

HOUSING AUTHORITY OF THE CITY OF JERSEY CITY
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETING – NOVEMBER 4, 2015

PRESENT: VICE CHAIR, REGINALD JONES
COMMISSIONER, Aneesah Abdullah
Commissioner, Hector Fuentes
Commissioner, Freddie Kitchens
Commissioner, Thomas Kukla

COUNSEL: Mitchell Pasqual, Esquire
Chasan Leyner & Lamparello, PC

STAFF: Marvin L. Walton, Executive Director/Secretary
Patricia Madison, Deputy Executive Director
Carmen Carrillo, Assistant Secretary to the Board
Sam Moolayil, Chief Financial Officer
Steven Cea, Director of Development & Design
Eilleen Ingram-Willis In-house Legal Counsel
Joyce Worthington, Director: Dept. of Compliance & Technical Support
Kenneth Pinnock, Purchasing
Vicki Guingon, Director Human Resources
Patricia Ramirez, Director Section 8, Rental Assistance

ABSENT: Raj Mukherji

Meeting commence at 6:00 p.m.

Vice Chair Jones: I called this meeting to order.

Vice Chair Jones: We will rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.
Pledge of Allegiance was done.

Vice Chair Jones: Can we have a roll call:

Marvin Walton: Commissioner Abdullah, here, Commissioner Fuentes, here,
Commissioner Kitchens, here, Commissioner Kukla, Vice Chairman Jones, here,
Chairman Mukherji, absent.

Mr. Walton will read the Public Meetings Act.

Mr. Walton: In accordance with the requirements of the Open Public Meetings Law this Meeting was advertised in, the Jersey Journal, the Hudson Reporter, the City Clerk's office and the JCHA Website. For the record that the minutes of this regular meeting reflect that adequate notice of this meeting has been announced as is required by the Open Public Meetings Act.

Vice Chair Jones announced: Do we have any public speakers on tonight's agenda?

Mr. Walton, yes we have six (6) speakers this evening.

The first speaker is Robin Stewart, Trustee - Booker T. Washington – I would like to thank the executive director and the entire Jersey City Housing Authority staff with addressing the heating problem we had. I am going to finally realize that you are going to help the people at Booker T. Mrs. Madison can you update me on the senior citizen's elevator lift ramp, it is still out of order.

Patricia Madison, Deputy – the work order has been placed by the manager to the company, so I can follow up the elevator company does have that on their list of things to repair. I do not know if they have not responded to the manager however, I will follow up with the company to make sure they respond to the manager.

Robin Stewart – did we work on a contract for the mice problem that is in Booker T.?

Mr. Walton: we just had the bid to close and Ken Pinnock can you speak on which firm was the successful bidder for extermination services?

Ken Pinnock - We did have a bid for pest management services but I cannot recall who the winner is at this point. But there were three (3) bidders.

Mr. Walton: we had three (3) bidders, we contracted with Corbett extermination that was an emergency contract because of the issue we were having at that time. But the idea is the vendor that we have is going to service our properties to do extermination services should address those issues. So we do have the three (3) bids and a contract will be awarded for sure at the December board meeting. So we will have a vendor onboard to address those issues.

Robin Stewart – Now, my questions will be is it at the same magnitude that it was at building 8 & 9? Buildings 8 & 9 are doing beautifully, the other buildings need it.

Mr. Walton: so they are experiencing a similar issue?

Robin Stewart – The ones across the street from the new warehouse, they want what we had done at 8 & 9 which is doing great.

Mr. Walton: we will get this addressed. My plans would be, before I entertain a request of the board to do an emergency contract I ask that we use an existing vendor that we have. So again, the bid has gone out we got three (3) responses and hoping we can get some action on that real soon.

Robin Stewart – are you saying existing, are you saying the previous stuff we were using before? I would like to know? Is that what you are telling me!

Mr. Walton: If memory serves me well we are currently using Alliance, our previous respondent, but I don't think Alliance was is the successful respondent. Now I am guessing so let me check and see, but if it is the same vendor than I will be concerned. If need be, we will do an emergency with Corbett, but I prefer we follow the procurement procedures. If we execute a contract with the successful bidder, we are should use that bidder and not do an emergency contract.

Robin Stewart – Mr. Cea you know what my questions is?

Mr. Walton: He is prepared, If I can refer to Mr. Cea to give us an update on the boilers for Booker T.

Mr. Steve Cea: As you know they are working there. They are removing & putting particular pipes and setting up on and off valves. They are doing this work in your particular building (9) it maybe that they are not directly underneath your apartment but they are there. They have been there for two weeks, what they are doing and how they are doing it I don't know, but they know the first place they have to put the units in building 9 and building 8 is next. We talked about how it is going to work how 8 will feed off 9. I spoke to NJFMA today and the last time you were here everything was done except the insurance. But know the insurance is done the bonds are done, everything is complete the only thing that NJMFA has to do is internally set up their closing date. I have and the attorneys have advise them the date that the closing is we will be present. We are definitely closing no matter what day it is. Closing documents have been prepared and reviewed by our attorneys. Heather Suarez had no problem with the documents. So it is just a matter of a phone call and we will close. I was made a promise by them by Thanksgiving.

