

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 1 **CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

SUMMARY

The Church of the Good Shepherd is nominated to the National Register of Historic Places for local significance under Criterion C in the areas of Architecture and Art. The 1882-1883 church is an excellent example of the Carpenter Gothic variant on the Late Gothic Revival Style, and was typical of early Florida settlers' use of local materials. The church includes lateral narthex and sacristy extensions, as well as a chancel extension. An open belfry with a pyramidal roof is located on the roof ridge. Original 1884 stained glass windows are executed in the Aesthetic Style, and are exceptional examples of this rare type of design. The church is nominated under the "Episcopal Carpenter Gothic Churches in Florida," Multiple Property Cover under the Historic Context "Episcopate of Bishop John F. Young, 1866-1885."

HISTORIC CONTEXT

Settlement adjacent to the site of Seminole War Era Fort Maitland was begun in the early 1870s. Important industries that promoted the development of the settlement were the arrival of the South Florida Railroad Company depot in 1880, and citrus growing that was spreading across Central Florida. The community also gained a reputation as a haven from the winter weather among wealthy Northerners. These seasonal residents built homes and invested in the citrus groves. The town was incorporated in 1885, and a small commercial district emerged in the 1890s. By 1900, the population was at 136 people. A public library built in 1907, was one of the state's earliest. By 1920 the population had only increased to 172 people. During the Florida Land Boom of the 1920s, residential subdivisions were added and the commercial area expanded. By 1930, the population was 511 people.¹ During the Great Depression the Maitland Art Center, an important community arts institution was established.

The property for the church was donated by Mr. C. H. Hall in 1875. The congregation was more formally begun in 1879, when people met in the parlor of winter resident Minnesota Bishop Henry Whipple's house across the street from the current church. The death of his son prompted Whipple to finance the church as a memorial to his son's memory. The construction was begun in 1882, and was completed by mid-1883.

¹ Alfred Hanna. Fort Maitland: Its Origin and History, Maitland, Florida: self published, 1936, p.12-47.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 2

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

ART CONTEXT

Aesthetic Style & Aesthetic Style Stained Glass

The Philadelphia International Exposition in 1876 marked the beginning in the United States of a period of increased popular attention paid to the arts, particularly the decorative nature of household products. Known as the Aesthetic Period, through travel and magazines the public became educated to the historic and international periods of design: Classical, Oriental, Gothic, Celtic, etc. Originating and defined in England, the style or movement was disseminated to the United States, and Oscar Wilde's 1882 American speaking tour brought it to everyone's attention. The phrase "art for art's sake," embodied the motivation that art is not didactic, but purely a thing of beauty and enjoyment. This approach to design began in England in the 1860s as a reaction to the standardization resulting from the Industrial Revolution. Prominent English designers Charles Eastlake and Christopher Dresser popularized the eclectic borrowing and blending of patterns and styles in books, graphics for publications, furniture, wall paper, and numerous household items. Designs emphasized flat, non-dimensional features often derived from plant forms.

Such design approaches were admirably suited to stained glass design which is based on fields of color and line. Some of the best known windows in this style are in New York's Greenwich Village, 1876, Jefferson Market Courthouse.² The windows are attributed to Charles Booth. The Aesthetic Period was an eclectic period. Stained glass that reflected this approach was produced in the 1870s and 1880s. One of the frequently used ornamental devices in English stained glass of the style was a lightly colored or muted pallet for the compositions in contrast to the richly colored Gothic Revival. Figural representations were usually reduced in size and were contained within medallions or cartouches set within lightly colored geometric backgrounds. These backgrounds were often glass squares with painted rosettes and repeating stylized ornaments in the center. Figures that were composed with graceful sweeping lines and faces exuded quiet or blissful expressions, in a manner often referred to as Pre-Raphaelite and associated with the figure art of Burne Jones. Leaded panels traditionally have borders, and during this period the border pieces were frequently given a sophisticated glass-painted ornamental treatment with the designs based on nature forms.

² Metropolitan Museum of Art, "In Pursuit of Beauty: Americans and the Aesthetic Movement." New York: Rizzoli, 1986, p.19

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 3

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

ARCHITECTURAL SIGNIFICANCE

The Church of the Good Shepherd is an excellent example of the Carpenter Gothic subset of the Late Gothic Revival. Along with its beautifully proportioned nave, the Gothic form was elaborated by additional elements. The church's chancel is a northern extension with sides recessed from the main body of the church. It has a southeastern corner lateral extension for a narthex. The main entrance to the narthex is through double panel doors that together form a pointed arch. At the eastern junction of the chancel to the nave is a sacristy. Placed on the roof ridge near the north end is a belfry with pointed arch openings on the four sides. It is capped with a steep pyramidal roof with a cross at its peak.

