

# PLUTARCH

MORALIA

VOLUME V

WITH AN ENGLISH TRANSLATION BY  
FRANK COLE BABBITT



HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS  
CAMBRIDGE, MASSACHUSETTS  
LONDON, ENGLAND

## PLUTARCH'S MORALIA

(413) πους, οἷς αἰτίας ἐστὶ γενέσεως καὶ τροφῆς καὶ τοῦ εἶναι καὶ φρονεῖν, οὐδ' ἅμα τὴν πρόνοιαν ἄσπερ εὐγνώμονα μητέρα καὶ χρηστὴν πάντα ποιούσαν ἡμῶν καὶ φιλάπτουσαν ἐν μόνῃ μητρικάκων εἶναι τῆς μαντικῆς, καὶ ταύτην ἀφαιρέσθαι δοῦσαν ἐξ ἀρχῆς, ὥσπερ οὐχὶ καὶ τότε πλειόνων ὄντων ἐν πλείουσιν ἀνθρώπων ποτηρῶν, ὅτε πολλαχόθι τῆς οἰκουμένης χρηστήρια καθειστική. Δεῦρο δὴ πᾶν καβίσας καὶ πρὸς τὴν κακίαν, ἣν εἴωθας αἰετῶ λόγῳ κολάζειν, Πυθικός ἐκεχειρίας σπεισάμενος, ἔτεραν τινὰ μεθ' ἡμῶν αἰτίαν ζήτει τῆς λεγομένης ἐκλείψεως τῶν χρηστηρίων τὸν δὲ θεὸν εὐμενῆ φύλαττε καὶ ἀμήμιτον.

Ἐγὼ μὲν οὖν ταῦτ' εἰπὼν τοσοῦτο διεπραξάμην, ὅσον ἀπελθεῖν διὰ θυρῶν σιωπῆ τὸν Πλανητιάδην.

8. Ἡσυχίας δὲ γενομένης ἐπ' ὀλόγον, ὁ Ἀμμωνίος ἐμὲ προσαγορεύσας, "ὄρα τί ποιούμεν," εἶπεν, "ὦ Λαμπρία, καὶ πρόσεχε τῷ λόγῳ τὴν διάνοιαν, Ἐσπῶς μὴ τὸν θεὸν ἀναίτιον ποιῶμεν. ὁ γὰρ ἄλλω τινὶ καὶ μὴ θεοῦ γνώμῃ τὰ πανσάμενα τῶν χρηστηρίων ἐκλιπεῖν ἠγούμενος, ὑπόνοιαν δίδωσι τοῦ μὴ γίνεσθαι μῆδ' εἶναι διὰ τὸν θεὸν ἄλλ' ἑτέρῳ τινὶ πρόπῳ νομίζειν. οὐ γὰρ ἄλλη γέ τις ἐστὶ μείζων οὐδὲ κρείττων δύναμις, ὥστ' ἀναιρεῖν καὶ ἀφανίζειν ἔργον θεοῦ τὴν μαντικὴν οὐσαν. ὁ μὲν οὖν Πλανητιάδου λόγος οὐκ ἀρεστός ἐμοὶ διὰ τε τᾶλλα καὶ τὴν ἀνωμαλίαν, ἣν περὶ τὸν θεὸν ποιεῖ, πῆ μὲν ἀπο-

<sup>1</sup> πολλαχόθι, Bases and Hartman: πολλαχέθεν.

<sup>2</sup> The sacred truce, made throughout the Greek world, for the duration of the Pythian games.

their unworthiness, when he is responsible for their birth and nurture and their existence and power to think; nor is it likely without that Providence, like a benign and helpful mother, who does everything for us and watches over us, should cherish animosity in the matter of prophecy only, and take away that from us after having given it to us at the beginning, as if the number of wicked men included among a larger population were not larger at that earlier time when the oracles were established in many places in the inhabited world! Come, sit down again and make a 'Pythian truce' with evil, which you are wont to chastise with words every day, and join us in seeking some other reason for what is spoken of as the obsolescence of oracles; but keep the god benign and provoke him not to wrath."

What I had said was so far effective that Planetiades went out through the door without another word.

8. There was quiet for a moment, and then Ammonius, addressing himself to me, said, "See what it is that we are doing, Lamprias, and concentrate your thoughts on our subject so that we shall not relieve the god of responsibility. The fact is that the man who holds that the obsolescence of such of the oracles as have ceased to function has been brought about by some other cause and not by the will of a god gives reason for suspecting that he believes that their creation and continued existence was not due to the god, but was brought about in some other way. (For prophecy is something created by a god, and certainly no greater or more potent force exists to abolish and obliterate it.) Now I do not like what Planetiades said, and one of the reasons is the inconsistency which it creates regarding the god,

στρεφόμενον καὶ ἀπαξιόδιοντα τὴν κακίαν πῆ δὲ πάλιν αὐτὸ προσείμενον, ὥσπερ εἰ βασιλεὺς τις ἢ τύραννος ἔτερας ἀποικελίαν θύρας τοὺς ποιητοὺς καθ' ἑτέρας εἰσδέχοιτο καὶ χρηματίζοι. τοῦ δὲ μετρίου<sup>1</sup> καὶ ἰκανοῦ καὶ μηδαμῆ περιττοῦ πανταχῆ δ' αὐτάρκους, μάλιστα τοῖς θεοῖς<sup>2</sup> πρόποντος ἔργου, εἰ παύτην ἀρχὴν<sup>3</sup> λαβὼν φαίη τις ὅτι τῆς κοινῆς ἀλυγανδρίας, ἣν αἱ πρότεροι στάσεις καὶ οἱ πόλεμοι περὶ πᾶσαν ὁμοῦ τι τὴν οἰκουμένην ἀπειργάσαντο, πλείστον μέρος ἢ Ἑλλάς μετέσχηκε, καὶ μάλιστα ἂν νῦν ὅλη παράσχοι τρισχιλίους ὀπλίτας. ὅσους ἢ Μεγαρέων μία πόλις ἐξέπεμψεν εἰς Πλαταιεύς (οὐδὲν οὖν ἕτερον ἦν τὸ πολλὰ καταλιπεῖν χρηστήρια τὸν θεὸν ἢ τῆς Ἑλλάδος ἐλέγχων τὴν ἔρημίαν), ἀκριβέστε<sup>4</sup> ἂν οὕτω<sup>5</sup> παράσχοι τὴν εὐρησολογίαν. τίνος γὰρ ἦν ἀγαθόν, ἐν Τεγύραις ὡς πρότερον εἶναι<sup>6</sup> μαντεῖον, ἢ περὶ τὸ Πιτῶν ὅπου μέρος ἡμέρας ἐντυχεῖν ἔσται ἀθροώπων νέμοντι; καὶ γὰρ τοῦτο δὴ τοῦνταῦθα<sup>8</sup> προσβύτατον ὄν χρόνῳ τε καὶ δόξῃ κλεινότερον ὑπὸ θηρίου χαλεποῦ δρακαιώης πάλιν χρόνον ἔρημον γενέσθαι καὶ ἀπροσπέλαστον ἱστοροῦσιν, οὐκ ὀρθῶς τὴν ἀργίαν<sup>9</sup> ἀλλ' ἀνάπαλιν λαμβάνοντες· ἢ γὰρ ἔρημία τὸ θηρίον ἐπιγέγετο μᾶλλον ἢ τὸ θηρίον ἐποίησε τὴν ἔρημίαν. ἐπεὶ δὲ τῷ θεῷ δόξαν οὕτως ἢ θ' Ἑλλάς ἐρώσθη πόλεσι καὶ τὸ χωρίον ἀθροώπων ἐπλήθυνε, διωὴν ἐχρόντο

