Claremont Graduate University

Spring 2023

TNDY 404 O
Collaboration Across the Public-Private Divide

Class Instructor

Robert Klitgaard, University Professor
Office: Harper 57
Phone: (909) 257-4175
E-mail: robert.klitgaard@cgu.edu
Drop-by hours: Tuesdays 9–11:45 a.m. or by appointment

Class Schedule

Semester start/end dates: January 16 – May 13.
Meeting day, time: Thursdays 7:00 – 9:50 pm
Course location: Online

Overview

Many of the most challenging problems facing our region and our world cannot be tackled by government alone. From health care to education, from poverty to social justice, from urban renewal to international development, effective projects and programs often require collaboration across the public-private-nonprofit divide.

This course explores how to design, lead, and manage collaboration across the public-private divide. We examine theoretical approaches to appraise when various forms of collaboration make sense. We consider the practical challenges of making public-private partnerships work, using outstanding case studies. Along the way, we reconsider the meaning and practice of leadership and governance.

Learning Objectives

1. Appraise the distinctive capabilities of different kinds of institutions.

2. Design collaborative arrangements.

3. Apply tools of leadership and management to public-private partnerships, including citizen empowerment.

4. Evaluate collaboration in terms of each partner, the partnership as an entity, and the attainment of public purposes.

5. Create a process that catalyzes problem-solving across the public-private divide.

Prerequisites

There are no curricular prerequisites.

Books

Robert Klitgaard. 2023. *Bold and Humble: How to Lead Public-Private-Citizen Collaboration, with Five Case Studies*. This book will be made available in digital form to all students.

Evaluation

Class Participation

Your participation in class counts for 25 percent of your final grade.

This seminar is highly participatory. Your careful preparation and enthusiastic participation are keys to your learning experience—and to the class's. If for some reason you are unable to come to a class or to prepare for it fully—things do happen—please let Prof. Klitgaard know in advance via email.

Many of our seminars will employ the case method. Here are some materials that introduce the method and describe how you can get the most from it:

1. https://www.hbs.edu/mba/academic-experience/Pages/the-hbs-case-method.aspx
2. "Learning by the Case Method," Harvard Business School (3 pages). https://www.google.com/search?client=safari&rls=en&sxsrf=ALiCzsbmmnP_D_KFiyzIKSpM-yW0uOcvvw:1672855211893&q=Harvard+Business+School+case+study+method+PDF&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjbk6mlv678AhVUI0QIHVU2D1UQ1QJ6BAhGEAE&biw=1231&bih=711&dpr=2
3. https://www.exed.hbs.edu/hbs-experience/learning-experience/case-study-method

Mid-Term Examination

The mid-term examination on March 9 counts for 25 percent of your final grade. This examination will be open-book and open-notes. The exam is designed to take two hours, but you will be allowed three hours to complete it.

Course Project

For the course project and some class assignments, you will be part of a transdisciplinary team of classmates from different disciplines and professions. The course project focuses on an example of a public-private-citizen partnership on a particular task or issue. The product is your team's design of a day-long event for leaders in the three sectors with the goal of stimulating collaboration and practical steps forward. More details will be supplied in the first weeks of the course. An initial, ungraded two-page prospectus is due before 5:00 p.m. on Sunday, February 5, via email to Prof. Klitgaard.

Teams will give an ungraded 15-minute briefing on their projects on April 27 and May 4. The purpose of this briefing is to get help from your classmates. More details under April 27 below.

Your report on the course project is due before 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, May 9. This report will be no longer than 5000 words (about 20 pages double-spaced), not counting references or tables. Details on what this report should contain will be provided later in the course.

The course project counts for 50 percent of your final grade.

There is no final examination.

Artificial Intelligence

An exciting development in higher education is the use of artificial intelligence (AI) tools. We will be exploring the use of ChatGPT (Generative Pre-trained Transformer). In November 2022, OpenAI made ChatGPT available for free: https://chat.openai.com/chat

Please download ChatGPT. Give it a try. Please be ready to use it in class on January 26.

* * * * *

Claremont Graduate University's description of course requirements appears at the end of this syllabus.

Schedule and Assignments

* Readings marked with an asterisk are optional.

January 19

Introduction of participants. Why is public-private-nonprofit collaboration so important today for leaders and managers in business, government, education, and civil society?

