthralled.) <https://www.philosophy.rutgers.edu/joomlatools-files/docman-files/4ElizabethAnderson.pdf>

Blanchard, Olivier, and Dani Rodrik (2019) "We Have the Tools to Reverse the Rise in Inequality." Peterson Institute for International Economics. 20 November. (30 minutes.) <https://www.piie.com/commentary/speeches-papers/we-have-tools-reverse-rise-inequality>

##### *b. "Predistribution": The Case of Preschool*

<https://heckmanequation.org>

Please spend an hour or more browsing this website by Nobel prize winner James Heckman, in particular Perry Preschool Research and 13% ROI for Birth-to-Five Programs.

Bailey, Martha J., Shuqiao Sun, and Brenden D. Timpe (2021) "Evaluating the Head Start Program for Disadvantaged Students." *The Digest*, No. 4 (April) National Bureau of Economic Research.

(15 minutes.) <https://www.nber.org/digest-202104/evaluating-head-start-program-disadvantaged-children>

Gertler, Paul, et al. (2021) "Effect of the Jamaica Early Childhood Stimulation Intervention on Labor Market Outcomes at Age 31," Unpublished ms. July 21. Abstract

We report the labor market effects of the Jamaica Early Childhood Stimulation intervention at age 31. The study is a small-sample randomized early childhood education stimulation intervention targeting stunted children living in the poor neighborhoods of Kingston, Jamaica. Implemented in 1987-1989, treatment consisted of a two-year home-based intervention designed

to improve nutrition and the quality of mother-child interactions to foster cognitive, language and psycho-social skills. The original sample is 127 stunted children between 9 and 24 months old. Our study is able to track and interview 75% of the original sample 30 years after the intervention, both still living in Jamaica and migrated abroad. We find large and statistically significant effects on income and schooling; the treatment group had 43% higher hourly wages and 37% higher earnings than the control group. This is a large increase over the treatment effect at age 22 where we observed a 25% increase in earnings.

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1ryCOPx4VAC0LIUJMSckbKDbIByHpeYTL/view?pli=1>

Gertler, Paul *et al.* (2014) "Labor Market Returns to an Early Childhood Stimulation Intervention in Jamaica," *Science* Vol. 344 (6187): 998–1001. Please also skim the supplementary materials at the end of the article. (One hour)

<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4574862/>

\* Devercelli, Amanda, Magdalena Bendini, Amer Hassan, and Sherri Le Mottee (2022) "Learning During the Early Years: What Is it? Why Does It Matter? And How Do We Promote It?" World Bank Brief. March. (15 minutes).

<https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099425203102220416/pdf/P16951303b956d040083410ab7f69343a45.pdf>

\* The RAND Corporation (2022) on early childhood education.

<https://www.rand.org/topics/early-childhood-education.html>

*Assignment (nothing to submit):*

1. Please use ChatGPT to explore concepts of "equality" and "equity." Please be prepared to discuss your results in class, both about ChatGPT and about these concepts.
2. How does your policy issue intersect with the goal of equality? What did you learn from this week that enhances your approach to the issue?

## Module 5. Sept. 28. What Are We Trying to Do? Goals and Measures (2)

### a. Composite Indicators

Skim OECD (2008) *Handbook on Constructing Composite Indicators: Methodology and User Guide*. Paris: OECD. Please spend about 1 hour capturing the basic ideas and the complexities.  
<https://www.oecd.org/sdd/42495745.pdf>

Please browse the remarkable resources on the website *Our World in Data*. (30 minutes)  
<https://ourworldindata.org>

Klitgaard, Robert (2007) "Contested Summary Measures," Claremont Graduate University. (20 minutes.) [https://scholar.cgu.edu/robert-klitgaard/wp-content/uploads/sites/22/2017/02/Contested\\_Summary\\_Measures\\_10-07.pdf](https://scholar.cgu.edu/robert-klitgaard/wp-content/uploads/sites/22/2017/02/Contested_Summary_Measures_10-07.pdf)

### b. Case Study: Happiness and Wellbeing

*World Happiness Report 2023*. New York: Sustainable Development Solutions Network.  
<https://worldhappiness.report/ed/2023/>. (Total under two hours.)

- Read about the WHR2023: <https://worldhappiness.report/about/> (15 minutes.) Then look at the executive summary <https://worldhappiness.report/ed/2023/executive-summary/> (10 minutes.) Explore the data on happiness. <https://worldhappiness.report/data/> (15 minutes).
- Read Chapter 3: Besley, Timothy, Joseph Marshall, and Torsten Persson (2023). "Well-being and State Effectiveness." <https://worldhappiness.report/ed/2023/well-being-and-state-effectiveness/>. (One hour).