<sup>1</sup> μετρίου Imperius: μεγίστου.  
<sup>2</sup> θεοῖς Bernardakis: θεοῖς.  
<sup>3</sup> ἀρχὴν omitted in some mss.  
<sup>4</sup> ἀκριβέστε F.C.B.: ἀκριβέστε. <sup>5</sup> οὕτω F.C.B.: ἀθῶ.  
<sup>6</sup> παράσχοι τι F.C.B.: παράσχοιμα. <sup>7</sup> εἶται Bryan: ἦν.  
<sup>8</sup> δὴ τοῦνταῦθα Haupt: δήπου ἐπταῖθα.  
<sup>9</sup> ἀργίαν] ἔρημίαν corr. in two mss.: αἰτίαν Meziriacus.

who in one way turns away from wickedness and disavows it, and again in another way welcomes its presence; just as if some king or despot should shut out bad men at certain doors and let them in at others and have dealings with them. Now moderation, adequacy, excess in nothing, and complete self-sufficiency are above all else the essential characteristics of everything done by the gods; and if anyone should take this fact as a starting-point, and assert that Greece has far more than its share in the general depopulation which the earlier discords and wars have wrought throughout practically the whole inhabited earth, and that to-day the whole of Greece would hardly muster three thousand men-at-arms, which is the number that the one city of the Megarians sent forth to Plataeae<sup>a</sup> (for the god's abandoning of many oracles is nothing other than his way of substantiating the desolation of Greece), in this way such a man would give some accurate evidence of his keenness in reasoning. For who would profit if there were an oracle in Tegeyrae, as there used to be, or at Pioum, where during some part of the day one might possibly meet a human being pasturing his flocks? And regarding the oracle here at Delphi, the most ancient in time and the most famous in repute, men record that for a long time it was made desolate and unapproachable by a fierce creature, a serpent; they do not, however, put the correct interpretation upon its lying idle, but quite the reverse; for it was the desolation that attracted the creature rather than that the creature caused the desolation. But when Greece, since God so willed, had grown strong in cities and the place was thronged with people, they

<sup>a</sup> Cf. Herodotus, ix. 21 and 26.

(414) προφήτισαν ἐν μέρει καθιμεμένας,<sup>1</sup> καὶ τρίτη δ' ἔφεδρος ἦν ἀποδεδειγμένη. ἦν δ' ἔστι μία μία προφήτις, καὶ οὐκ ἐγκαλοῦμεν. ἔφαρκε γὰρ αὐτῇ τοῖς δεομένοις. οὐ τούτων αἰτιατέον οὐδὲν<sup>2</sup> τὸν θεόν. ἢ γὰρ οὐσα μαντική καὶ διαμένουσα πάντων ἔστιν ἡ ἰκανή καὶ πάντας ἀποπέμπει τυγχάνοντας ὧν χρηζοῦσι. ὥσπερ οὖν ἐπέα κήρυσεν ὁ Ἀγαμέμνων ἐχρήστω, καὶ μόλις κατέχευε τὴν ἐκκλησίαν διὰ πῆθος, ἐπ' αὐθὰ δ' ἄφρασε μεθ' ἡμέρας ὀλίγας ἐν τῷ θεάτρῳ μίαν φωνὴν ἐξικουμένην εἰς πάντας. οὕτω τότε πλείους ἐχρήστο φωνᾶς πρὸς πλείονας ἢ μαντική, ἦν δὲ τούναντίον ἔδει θανατάζειν τὸν θεόν, εἰ περιώρα τὴν μαντικὴν ἀχρήστως δίκην ὑδατος ἀπορρέουσαν ἢ καθάπερ αἰ πέτραι ποιμένων ἐν ἐρήμῳ καὶ βοσκημάτων φωνᾶς ἀντηχοῦσαν."

9. Εἰπόντος δὲ ταῦτα τοῦ Ἀμμωνίου κάμοδ σιωπᾶντος, ὁ Κλεόμβροτος ἐμέ προσαγορεύσας, " ἦδη σὺ τοῦτο δέδωκας," εἶπεν, " τὸ καὶ ποιῆν ταυτὶ τὰ Δμαντεῖα καὶ ἀναρῆν τὸν θεόν."

" Οὐκ ἔγωγε," εἶπον, " ἀναφείσθαι μὲν γὰρ οὐδὲν αἰτία θεοῦ φημι μαντεῖον οὐδὲ χρηστήριον ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἄλλα πολλὰ ποιούντος ἡμῶν ἐκείνου καὶ παρασκευάζοντος, ἐπάγει φθορὰν ἐνίοις καὶ στέρτησιν ἢ φύσιν, μᾶλλον δ' ἢ ἄλλῃ στέρησις οἶσα ἀναφείγει πολλάκις καὶ ἀναλύει τὸ γινόμενον ὑπὸ τῆς κρείττονος αἰτίας, οὕτω μαντικῶν ὄψμαι δυνάμεων σκοτώσεις ἐτέρας<sup>3</sup> καὶ ἀναρέσεις εἶναι, πολλὰ κατὰ

<sup>1</sup> καθιμεμένας Xylander.

