

## AGPI Report on Western Aid Supporting Palestinian Terror and Call for Donors to Stop Funding Mass Murder

March 2, 2023

Prepared by: Henry Kopel, a retired U.S. Federal Prosecutor and the author of *War on Hate: How to Stop Genocide, Fight Terrorism, and Defend Freedom* (Lexington Books, 2021). He serves on the AGPI Global Advisory Board.

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Israel now faces another year of surging Palestinian murders of innocent Israelis, following 29 such murders and 2,200 terror attacks in 2022 across Israel and the West Bank. This happens not just despite, but in part because of, over \$6 billion in US, Canada, and EU aid given to the Palestinian Authority (PA) and UNRWA since 2008. The PA invests a substantial share of its budget, and hence of this foreign aid, on inciting terrorism, on glorifying terrorism, and on financially rewarding terrorism. The PA's complicity in terrorism promotion and its payment of rewards to terrorist murderers stands in blatant violation of several PA commitments to foreign aid donors, and in clear violation of US and EU conditions on such foreign aid. All other efforts to get the PA to halt its promotion and financing of terror having failed, it is time to enforce the many laws that this conduct violates, and to stop the aid flow to the PA unless and until the PA ends its murderous support and payments for terrorism.

## **FULL REPORT**

## Western Aid Supports Palestinian Terror - It's Long Past Time to Stop Funding Mass Murder

Yet again the world is witnessing a <u>surge</u> of Palestinian terrorists mass-murdering innocent Israelis – innocents driving to work, waiting for busses, and even at houses of prayer.

On February 28, a terrorist shot and killed Elan Ganeles, a Connecticut native and recent Columbia University grad, who was visiting Israel for a wedding.

On February 26, a terrorist murdered two brothers, ages 21 and 19, while sitting in their car in a traffic jam.

On February 10, a terrorist rammed his car into a crowd of civilians standing at a Jerusalem bus stop, immediately killing a 6-year-old boy and a 20-year-old man; the boy's 8-year-old brother died later from his injuries.

On January 27, at the end of Friday evening synagogue prayers in Jerusalem, a terrorist opened fire into the departing crowd, murdering seven congregants aged 14 to 68.

This continues a deadly <u>trend</u> from 2022, which witnessed 29 terrorist murders of Israelis, the highest annual number since 2008.

But the number of terror victims killed reflects only the tip of the Palestinian terror wave rolling through Israel. Just for the year 2022, Israeli security agencies <u>recorded</u> 2,200 terror attacks across Israel and the West Bank. Yet Fatah, the political faction of Palestine Authority leader Mahmoud Abbas, disputes this number as far too low: it has publicly <u>boasted</u> of perpetrating a total of 7,200 terror attacks against Israeli targets in 2022.

For Western audiences, even those numbers greatly understate the gravity of the situation, owing to Israel's much smaller population than most other democracies. At 8.9 million, Israel has a mere thirty-seventh of the population of the United States, which tops out at 333 million.

Translated into American population numbers, Israel's 2022 terror wave would have meant 1,073 terror-murders, and 81,400 recorded terror attacks – and that latter figure comes from the lower Israeli attack number. Fatah's higher claimed number would translate into 266,400 terror attacks across the U.S. in one year.

Now try to imagine the American response if the terrorist group responsible for such murderous carnage and violence were being generously subsidized by foreign countries. Because that has been exactly the Israeli experience for several years.

According to the Congressional Research Service, the United States <u>since</u> <u>2008</u> has given the Palestinian Authority between \$250 million and \$500 million annually. Over that same period the United States also has given <u>between</u> \$180 million and \$390 million to the UN Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA), which administers the Palestinian refugee camps across the Middle East. In total therefore, annual US aid to the Palestinians has ranged between \$430 million and \$890 million, or well in excess of half a billion each year.

Similarly, since 2014 the European Union has granted a <u>total</u> of \$1.5 billion in aid to the Palestinians. And through donations to UNRWA, Canada has been gifting the Palestinians over \$20 million annually.

