

Sample of Developmental Critique

By Reba Chaisson

Hello XXXX:

I read your draft and I must say that you have collected very good information on Title IX. There is certainly enough there to produce a good paper on the subject. I do of course have several comments and suggestions concerning how you make use of the information you found on Title IX. There is no significance to the order of my comments.

1. The paper presents a lot of facts about Title IX but they are not presented in a manner that moves toward any point. What is your point? What are you arguing here? Is/was Title IX a good law or not? Why/why not?
2. Try outlining. Refer to the Research Guide I disseminated in class. It is very specific about an outline for nearly any topic.
3. Write a conclusion. Is/was Title IX a good law or not? Why/Why not? Again, see the Research Guide for help with this. The conclusion is in effect a restatement of your Introduction (your stance).
4. You have talked about your daughter's woes with football at her school. Speaking to this in your paper can convey the importance of the topic for you. It gives it relevance. In sum, approach your paper differently. Begin with YOU. Clearly explain Title IX and its scope. Talk about the problem of gender discrimination (i.e. your daughter). Find facts that indicate that schools are or are not complying. You are not clear on this in your paper; your statements on this are contradictory. Conclude: is the law or isn't the law an effective tool for eradicating gender bias in school sports/activities? Also stay within the scope of schools. Professional occupations do not fall under the purview of Title IX.
5. Finally, I know you understand this material quite well and I have told this to you before. Your comments in class indicate that you do and hints of this have shone through in your papers. However, I need to see you present it in an organized and logical manner. In short, I need you to use your research and your understanding of it to build an argument. You are dealing with institutional discrimination here as well as the issue of equity, and the reproduction of gender relations (among other things). Integrate your understanding of these concepts into your paper. I know it is a challenge for you, but if it were not then you would not be learning to think and write critically. I cannot overemphasize the importance of these skills. You can do this. I have not doubt whatsoever. Hang in there.