<sup>2</sup> οὐδὲν Kronenbergr: οὐδὲ.

<sup>3</sup> ἀναφείγει] ἀνοφάβει Xylander; διαφθείρει Schwartz; τὸ εἶναι φεύγει Michael; ἀναρέσει?

<sup>4</sup> ἐτέρας] ἰδιαιρέτας Paton.

<sup>5</sup> Homer, Il. ii. 96.

used to employ two prophetic priestesses who were sent down in turn; and a third was appointed to be held in reserve. But to-day there is one priestess and we do not complain, for she meets every need. There is no reason, therefore, to blame the god; the exercise of the prophetic art which continues at the present day is sufficient for all, and sends away all with their desires fulfilled. Agamemnon,<sup>9</sup> for example, used nine heralds and, even so, had difficulty in keeping the assembly in order because of the vast numbers; but here in Delphi, a few days hence, in the theatre you will see that one voice reaches all. In the same way, in those days, prophecy employed more voices to speak to more people, but to-day, quite the reverse, we should needs be surprised at the god if he allowed his prophecies to run to waste, like water, or to echo like the rocks with the voices of shepherds and flocks in waste places."

9. When Ammonius had said this and I remained silent, Cleombrotus, addressing himself to me, said, "Already you have conceded this point, that the god both creates and abolishes these prophetic shrines."

"No indeed," said I, "my contention is that no prophetic shrine or oracle is ever abolished by the instrumentality of the god. He creates and provides many other things for us, and upon some of these Nature brings destruction and disintegration; or rather, the matter composing them, being itself a force for disintegration, often reverts rapidly to its earlier state and causes the dissolution of what was created by the more potent instrumentality; and it is in this way, I think, that in the next period there are dimmings and abolitions of the prophetic agencies; for while the god gives many fair things to

ζήτησιν τὰ δὲ μανθάνειν, ἔριδος ἐκποδῶν οὕσης καὶ φιλονεικίας ἀπάσης συγγνώμης δὲ παντὶ λόγῳ καὶ παρησιαίας ὡς ὄρεῖ δεδομένης."

39. Ταῦτα δὴ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων συμπαρακαλούντων, μικρὸν ἐγὼ σιωπήσας, "καὶ μὴν ἀπὸ τύχης τυπός, ὧ Ἀμμώνιε, τοῖς τότε λόγοις αὐτὸς ἀρχὴν ἔπινα καὶ πάροδον ἐνδεδωκας. εἰ γὰρ αἱ δακρυβίσεις σώματος ἢ μὴ μετασχοῦσαι τὸ παράπαν ψυχῆς δαίμονες εἰσι κατὰ σέ καὶ τὸν θείον Ἡσιόδου,

ἄγνοι' ἐπιχθόνιοι φύλακες θνητῶν ἀνθρώπων,

διὰ τί τὰς ἐν τοῖς σώμασι ψυχὰς ἐκέλευς τῆς δυνάμεως ἀποστειροῦμεν, ἢ τὰ μέλλοντα καὶ προγγνώσκων πεφύκασι καὶ προδηλοῦν οἱ δαίμονες; οὔτε γὰρ δύναμις οὔτε μέρος οὐδὲν ἐπιγίγνεσθαι ταῖς ψυχαῖς, ὅταν ἀπολίπωσι τὸ σῶμα, μὴ κεκτεμένους πρότερον εἰκός ἐστίν, ἀλλ' αἰεὶ μὲν ἔχειν, ἔχειν δὲ φαιλότερα τῷ σώματι μεμεγμένους, καὶ τὰ μὲν ὅλως ἀήληθα καὶ κεκρυμμένα τὰ δ' ἀσθενῆ καὶ ἀμαυρὰ καὶ τοῖς δι' ὀμίχλης ὄρωσιν ἢ κινουμένοις ἐν ὑγρῷ παραλησιῶς δίσσεργα καὶ βραδέα, καὶ πολλὰν ποθοῦντα θεραπεῖαν τοῦ οἴκειου καὶ ἀνάληψιν ἀφαίρεσιν δὲ καὶ κάθαρσιν τοῦ καλύπτοντος.<sup>1</sup> ὥσπερ γὰρ ὁ ἥλιος οὐχ ὅταν διαφύγῃ τὰ νέφη γίγνεται λαμπρός, ἀλλ' ἔστι μὲν αἰεὶ φαίνεται 432 δ' ἡμῶν ἐν ὀμίχλῃ δυσφαῖς καὶ ἀμαυρός, οὕτως ἢ ψυχῇ τὴν μαντικὴν οὐκ ἐπικτᾶται δύναμις ἐκβάσα

<sup>1</sup> ἀγνοί] ἐσθλοὶ Hesiod.

<sup>2</sup> καλύπτοντος Empertius: κελύωντος (καλύωντος in one MS., which also adds a short paraphrase of what has gone before).

gain information on this point or that; all strife and contention is banished and a sympathetic hearing and freedom of statement, as you observe, is granted for all that may be said."

39. As the others also joined in the request, I, after a moment of silence, continued, "As a matter of fact, Ammonius, by some chance you happen to be the one who provided the opening and approach for what we said on that occasion. For if the souls which have been severed from a body, or have had no part with one at all, are demigods according to you and the divine Hesiod,<sup>a</sup>

Holy dwellers on earth and the guardian spirits of mortals, why deprive souls in bodies of that power by virtue of which the demigods possess the natural faculty of knowing and revealing future events before they happen? For it is not likely that any power or portion accrues to souls when they have left the body, if they did not possess them before; but the souls always possess them; only they possess them to a slight degree while conjoined with the body, some of them being completely imperceptible and hidden, others weak and dim, and about as ineffectual and slow in operation as persons that try to see in a fog or to move about in water, and requiring much nursing and restoring of the functions that properly belong to them and the removal and clearing away of the covering which hides them. Just as the sun does not become bright when it bursts through the clouds, but is bright always, and yet in a fog appears to us indistinct and dim, even so the soul does not acquire the prophetic power when it goes forth from the body

<sup>a</sup> Works and Days, 123.