The Church of the Good Shepherd is one of the few Episcopal Carpenter Gothic churches in Florida whose architect is currently recorded, and one of the very few whose builder is known. The architect was Charles C. Haight of New York City, who was a member of the Ecclesiological Society. He likely had contact with Florida's Bishop John Freeman Young at Trinity Cathedral in New York. The builder is known from the annual diocesan reports as a "Mr. McGuire a northerner."³ In the course of preparing this nomination, a little information has surfaced about James A. McGuire.

The Church of the Good Shepherd is one of eight recorded Episcopal Carpenter Gothic churches in Florida with the distinctive 3-inch-sided triangular battens. One speculation is that this feature reflects the influence of the builder. The Church of the Good Shepherd is a very rare example of one of only two known Episcopal Carpenter Gothic churches in Florida with ventilators below the windows. St. Mary's Episcopal in Green Cove Springs is the other example. Apart from the porch extension to the narthex, the level of architectural integrity is very high. The church's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and associations convey its history and significance.

³ Journal of the 38th Annual Council of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the Diocese of Florida, Jacksonville, FL: Ashmead Bros., 1881, p.62.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 4

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

James A. McGuire (?- 1918)

McGuire was from somewhere in New England, and died in Brooklyn, New York, in September of 1918. In addition to the Episcopal Church of the Good Shepherd in Maitland, he also built the Episcopal Church of the Holy Cross in Sanford,⁴ and St. Mary's in Green Cove Springs.⁵ A Joseph McDonald formed a business partnership with McGuire when McDonald arrived in Florida in 1881. They built the Seminole Hotel in Winter Park, and the Clarendon Hotel in Green Cove Springs. The partnership also built the San Marco Hotel in St. Augustine, where Henry Flagler visited and learned of them. Flagler had them build the Ponce de Leon Hotel (1886), the Alcazar Hotel, Grace Methodist Church, Memorial Presbyterian Church, Union Station (1888), and Kirkside (1893), Flagler's home. They built the Hotels at Ormond (1891), Royal Poinciana (1895), Royal Palm of Miami (1897), The Colonial in Nassau, Bahamas (1899), Whitehall (1901), and The Breakers (1905). The partners kept an office in the Ponce de Leon Hotel. And illustrating how well connected they had become the partners held the liquor licenses for the Alcazar and San Marco Hotel in St. Augustine, in 1899. About that time McDonald moved to Miami, and McGuire stayed in St. Augustine. McGuire built and owned the Valencia Hotel in 1891, and supervised the mausoleum addition onto Flagler's Presbyterian Church. He rebuilt the Casino on the upper floors of the Alcazar after a fire.⁶

Haight, Charles Coolidge, F.A.I.A. (1841-1917)

Charles Coolidge Haight, architect, was born in New York City in 1841, the son of the Rev. Benjamin L. Haight, the assistant rector of Trinity Church. He died February 8, 1917, at his home at Garrison-on-Hudson, New York. Height graduated from Columbia College after studying law in 1861, and served as a Lieutenant and Captain of the Thirty-ninth New

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Gilbert Wilson (a.k.a. Dr. Bronson), www.drbronsontours.com "St. Augustine History," accessed September 30, 2010.

⁶ Thomas Graham, Chapter 7, "The Flagler Era," *The Oldest City*, Jean Parker Waterbury, editor, St. Augustine, Florida: The St. Augustine Historical Society, 1983, p.193. Harvey, Karen, *St. Augustine and St. Johns County: A Picture History*, Virginia Beach, Virginia: The Donning Company/Publishers, Inc., 1980. p.85, 90. Wilson, Gilbert, drbrnson web site.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 5 **CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

York Volunteers during the Civil War. He studied architecture in the office of Emlyn Little. His first major commission was in 1874 for Columbia College's School of Mines, later the architecture building. By the mid-1880s, his practice was well established, designing schools, churches, and public buildings, mostly in the Gothic Style.