In sum, over the past ten years the United States, Canada, and Europe have cumulatively given well over \$6 billion from their respective taxpayers to the principal institutions of Palestinian governance.

And over that same period, the Palestinian Authority has been investing a substantial share of its budget on inciting terrorism, on glorifying terrorism, and on financially rewarding terrorism. Often ignored by donors, these malevolent practices have a long history.

In fact the Palestinian leadership's machinery of terror incitement has been operating continuously for nearly a century, since 1928. In that year the then-Palestinian Arab leader Haj Amin al-Husseini launched a murderous anti-Jewish <u>propaganda campaign</u>, falsely accusing the Jewish community of plotting to attack and destroy the Muslim mosques atop the ancient Temple Mount in Jerusalem. That campaign culminated in August 1929 with a wave of Arab pogroms across Palestine, destroying homes and properties, massacring over 130 Jews, and wounding hundreds more.

Lionized as the father of Palestinian-Arab nationalism, al-Husseini in 1941 moved to Berlin, where he publicly concluded an <u>alliance</u> with Adolf Hitler based on an explicit <u>commitment</u> to conquer the Middle East, annex it to the Nazi empire, construct death camps, then exterminate all Jews across the region. That this did not happen is owed entirely to the British-American defeat of Hitler's armies in North Africa in May 1943.

Al-Husseini's decades of Jew-hating incitement was embraced and expanded in 1968 by the PLO's then-new leader Yasir Arafat, and it continues today under Arafat's successor Mahmoud Abbas. As abundantly documented by NGOs like Palestine Media Watch (PMW) and Impact-SE, Palestinian schools, summer camps, TV shows, newspapers, and civic ceremonies relentlessly disseminate Jew-hating propaganda on a scale comparable to that of Nazi Germany.

The schools of the Palestinian Authority orient their entire curricula toward inculcating Jew-hatred and Israel-hatred. A typical eighth-grade reading text <u>includes</u> passages like this: "Your enemies have murdered your children, have sliced open the stomachs of your wives, have seized the beard of your honorable Sheiks and have driven them into the ditches of death." A twelfth-grade literature exercise includes this <u>sentence</u>: "Zionist gangs stole Palestine and expelled its people from their cities, their villages, their lands and their houses, and established the State of Israel."

When the school year ends, Palestinian kids attend PA <u>summer camps</u> named for and glorifying terrorists who committed mass murders of Israelis, such as <u>Dalal Mughrabi</u>. In 1978 Mughrabi led a terrorist team that hijacked two Israeli busses and murdered 37 civilians, 12 of them children.

Palestinian TV regularly broadcasts commentary <u>declaring</u> that Israel perpetrated the Holocaust (though there was no Israel until after the Holocaust), and falsely claiming that Israel now conducts an ongoing Holocaust against the Palestinians: "They opened the ovens for us . . . destroyed the villages and burnt the cities. . . . Their hands are covered with the blood of our children." Children's theatrical performances, broadcast on PA TV, include plays that <u>claim</u> the Jews crucified Jesus and murdered Yasir Arafat through poisoning.

The PA's state-run daily newspaper reinforces these messages of hate with declarations like these: "[m]assacre is the basis of the State of Israel"; "[c]orruption is the nature of the Jews"; the Jew is "the disease of the century"; Israelis "are the new Nazis upon the earth," who commit crimes "worse than" the "gas chambers"; "the oppressive occupier [Israel] drives his nails into our living flesh and murders in cold blood"; "Israel . . . is . . . a cunning Satan which violates all human principles . . . [and] carries out the ugliest forms of racism and torture"; and Jews are "Shylocks of the land, busily emptying Palestinian pockets."

In the UNRWA refugee camps, the same type of <u>incitement</u> predominates in the schools and civic culture: children are taught to hate Jews and Israel, and terrorism against Israelis is glorified.

Lest there be any doubt about the purpose of the hate incitement, Palestinian leaders also celebrate and glorify those who convert the hatred into acts of mass killing. Not just summer camps, but public streets, sports teams, and civic events across the West Bank are named in honor of suicide bombers. Mass murderers of Jews are routinely lauded by PA leaders as "heroes," and PA leaders regularly visit and thank the parents of suicide bombers for their child's successful mass kills. News of Jew-murders are virtually always followed by dancing and cheering in the streets, and the handing out of candy to children – as exemplified <a href="here">here</a> and <a href="here">here</a> and <a href=here</a>.