(432) τοῦ σώματος ὀσπερ ἑρέφους, ἀλλ' ἔχουσα καὶ νῦν τυφλοῦται διὰ τὴν πρὸς τὸ θρηγὸν ἀνάμειξιν αὐτῆς καὶ σύγχρυσιν. οὐ δεῖ δὲ θαυμάζειν οὐδ' ἀπιστεῖν ὀρώνας, εἰ μηδὲν ἄλλο, τῆς ψυχῆς τὴν ἀπίστηρον φωνὴν τῆ μαντικῆ δύναμιν, ἣν μνήμην καλοῦμεν, ἡλικον ἔργον ἀποδείκνυσται τὸ σῶζειν τὰ παρεχόμενα καὶ φυλάττειν, μᾶλλον δὲ ὄντα· τῶν γὰρ γεγονότων οὐδὲν ἔστω οὐδ' ὑφέστηκεν, ἀλλ' ἅμα γίνεσθαι πάντα καὶ φθείρεται, καὶ πράξεις καὶ λόγοι καὶ πάθηματα, τοῦ χρόνου καθάπερ ρεύματος ἕκαστα παραφέροντος· αὐτῆ δὲ τῆς ψυχῆς ἡ δύναμις οὐκ οὐδ' ὄντως τρόπον ἀντιλαμβάνομένη τοῦ, μὴ παροῦσι φαντασίαν καὶ οὐσίαν περιτίθησιν. ὁ μὲν γὰρ Θεπταλοῖς περὶ "Ἀρηίης" δοθεὶς χρηρισμὸς ἐκέλευε φράζειν

κωφοῦ τ' αἰκὸν τυφλοῦ τ' ἐρέξεν,

ἡ δὲ μνήμη καὶ κωφῶν πραγμάτων αἰκὸν καὶ τυφλῶν ὅμεις ἡμῶν ἔστω. ἄθεν, ὡς ἔφη, οὐκ ἔστι θαυμαστόν, εἰ κρατούσα τῶν μηκέτ' ὄντων προλαμβάνει πολλὰ τῶν μηδέπω γεγονότων· ταῦτα γὰρ αὐτῇ μᾶλλον προσήκει καὶ τούτοις συμπληθῆς ἐστί· καὶ γὰρ ἐπιβάλλεται καὶ προστίθεται<sup>1</sup> πρὸς τὰ μέλλοντα καὶ τῶν<sup>2</sup> παρεχόμενων καὶ τέλος ἔχόντων ἀπῆλλακται πλὴν τοῦ μνημονεύειν.

40. " Ταύτην οὖν ἔχουσα τὴν δύναμιν αἱ ψυχαὶ σύμφυτον μὲν ἀμύδραν δὲ καὶ δυσφάνταστον, ὅμοις ἑξάνθοισι πολλάκις καὶ ἀναλαμβάνουσιν<sup>3</sup> ἐν τε τοῖς

<sup>1</sup> "Ἀρηίης Turnebus: ἀρηίης.

<sup>2</sup> προστίθεται F.C.B.: προτίθεται.

<sup>3</sup> τῶν added by Stegmüller.

<sup>4</sup> ἀναλαμβάνουσιν one ms. (E) and Imperius: ἀναλαμβάνουσιν.

as from a cloud; it possesses that power even now, but is blinded by being combined and commingled with the mortal nature. We ought not to feel surprised or incredulous at this when we see in the soul, though we see naught else, that faculty which is the complement of prophecy, and which we call memory, and how great an achievement is displayed in preserving and guarding the past, or rather what has been the present, since nothing of all that has come to pass has any existence or substantiality, because the very instant when anything comes to pass, that is the end of it—of actions, words, experiences alike; for Time like an everflowing stream bears all things onward. But this faculty of the soul lays hold upon them, I know not how, and invests with semblance and being things not now present here. The oracle given to the Thessalians about Arnê<sup>a</sup> bade them note

A deaf man's hearing, a blind man's sight.

But memory is for us the hearing of deeds to which we are deaf and the seeing of things to which we are blind. Hence, as I said, it is no wonder that, if it has command over things that no longer are, it anticipates many of those which have not yet come to pass, since these are more closely related to it, and with these it has much in common; for its attachments and associations are with the future, and it is quit of all that is past and ended, save only to remember it.

40. " Souls therefore, all possessed of this power, which is innate but dim and hardly manifest, nevertheless oftentimes disclose its flower and radiance in

<sup>a</sup> Cf. Thucydides, i. 12.

(432) ἐνυπνίοις καὶ περὶ τὰς τελευταί<sup>1</sup> ἔνιαι, καθαροῦ γιγνομένου τοῦ σώματος ἢ τινα κρᾶσιν οὐκείαν πρὸς τοῦτο λαμβάνοντος, ἢ<sup>2</sup> τὸ λογιστικὸν καὶ φροντιστικὸν ἀνιέται καὶ ἀπολύεται<sup>3</sup> τῶν παρόντων τῶ<sup>4</sup> ἀλόγῳ καὶ φαντασιαστικῶ τοῦ μέλλοντος ἐπιστηρεφόμενα<sup>5</sup>. οὐ γάρ, ὡς ὁ Εὐριπίδης φησὶ, μάντις δ' ἄριστος ὅστις εἰκάξει καλῶς,

ἀλλ' οὗτος ἐμύρων<sup>7</sup> μὲν ἀνὴρ καὶ τῶ νοῦν ἔχοντι τῆς ψυχῆς καὶ μετ' εἰκότος ἡγουμένῳ καθ' αἰὸν ἐπόμενος. τὸ δὲ μαντικὸν ὡσπερ γραμματεῖον ἀγράφον καὶ ἄλογον καὶ ἀόριστον<sup>8</sup> ἐξ αὐτοῦ, δεκτικὸν δὲ φαντασιῶν<sup>9</sup> πάθει καὶ προαισθήσεων, ἀσφαλτοῦ γίστων ἀπτεται τοῦ μέλλοντος, ὅταν ἐκστῇ μάλα τοῦ παρόντος. ἐξίσταται δὲ κράσει καὶ διαθήσει τοῦ σώματος ἐν μεταβολῇ γιγνομένου,<sup>10</sup> ἢ<sup>11</sup> ἐνθουσιασμὸν καλοῦμεν. αὐτὸ μὲν οὖν ἐξ αὐτοῦ τὸ σώμα τοιαύτην πολλάκις ἴσχει διάθεσιν· ἢ δὲ γῆ πολλῶν μὲν ἄλλων δυνάμεων πηγῆς ἀνίστην ἀβηράταις, τὰς μὲν ἐκστατικὰς καὶ νοσώδεις καὶ θανατηφόρους, τὰς δὲ χρηστὰς καὶ προσηγείας καὶ ὠφελίμους, ὡς δηλαδὴ<sup>12</sup> γίνονται πείρα προστιγγάνουσι. τὸ δὲ μαντικὸν ρέθμα καὶ πνεῦμα θειοτάτων ἐστὶ καὶ ὀσιώτατον, ἂν τε καθ' ἑαυτὸ δὲ ἀέρος ἂν τε μεθ'