Robert Klitgaard. 2023. *Bold and Humble: How to Lead Public-Private-Citizen Collaboration, with Five Case Studies*, Preface and Chapter 1. Available on Canvas.

"Partnership for Dealing with Dropouts (A)," 8 pages. On Canvas.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

As preparation for class discussion, please consider the following questions:

1. What do you see as the advantages and disadvantages of a cross-age tutoring program?
2. What do you judge to be the critical activities that should be considered part of the program?
3. How might the partners combine forces in implementation?

January 26

1. Some examples of collaboration across the public-private-citizen divide.

Daniel P. Gitterman and Neil Britto. 2021. "The Intersector as a Tool to Address Intractable Problems," in *The Intersector: How the Public, Nonprofit, and Private Sectors Can Address America's Challenges*, ed. Daniel P. Gitterman and Neil Britto (Washington, DC: Brookings, 2021): 1–17. https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/9780815739029_intro.pdf

Howard W. Buffett and William B. Eimicke. 2018. "How Companies, Governments, and Nonprofits Can Create Social Change Together," *Harvard Business Review*. 31 May. https://hbr.org/2018/05/how-companies-governments-and-nonprofits-can-create-social-change-together

Please spend a half hour looking through the World Bank's resources on public-private partnerships: https://ppp.worldbank.org/public-private-partnership/

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Please consider an example that you know of collaboration across the public-private divide. What are its advantages and disadvantages? Be prepared to discuss them in class.

2. Case study

"A Cultural Festival for the Highlanders," ch. 2 of *Bold and Humble*, 13 pages. To be distributed.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Please prepare your answers for the questions on p. 33 to discuss in class.

February 2

1. Some design principles.

Bold and Humble, chs. 3–4, 25 pages. To be distributed.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Use ChatGPT to investigate some of these concepts from ch. 3 of *Bold and Humble*: rivalrous goods, excludable goods, private goods, public goods, common-pool resources, toll goods, externalities, and civil society organizations.

Working in your course-project teams, create a Zoom chat session to discuss what you learned from these explorations about the strengths and weaknesses of ChatGPT. Be prepared to share some of your findings in class.

2. Case study

"A Dump Outside Our Door," ch. 5 of *Bold and Humble*, 6 pages. To be distributed.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Please prepare your answers for the questions on p. 64 to discuss in class.

February 9

1. More on the design and management of collaboration

Bold and Humble, chs. 6–7, 28 pages. To be distributed.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Use ChatGPT to investigate some of these concepts on p. 65 of *Bold and Humble*: public-private partnerships, collaborative governance, network governance, cross-sector collaboration, participatory governance, coproduction, holistic governance, integrated governance, and interactive governance.

Working in your course-project teams, create a Zoom chat session to discuss (a) what you learned from these explorations about ChatGPT and (b) how these various concepts might apply to your course project. Be prepared to share some of your findings in class.

2. Case study

"A Partnership for Educational Innovation," from ch. 8 of *Bold and Humble*. To be distributed.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Please prepare your answers for the three questions on pp. 98–9 to discuss in class. You will receive the rest of ch. 8 in class.

February 16

1. More on the design and management of collaboration

Anaïs Fabre and Stéphane Straub. 2021. "The Impact of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in Infrastructure, Health and Education," Working Paper № 986. Toulouse: Toulouse School of

Economics. September. Forthcoming in *Journal of Economic Literature*. https://www.tse-fr.eu/sites/default/files/TSE/documents/doc/wp/2019/wp_tse_986.pdf.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

How would you summarize the findings of Fabre and Straub's review? What surprised you? Please be prepared to discuss your answers in class.

2. Case study

Jennifer Widner. 2018. *All Hands On Deck: The US Response to West Africa's Ebola Crisis, 2014-2015*. Innovations for Successful Societies, Princeton University. June. 42 pp. https://successfulsocieties.princeton.edu/sites/successfulsocieties/files/JW_Ebola_USResponse_Final_June%2028%202018_JRG_0.pdf

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Apply the frameworks of chs. 3 and 6 of *Bold and Humble* to "All Hands On Deck." Be prepared to discuss in class.

February 23

1. Implementing partnerships

Lynn Barendsen *et al.* 2013. *The Good Collaboration Toolkit: An Approach to Building, Sustaining, and Carrying Out Successful Collaboration*. Cambridge, MA: The Good Project, Harvard University, pp. 7–48. Available on Canvas.