Haight designed the brick buildings of Columbia College on Madison Avenue, now removed, and those of the General Theological Seminary in Chelsea Square. For Yale University, he designed Vanderbilt and Phelps Halls; the library; the Mason, Sloane and Osborn laboratories; as well as new dormitories for the Sheffield School. Other buildings designed by Haight were the New York Cancer Hospital, St. Ignatius' Church, the Havemeyer House, the Second Field Artillery Armory in the Bronx, the Garrison Chapel of St. Cornelius on Governor's Island, and the Keney Memorial Tower in Hartford, Connecticut. He was a member of the Loyal Legion and the University, Century and Church Clubs of New York, and the St. Nicholas Society. He was elected an Associate of the American Institute of Architects in 1867 and a Fellow in 1869, and was a member of the Architectural League of New York in 1890, and of the National Sculpture Society.⁷

ART SIGNIFICANCE

Good Shepherd's original 18 stained glass windows were donated by the Minnesota Diocese in honor of family and friends of Bishop Henry Whipple who had commissioned the church construction. The records for Church of the Good Shepherd do not reveal who executed the exceptionally fine stained glass windows. The attribution to the Charles Booth studio is based on records and photos of St. Luke's Episcopal Church in Lincoln, North Carolina.⁸ Their web site illustrated their windows and identified Charles Booth. The centerpiece figures and floral designs are identical, and the compositions, glass, and color selections match the windows in Good Shepherd. Striking similarities to Booth windows in Trinity Episcopal Church in Hannibal, Missouri, and Pine Street Presbyterian Church in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, reinforce the attribution.

⁷ Society of Architectural Historians, "Brief Biographies of American Architects," www.sah.org New York Times, Obituary, Feb. 10, 1917. MacKay, Robert B., Anthony Baker, Carol Travnor, Long Island Country Houses and Their Architects: 1860-1940. New York City: W.W. Norton and Co., Inc., 1997. Avery Architectural and Fine Arts Library, "Haight, Charles Coolidge (1841-1917) Collection."

⁸ St. Luke's Episcopal Church, Lincoln, North Carolina site www.episcopallincolntonnc.org/windows.htm

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 6

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

On display in the church's office conference room are some of the original, modest, leaded glass panels with rondel inserts that were used in the church when it was first constructed in 1883 (Photo #22). These panels were replaced with more elaborate memorial windows in 1884, and exhibit the same choice of glass and leading.

The most spectacular pair of windows and examples of the Aesthetic Style of artistry are the tall lancets in the south gable end of the church (Photo #13). In the center of each lancet is a kneeling angel, each facing the other, one with face raised and the other lowered. Each angel is framed in blue-glass lozenges pointed at each end, and by big wings that create a broad curve behind the figures. Above and below the angels are scrolls that crisscross the composition and contain inscriptions. Four large circular medallions with floral motifs are present, one up, one down in each window. The spaces in between the medallions and scrolls are filled with various lightly tinted glasses, and brightly colored flowers (Photo #23). The lightly tinted glass is covered with plant designs rendered in black, brown, and silver-stain yellow painting. The composition of shifting colors and patterns creates an unusually complex background.

A motif particular to the Aesthetic Style glass work was the use of lightly tinted squares used as the background, with painted ornaments centered on each. The Booth windows in the nave all exhibit this motif, and an excellent example is the Lynn family memorials in the eastern wall (Photo #24). Aesthetic Style glass of English manufacture often had borders with sophisticated painted ornamental designs based on nature forms. A narthex medallion depicting a lily includes corner ornamentation depicted with black outlines, brown shadowing, and silver-stain yellow highlights (Photo #25 & 12).

The north window behind the altar has a symbolic theme of Jesus Christ represented as the Lamb carrying the Christian banner (Photo #16). The window is the most dramatic color-wise, with the use of deep orange glass filling a double-pointed lozenge medallion representing light. The figural windows on the east and west sides of the chancel depict angels set within double-pointed lozenge medallions, and are all derived stylistically from Renaissance figures, in keeping with the eclectic borrowing of styles (Photo #17).

As the stained glass was manufactured by either English craftsmen, or in London, the windows in Church of the Good Shepherd are a large ensemble and a pure example of the

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 7

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

Aesthetic Style. They constitute probably the finest collection and expression of the style in stained glass in Florida.

Booth Art Glass

Charles Booth was born in Liverpool, England, in 1844. He had immigrated to the United States by 1869 when he married Sarah Roberts in St. Luke's Protestant Episcopal Church, Brooklyn. They moved to Orange, New Jersey, where he had a stained glass workshop in a shed in his back yard. In 1870, Booth formed the Slack and Booth Studio with another talented English-born glass artist, Stephen Slack, who had worked locally in the trade since 1860. Booth opened a showroom and office in New York City. In 1876, Slack started another business and Booth started Booth Art Glass, continuing the Orange, New Jersey, shop and New York City showroom.