Mr. Walton: I would like to add a piece to that even though a closing date has not been granted. I have authorized the vendor to proceed with the work. So before we were at a stalemate, the closing date was a driving factor. I pray that no invoice come in before the closing date, as long as that happens we will be ahead of the eight ball if they start the work now and not waiting to closing to commence the work. Either way if the housing authority has to end up paying, in which I don't predicate this happening. We can pay because the problem with NJHMFA do not do a reimbursement so you have to pay after the work has been complete as oppose to us pay and then requesting reimbursement from NJHMFA. So the ball is rolling.

Robin Stewart – I know it is I appreciate it. Thank you.

Mr. Walton – the next speaker I have is also from Booker T. Washington, Sonya Coleman.

Sonya Coleman – hello, good evening everyone I would to talk about in the back of buildings 8 & 9 is a parking lot. It is for the tenants in one side and the other side is car rails. You have lots of cars parking on that side, you have school buses from Hudson Catholic, you have a lot going on but the other thing is me and Robin sat in my car the other day and I wanted to see how these vehicles fly fast, they fly right thru. The speed bumps are two low they need to be redone because that is going to cause a big problem. Then I would like to discuss the parking lot for the tenants.

Mr. Walton – can I talk about the speed bumps? We talked about this before; remember those speed bumps are not property of the JCHA. This is when the residents have contact the resident response center and make your complaint there. Because I drive thru there every day and I know what you are talking about. They are low to the ground and people will speed thru there. Nothing we can do but I can still make a call to but it helps if the residents call the Resident Response Center because the city is responsible for the speed bumps.

Sonya Coleman – Okay, no problem I will get other people to call. Then I would like to speak about the parking spaces, I have nowhere to park. You are supposed to have a parking sticker but everyone there just parks then if I park in the front I have a big thing with Beloved because the parents block my car and I will be late for work. So I don't know which way to go with this.

Mr. Walton – you are bringing it to the correct place and there are property managers that can contact the towing company that will tow vehicles if they do not have the stickers. We have to make sure that this is fully enforced. Mrs. Madison will take care of this. Anything else? Thank you.

The next speaker is Ethel Jones, Chairperson of Booker T. Washington Tenant Association - Absent.

The next speaker I have is Curries Woods Task TAB – Barbara Wise – Absent.
Williemae Tucker - absent,

The last speaker I have is Telissa Dowling – I didn't mess up your name did I? I have her down as a community activist and I explained to her that since she is not a resident she introduce herself and let us know the case she wants to present to the board.

Telissa Dowling – no you didn't mess up the name. Good evening. For those who don't know me, my name is Telissa Dowling and I was born and raised in Hudson County and my mom was original tenant at Marion when I was born. I do have some roots not only in public housing but I have roots in the community. A lot of my residents that are here know me. I am always concern because I sat in the National Low Income Housing

Coalition Board in Washington DC for nine years. I still advocate on the Federal level for these programs. That is how I met a lot of the residents here thru training and empowering those residents to be full participants in their housing authority in their communities. So I waited and found out we have a new executive director coming in I gave him six months and I appreciate what he has done. I do appreciate it the fact that the new executive director has been very transparent. Because the information that I have been begging from this housing authority is now out there. I have downloaded the Agency Plan and what effects it has on the coalition. I sit on the Hudson County Homeless Service and a lot of your managers know that I fight for services for the homeless. I see that you guys have a contract with United Way and I am concern because I know Patricia does a great job administering the vouchers but what happens to the residents that get put out of public housing. While they be denied access to rapid rehousing dollars because you are now administrating those dollars? I have concerns? I read about large units? I know that HUD will provide you with more money for larger families in those units. This was my issue with the past administration, they were so many units that were offline. It automatically starts demolish dispose for the building, where the numbers of those units are. Last time I ask for that information it was 6% vacancy rate across the housing authority. I would like to know where that is because right now Hudson County is the second largest County with highest homeless population in the State. We need to get those people in those units. Do you re open the agenda to talk about the agenda items or do I incorporate that also.

Marvin – all agenda items in order are for approval tonight will be presented tonight.

Mitchell Pasqual – counselor – you may speak during the public comment period on any resolution you want. Once we discuss the resolution it is closed from public session.

Telissa – Because I see on item no #9 – Resolution regarding the memorandum on Garden State Episcopal supervise (Section 8 vouchers).

Marvin – if you will allow me I have staff here who oversees that particular contract. Mrs. Patricia Ramirez would speak on what would compensate that resolution.

Patricia Ramirez – good evening Garden State Episcopal has been award vouchers through HUD and thru the County and homeless persons. We haven't been award the vouchers Episcopal has. They are looking for us to do the housing part. Garden State Episcopal does not have the supportive services. They do not have the manpower to do the leasing to search for the units, to execute contracts. So we have some of these MOUs. What they are asking the housing authority is the help them administer the vouchers for them. They are going to provide the supportive services we are going to do the housing search, rent studies, inspections and calculation of rent. This is what basically what we do.

Telissa – so you are going to be getting part of the admin fees because it only comes with 7% percent. How many vouchers are we talking about? How long?

Patricia Ramirez – Initially we are talking about 12 vouchers. It for a year and with the option to renew in an annual basis.

Telissa – item#12 is refinancing what are you guys refinancing?