In fact, funerals of Palestinian suicide bombers are routinely treated as occasions for <u>mass celebration</u>, for which "martyr cards" portraying the murderer are printed up by the thousands; the cards are then distributed *en masse* to children and neighbors. "<u>Martyr posters</u>" of glorified suicide bombers also are plastered throughout public spaces in the Palestinian territories. As Palestinian political analyst Addie Awad <u>puts it</u>, "the veneration of martyrs is part and parcel of the Palestinian national identity."

In sum, the Palestinian Authority – subsidized by billions in Western aid money – inculcates each generation of children in the belief that the Palestinians' greatest heroes and role models are mass murderers of Jews.

To be clear, the incentives for such killing are not limited to exhortation and celebration; they also include generous financial benefits. For several years now the PA has paid lavish cash rewards and pensions to terrorists, as well as to the families of suicide killers. In total the PA's <u>spending</u> on terror bonuses has exceeded \$300 million

per year, which includes "salaries to Palestinian terrorists in Israeli jails, continuing after they are released, and to the families of dead terrorists . . . ." The PA makes no secret of these payments, which it lists in its annual budgets. These so-called "pay-to-slay" payments equal more than 20 percent of annual foreign aid to the PA.

For just a <u>hint</u> of the horror behind this program: "Among the thousands of recipients of the PA payments are mass murderers like Abdallah Barghouti, who is responsible for multiple terror attacks in which 67 people were murdered, and the family of Abd Al-Basset Odeh, the suicide bomber who carried out the Passover attack at the Park Hotel in Netanya on March 27, 2002, murdering 30 Israelis."

The PA has created whole bureaucracies to administer its pay-to-slay program. As reported in Commentary magazine: "Payment amounts correlate to the number of people the terrorists manage to victimize. It's a system that not only foments violence but also makes terrorism a lucrative career choice for young Palestinians." As also reported, the payments are exceedingly generous:

"Salaries start at \$400 per month for terrorists incarcerated for up to three years. They rise to \$570 for those in for three to five years, and \$1,142 for five to 10 years. For those serving more than 30 years, the salary is \$3,429. That's per month. And this is a society in which the gross national product per capita amounts to \$258 per month."

Accordingly, for Palestinians contemplating their future life course, it is "five times more profitable to become a convicted terrorist than a teacher."

In a 2016 speech before the UN General Assembly, Israeli Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu graphically <u>described</u> what this means in day-to-day Palestinian life:

On YouTube, Ali [a Palestinian teen] watches a clip of President Abbas himself saying, "We welcome every drop of blood spilled in Jerusalem." Over dinner, Ali asks his mother what would happen if he killed a Jew and went to an Israeli prison. Here's what she tells him. She tells him he'd be paid thousands of dollars each month by the Palestinian Authority. In fact, she tells him, the more Jews he would kill, the more money he'd get. Oh, and when he gets out of prison, Ali would be guaranteed a job with the Palestinian Authority . . . . Hundreds of thousands of Palestinian children . . . are indoctrinated with hate every moment, every hour. This is child abuse. Imagine your child undergoing this brainwashing. Imagine what it takes for a young boy or girl to break free out of this culture of hate. Some do but far too many don't.

A 2015 hearing of the U.S. House of Representatives' Committee on Foreign Affairs offered a similar <u>description</u> of Palestinian terror promotion:

Israel is contending with a deep-seated hatred, nurtured by Palestinian leaders over many years in mosques, in schools, in newspapers, and on

television channels. Consider growing up in an environment in which television shows regularly glorify terrorists who have killed Israeli civilians; where you are taught that Jews are subhuman. Or watching a small boy interviewed on television who speaks of wanting to be an engineer, in his words, "so that I can build bombs to blow up all the Jews." Or seeing the family next door receive a generous stipend for their son igniting his suicide vest.