In 1880, the Booths moved to London, and acquired Edward Cook's old glass firm at 115 Gower Street.⁹ He maintained his branch in New York, which was managed by Charles F. Hogeman. Hogeman moved into the Booth's old house, kept the workshop in Orange, and the showroom in New York City. The firm was known as Booth and Hogeman. Booth died in 1893, but Hogeman kept the American branch open under the name Charles F. Hogeman, until 1930. Booth windows are to be found from the northeast and east coast to Michigan, Texas, Colorado, Tennessee, and now Florida.¹⁰

Booth's New York promotional materials show designs in keeping with the popular eclectic Aesthetic Style. The style of painting coming out of the Orange, New Jersey, shop reflected a refined English style of painting. Further understanding of the firm may reveal whether the glass painting was done in London, or by English painters working in New Jersey, or both.¹¹

⁹ Metropolitan Museum, p.404.

¹⁰ Robert O. Jones, Biographical Index of Historic American Stained Glass Makers, Raytown, Missouri: Stained Glass School of the Stained Glass Association of America, 2002. p.15,57.

¹¹ Donald L. Clapper, an organist from Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, should be cited for his generous sharing of his historic research. His contributions provide much of what is currently known about the Booth Studio. Clapper has shared his findings with churches and the Biographical Index cited in section #9.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 8 Page 8

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

Also of interest as examples of the Aesthetic Style stained glass produced probably by an American studio are the "Minnesota," and Eaton memorial windows in the west wall of the Good Shepherd nave (Photo #26). Glass "jewels" and ripple glass were used to construct the panels, and painted glass was used to render flowers and framing for two centerpiece medallions. One is of the crest of the office of the Minnesota Episcopal bishop, Henry Whipple, the early promoter of the church and sponsor of the building. The other is an anchor with an inverted United States flag. Above the anchor medallion is an exceptionally fine painted image of a child holding flowers, possibly a portrait of the person memorialized. The windows have patterns and floral elements common to the Aesthetic Style as well as Renaissance derived border elements around the medallions and child painting.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 9 Page 1 **CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

BIBLIOGRAPHY

"Brief Biographies of American Architects," Society of Architectural Historians,
www.sah.org

Beatty, Bob, interviewed by Charlotte Everbach, December 2010. Funded the access ramp
and porch extension in 1988.

Clapper, Donald L., unpublished Charles Booth research shared with St. Luke's Episcopal
Church, Lincolnton, North Carolina. www.episcopallincolntonnc.org.

Graham, Thomas, "Flagler Era," Chapter 7, editor Jean Parker Waterbury, The Oldest City.
St. Augustine, Florida: The St. Augustine Historical Society, 1983.

"Haight, Charles Coolidge (1841-1917)," Collection. Avery Architectural and Fine Arts
Library.

Hanna, Alfred. Fort Maitland: Its Origin and History, Maitland, Florida: self published,
1936.

Harvey, Karen, St. Augustine and St. Johns County: A Pictorial History. Virginia Beach,
Virginia: The Donning Company/Publishers, Inc., 1980.

Jones, Robert O., Biographical Index of Historic American Stained Glass Makers,
Raytown, Missouri: Stained Glass School of the Stained Glass Association of
America, 2002.

Journal of the 38th Annual Council of the Episcopal Diocese of Florida, 1881. (Mention of
Bishop Whipple as donor, and McGuire as builder)

MacKay, Robert B., Anthony Baker, Carol Traynor, Long Island Country Houses & Their
Architects; 1860-1940,. New York City: W.W. Norton & Co., Inc., 1997.

Metropolitan Museum of Art, In Pursuit of Beauty: Americans and the Aesthetic
Movement. New York: Rizzoli, 1986, p.19, 404.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET**

Section number 9 Page 2

**CHURCH OF THE GOOD SHEPHERD,
MAITLAND, ORANGE COUNTY,
FLORIDA**

New York Times, Obituary [Charles C. Haight], February 10, 1917.

Whipple, Rt. Rev. H.B., Lights and Shadows of a Long Episcopate. New York: The
McMillan Company, 1902.

Wilson, Gilbert, www.drbronsontours.com "St. Augustine History." accessed September
30, 2010.