Marvin – refinancing item#12 the agency here participated here in an Escrow which Energy Service Contract back in 2010. Actually, it is energy retro fits. Throughout our properties we concentrated on light fixtures, shower heads and toilets. They were all replaced. So when you do that type of work HUD allows us to do an energy services agreement and the agreement that we had been with Simens but that came to a tune of \$8.5 million dollars. So what we do is the way the Escrow program works is if you have a frozen rolling base of utilities for the last three (3) years at that given port and this agency chose frozen rolling base. So energy consumption expenditure levels were here, they took the consumption average for a three (3) year period. And if you consumption come in below that level and that is what this agency has been successful in doing, then HUD allows you to pay back the debt from the savings. So we initially set up this contract this loan which was for a 15 year period and at the time it was initially financing and this is a second refinancing. Initially it started at 7% percent and it went down to 5% percent. Back up it started at 5.32 percent and it dropped down to 2.95% percent and now we are able to get 2.2% percent. So now we are saving even on the debt service payment. So it is a win, win for the housing authority you not only saving from the utility cost perspective but you also saving when it comes to paying back the actual debt. So that is what this refinance is about.

Telissa – I'm glad you mention it because I do know there was an energy service done I think it was about solar panels back the last time I came here couples a years back. Have the solar panels been paid?

Marvin – yes it is part of this. The solar panels are at the Holland Gardens development and actually what it is doing is and I had an opportunity to visit there recently where the hot water is now being heated by the solar panels and there is this whole process the water goes thru and right back out into the property. It is an interesting site to see that being there successful. But if the agency and we haven't looked this far yet to see if there is going to be any future phases on the Escrow project. You kind of want to get the phase I which was done so under the belt you want to get to the 15 year repayment period before you commit into the future debt to it. But if you experience a large amount of savings like we are doing there it is advantage to the housing authority to begin future phases now. But we have not talked about that yet but there is an opportunity.

Telissa – the trouble agency status?

Marvin – this agency is no longer in trouble status. We are a standard agency but we are sub-standard financially which means we do not have the adequate reserves on hand to pay the expenses. We have a game plan that we are implementing here to help hopefully eradicate that. My plans are hopefully by the end of this current fiscal year we will get the adequate points from a reserve perspective at the properties. The plan that I have rolled

out we should be there. We are fully implementing the Asset base management model, which states any funds that are generated by the property are kept at the property. Any expenditures that occur at the property remain at the property. No longer will the central office bailing out the property and vice versa. So we now have a Director of Development and Chief Financial Officer, those two positions were vacant and they are now filled with competent staff who are familiar with HUD regulations as well as the procedures that we have to take so we can implement this model properly across our properties. In addition to that, you weren't here last month but also you are right that the percentage was high at 9% percent for our vacancies. With them there it may be a large percentage of the larger units because we do have two six bedrooms out here that are not occupied but you have to understand the way public housing works we have a waiting list. Even though we have a six unit family that needs housing we cannot circumvent the waiting list. We have thousands of applicants on our waiting list. When I attended my first Board meeting in May of this year, a lady stood up and stated that she had finally gotten a letter after being on the waiting list for ten (10) years. It doesn't happen rapidly like it should. Last month the Board approved a vacancy turn project. We awarded three (3) contracts to vendors to turn our 9% percent vacancies that we have here at JCHA. But we also have applicants on a waiting list that we can send out letters to get those unit filled. Follow me if you can I just told you we were sub-standard financially we have roughly 9% percent vacant units across the portfolio. HUD provides subsidy but the rental income is not coming in for those units because they are vacant. So if we can fill those vacancies, we will have additional revenues being recognized at those properties. We are sub-standard financially so that means we can't necessarily meet the debt that we have. So if you have more revenue coming in and your expenditures are maintained at a certain level and you cannot go anywhere but up which is where we want to be here at JCHA.

Telissa – I will be at the agency plan on November 19th to ask more questions. There has been a gap between the past leadership. That is why a lot of the residents haven't been able to advocate the way they wanted to because there was retaliation against those families. We need to get the word in the housing authority out because you have to acknowledge that in order to move past it.

Marvin – Well there is no retaliation with those families her at the Jersey City Housing Authority. The president of the TAB just walked in and that is the partnership that we are developing here. Now that we have unveiled the agency annual plan and the doors are open and we will entertain any one on one meeting with any of the tenant association that would like to discuss the plan. Things changed a little, we changed the process a little bit this year instead of setting up four or five meetings, meetings will be set up on demand and as of today, November 4th we have not received a request from any of the tenant associations to sit down and discuss any components of the annual plan. But the door has been open since October 1, 2015. So again, it's a little different but I thought this would work better than us just setting meetings up but we will meet at your demand if you want to sit down and talk. The way I interpret that is everything is fine we don't have any questions. Because if you have questions I will be having requests for meeting. You have until 12 noon on November 16th to give all questions or comments in. But I still will

entertain setting up a meeting discussing anything in the annual plan if they send the request in.

Robin: Mrs. Jones wanted me to speak to you Mrs. Madison about having that done if possible we are talking about Tuesday, questions she has with annual plan. Meeting is at 6:00 p.m.