<sup>1</sup> τελευταίς] τελευταίς in some mss.  
<sup>2</sup> ἀνιέται καὶ ἀπολύεται Wyttenbach: ἀνέσθαι καὶ ἀπολύεσθαι.  
<sup>3</sup> τῶ added by Wyttenbach.  
<sup>4</sup> ἐπιστηρεφόμενα F.C.B.: ἐπιστηρεφόμενα.  
<sup>5</sup> δ' in Euripides, omitted in the mss. of Plutarch.  
<sup>6</sup> ἐμύρων Meziriacus: ἐμύρων.  
<sup>7</sup> ἀόριστον] ἀόριστον Blümler.  
<sup>8</sup> φαντασιῶν Meziriacus: φαντασῶν or φαντασῶν.  
<sup>9</sup> γιγνομένου F.C.B.: γιγνόμενον.  
<sup>10</sup> δὲ ἄλλοι Turnebus: δὲ ἄλλοι.

dreams, and some in the hour of death,<sup>a</sup> when the body becomes cleansed of all impurities and attains a temperament adapted to this end, a temperament through which the reasoning and thinking faculty of the souls is relaxed and released from their present state as they range amid the irrational and imaginative realms of the future. It is not true, as Euripides says, that

The best of seers is he that guesses well;

no, the best of seers is the intelligent man, following the guidance of that in his soul which possesses sense and which, with the help of reasonable probability, leads him on his way. But that which foretells the future, like a tablet without writing, is both irrational and indeterminate in itself, but receptive of impressions and presentiments through what may be done to it, and inconsequently grasps at the future when it is farthest withdrawn from the present. Its withdrawal is brought about by a temperament and disposition of the body as it is subjected to a change which we call inspiration. Often the body of itself alone attains this disposition. Moreover the earth sends forth for men streams of many other potencies, some of them producing derangements, diseases, or deaths; others helpful, benignant, and beneficial, as is plain from the experience of persons who have come upon them. But the prophetic current and breath is most divine and holy, whether it issue by itself through the air or come in the company of

<sup>a</sup> Cf. Plato, *Apology*, 39 B.

<sup>b</sup> Cf. Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 674, Euripides, no. 973; cf. *Moralia*, 399 A, *supra*.

Ἐ ὄγρου νάματος ἀπερᾶται.<sup>1</sup> καταμεγρύνμενον γὰρ εἰς τὸ σώμα κράσιν ἐμποιεῖ ταῖς ψυχαῖς ἀήθη καὶ ἄστονον, ἧς τὴν ιδιότητα χαλεπὸν εἶπέν σαφῶς, εὐκάσαι δὲ πολλαχῶς ὁ λόγος διδωσι. θερμότητι γὰρ καὶ διαχύσει πόρους τινὰς ἀνοίγειν φανταστικούς τοῦ μέλλοντος εἰκὸς ἐστίν, ὡς αἴνεος ἀναποικειμένους καὶ λαιθάροντας ἀποκαλύπτει.

καὶ τὸ μαινώδες μαντικῆ<sup>2</sup> πολλὴν ἔχει τὸ γὰρ βακχεύουμον

Ἐ κατ' Εὐριπίδην, ὅταν ἐνθερμος ἡ ψυχὴ γενομένη καὶ πυρώδης ἀπώσῃται τὴν εὐλάβειαν, ἣν ἡ θνητὴ φρόνησις ἐπάγουσα πολλὰκις ἀποστρέφει καὶ καταφένναι τὸν ἐνθουσιασμόν.

41. "Αμα δ' ἂν τις οὐκ ἀλόγως καὶ ξηρότητα φαίῃ μετὰ τῆς θερμότητος ἐγγυρομένην λεπτήναι τὸ πνεῦμα καὶ ποιῆν ἀθερῶδες καὶ καθαρὸν· αὕτη γὰρ 'ξηρὴ' ψυχὴ, καθ' Ἡράκλειτον. ὕγρῳ<sup>3</sup> τῆς δ' οὐ μόνον ὄψιν ἀμβλύνει καὶ ἀκοήν, ἀλλὰ καὶ κατώτερων θιγόντα καὶ μειχθεῖσα<sup>4</sup> πρὸς ἀέρας ἀφαρᾶει τὴν λαμπρότητα καὶ τὸ φέγγος. τούτων<sup>5</sup> πάλιν αὐ περιψύζει τινὲ καὶ πυκνώσει τοῦ πνεύματος ὅσον βαφῆ σιδήρον<sup>6</sup> τὸ προγυρωστικὸν μόρον ἐπτείνεσθαι<sup>7</sup> καὶ στομοῦσθαι τῆς ψυχῆς οὐκ ἀδύνατόν ἐστι. καὶ μὴν ὡς κασσίτερος ματῶν

<sup>1</sup> ἀπερᾶται F.C.B. (ἀναφέρηται Bernardakis; ἀρτέηται S. A. Naber); ἀφαίρηται.

<sup>2</sup> ἔτερα ἐγγείη. Wyttenbach; καὶ Faton.

<sup>3</sup> μαρτυρῶν Euripides (Bacch. 298); μαρτυροῦν in most mss.

<sup>4</sup> ξηρῇ 935 E, Life of Romulus, chap. xxviii., Stobaeus; ξηρα.

<sup>5</sup> μειχθεῖσα Empirius; μίγες καί.

<sup>6</sup> σιδήρον Michael and Kronenberg; σιδήρου.

<sup>7</sup> ἐπτείνεσθαι Wyttenbach; ἐγγυροῦσθαι.

running waters; for when it is instilled into the body, it creates in souls an unaccustomed and unusual temperament, the peculiarity of which it is hard to describe with exactness, but analogy offers many comparisons. It is likely that by warmth and diffusion it opens up certain passages through which impressions of the future are transmitted, just as wine, when its fumes rise to the head, reveals many unusual movements and also words stored away and unperceived.

And frenzied mind contain much prophecy, For Bacchic rout

according to Euripides,<sup>a</sup> when the soul becomes hot and fiery, and throws aside the caution that human intelligence lays upon it, and thus often diverts and extinguishes the inspiration.