Intersector. 2017. *The Intersector Toolkit*. https://intersector.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/The-Intersector-Project-Toolkit.pdf

CollaborateUp. 2018. *Backbone Organizations: A Field Guide. 27 Ways to Drive Impact in Multi-Stakeholder Initiatives*. 22 pp. https://ssir.org/pdf/Backbone_Organizations_Field_Guide.pdf

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Create a Zoom session to discuss how these three readings might apply to your course project. Be prepared to share your thoughts in class.

2. Case study

"Leading Collaboration as a New Employee," from ch. 9 of *Bold and Humble*, 10 pages. To be distributed.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Please prepare your answers for the two questions on pp. 112–3 to discuss in class. You will receive the rest of ch. 9 in class.

March 2

1. Partnerships and common-pool resources

Garrett Hardin. 1968. "The Tragedy of the Commons," *Science*, 162(3859): 1243–1248. 13 December. http://science.sciencemag.org/content/162/3859/1243

Robert Boyd *et al.* 2018. "Tragedy Revisited," *Science*, 362(6420): 1236–1241. 14 December. http://science.sciencemag.org/content/362/6420/1236.full

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Create a conversation with ChatGPT about the tragedy of the commons. You might explore such aspects as examples, data, theoretical developments, research priorities, connections with the topic of your course project, etc.

Please be prepared to discuss some of your findings in class.

2. Case study

Irrigation systems and forests in Nepal. Robert Klitgaard. 2021. *The Culture and Development Manifesto*. New York: Oxford University Press, ch. 10. On Canvas.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

What impressed you about Elinor Ostrom's work in enabling collaborative governance?

March 9

Midterm examination

March 13–17

Spring Break

March 23

Vijay Sathe. 2011. "The World's Most Ambitious ID Project," *Innovations* 6(2): 39–66. Available on Canvas.

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Please use ChatGPT to explore the concept and examples of "universal ID."

Summarize the key challenges facing the leaders of Aadhaar in 2011. What would you recommend? Please be prepared to discuss in class.

March 30

1. Designing together

Lynn Barendsen *et al.* 2013. *The Good Collaboration Toolkit: An Approach to Building, Sustaining, and Carrying Out Successful Collaboration*. Cambridge, MA: The Good Project, Harvard Graduate School of Education, pp. 49–79. https://www.thegoodproject.org/collaborationtoolkit

> *Assignment (nothing to write or submit)*

Engage ChatGPT in a chat about techniques for involving people in collaboration. Employees, clients, citizens—see what you can uncover. Be prepared to discuss your findings in class.

2. Case study

Robert Klitgaard. 2019. "Engaging Corruption: New Ideas for the International Monetary Fund" *Policy Design and Practice* 2(3): 229–242.
https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/25741292.2019.1612542

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Create a Zoom chat to begin applying this article's convening framework to your course project. Talk about questions such as:

a. Who should participate in a convening?

b. What data would be most useful to help participants locate their challenges?

c. What example of success might kindle their creativity?

d. What framework or checklist might help them reframe their problems and possibilities?

April 6

Reforms to promote collaboration across the public-private-citizen divide: a system and a case study

"Collaboration through Systems and Processes," ch. 10 of *Bold and Humble*, 23 pages. To be distributed.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Table 10.1 on p. 141 summarizes what the Performance Government System requires and how Mandaue's version was falling short. If you were advising Mayor Jonas Cortes, what would you recommend for each issue? Be prepared to discuss in class.

April 13

1. More on Mandaue

"Implementing Systemic Collaboration," ch. 11 of *Bold and Humble*, 21 pages. To be distributed.

2. Case study continued

Robert Klitgaard. 2019. *Reforming Mandaue City: Overcoming Backsliding*. Teaching Case, Claremont Graduate University. August. To be distributed.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Study questions appear at the end of the 2019 Mandaue case—please prepare them carefully for class discussion.

April 20

1. "Leading Innovation Through Collaboration," ch. 12 of *Bold and Humble*, 29 pages. To be distributed.

2. A partnership in public health

Alan M. Trager and Jessica Droste Yagan. 2007. "The Eli Lilly MDR-TB Partnership: Creating Private and Public Value," Harvard Kennedy School. On Canvas.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Use ChatGPT to find new information about multidrug resistant TB and ways to forestall it.