Blanchflower, David G., and Alex Bryson (2022) "Wellbeing Rankings." IZA DP No. 15790. Bonn: IZA Institute of Labor Economics, December. Read pages 5–10 and skim the rest. Find your country and/or state in the rankings and compare with other locations you know. (45 minutes)  
<https://docs.iza.org/dp15790.pdf>

Centre for Bhutan Studies and GNH Research (2015) "Bhutan's 2015 Gross National Happiness Index." Thimphu, Bhutan. November, 8 pages. (15 minutes.) On Canvas.

Please watch this talk by Tshering Tobgay, then Prime Minister of Bhutan, "Gross National Happiness," Dubai, 2017. (32 minutes.) <https://youtu.be/KZUWSVFT9A>

\* Alexandrova, Anna, and Mark Fabian (2022) *The Science of Wellbeing*. John Templeton Foundation. 63 pages. February. [https://www.templeton.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/Science\\_of\\_Wellbeing\\_JTF\\_1.pdf](https://www.templeton.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/Science_of_Wellbeing_JTF_1.pdf)

\* Lomas, Tim (2023) "Exploring associations between income and wellbeing: new global insights from the Gallup World Poll," *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, published online August 20.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/17439760.2023.2248963>

*Assignment (nothing to submit)*

Please use ChatGPT to explore the concept and use of "composite indicators." :

- a. Explore concepts and measures of "human flourishing" and "happiness."

b. Find out what composite indicators are relevant to your policy area.

Please be prepared to discuss your results in class.

### *Module 6. Oct. 5. What Will Work Here?*

Imbens, Guido W. (2022) "Causality in Econometrics: Choice vs Chance." Nobel Prize Lecture. *Econometrica* 90(6): 2541–2566. (2½ hours). On Canvas.

Deaton, Angus, and Nancy Cartwright (2016) "The Limitations of Randomised Controlled Trials." Blog, Vox EU and Centre for Economic Policy Research. 9 November (20 minutes)  
<https://cepr.org/voxeu/columns/limitations-randomised-controlled-trials>

Wagenmakers, Eric-Jan *et al.* (2021) "Seven Steps toward More Transparency in Statistical Practice." *Nature Human Behavior* 8 pages. (45 minutes.)  
<https://www.nature.com/articles/s41562-021-01211-8.pdf>

#### *Discussion on Canvas:*

For what kinds of policy issues do you think a randomized controlled trial would make the most sense? For what kinds of issues would they not make sense? (Two paragraphs.)

Please post on Canvas under Discussions before 5:00 p.m. on October 4 (the day before class). After posting your contribution, please comment on the answers of at least two of your colleagues.

### *Module 7. Oct. 12. Checklists for Action*

Gawande, Atul (2010) *The Checklist Manifesto: How to Get Things Right*. New York: Macmillan. (6 hours.)

Klitgaard, *The Culture and Development Manifesto*, ch. 5 and pp. 104–106. (1 hour.)

#### *Case study: Overcoming Ethnic Inequalities*

McKinsey & Company (2021) *The Economic State of Black America: What Is and What Could Be*, overview. (1 hour.) <https://www.mckinsey.com/featured-insights/diversity-and-inclusion/the-economic-state-of-black-america-what-is-and-what-could-be#/>

Klitgaard, Robert (2021) *Adjusting to Reality: Beyond "State vs. Market" in Economic Development*. London: Routledge, ch. 12. (1½ hours.) If you get fascinated, also have a look at chs. 10–11. Available through Honnold-Mudd Library (online).

\* Quillian, Lincoln, Anthony Heath, Devah Pager, Arnfinn H. Midtbøen, Fenella Fleischmann, and Ole Hexel (2019) "Do Some Countries Discriminate More than Others? Evidence from 97 Field Experiments of Racial Discrimination in Hiring." *Sociological Science* 6: 467–496.

### *Oct. 19. Mid-Term Examination*

Open book and open notes. The exam is designed to take 2 hours, but students may use up to 3 hours to complete it.



## *Module 8. Oct. 26. Implementation 1*

Weimer, David L., and Aidan A. Vining (2017) *Policy Analysis: Concepts and Practice, 6th Ed.* New York: Routledge, Ch. 12, "Implementation," 280–303. (2 hours.) On Canvas.