41. "At the same time one might assert, not without reason, that a dryness engendered with the heat subtilizes the spirit of prophecy and renders it ethereal and pure; for this is 'the dry soul,' as Heraclitus has it.<sup>b</sup> Moisture not only dulls sight and hearing, but when it touches mirrors and combines with air, it takes away their brightness and sheen.<sup>c</sup> But again the very opposite of this may not be impossible: that by a sort of chilling and compacting of the spirit of inspiration the prophetic element in the soul, as when steel is dipped in cold water, is rendered tense and keen. And further, just as tin

<sup>a</sup> Bacchar, 298.

<sup>b</sup> "A dry soul is best (and/or wisest)" is the dictum of Heraclitus, which is often quoted; see Diels, *Fragment der Vorsokratiker*, i. p. 100, Heraclitus, no. 118; cf. also *Moralia*, 935 E, and *Life of Romulus*, chap. xviii. (36 A).

<sup>c</sup> Cf. Plutarch, *Moralia*, 736 A-B.



when alloyed with copper, which is loose and porous in texture, binds it together and compacts it,<sup>a</sup> and at the same time makes it brighter and cleaner, even so there is nothing to prevent the prophetic vapour, which contains some affinity and relationship to souls, from filling up the vacant spaces and cementing all together by fitting itself in. For one thing has affinity and adaptability for one thing, another for another, just as the bean<sup>b</sup> seems to further the dyeing of purple and sodium carbonate<sup>c</sup> that of scarlet, when mixed with the dye ;

All in the linen is blended the splendour of glorious scarlet, as Empedocles<sup>d</sup> has said. But regarding the Cydnus and the sacred sword of Apollo in Tarsus we used to hear you say, my dear Demetrius, that the Cydnus will cleanse no steel but that, and no other water will cleanse that sword. There is a similar phenomenon at Olympia, where they pile the ashes against the altar and make them adhere all around by pouring on them water from the Alphicus ; but, although they have tried the waters of other rivers, there is none with which they can make the ashes cohere and stay fixed in their place.

42. " It is not, therefore, anything to excite amazement if, although the earth sends up many streams, it is only such as these that dispose souls to inspiration and impressions of the future. Certainly the voice of legend also is in accord with my state-

<sup>a</sup> Cf. Aristotle, *De Generatione Animalium*, ii. 8 (747 a 34).

<sup>b</sup> Cf. H. Blümmner, *Geerbe und Künste bei Griechen und Römern* (Leipzig, 1875), I. 236.

<sup>c</sup> *Ibid.*, 238.

<sup>d</sup> Cf. Diels, *Frag. der Vorsokratiker*, i. p. 255, Empedocles, no. 393.

PLUTARCH'S MORALIA

(433) ὄντα καὶ πολύπορον τὸν χαλκὸν ἐντακεῖς ἅμα μὲν ἐσφίγγει καὶ κατεπύκνωσεν ἅμα δὲ λαμπρότερον ἀπέδειξε καὶ καθαρώτερον, οὕτως οὐδὲν ἀπέχει τὴν μαντικὴν ἀναθμίασιν οἰκείων τι ταῖς ψυχαῖς καὶ συγγενῆς ἔχουσαν ἀναπληροῦν τὰ μωᾶ καὶ συνῆχεν ἐναρμόττουσαν. ἄλλα γὰρ ἄλλοις οἰκεία καὶ πρόσφορα, καθάπερ τῆς μὲν πορφύρας ὁ κύαμος τῆς δὲ κόκκου τὸ ὑἴτρον δοκεῖ τὴν βαφὴν ἐπιάγειν<sup>1</sup> μεμειγμένον.

βύσσω δὲ γλαυκῆς κόκκου<sup>2</sup> καταμίσγεται ἀκρίς,<sup>3</sup> ὡς Ἐμπεδοκλῆς εἶρηκε. περὶ δὲ τοῦ Κύδνου<sup>4</sup> καὶ τῆς ἱερᾶς τοῦ Ἀπόλλωνος ἐν Ταρσῶ μαχαίρας, ὡς φέρεται Διμητρίῳ, σοὺ λέγοντος ἠκούομεν, ὡς οἱ οὐκ ὁ Κύδνος ἄλλον ἔκκαθαίρει σίδηρον ἢ ἐκεῖνον ὡς ἴδωρ ἄλλο τὴν μάχαιραν ἢ ἐκεῖνο· καθάπερ καὶ Ὀλυμπία τὴν πέφραν προσπλάττουσι τῷ βλαφῆ<sup>5</sup> καὶ περισηγηροῦσιν ἐκ τοῦ Ἀλφειοῦ ποταμῶν<sup>6</sup> οὐδὲν ὕδωρ, ἑτέρων δὲ πειρώμενοι ποταμῶν<sup>7</sup> οὐδὲν δύνανται συναγαγεῖν οὐδὲ κολλησά τὴν πέφραν.

42. " Οὐ θαυμαστόν οὖν, εἰ πολλὰ τῆς γῆς ἴσως ῥεύματα μεθεισότης, ταῦτα μόνον τὰς ψυχὰς ἐμπνευστικῶς διατίθῃσι καὶ φαντασιαστικῶς τοῦ μέλλοντος. ἀμέλει<sup>10</sup> δὲ καὶ τὰ τῆς φήμης σιγήματα τῶν

<sup>1</sup> κάμωσι] καμῶσι Paton and Hatzidakis.  
<sup>2</sup> ἐπάγειν F.C.B. (außen Wyttenbach): ἀγειν.  
<sup>3</sup> κόκκου Nyländer (κόκκος Diels): κόκκου, κρόκου, κόκκου.  
<sup>4</sup> ἀκρίς not in most mss. (ἀκρίς Wilamowitz-Mitlenider ff).  
<sup>5</sup> Κύδνου] κάμωσι in all mss. but one (E).  
<sup>6</sup> οὐδ' added by Madvig.  
<sup>7</sup> ἑτέρων Emperius.  
<sup>8</sup> ἑτέρων . . . ποταμῶν Schellens: ἐτέρων . . . ποταμῶν.  
<sup>9</sup> ἀμέλει Wyttenbach: ἀμαχέι.