Marvin – here is what I am going ask you to have Mrs. Jones do. Have Mrs. Jones reach out to my office directly with her request and they just need to let me know which component of the plans they would like to have discuss because I do not want to come out to the meeting and not know what they want to have discuss. If it is section 5 of the ACOP then put that in the request and we will make sure it happens. If Mrs. Madison is not available adequate staff will be there to address the matter. Again, and the way I would like to see this happen is we will address any questions, it still should not prevent you from submitting your questions and comments but we can come out to clarify. Hopefully, if you have questions or do not understand we can add some clarity to it so either the question may go away or the question may be enhanced. Once you get the clarification on it.

Telissa – Enclosing can you put the bio of the new commissioners on the website so we can know who they are I see new faces.

Marvin – no problem – The Tenant Advisory Board has come in Mrs. Barbara Wise can you come forth.

Barbara Wise – good evening, sorry I am late. My name is Barbara Wise and I am the president of the Tenant Advisory Board. I am not here to bash anyone, I am not here to throw anyone underneath the bus. I am here concerning the Resident Council Board and the residents. Because it is a lot, we had a meeting on the 29th with the Executive Director, Mr. Walton and wasn't too pleased. There is a lot of changes taking away from the residents, you already know about the community hall taking away from the resident councils we know about the abolishment of the Currie Woods Senior Club stating that we have to have a 501 C (3) if needed and because the senior club collects the dues of four dollars when they have their meeting. I spoke to Andrea, Accountant, CPA she faxed over some information and she stated we do not need that because we just a small social club. We want to keep our senior social club, all the senior clubs on this site. I don't know if you commissioners know it's not like is a bunch of buildings out here. Its only six sites standing up and it is a shame that there are a lot of residents who work hard who brought resident council to Jersey City Housing Authority. We are supposed to be working together, I hear you say about partnership; I'm just going to read you here this it said "HUD promote partnerships between residents and the housing authority" How can we have a partnership when we have a meeting and everything gear towards the housing authority it's not gear towards the residents, everything is being taken away from the resident councils, we feel that you are trying to demolish the resident councils. But we are not going to let that happen we are going fight all the way. The resident council now you want to take the leadership keys from them. We ask for TAB board and space for

that and we haven't received the space, we stated that we had more meetings with the Chairman Raj at the time of Vice President Mrs. Abdulla was there, Reggie he came. It was stated that we needed this space here for TAB. Our resident council board rooms are inside the community centers. We don't need anyone to call and say come open the door for us. We understand that things disappear, but it is not the resident council. We have cameras there they can go back and look. It seems like the resident council is being disrespected all the way and it is shame because we fought to have a resident council board. We were up here fighting the previous administration we want to have that partnership with this administration but it seems like it is not working because everything is geared towards housing authority. Nothing is geared towards the resident. Our community centers with the lab (computer room) the children cannot go in there, the residents cannot do resumes or anything like that. It doesn't make any sense then when you come in there we have here it said that "housing authority the resident council advises and assists the housing authority". Every time we have a meeting what we say is being pushed to the side and that is not right. We have an opinion too and HUD recommends have a partnership, so we want the partnership. But you are not allowing us to have the partnership, as HUD says you have 90 days or whatever, if we have no partnership, we going keep on stepping and going to get some help from somebody else. We want this partnership but don't take and strip us from everything, we work hard for that. We understand that you are running a business but we were running a business too when we were controlling the community centers. We understand that everything has changed but now you want us to tell the leadership no give me the keys back. That's like the commissioners telling you the executive director well I'll tell you from now you have to call one of us up to get into the building. That is not fair or not right. So we are asking you to think about what you are doing and get this partnership on. That is all we are asking!

Marvin – are you done?

Barbara Wise – yes! And it is in the book now! Because that is what you ask me. Flip out the book it's in the 964.

Marvin – thank you so very much going thru the regulations because I am a firm believer and continue to be, the regulations is what going to drive this process and I just want to comment on a couple of things that you said I have been here for six months. Don't you recall that I spent my first three weeks focusing on what? The residents, went to every single community meeting myself. Mrs. Wise replied "yes you did" Let me talk I didn't interrupt you when you were talking, if you don't mind just let me say what I have to say. It is not in retaliation to anything that you said. It's just that the picture you just painted wasn't a pretty picture and if that is the perception of what's going on than we need to get another artist to paint the picture. Because that picture you painted, from my perspective, is totally incorrect okay, I took this job with the known fact that in order to be successful at this job I have to have a great relationship with the residents and the tenant associations. I spent time doing my three E's; Engagement, Education and Empowerment and I stated to you all when I met with you, there is going to be some tough decisions we have to make here. There are some things broken that have to be fixed. The way we conducted business at the Jersey City Housing Authority has not been a

100% percent in compliance with the Federal Regulations there are some tough decisions we are probably going to have agree to disagree for some of them and I spent time, day in and day out following up establishing protocols. We now have follow ups after every resident council meeting that meets on a monthly basis. There is a follow up, the manager takes notes. These were things that were not happening before. I am not trying to preach my praises but when you come forth and put out a picture that you just painted I have to help those who are not aware that from my perspective, I think we are going the right direction. There is a partnership, I explained to you a partnership is just that. My day one when I met with you all the biggest concern I had was the way the community centers were being run; it was not standard across the JCHA portfolio. Some properties were given option to take their tenant participation funds or they were allow to run the community center.