Gawande, Atul (2013) "Slow Ideas." *The New Yorker*, July 29. (1½ hours.)

[http://www.newyorker.com/reporting/2013/07/29/130729fa\\_fact\\_gawande](http://www.newyorker.com/reporting/2013/07/29/130729fa_fact_gawande)

*Case study: Anti-poverty Programs*

Klitgaard, Robert (1997) "'Unanticipated Consequences' in Anti-Poverty Programs." *World Development* 25(12): 1963–72. December. (1½ hours.) On Canvas.

*Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Have a conversation with ChatGPT about poverty. Explore both data and policies. Be prepared to share what you learned in class.

## *Module 9 Nov. 2. Implementation 2*

Heath, Chip, and Dan Heath (2010) *Switch: How to Change Things When Change Is Hard.* New York: Broadway Books. (6 hours.)

*Case Study Presented in Class*

Statistical methods for identifying exceptional performers.

*Discussion on Canvas*

What idea in *Switch* struck you as most important and applicable to policy analysis? (Two paragraphs.)

Please post on Canvas under Discussions before 5:00 p.m. on Nov. 1 (the day before class). After posting, please comment on the answers of at least two of your colleagues.

## *Module 10. Nov. 9. Implementation 3*

Klitgaard, Robert (2023) *Bold and Humble: How to Lead Public-Private-Citizen Collaboration, with Five Success Stories.* Bhutan: Royal Institute for Governance and Strategic Studies. Available open access here: <https://robertklitgaard.com/bold-and-humble> (five hours).

\* Eggers, William D., and Donald F. Kettl (2023) *Bridgebuilders: How Government Can Transcend Boundaries to Solve Big Problems.* Boston: Harvard Business Review Press.

\* The World Bank (2023) *Private Cities: Outstanding Examples from Developing Countries and Their Implications for Urban Policy*, Edited by Yue Li and Martin Rama. Washington, DC: The World Bank. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/entities/publication/fccf4455-31c6-4edc-8816-6f66fe7a1a00?deliveryName=DM189843>

*Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Have a conversation with ChatGPT about public-private partnerships. Explore both data and examples of success. Look especially for things related to your policy issue. Be prepared to share what you learned in class.

## Module 11. Nov. 16 Taking Culture into Account

### a. Thinking about cultures and contexts

Klitgaard, *The Culture and Development Manifesto*, chs. 1, 5, 7–8. (4 hours.)

### b. Case Study: Overfishing.

Skim California Environmental Associates (2012) *Charting a Course to Sustainable Fisheries*. San Francisco: California Environmental Associates. Spend at least 1 hour with this exemplary analysis. On Canvas.

Poblete, JoAnna (2020) *Balancing the Tides: Marine Practices in American Sāmoa*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, pp. 111–142. (2 hours.)

<http://library.oapen.org/handle/20.500.12657/23603>

### Discussion on Canvas

How does cultural diversity affect programs in your policy area? (Two paragraphs.)

Please post on Canvas under Discussions before 5:00 p.m. on Nov. 15 (the day before class). After posting, please comment on the answers of at least two of your colleagues.

Nov. 23. Happy Thanksgiving!

## Module 12. Nov. 30. Policy Analysis and Evaluation 2.0

### a. Collaboration in Policy Design and Implementation

Klitgaard, *The Culture and Development Manifesto*, ch. 10. (One hour.)

Klitgaard, Robert (2019) “Engaging Corruption: New Ideas for the International Monetary Fund.” *Policy Design and Practice* 2(3): 229–242. (One hour)

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/25741292.2019.1612542>

Watch “Who’s Corrupt?” (2019) (about 35 minutes) — if you’re pressed for time, you can start at about minute 24. <https://youtu.be/q2JDxDrVMvU>

### b. Case Study: Improving Governance

Klitgaard, *Bold and Humble: How to Lead Public-Private-Nonprofit Collaboration, with Five Case Studies*, chapter 10. (1½ hours.)

### Assignment (nothing to write or submit):

Be prepared to discuss in class the questions at the end of Chapter 10 of *Bold and Humble*.

## Module 13. Dec. 7. Review of the Course

Selected students will make 10- to 15-minute briefings on various parts of the course. No additional readings.

## Dec. 14. Final Examination

This examination will cover the entire course. Open book and open notes. The exam is designed to take 2 hours, though students may use up to 3 hours to complete it.