(433) λόγῳ· καὶ γὰρ ἐνταῦθα τὴν περὶ τὸν τόπον δυνάμιν ἐμφανῆ γενέσθαι πρῶτον ἰστοροῦσιν, νομῆως τινὸς ἐμπροσθέντος κατὰ τύχην, εἶτα φωνῆς ἀναφέροντος ἐνθουσιάζεις, ἃν τὸ μὲν πρῶτον οἱ παραγενόμενοι κατεφρόνουν, ὕστερον δὲ γενομένων ἄν προσέειπεν ὁ ἄνθρωπος, εἰσάμασαν· οἱ δὲ λογιώτατοι Δελφῶν Δ καὶ τούνομα τοῦ ἀνθρώπου διαμνημονεύοντες Κορήταν λέγουσιν. ἐμοὶ δὲ δοκεῖ μάλιστα τῆσιν αὐτῶν πρὸς τὸ μαυτικὸν πνεῦμα λαμβάνειν σύγκρασιν ψυχῆ καὶ σύμψηξιν, ὅταν πρὸς τὸ φῶς ἢ ὄψις ὁμοιωταδὲς γιγνώμενον· ὀφθαλμοῦ τε γὰρ ἔχοντος τὴν ὀρατικὴν δυνάμιν οὐδὲν ἄνευ φωτὸς ἔργον ἔσται, ψυχῆς τε τὸ μαυτικὸν ἄσπερ ὄμμα δέεται τοῦ σνεξάπτουτος οὐκείου καὶ συνεπιθίγοντος. ὁδὲν οἱ μὲν πολλοὶ τῶν προγενεστέρων ἓνα καὶ τὸν αὐτὸν ἡγοῦντο θεὸν Ἀπόλλωνα καὶ ἥλιον· οἱ δὲ τὴν καλὴν καὶ σοφὴν ἐπιστάμενοι καὶ τιμωρὸν ἀναλογίαν, ὅπερ<sup>1</sup> σῶμα πρὸς ψυχὴν ὄψις δὲ πρὸς δυνάμιν εἶκαζον εἶναι πρὸς τὴν Ἀπόλλωνος φύσιν, ἔκγονον ἐκείνου καὶ τόκον ἄντος<sup>2</sup> αἰεὶ γιγνώμενον αἰεὶ τοῦτον ἀποφαίνοντες.<sup>3</sup> ἐξάπτει γὰρ καὶ πρὸς ἀγεται καὶ συνεξορμῆ<sup>3</sup> τῆς αἰσθήσεως τὴν ὀρατικὴν δυνάμιν ὁδὸς ὡς τῆς ψυχῆς τὴν μαυτικὴν ἐκείνου.

43. "Οἱ μέντοι δοξάζοντες ἓνα καὶ τὸν αὐτὸν θεὸν εἶναι, ἐκόντως Ἀπόλλωνι καὶ Ἡῷ κοινῶς ἐθέσαν τὸ χρησιστήριον, οἴμενοι τὴν διάθεσιν καὶ κρᾶσιν ἐμποιεῖν τῇ γῆ τὸν ἥλιον, ἀφ' ἧς ἐκφύει

ment; for they record that here the power hovering about this spot was first made manifest when a certain shepherd fell in by accident and later gave forth inspired utterances, which those who came into contact with him at first treated with disdain; but later, when what he had foretold came to pass, they were amazed. The most learned of the people of Delphi still preserve the tradition of his name, which they say was Coretas. But I incline most to the opinion that the soul acquires towards the prophetic spirit a close and intimate connexion of the sort that vision has towards light, which possesses similar properties. For, although the eye has the power of vision, there is no function for it to perform without light<sup>a</sup>; and so the prophetic power of the soul, like an eye, has need of something kindred to help to kindle it and stimulate it further. Hence many among earlier generations regarded Apollo and the Sun as one and the same god; but those who understood and respected fair and wise analogy conjectured that as body is to soul, vision to intellect, and light to truth, so is the power of the sun to the nature of Apollo; and they would make it appear that the sun is his offspring and progeny, being for ever born of him that is for ever. For the sun kindles and promotes and helps to keep in activity the power of vision in our perceptive senses, just as the god does for the power of prophecy in the soul.

43. "Those, however, who had reached the conclusion that the two are one and the same god very naturally dedicated the oracle to Apollo and Earth in common, thinking that the sun creates the disposition and temperament in the earth from which the prophet-

<sup>1</sup> ὄψεσ] ὄψις in most mss.

<sup>2</sup> ἄντος] ἄντος in some mss.

<sup>3</sup> ἀποφαίνοντες] ἀποφαίνοντες in most mss.

<sup>a</sup> See 436 D, *infra*, and Plato, *Republic*, 508A-509 B.

498 γὰρ ἄλλοτε τῷ φανταστικῷ τρεπόμενοι, καθάπερ οἱ πολλὰ βιάλλοντες, ἐπιτυγχάνουσι πολλάκις.

51. "Ὄταν οὖν ἀρμυσιῶς ἔχη πρὸς τὴν τοῦ πνεύματος ὤσπερ φαρμάκου κράσιν ἢ φανταστικὴ καὶ μαντικὴ δύναμις, ἐν τοῖς προφητημένοι ἀνάγκη γίνεσθαι τὸν εὐθουσιασμόν· ὅταν δὲ μὴ οὕτως, μὴ γίνεσθαι, ἢ γίνεσθαι παράφορον καὶ οὐκ ἀέραον καὶ παρακτικόν,<sup>1</sup> ὡσπερ ἴσμεν ἐπὶ τῆς ἑναγχοῦ ἀποβασιῆς Πυθίας.<sup>2</sup> θεοπρόσπιον γὰρ ἀπὸ ξεινῆς παραγενόμενον, λέγεται τὰς πρώτας κατασπείσεις ἀκνήτων ὑπομέναι καὶ ἀπαθῆς τὸ ἱερεῖον· ὑπερβαλλομένων δὲ φιλοτιμῶν τῶν ἱερέων καὶ προσβαλλομένων, μόλις ὑποφέρον γενόμενοι καὶ κατακλυσθῆν ἐνδοῦναι.<sup>3</sup> τί οὖν συνέβη περὶ τῆς Πυθίας; κατέβη μὲν εἰς τὸ μαντεῖον ὡς φασιν ἀκουσα καὶ ἀπρόθυμος, εὐθὺς δὲ περὶ τὰς πρώτας ἀποκρίσεις ἦν καταφανὴς τῇ τραχύτητι τῆς φωνῆς οὐκ ἀναφέρουσα δάκην νεῶς ἐπειγομένης, ἀλλὰ καὶ κακοῦ πνεύματος οὐσα πλήρης· τέλος δὲ παντάπασιν ἐκταραχθεῖσα καὶ μετὰ κραυγῆς ἀσήμεου καὶ φοβερῆς φερομένη πρὸς τὴν ἔξοδον ἔρριψεν ἑαυτὴν, ὥστε φηγεῖν μὴ μόνον τοὺς θεοπρόσπιους ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸν προφήτην Νικάνδρον καὶ τοὺς παρόντας τῶν δαίμων· ἀπειλοντο μὲντοι μετὰ μικρὸν αὐτὴν εἰσελθόντες ἐμφόρουα καὶ διεβίωσαν ὀλίγας ἡμέρας.