That same 964 that you read, I want you to read down further where it clearly says “tenant participation funds is not an option” it is mandatory that every housing authority; it is a part of the public housing subsidy calculation formula that is set aside there, so as a housing authority we cannot make a decision to say as a tenant association, you can opt out of taking these funds and take those proceeds that are coming in from the rentals of the community centers.

I am not at liberty in doing that, no one is in liberty of doing that, I’m not sure how it was allowed to happen here, but I stopped it immediately when I found that out. Also, Asset Management clearly states anything that happens in an individual property being any income coming in or any expenditure that is being expensed has to remain at that property. So what did I do; when I got here there were no budgets. I set up budgets, I took it upon myself to establish but I didn’t pick numbers out the sky; I went out and looked at the historical spending for the last three years of this agency across each of the properties. I did not interrupt you madam!

Barbara Wise: Excuse you Mr. Walton I know you doing this, but I am doing all this so you don’t have to prolong it.

Marvin – We now hear this, I didn’t ask this. I want to read this into record because the statement you made madam chair you painted an awful picture and I cannot sit on my hands as you made that statement. I can’t you are going to have to bear with me okay, but I do apologize if you feel I am being prolonged and you heard this before but must do this. Because there are those who probably have concluded wow that is the way Jersey City Housing Authority is being run and these very minutes are being read by the public. So, I want the public to also have another perspective here on how we are going forward regardless of what is just being said and I’m going to continue to go so please I prefer that you won’t interrupt me because I am doing this for a particular reason. Not only with that peace but I can’t remember where I was but I will just jump right on it. I have been nothing but transparent since I’ve been here and my goal has been to continue to work with you whether you want to work with me or not. I am going to continue to be a regulatory driven executive director and I am going to end up being an in-your-face type of executive director. I am not going to sit back here and push paper. I am going to come

out to your community meetings and we going to sit down and we are going to have dialogue. I have invited you into the conversation, I haven't distance you from the conversation you are part of the conversation. We haven't even gotten to deal with the meat of the stuff that we need to deal with as a housing authority. I told you from day one, I didn't share the numbers with you just to be sharing it. I shared those numbers so you can see from what we are dealing with and how we got to have your involvement as we make these tough decisions as to what the direction this housing authority is going in. We are one JCHA and that includes the residents, that includes the staff that works here, that includes everybody the on the Board; one JCHA I'm not sure for whence we came but this is the direction we are going, as we going forward. But we can't do that with the "us" and "them" attitude! We can't, yes that whole piece around the community centers, I know it was a heavy, heavy lift; it was like that big old horse pill to swallow that it couldn't go down even after you drunk two glasses of water. Well we have to somehow figure out how to get that pill to dissolve because the train has left the station on that. That is not going to change, and that is not being me inflexible, we have no other choice on that piece. There is a number of things that you all outlined to me when I met with you and again, I haven't rendered any decisions on that. I want to have a conversation with you about it but you state meeting after meeting; the only meeting I am aware of where there were some issues was this last meeting we had. So you got to be fair to the executive director, you can't come to the board meeting and say we had all these meetings which we have had, because I have been very present at the properties and we talked about a number of things but you never had so many things that are on that list provided to me or said hey executive director by the way these are the things we discussed with the board. I never had an opportunity to address that so that is not fair to me. When I came here I explained to you my protocol was you can't come to the executive director to address the issues you are having at the property. Each property has an asset manager and the agency has a deputy executive director.

My recommendation is if you want to speak to me about a property related issue you should at least touch bases with the both the asset manager and the deputy executive director. You have to give them an opportunity to fulfil their roles. If you fill they are not adequately addressing your issue you have a right to come to the executive director. The first question my assistant Carmen Carrillo will ask, is have you spoken to the property manager? Have you spoke to the deputy executive director? Upon an answer of yes and I did not get the appropriate resolved she will set up a meeting with you on any Friday of the month that you can come in and meet with the executive director. I've had several of those meeting so, I'm not being defensive those who are hearing what I am saying, I am painting another picture other than what you have presented because that picture to me is not the picture that should be painted.

Now I say that to say this, I am still open and will continue to be open as long as I occupy this job as executive director of the housing authority to meet with the tenant advisory board, the resident councils, I am open to meet with any of them so we can sit down and talk and lets address the business issue. I am a regulatory executive director and I have a business mind set and the decisions that I make are going to be business driven and they are all justifiable. So I can address some of the things you talked about! I talked

about the community room, so that is one of those that you can talk and keep but that decision is not going to be changed because that is 100% percent regulatory. The piece around the whole with the senior club, again what did I do when I arrived here, as I found out things my perspective with the little business knowledge that I have that are not being done correctly I put a halt on them. The senior club at Curries Woods was the very first one because when I met with you all what did you tell me you were doing? You collecting dues and selling stuff (fundraising) and you are taking in proceeds and you were not an official non-profit organization. By the IRS definition if you are collecting proceeds. So again, as you ask your accountant and the other folks who work with you, you got to be transparent with them. You can't tell them bits and pieces to get your desire response. You got to be completely transparent and give them whole picture. Yes, you want to make it seem like you just this little social club, you are bigger than a social club because the things that you are doing. You have to let me finish because I have to do this, you got to be completely transparent. Andrea, your accountant, I do not know her but I've only spoken to her twice and she seems to have a good accountant and she is a CPA. But if you go back and revisit with her and give her the full picture, I don't think you are going to get the same response from her as you stated you did. I am not here to tear down any of it, so your conclusion of me wanting to destroy the resident association is beyond false. Because I am not, even if I decided to take that route that is failure from the onset.