Study questions appear at the end of the Eli Lilly case—please prepare them carefully for discussion in class.

April 27

Briefings on your course projects.

Have a look at RAND Corporation. 1996. "Guidelines for Preparing Briefings." https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a317235.pdf

In this case, each team's 15-minute briefing is designed to get you help from your classmates. You might spend three minutes describing the topic. Then use seven minutes to outline what progress you've made. Then take five minutes to describe "where we're stuck"—in other words, ask for your colleagues' help.

These briefings are ungraded. Do make them "professional" by rehearsing them—but the point is to get help, not to present a finished product.

May 4

More briefings on your course projects.

Review of the course and agenda for the future

Your final course projects are due by 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, May 9.

Claremont Graduate University on Course Requirements

Grading

Details of CGU's policy are found on the Student Services webpage.
https://mycampus.cgu.edu/web/registrar/for-current-students/student-policies#Satisfactory_Academic_Progress

Course Policies

The CGU institutional policies apply to each course offered at CGU. A few are detailed in the space below. Students are encouraged to review the student handbook for the program as well as the policy documentation within the bulletin and on the Registrar's pages.
http://bulletin.cgu.edu/

Attendance

Students are expected to attend all classes. Students who are unable to attend class must seek permission for an excused absence from the course director or teaching assistant. Unapproved absences or late attendance for three or more classes may result in a lower grade or an "incomplete" for the course. If a student has to miss a class, he or she should arrange to get notes from a fellow student and is strongly encouraged to meet with the teaching assistant to obtain the missed material. Missed extra-credit quizzes and papers will not be available for re-taking.

Scientific and Professional Ethics

The work you do in this course must be your own. Feel free to build on, react to, criticize, and analyze the ideas of others, but when you do, make it known whose ideas you are working with. You must explicitly acknowledge when your work builds on someone else's ideas, including ideas of classmates, professors, and authors you read. If you ever have questions about drawing the line between others' work and your own, ask the course professor who will give you guidance. Exams must be completed independently. Any collaboration on answers to exams, unless expressly permitted, may result in an automatic failing grade and possible expulsion from the Program. Additional information on CGU academic honesty is available on the Student Services webpage. https://cgu.policystat.com/policy/2194316/latest/

Instructor Feedback and Communication

The best way to get in touch with the professor is via email at robert.klitgaard@cgu.edu. He will respond to email/voice messages within two business days.

Expectations and Logistics

Accommodations for Students with Disabilities

If you would like to request academic accommodations due to temporary or permanent disability, contact Dean of Students and Coordinator for Student Disability Services at DisabilityServices@cgu.edu or 909-607-9448. Appropriate accommodations are considered after you have conferred with the Office of Disability Services (ODS) and presented the required documentation of your disability to the ODS.

Mental Health Resources

Graduate school is a context where mental health struggles can be exacerbated. If you ever find yourself struggling, please do not hesitate to ask for help. If you wish to seek out campus resources, here is some basic information about Monsour.
https://www.cuc.claremont.edu/mcaps/

"Monsour Counseling and Psychological Services (MCAPS) is committed to promoting psychological wellness for all students served by the Claremont University Consortium. Our well-trained team of psychologists, psychiatrists, and post-doctoral and intern therapists offer support for a range of psychological issues in a confidential and safe environment."

Phone 909-621-8202

Fax   909-621-8482

After hours emergency 909-607-2000

Tranquada Student Services Center, 1st floor
757 College Way
Claremont, CA 91711

Title IX

If the professor learns of any potential violation of our gender-based misconduct policy (rape, sexual assault, dating violence, domestic violence, or stalking) by any means, he or she is required to notify the CGU Title IX Coordinator at Deanof.Students@cgu.edu or (909) 607-9448. Students can request confidentiality from the institution, which the professor will communicate to the Title IX Coordinator. If students want to speak with someone confidentially, the following resources are available on and off campus: EmPOWER Center (909) 607-2689, Monsour Counseling and Psychological Services (909) 621-8202, and The Chaplains of the Claremont Colleges (909)621-8685. Speaking with a confidential resource does not preclude students from making a formal report to the Title IX Coordinator if and when they are ready. Confidential resources can walk students through all of their reporting options. They can also provide students with information and assistance in accessing academic, medical, and other support services they may need.