"Τούτων ἕνεκα καὶ συνουσίας ἀγνων τὸ σῶμα καὶ τὸν βίον ὄλως ἀπεπέμεικτον ἀλλοδαπαῖς ὀμιλίαις

<sup>1</sup> παρακτικόν] πρακτικόν in most mss.  
<sup>2</sup> Πυθίας Bernardakis (but cf. 295 n); πυθιάδος.  
<sup>3</sup> ἐδοῦναι Turnebus: ἔδον ἢ.  
<sup>4</sup> Πυθίαν] πυθιάδα in almost all mss.  
<sup>5</sup> δὲ περὶ Turnebus: δ' ἐπὶ.  
<sup>6</sup> ἀλλὰ] ἀλλ' ἄλλου Reiske.  
<sup>7</sup> ἀσήμεου καὶ omitted in most mss.

and now to that in their imagery, like persons who shoot many arrows, they often manage to hit the mark.

51. "Whenever, then, the imaginative and prophetic faculty is in a state of proper adjustment for attemping itself to the spirit as to a drug, inspiration in those who foretell the future is bound to come; and whenever the conditions are not thus, it is bound not to come, or when it does come to be misleading, abnormal, and confusing, as we know in the case of the priestess who died not so long ago. As it happened, a deputation from abroad had arrived to consult the oracle. The victim, it is said, remained unmoved and unaffected in any way by the first libations; but the priests, in their eagerness to please, went far beyond their wonted usage, and only after the victim had been subjected to a deluge and nearly drowned did it at last give in. What, then, was the result touching the priestess? She went down into the oracle unwillingly, they say, and halfheartedly; and at her first responses it was at once plain from the harshness of her voice that she was not responding properly; she was like a labouring ship and was filled with a mighty and baleful spirit. Finally she became hysterical and with a frightful shriek rushed towards the exit and threw herself down, with the result that not only the members of the deputation fled, but also the oracle-interpreter Nicander and those holy men that were present. However, after a little, they went in and took her up, still conscious; and she lived on for a few days.

"It is for these reasons that they guard the chastity of the priestess, and keep her life free from all

(438) καὶ αἰθκτον φυλάττουσι<sup>1</sup> τῆς Πυθίας,<sup>2</sup> καὶ πρὸ τοῦ χρηστηρίου τὰ σημεῖα λαμβάνουσι, οἴμενοι τῷ θεῷ κατάδηλον εἶναι, πότε τὴν πρόσφορον ἔχουσα κρᾶσι καὶ διάθεσιν ἐβλαβῶς ὑπομενεῖ τὸν ἐβου-  
 σιασμόν. οὔτε γὰρ πάντας οὔτε τοὺς αὐτοὺς αἰεὶ διατίθῃσι ὡσαύτως ἢ τοῦ πνεύματος δύναμις, ἀλλ' ὑπέκκαυμα παρέχει καὶ ἀρχὴν ὡσερ εἴρηται τοῖς ἑτέροις τὸ παθεῖν καὶ μεταβαλεῖν οἰκείως ἔχουσαν. ἔστι δὲ θεία μὲν ὄντως καὶ δαιμόνιος, οὐ μὴν ἀνεκλειπτος οὐδ' ἀββαρτος οὐδ' ἀγήρωσι καὶ διαρκεῖς εἰς τὸν ἄπειρον χρόνον ἢ φ' οὐ πάντα κάμνει τὰ μεταξὺ γῆς καὶ οὐρανόθεν κατὰ τὸν ἡμέτερον λόγον. εἰσὶ δ' οἱ καὶ τὰ ἐπάνω φάσκοντες οὐχ ὑπομένειν, ἀλλ' ἀπαυδῶντα πρὸς τὸ αἰδίων καὶ ἄπειρον συνεχέει<sup>3</sup> χρῆσθαι μεταβολαῖς καὶ παλιγενεσίαις.  
 52. "Ταῦτ' εἶπεν ἐγώ, "πολλὰ καὶ ἀνασκέπτε-  
 σθαι καὶ ἡμᾶς παρακαλῶ καὶ ἐμαυτὸν, ὡς ἔχοντα πολλὰς ἀντιλήψεις καὶ ὑπονοίας πρὸς τὸ ὑψηλόν, ἃς ὁ καιρὸς οὐ παρέχει πάσας ἐπεξελεῖν ὥστε καὶ ἐ ταῦθ' ὑπερκείσθω καὶ ὁ Φίλιππος διαπορεῖ περὶ ἡλίου καὶ Ἀπόλλωνος."

<sup>1</sup> φυλάττουσι] φυλαττούσης most mss.

<sup>2</sup> Πυθίας] πυθιάδος most mss.

<sup>3</sup> συνεχέει Wittenbach; ὀξεῖας Reiske: ὀξεῖα.

association and contact with strangers, and take the omens before the oracle, thinking that it is clear to the god when she has the temperament and disposition suitable to submit to the inspiration without harm to herself. The power of the spirit does not affect all persons nor the same persons always in the same way, but it only supplies an enkindling and an inception, as has been said, for them that are in a proper state to be affected and to undergo the change. The power comes from the gods and demigods, but, for all that, it is not unfailing nor imperishable nor ageless, lasting into that infinite time by which all things between earth and moon become wearied out, according to our reasoning. And there are some who assert that the things above the moon also do not abide, but give out as they confront the everlasting and infinite, and undergo continual transmutations and rebirths.  
 52. "These matters," I added, "I urge upon you for your frequent consideration, as well as my own, in the belief that they contain much to which objections might be made, and many suggestions looking to a contrary conclusion, all of which the present occasion does not allow us to follow out. So let them be postponed until another time, and likewise the question which Philip raises about the Sun and Apollo."