Okay, and my goal is not to fail at this role it is to succeed and there is going to be and has to be a partnership. Not a dictatorship, I am not a dictator. I believe in sitting down and talking, one meeting does not get it. It normally takes one meeting to get the stuff out and now you have your agenda of things that you are going to discuss. That one meeting doesn't make the decisions, it doesn't and I really feel strongly that meeting we had last week you took as a he is final, he is done. No, all I ask for you to do come to me with your proposals, I got to pull proposals out of you that is not my role. My role is help and assist you. I want the Jersey City Housing Authority to be the National model and I do and I am striving to get there. I can't get there by myself, yes it takes the partnership for it.

So I just say this to say, I don't like to address things like this in public but if you start with a picture that is false from my perspective I can't sit over here on my hands, and I will not. It is not Marvin's way I can only be who I am and be real in it and I've been nothing but that since I've have been here. You may have not liked some of things I've done or the decisions I have made. You should ask Mr. ED you made that decision or is that the recommendation you are making? Can you help substantiate why you feel that way? And then I can share with you a number of things. It is not to publically humiliate anybody, but facts are facts, I only act off of facts. Not hearsay of what I think or anything, in fact in any case, that is wrong. I do all in my power to change it and I will continue to do that. I am almost there, I know, I am sorry, I apologize, there are a couple of things you address well, Mr. ED now you want to take our keys, well how about asking me what does that mean, okay for those who don't know for the record so I can read in, I think on the community rooms, I think we got the picture but let me take it a little step further the current way the housing authority, when I arrived the housing authority the tenant association at some of the properties not all of them basically coordinated all the activity

in the community room. If someone want to have repass or party or whatever they contacted the tenant association. The tenant association supposedly had a log or logging in the entry that this person wants to utilize it etc. etc. and they would collect the proceeds. Proceeds would stay with the tenant association none of the proceeds went to the operations of the property. They stayed with the tenant association and it was only at some of the properties where I guess the agreement was and this all from what I was told and this has to be true because I do not think my staff would lie to me about this.

Anyway, so those who decided that I did not want my tenant participation funds okay so we got that. So in that if you are going to control the community room you also needs keys to get in. So each of them (tenant association leaderships, the chair, vice chair) got keys so that they can operate the community room. The resident council tenant association had access to the community room. I am not sure who had keys, but on each site each of them had one. So within that they coordinated the ins and outs of the community rooms. Okay, so when I arrived, I get a call on a Saturday, and this is just an example well yes it is an example but again, it is factual, I tend to make decisions based off of facts. On Saturday, May 30th at 4:15 p.m. and this is the truth, I was on Communipaw Avenue in my truck parking it so I can go get me a haircut and I got a call from Deputy Executive Director started work at the JCHA on 4/28/15, so I had only been here a little over a month and I get a call about something happened at Curries Woods and to be factual I am giving out the actual location. There is a rental scheduled and someone has entered the community room and taken chairs and looks like some other items (*I have pictures right here*). I share all of this with you, but some didn't believe me last week so again, I am not here to lie, let me share! Let me finish, I said I would share the information but not pictures, but I felt it necessary to bring the pictures so you can see this is not something fabricated.

Folks are seen taking out tables, chairs, dragging black trash bags of stuff and someone is seen pulling a bag of ice. I concluded a couple of things from the pictures that I saw that there personal things being stored in the community rooms there not control from the housing authority perspective of the assets in there; tables, chairs etc. But then there is other things that are being taken from here that are not being revealed but are in a black trash bag and dragged by someone. Again, this is not to put anybody on the spot. But this is factual this isn't fabricated. So when I hear this I say to the Deputy Executive Director how did they get into the community room? If they take the tables and chairs and someone has reserved the space, what happens if the folks who reserve the space come and tables aren't there? They paid the deposit to rent the community room, etc. so you can see the picture that is being painted there. I then thought to myself, there is a problem with this process. Curries Woods just happens to be the most sophisticated community room that we have that has cameras. But then we have a number of others that don't have cameras (*Commissioner Abdullah that we will be installing*) that we have no idea of what is going on. So again, my business instincts kicked-in to say you got to fix this Mr. ED. So temporary, it may be permanent but I figure out something because if it is happening at the most sophisticated one what you think is happening at the ones where the sophistication lacks.

The mind begins to wonder and my business sense says, okay let us look at the procedures, now the tenant associations do not have oversight to the coordination of the community rooms it is now the responsibility of the property management staff we need to shift this then this is also a part of the property manager responsibility that they should be the ones who coordinates the ins and outs of the community rooms. The other scenario but the other fact in there is the most of our tenant association if not all of them have offices within the community room, so there in itself is another big issue. If we remove the key, not even take the key, if we remove the keys from the tenant association, the asset manager can now be responsible. If the tenant association needs to use the room for a board meeting or use it for any community activities, what do they do? So that can happen that way we got to figure out how? So in my head and thinking through it, we got to get a temporary something in place because from what I see we don't have enough control to determine if this is happening at the other properties. So I am only going through this so you can understand the decisions I make. I don't make these decisions without thinking. I don't make these decisions to hinder or harm anyone but I got to do something, we can't sit here and can't we look at this with blind eyes and act like we don't see it. I got to do something.