All of the above-described activity – incitement to terror, glorification of terror, and financial rewards for terror – blatantly violates several laws and agreements binding on both the donors and the Palestinian Authority.

Most significantly, these activities violate the United States' Taylor Force Act, codified at 22 United States Code, Section 2378c-1. This Act requires that all U.S. aid "that directly benefits the PA" be suspended unless the Secretary of State certifies that the Palestinian Authority has met four conditions: terminating these payments to terrorists, revoking laws authorizing this compensation, taking "credible steps" to end Palestinian terrorism, and "publicly condemning" and investigating such acts of violence. The Act excepted from its coverage, aid to the East Jerusalem Hospital network, and aid for water projects. To date, the Palestinian Authority has *never* been in compliance with the Act – and yet American aid still flows to the PA.

Viewed objectively, these activities also violate the European Union's conditions on foreign aid grants. Under the heading "Annex II," section 12.2(d) of those conditions requires termination of any foreign aid grant for which "it has been established . . . by proof in possession of the contracting authority that the beneficiary(ies) has been guilty of . . . terrorist financing, [or] terrorist related offences . . . ." The PA has never ceased its support and promotion of "terrorist related offences" – and yet, European aid still flows to the PA.

These activities also violate multiple <u>commitments</u> made by the Palestinian Authority as part of the Oslo Peace Process. The so-called Cairo Agreement of May 1994 required that the "Palestinian Authority . . . shall . . . abstain from incitement, including hostile propaganda," against Israel. In the Oslo II agreement of September 1995, the PA promised to "take all measures necessary in order to prevent acts of terrorism, crime, and hostilities." And again in January 1997, after further Israeli territorial withdrawals, the PA promised to prevent "incitement and hostile propaganda," to combat terror, and to prevent violence. The PA was then and still now stands in blatant violation of all such commitments – and yet the foreign aid keeps flowing to it.

It also bears mentioning that, if such foreign aid funding were provided by private citizens or NGOs rather than by governments, it would conceivably constitute criminal conduct subject to prosecution. In Title 18 of the U.S. Code at section 2339A, the United States <a href="criminalizes">criminalizes</a> all acts deemed to constitute "material support" of terrorism, specifically including the provision of "currency or monetary instruments" for use in preparing for or conducting terrorist acts. European countries similarly criminalize

financial support for terrorism, as in the <u>British</u> Terrorism Act of 2000 at Chapter 11, Part III, Offences Section 15, and in the <u>German</u> Criminal Code at Section 89c. <u>Canada's</u> Anti-Terrorism Act also criminalizes terrorist financing. Why such otherwise criminal acts become legitimate when sovereign governments pay the terror bills has yet to be explained.

With respect to the aforementioned civil law prohibitions on the use of foreign aid for terrorism, there have been occasional efforts to bring the Palestinian Authority into compliance. After passage of the Taylor Force Act, the Trump administration <a href="cut aid">cut aid</a> to the PA; but the Biden administration restored it despite the PA's continuing to pay reward money to terrorists and to suicide bombers' families. The European Union <a href="suspended">suspended</a> aid payments to the PA because of terrorism promotion in children's schoolbooks, but then restored the aid without verifying whether such materials had been removed. The US Congress has occasionally held <a href="hearings">hearings</a> on Palestinian incitement to terrorism, but the aid keeps on flowing.

The unfortunate but glaring reality here is this: Decades of negotiations, agreements, promises, warnings, moral appeals, and temporary aid suspensions all have done nothing to reduce or prevent the Palestinian Authority's relentless commitment to inciting, glorifying, and financially rewarding acts of terrorism committed against innocent Israelis. While diplomats talk, Israelis are murdered in cold blood. While Western leaders call for peace, Israelis are murdered in cold blood.

It is long past time for Western leaders to recognize, to expose, and to impose consequences for the Palestinian Authority's deep and culpable involvement in this long history of murder and mayhem. And it is long past time for Western leaders to tell the Palestinian leaders that they have a choice: End the incitement; End the glorification of; and End the financial support of terror. Or else, we end the aid, period.