Barbara Wise – wait a minute – no, no I appreciate the fact of what you are saying but being you are the executive director and everything and you had, why didn't you have that meeting with the resident council? That way you would have known who was taking out the black bags and why were they taking out the black bags. The black bags it was where somebody was having a party and some stuff was store in the freezer which you know we have food bank (just to store in the freezer) and they went there and got the stuff out for the party. If you would have had a meeting with us.

Marvin – but again, I have a problem with that because personal items should not be stored in those facilities because facts coming in and person towing a bag you don't know what is inside, your point is very well taken. The only problem with that is that should not be allowed. But again, when you look across these properties it is not uniformed this one does this, that one does that and that is what I got to bring and you have to help me with that we got to standardize it and it has to be consistent across the board. It can't be over here they get all the luxuries and they could do what they please.

Commissioner Abdullah – Enough is enough leave it alone ED. Mrs. Wise, I appreciate you coming.

Marvin – if you allow me just one minute to sum up my goal was not to put anybody on the spot once again, it just state the facts into and give another picture in supporting information around it because we all draw our conclusion from what we hear and I will continue to be the executive director that I am, and I am extending an olive branch as I've done since I have been here to the tenant advisory board and the resident councils and will continue to do so. We are going to make Jersey City Housing Authority the best housing authority in the State as well as the nation and we going to do that together not by ourselves. Thank you,

I have one more speaker and that is Williamae Tucker, from Curries Woods – I just have a little issue, yesterday I met with recreation manager, she came to meet with me and the board who met with me and the board briefly; she gave me five minutes in the hall way stating she had another meeting to attend. Tamika McReynolds from recreation and she stated that she was having a program brought to Curries Woods in reference to children our youth, but the problem I have with her bringing that information to me it was announce in church on Sunday that she was having this program and I was stun when I received a phone call at home on Sunday stating this program is in place when I was supposed to meet with her on Monday. So how do you go to church on Sunday and tell everybody that this is what is happening at Curries Woods. Did this happen Mr. Kitchens, yes it went out. I just want to say that is a slap in my face as President of the Curries Woods Tenant Task Force. I should have been aware of the situation long before the church members and I didn't really appreciate that. When I brought to your attention I sat it on the table when we had the meeting with TAB that of course she was bringing it and I wanted you to be aware that she wanted to bring this program. But already on Sunday she had had already out there. I have a problem with that.

Marvin – Okay, and I do too because I knew nothing about it. All I can tell you is this there is a meeting schedule on Thursday with their director of recreation, so maybe at that point they going to bring me in the loop. We met with Gary Nye about two months and remember when I told you all that someone from recreation's reached out to me and try to put computers back into Curries Woods computer center and that was Gary Nye who I met with. He met with us and has not followed up with us.

Williamae – well he was with her.

Marvin – Amazing, that is fine you know what I don't want you to get bent out of shape because I am the one who should be bent out of shape! I got that so I will discuss that and talk about that tomorrow with them, because this is a first I am hearing of them finalizing anything without the approval of the housing authority. You are right you should be upset and should have raised your hand with all due respect

Commissioner Abdullah – did she give a specific date on when this program is supposed to start?

Williamae – no, she is going to have a meeting with executive director.

Marvin – my question is would you like to have a program out there right?

Williamae – we got to have a program out there certainly.

Marvin – it may not be this one, or it may be delayed because of the process.

Williamae – that is fine but can we at least discuss it collectively as a task force.

Marvin – yes, yes. Did you think for one second that the executive director knew about that?

Williemae – I really don't know what to think, you know why because she sound so conveniencing and we had five minutes in the hall way and I have to go to a meeting and my director called me I have to go I can give you five minutes. She gave Donna who she thought was me the whole scenario.

Marvin – what I will do is this, I will discuss it with them I will try not to hinder the program because I know the program is needed at the property. I will share with them proper protocol going forward. I will not step in the way of the program because it sounds like something you want to happen. We are going to lean on the fact that there is no leadership there now. They have acting people, so it's a communication thing. I will take care of that tomorrow and inform them any programs that go on at the Jersey City Housing Authority thru the Recreation Department must be first vetted with the housing authority. Notice I said housing authority I didn't say the executive director, tenant association and I didn't say the TAB. JCHA we are one JCHA. If I know it you are going to know it.

Williemae – okay, that is all I ask.

Vice Chair Jones: that will conclude our public speaking portion.

Vice Chair Jones: do we have a motion to move item #1 to the conclusion of the end of the Agenda?

ITEM #1: RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING A CLOSED CAUCUS REGARDING PERSONNEL MATTERS, LITIGATION AND GRANT STRATEGY.

Commissioner Kitchens I make a motion....Moved by Commissioner Kitchens, second by Commissioner Abdullah...seeing no discussion we will close by unanimous consent.

Please call the ROLL:

There being no questions, comments, or discussion Mr. Walton took the roll. Commissioner Abdullah, yes Commissioner Fuentes, yes, Commissioner Kitchens, yes, Commissioner Kukla, yes and Vice Chair, Jones, yes.

Vice Chair Jones: do I have a motion to place Items #2 thru 13 on this evening's agenda and moved onto the consent agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Abdullah and seconded by Commissioner Fuentes to move items #2 thru 13 onto a consent agenda.

ITEM #2: RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE ACCEPTANCE OF THE MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS REGULAR MEETING OCTOBER, 2015.

- ITEM #3:** RESOLUTION BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE HOUSING AUTHORITY OF THE CITY OF JERSEY CITY APPROVING ACCOUNTS PAYABLE FOR THE MONTH OF NOVEMBER, 2015.
- ITEM #4:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING AWARD OF A CONTRACT TO RAYMOND GLASS COMPANY INC. FOR GLASS REPLACEMENT SERVICES FOR ALL JCHA OWNED DEVELOPMENTS FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS WITH OPTION FOR AN ADDITIONAL TWO (2) YEARS.
- ITEM #5:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AWARD OF A CONTRACT TO UNIVERSAL ELECTRIC MOTOR SERVICE, INC. FOR MOTOR AND ACCESSORIES REPAIR SERVICES "ON DEMAND" AT ALL JCHA DEVELOPMENTS FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS WITH AN OPTION FOR AN ADDITIONAL TWO (2) YEARS.
- ITEM #6:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AWARD OF A CONTRACT TO NORTH EAST AUTO & TRUCK PARTS FOR MACHINE SHOP SERVICES FOR ALL JCHA OWNED DEVELOPMENTS FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS WITH OPTION FOR ADDITIONAL TWO (2) YEARS.
- ITEM #7:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING AWARD OF A CONTRACT TO B&B EXCAVATING FOR EQUIPMENT RENTAL AND SERVICES FOR EXCAVATION AND CONCRETE REPAIR FOR ALL JCHA DEVELOPMENTS, FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS WITH OPTION FOR TWO (2) ADDITIONAL YEARS.
- ITEM #8:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING REVISIONS TO THE UTILITY ALLOWANCE SCHEDULE FOR TENANT PAID UTILITIES FOR THE JCHA HOUSING CHOICE VOUCHER (SECTION 8) AND PUBLIC HOUSING PROGRAMS.
- ITEM #9:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTION OF A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING WITH GARDEN STATE EPISCOPAL (GSECD) TO PROVIDE HOUSING AND SUPPORTIVE SERVICES UNDER THE DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT'S FINALLY HOME I AND II PROJECTS.
- ITEM #10:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AMENDMENT OF MULTIPLE SUPPLY CONTRACTS FOR VARIOUS JCHA DEVELOPMENTS FOR VACANT APARTMENT ALTERATIONS.
- ITEM #11:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AWARD OF A CONTRACT TO EASTGATE CONSTRUCTION CO., INC., FOR ROOF REPAIR & MAINTENANCE SERVICE "AS NEEDED", SHINGLE ROOFS, EPDM, AND BUILT-UP/MODIFIED ROOFS FOR ALL JCHA DEVELOPMENTS FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEAR WITH AN OPTION FOR TWO (2) ADDITIONAL YEARS.
- ITEMS #12:** RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE REFINANCE OF THE EPC LOAN WITH GRANT CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, INC., AND THAT MARVIN WALTON, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OR PATRICIA MADISON, THE DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR , SHALL ATTEND THE CLOSING TO EXECUTE ALL DOCUMENTS NECESSARY TO EFFECTUATE THE REFINANCE.

ITEM #13: RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING OFFICIAL TRAVEL BY JCHA BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF TO ATTEND DESIGNATED TRAINING WORKSHOPS AND CONFERENCES.

Vice Chair Jones: those are the items onto the consent agenda, seeing no discussion we will call the roll.

Mr. Walton took the roll. On Roll Call Vote, Commissioner Abdullah, yes, Commissioner Fuentes, yes, Commissioner Kitchens, yes, Commissioner Kukla, yes, and Vice Chair, Jones, yes...

Vice Chair Jones: do we have a motion on the consent agenda that we read.

Vice Chair Jones: Motion on the consent agenda: Moved by Commissioner Abdullah and seconded by Commissioner Fuentes.

Vice Chair Jones: The consent agenda is open for questions or comments or discussion. That is item 2 thru 13 on this evenings' agenda.

Being no discussion, we will close it by unanimous consent and call the roll:

Mr. Walton took the roll. On Roll Call Vote, Commissioner Abdullah, yes, Commissioner Fuentes, yes, Commissioner Kitchens, yes, Commissioner Kukla, yes, and Vice Chair, Jones, yes...

Vice Chair Jones: consent agenda carries.

Vice Chair Jones: can we move a motion on item no #1 which is:

ITEM #1: RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING A CLOSED CAUCUS REGARDING PERSONNEL MATTERS, LITIGATION AND GRANT STRATEGY.

Commissioner Abdullah I make a motion...Moved by Commissioner Abdullah, second by Commissioner Kitchens...seeing no discussion we will close by unanimous consent.

Please call the ROLL:

There being no questions, comments, or discussion Mr. Walton took the roll. Commissioner Abdullah, yes Commissioner Fuentes, yes, Commissioner Kitchens, yes, Commissioner Kukla, yes and Vice Chair, Jones, yes.

Vice Chair Jones: We will not be returning to conduct any business in the public portion that would conclude our meeting we will see everyone in December's meeting. Happy Holidays thank you

Meeting ended at 8:00 p.m.